WORKFORCE ANALYSIS FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR:
STAKEHOLDER PERSPECTIVES

AHMED ALI ABDALLA NAAMA, BSc., MSc.

Thesis submitted to the Cardiff School of Management in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

2007

Cardiff School of Management,
University of Wales Institute, Cardiff,
Colchester Avenue,
CARDIFF,
CF23 9XR
United Kingdom
DECLARATION

I declare that this work has not previously been accepted in substance for any degree and is not being concurrently submitted for any other degree. I further declare that this thesis is the result of my own independent work and investigation, except where otherwise stated (a bibliography is appended). Finally, I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and abstract to be made available to outside organisations.

Ahmed Ali Abdalla Naama (Candidate)

Dr. Claire Haven-Tang (Director of Studies)

Prof. Elen Jones (Supervisor)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Praise be to Allah; the Cherisher and Sustainer of the worlds; most Gracious, most Merciful. He has given me the ability to do this work.

This thesis would not have been possible without the guidance, information and support provided by many people.

In particular, I would like to thank my Director of Studies, Dr. Claire Haven-Tang and my supervisor, Professor Eleri Jones for their continuing support, valuable input during the work, patience and undoubted knowledge and wisdom.

I would like to express my sincere thanks and appreciation to all the managers and staff of the Libyan hotel sector, who participated in this research. Without them, there would not be a thesis to submit. And special thanks to Emma Bettinson for her support and assistance.

I had an inspiring time at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff, which is mainly due to the cooperative staff and my research colleagues. I want to thank them very much indeed for every pleasant interaction and for providing immeasurable help.

On a personal level, I would like to thank my family, especially my mum, my wife and my little daughters, whose patience made the completion of this research possible.

To all mentioned, I dedicate this work.

Wales, November 2007
Ahmed Ali Naama


ABSTRACT

Tourism in Libya is perceived as the best long-term alternative to the oil industry upon which the country’s economy has been heavily dependent. Hotels are a key element in the tourism industry. This study focused on developing a model of workforce analysis (WFA) for the Libyan hotel sector to support the development of Libya as an internationally competitive tourism destination. Specifically, the objectives of this study were: to explore tourism development in Libya and critically analyse Human Resource Development (HRD) strategy proposed in the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) for the Libyan hotel sector; to carry out a critical review of literature to identify HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as alternative models of workforce planning (WFP) to inform adaptation of a unified theoretical model; to identify Human Resource (HR) issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, Hospitality Education Institution HEI and government views on these issues and to develop a best practice WFA model appropriate to the needs of the Libyan hotel sector.

This study was carried out in four main stages. The first stage involved an extensive literature review to generate a background and develop a theoretical framework for the research. This study adopted a case study approach (Yin, 2003), incorporating semi-structured interviews with hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials. The second stage involved the use of the Delphi technique to build consensus on the best practice WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector. The third stage involved conducting further semi-structured interviews with hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials to identify key WFP issues within the Libyan hotel sector. The fourth stage provides recommendation to solve the existing human resource problems facing the hotel sector and WFP implementation strategy.

The study concludes that there are some major HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector, including: recruitment and selection; skills gaps; inadequate practical training; minimum opportunities given to overseas workers; role of public and private sector in HR development; shortage of qualified academic staff; outdated curricula; inadequacy of LTMP; funding of Libyan HEIs; lack of co-operation between the hotel sector, HEIs and the government; leakage of graduates and academic staff and poor image. To tackle these HR issues, this study proposes a best practice WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector. The WFP model comprises seven elements: the government; the hotel sector (demand side); the HEIs (supply side); gap analysis; workforce development plan (WFDP); implementation strategy and evaluation.

The main contributions of this study include: the understanding of the key HR issues confronting the Libyan hotel sector; the application of Delphi technique to build consensus on the essential elements for WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector and the development of a best practice WFP model.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION........................................................................................................i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS..........................................................................................ii
ABSTRACT...............................................................................................................iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS............................................................................................iv
LIST OF APPENDICES............................................................................................viii
LIST OF TABLES.....................................................................................................ix
LIST OF FIGURES..................................................................................................x
LIST OF PLATES.....................................................................................................xii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....................................................................................xiii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 ECONOMIC DIVERSIFICATION THROUGH TOURISM ......................................1-2
1.2 THE IMPORTANCE OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY IN LIBYA ..........................1-5
1.3 THE LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP)...............................................1-7
1.4 PREVIOUS RESEARCH.....................................................................................1-8
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS....................................................................................1-10
1.6 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES................................................................1-11
1.7 WHY CHOOSE TRIPOLI AS A CASE STUDY?................................................1-12
1.8 STUDY DESIGN................................................................................................1-13
1.9 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS.........................................................................1-16

CHAPTER TWO: TOURISM IN LIBYA

2.1 INTRODUCTION...............................................................................................2-3
2.2 THE LIBYAN CONTEXT....................................................................................2-3
2.3 NATIONALISATION OF THE PRIVATE SECTOR IN LIBYA..............................2-13
2.4 EMPLOYMENT AND WAGES LAW.................................................................2-17
2.5 IMPACTS OF EMPLOYMENT LAWS: PUBLIC VERSUS PRIVATE SECTORS IN LIBYA ..........................2-23
# Table of contents

2.6 TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN LIBYA ........................................... 2-26
2.7 LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP) ............................... 2-40
2.8 SUMMARY ................................................................................. 2-57

## CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................... 3-2
3.2 HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT (HRM) ............................... 3-3
3.3 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (HRD) ............................... 3-8
3.4 HRM AND HRD ISSUES IN THE TOURISM AND HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY ................................................................. 3-14
3.5 WOMEN IN THE HOSPITALITY SECTOR WORKFORCE ............ 3-38
3.6 WORKFORCE PLANNING .......................................................... 3-43
3.7 SUMMARY ................................................................................. 3-73

## CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH APPROACH

4.1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................... 4-2
4.2 RESEARCH OVERVIEW ............................................................. 4-3
4.3 QUALITATIVE OR QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH? ......................... 4-4
4.4 THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE .................................................. 4-6
4.5 CASE STUDY OF LIBYA ............................................................. 4-10
4.6 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE THREE ......................... 4-15
4.7 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE FOUR ............................. 4-24
4.8 RELIABILITY, VALIDITY AND TRIANGULATION ...................... 4-36
4.9 GENERALISATION OF RESULTS ............................................... 4-39
4.10 SUMMARY ................................................................................. 4-40
### CHAPTER FIVE: WORKFORCE PLANNING FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

5.1 INTRODUCTION..................................................................................5-2
5.2 WFP MODEL ....................................................................................5-3
5.3 PROBLEMS FACING WORKFORCE PLANNING (WFP) IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR .............................................5-5
5.4 CRITICAL ISSUES ARISING FROM THE INITIAL WORKFORCE ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK .......................................................5-16
5.5 BUILDING CONSENSUS ON THE WFP MODEL ...............................5-21
5.6 PROPOSED BEST PRACTICE WFP MODEL FOR LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR ........................................................................5-23
5.7 SUMMARY .........................................................................................5-46

### CHAPTER SIX: HR ISSUES IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

6.1 INTRODUCTION..................................................................................6-3
6.2 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR ......................6-4
6.3 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN HOSPITALITY EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS (HEIs) .................................................................6-26
6.4 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN GOVERNMENT ..........................6-39
6.5 CONGRUENCE AND DISSONANCE BETWEEN KEY STAKEHOLDERS' VIEWS ON HR ISSUES FACING THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR .........................................................6-51
6.6 SUMMARY .........................................................................................6-59
CHAPTER SEVEN: RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 7-2
7.2 GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS ................................. 7-2
7.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR ...... 7-4
7.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HEIs .................... 7-6
7.5 RECOMMENDATIONS LIBYAN GOVERNMENT .................. 7-8
7.6 WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT PLAN (WFDP) A SOLUTION FOR
  WORKFORCE PLANNING ISSUES IN LIBYA ...................... 7-13

CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSIONS

8.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 8-2
8.2 REVIEW OF RESEARCH OBJECTIVES ............................ 8-2
8.3 LINKING RESEARCH FINDINGS TO RESEARCH QUESTIONS ...... 8-15
8.4 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO THEORY ......................... 8-20
8.5 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO PRACTICE ....................... 8-21
8.6 LIMITATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH .... 8-22
8.7 PERSONAL THOUGHTS .......................................... 8-25

REFERENCES

APPENDICES
LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: LIST OF INSTITUTES OFFERING COURSES IN HOTEL SECTOR AND TOURISM INDUSTRY IN LIBYA ..........1

APPENDIX 2: INCREMENTAL STAFFING REQUIREMENTS BY SKILL CATEGORY ....................................................... 3

APPENDIX 2: INCREMENTAL WORKFORCE REQUIREMENTS BY LOCATION TYPE AND GRADE OF ESTABLISHMENT ......4

APPENDIX 3: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS ON WORKFORCE PLANNING .............5

APPENDIX 4: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS FOR HOTEL MANAGERS ..................7

APPENDIX 5: LIST OF PUBLIC HOTELS IN TRIPOLI IN LIBYA ...............10

APPENDIX 6: THEMES DISCUSSED WITH KEY STAKEHOLDERS ...............11

APPENDIX 7: FUNCTIONAL GRADES AND SALARIES FOR EACH GRADE ............................................................. 14
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 GDP according to economic sectors in the years 1998, 2000 & 2004 (LD '000') .................................................. 1-2
Table 1.2 Visitor arrivals to Libya ........................................... 1-7

Table 2.1 Changes in the nationalisation of the private sector in Libya ............................................................. 2-14
Table 2.2 Main themes in the Libyan employment laws ............................................................. 2-18
Table 2.3 Gross National Product (GDP) with the cost of the income factors with fixed prices, 1986-2002 (Million LD) ........................................ 2-29
Table 2.4 Gross National Product (GDP) with the cost of the income factors with current prices, 1986-2002 (Million LD) ........................................ 2-29
Table 2.5 Employment in the Libyan hotel sector in relation to the total employment, 1986-2002 ('000')........................................ 2-31
Table 2.6 Lodging Management courses ........................................ 2-44
Table 2.7 Catering Management courses ........................................ 2-45
Table 2.8 Education and training institutions in Libya .................................................. 2-47

Table 3.1 Current employment status ........................................ 3-37
Table 3.2 Time period in tourism industry following graduation .................................................. 3-38
Table 3.3 The gendering of employment in accommodation and catering .................................................. 3-40
Table 3.4 Female hotel managers in Egypt by job title .................................................. 3-41
Table 3.5 A summary of steps in workforce planning .................................................. 3-68

Table 4.1: Number times before a final consensus on the best practice WFP model. 4.23
Table 4.2 Classification of hotels in Tripoli, Libya ........................................ 4-30
Table 4.3 Summary of research design ........................................ 4-35
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Comparative oil production between Libya and Arab countries, 2004...1-3
Figure 1.2 Research design.........................................................1-15
Figure 1.3 Thesis structure.........................................................1-18

Figure 2.1 Map of Libya...............................................................2-5
Figure 2.2 GDP trend, 1999-2001..................................................2-12
Figure 2.3 International tourist arrivals in Libya, 1994-2000 (‘000’)..............2-33
Figure 2.4 Libyan estimates and forecasts........................................2-34
Figure 2.5 Structure of the Libyan tourism sector................................2-36
Figure 2.6 Organisational structure of the new Libyan Ministry of Tourism.....2-39
Figure 2.7 Libyan educational pyramid..........................................2-43
Figure 2.8 Employment estimates and forecast, 2003-2013........................2-48
Figure 2.9 Tourism workforces in Libya..........................................2-49
Figure 2.10 Incremental staffing requirements, 1998-2018........................2-50
Figure 2.11 Incremental room requirements, 2003-2018........................2-51
Figure 2.12 The national HRD plan proposed in the LTMP.....................2-53

Figure 3.1 Major functional areas for HRM.....................................3-7
Figure 3.2 Human resource issues in tourism and hospitality Industry........3-19
Figure 3.3 Different employment systems......................................3-21
Figure 3.4 Phases in workforce planning and development......................3-52
Figure 3.5 The strategic direction for workforce planning and development....3-55
Figure 3.6 Workforce analysis and strategies...................................3-57
Figure 3.7 A unified theoretical model of workforce planning and development...3-72

Figure 4.1 Research approach....................................................4-3
Figure 4.2 Levels of decision making in setting a research design...............4-5
Figure 4.3 Multiple sources of evidences in case studies.........................4-13
Figure 4.4 Delphi Technique process...........................................4-17
Figure 4.5 Process of interview transcription..................................4-33
Figure 4.6 Summary Research Design..........................................4-41
Figure 5.1 Phases in WFP ................................................................. 5-4
Figure 5.2 Initial workforce analysis framework .............................. 5-5
Figure 5.3 WFP problems facing the Libyan Hotel sector ............... 5-16
Figure 5.4 Modified workforce analysis framework ....................... 5-20
Figure 5.5 Potential WFP for the hotel sector in Libya ................... 5-24

Figure 6.1 Structure of discussion .................................................. 6-4
Figure 6.2 Key HR issues identified by hotel managers, HEIs staff and
government officials .................................................................. 6-51

Figure 8.1 Proposed best practice WFP Model for the hotel sector in Libya .... 8-8
**LIST OF PLATES**

Plate 2.1: Akokess Mounts..................................................2-26
Plate 2.2: Temple of Zeus....................................................2-27
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BBC</td>
<td>British Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBI</td>
<td>Confederation of British Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBL</td>
<td>Central Bank of Libya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligence Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBP</td>
<td>Education Business Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIU</td>
<td>Economist Intelligence Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELM</td>
<td>External Labour Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBT</td>
<td>General Board for Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBTA</td>
<td>General Board for Tourism and Antiquities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPCT</td>
<td>General People’s Committee for Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEIs</td>
<td>Hospitality Education Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Human Resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRM</td>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRP</td>
<td>Human Resource Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td>Internal Labour Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LD</td>
<td>Libyan Dinar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LTMP</td>
<td>Libyan Tourism Master Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODI</td>
<td>Overseas Development Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODTI</td>
<td>Office for the Development of Tourism and Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLM</td>
<td>Occupational Labour Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMEs</td>
<td>Small and Medium Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TILM</td>
<td>Technical/Industrial Labour Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIPB</td>
<td>Tourism Investment and Promotion Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UFHRD</td>
<td>University Forum for Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNWTO</td>
<td>United Nations World Tourism Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFA</td>
<td>Workforce Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFD</td>
<td>Workforce Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFDP</td>
<td>Workforce Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFP</td>
<td>Workforce Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Tourism Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTTC</td>
<td>World Travel and Tourism Council</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 ECONOMIC DIVERSIFICATION THROUGH TOURISM 1-2
1.2 THE IMPORTANCE OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY IN LIBYA 1-5
1.3 THE LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP) 1-7
1.4 PREVIOUS RESEARCH 1-8
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS 1-10
1.6 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES 1-11
1.7 WHY CHOOSE TRIPOLI AS A CASE STUDY? 1-12
1.8 RESEARCH DESIGN 1-13
1.9 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS 1-16
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 ECONOMIC DIVERSIFICATION THROUGH TOURISM

Libya has one of the least diversified economies among the Maghreb Arab countries and even among the oil-producing countries (Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), 2005). Some of Libya’s Maghreb Arab neighbours have diversified economies with agriculture, mining, energy, tourism (particularly Egypt and Tunisia) and manufacturing sectors registering good performance. Over the years, the Libyan economy has been heavily reliant on the oil sector as the main source of foreign exchange earnings and its contribution is about 90% of total exports (Alqadhafi, 2002: 19). Moreover, in the year 2004, the oil and natural gas sector contributed 66% (i.e. Libyan Dinar (LD) 26,342,000) of the Libyan GDP (Table 1.1).

Table 1.1: GDP according to economic sectors in the years 1998, 2000 & 2004 (LD ‘000’)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing</td>
<td>1394</td>
<td>1438</td>
<td>1439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oil and Natural Gas</td>
<td>2786</td>
<td>7081</td>
<td>26342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining and Quarrying</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>294</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>779</td>
<td>890</td>
<td>761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity and water</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>713</td>
<td>1014</td>
<td>1495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade and tourism</td>
<td>1715</td>
<td>1686</td>
<td>2392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and communication</td>
<td>1168</td>
<td>1214</td>
<td>1664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Insurance and ownership of dwellings</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>357</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>476</td>
<td>592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General services</td>
<td>1184</td>
<td>1238</td>
<td>3532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and health</td>
<td>1359</td>
<td>1428</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other services</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>12611</td>
<td>17778</td>
<td>39947</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Central Bank of Libya (CBL) (2005)
Although Libya produces more oil per day as compared to the majority of the Maghreb Arab countries (figure 1.1), Libya often experiences shortages of basic necessities, such as foodstuffs, due to unpredictable fluctuations in oil prices and import restrictions. Consequently, the Libyan government has begun to explore alternative ways to minimise its dependency on oil as the sole source of income and to increase investment in other sectors.

**Figure 1.1:** Comparative oil production between Libya and Arab countries, 2004

![Bar chart showing oil production comparison](image)

**Source:** CIA (2005)

One of the most promising economic development options for Libya is the tourism industry. In the recent past Libyan economic policy has been shifting towards a tourism development strategy (Hosni, 2000). As with other Arab countries, such as Egypt,
Tunisia and the United Arab Emirates, tourism has great potential for contributing significantly to economic development in Libya.

Tourism is a key sector in the economy of most developed and developing countries and is being used as "a ubiquitous vehicle for economic development and diversification and ... an integral element of economic development policy" (Sharpley, 2002: 221). Tourism is expected to generate US $ 9,285.9 billion globally by the year 2011; the tourism and travel industry employment worldwide was estimated at 207.1 million jobs in 2001 and expected to rise to 260.4 million jobs by 2011 (WTTC, 2002). The total exports generated by tourism and travel industry are expected to increase from US $ 1,063.8 billion recorded in 2001 to US $ 2,583.3 billion by 2011 (WTTC, 2002). UNWTO’s tourism 2020 vision forecasts an increase in international arrivals to over 1.56 billion by the year 2020. Many developing countries have focused their attention on developing tourism trade and tourism-related sectors. Many countries have succeeded not only in attracting a significant number of tourists but also in turning tourism into a source of wealth. In the year 2003, for example, total exports generated by tourism in Egypt was 23.4 % and tourism receipts were estimated at US $ 4,704 million (Overseas Development Institute (ODI), 2006).
1.2 THE IMPORTANCE OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY IN LIBYA

The Libyan tourism sector is expected to become a major source of foreign exchange based on exploitation of Libya’s extensive natural, financial and human resources and enabling it to take a lion’s share of international tourism in the region (WTO, 2003: S/3) asserts that a significant opportunity exists in which the Libyan tourism sector may develop such that it:

- assists the state to achieve overall national economic and social development objectives;
- presents a product that will minimise any social and environmental disruption;
- will be high profile in character and will stimulate the creation of a positive image for the country;
- will avoid the mistakes made by a number of other tourist destinations, providing the setting and design of new facilities does not cause negative environmental impacts; is meaningful in terms of market requirements.

Libya has several touristic advantages, which should potentially enhance its competitiveness, including: its location (i.e. close to Europe); an abundance of interesting heritage sites (e.g. Greek and Roman ruins, romantic oasis towns); diverse natural resources (e.g. long beaches, sea, oasis, mountains and desert); urban centres (e.g. Tripoli) and the genuine warmth and friendly of the Libyan people. The Libyan tourism potential has remained unexploited and underutilised. After many years of isolation due to the international embargo (Hosni, 2000), the Libyan Government has made moves to normalise its relations with the rest of the world. The government’s
future strategy is to increase its tourism market share in the international market. Forecasts by WTTC (2003) indicate that by 2013, the Libyan tourism industry directly will contribute LD 2,552.4 million (US $ 1,469.8 million) to the Libyan GDP, 42,060 jobs and visitor exports of LD 211.1 million (US $ 121.5 million).

Although visitor arrival statistics have been collected for many years by the immigration authorities in Libya, it was not until 1997 that these arrivals were classified by nationality and purpose of visit. The number of visitors to Libya has increased dramatically over the years. Table 1.2 shows visitor arrivals by visitor-generating areas from 1997 to 2000 and identifies North Africa and the Middle East as the major visitor-generating areas, providing 96% of the total visitors. In 2000, European tourists represented 3.6% of visitors. The number of visitors fell from 1,832,000 in 1995 to 960,191 in 2000. This was mainly due to a fall in the number of overseas workers who sought employment in Libya. It is worth noting that due to a lack of a visitor identification and classification system, all visitors to Libya, including job seekers, were counted as visitors. It was therefore impossible to determine actual tourist figures (Libyan government, 2004).
### Table 1.2: Visitor arrivals to Libya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>563118</td>
<td>457950</td>
<td>527968</td>
<td>530189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>861</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>463</td>
<td>647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1814</td>
<td>1952</td>
<td>620</td>
<td>787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>28140</td>
<td>22649</td>
<td>33409</td>
<td>34296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2556</td>
<td>2140</td>
<td>2238</td>
<td>2525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>307105</td>
<td>361295</td>
<td>396604</td>
<td>391747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>659000</td>
<td>1493000</td>
<td>1832000</td>
<td>1276000</td>
<td>903594</td>
<td>846442</td>
<td>961302</td>
<td>960191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** General Peoples Committee of Tourism Libyan Report (2004)

### 1.3 THE LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP)

There are four generic issues which are key to tourism development and are reflected in most national and regional tourism strategies: infrastructure; product development; human resource development, and marketing. In recognition of the fact that the tourism sector is now a major industry on the world economic stage, the Libyan General People's Committee (LGPC) for Tourism requested that the World Tourism Organisation (WTO), as the executing agency for tourism of the United Nations Development Programme, prepare the Libyan Tourism Master Plan for Libya. The Libyan Government hoped that this plan would attract foreign investment of US $27,000 - 28,000 million for infrastructure, training, new hotels, marketing, and product development. The LTMP identifies a number of strategic initiatives to develop the
tourism industry in Libya. It focuses on the role of the public sector through short and long-term planning, marketing, infrastructure development and human resource development. The main aim for the tourism sector is to improve the international image of Libya and to use tourism as a stimulus for regional development. The longer-term objectives of the LTMP concentrate on employment generation, increased foreign exchange earnings and promotion of both international and domestic investment into the sector. The LTMP will also focus on the growth of small and medium-sized tourism-related enterprises (SMEs). A key element of the thesis is to critically analyse the LTMP’s proposed HRD strategy for the Libyan hotel sector. This analysis is presented in Chapter two.

1.4 PRELIMINARY RESEARCH

Previous research has identified several problems associated with aspects of the LTMP. Research by Abuzed (2002) and Jwaili et al. (2004) emphasises the dissatisfaction of the private sector with the LTMP. Some of the general problems such as lack of knowledge and awareness; lack of tourism-related infrastructure; lack of technical know-how and weak promotional activity; lack of language skills; lack of preparation and training of all personnel in the tourism guidance sector and a lack of co-ordination to develop a competitive pricing policy. LTMP is being implemented to tackle these problems.

Generally, the hotel sector workforce in Libya comprises both permanent and temporary staff. However, previous studies (e.g. Libyan Government, 1998) assert that the Libyan
hotel sector in particular, and the Libyan tourism industry in general, suffer from skills shortages because:

1. There has not been enough investment in tourism education;
2. There has been a tendency to use overseas staff;
3. Libya's economic history has been in a different sector;
4. Culturally, there is reluctance amongst Libyans to work in the service sector.

Key stakeholders, including the Ministry of Tourism, Libyan vocational education institutions and the private sector, have proposed optimistically that financial investment is not required and that training and tourism expertise is more of a priority (Kieilen, 2004). Libya is investing its financial resources in building, for example, hotels, airports, road and other facilities, without considering the availability of its skilled human resource. Thus, appropriate human resource development strategies in the Libyan tourism industry in general, and the hotel sector in particular, would help solve some of the problems which the Libyan hotel sector is facing.
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The previous research on small and medium-sized enterprises of the Libyan tourism industry indicates that tourism hotel sector do not perceive the LTMP to be addressing the issues they are experiencing in relation to HRD (Jwaili et al. 2004). This raises key questions on the LTMP and HRD issues in Libya that the research seeks to address. These questions are discussed below:

1. What are the issues that hotel managers face and how would they like to see these issues addressed in the LTMP or through a workforce development plan for the hotel sector?

2. How would hotel managers like to see the Hospitality Education Institutions (HEIs) curriculum respond to the HRD needs of the industry?

3. How would hotel managers like to see the role of the government in the development of HR issues in the Libyan hotel sector and general cultural issues, such as attitudes towards careers in the hotel industry; being addressed?

4. What are the main issues that HEIs face in their endeavour to deliver high quality training to produce competent graduates? And what responsibility do the HEIs take for HRD for the hotel sector?

5. How do the government and hotel sector impact on the agenda of HEIs in preparing graduates for the hotel sector? And what responsibility does government take for HRD in the hotel sector?

These questions will be addressed through the development of a case study (Yin, 2003) of the HRD requirements of Libyan hotels in Tripoli matched against the HRD
objectives of the LTMP to identify congruence and dissonance between the HRD objectives of the LTMP and the HRD requirements of Libyan hotel sector.

1.6 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES

The aim of this study is to propose a model of workforce analysis for the Libyan hotel sector to support the development of Libya as an internationally-competitive tourism destination. To fulfill this aim, five objectives are formulated, namely:

1. To explore tourism development in Libya and critically analyse the LTMP’s proposed HRD strategy for the Libyan hotel sector;
2. To carry out a critical review of literature to identify HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as alternative models of WFP to inform adaptation of a unified theoretical model;
3. To develop a best practice Workforce Analysis (WFA) model appropriate to the needs of the Libyan hotel sector;
4. To identify HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEI and government views on these issues;
5. To provide recommendations for key stakeholders through the development of WFDP for the Libyan hotel sector to help them tackle HR problems facing the sector through a WFA implementation strategy.
1.7 WHY CHOOSE TRIPOLI AS A CASE STUDY?

Tripoli lies in the northern part of Africa, and its population is 1.68 million (CIA Fact Book, 2006). It is the capital city of Libya. Tripoli is an old city - it was one of the main four Phoenician cities in North Africa. At the beginning of the third century it was named ‘Tripolitanos’ which means ‘the three cities’. The Arabic name is Tarablus, which was acquired after the Arabs entered (621 BC). Some historians gave Tripoli the name ‘The White City’ because its buildings were painted white.

Tripoli is the principal seaport of Libya as well as being Libya’s economic centre. It is the leading centre of banking, finance and communication as well as the leading commercial and manufacturing centre. Since the lifting of UN sanctions against Libya, Tripoli has experienced increase in foreign investment, including tourism. Consequently there has been increasing demand for hotels and quality services (Hosni, 2000). Besides, due to its long history, Tripoli has many archaeological sites, which are of great interest to tourists. Other tourist attractions include good climate, sandy beaches, the famous Red castle, classical statues, and the Jamahiriya museum, which is Libya’s national museum (eBizguide, 2006). Currently, Tripoli is the main tourist destination in Libya and has the highest concentration of hotels in the country.
1.8 STUDY DESIGN

The study design represents the logic that will link the data collected and the conclusions drawn to the research objectives. This study is organised into four stages as shown in figure 1.2 and discussed in the subsequent sections.

Stage 1

This stage begins with an exploration of tourism development in Libya and a critical analysis of the LTMP proposed strategy for HRD to identify research problems. This is followed by a review of literature on human resource management, human resource development and workforce planning, with specific emphasis on hospitality management in order to adopt a unified theoretical workforce planning (WFP) model.

Stage 2

This stage involves using the Delphi technique to build consensus on the best practice WFA model to suit the Libyan hotel sector context. The Delphi technique involves the gathering of information from a group of experts on a specified issue where each expert states separately their opinion (Xie and Smith, 2000). These opinions are analysed, summarized and circulated to those experts again for further comments, where the experts are asked to declare which opinion they think to be the most appropriate and if they want to modify their ideas in the light of the other experts’ opinions; a process which might be repeated a number of times before a final consensus is built, depending on the extent to which the initial opinions are similar (Xie and Smith, 2000).
Stage 3

This stage involves using the case study methodology to establish important human resource (HR) issues facing the Libyan hotel sector. Specifically, this stage focuses on semi-structured interviews with key stakeholders in the hotel sector, including hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials to establish the congruence and dissonance in their views regarding HR issues in the Libyan hotel sector.

Stage 4

This stage provides recommendations to solve the existing HR problems facing the sector and WFDP implementation strategy (i.e. to address the third and the fourth research objectives). Specifically, this stage focuses on gathering a balanced and broad cross-section of opinions from hotel managers, (HEI) staff and government officials on the suggested WFA framework.
Figure 1.2: Research Design

Stage 1
- Identify research problems
- General literature review
- Focused literature review

Stage 2
- WFP Theoretical model
- Research Methodology: Delphi Technique Case Study
- Delphi Technique: Interviews conducted using Delphi technique
- Modified Theoretical WFP model to reflect the

Stage 3
- Semi-structured interviews to identify HR issues from the hotel sector, HEIs and government perspectives
- Develop WFA Best Practice Model
- Data analysis

Stage 4
- Recommendations
- Conclusions
1.9 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS

This thesis comprises eight chapters as summarised in figure 1.3. Chapter one presents background information on the study, including the aim and objectives, and justification for the use of Tripoli as the case study destination.

Chapter two provides background on Libya, specifically in relation to tourism development and employment law. The chapter also analyses the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP), illustrating its proposed plans for human resource development and stages for human resource training and development.

Chapter three provides a literature review on human resource management (HRM), human resource development (HRD) and HRM and HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry. Furthermore, the chapter provides a critical review of different WFP models to inform adaptation of a unified theoretical model of WFP for the research.

Chapter four encompasses the research epistemology, theoretical perspective, and methodology and research methods adopted to execute the research activities in order to meet the stipulated research objectives. This chapter also provides justification for the research methodology adopted within the study through its consideration of the methodological choices available to the researcher, and the research strategy and methods. Also, the chapter explores issues of research validity and reliability, and details how each is addressed within the study.
Chapter five uses the Delphi technique to create consensus amongst key hotels sector stakeholders (hotel managers, HEIs staff and government officials) to inform the WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector. This chapter provides the understanding and analysis needed to develop and a theoretical model so that it reflects the reality of what was found.

Chapter six provides results and discussion on key issues facing human resource development, their causes and effects and possible solutions from the hotel sector, HEIs and government perspectives. Also the chapter provides a discussion on congruence and dissonance between the views of the hotel sector, HEIs and government on human resource issues facing the Libyan hotel sector.

Chapter seven provides recommendations for a Libyan hotel sector WFA implementation strategy to solve the existing problems and to ensure that the right people are hired for the right job in the right place and at the right time.

Finally, chapter eight presents conclusions of the research. It presents a review of the research objectives and major research findings. The chapter also outlines significant contributions of the study in terms of theory and practice and research limitations. Lastly the chapter suggests opportunities for further research.
Figure 1.3: Thesis structure

- **CHAPTER 1: Introduction**
  - Research problem
  - Research questions
  - Research aims and objectives
  - Study design
  - Thesis structure

- **CHAPTER 2: Tourism in Libyan**

- **CHAPTER 3: Literature review**

- **CHAPTER 4: Research approach**

- **CHAPTER 5: Workforce Planning for the Libyan Hotel Sector**
  - To explore tourism development in Libya and critically analyse the LTMP's proposed HRD strategy for the Libyan hotel sector

- **CHAPTER 6: HR issues in the Libyan hotel sector**
  - To carry out a critical review of literature to identify HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as to identify alternative models of WFP to inform adaptation of a unified theoretical model

- **CHAPTER 7: Recommendations**
  - To develop a best practice WFA model appropriate to the needs of the Libyan hotel sector
  - To identify HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEI and Government views on these issues
  - To provide recommendations for key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector to help them tackle HR problems facing the sector through a WFP implementation strategy

- **CHAPTER 8: Conclusions**
  - Review of objectives
  - Contribution of the study
  - Limitations
  - Future research
  - Personal reflection
CHAPTER TWO: TOURISM IN LIBYA

2.1 INTRODUCTION  2-3

2.2 THE LIBYAN CONTEXT  2-3
   2.2.1 Location  2-3
   2.2.2 Climate  2-4
   2.2.3 Topography  2-6
   2.2.4 Historic background  2-6
   2.2.5 Population  2-7
   2.2.6 Society and culture  2-8
   2.2.7 Economy  2-10

2.3 NATIONALISATION OF THE PRIVATE SECTOR IN LIBYA  2-13
   2.3.1 Abolition of private sectors  2-14
   2.3.2 Introduction of partnerships (Tasharukit)  2-15
   2.3.3 Reorganisation of the private sector  2-16
   2.3.4 Introduction of partnerships and joint venture companies in private sector  2-16

2.4 EMPLOYMENT AND WAGES LAW  2-17
   2.4.1 Employment law governing employees on contracts  2-18
   2.4.2 Employment law governing annual leave and promotion  2-18
   2.4.3 Employment law governing overtime hours  2-19
   2.4.4 Employment law governing employee’s compensation  2-19
   2.4.5 Employment law governing employee unions  2-20
   2.4.6 Employment law governing civil service  2-20
   2.4.7 Employment law governing salaries  2-21

2.5 IMPACTS OF EMPLOYMENT LAWS: PUBLIC VERSUS PRIVATE SECTORS IN LIBYA  2-23

2.6 TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN LIBYA  2-26
   2.6.1 Libya General People’s Committee for Tourism (GPCT)  2-37
2.7 LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP)

2.7.1 Overview of the LTMP

2.7.2 HRD and tourism training in Libya

2.7.3 Shortcomings of the LTMP

2.8 SUMMARY
CHAPTER TWO: TOURISM IN LIBYA

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter aims to provide a background to Libya’s tourism and hotel sector and its development. The chapter begins with reference to Libya’s geographical location, climate, topography, population and economy (section 2.2). This is followed by a discussion on nationalisation of the private sector in Libya (section 2.3). The evolution of the employment laws and civil service law in various sectors of the Libyan economy and their impact on the Libyan public and private sectors is analysed in detail in sections 2.4 and 2.5. Issues on tourism development in Libya are presented in section 2.6. Finally the chapter presents a review of the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP), highlighting some of its weaknesses in relation to issues pertaining to human resource development in the Libyan hotel sector (section 2.7).

2.2 THE LIBYAN CONTEXT

2.2.1 Location

Libya is located in the North of Africa, bordering the expansive Mediterranean Sea to the North, Egypt to the East, Sudan to the South-east, Chad and Niger to the South, and Algeria and Tunisia to the West (Figure 2.1). It has a coastline of 1770 kilometres (1100 miles), which stretches from Zuwarah in the West to Al-Bardia in the east making it the longest coastline amongst the African countries bordering the Mediterranean (Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), 2006a). Libya covers an area of approximately 1,774, 440 square kilometres, making it the fourth largest country in Africa and seventeenth largest...
in the world (eBizguide, 2006). It is estimated that over 90% of the Libyan land surface is either desert or semi-desert.

2.2.2 Climate

The climatic conditions in Libya are influenced by the Mediterranean Sea and the Sahara desert. The northern part of the country enjoys a Mediterranean climate, warm and sunny weather, with temperatures ranging between 20 and 30 degrees Celsius for the greater part of the year. Also, the country experiences mild winters brought by Mediterranean depressions, particularly in January, when temperatures drop below 8 degrees Celsius. The hill and plateau regions are the wettest areas of the country, receiving an annual rainfall of approximately 600 mm. Beyond a distance of 160 km or less from the coastline, annual rainfall drops below 100 mm.

The Libyan Desert is part of the Great African Sahara. Like other desert areas, the Libyan Desert receives hardly any substantial rainfall. The desert is warm for the most part of the year; with the months of May to September recording the highest temperatures, up to 50 degrees Celsius. Usually, during the months of March to June, the coastal districts of Libya are affected by very hot, dusty winds from the desert, which contribute to dramatic rises in temperature.
Figure 2.1: Map of Libya

2.2.3 Topography

The Libyan land surface largely consists of barren rocky and sandy desert. Along the southern border near Chad rises the rugged mountain range of Tibesti Massif, which contains Libya's highest point, Bette Peak (2,286m; 7,500 feet) (Arab net, 2002). Further south are depressions, extending from east to west. Inside these depressions are many oases, such as Jalu and Jaghbub, and artesian wells. There are no perennial rivers but there are several perennial saline lakes although the coastal plain is often marshy. Coastal lowlands are separated from one another by a pre-desert zone and backed by plateaux with steep, north-facing scarps. Here the land rises to between 2,000 and 3,000 feet above sea level (Arab net, 2002).

2.2.4 Historic background

Several nations, political systems and leaders have left their mark on Libya and its history. For example, in 800 B.C, the Phoenicians arrived from the shores of Lebanon and built several coastal trading centres on the western shore, three of which eventually became major cities. These were Tripoli, Leptis Magna, and Sabrata. Similarly, in the 7th century the Greeks settled on the eastern shore and developed an elaborate system of irrigation, which helped to boost the agricultural sector (Arab net, 2002). They also built five major cities, among them Benghazi and Cerene. Most of these cities became thriving trade and cultural centres and their ruins still depict their previous glory. Then came the Romans around the year 150 B.C., who ruled Libya until the collapse of their empire. Later the Byzantine Empire took over Libya and ruled from the fifth century AD to the seventh century. During this era, Islam was introduced to Libya, and later the country became a part of the Ottoman Empire. Since then, Libya has continued to
maintain its Arabic Islamic identity, although there were several attempts from Christian Europe (the Spanish, the Knights of St. John from Malta who ruled the north western shores for half a century during the sixteenth century and the Italians who invaded the country in the early days of twentieth century) to change it.

Libya was granted independence by a United Nations Resolution in 1949, which was realised within two years. Libyan independence was proclaimed on December 24, 1951, and became a kingdom following the British model. On September 1st 1969 Libya was transformed from a constitutional monarchy into a revolutionary republic.

2.2.5 Population

Libya has a small population for its large territory, with a population density of about 3 people per square kilometre in the northern regions of Tripolitania and Cyrenaica and less than one person per square kilometre elsewhere. Libya is thus one of the least densely-populated nations by area in the world. UN statistics from 2003 show a provisional population figure of 5,551,000 inhabitants (Encyclopedia of the Nations, 2006) with 90% living in less than 10% of the area, mostly along the coast. According to eBizguide (2006) the current population figures are estimated to be close to 6.1 million people. Libya’s population grew at a rate of about 4% per annum during the 1970s and the early 1980s. The present annual growth rate is estimated to be 4.5% (Alqadhafi, 2000). Nearly half of the Libyan population is below fifteen years of age, indicating that Libya is indeed a young society (Alqadhafi, 2000).
2.2.6 Society and culture

The family is extremely important in Libyan society. Social relations are tied to family considerations and family obligations have priority over any other obligations. The issue of the family is a political and economic issue of fundamental importance, for the extended family remains the basic unit of social organization. Indeed, the family provides economic and emotional support to its members, which might consist of groups as small as twenty or as large as 200, for not only mother, father, and children are included in the definition of the family, but also grandparents, uncles, aunts, and cousins, to several degrees on both sides of the marital connection. The Libyan leader, Muammar Aqadhafi sees the family as a kind of organic growth which provides, along with the Qur’an, a basis for the improvement of the human condition in modern times as expressed in his Green Book (Aqadhafi, 1977)

Islam is the state religion and Sunni Muslims comprise about 97 per cent of all Libyans. As a consequence, Libyan society has been strongly influenced by the Islamic religion and Arab culture. The Islamic traditions and practices are based on the teaching of the Qur’an. According to Ibrahim (2004:3-8) the Qur’an in the “most authoritative source of normative Islam”.

Islam recognises women and men as equal partners in the sight of God (Ibrahim, 2004). In support, the study of traditional and modern Islamic texts by Latifi (1997) emphasised equality before God and recognition of personal choices. The Noble Quran

1 The Green Book is a work edited by Colonel Muammer Alqadhafi, the leader of Libya, covering political, economic and social problems and solutions in Libya. The English version was published in 1981.
(cited in Ibrahim 2004: 3-9) provides clear evidence that women are equal to men in the sight of God: “Every person is a pledge for what he has earned”... “So their Lord accepted them”... “Never I will allow to be lost the work of any of you, be he a male or female”.

The Islamic decrees provide social, economic, legal and political rights to women. According to Ibrahim (2004), for example:

- Women have a right to kind treatment by their husband. The Qur’an prohibits physical abuse and violence;
- Women are entitled to independent ownership and possession of property, financial security, inheritance and work. Over and above this, women have a right to own and manage all businesses;
- Women have a right to participate in political agendas, including election and nomination to political offices;
- Women have a right to employment. In Islam work is obligatory and self-reliance is a source of success. Furthermore, the Qur’an encourages everyone to work and discourages unemployment without reason.

Whilst women are afforded a number of rights to employment, marriage, divorce and education, there is evident discrimination against them legally, socially and economically. For example, in Libya women have to follow a strict Islamic dress code at work and indeed elsewhere. A policy of segregation of sexes is observed in prayers, wedding ceremonies and so forth. Women must have written permission from their husbands or their fathers before they can travel. In most cases, women are not allowed
to travel, particularly abroad, without being accompanied by a man. Sonmez (2001) argues that women’s inferior status in Libya and other Muslim countries is legitimised by misinterpretation of the religious text, resulting in barriers to participation in tourism as well as other spheres of activity.

Unlike some Muslim countries, such as Saudi Arabia, women in Libya are allowed to drive cars and to vote. Also, they can stand for parliament. However, according to a report by Agha (2005), girls continue to lag behind boys in education and about 30 percent of Libya females over the age of 15 are illiterate. Again, the report reveals that labour force participation for women is around 22%. Such a low participation of women is attributed to prevailing traditions and cultural practices. Agha (2005:16) asserts that women in Libya “have limited methods to advocate on behalf of women’s rights or change attitudes within society”.

2.2.7 Economy

The Libyan economy is one of the developing economies according to the indicators of the United Nations and international economic and financial organizations (Economist Intelligence Unit (EIU), 2004). The Libyan economy enjoys some peculiarities that distinguish it from other international economies, particularly with regard to the adoption of public capitalism to match the Jamahiriya political regime (i.e. a political regime, which advocated for devolution of powers to the people of Libya). Since 1977, in accordance with the Third Universal Theory expounded in the Green Book, Libya transferred its authority to the General People’s Congress (GPC) which became the
highest legislative body in the State. Furthermore, the Great Socialist People's Libyan Arab Jamahiriya (GSPLAJ) became the official name of Libya.

Moreover, the Libyan economy or the constituents and elements of its national income differ, qualitatively and quantitatively, from other economies. While neighboring countries, such as Algeria, Egypt, Morocco and Tunisia, have substantial agricultural sectors and a well-established industrial base, Libya possesses few of these.

Libya's economy depends primarily upon revenues from the oil sector, which constitutes about 95% of export earnings, about one-quarter of GDP and 60% of public sector wages (CIA, 2006b). These oil revenues coupled with a small population give Libya one of the highest rates of GDP per person in Africa. Libya has indeed made very considerable progress, developing from one of the poorest countries in the world in the 1950s into one whose physical infrastructure compares stander of living favourably with that of its neighbours. Current research (CIA, 2006b) reveals that Libya enjoys an extremely low level of poverty compared to its neighbours. The national economy has made tremendous achievements in various fields as a result of the exploitation of petroleum resources to implement socio-economic projects in areas relating to agricultural and industrial production, energy and roads.

Over the last couple of years Libyan officials have made significant progress on economic reforms as part of a broader campaign to reintegrate the country into the international arena (CIA, 2006b). Lifting of UN sanctions in September 2003 and US unilateral sanctions in April 2004 resulted in increased foreign direct investment, particularly in the energy sector. After the announcement in 2003 that Libya would
abandon its weapons of mass destruction programmes and accept a more stringent weapons inspection than would ordinarily occur for a signatory state of the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty, the Libyan economy began to recover (EIU, 2004). Statistics indicate an increase in GDP from LD 16,902.2 million in 1999 to LD 18,112.0 million in 2001 (Figure 2.2). Moreover, Libya records more favourable growth rates with an estimated 8.5% growth of GDP in 2005 (CIA, 2006b).

**Figure 2.2:** GDP trend, 1999-2001

![GDP Trend Chart](image)

**Source:** General Board of Planning (2002, cited in eBizguide, 2006)

Libya has started to reduce its dependency on oil as the main country’s source of income and to increase investment in other sectors, such as agriculture, tourism, fisheries, mining and natural gas. This is to minimise the risks associated with
international oil price fluctuations (eBizguide, 2006). Currently, agriculture represents about 5% of the total GNP, mainly produced for the domestic market.

2.3 NATIONALISATION OF THE PRIVATE SECTOR IN LIBYA

Despite the important role of the private sector in any country's economy, the private sector in Libya has remained weak (Alqadhafi, 2002). The enactment of different laws over the years has witnessed first the abolition and then the reinstatement of the private sector in Libya. This has had a negative impact on the private sector, including the hotel and tourism sectors. For example, the abolition and reinstatement of the private sector affected the country's stability and as a consequence it was difficult to attract investments. The Libyan private sector, which is commonly referred to as the local sector, was until 1992 limited in size, importance and participation in national economic structures. All economic activities in Libya were subject to the control and management of the government. For example, the public hotels established a company, the Hotels Management Company, which owns and manages most of the hotels in Libya. Some hotels were granted public trading companies to manage them while others were granted to the workers therein, in the frame of collective ownership to manage and operate, being subject to law No. 15 (1981). The private sector was restricted to some activities or marginal services, mainly informal, which represent no great importance to the national economy or the global product.

The next section provides a description of important events (see table 2.1), which took place in the process of nationalising the private sector in Libya.
Table 2.1: Changes in the nationalisation of the private sector in Libya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Main event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Abolition of private cooperatives and companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Abolition of private trading businesses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Introduction of partnership (Tasharikit) as alternatives to private sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Reorganisation of private sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Introduction of partnerships and joint ventures companies in private sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Change in the number of shareholders in the private-joint ventures companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Formation of diverse types of companies, including tourist companies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.3.1 Abolition of the private sectors

In 1979, a Workers’ Revolution occurred upon the instigation and guidance of the political and revolutionary leadership in Libya, which witnessed the nationalization of most of the private economic corporations and companies, as well as the private companies in all service and productive sectors in Libya. The ownership of such corporations was transferred to the Libyan State to public corporations and boards, to General People’s Committees to groups of workers or citizens, or to the society treasury. All workers in the corporations, companies, markets, hotels and secretariats became public employees or workers in the public sector receiving their salaries and wages according to the rules of civil service law No. 55 (1976). No activity remained in the private sector except some handicraft and traditional activities together with private organisations owned by citizens. The Libyan economy became wholly a public economy.
In 1981, all private economic activities were cancelled, especially trading ones. The private economic activities were replaced by what came to be known as cooperative societies, distribution centres and complex markets, all of which were considered public corporations owned by the State, and the workers therein were subject to civil service law and law No. 15 (1981) regarding salaries. It is possible to consider the period from 1979 to 1981 as a transfer of economic activity in Libya totally – without exception, including agricultural, marine, real-estate, housing, hotel, cinematographic and theatre activities – to the public sector, which is known as socialism or people’s capitalism.

2.3.2 Introduction of partnerships (Tasharukit)

Law No. 9 (1985) was issued regarding the rules relating to partnerships, commonly known as Tasharukit. Tasharukit are economic bodies created in the Libyan economic system. They comprise groups of people practising different economic activities who pool their efforts and money together to form a chain of businesses jointly owned by the partners as shares in kind or funds. Tasharukit were created as alternatives to private companies, which were not permitted to operate at that time, based on the socialist guidance in Libyan economic thinking. Tasharukit were considered the cornerstone of labour law and was considered the first aspect among the private sector existence in the Libyan economy.
2.3.3 Reorganisation of the private sector

Law No. 8 (1988) was issued regarding the rules governing economic activities, to reorganize the private sector again. It included a determination of the firms in Libya, which are represented in the following:

- Private activity in all fields;
- Family activity in all fields;
- Partnerships;
- Joint-venture companies, private and public.

By such a law, the private sector rose again to take its status in the Libyan economic structure, though in a limited form. However, such amendments did not take into consideration the increase in wages, salaries or the conditions of labour and workers, but all its interest was focused on the creation of public and private to carry out economic activities, without preparing a suitable climate and environment for such private to work transparently.

2.3.4 Introduction of partnerships and joint venture companies in private sector

Law No. 8 (1988) was amended by virtue of law No. 9 (1992). The amendment was related to the establishment of partnerships and joint-venture companies in the private sector and it allowed the private sector to be organised in an individual form, that is, individual distributors (the trading, industrial, agricultural and private activities), and in a collective form through the family production, partnerships or joint-venture companies.
Law No. 9 (1992) was amended by virtue of the law No. 21 (2003). The amendment was related to organizing the establishment of the private joint-venture companies and it ensured a change in the capital and in the number of shareholders and their possession.

Law No. 21 (2003) was amended by virtue of the law No. 1 (2005), to include new types of economic activity to support the local sector. The law set up a specific new group of firms practicing the economic activity, such as holding companies, real-estate sales and investment companies, tourist companies, aviation companies, economic and consultation services companies.

2.4 EMPLOYMENT AND WAGES LAW
Over the years, the Libyan government has issued different laws governing employment and civil services in various sectors of the economy, including the hotel sector. It must be noted that laws discussed in this section do not exclusively relate to the tourism and hospitality sector, they are uniform across all sectors of the Libyan economy. These laws have had implications for the performance of these sectors, as well as, for their image as employers. For example, law No. 15 (1981) regarding employment, wages and salaries, and regarding job appointment procedures and restrictions, influenced the procedures of employment and employment conditions, duration and lawfulness. Subsequent amendments made to law No. 15 (1981) have negatively affected workers and their wages in both public and private sectors. At one time, housing allowances were either cancelled or decreased, and at another time the workers were denied of promotion for a period of two years.
The main themes of the employment laws, including the year of issue, are summarised in table 2.2. The information presented in the subsequent section was obtained through the analysis of employment and wage laws enacted by the Libyan government over the years.

Table 2.2: Main themes of the Libyan employment laws

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contracts</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual leave and promotion</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overtime</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salaries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.4.1 Employment law governing employees on contracts

On the first of May 1970, law No. 58 (1970) regarding employment was issued. According to its stipulations, the law is applicable to all national and foreign employees working on contracts in all sectors (the public sector, including the general authorities and services, the armed forces, the courts and the police, and the private sector that existed, at the time the law was issued).

2.4.2 Employment law governing annual leave and promotion

The employment law was amended by virtue of law No. 22 (1971), which amended articles 44 and 76 regarding the annual leave of the employee as well as the promotion
of the employee. However, the law did not tackle salaries and wages or the contractual relations between the employer and the employee or the applicable minimum salary.

On June 12th 1986, law No. 11 was issued regarding the entitlement to promotion and annual allowances. All employees were denied of promotion in 1986 and 1987, which meant a reduction in the basic salary for employees.

2.4.3 Employment law governing overtime hours

This law was further amended by virtue of law No. 108 (1971) amending article No. 87 that pertains to the determination of overtime wages earned by the employee against his employment outside official working hours. This amendment was the first to tackle the subject regarding salaries and wages payable to the employee. This was seen as the first positive step towards amending employee salary averages.

This law was amended once again by virtue of law No. 72 (1972) that amended article No. 87. The amendment related to overtime wages given to the employee for his employment outside official working hours and overtime wages given to the employee for his employment during the official holidays or leave. The overtime wages were increased, which motivated employees to dedicate more time to work, particularly during official holidays or leave.

2.4.4 Employment law governing employee’s compensation

Law No. 50 (1972) amended article No.100 (1972), relating to the provision of housing and food to the employees with any form or means provided it was not in cash
compensation under any condition. Despite the fact that this amendment has good social significance, it did not affect the salary averages substantially, since the compensation was not in direct monetary terms.

2.4.5 Employment law governing employee unions

This law was amended once again by virtue of law No. 107 (1975) that amended the fourth chapter relating to unions. This chapter was deleted from the employment law and all employees became partners in the establishments for which they worked. However, this did not justify the abolition of unions and down-playing their important role in improving the nature of work and workers' conditions in general as well as in improving the level of economic and production activity in particular. As a result of the abolition of the unions, employees' negotiating powers for better working conditions was adversely affected.

2.4.6 Employment law governing civil service

On July 14th 1976, law No. 55 (1976) was issued regarding the civil service. This law is applicable to all employees in administrative units and companies and establishments of the Libyan public sectors. According to its stipulations the law is applicable to all national and foreign employees working under contract in all sectors (the public sector including the general authorities and services, the armed forces, courts and police and the private sector that was existing, and organized at the time the law was issued). It was annexed with four tables. Three of them related to the specific groups of the functions. And one was table of the functional grades and the salaries for each grade. This law stipulated that all employees working on contracts should be paid fixed wages
regardless of whether they were working in the private or public sector, including the tourism and hotel sectors. Thus all the sectors, including the hotel sector did not have the freedom to increase salaries to attract highly qualified staff.

2.4.7 Employment law governing salaries

On November 5th 1981, law No. 15 (1981) was issued regarding the salaries of national employees in Libya, based on law No. 55 (1976) regarding the civil service and its amendments. The law set the applicability of its requirements as regards the state employees in all general authorities and services, armed forces, courts, police and the general companies and establishments and similar bodies. It was annexed with ten tables relating to the functional grades and their respective salaries for each of the following:

- Those subject to law No. 15 (1981), i.e. the employees at the general companies or general sector.

- Those subject to the civil service law No. 55 (1976), i.e. the employees in the administrative units of the state:
  - Policemen;
  - Customs guards;
  - Armed forces;
  - Judicial employees;
  - Employees in a Libyan security authority;
  - Employees at the central board for administrative control;
  - Employees at the municipality guards;
• Members of the teaching staff at the universities and higher institutes.

It is important to mention that the economic units in special domains, such as hotels, restaurants, tourism, aviation and parks companies and contracting companies that are managed by the state are also subject to the provisions of the civil service law and the provisions of the salaries law.

Law No. 5 (1985) was issued regarding the amendment of the provisions of law No. 15 (1981) related to salaries. The amendment addressed the ten salaries tables mentioned above, as regards the order of the functional grades and the functional scale of the grades in the sectors included under the law No. 15 and the law No. 55. In other words, the amendment was made to the functional grades and scales without changes in salaries. Thus, the amendment did not address the value of the annual salaries of the employees that remained at the same value as that astral stipulated in the law of year 1981. The lack of increment in salaries affected the image of these sectors, particularly the tourism and hotels sector as employers. As a result, the majority of qualified candidates chose to work in other sectors with additional benefits other than salaries, such as the oil sector.

On June 12th 1986, law No. 13 (1986) was issued regarding the amendment of some provisions of law No. 15 (1981) (specifically Article Fourteen). The law however, did not address the salaries table annexed with law No. 15. The amendment was made to the housing allowance, which was reduced to approximately half, thus reducing the basic salary of the employee and its annexed advantages or allowances.
Chapter Two: Tourism in Libya

It is worth mentioning that civil service law, labour law and salaries law in Libya was governed by economic activities and laws in force in Libya, in addition to the economic orientations determined in the enlargement of the collective ownership base and the prevention of capitalism.

2.5 IMPACT OF EMPLOYMENT LAWS: PUBLIC VERSUS PRIVATE SECTORS IN LIBYA

Law No. 1 (1987) related to temporary appointments, and its executive regulation was issued by virtue of the decision of the General People’s Committee No. 573 (1987). The law allowed public companies and corporations to appoint national workers by virtue of employment contracts with salaries not subject to the law No. 15 (1981). The wages and salaries paid to the workers are evaluated by this law according to both parties’ willing agreement (public companies or corporations and employees). However the law was advantageous to the public sector, since the contracting period was limited to two years and non-renewable. Initially, (i.e. before the enactment of Law No. 1 1987), the contracting period was considered “indefinite” and worker would remain on contract until he or she was due for retirement. This condition made it difficult for organisations to get rid of unproductive employees.

On October 2\textsuperscript{nd} 1988, a decision made by the General People’s Committee No. 628 (1988) regarding foreigners’ employment determined the conditions for employing foreign workers in the public sector and administrative units of the State. However, on
March 2\textsuperscript{nd} 1989, another decision was issued by the General People’s Committee No. 260 (1989) regarding some employment restrictions. This decision encouraged all the employment to be done in agreement with the regulations stated in the law No. 15 (1981). This change of decision made matters worse, as overseas workers’ salaries were to be based on the government law No. 15 (1981). As a result most of the overseas workers either returned to their home countries or switched to the private sector. As a consequence, the public sector suffered, in all economic, productive and service fields as well as in industrial, agricultural, tourist and hotel sectors.

Further, on April 30\textsuperscript{th} 1991, a decision was issued by the General People’s Committee No. 340 regarding employment restrictions in both individual and partnership economic activities. Such a decision, reflected the reality of the situation between employees in the individual and partnerships activities and the employers, after having issued the law No. 9 (1985) regarding partnerships. The partnerships, whether operating in the productive or service economic activity, were not employing national workers. Instead the majority of their workers were mainly foreigners from other Arabic countries.

On November 9\textsuperscript{th} 1991, a decision was issued by the General People’s Committee No. 931 (1991) regarding contracting rules for workers in the public bodies (the Libyan public sector). In its first article, the law allowed for general administrative units and public companies and corporations to contract with some of their workers to perform special works by virtue of employment contracts provided that each contracting worker was considered to be on unpaid leave from the employer. This gave the employee an opportunity to benefit financially during this contracting period. However, the employee
was denied annual allowances and periodic promotions according to the rules of the law No. 55 (1976). According to the Law No 55 (1976) an employee is entitled to promotion after every four years. However, if an employee accepts a contract with another company or organisations which require him or her to take unpaid leave from the employer, then he or she is not entitled to immediate promotion once he or she is back with the employer.

Law No. 31 (1994) has been issued to resolve some rules related to the National Service and the employment of the workforce. It is the law that enlarged the employment base in public companies and corporations, although it did not give any new guidance regarding wages and salaries.

In conclusion, it can be stated that the law No. 15 (1981) regarding salaries is applied to all workers in the companies and corporations of the Libyan public sector, under any form or in any activity, or in any public body among those practicing economic activity in Libya. However, the law damaged the Libyan public sector which was controlling the course of economic activity in Libya for a long time, yet it was representing the only sector for several years, where all companies operating in the field of agriculture, industry, internal trading, construction, contracting, banks, tourism, hotels, services, distribution, external trading, aviation, transport, communications, education or health were owned managed or supervised, by the government.
2.6 TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN LIBYA

According to eBizguide (2006), Libyan tourist areas can be broadly classified into three, namely: (1) Coastal Area Tourism, which includes beaches and the sea, old architectural cities, historical cities and Islamic landmarks (Plates 2.1 and 2.2); (2) Desert Tourism, which includes a variety of natural desert sites, a huge treasury of pre-historic arts, agricultural and developmental structures in villages and settlements in oases areas, and fascinating culture and folklore in oases and desert cities; (3) Mountain Tourism, which includes beautiful natural resources, distinguished culture, architecture, historical arts and unique civil constructions.

Plate 2.1: Akokess Mounts (Othman, 2007)
One unique tourism attraction is the great man-made river, which is considered the largest irrigation system in the world, where water is carried through pipelines stretching thousands of kilometres from basins in the south east of Libya to the north of the country for domestic and agricultural purposes.

However, for many decades, despite the presence of diverse tourism attractions, the Libyan tourism industry remained rudimentary and unknown to potential market sources. For example, Millington (2001:52) observes that some of the most exciting tourist sites on the coast “have been untouched by tourism and have only in relatively recent years been uncovered, being preserved under desert sands for centuries”. According to Hosni (2000) this was partly due to the country’s lengthy absence from the world stage during the international embargo and the lack of real political will to develop this sector of the economy. The Libyan government was implicated in two
airline bombings in the late 1980s: the 1988 bombing of Pam Am Flight 103 over Lockerbie, Scotland, that killed 270 people, and the 1989 bombing of a French UTA airline over the Niger desert, which killed 170. Consequently, the United Nations (UN) imposed a number of sanctions on Libya to press Tripoli to hand over two suspects wanted for trial in connection with the bombings. The sanctions included a ban on military sales, air communication and certain oil equipment. Libya’s assets abroad were frozen and measures put in place to prohibit transfers of money or assets to the Libyan government or its agents.

A closer look at some of the existing statistics (tables 2.3 and 2.4), which indicate the tourism and hotel sector contribution to the Gross National Product (GNP) from 1986 to 2002, reveals that the percentage of local product for the hotel sector of the national economy does not exceed 2.25% of the GNP throughout the years, whether the local product is evaluated by fixed prices or by current prices.
### Table 2.3: \( \text{Gross National Product (GNP) with the cost of the income factors with fixed prices, 1986-2002 (Million LD)} \)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotels and Restaurants</td>
<td>127.3</td>
<td>129.9</td>
<td>132.5</td>
<td>135.2</td>
<td>139.4</td>
<td>145.2</td>
<td>152.9</td>
<td>281.4</td>
<td>274.8</td>
<td>282.0</td>
<td>265.6</td>
<td>261.0</td>
<td>265.6</td>
<td>284.0</td>
<td>277.9</td>
<td>305.5</td>
<td>339.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Product</td>
<td>11367.8</td>
<td>9696.5</td>
<td>10431.4</td>
<td>11182.4</td>
<td>11598.4</td>
<td>12752.2</td>
<td>12731.0</td>
<td>12980.2</td>
<td>12986.2</td>
<td>13106.3</td>
<td>13620.3</td>
<td>13800.5</td>
<td>13861.2</td>
<td>13875.8</td>
<td>14135.7</td>
<td>14583.2</td>
<td>15073.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage %</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>2.09</td>
<td>2.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variation Rate %</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+0.22</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
<td>+0.06</td>
<td>+0.97</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
<td>+0.03</td>
<td>-0.20</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>+0.03</td>
<td>+0.13</td>
<td>-0.08</td>
<td>+0.12</td>
<td>+0.18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Data from the Ministry of Economics, Libya, 2002

### Table 2.4: \( \text{Gross National Product (GNP) with the cost of the income factors with current prices, 1986-2002 (Million LD)} \)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotels and Restaurants</td>
<td>87.2</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>87.6</td>
<td>93.4</td>
<td>107.7</td>
<td>133.0</td>
<td>144.4</td>
<td>160.3</td>
<td>179.4</td>
<td>201.1</td>
<td>229.9</td>
<td>261.0</td>
<td>283.1</td>
<td>305.9</td>
<td>303.3</td>
<td>338.8</td>
<td>376.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Product</td>
<td>6960.7</td>
<td>6011.6</td>
<td>6186.0</td>
<td>7191.0</td>
<td>8246.9</td>
<td>8757.3</td>
<td>9231.9</td>
<td>9137.7</td>
<td>9670.8</td>
<td>10672.3</td>
<td>12327.3</td>
<td>13800.5</td>
<td>12610.6</td>
<td>14075.2</td>
<td>17775.4</td>
<td>17640.7</td>
<td>24981.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage %</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>2.24</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>1.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variation Rate %</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+0.18</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
<td>+0.21</td>
<td>+0.04</td>
<td>+0.21</td>
<td>+0.11</td>
<td>+0.02</td>
<td>-0.02</td>
<td>+0.03</td>
<td>+0.35</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>-0.46</td>
<td>+0.21</td>
<td>-0.41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Data from the Ministry of Economics, Libya, 2002
This confirms the marginality of the hotel and tourism sector in the Libyan economy and the constancy of the income resulting from the sector activity indicates the stagnancy of the sector for many years.

Similarly, table 2.5, which represents employment averages in the tourism and hotel sector between the years 1986 and 1998, shows that the employment average does not exceed 6% of the total employment in all economic activities, whether productive or service or others. These statistics also show a pattern of stagnation in employment, indicating clearly that tourism and hotel activity did not attract any new projects due to the non-introduction of any new employees to the sector. The figures evidence that this sector did not witness any type of development or upgrading or new investments.
**Table 2.5:** Employment in the Libyan hotel sector in relation to total employment, 1986-2002 (‘000’)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotels and Restaurants</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>53.7</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>61.3</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>64.1</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Employment</td>
<td>433.5</td>
<td>1018.6</td>
<td>1012.5</td>
<td>1045.2</td>
<td>1113.6</td>
<td>1149.0</td>
<td>1185.5</td>
<td>1224.0</td>
<td>1255.1</td>
<td>1323.7</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage %</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variation Rate %</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+0.2</td>
<td>+0.5</td>
<td>+0.1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+0.1</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+: means missing data

**Source:** Data from the Ministry of Economics, Libya, 2002
However, over the last few years, the Libyan government has increased its efforts to diversify its economy from one based almost exclusively on oil exports to one which is more balanced and less reliant on the oil sector. One of the most promising economic development options for Libya is the tourism industry. Consequently, the Libyan economic policy has been shifting towards a tourism development strategy (Hosni, 2000).

Efforts to obtain reliable data on the actual performance of the Libyan tourism industry have been hampered by the scarcity of information. Furthermore, Millington (2001) argues that although the People’s Committee for Tourism is responsible for collecting data on tourism, it does not have properly-established data collection and identification procedures. However, the existing statistics on international tourist arrivals indicate an increasing trend in tourist numbers (Figure 2.3).

According to the World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC) (2003) the Libyan tourism industry is expected to grow and gradually become more prominent within the Libyan economy (Figure 2.4), taking into consideration Libya’s improved relations with the outside world, particularly with the West. However, for Libya to witness considerable growth in tourism as estimated by the WTTC (2003), Millington (2001) suggests that the Libyan government needs to address a range of issues relating to visa requirements, exchange rates, hospitality and accommodation facilities. Furthermore, Millington (2001:61) asserts that Libya offers unique and fascinating attractions and “for most countries in Europe, it can be considered as a short-haul destination”.
Figure 2.3: International tourist arrivals in Libya, 1994-2000 (‘000’)

Source: Millington (2001:55)

Besides, WTO (2003:S/3) asserts that a significant opportunity exists in which the Libyan tourism sector may develop such that it:

- assists the State to achieve overall national economic and social development objectives;
- presents a product that will minimise any social and environmental disruption;
- will be high-profile in character and will stimulate the creation of a positive image for the country;
- will avoid the mistakes made by a number of other tourist destinations, providing that the setting and design of new facilities does not have a negative environmental impact;
- is meaningful in terms of market requirements.
Chapter Two: Tourism in Libya

Figure 2.4: Libyan estimates and forecasts


The organisational framework of the Libyan tourism industry dates back to the late 1960s. In 1968, the first Tourism Ministry was established through Royal Act Number 44, setting out its organisational structure and activities, which included; welcoming and facilitating incoming tourists; classification of hotels, guesthouses, restaurants and other tourist establishments; granting of exemptions to foreign investors to own capital assets in the country; security and safety for tourism locations; setting out licensing laws for all tourist activities; control of the employment procedures within the tourism industry; approval of price lists in tourism establishments.

In 1989, the Libyan General Board for Tourism (GBT) was established. This body was responsible for promoting the tourism industry locally and internationally, carrying out statistical surveys, issuing licenses, classifying all tourism establishments and
supervising tourism training institutions. Later, in spring 1996, the Libyan Government announced that it intended to invest US $1,700 million in tourism-industry infrastructure and promotion up to the year 2000. Its five-year plan was aimed at: establishing a special investment company; creating a new bank and a firm to handle the purchasing of equipment and other supplies; setting up a transport operator and marketing agency; producing a hotel-staff training scheme; organizing a range of festivals; arranging participation at national and international trade fairs; opening tourism-promotion offices in foreign countries (Hosni, 2000). Furthermore, the Libyan authorities, through Decree 2.2 (1998), set up the Office for the Development of Tourism and Investment (ODTI), which was directly answerable to the General Peoples’ Committee, established in 1995. While the ODTI was mandated with the responsibility of promoting national treasures (archaeological sites, exhibitions, etc.) and using tourism earnings to put an appropriate infrastructure in place, the General People’s Committee was to establish a comprehensive strategy and an implementation plan to further develop the tourism industry. Figure 2.5 illustrates the structure of the Libyan tourism sector.
From the onset of the year 2003, a newly-formed General People’s Committee for Tourism (GPCT) took over the work of the General board for Tourism (GBT). However, one of the fundamental achievements of GBT was the completion of the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP).
2.6.1 Libya General People’s Committee for Tourism (GPCT)

The GPCT was established under Act 4/2003 by the General People’s Committee (Prime Ministry) to re-organise the General People’s Committee. This Act was followed by Act 10/2003 to replace the General Board for Tourism and Antiquities (GBTA), and Act 52/2003 for the organisational structure of GPTC. Act 10/2003 states that GPCT replaces the GBTA with all its assets and liabilities, Act 52/2003 lays out the organisational structure of GPCT and its departments as well as the duties and responsibilities of each of those departments within GPCT. Act 52/2003 lists the objectives of the GPCT, which refer to the human resource developments, including:

1. To prepare and implement a comprehensive strategic plan for tourism in the country;
2. To follow-up the implementation of the Tourism Master Plan, and to evaluate - in co-ordination with other parties - its progress during the last five years;
3. Attractions as a tourist destination both inside and outside the country;
4. To encourage research and programmes necessary to develop the tourism industry;
5. To identify all tourist development zones and prepare plans on how best to develop them to become tourist attractions;
6. To supervise all projects related to the tourism sector;
7. To grant customs and excise exemptions as well as tax exemptions for projects within the sector according to the law;
Chapter Two: Tourism in Libya

8. To set conditions on personnel and companies working in the tourism industry, which include tour operators; travel agents; hotels; guest houses; restaurants; tourist villages; tourist camps; tourist transportation and tourist guides;

9. To grant licences to all personnel and companies working and /or wishing to work in the tourism industry;

10. To classify all tourist utilities;

11. To develop local crafts and encourage participation by all parties interested in it;

12. To encourage the participation of the private sector both nationally and internationally in tourism projects and to ease problems that might arise and hinder their participation;

13. To prepare training and development programmes in all aspects of the tourism and related activities.

The public sector organisations involved in running the Libyan tourism industry under the GPCT include:

- Antiquities Authority;
- Craftsman Development Board;
- Tourism Investment and Promotion Board;
- Other public companies established under their authority.

The organisational structure of GPCT includes (see figure 2.6):

- General department for planning, investment and follow-up;
- General department for tourism services;
- General department for tourism product development;
- General department for administrative and financial affairs;
- Bureau for legal affairs;
- Bureau for relations and co-operation;
- Bureau for tourism information and documentations;
- Bureau for committee affairs.

**Figure 2.6:** Organisational structure of the new Libyan Ministry of Tourism

**Source:** Libyan government (1998)
2.7 LIBYAN TOURISM MASTER PLAN (LTMP)

2.7.1 Overview of the LTMP

It is well-known that the tourism industry plays an important role in national economies (ODI, 2006). For example, tourism constitutes more than 10% of total exports for most countries, particularly in Africa. WTO (2003) statistics indicate that tourism contributes 23.4%, 17.6% and 26.7% of total exports for Egypt, Tunisia and Morocco, respectively (ODI, 2006). Moreover, tourism is labour-intensive and employs millions of people in both formal and informal sections worldwide. According to Roe and Khanyan (2001) tourism employs approximately 200 million people. Tourism also stimulates investments in different economic sectors, such as infrastructure, as well as generating much-needed government revenues through taxes and fees. These facts justify the need for different countries to embrace tourism development.

Driven by the expected socio-economic benefits accrued from tourism, the Libyan government started to look for ways to improve its tourism industry. The first step taken by the Libyan government towards improving the tourism industry was to develop a general LTMP with the help of WTO (Libyan Government, 1998). The main mission of the LTMP was to:

*Provide the Great Socialist People’s Libyan Arab Jamahiriya with a realistic and implementable base for the development of the sector through the establishment and promulgation of a policy framework, short and long-term objectives.*

(Libyan Government, 1998:i)

To facilitate the improvement of the performance of the tourism sector in Libya, the LTMP addressed the following areas:
• Strategic framework;
• Product development;
• Implementation framework;
• Marketing;
• Human resource development;
• Awareness programmes;
• Impacts of the sector.

The main problems faced by Libyan tourism, which have prevented development over the years, include its poor international image and difficulties caused by the international air embargo. These problems were made worse by the:

\textit{inherent structural exacerbated weaknesses that exist within the institutional framework that underpins the tourism sector and in the general lack of training in tourism-related activities.}

(WTO, 1998: S/4)

It was therefore expected that for Libyan tourism to grow, there was an urgent need to address issues concerning human resources.

Thus the following section provides an analysis of human resource development and tourism training issues in Libya, highlighting how they have been addressed in the LTMP.
2.7.2 HRD and tourism training in Libya

Generally, a well-trained and skilled workforce is vital for the development of tourism. Furthermore, the quality of service provided by any destination’s tourism staff to visitors is important in developing a highly competitive destination as well as in gaining market share (Reisinger and Waryszak, 1994; Johns and Lee-Ross, 1997; Nadiri and Hussain, 2005).

Generally, HEIs in Libya fall under the frame of vocational or intermediate education, and higher institutions of education, i.e. the second and third tier of the educational pyramid (see figure 2.7). However, graduates from such institutes are treated similarly to those holding bachelor and licentiate degrees (academic qualifications) when appointed for the first time and their salary is calculated according to the rules of civil service law No. 55 (1976) and salaries law No. 15 (1981).
At the moment, Libya has three main institutes specialising in tourism and hospitality training (see appendix 1):

(i) The Hotel Professions Institute in Tripoli, which was established in 1990 and serves the population of the western side of Libya;

(ii) The Hotel Professions Institute in Misurata, which was established in 1995 and serves the population of the central part of Libya;

(iii) The Hotel Professions Institute in Shahat, which was founded in 1992 and serves the population of the eastern side of Libya.
Training in these institutions lasts for about two years or four semesters, after which the students graduate with a High Diploma in Hostelry with one of the following specializations: Lodging Management or Catering Management.

1. Lodging Management

Table 2.6: Lodging Management courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semesters</th>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Number Credit-Hours approved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semester 1</td>
<td>Principles of Administration</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Front Offices I</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotel Procurement I</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 2</td>
<td>Principles of Hotel Management</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Front Offices II</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotel Procurement II</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 3</td>
<td>Front Offices III</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotel Procurement III</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 4</td>
<td>Front Offices IV</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotel Procurement IV</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: HEIs, 2004
2. Catering Management

Table 2.7: Catering Management courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semesters</th>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Number Credit-Hours approved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semester 1</td>
<td>Principles of Administration</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food Production I</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering Service I</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 2</td>
<td>Principles of Hotel Management</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism and Archaeology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food Production II</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering Service II</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 3</td>
<td>Principles of Accounting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering Control</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food Production III</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering Service III</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 4</td>
<td>Hotel Accounting</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Individual Affairs</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food Production IV</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering Service IV</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: HEIs, 2004
In addition to sector-specific subjects, students are also taught other courses, including Arabic, English, social education, political awareness and human sciences. The number of credit-hours approved for the hotel specialized subjects represents about 65% of the total credits approved for study in the Lodging Department, while the number of credit-hours approved for the hotel specialized subjects represents about 60% of the total credits approved for study in the Catering Department.

It is important to mention that the number of institutions specialising in hospitality training is quite low and they tend to attract low numbers of students. For example, although the number of institutions specialising in manufacturing professions and hostelry profession are the same, the former attracts more than double the number of students attracted by the latter (Table 2.6). However, the estimated growth in the Libyan tourism industry is expected to place significant demand on the human resource capacity and therefore should create a greater demand for hospitality training. WTTC (2003) estimates indicate that Libyan tourism is likely to create 42.1 million jobs by the year 2013 (Figure 2.8).
### Table 2.8: Education and training institutions in Libya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of education and training</th>
<th>Number of educational and training institutions</th>
<th>Percentage of total institutions</th>
<th>Number of students joining them</th>
<th>Percentage of total students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multi-disciplinary professions</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
<td>11070</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing professions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.03%</td>
<td>3022</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electric profession</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>990</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial technology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>538</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooling and air-conditioning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering professions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>1741</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer technology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>2140</td>
<td>0.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic professions</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>1116</td>
<td>0.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional safety</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>502</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial and administrative professions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
<td>3842</td>
<td>6.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitality education institutions (HEIs)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.03%</td>
<td>1292</td>
<td>0.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers preparation</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>47.5%</td>
<td>25518</td>
<td>44.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trainers preparation</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
<td>5787</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>57780</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** General People's Committee for Education and Vocational Formation, Education and Training Progress in Libya (1999)

Should these estimates by WTTC (2003) be achieved, the demand for skilled and experienced staff will increase and the demand for well-trained new entrants into the industry will increase. This situation, therefore, places the need for all stakeholders in
the tourism industry to ensure that there are sufficient numbers of trained personnel at all levels to deliver internationally required standards.

**Figure 2.8:** Employment estimates and forecast, 2003-2013

![Employment estimates and forecast, 2003-2013](image)

**Source:** WTTC (2003)

The surveys undertaken as part of the field research for the LTMP development indicated that there were 5,069 people employed in tourist accommodation and travel agency/tour operations (Figure 2.9). Other people were employed in planning, marketing and administering tourism at a national level.
Figure 2.9: Tourism workforce in Libya

![Tourism workforce in Libya](image)

Source: Libyan government (1998)

While the majority of the employees in tourist accommodation were foreigners, the majority of employees in travel agency/tour operations were Libyans. This difference was attributed partly to a shortage of skilled Libyans and a reluctance on the part of the Libyans to work in service jobs such as waiting-staff or room attendants.

The LTMP estimates increase of approximately 80% in the demand for people to work in tourist accommodation to meet the needs of future development by the year 2018 (figure 2.10)
Figure 2.10: Incremental staffing requirements, 1998-2018

Source: Libyan government (1998)

Moreover, LTMP estimates an increase in room requirements from 4620 in 2003 to 9600 in 2018 (Figure 2.11).
Despite the predicted increase in room requirements and personnel demand, the Libyan hotel sector continues to suffer from human resource development problems, including:

- Few mechanisms for further development;
- Stiff competition faced by Libyan job-seekers, from highly experienced foreign workers;
- Distortion of salary levels by foreign nationals who are prepared to take very low wages;
- Lack of institutional capacity to plan effectively for tourism growth, to analyse the impact of tourism and to monitor its quality.
Again, a close examination of the tourism training institutions revealed major weaknesses in education delivery. Some of the weaknesses mentioned in the LTMP include:

1. Lack of consistency in curriculum delivery and heavy reliance on foreign curricula;
2. Lack of in-service training for teachers;
3. Few Libyan teaching staff;
4. Insufficient practical training;
5. Lack of teaching materials and practical training facilities;
6. Outdated teaching methods ("the chalk and talk" approach), which do not encourage active participation of the students;
7. Lack of on-the-job training.

These shortcomings in the tourism training institutions have resulted in poor quality graduates, which impact negatively on the quality of services offered in most of the tourism establishment and in particular, hotels. In its attempts to address these problems, the LTMP proposed:

1. Long-term and short-term programmes geared towards tourism human resource training and development;
2. Training for groups of people to be instructors in tourism and other related fields;
3. The establishment of tourism institutes, committees and training centres.

Again, putting into consideration some of the long-term training needs, which include developing a training culture within the tourism sector, strengthening the national training capacity and institutional strengthening, LTMP proposed the formulation of a
national HRD strategy, which would guide all those institutions involved in providing some sort of training, both formal and informal. The main focus areas for the national HRD strategy included creating a training culture, enhancing professional standards and developing quality training (Figure 2.12).

**Figure 2.12:** The national HRD plan proposed in the LTMP

Source: Libyan government (1998)

Though each of these focus areas required different implementation actions as outlined in the LTMP (1998:8/14-8/15), the ultimate effectiveness of a national education and training programme was thought to depend on five main components (LTMP, 1998:8/16):
1. The strengthening of current training provision;
2. The establishment of monitoring procedures for current provision;
3. The introduction of management training;
4. The development of on-the-job training as an integral part of business;
5. The creation of a hotel and tourism training committee to implement these recommendations.

However, it is worth acknowledging the fact that LTMP preparation and development process was hampered by several limitations, some of which included:

1) Severe lack of data related to tourism in Libya, which was attributed to:
   - Disinterest in establishing a database for a long period;
   - Heavy reliance on oil exportation, thus neglecting the need to look for an alternative source, including tourism.

2) Tourism development was limited to construction of hotels, i.e. dwelling hotels.

3) The opening of borders for Arabs and other Africans without an appropriate registration and residence follow-up system made it difficult to set up a database to plan for the future.

4) The available tourist data consisted of information on visitor arrivals and departures, in which the Arabs and Africans entering the country were considered to be tourists, although the majority were job-seekers. For example, according to a government report (2004) the total number of arrivals was 999,343 out of which 853,444 were Arabs and Africans.
5) The restrictive procedures for foreigners’ entry, including the translation of passports into Arabic as a precondition for entry and the requirement to obtain a visa prior to entry led to an increased unwillingness to visit Libya. Previous studies indicate that the majority of visitors to Libya were mainly merchants who were on business trips, mostly at the invitation of the Libyan private sector.

6) Libya was subject for a long period to sanctions, thus leading to an interruption in the flow of tourism information during that period.

2.7.3 Shortcomings of the LTMP

Despite the efforts made by the consultants to produce the LTMP under the above mentioned limitations, critical analysis of the plan revealed some important shortcomings:

1) The plan tries to avoid the shortage in tourist information and data by using the expression “estimated by the consultant”, without referring to any scientific bases used in making these estimates. Generally, all the consultants’ estimates involve personal factors and are therefore weak.

2) In some of the estimates the consultants rely on projecting some criteria applied in other countries, which are different in terms of tourism development, on Libya (for example the use of direct and indirect employment criteria in clause 8/1, and its comparison with what is mentioned in table 8/2 see appendix 2).

3) Though employees’ working conditions are vital in human resource management, the plan does not give significant attention to such issues. Nonetheless, the pressure to improve efficiency and production must be balanced with the need for quality of life for tourism workers.
4) Certainly, the majority of workers in the hotel sector, particularly in the low level jobs, were from overseas countries. However, the plan neither elaborated nor suggested the way forward with regard to employment of foreign workers.

5) Though on-the-job training is a way of ensuring that employees enhance their skills and are able to meet the ever-changing customer demands, there is a danger of transforming tourists into test mice (i.e. specimens). Thus much emphasis should be laid on recruiting qualified personnel and then embarking on upgrading their skills to satisfy the potential demands and to develop their careers in the industry.

6) Though poor education delivery in HEIs was mentioned as one of the major problems confronting the Libyan tourism industry, issues concerning the monitoring of education standards were not given much attention in the plan. Furthermore, concerns on curriculum review and practical training so as to ensure that the graduates match the changing tourism trends was also downplayed.

7) Most importantly, the plan ignored the reality that human planning and development in the tourism and hotel sector should be linked to an analysis of the needs of the tourism structures and the level of training of the graduates from different HEIs and colleges. Thus, it can be argued that the plan did not take into consideration concerns about the actual and projected number of graduates, their qualifications and the demand for each area of specialization.

8) Though the plan provides labour market estimates and forecasts for the years 2003-2018, it does not provide estimates of staffing levels and competencies
required to enable the tourism industry, particularly the hotel sector, to meet its future needs and to guide employee recruitment, training and retraining processes.

Commenting further on the above LTMP shortcomings, particularly in relation to human resource planning and development, it can be argued that existing human resource problems, particularly in relation to the shortages of skills in the Libyan workforce, are unlikely to be addressed unless an appropriate workforce planning model is developed and implemented.

2.8 SUMMARY

For many years, the public sector dominated economic activities in Libya, under the umbrella of socialist change. The public sector provided for all the needs of society as well as planning, implementing and financing all the development programmes. Consequently, the Libyan private sector was abolished. However, in 2003, the Libyan government began to put in place measures to re-organise the private sector. To date, the Libyan private sector is still weak.

The Libyan government has increased its efforts to diversify its economy from one based almost exclusively on oil exports to one which is more balanced. One of the most promising economic development options for Libya is the tourism industry. According to the WTTC (2003) the Libyan tourism industry is expected to grow and gradually become more prominent within the Libyan economy. Furthermore, the LTMP estimates an approximate 80% increase in the demand for people to work in tourist establishments to meet the needs of future tourism development. However, the Libyan tourism sector,
especially the hotel sector has been hampered by serious problems relating to human resource development, which have impacted negatively on the overall performance of the sector.

The next chapter presents a literature review of human resource management, with particular emphasis on human resource management and development in the hotel sector. It will move the discussion on further to explore different workforce planning models with the aim of constructing an initial workforce planning model, which will be used by the researcher to assess its appropriateness of WFP in the Libyan hotel context. The final workforce planning model (i.e. best practice workforce planning model) is thought to provide the way forward to solving the human resource problems facing the Libyan hotel sector in particular, and the Libyan tourism industry in general, by recruiting the right people in the right place at the right time.
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 INTRODUCTION

3.2 HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT (HRM)
   3.2.1 HRM: A historical perspective
   3.2.2 What exactly is HRM?
   3.2.3 Importance of HRM

3.3 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (HRD)
   3.3.1 HRD: A historical perspective
   3.3.2 Definitions of HRD
   3.3.3 Importance of HRD for destination development

3.4 HRM AND HRD ISSUES IN THE TOURISM AND HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY
   3.4.1 Tourism and Hospitality: A service sector
   3.4.2 Service quality
   3.4.3 Human resource issues in international tourism

3.5 WOMEN IN THE HOSPITALITY SECTOR WORKFORCE

3.6 WORKFORCE PLANNING
   3.6.1 Definitions of workforce planning
   3.6.2 Importance of workforce planning
   3.6.3 Strategy and workforce planning
   3.6.4 Workforce planning models
   3.6.6 Workforce analysis in hotel sector

3.7 SUMMARY
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter considers human resource management (HRM) and its role in the tourism and hospitality industry. Section 3.2 charts the historical development, importance and definitions of HRM. Section 3.3 centres on human resource development (HRD) – an extension of HRM – and its importance. Section 3.4 explores HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry, in addition to the role of service quality in achieving competitiveness in the tourism and hospitality industry. These issues are categorised into three main areas: issues related to the labour market which encompasses skills gaps, skills shortages, turnover, and retention; education and training issues including curriculum, qualifications and links with industry; attitudes towards tourism and hospitality careers which comprise the image of the tourism and hospitality industry, low pay, leakage, and career status. This chapter also provides general background to workforce planning and explores existing models (section 3.5) leading to the adaptation of a unified theoretical framework for workforce planning (WFP). which was adopted as a framework for the semi-structured interviews with Libyan stakeholders the results of which will be presented in chapters 5 and 6.
3.2. HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT (HRM)

3.2.1 HRM: A historical perspective

This section briefly traces the origins and development of HRM. The roots of people management can be traced back to the Industrial Revolution in England in the late 18th century (Tyson and York, 1996). However, it became more obvious after the Second World War (1939-45), when the demand for labour and personnel specialists increased. The origins of personnel management date from the early interventions of high profile social reformers, such as Lord Shaftesbury and Robert Owen (Stredwick, 2000), who were concerned with the exploitation of factory workers. There was a strong emphasis on discipline and employees’ health and welfare, as their personal living standards were being compromised, leading to inefficiencies and low production. Shaftesbury’s and Owen’s focus was on improving working conditions as they believed that if employees were treated humanely and rewarded fairly, their productivity would increase and they would work more effectively (Stredwick, 2000).

The period after 1945 witnessed significant changes in industrial relations. There was a breakdown of national-level bargaining through employers’ federations. This resulted in an increase in productivity bargaining as employers and unions negotiated shares in wealth gained from improvements in technology (Tyson and York, 1996). Large companies developed their own industrial relations in line with their overall corporate strategy. Many organisations started to employ full-time employees and the spread of ideas and specialisations formed the basis for personnel management as an occupation in its own right (Tyson and York, 1996).
In the last quarter of a century, HRM has become a major component of business study courses and is rapidly becoming a dominant focus of management research (Lewin, 1991; Storey, 1992; Kauftnan 1993). It has almost universally displaced personnel management and, in many business schools, is threatening to replace industrial relations (IR) and organisational behaviour (Marciano, 1995). Schuler (1998) mentions that in the 1970s, the term “human resource management” replaced the term “personnel management” and there has been considerable debate over whether HRM is no more than just a re-labelling of personnel management - the “old wine in new bottles” (Legge, 1989) critique- or whether the change of label signifies a more fundamental change (Legge, 1989; Gennard and Kelly, 1997).

3.2.2 What exactly is HRM?

HRM has increasingly been viewed from different perspectives (Luoma, 2000). Whilst personnel management traditionally included the management of people and was seen to be focussing on the activities of personnel professionals, the new term HRM reflects a broader perspective which includes issues such as health and safety, the strategic role of employees and how organisations can achieve competitive advantage by reducing stress and increasing employee satisfaction (Redman and Wilkinson, 2001). Schuler (1998) adds that HRM is used to acknowledge the importance of employees as corporate assets, as their skills, knowledge, and experiences have an economic value to an organisation because they enable the organisation to be more productive and adaptable. Moreover employees, like other assets, have a high value in the marketplace; however, their potential value can only be realized with their co-operation.
In the literature there are a number of definitions of HRM. One example is that provided by Schuler (1998: 4):

*Human Resource Management is about managing people in organisations as effectively as possible for the good of the employees, the company and society...Managing human resources is a vital function in organizations; it engages everyone and it takes time.*

Torrington and Hall (1987: 44) suggest that “HRM is the process, which involves a central philosophy of the way that people in the organisation are managed and the translation of this into personnel policies and practices”. Stone and Meltz (1988) describe HRM as the process of organising and effectively employing people aiming to fulfil the organisation’s goals. Broadly, Haven-Tang and Jones (2005: 90) assert that HRM is concerned with “managing people and their interrelationships within organisations”.

Bratton and Gold (2003) and Legge (2005) explain that the meaning of HRM is focused on “hard” and “soft” versions of HRM. The “hard” version of HRM emphasises the term “resource” and adopts a “rational” approach to managing employees, which is concerned with viewing employees as any other economic factor, i.e. as a cost that has to be controlled. The “soft” version of HRM, on the other hand, emphasises the term “human” and focuses on employees’ training and development to ensure that highly skilled and loyal employees will deliver competitive advantage to an organisation.

### 3.2.3 Importance of HRM

According to Baum (1996), HRM is key in determining the success or the failure of any firm or organisation. It is a vital component in any organisation due to the high level of competition between large numbers of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) that
dominate most destinations. Furthermore, the changing values and educational standards related with rapid technological advances, dynamic legal, political and social realities and the demand for high quality products and services at low prices are other contributory factors for managing human resources (Schuler, 1998).

Dessler (2002: 2-3) suggests that effective management of human resources in any organisation helps:

- to hire the right person for the right job;
- to reduce the turnover of employees;
- employees to do their best;
- companies and / or organisations to avoid discriminatory actions and to be fair with their employees in relation to pay, training and labour practices.

The human resource manager in an organisation faces a multitude of problems, ranging from a constantly-changing workforce to coping with government regulations. However, to overcome these problems, human resource managers should work through an effective HRM system. In this context, Mondy and Noe (1993:6) suggest that HRM consists of six functional areas as shown in figure 3.1:

- Human resource planning;
- Recruitment and selection;
- Human resource development;
- Compensation and benefits: safety and health;
- Employee and labour relations;
- Human resource research.
**Figure 3.1:** Major functional areas for HRM

- Human resource planning
- Human resource development
- Employee and labour relations
- Human resource research
- Compensation and benefits: safety and health
- Recruitment and selection

**Source:** Modified from Mondy and Noe (1993:22)
3.3 HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (HRD)

3.3.1 HRD: A historical perspective

One of the main outcomes of the spread of HRM has been the expansion of HRD. In recent years, HRD has emerged as a complex heterogeneous field serving many areas with diverse purposes. According to Beardwell and Holden (1997), HRD is seen as having a significant role to play in achieving and maintaining the survival and development of an organisation. Additionally, Armstrong (1992) asserted that the real meaning of HRM is that employees are valued assets and that their value should be increased by a systematic and consistent approach to investing in training and development. Resourcing is about providing the skills base needed by the organisation. HRD is about enhancing and widening these skills through training, by helping people develop within the organisation, and by facilitating better use of their skills and abilities.

In Mankin’s view (2003), the relationship between HRD and HRM is perceived to be unclear and vague. Sambrook and Stewart (1998: 172) argue that “HRD has been born to accompany HRM”. While some think of HRD as a subset of HRM, the University Forum for Human Resource Development (UFHRD) (cited in Walton, 1999: 66) contend that HRD should not be viewed “as a subset of HRM either in structural or functional terms”. While some HRD academics and practitioners may consider HRM as a distinct area, O’Donnell et al. (2006) argue that it is not possible or realistic in any way for HRD to fully disown HRM. According to them, both the HRM and HRD functions within the capital–labour relationship involve management of, and investment in, labour and both strive to attain competitive advantage through labour for the benefit of the organisation, whether public or private.
3.3.2 Definitions of HRD

Like HRM, the definition of HRD has been widely contested. HRD features in a wide range of disciplines, including economics, sociology and psychology and has more or less direct connections and relationships with a variety of management ideals and functions, such as strategic management, HRM and leadership (Stewart, 2005). This characteristic of HRD makes it difficult to reach a unified definition. Nonetheless, previous studies have attempted to provide working definitions for HRD. A generalist definition provided by McGoldrick et al. (2002: 396) describes HRD as being concerned with “supporting and facilitating the learning of individuals, groups and organisations”. Bratton and Gold (2003: 316) state that HRD:

comprises the procedures and processes that purposely seek to provide learning activities to enhance the skills, knowledge and capabilities of people, teams and the organisation so that there is a change in action to achieve the desired outcomes.

Mondy and Noe (1993) define HRD as the process which helps individuals, groups, and the entire organisation to become more effective. From a more holistic perspective, Horwitz et al. (1996:138) assert that HRD is concerned with:

the processes whereby the citizens of a nation acquire the knowledge and skills necessary to perform both specific occupational tasks and other social, cultural, intellectual and political roles in a society.

In support, Vince (2003: 559) suggests that HRD should focus on generating trust through action and on influencing and working with others in situations loaded with “emotions and politics”.

HRD, with its focus on increasing person’s skills, ability and or knowledge (Luoma, 2000), is needed throughout the career of an individual, i.e. from the time that an
individual joins an organisation to the time that s/he leaves the organisation. Furthermore, technological revolutions and organisational change have progressively led some employers to recognise that the success of an organisation depends on the skills and abilities of their employees, which should involve considerable and continuous investment in training and development. This has led senior management teams to realise the increased importance of training, employee development and long-term education (Beardwell et al., 2004).

There is a link between development, training, and education and whilst training, development and education are essentially concerned with learning, the distinguishing features can be emphasised in the HRD context (Garavan, 1995; 1997). In a training context, behavioural objectives are quite explicit and are usually related to the current role. Generally, education has a focus on the individual and its objectives cannot be measured quantitatively as each individual’s learning priorities differ. Development, in the HRM/HRD context, usually focuses on future roles or jobs, therefore behavioural objectives tend to be less precise. Garavan (1997) states that the distinction between training, development and education is, at times, a function of their use. He uses the study of employment law as an example to explain this difference. Garavan (1997) further argues that whilst employment law may have a role to play as an educational endeavour, it may equally comprise an element of an in-house training programme.

Garavan (1997) adds that development appears to be the main process to which training and formal education contributes. This contribution facilitates both the individual and the organisation. In addition, educational activities are often viewed as a requirement for
a job because they verify the individual’s ability and suitability. Training may further enhance this suitability to the organisation. Van Wart et al. (1993 cited in Garavan, 1997: 40) suggest “training is application-driven and aims to impart skills that are useful immediately in particular situations”. In addition, Van Wart et al. (1993) argue that training is generally completed in a shorter time than education and has more focused outcomes. It is therefore logical to suggest that development, training, and education are seen as complementary components of the same process, i.e. the enhancement of human potential or talent.

3.3.3 Importance of HRD for destination development

The primary purpose of HRD is to improve worker productivity and the firm’s profitability. The function of HRD is a long-term investment that yields returns to a nation by providing it with the technical human resources essential for industrial development. Education and training for human resource development can help people to obtain the right skills for developing society and solving problems which the labour market or the country may face. In support, Donald (1981) maintains that human resources as a capital should be helped to develop skills as well as improve logical thinking, observation and decision-making in order to enable them to manage the problems.

The development of human resources is directly linked to economic growth in several ways, for example, to provide skilled human resources at all levels to support the labour market and economic needs. According to Mader (1988: 216):

the aim of human resources development is to raise the standard of skills at all levels needed to support the economic growth, and provide an
In addition, Al-Ajawi (1986) explains that the relationship between human resource education and the economic development is rooted in the fact that appropriate education systems produce qualified people, in the right number and right place and at the right time.

The connection between economic survival and productivity has become a strategic goal for many firms, so many organisations invest in HRD because they believe it will result in higher profits (Mondy and Noe, 1993). Dessler (2000) asserts that the investment in human capital is the foundation of success in the knowledge-based global economy of the twenty-first century. Dessler (2000) adds that HRD includes the employees and managers in an attempt to improve their performance by imparting knowledge, changing attitudes, or increasing skills. On the other hand, HRD departments should provide their employees with continuous training from basic remedial skills to advanced decision-making techniques throughout employees’ careers.

According to a UK report by the HM Treasury (2002), human capital is increased both by formal education and training and by learning-through-doing. Growth is centrally driven by the gathering or accumulation of human capital, which also, through technical knowledge, provides the basis for innovation (Benhabib and Spiegel, 1994; Aghion and Howitt, 1998; Krueger and Lindahl, 2000; Temple, 2000; Bassanini and Scarpetta, 2001). Donald (1981) further states that practical skills, as well as knowledge, should contribute to the development of society. Donald (1981) goes further to suggest that
education for HRD needs to be flexible to accommodate unforeseen problems and changes.

Education and training should be available for people and should be viewed as a continuous process. In a study by Dearden et al. (2000), it was found that training is associated with greater productivity gains than wage gains, involving considerable returns for employers as well as individuals. They reported on a study by the Institute for Fiscal Studies which has shown that a 15% increase in the proportion of trained workers in an industry leads to average wage gains of 1.5%, compared to 4% increases in value added per worker (Dearden et al., 2000).

It could be concluded that HRD is a process for developing people within an organisation. This development can be applied to both skills and knowledge and may occur at any stage of a person’s life, at school, college, or university, at vocational school, training centre or in the workplace, or even at home and during social and leisure situations. HRD may be conducted at an international, a national, a societal level or at the level of business enterprise regardless of the size of a business and includes the use of systematic and planned training approaches, adopting a policy of continuous development, and paying particular attention to management development and career planning (Dearden et al., 2000).
3.4: HRM AND HRD ISSUES IN THE TOURISM AND HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY

3.4.1 Tourism and hospitality: A service sector

There are unique factors in a service sector, such as tourism and hospitality, which make separate analysis essential. The service sector in general and tourism products in particular possess characteristics that differentiate them from other sectors such as the manufacturing sector (O’Connor, 1999). In this context, Jones and Haven-Tang (2005) restate the characteristics as: intangibility, perishability, inseparability of production and consumption, heterogeneity and interdependence. Benson (1986: 44 cited in Korczynski, 2002) asserts that:

Taxonomies of management practice derived primarily from manufacturing may not be readily applicable to service industries with their more complicated social reality and greater variability.

Korczynski (2002) states that hospitality work is an age-old area of service work and is linked with consumption as leisure. Moreover, Nolan (2002: 1) emphasised that:

HRM has become a critical issue for the hotel industry in recent years. The growing interest and concern with HRM has developed primarily because many of the traditional sources of competitive advantage that companies have been able to rely on, such as patents, economies scale, access to capital and market expansion, are being eroded.

The most important factor is that there is direct contact with the customer. Often, the time between demand and supply is short (Lai and Baum, 2005). Consequently, the customer becomes an important part of the social relation of the workplace. The task then is to develop an analysis that can support an understanding of the nature of the service work. Thus, service industry employment can be seen as a three-way relationship that involves management, workers and customers (Korczynski, 2002).
3.4.2 Service quality

Service quality is conceptualised as an assessment of the overall excellence and superiority of a service (Tian-Cole and Crompton, 2003). Superior service quality promotes customer satisfaction, stimulates intention to return and encourages word of mouth recommendations (Nadiri and Hussain, 2005). Service quality is increasingly gaining attention in the tourism and hotel sectors as a means of achieving competitive advantage (Walker, 1990; Tsang and Qu, 2003; Nadiri and Hussain, 2005). In addition, employees are crucial to the success of any tourism organisation due to the role they play in customer interaction (Reisinger and Waryszak, 1994; Johns and Lee-Ross, 1997). Whilst managing the customer-employee interaction is considered to be one of the most difficult tasks, Baum (1997) and Haynes and Fryer (2000) maintain that good customer-employee interaction is vital for tourism managers to realise high quality service. Reisinger and Waryszak (1994) assert that the value for employees’ involvement in the service delivery process is emphasised by the intangibility of services. Due to the intangible nature of services delivery, customers use physical cues, such as employees (i.e. their physical appearances, behaviour/contact) to judge service quality. In other words, employees are regarded as “the service” in front of the customer’s eyes.

Several definitions of service quality demonstrate the role of customer-employee interactions. For example “a responsive, caring and attentive staff who get things done promptly or provide honest answers where there are genuine problems...hospitality that leads the guest to feel at home, well cared for and anxious to return” (Reisinger and
Waryszak, 1994: 22). It can therefore be stated that the form of social interaction between the service provider and the customer, the service provider’s attitude, behaviour and verbal skills are essential in determining the eventual service quality. Furthermore, Haven-Tang and Jones (2006) assert that establishing a sound employee-customer relationship is imperative to the delivery of quality service.

Go et al. (1996) indicate that HRM practices are a critical factor in the success of hospitality and tourism organisations. Consequently, many companies should build competitive advantage by using their employees to implement improved service delivery processes. Human resources are a critical element for the future hotel industry, and there is a strong association between human resources and both productivity and financial performance (Dayid et al., 2003). Nolan (2002) adds that companies are relying on their human assets, the knowledge, competence and capabilities of the workforce as a source of competitive advantage. In other words - in today’s world, people, and the way they are managed, have become an important source of competitive advantage.

3.4.3 Human resource issues in international tourism

This section highlights some of the major HR issues in international tourism. Although human resources are critical in a people-oriented industry such as tourism (Baum, 1993), the area is dominated by negative attitudes towards investment in human capital, inflexible employment practices and unreliable educational and training support systems (Parsons, 1996).
Go et al. (1996) mention that the hospitality and tourism industries encounter a number of issues including: recruitment problems; poor retention rates; poor image; lack of training; weak management and supervisory skills. Baum (1993) and the ILO (2003) also identify some major universal HR issues in international tourism, such as:

- The impact of changing demographics and shrinking employment labour shortages;
- Skills shortages, particularly at higher management level;
- The failure of education providers to meet the industry’s needs;
- Poor HRM and planning information in the tourism industry;
- The hospitality and tourism industry’s poor image as an employer;
- Cultural and traditional perception of the industry;
- Low pay;
- Linking HD concerns with service and product quality.

Any organisation must have qualified individuals in order to accomplish its goals. Obtaining such people involves human resource planning (HRP), recruitment and selection. The HRP process comprises of a review of human resource requirements to ensure that the required numbers of employees, with the required skills, are available when needed. According to Fisher et al. (2003) and Mondy and Noe (1993), recruitment is the process of attracting individuals to apply for jobs within the organisation, whilst selection is the process through which the organisation selects an applicant who best suits the vacancy and the company.
World-wide HR issues (see figure 3.2) relating to tourism seem to be very similar in nature. Haywood and Pickworth (1993), for example, indicate that in Canada the major HR issues are: labour shortages, particularly in non-skilled positions; recruitment and industry image; employee retention; productivity, quality; and the need for training and technology. Similarly, in China, the hotel industry is faced with the problem of shortage of qualified employees (Tsang and Qu, 2000; Qiu and Lam, 2004). In the UK and Europe, the problem of vocational education and training still exists. There is a high turnover of staff in most tourism sectors due to the bad working conditions, long working hours and low salaries (Holloway, 1993; Lashley, 2000; Jones and Haven-Tang, 2005). A Libyan study conducted by Abuzed (2002) and Porter (2006) identified similar HR issues.
Figure 3.2: Human resource issues in the tourism and hospitality industries

Figure 3.2: illustrates the key issues for the tourism and hospitality industry which emerged from the literature review.

Abuzed (2002) and Brien (2004) observe that the issues illustrated in figure 3.2 are complex and interrelated. The next section provides a further discussion on the issues illustrated in figure 3.2.
i) Labour market issues

The labour market "consists of individuals in possession of knowledge, skills, attitude and abilities that meet the standards for employment within the organisation" (Tesone, 2005: 105). Labour markets vary in the number of people they hold (Riley, 1996). To understand the labour market for a particular organisation requires in-depth knowledge on labour sources, required skills and characteristics and composition of the labour force (Goss-Turner, 1992). Often, labour markets are perceived to influence the employment system. Without sufficient information on labour market, it is difficult to establish and adopt appropriate employment systems (Torbjörn, 2005). Hendry (1995:32) describes four main types of employment systems (figure 3.3) as follows:

- Internal Labour Market (ILM);
- External Labour Market (ELM);
- Occupational Labour Market (OLM);
- Technical /Industrial Labour Market (TILM).
Chapter Three: Literature review

Figure 3.3: Different employment systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Internal Labour Market (ILM)</th>
<th>The External Labour Market (ELM)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Refers to the structure of jobs with an organisation</td>
<td>• Focus is on the internal labour market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Few points of entry into the firm</td>
<td>• Jobs are narrow and unskilled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Development of firm-specific skills</td>
<td>• Skills that are required are ready available in the labour market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Jobs are flexible and broadly defined</td>
<td>• Training requirement is minimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Long service is valued</td>
<td>• Deployment is tightly controlled by the employer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employment security is high</td>
<td>• Job security is low-hire and fire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Occupational Labour Market (OLM)</th>
<th>The Technical/Industrial Labour Market (TILM)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Many features the ILM, but outward facing</td>
<td>• Many of the features of the ELM, but the more extreme aspects are ameliorated by detailed agreements, often with trade unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus is on the external labour market</td>
<td>• Jobs are narrow and semi-skilled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Skills are sought after</td>
<td>• Jobs are tightly defined by employers and agreement with trade unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Jobs are controlled by occupation agreements</td>
<td>• Job security is low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Development activities are valued</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Often found in relation to professional employees or skilled craft workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hendry (1995:82)

The concept of an ILM is based on a set of rules that guide the movement of employees within an organisation (Jago and Deery, 2004). For the best part of the last 50 years, ILM has been used by labour market theorists as the basis of labour market analysis. The key elements of an ILM are training, promotional opportunity, job security, pay and custom (Althauser and Kalleberg, 1981). The presence or absence of an ILM has an important impact on the stability of an organisation’s workforce. Riley (1980) contends that the limited development of ILMs in the hotel industry has an impact on labour
turnover because it forces people out of an organisation. The lack of training in these organisations contributes to the high rates of turnover.

Labour turnover in the tourism industry is a serious issue (Battersby, 1990; Go et al., 1996; Gottlieb, 2000; Hjalager and Andersen, 2001) due to the adverse effects it has on the costs (direct and indirect) to the organisation. Direct costs include costs such as dealing with leaving, replacement and transition (Institute for Personnel Development, 1997 cited in European Industrial Relations Observatory, 2002). Indirect costs refer to lost production, reduced performance levels, unnecessary overtime and low morale (Confederation of British Industry, 1998).

Turnover in hospitality and tourism organisations tends to vary significantly (Walmsley, 2004). The hotel industry is often quoted as particularly suffering from high staff turnover (e.g. Johnson, 1981; Simms et al., 1988; European Industrial Relations Observatory, 2002). Although research into why people leave has been widely conducted (Muchinsky and Morrow, 1980), there is no universal accepted account or framework for the causes (Cotton and Tuttle, 1986; Lee and Mitchell, 1994). This could also be due to the complexity of the turnover decision-making process and at the same time difficulties arising in empirical assessment (Mobley, 1982).

A study conducted by Graver and Harrison (2002) found that staff turnover amongst tourism establishments in the South-east of England is around 23%. However, sector organisation information suggests that turnover can exceed 70% for many businesses, depending on which individual industry is examined, and has been reported to exceed
120% for some organisations per annum (Graver and Harrison, 2002). Wessex Partnership Ltd (2002) has estimated the turnover to be around 50%, and Battersby (1990) claims that in some tourism sectors, turnover rates are as high as 300%. Additionally, figures published by the Department of National Heritage (1996) claim that the proportion of the workforce with their current employer for less than 2 years was 46% for the tourism industry compared with an all industry average of 29%. Although the above figures vary, the tourism staff turnover is clearly higher than other sectors (CBI, 1998).

The concept of ILMs is useful because it provides a theoretical link to turnover rates. Strong internal labour markets tend to suffer less from high rates of employee turnover as they are less open to the external labour market. Weak ILMs, on the other hand, suffer from a high turnover due to the following characteristics:

- Unspecified hiring standards;
- Multiple ports of entry;
- Low skills specificity;
- No on-the-job training;
- No fixed criteria for promotion and transfer;
- Weak workplace customs;
- Pay differentials vary over time.

(Simms et al., 1988; Riley, 1991)
Therefore, it can be inferred that ILMs in tourism firms are prone to weakness given their structural characteristics and this weakness goes some way to providing a partial explanation for high turnover rates within the industry.

In order to recruit successfully, it is important to have an understanding of labour markets in general and to understand the specific labour market for the hospitality industry, including the primary and secondary labour markets. Generally, the primary labour market consists of people who, through education, training and experience, are committed to an industry or sector. In the hospitality industry, for example, these may include hotel managers, chefs, hotel receptionists, hall porters and cocktail bar staff (Vinten, 1998; Brien, 2004). The secondary labour market, on the other hand, consists of people who are not committed to the industry although they have skills of use to an employer, e.g.: hotel; these include housewives, students and unskilled working people (Ohkusa et al.; 1997 Boella, 2000).

Whilst the main focus of the concept of ILM is the movement of employees within an organisation (Jago and Deery, 2004), ELM focus on the movement of employees between organisations (Fee et al., 2006). Thus, ELM represents a heterogeneous collection of employment opportunities that might be available as an alternative to any particular person’s current job. Fee et al. (2006) note that whilst movement of employees between organisations may depend on individual’s performance, this may not be the case with movement of employees within an organisation. Fee et al. (2006: 822) argue that:
For a given individual to be promoted internally, it must be the case that (a) there is an opening for an insider and (b) the organisation chooses the individual over other internal candidates.

According to Mercer (2003), ELM analysis provides the knowledge base for making decisions around the external environment of business; specifically, issues related to labour. Through the use of ELM analysis, an organisation is capable of acquiring information on the currently available and future qualified labour in the external environment in order to make specific recommendations to enable effective attraction people with fundamental skills (Mercer, 2003).

OLM is another type of employment system worth highlighting. Basically, OLM is often characterised by "greater mobility and more loyalty to the skills or profession than to the firm" (Ohkusa et al., 1997: 447). Examples of OLM jobs include computer programmers and salesmen (Osterman, 1987 cited in Ohkusa et al., 1997). Often such occupations are not organised in definite job hierarchy, simply because of their characteristics (i.e. they require general skills). Commenting on ILM and OLM, Ohkusa et al. (1997: 447) assert that:

...ILM systems are often viewed as less suitable than occupational labour market (OLM) systems both for the development of new skills in an environment characterised by rapid technological change and for the adequate utilisation of the full scope of individual talents.

Different employment systems can co-exist within the same organisation or industry, depending on job allocation criteria. However Ohkusa et al. (1997: 448) note that ILM employment systems are commonly identified with "large and unionised" organisations.
ii) Training and education

Globally, there is a large body of literature indicating that training and education for tourism is a fast-growing area (Patton, 2000; Sio, 2000; Skoulas, 2000). Governments, (such as the governments of China and Egypt) have recognised the value of tourism and hospitality to their economies (Kattara, 2000; Liangqing, 2000) and linked education, training and workforce planning with competitiveness and productivity. At the same time, most organisations are beginning to see the importance of education and training and are putting into place education and training systems, often in collaboration with educational institutions. A growing number and variety of tourism education and training programmes are now offered across the world (Cooper, 1993). However, it is not so easy to view training and education as completely separate entities. Cooper (1993) argues that tourism education and training should involve communication of knowledge, concepts, and techniques with reference to the field of tourism and hospitality. Subsequently Cooper et al. (1994: 177) emphasise that:

*Training and education should be parallel and complementary to each other; and at different points of an individual’s career it is quite common and quite right that one predominates over the other.*

The terms education and training have often been used together in the academic world. Consequently, any organisational change programme must ensure the proper education and training of those who are involved in planning and implementing any new strategies.

Cherrington (1995) describes training as gaining specific skills or knowledge. In a more elaborate manner, Tanke (2001:167) defines training as:
a systematic process through which the human resources in the hospitality industry gain knowledge and develop skills by instruction and practical activities that result in improved performance.

Training in its simplest definition is the process of improving the staff members' skills within the organisation's system whether they are recent or new staff members (Tesone, 2005). It is a process of bringing a person to an agreed standard of skills proficiency through instruction. Thus, training programmes attempt to teach employees how to perform particular activities or jobs (Tanke, 2001).

Cooper (1994) asserts that tourism training was formerly associated with the operation of intermediaries in the areas, such as airline ticketing or craft operations for hospitality. In many developing countries, tourism training is still limited to these areas, but training in tourism has expanded to cover many functions in developed countries, such as UK and US, as the industry becomes more professional and demands a higher standard of service.

In addition, Brogan (1994 cited Jithendran and Baum, 2000:404) states: “[training] providers tended to deliver courses in areas where they had skills, rather than in what the market required”. Added to this is a lack of co-operation and communication between tourism education and industry, which has led to the prevalence of “student-centred” courses rather than “industrially-centred” courses (Baum, 1993).

However, education is much more general, and endeavours to provide employees with general knowledge that can be applied in many different situations. Indeed, while
education delivers principles and allows students to interpret knowledge, training focuses on the more specific applications and development of skills (Cooper and Westlake, 1989). In addition, education tends to be more philosophical and theoretical, and less practical than training (Goetsch and Davis, 2003). Seymour (1992) asserts that education and training also provide people with the requisite skills that help them to do things correctly in the first place. Furthermore, Seymour (1992) points out that people need to be trained in a way that enables them to react to new situations.

Traditional tourism education is concerned with analytical thinking and understanding of conceptual issues in order for a person to develop professionally and intellectually (Raybould and Wilkins, 2005). Go (1994) describes tourism education as an academic development of a person's skills, such as foreign languages, computational skills, and knowledge of countries and culture, without particular concern for specific jobs or responsibilities, all of which would be relevant for tourism and hospitality education in Libya (see chapter 6).

Jayawardena (2001: 310-311) criticises business education, which includes tourism education, for the following reasons:

- **Insufficient emphasis on generating “vision” in students with courses focusing more on problem solving than problem finding;**
- **Insufficient emphasis on integration across functional areas;**
- **Too much emphasis on quantitative analytical techniques;**
- **Insufficient attention to managing people;**
- **Insufficient attention to oral and written communication;**
- **Insufficient attention to the external environment;**
- **Insufficient attention to the international dimension of business;**
Chapter Three: Literature review

- Insufficient attention to entrepreneurism;
- Insufficient attention to ethics.

McDonald and Hopkin (2003 cited in ILO, 2001) believe that hospitality education is a support mechanism for improving the employees in the industry. However in the Caribbean hospitality industry, for example, it is difficult to understand the lack of emphasis on developing HR when the industry employs around 3.1 million people in 2000, comprising 13.5 percent of total employment (ILO, 2001). Goldsmith and Zahari, (1994) postulate that inadequate funding of institutions which are responsible for matching students’ qualifications and skills to international standards has greatly influenced the performance of such institutions.

Elsewhere, for example in China, existing tourism institutions and vocational training schools, which are considered to be the main supply for the workforce, cannot fulfil the expanding needs for high quality service providers. Lam and Xiao (2000) observe that the teaching materials are outdated and textbooks are usually written and published by faculty members. Additionally, in developing countries, most textbooks are simply translated from foreign texts without considering national cultures, values and contemporary issues. Thus, knowledge gained by students may not be applicable or related to their environments. This indicates that it is crucial to develop such institutions by offering them sufficient funds, contemporary programmes and facilities, and qualified staff. Consequently, long-term investment could be realised and the national economy would be enhanced and supported.
According to Williams (2005: 80) "the perfect curriculum has not yet been designed and a consensus from industry and academe on a single one is highly unlikely". Hospitality educators will continually be challenged to determine clear objectives for a curriculum that will serve the purposes of all stakeholders - students (in terms of what skills they have) and industry (in terms of the quality of students they employ). The ideal curriculum may not exist as relevance will change and therefore the process of curriculum review will be ongoing.

Jayawardena (2001) noticed that in order to market hospitality management degree programmes, well-established educational institutions wrongly use the term "international" as a descriptor. He argues that if analysed properly, most of these programmes are unfortunately rather local in design, delivery and discussions, and are delivered to a student population which is predominantly local by a faculty with limited or no international experience. Jayawardena (2001) further adds that the inclusion of a few international case studies seems to be the only international ingredient of these programmes.

In some countries, such as China, no integration is found between hardware and software contexts, i.e. there is a mismatch between the tangible and the intangible aspects of the tourism industry. As Lam and Xiao (2000: 291) states:

> although the industry people consider that the hardware contexts of hotels, restaurants, airports and transportation facilities have generally attained international standards, the software contexts in terms of employees' service attitude, skill levels, and language ability still fall short of those expected by international travellers. The employers feel that the government due to lack of visionary education and training plans provides the poor quality of service providers in China.
Basically, there is a gap between supply and demand. In China's context, Lam and Xiao (2000) state that while China's tourism education has been in development for the last 20 years, the gap between supply and demand is widening for quality managers, supervisors and operative staff as a result of the rapid growth of the tourism industry. It appears that in the current tourism education system, emphasis is placed on the supply of a labour force to meet the industry's needs, but less attention is given to the development of quality human resources for this service industry.

HRD for tourism continues to be a subject which requires a more comprehensive and strategic approach (Pollock and Ritchie, 1990), not only to make the industry more professional but also to address issues such as the quantitative and qualitative shortages of trained personnel and the mismatch between demand and supply.

Collaboration between education and industry should involve the professional and trade associations, national, regional and area tourist boards, and awarding bodies. This could take many forms, such as: awards, scholarships, and sponsorship, formulation of professional standards, joint research projects, training delivery, curriculum development, and steering committees (STRU, 1998). For example, in the UK, the Education Business Partnerships (EBP) and Understanding Industry are organisations working closely with the education sector and facilitating collaboration in a wide range of areas (Jithendran and Baum, 2000).

In general, Jithendran and Baum (2000: 411) assert that:

"tourism can simply be included in the school curriculum at all levels, especially as it can be delivered as part of many established subject..."
areas, such as geography, economics or history. It would not only help create tourism awareness but also attract students at an early stage to a career in tourism by creating a better image of the industry and therefore attracting better talent.

Education and training are often put forward as the keys to employment, but in developing countries many remain unemployed despite, or because of, their high level of education. Paradoxically recruiting those skilled, but unemployed, labour forces in one part of the world would provide a solution for skilled labour shortages in another part of the world (Choi et al., 2000).

Some countries, such as Kuwait and Saudi Arabia as well as Hong Kong and Singapore, have developed the recruitment of foreign workers as a solution to the inability of their hospitality institutions to meet international standards and provide high quality outcomes (Goldsmith and Zahari, 1994). Zhou (1991) asserts that due to the limited experience of most of the faculty and laboratory facilities in hospitality institutions and the fact that the higher education curriculum of higher learning generally emphasises theoretical instruction and de-emphasises skill development, many graduates lack practical experience before they enter the industry as employees.

iii) Attitudes towards hospitality employment

The international hospitality industry has been confronted with the issue of retaining and attracting high quality employees (Jameson, 2000; Ferris et al., 2002; Qui and Lam, 2004). Brien (2004) suggests that the hospitality industry is often viewed as a negative employment option and has a temporary job-label attached to it until a real job is available. In support, Qiu and Lam (2004) assert that job security in the hotel sector is
questionable; people think that careers in hotels are short and that managers will not keep them for long, particularly when they reach the age of 40. Aksua and Köksal (2005) in their study on perceptions and attitudes of tourism students in Turkey found out that the seasonality of vacancies in tourism-related sectors, such as the hotel sector, made it difficult for people to secure a stable job. Image is also a major factor in effective recruitment for the hospitality industry (Brien, 2004) and has been described as the main barrier to recruitment by the Department of Education in the UK (1989). Aksua and Köksal (2005), for example, assert that there is a general view amongst the Turkish community that jobs in the tourism industry are not important. Aksua and Köksal (2005: 444) established that the majority of tourism students regarded pay in the tourism industry as being “insufficient to lead a satisfactory life”. Elsewhere, similar observations were evident in research in Scotland (Getz, 1994; Littlejohn and Watson, 2004).

In the UK in the late 1990s, the industry’s image was being portrayed not only in literature, but also on television. The BBC reality TV series Hotel – showed various hotels and working conditions, building an industry’s image that many may have enjoyed, but which others thought disturbing and negative. From the 1990s onwards, research regarding the industry’s image appears to have been divided into two sections: hospitality students’ images and in-industry employee perceptions of the industry (Brien, 2004).

Past research highlights low retention of graduates shortly after they enter the industry full time – potentially the outcome of the reality of working in the industry and its
image (Barron and Maxwell, 1993; Brien, 2004). Research on employee’s in-industry is also common, particularly in relation to human resource issues, e.g. job satisfaction and perceptions, which collectively builds to give a view of the image of the industry (Tepeci and Bartlett, 2002).

Boullé and Reithler (2000), ILO (2003), Andriotis (2004), Brien (2004) and Haven et al. (2004) suggest various reasons for the industry’s inability to attract competent employees: long working hours, poor terms and conditions, low pay, job insecurity, and image. Supporting Brien’s (2004) suggestion, i.e. that finding the right person to engage (right in this sense being defined as including calibre, qualifications, experiences) is becoming more difficult.

In some hotels, the recruitment process itself can be strategic. They deliberately encourage the use of a peripheral (part-time) staff to manage their labour costs, and while this approach meets their financial needs, it projects an image that the industry is only interested in cost and nothing else (Richardson, 2005).

The problems related to the retention of employees have been well-studied and documented, with many researchers (Emenheiser et al., 1998; Vinten, 1998; Carroll et al., 1999) concluding that recruitment and retention are linked. A number of programmes, such as: childcare facilities; career development opportunities, employee assistance programmes, and employee stockholdings, have been implemented to retain employees and are termed “potential retention enhancers” (Fisher et al., 2003). The success of these enhancers depends on property location and management and company
culture, yet they report that this approach can help to retain employees in the industry and at the same time provide a positive image of the industry. One of the major issues for lack of retention is the pay level. Walsh (2001 cited in Brien 2004: 38) suggests that this alone is not the only factor people go to work for, but he suggests the full “package” needs to be looked at, and at times may attract or retain employees.

The problems of negative attitudes towards the hospitality industry are very similar in many countries. In Saudi Arabia (Wilkins, 2001) for example, most of the employees in the hospitality industry are from different nationalities because they are more qualified than the local population and are able to speak foreign languages. Moreover, the attitude of the local population towards careers in hospitality is poor. As a result, most Saudi Arabians resort to working in the production industries (oil industry and manufacturing), causing leakage of the workforce from the hospitality industry. Therefore, a need exists to create a suitable environment to attract qualified people as well as to recruit and train graduates for job advancement in the hospitality industry.

Divine and Bartlett’s (1988: 77) study in the US “found that the negative industry stereotype was unfounded, and teenagers generally had positive impressions of their hospitality jobs”. Another study examining Scottish high school students’ perceptions of hospitality careers undertaken by Getz (1994) found that negative attitudes were principally due to the decline in the regional economy, while Ross (1992), surveyed Australian high school students about the personal qualities needed for successful careers in the hospitality industry and found that positive attitudes, working with people, and concerns for personal appearance were ways in which hospitality values
differed from industry generally. Barron and Maxwell (1993) concluded that graduate transfer and retention rates for all students in hospitality programmes were low, therefore, confirming that training, retention and promotion of graduates are problems for the hospitality industry.

"The hospitality industry not only in UK but throughout much all of the world appears to have recruitment problems associated with a poor image as an employer" (Boella, 2000: 52). The most important reasons cited for leaving the tourism industry are poor pay, unsociable hours and lack of career structure (Farrell, 2002). Weiss (1997) found that the key cause for concern was pay equity within the organisation, a retention issue to the extent that it affects employee morale. Also other factors, such as the lack of training opportunities and turnover culture, were not considered important reasons for leaving the hospitality and tourism industries. Farrell (2002) stressed that pay and conditions have become ethical issues. He adds that some graduates interviewed highlighted how some sectors of the industry rely on tips and service charges in order to complement a basic income for employees.

A study in Ireland by Farrell (2002) showed that approximately one-third of tourism graduates left the tourism industry and a further one-fifth were working abroad. A further one-sixth of those working in the industry plan to leave and another one-fifth approximately are undecided. While 90.7% worked in the tourism industry after graduation, the findings showed the current employment status was only 40.4% (see table 3.1).
Table 3.1: Current employment status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment status</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working in Irish Tourism</td>
<td>40.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further training in tourism</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working abroad</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No longer in tourism</td>
<td>33.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 3.2 shows how, after graduation, tourism graduates left the tourism industry. The majority (64%) had left within two years. Of those working outside tourism, 27.6% are employed in professional services, 3.4% in the retail trade, 24.1% in information technology, 13.8% in the public service and 31% in other employment.
Table 3.2: Time period in tourism industry following graduation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Leave tourism</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Immediately after graduation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 – 6 months</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 months-12 months</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 months-24 months</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 months-60 months</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In addition, other challenges facing the tourism industry include: recruiting more individuals to a career in tourism; matching the programmes of public and private training providers with changing industry needs; and developing and utilizing tourism HRD tools and training resources.

New strategies that have shown some success in increasing the labour pool, dealing with the image of the hospitality sector and helping tackle the industry's skills shortages and recruitment challenges have been evidenced in the US and UK (Brien, 2004), namely:

- A US initiative, which was introduced to promote the industry in schools to match employee shortage;
- In the UK, Springboard UK was created. Sponsored by major national and international hospitality businesses, Springboard UK facilitates practical work
experience opportunities, promotion of the industry in schools, seminars, and scholarships (Brien, 2004).

In each of the above strategies, several key points emerge (Brien, 2004: 37):

1- They are looking forward and outside of the industry;
2- Both are major national promotional campaigns by which prospective employees hear about the industry;
3- Each clearly spelt out what the industry had to offer;
4- Each focused on a positive industry image;
5- They are cooperatively industry-driven.

Some of the solutions in developing an integrated HR strategy include: establishing and coordinating co-operation with industry and developing financial foundations through training revenue and industry contributions; and establishing credibility with government as the industry expert in human resource development - ensuring public funding and private sector initiatives are focused on key industry priorities. The workforce consists of four different aspects of the strategy:

- Attracting the right numbers and the right kind of workers to the industry;
- Improving employers' people management practices;
- Providing workers with opportunities;
- Incentives for ongoing skill development.

3.5 WOMEN IN THE HOSPITALITY SECTOR WORKFORCE

Women constitute a significant proportion of the hospitality sector workforce in several countries. Doherty and Stead (1998) note that of the 2.4 million people employed in the hotel and catering industry in industrialised countries, the majority are female.
According to Purcell (1996) 60% of people employed in the hotel trade and the tourist accommodation in the UK are female (table 3.3).

**Table 3.3: The gendering of employment in accommodation and catering**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accommodation or catering activities</th>
<th>Male (%)</th>
<th>Female (%)</th>
<th>Percentage of females who are part-time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel trade and other tourist</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>60.00</td>
<td>55.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurants, café, etc</td>
<td>41.20</td>
<td>58.80</td>
<td>69.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public houses and bars</td>
<td>32.50</td>
<td>67.50</td>
<td>83.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night-clubs and licensed clubs</td>
<td>39.80</td>
<td>60.20</td>
<td>85.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38.00</td>
<td>62.00</td>
<td>72.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Adapted from Purcell (1996: 18)

Table 3.3 reveals that significant percentage of the women who work in the accommodation and catering facilities are employed on part-time basis. Doherty and Steady (1998) assert low pay in the hotel sector as a major factor contributing to the pay gap between males and females in most industrialised countries. In a survey of cohorts consisting of males and females with similar qualifications, Purcell (1996: 21-22) found that:

*The average wage of the highly-qualified women in this cohort who were currently employed in the hospitality industry, more than three years after graduation, was £11,562, whereas the average wage for their male peers was £14,816.*

These findings reflect the wider picture of the fate of women in the hospitality industry. Apart from the low pay, the majority of women in the hospitality sector do not manage to reach well-paying top positions (Kunz and Johnson, 2000; Kattara, 2005). Men tend to occupy higher-status positions than women (Biswas, 1996). In their study, Li and...
Leung (2001) found that only two of the managers of 77 hotels sampled in Singapore and three out of 72 managers in Hong Kong hotels were female. Kattara (2005) found that only three women occupied the top positions (i.e. general manager, executive assistant general manager and resident manager) in 71 hotels sampled in Egypt (Table 3.4). Petrick (1998) surveyed a group of restaurant executives in the USA and showed that very few women had reached executive status in the industry. Further, many women tend to leave hospitality careers for other more flexible jobs, especially after marriage (Kattara, 2000).

**Table 3.4:** Female hotel managers in Egypt by job title

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Title</th>
<th>Number of females</th>
<th>Percentage to total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive assistant general manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resident manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duty manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information technology manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Extracted from Kattara (2005: 241)

There are several elements that determine women’s careers in hospitality. Purcell (1996: 18) identified three main elements:

- Contingently-gendered jobs, where women are recruited for particular jobs as a result of employers’ pursuit of economic advantage rather than gendered
preferences. In other word, employers want cheap labour, in terms of part-time labour;

- Sex-typed occupations, where women are recruited for specific jobs as a result of perceptions that a certain kind of personality is more important than formal qualification;

- Patriarchally-prescribed occupations, where patriarchal practices determines and prescribes appropriate job incumbency.

Also, cultural values and practices have been found to prevent the majority of women from participating actively in the hotel sector. Kattara (2005) asserts that females holding top positions in the hotel sector are far from being accepted in Middle Eastern cultures, which are generally based on Islamic traditions. According to Islamic doctrine, “work is for men and home is for women” (Ibrahim, 2004: 9-7). In other words, familial obligations take priority for a Muslim woman over any other thing. According to Ibrahim (2004) taking care of husbands, maintaining households, bearing and raising children to follow the religious values are the main functions of women in society. Often, women do not build their careers without the approval of their husbands or male guardians if they are unmarried. Similar assertions were made by Li and Leung (2001: 189), where a woman’s commitment to, and involvement in, work in Asia depends on the “amount of support she receives from her spouse and other relatives”.

Many of the work patterns in hospitality do not cope with the prevailing Islamic norms and traditions in relation to women’s work. As a consequence, women tend to decline or refuse to work in all anti-social work circumstances, which represent an essential component of the business activities. Examples of such circumstances are long working
hours, night shifts and frequent interactions with people of different cultures (e.g. Western cultures). Moreover, according to Islamic traditions, women are expected to be at home before sunset. Any job (as is the case with the majority of jobs in the hospitality industry) that includes delays after the regular daytime working hours is often unacceptable. Consequently, the majority of Muslim women decline to take jobs requiring long working hours.

Most importantly, Islamic customs include wearing of the veil. However, some hotels require women to wear uniform. As observed by Ibrahim (2004) some of the women’s uniforms are too tight or extremely short. Thus, some Muslim women opt to quit the job rather than wear such uniforms. Alemdar (2000: 327), for example found that:

18 per cent of women in Turkey wear head scarves...never take them off....This creates a problem in some situations, and many hospitality companies avoid employing women from this segment of society.

Generally, irrespective of religion, work-family conflict remains the major constraint for women in the hospitality industry, in both developed and developing countries. Li and Leung’s (2001) study in Singapore found that women have to double their familial obligations with work. MacVicar et al.’s (2000: 380) study in Scotland found that “women still appear to remain responsible for the domestic work”. It can be argued that work-family conflicts in particular, have a knock-on effect on women’s careers in hospitality as well as their earnings capacity.

To summarise, the preceding sections have highlighted several HRD and HRM issues such as high labour turnover, low skill levels and poor attitudes which are endemic to
the hospitality and tourism sector. Tourism educators and trainers are attempting to strike a balance between academic/theoretical and practical issues. However, persistent difficulties in the areas of recruitment and retention of skilled employees that cause difficulties in maintaining service consistency still remain. Whilst a range of solutions for these problems has been suggested, they vary according to the differing political and economic systems, education traditions and local needs in different countries. In recent years, workforce planning has emerged and been suggested as a solution to combating HR issues in the labour market. The remainder of this chapter will explore workforce planning models in considerable detail to provide background information on some of the existing WFP models. Such information will guide adaptation of a unified WFP model for the research.

3.6 WORKFORCE PLANNING

Workforce planning (WFP) in the US and UK developed during the 1960s and early 1970s in a period of relative economic stability when unemployment was low and organisations were faced with supply shortages and a need to improve labour utilisation (Reilly, 1996). Therefore, most of the literature in this study is drawn from US-based literature. WFP remained a significant practice in many large HR departments until the economic downturn of the 1980s when an inability to prove the economic value of workforce plans resulted in efforts to improve WFP being eliminated (Sullivan, 2002a). However, Castley (1996) and Reilly (1996) believe that a number of shifts in organisational structures and attitudes during the 1980s were opposed to the practice of WFP for three key reasons. Firstly, there was a reaction against a centralised corporate
power and organisations began devolving power to local units which, in turn, made WFP more difficult and led to the loss of some workforce planning skills. Secondly, the HR agenda switched from a quantitative approach and a concern for numbers to a more qualitative approach looking at the skills employees bring to the workplace (Castley, 1996). Thirdly, the fluctuating economy led some to regard planning as an ineffective activity (Reilly, 1996). However, this attitude continued into the early 1990s.

In the latter part of the 1990s, WFP started to get back onto the HR agenda and today it is a high priority for an increasing number of organisations as they realise that the need for planning is greater than ever (Sullivan, 2002a). There is an awareness of the importance of skills development in an environment that requires adaptability rather than stability. There is recognition that employee contribution must be maximised through better utilisation and deployment. Finally, there is an understanding of the need to frame employee tasks in the context of business plans and to make them more challenging in the drive for continuous business improvement.

Far from undermining WFP, the unpredictable nature of business necessitates thinking about the future. Organisations need to be able to deal effectively with any upturns or downturns in business. The beginning of the new century has seen a period of instability in the economy, which has led to downsizing and lay-offs in many industrialised nations (Melymuka, 2002). Organisations that were unprepared for the cutbacks are now planning for how they will regenerate the business when the economy brightens up again. There is increasing concern (especially in industries such as the information and communication technology industry) of throwing the baby out with the bath water, and
losing competitive advantage because of a failure to protect core competencies (Melymuka, 2002):

Even if recession has forced you to cut back on projects you can use this time to assess your skill base, figure out what you’ll need and get organised to hit the ground running when your budget loosens.

(Melymuka, 2002:5)

Although it is possibly easier to predict and plan for changes related to the workforce than it is for changes in the business world, the future is expected to bring a shift to higher-skilled “knowledge-worker” jobs, increased competition for talent as well as greater worker diversification, changes in worker values and expectations and an increasing number of workers retiring (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003a).

An examination of organisational WFP guidelines suggests that it is this latter problem, i.e. of an increasing number of workers retiring, that has spurred a number of organisations into creating workforce plans. As the first wave of baby-boomers edges towards retirement age, organisations that do not prepare for their replacement are expected to face a sudden loss of skills, or a “brain drain” (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003a). Some organisations are planning for the increasing diversity of the population. Despite equal opportunity and diversity initiatives, most middle and senior management positions are still held by white middle-aged men, particularly in many areas of the private sector. However, a multicultural economy is on the way and many believe that if organisations want to identify with their customers, the people running the businesses need to look like the people they serve (e.g. White, 2002; Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003a). One organisation, Abbott
Laboratories, a US-based company producing health-care products, has begun to increase the diversity of its workforce through aggressive targeted recruitment initiatives, including building relationships with minority universities and sponsoring science programmes in schools in predominantly minority neighbourhoods (White, 2002).

3.6.1 Definitions of workforce planning

The term “workforce planning” is a relatively new term, which is used interchangeably with other previous terms, such as “human resource planning”, “succession planning” and “building bench strength”. In the 1960s and early 1970s workforce planning was predominantly known as ‘manpower planning’ (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003a). However, although still used occasionally, this latter term has been replaced due to its gender-bias and because it suggests a mechanistic quantitative approach to thinking about the workforce (Reilly, 1996). Additionally, manpower planning is associated with a rather centralised, number crunching and complicated process (Beardwell and Holden, 1994), whereas WFP allows for a greater recognition of qualitative issues, especially concerning skills, and is appropriate in a variety of organisational settings (Reilly, 1996).

WFP has been defined in several ways. For instance, the United States Department of Health & Human Services (1999: 2) defines WFP as:

*The right number of people with the right skills, experiences, and competencies in the right jobs at the right time*

*The right number of people with the right set of competencies in the right jobs at the right time*

However, these two, very similar, definitions are shorthand for a management framework of making staffing decisions and related investments based on an organisation’s mission, strategic plan, budgetary resources, and desired workforce competencies. The Workforce Planning Guide (1999: 3) provides a more detailed definition:

*Workforce planning is looking at what an organization needs to accomplish in a given period of time; what knowledge, skills, and experience are required to get the job done; and how large and what type of workforce is required to provide that mix of skills, knowledge, and experience.*

Reilly (1996, cited in Employers' Organisation for Local Government, 2003a: 5) provides another comprehensive definition, which is:

*A process in which an organisation attempts to estimate the demand for labour and evaluate the size, nature and sources of supply which will be required to meet that demand.*

A more recent definition is provided by Garrant (2004: 2), who suggests that workforce planning is:

*A systematic process for identifying the human capital required to meet agency goals and developing the strategies to meet these requirements*

For the purpose of this research, the definition of Reilly (1996) and Garrant (2004), will be merged into a working definition to incorporate and describe the concept and process
of WFP, i.e. WFP is a systematic process for getting the right number of people with the right skills in the right jobs at the right time to deliver the organisation’s goals.

Reilly (1996) and Garrant (2004) breakdown the definition of WFP into the following:

- The right people are the ones with the necessary knowledge, skills, training, quality and motivation to effectively undertake the job for which they are employed;
- The right place refers to a particular job which will have been appropriately analysed, described and classified;
- The right time means that fully competent workers should be in post and functioning at full effectiveness at the time they are needed.

In this thesis, WFP will be used to name the process as it is a wider term and encompasses components such as forecasting and assessment; succession planning; leadership development; recruiting; retention; redeployment; potential retirements; performance management; internal replacements and identifying job and competency needs (Sullivan, 2002a).

3.6.2 Importance of workforce planning

WFP is one of the most important issues that HR professionals are talking about today. The idea of WFP is grounded in the theory that a company can be staffed more efficiently and economically if it forecasts its talent needs as well as the actual supply of talent that is or will be available (Helton, 2004). According to Morrish (2000), WFP is all about good and effective business and strategic management and, particularly, good people management. It is important in managing the match between the people and jobs.
to ensure that people are qualified to execute the jobs created or changed to reflect customer or organisational demands (Saliba, 1993). WFP provides insight into the best policies and initiatives needed to improve the overall human resource system and to draw up an appropriately-composed workforce to deliver future services. The U.S. Department of Energy (2005: 6) provides a detailed description of the benefits of WFP, some of which include: more effective human resource management through accurate, efficient alignment of the workforce with an organisation’s strategic objectives and performance measures; linking expenditures to an organisation’s long-term goals and objectives; ensuring replacement availability to fill critical vacancies; linking recruitment, development and training decisions to organisational goals; providing for a systematic way to continually address any new drivers that could change the workforce; implementing diversity policies effectively and providing understanding of the present in order to confront the future.

3.6.3 Strategy and workforce planning

Strategic planning sets an organisational direction, strategic goals and measurable programme objectives. These goals and objectives not only provide the foundation for determining necessary financial resources, but also provide the basis for workforce needs. If the right people with the right competencies are not in place, it is difficult to effectively achieve an organisation’s strategic goals and objectives. The workforce plan highlights the people factor in achieving results. WFP requires strong management leadership and cooperative supportive efforts of staff in several functional areas. Strategic planning, budget, and human resources are key players in WFP. Human resources provide tools for identifying needed competencies and for building the future
workforce through strategic recruitment, training, development, and retention techniques (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000; Garrant, 2004).

3.6.4 Workforce planning models

Many organisations, both private and public, such as the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) have developed models to support WFP. These workforce models help in the analysis of the current situation and try to find out the lack of competence to chart the needs of the workforce to overstep the present gap (Employers' Organisation for Local Government, 2003a). WFP can be conducted in many ways depending on the requirements of an organisation; therefore, the order and phases used may be different (Garrant, 2004).

Morrish (2000) suggests that the various models may use different terminology, but their frameworks are very similar in nature. According to Morrish (2000), all models generally progress through similar stages, namely:

- Analysing: identifies factors that determine or influence future demand for outputs or services as well as the internal and external supply of labour;
- Forecasting: involves the identification of changes and developments likely to occur some time in the future that may result in a demand/supply gap;
- Planning: requires the development of a coherent approach to people management;
- Implementing: requires the implementation of changes and their evaluation requires decisions to be made at the strategic, procedural and operational levels.
Chapter Three: Literature review

The Washington State Department of Personnel’s (2000) model essentially includes four phases.

- Setting the Strategy Direction;
- Conducting Workforce Analysis;
- Implementing the workforce plan; and
- Monitoring, evaluation and revision.

A summary of the model is shown in the figure 3.4, which has a similar shape to Kolb’s model of experimental learning. The model is derived from considerable research of models used in a variety of public and private sector organisations, jurisdictions and adapted/modified for the Washington State government.

**Figure 3.4**: Phases for workforce planning and development

![Workforce Planning Model](image)

Whilst the models of WFP cycle describe four stages and are cyclical, in reality the process may not be so clear-cut and may include more stages. WFP systems are not necessarily perfect and establishments should not be constrained by blockages or barriers in one phase, for example data collection, which prevent or delay consideration of others and useful work can be undertaken around scenario planning without necessarily having all the employee data available (Employers’ Organization for Local Government, 2003b). The next section presents detailed discussion on each of WFP phases. Special attention is given to phase two of WFP which deals with workforce analysis and its elements (i.e. demand forecast, supply projection, gap analysis, strategy development).

**Phase one: Setting the Strategic Direction**

This phase determines future functional requirements through the strategic planning and budgeting process (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). Strategic planning helps organisations plan where they are, where they are going, and how they plan to get there (Office of Personnel Management, 1999) and a workforce plan lays out the specific tasks and actions needed to ensure that an organisation has the resources to accomplish its task. Morrish (2000) asserts that workforce and strategic planning needs to be incorporated to ensure that policies and programmes are in line with the overall strategic direction of the organisation. Furthermore, it is important that the management of people is not attached at the end of an organisational decision as though it were some sort of corporate afterthought. According to Morrish (2000), HR requirements should be
at the core of the strategic planning process. This view would strengthen the links between workforce and strategic planning.

One of the main purposes of WFP is to ensure that an organisation has the necessary workers to support its work and strategic plan (Garrant, 2004). The workforce plan translates strategic thinking into concrete actions in the area of workforce staffing and training needs. It attempts to answer the following questions:

- How many and what types of jobs are needed in order to meet the performance objectives of the organisation?
- How will the organisation develop worker skills?
- What strategies should the organisation use to retain these skills?
- How have retirements, reductions in force, and/or hiring freezes affected your organisation’s ability to get the work done? (Garrant, 2004: 7).

WFP cannot be effectively accomplished unless a strategic plan has been prepared for the organisation (figure 3.5). Strategic plans are required as part of the budget process. In addition, most organisations have balanced and summarize key priorities (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).
Figure 3.5: The strategic direction for workforce planning and development

Source: Adapted from Washington State Department of Personnel (2000: 6)

Phase two– Workforce Analysis (WFA)

Analysis of workforce data is the key element in the workforce planning process. Garrant (2004) explained that the workforce analysis frequently considers information such as occupation, skills and experience, retirement eligibility, diversity, turnover rates, and trend data. Questions should consider certain occupational groups with increasing worker turnover; also, identifying the factors influencing turnover and whether the turnover would reduce the skill set of a certain occupational group. Answering these questions should help organisations develop plans for stable staffing levels, succession planning, and skill development (Garrant, 2004).
According to Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) and Garrant (2004), there are **four key steps** to the workforce analysis phase of the planning model (figure 3.6):

- Demand Forecast
- Supply Projection
- Gap Analysis
- Strategy Development

It is important to note that the above-mentioned steps of workforce analysis, in particularly demand forecast, supply projection and gap analysis involve both quantitative and qualitative approaches to workforce analysis. However, as discussed later in the research approach (see chapter 4), this study adopted a qualitative approach rather than a quantitative one.
Figure 3.6: Workforce analysis and strategies

Source: Adapted from Washington State Department of Personnel (2000: 7) and Garrant, (2004: 8)

Step 1: Demand forecast
This step deals with measures of future activities and workloads, and describing the competency set needed by the workforce of the future. Demand analysis identifies the workforce needed to carry out the mission of an organisation. Morrish (2000) suggests...
that broadly the issues that influence the demands on organisations fall into two categories: an organisation’s own direction and its environmental factors.

Every organisation is faced with different demands and challenges. Recognition of the issues that influence demand and the mechanism devised by the organisation to tackle the challenges is what determines an organisation’s direction. Organisational issues that may influence direction include: the strategic plan; budget forecasts; new equipment; work inflows and outflows; work practices; workforce culture, and reward systems. Environmental factors, generally, fall into four categories: social, technological, economic and public sector employment (Bassman, 1990).

Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) stated that an important part of the demand analysis process is examining not only what work the organisation will do in the future, but how that work will be performed. Some possible considerations cited by Morrish (2000: 22-23) include:

- **How will jobs and workload change as a result of technological advancements, economic, social, and political conditions?**
- **What are the consequences or results of these changes?**
- **What will be the reporting relationships?**
- **How will divisions, work units, and jobs are designed?**
- **How will work flow into each part of the organisation? What will be done with it? Where will the work flow?**
They further recommend that once these considerations have been assessed, the next step should be to identify the competencies employees will need to carry out that work. Competencies are a set of behaviours that encompass skills, knowledge, abilities, and personal attributes that, taken together, are critical to successful work accomplishment (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). Competencies may be defined organisationally or on an individual basis. Identifying competencies on an organisational basis provides a means for pinpointing the most critical competencies for organisational success. These core competencies are those that are embodied across the organisation and between job types (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). The competencies provide management and staff with a common understanding of the skills and behaviours that are important to the organisation. Therefore, it plays a key role in decisions on recruiting, employee development, personnel development, and performance management (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).

Garrant (2004) argues that the focus of demand forecasting should be on the functions that an organisation must perform and not just on the people. This may provide one of the greatest benefits in WFP because it offers the chance for an organisation to re-examine long-standing assumptions about the purpose and direction of its programme in light of changes that are taking place in the external environment.

Step 2: Supply projection

Once the demand issues have been identified, supply of labour is required. Supply analysis focuses on identifying and analysing existing workforce and projecting future workforce supply (Garrant, 2004). In general, this step involves:
1. Creating an existing workforce profile;

2. Reviewing trend data that provide both descriptive and forecasting models describing how turnover will affect the workforce in the absence of management action. This kind of trend analysis is essential to the solution analysis phase;

3. Projecting future workforce supply.

Morrish (2000) suggests that as much of the labour for future workforce will be provided by those who are already currently employed within an organisation, it is both vital and useful to ascertain the strengths and weaknesses that exist within the workforce. A profile of its existing workforce helps an organisation to understand where it is in terms of the right number of people with the right skills (Garrant, 2004) and there are many factors that can be included in the analyses of the present workforce profile such as:

- Number of employees and contracted workers;
- Education level;
- Skill/ Competency assessment of employees;
- Salary level and contract workforce expenditure data;
- Workforce diversity (age, gender, and race);
- Retirement eligibility statistics;
- Location.

Morrish (2000) categorises the types of workforce data into two types: census and trend. The census data provides a picture of the current workforce at a particular point in time or over a period and may include demographic data such as occupation, level, sex, age, level of service, location, employee type and status. Trend or transaction data provides
historical data of what has happened or gone on before. This may include features such as employee separation and acquisition, vacancies, retirement patterns, promotion and workload (Bartholomew et al., 1991)

Apart from skill/competency assessment the other factors stated above should be readily available to organisations through employee payroll records, employee files, and various human resources databases (Garrant, 2004; Office of Human Resource Assistant Secretary for Management and Budget, 1999).

Assessing Skills/Competencies

There are a number of ways to assess competencies. Assessment methods vary in degrees of precision, complexity, and time and effort to administer (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). One relatively simple assessment method is concluding what competencies are from the employees’ job class specifications and position descriptions. This would give a very general idea of the number of employees who are presumed to have certain knowledge and skill sets (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).

The problem with this approach is its lack of precision. For example, because it does not look at the employee, it will not identify available competencies that are not represented in the existing class specification. As such, the organisation could miss some good opportunities for selecting and developing from within. Nonetheless, as a first cut or where the organisation has limited WFP capability, this may be the approach to take in the beginning.
A better, more specific, approach is to conduct an actual assessment of employees’ competency levels. An actual assessment will provide much more useful information for determining the number of those available and capable of fulfilling future functional requirements. It will give good information as to what recruitment, training, and other strategies need to be deployed to address workforce gaps and surpluses (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).

As mentioned previously, conducting an actual assessment can get very complicated depending on what approach is taken. For example, some organisations conduct thorough job analyses and individual employee assessments by multiple sources, including the employee. The degree of precision needed by the organisation, its culture, and time and resource availability are some of the key factors influencing which approach to take (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).

**Step 3: Gap Analysis**

Gap analysis is the process of comparing information from the supply and demand analysis to identify the differences, i.e. the “gaps” between the current organisational competencies and the competency set needed in the future workforce (Garrant, 2004; Helton and Soubik, 2004). Gap analysis is a process of identifying the differences between the workforce of today and the workforce that will be needed in the future (U.S Department of Health and Human Services, 1999).

A gap indicates a future shortage of needed employees and effective strategies such as outreach recruitment, training, succession and planning will need to be developed and
implemented to fill the need. An analysis of such gaps and timely action is needed to ensure that the “gap” problem does not become too hard to handle (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). An analysis should consider the composition of the workforce, including demographic characteristics, geographic location, size, and employee skill level (Garrant, 2004).

Organisations should establish workforce strategies based on the results of this analysis. For an organisation that has carried out such an analysis, the results will show one of the following (Garrant, 2004):

- A gap (when projected supply is less than forecasted demand), which indicates a future shortage of needed workers or skills;
- A surplus (when projected supply is greater than forecasted demand), which indicates a future excess in some categories of workers and may require action (Garrant, 2004);
- Supply gaps associated with national and local labour market shortages. This may include a wide range of professions and in particular those of teachers, social workers, environmental health, planners and building control employees. Shortages may be more severe in some areas or regions (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b);
- Changes in demand associated with modernising the way that services are to be delivered including changing roles, new skill mixes, and different ways of delivering services e.g. outsourcing, partnerships, and joint ventures;
- Skills shortages within the workforce, this includes basic/essential skills, customer care skills, managerial competences, project management and skills required to deliver e-government (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b).
It is not always possible to produce very detailed workforce development plans for every group of staff in the organisation. It is therefore, important to prioritise in the pre-planning phase those groups that have the highest impact on the business (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b). WFP should support decision-making regarding recruitment criteria and effective methods. Workforce costs can be reduced by identifying how services can be delivered most effectively and efficiently. Forecasting the type and number of jobs that are needed in the future identifies the skills, knowledge and behaviour needed by both existing employees and potential recruits. Anticipating future changes can allow remedial action to be taken like recruitment freezes and retraining to minimise the potential costs of redundancies. As working practices change WFP information will also provide information about the future workplace accommodation needs, thereby enhancing opportunities to control costs (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b).

**Step 4: Strategy Development**

The final step in the workforce analysis phase involves the development of a strategy which is also sometimes known as solution analysis, to address future gaps and surpluses (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b; Garrant, 2004). A wide range of strategies exists that organisations might use to attract and develop staff with needed competencies and to deal with excesses in competencies no longer needed in the organisation (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). Solution analysis must also take into account changes that take place in the workforce on an ongoing, unplanned basis. This is where the trends identified in workforce analysis (as
part of the supply analysis) come into play (U.S Department of Health and Human Services, 1999).

Strategies include the programmes, policies, and practices that assist organisations in recruiting, developing, and retaining the critical staff needed to achieve programmes and goals. Many factors that may influence which strategy or, more likely, which combination of strategies should be used are as follows (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000: 11):

- Time: Is there enough time to develop staff internally for anticipated vacancies or new competency needs, or is special, fast-paced recruitment the best approach?;
- Resources: The availability of adequate resources is likely to influence which strategies are used and to what degree, as well as priorities and timing;
- Internal depth: Does existing staff demonstrate the potential or interest to develop new competencies and assume new or modified positions, or is external recruitment needed?;
- ‘In-demand’ competencies: How high the competition is for the needed future competencies may influence whether recruitment versus internal development and succession is the most effective strategy, especially when compensation levels are limited;
- Workplace and workforce dynamics: Whether particular productivity and retention strategies need to be deployed will be influenced by workplace climate (e.g., employee satisfaction levels, workforce age, diversity, personal needs);
strategic plans and focuses on the budget. This also leads to the development of future workforce profile, skill, numbers and levels. The gap analysis stage compares

Table 3.5: A summary of steps in workforce planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supply Analysis</td>
<td>Workforce demographic and transaction data</td>
<td>Workforce profiles (such as age, grade, service, occupation, permanent /temporary tenure, supervisory ratio, and diversity)</td>
<td>Senior Management (commitment required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Workforce skills / experience data collection; workload measurement inputs</td>
<td>Trends / predictors (such as turnover, retirement rates, and replacement patterns)</td>
<td>Programme Managers, supervisors, and staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Workforce skills inventory; workload measurement data</td>
<td>HR Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demand Analysis</td>
<td>Management Assessment of programme direction</td>
<td>Future workforce profile: skills, numbers, levels</td>
<td>Union representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strategic Plans</td>
<td></td>
<td>Optional: contract support; internal consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Budget Plans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gap Analysis</td>
<td>Supply Analysis data: Demographics, employment trends; skills inventory</td>
<td>Analysis of differences between present workforce and future needs; priorities for addressing change</td>
<td>Senior Management; Programme Managers; supervisors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demand Analysis data: Future skills needs; staffing levels</td>
<td></td>
<td>Optional: contract support; internal consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solution Analysis</td>
<td>Output from Gap Analysis: Identified &quot;gaps&quot; between present workforce and workforce needed for the future.</td>
<td>Strategies / options for workforce transition</td>
<td>Senior Management; Programme Managers; Supervisors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis of interventions needed for transition</td>
<td>HR Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Optional: contract support; internal consultant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S Department of Health and Human Services (1999: 12)
information from the supply and demand analysis to identify the differences. The final stage, i.e. solution analysis, assesses the results of the gap analysis and develops strategies/options for workforce transition. All these stages require the participation and commitment of senior management, programme managers, and supervisory staff and in some cases the support of internal consultants.

**Phase three – Develop and Implement Workforce Plan**

Certain basics of any good project management plan should be addressed when implementing the Workforce Plan strategies developed in step four (Strategy analysis) (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000). The Workforce Plan should be implemented in relation to the requirements of the organisation’s strategic plan. If the strategic plan timetable changes due to unexpected customer, leadership, or legislative changes, adjustments to the workforce plan strategies may be needed (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000; Garrant, 2004). Implementation brings the workforce plan to life and may need a separate action plan to address the implementation of each strategy in the workforce plan. Before implementing the plan, organisations should consider:

- Ensuring that there is executive support for the Plan (Garrant, 2004);
- Allocating necessary resources to carry out workforce strategies;
- Clarifying roles and responsibilities in implementing strategies which includes identifying who is involved in implementing what and identifying the need for coordination among different parts of the organisation or with different agencies (Garrant, 2004);
- Communicating the plan. The basis of the plan, as well as its elements, should be communicated to all employees (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).
Phase four: Monitor, Evaluate, and Revise

Evaluation and modification are very important in workforce planning and are key to continuous improvement. Although a workforce plan may cover five years, it should be reviewed annually. If an organisation does not regularly review its workforce planning efforts, it runs the risk of failing to respond to unanticipated responding to changes that occur incrementally from within or unanticipated external impacts (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000; Garrant, 2004).

Consequently, organisations and managers should ensure and establish a process that allows for a regular review of WFP and implementation progress efforts in order to:

- Review performance measurement information;
- Assess what's working and not;
- Make needed adjustments to the plan and strategies;
- Address new workforce and organisational issues that might take place (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000; Garrant, 2004).

Organisations that have already been using WFP have found the following data collection tools to be helpful in determining whether or not the workforce plan is achieving results (Garrant, 2004):

- Customer satisfaction inventories;
- Programme progress reviews;
- Standardized questionnaires.
Finally, Morrish (2000) asserts that ongoing evaluation helps organisations and agencies attain the most favoured model of career management and aids in combating discriminatory barriers to promotion.

In summary, it can be said there are many frameworks and models for WFP developed by many authors and these models are different, because of the different perspectives that the authors have taken. However, the WFP models are very similar despite variations in their terminology and the order of the processes. They provide a solid framework for discussing current and future internal and external pressures facing human resource management. Successful implementation and application of workforce planning depends on a holistic approach and requires the commitment of the organisation and its stakeholders and integration with the core business activities such as strategic and financial planning.

3.6.6 Workforce analysis in the Libya hotel sector

Borrowing and modifying the WFP model outlined in figure 3.6, the researcher has adapted a theoretical unified model identifying four steps of WFA that would be an appropriate strategy/plan to solving the HR issues in the Libyan hotel sector (Figure 3.7). The figure shows the steps to be followed to reach the recommendations, which will lead to the implementation of the strategy plan.
Figure 3.7: A unified theoretical model of workforce planning and development

The left part (demand) represents the HR issues facing the hotel sector and identifies the workforce needed to carry out the tasks of the hotel sector. The right part (supply) represents the issues which face the Hospitality Education Institutions (HEIs). Supply analysis involves creating a current workforce profile and reviewing data and projecting future workforce supply (Garrant, 2004). A profile of its existing workforce helps an organisation understand where it is in terms of the right number of people with the right skills (Garrant, 2004). A should be a two-way communication between the HEIs and
the hotel sector in terms of HEIs providing the relevant curriculum and skilled workers and hotel sector recruiting those graduating and acquiring practical skills.

The gap analysis part is the process of comparing information from the supply analysis and demand analysis to identify the issues from the left part (hotel sector) and the right part (HEIs), which lead to low quality services in the hotel sector. Also, this involves the process of comparing the workforce supply projection to the workforce demand forecast. An analysis should consider the work of the workforce, including demographic characteristics, geographic location, size, and employee skill levels (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000; Garrant, 2004).

The final step of the model is the strategy development part; which is the process of developing strategies for closing gaps in competencies and reducing surplus competencies (Employers’ Organisation for Local Government, 2003b). This final step in WFP involves the development of strategies to address future gaps and surpluses. Strategy development includes the programmes, policies, and practices that assist organisations in recruiting, developing, and retaining the critical staff needed to achieve their programmes and goals. Also, it involves developing staff with needed skills and dealing with workers or skills no longer needed in an organisation (Garrant, 2004).

3.7 SUMMARY

This chapter has explored the literature on human resource development issues and human resources issues specific to the tourism and hospitality sector. It then provided a background to workforce planning and explored the existing theoretical models for
Chapter Three: Literature review

WFP and development. Four phases, namely: setting strategic direction; workforce analysis; development and implementation of WFP and monitoring, evaluation and revision were also analysed in detail. The second phase, i.e. the workforce analysis, which includes the four steps: supply; demand; gap (problems) and solution (strategy plan) were researched in detail and were brought together into a unified model (figure 3.7) which will be used to study the HR issues in the hotel sector in Libya (chapter 5). The next chapter will present the research approach and provide a justification for choosing the research design and methodology.
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH APPROACH

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 RESEARCH OVERVIEW

4.3 QUALITATIVE OR QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH?

4.4 THEORETICAL APPROACH

4.4.1 Epistemology: constructionism.

4.4.2 Theoretical perspective: Interpretive / Phenomenology

4.5 CASE STUDY OF LIBYA

4.5.1 Grounded approach

4.6 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE THREE

4.6.1 Delphi Technique

4.7 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE FOUR

4.7.1 Document analysis

4.7.2 Semi-structured interviews

4.7.3 Recording and transcription of interviews

4.7.4 Data analysis

4.8 RELIABILITY, VALIDITY AND TRIANGULATION

4.8.1 Reliability

4.8.2 Validity

4.8.3 Triangulation

4.9 GENERALISATION OF RESULTS

4.10 SUMMARY
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH APPROACH

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter provided a critical review of literature on HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as alternative models of workforce planning and adapted a unified theoretical model for WFA. This chapter discusses the research approach used to achieve the research objectives outlined in chapter 1. The chapter begins by outlining the research overview (Section 4.2) followed by a discussion of the design approach used, i.e. opting qualitative for and or quantitative study (Section 4.3). The chapter then describes the four core research elements as identified by Crotty (1998), that is, epistemology, theoretical perspective, methodology and methods (Section 4.4) (figure 4.1), detailing their relevance in this research. Next, the chapter discusses the research methodology and methods used to achieve objectives three and four in the research (Section 4.5, 4.6 and 4.7 respectively). Issues relating to reliability, validity and triangulation are presented in section 4.8. This is followed by a brief discussion on generalisation of results (section 4.9).
4.2 RESEARCH OVERVIEW

Figure 4.1: Research approach

Crotty (1998) identifies four different levels of consideration for research design: Epistemology; Theoretical Perspective; Methodology and Methods. Crotty asserts that setting out the research in the right sequence should support the research process and therefore determine the status of the findings. According to Crotty (1998:3): epistemology refers to the theory of knowledge embedded in the theoretical perspective and thereby in the methodology.
Theoretical perspective: the philosophical stance informing the methodology and thus provides a context for the process and grounds its logic and criteria.

Methodology: the strategy, plan and action, process or design lying behind the choice and use of particular methods and linking the choice and use of methods to the desired outcomes.

Methods: the techniques or procedures used to gather and analyses data related to some research question or hypothesis. These are usefully be considered in two ways: theoretical approach (see section 4.4) practical approach (see section 4.6, 4.7)

In this research, HR issues facing the Libyan tourism and hospitality sector, the Libyan Tourism Master Plan and development of a best practice WFA were explored via a research string of Constructionism (epistemology)-interpretivism (phenomenology) – case study (methodology).

4.3 QUALITATIVE OR QUANTITATIVE RESEARCH?

Brewerton and Millward (2001) point out that the process of setting a research design involves three levels of decision-making (figure 4.2). At the broadest level, the researcher must decide whether the investigation is going to be largely quantitative, largely qualitative or both (i.e. what type of evidence is required). At the next level of consideration the actual design of the study must be decided upon (i.e. what type of strategy will be adopted). At the lowest level, a decision is made about how evidence is to be collected and analysed (i.e. what type of research methods will be employed).
Chapter Four: Research Approach

Figure 4.2: Levels of decision making in setting a research design

![Levels of decision making in setting a research design]

Source: Adapted from Brewerton and Millward (2001:19)

According to Amaratunga et al. (2002) qualitative research is a source of well-grounded rich descriptions and explanations of processes in identifiable local contexts. Berg (2001) differentiates between qualitative and quantitative research by identifying qualitative research as referring to meanings, concepts, definitions, characteristics, metaphors, symbols, and descriptions of things, and quantitative research as referring to counts and measures of things. Bell (1993) adds that quantitative researchers assimilate facts and study the association between one set of gathered facts with another, whilst qualitative researchers are more interested in understanding individual and group perceptions of their environment. Fundamentally, qualitative research methods are designed to help researchers understand people and the social and cultural contexts within which they live.
Chapter Four: Research Approach

In developing the WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector and exploring human resource issues, the researcher needed to get a grasp of the cultural context of Libya and considered it necessary to interact with HEI staff, hotel managers and government officials. Thus, the research approach adopted for this study was geared more towards qualitative rather than quantitative in order to generate rich descriptions from interviewees. Silverman (1998) observed that quantitative research tends to neglect aspects of cultural environment and social interaction and negotiation that could affect the outcomes of studies. Silverman’s (1998) argument seems to underline the relevance of qualitative approach in this study. Libyan society is deeply rooted in Islamic culture, which cannot be overlooked in this research, particularly in view of the fact that the hotel sector involves the interaction of people with varied cultural practices and beliefs.

4.4 THEORETICAL APPROACH

4.4.1 Epistemology: constructionism
Epistemology is derived from a Greek word ‘episteme’ which means knowledge and ‘logos’ meaning explanation (Miller and Brewer, 2003). Epistemology therefore is concerned with the nature of knowledge and more specifically how we know what we know. Crotty (1998:3) defines epistemology as “the theory of knowledge embedded in the theoretical perspective and thereby in the methodology”

The epistemological choice for this research finds itself rooted in constructionism. Constructionism provides a methodology for investigating the beliefs of individual respondents rather than investigating an external reality, such as the tangible and comprehensible economic and technological dimensions of management (Hunt, 1991).
It rejects the objectivist view of human knowledge and holds that there is no objective truth waiting to be discovered (Crotty, 1998). Truth, or meaning, comes into existence in and out of people’s engagement with the realities in the world (Crotty, 1998). Thus, meaning is not discovered but constructed.

Indeed, scholars (e.g. Guba, 1990; Lincoln, 1990; Guba and Lincoln, 1994; Schwandt, 1994; Crotty, 1998) working within the constructionist paradigm maintain that reality does not exist ‘out there’ but is constructed by human beings in relation to each other. In other words, meaning does not exist inherently in goods and services rather individuals ascribe meaning to things according to a diverse range of associations/interactions. Categorically, Crotty (1998) asserts that constructionism is not just about the human construction of meaning as if it were independent of phenomena in the world, rather, it is human interaction with the world and how humans then make sense of that interaction. Sless (2002) agrees with Crotty (1998) in pointing out that human beings construct meaning through, for example, conversation. Sless (2002) further iterates that people learn particularly well when making things – especially things that can be shared with others. Sharing a creation can result not only in refinement of meaning, but also in the learner obtaining a deeper understanding of other people’s perspectives on the object and on the ideas to which it is related (Sless, 2002).

In general, constructionism identifies the myriad of mental constructions of the world; tries to understand them, to locate some consensus among them, and to reconstruct the world based on these understandings. Also, drawing from the inductive nature of qualitative inquiry constructionists seek theories that arise from the data and help
explain the many ways that humans conceptualize the world in which they live. Hence, the theoretical lens of constructionism is ideal when developing a WFA model for the hotel sector in Libya. Arguably, the development of best practice WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector will be an outcome of shared constructed reality amongst key stakeholders.

4.4.2 Theoretical perspective: Interpretivism / Phenomenology

A theoretical framework is "the philosophical stance informing the methodology and thus providing the context for the process and grounding its logic and criteria" (Crotty, 1998: 3). In this research, theoretical framework provides the background for understanding the experiences and the viewpoints of the key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector to inform the development of best practice WFA model that suits the Libya context.

According to Myers (1997) and Neuman (2000) interpretive research attempts to study a phenomenon in its natural settings and interpret the phenomenon through the meanings that people give to them. Schwandt (1994:118) adds that interpretive research is "fundamentally concerned with meaning and it seeks to understand social members’ definition of a situation". It often addresses essential features of shared meaning and understanding whereas constructionism extends this concern with knowledge as produced and interpreted to an anti-essentialist level. The main feature of the interpretive research tradition is the stipulation that person and world are inextricably related through persons’ lived experience of the world.
To acquire better understanding of experiences and the viewpoints of the key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector, this research uses an interpretative-phenomenological approach. With an interpretative approach, there is no predefined dependent and independent variables; rather the focus is on the full complexity of human sense making as the context emerges. Furthermore, understanding of people’s viewpoints (i.e. the hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials as in the case of this research) is considered a subject of a process of interpretation rather than hypothesis testing (Sanders, 2002).

According to Patton (1990), a phenomenological study is one that focuses on descriptions of what people experience and how it is that they experience. It seeks to explain the structure and essence of the experiences of a group of people. Saunders et al. (1997) assert that phenomenology is characterized by the researcher’s attempt to understand what is happening and why it is happening. According to them, such research would be particularly concerned with the context in which such events take place.

Denscombe (2003) outlines the features of the phenomenological approach to social research that deals with people’s perception or meanings, attitudes and beliefs, feelings and emotions. Denscombe (2003) asserts that phenomenological research first and foremost needs to provide a description that adequately covers the complexity of the studied situation.
Crotty (1998) provides a recapitulation of phenomenology as an approach to research, in asserting that phenomenology endeavours to advance the notion that humans are creative agents in the construction of social and natural worlds and the mixture of cultures and sub-cultures into which people are born provides them with meanings. Because the intent of this study is to understand the experiences and points view of the Libyan hotel sector’s key stakeholders, phenomenology, with its focus on individual subjective experiences and perceptions seemed absolutely appropriate. Specifically, the use of a phenomenological approach aids in understanding the HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector, their causes and effects from the hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials’ experiences and interactions within Libyan social-cultural and political context. Interviewing key stakeholders helps to present their views on the subject matter, which in turn enriches the researchers’ own experiences and enhances the research output.

4.5 METHODOLOGY: CASE STUDY OF LIBYA

Methodology refers to "the strategy or plan of action, process or design lying behind the choice and use of particular methods and linking the choice and use of methods to the desired outcomes" (Crotty, 1998:3). Case study was the chosen methodology for this piece of research. The rationale underpinning this choice is that a case study is concerned with exploring particular incidents, cases or events and provides the richest picture of what transpires (Cornford and Smithson, 1996). In this study, the case study methodology was implemented to investigate the views of the key stakeholders (hotel managers in Libya, HEI staff and government officials in Libya) in relation to the HR issues facing the Libyan tourism sector and to establish congruence and dissonance.
between them (Objective four). This provided a rich picture of HR and WFA issues facing the Libyan hotel sector.

The term case study is strongly associated with qualitative research although it is used in a variety of ways. Robson (2002 cited in Saunders, et al., 2003:93) defines a case study as:

*A strategy for doing research which involves an empirical investigation of a particular contemporary phenomenon within its real life context using multiple sources of evidence.*

Yin (2003) describes a case study as being an empirical inquiry that investigates contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and when multiple sources of evidence are used. Yin (2003:12) adds that the essence of a case study is “to illuminate a decision or set of decisions: why they were taken, how they were implemented, and what result”.

Case studies have been used to describe a unit of analysis (e.g. a case study of a particular organisation) as well as to describe a research method. Other writers (Bell, 1993), argue that case study methodology is particularly appropriate for individual researchers, because it gives the opportunity for one aspect of a problem to be studied in depth within a limited scale time. Bell (1993) adds that the great strength of the case study methodology is that it allows the researcher to concentrate on a specific instance or situation and to identify, or attempt to identify, the various interactive processes at work.
Case studies are used widely today as a methodology across various types of social research such as sociology, psychology, history, economics, planning, administration, public policy, education, management studies and tourism (Yin, 1993; Holliday, 2002; Miller and Brewer, 2003; Weber 2004). Finn et al. (2000) notes that using the case study approach helps to not only understand the particular and unique features of the case but also to draw out analysis that has a wider applicability. For some researchers, case study research includes a single case; otherwise the research would be regarded as comparative and not case study research. Other researchers (e.g. Yin, 2003) argue that multiple cases may be chosen to try to replicate insights found within individual cases or to represent contrasting situations. Multiple case studies are “considered more compelling, and the overall study is therefore regarded as more robust” (Yin, 2003:46).

Basically, case studies are usually inductive, seeking to understand certain phenomenon by exploring issues surrounding the phenomenon in depth and in context to generate or replicate theory. The aim is not only to understand the particular and unique feature of the case but also to draw out analysis that has a wider applicability (Finn et al., 2000). A key strength of the case study methodology involves using multiple sources and techniques in the data gathering process, consequently, providing researchers with opportunities to triangulate data in order to strengthen the research findings and conclusions (Soy, 1996). Any findings or conclusions in a case study are therefore likely to be much more convincing and accurate if it is based on several different sources of information, following a corroboratory mode (Soy, 1996).
The data collection methods employed may be various and may include questionnaires, interviews, observations and document analysis (Yin, 2003; Saunders, et al., 2003) (see figure 4.3).

**Figure 4.3:** Multiple sources of evidence in case studies.

![Diagram showing multiple sources of evidence in case studies](image)

**Source:** Adapted from Yin (2003:100)

### 4.5.1 Grounded approach

An alternative methodology that the researcher considered was grounded theory which has become a popular choice of methodology among social researchers (Denscombe, 2003). In particular, it has been adopted by those engaged in small-scale projects using qualitative data for the study of human interaction, and by those whose research is exploratory and focused on particular settings.
The normal starting point for research is to use findings from previous research as a platform for deciding what is worth investigating and how it needs to be investigated. Grounded theory, in contrast, expects the researcher to start without any fixed ideas about the nature of the thing that is about to be investigated or how it operates. Thus, rather than testing theoretical workability grounded theory helps build up theories that emerge from data. This calls for the researcher to approach the topic without being influenced by previous theories or other research relating to the area. Another important characteristic of grounded theory relates to the data analysis procedure, which involves identifying, categorising and describing phenomena in detail. Exceptional emphasis is put on open-coding as part of the data analysis process (Borgatti, 2004).

In order to meet the objectives of this research, a grounded approach (Pettigrew, 2000) as opposed to grounded theory was adopted. In contrast to grounded theory, a grounded approach is more flexible and includes aspects of literature review (meaning there is use of findings from previous research), which can be used to supplement the researcher’s findings. Specifically, a grounded approach was used with the Libyan hotel managers to gather more information on LTMP and its HRD strategies, to supplement information gathered from previous studies by Abuzed (2002) and Jwaili et al. (2004).

According to Denscombe (2003) one should be cautious while using the term ‘grounded theory’. Denscombe (2003) notes that the term is often used in a rather loose way to refer to approaches that accept some of the basic premises but do not adopt the methodological rigour that was advocated by Glaser and Straus (1967). Grounded theory was ultimately rejected for two key reasons. First, the researcher had the
availability of a vast number of secondary resources and some understanding of the
issues to be investigated. Furthermore, the LTMP provided background literature, which
initiated the research. Thus, data collection in the field was not the starting point of this
research as advocated in ground theory. Second, open-coding, which is an important
part of data analysis in grounded theory was not used, instead the research adopted
thematic analysis to develop core issues/themes.

4.6 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE 3

The discussion in this section will illustrate the methodology used to achieve objective
three: To develop a best practice WFA model appropriate to the needs of the Libyan
hotel sector.

4.6.1 Delphi Technique

A key method used to gain an insight into workforce planning issues facing the Libyan
Hotel Sector was the Delphi Technique. Delphi technique is "a class of qualitative
models" (Xie and Smith, 2000:17), which involves gathering information from a group
of experts on a specified issue where each expert states separately his or her opinion.
Delphi technique - named after the classical Greek "Delphic" oracle (Strauss and
Zeigler, 1975) - is a well-established means for building expert consensus.

The development of the Delphi technique was arguably inspired by the need of the
American Air Force to deal with a wide spectrum of futuristic problems ranging from
long-term threat assessment forecasts of technology and social development (Dalkey,
1969). The technique is based mainly on the theory that two or more heads are better
than one (Storey et al., 2001). Dalkey (1969) simply describes the technique as a method of eliciting and refining group judgement.

Following extensive experiments by the Rand organisation on the effectiveness of the Delphi procedure in formulating group judgment, the use of experts in solving problems was recommended due to the fact that during the iteration process the residual information of the less knowledgeable or non-experts did not feature prominently (Dalkey, 1969). Tersine (1976) thus sees the technique as a tool for problem solving and forecasting using a group of experts from diverse backgrounds. Tersine (1976) further defines the technique as a method that systematically solicits, collects, evaluates and tabulates independent opinion of experts without group discussion, hence an anonymous approach.

Referring to the main features of the Delphi technique, Strauss and Zeigler (1975) state that the Delphi technique holds a number of characteristics, which are:

- Using groups of experts for obtaining information;
- Conducted in a series of rounds between which a summary of the experts' opinions of the previous round is circulated to the participating experts;
- Using iteration, where each expert is permitted to review his or her opinion comparing to the other experts' opinions. The successive rounds often produce a narrowing of the initial spread of opinions and shifting of the median;
- Attempting systematically to produce a consensus.

Tersine (1976) suggests that the initial stage of the technique entails the definition of the problem and the distribution of series of questionnaires to relevant experts. The
Interviewees are then asked for information to aid other interviewees' responses. The opinions are then eliminated and only facts are carried forward and tabulated. The resulting information is shared amongst the participants and the process is repeated until a consensus is achieved. Figure 4.4 below summarises Tersine's (1976) approach.

**Figure 4.4: Delphi Technique process**

```
Problem definition

Determine expertise required

Select experts

Prepare questionnaires

Distribute questionnaires

Analyse responses

Consensus reached

Consensus not reached

Provide requested information and tabulate responses

Prepare next questionnaire

Compile final report and disseminate results
```

**Source:** Tersine (1976:53)

Story *et al.* (2001) on the other hand identify three key distinct stages of the Delphi technique; exploration, synthesis and verification. The exploration stage entails a definition of the study's objectives and conduction of experience surveys with an expert sample. They argue that this stage is crucial to the success of the Delphi technique because it involves the selection of the panel of experts and also the problem specification. The synthesis stage basically involves the iteration and feedback of
responses into a workable consensus. Story et al. (2001) recommend the use of qualitative questions to simplify the synthesis of participants' responses. Lastly the verification stage involves enhancing reliability and validity of the responses. Story et al. (2001) proposes a combination of techniques necessary to improve the accountability of the study. They, for instance, propose the use of a split sample through which comparisons can be made in the initial stages. They argue that this will enable the assessment of reliability. They also propose the use of additional researchers to minimise possibility of bias in the interpretation of exploratory data.

In addition, the Delphi technique allows for anonymity, minimisation of bias, the non-requirement of common location and the enhanced individuality in responses Mitchell, 1991). Several authors have argued the anonymity element of the Delphi is beneficial over other similar methods for a number of reasons. Dalkey (1969), for instance, observed that the design of Delphi technique was such that it sought to minimise the biasing effect of dominant individuals, eliminate irrelevant communications and peer pressure towards conformity. Tersine (1976) further argues that by concealing the identities of panelists the 'bandwagon' effect is minimised thereby encouraging individual thinking. Moreover, Mitchell (1991) notes that the anonymity element in addition helps to ensure confidentiality, an integral aspect of research. The Delphi technique as such ensures the equal participation of panelists.

The justifications for employing the Delphi technique in this research are:

1. The Delphi technique is conceived as a method for obtaining the experts' opinions without necessarily bringing them together;
2. The Delphi technique is a programme of sequential, individual interrogations, interspersed with information feedback on the opinions expressed by the experts in previous rounds; in such contexts the Delphi technique tends to be a theory or model-building approach where the process of adding and removing is continuous in order to establish a consensus, which can be taken as a solid base for forming a theory or a model. This feature supports and complements the inductive attitude adopted in this research;

3. The Delphi technique is efficient for obtaining judgmental data, as it (a) maintains attention directly on the issue, (b) provides a framework within which individuals with diverse backgrounds can work together on the same problems, and (c) produces precise documented records.

In order to develop a best practice WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector (Objective 3), Delphi technique was well-suited. It helped in the provision of crucial information on the issues surrounding WFA in the Libyan hotel sector. For example, whether there is a need for WFA, whether the Libyan hotels have any workforce plan and whether such plans are implemented. By implementing the steps in the exploratory stage, the researcher was able to build consensus amongst key stakeholders on the best practice WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector. Experts’ opinion was sought on the proposed theoretical WFA model. Effectively, the development of the best practice model was an iterative process as most of the experts were approached more than once and asked for their opinion on how to improve and modify the model.
At this stage, the researcher mainly used purposive sampling. According to Saunders et al. (2003) purposive sampling enables the researcher to use his/her judgement to select cases that will best enable him to answer his research questions and meet the research objectives. Maxwell (1996) asserts that purposive sampling is a strategy in which particular settings, persons, or events are selected deliberately in order to provide important information that can not be derived from other choices. Purposive sampling maximizes the chance of obtaining accurate information about the studied phenomenon for it relies upon choosing those who have both the experience of the phenomenon and also the ability to communicate their experience of that phenomenon. Purposive sampling was used to target specific hotel managers, senior HEI staff and senior government officials for interviews according to the following criteria:

1. All of them have experienced the phenomenon under study,

2. They can communicate their experience of the phenomenon as free as possible from embarrassment and bias,

Those individuals were selected who were deemed experts in aspects of what is going on in their own environment, community or institution (Maxwell, 1996). The rationale behind the use of this sampling technique is to seek information-rich persons (in this case – Libyan hotel sector experts) who could be interviewed. For this phase of the research, the candidates were selected very carefully. The selection was based on their position and experience. For the hotels, 17 Hotel managers, who had over 10 years experience working as senior managers, were selected. Out of this sample, the researcher was able to interview 14 managers. Three heads of institutions who had at least five years experience were chosen for the HEIs. Seven government officials were selected and the selection was based on their positions in government as heads of
departments that were involved in WFP related to the hotel sector and tourism industry in general, their qualifications and over seven years experience. Out of the seven, two officials declined to be interviewed due to lack of time. Thus, the sampling procedure yielded a total of 27 experts of which 22 were interviewed 5 having dropped out as they could not commit their time. The breakdown of the interview process is provided in table 4.1

The process of questioning was iterative and comprised four stages.

**First Stage:**

Three main sets of questions presented to the experts in the first round of interviews. This round of questioning was divided into three themes namely: General awareness of WFP; Phases in WFP; Best Practice WFP model (see appendix 3). The first theme of interview questions focused on general awareness of WFA amongst the key stakeholders. The respondents were fully aware of WFA and highlighted key issues facing WFP in the Libyan hotel sector (see chapter 5 section 5.3). The second theme of interview questions focused on the four phases of WFP that is, setting strategic direction, workforce analysis, implementation of workforce plan and monitoring, evaluating and revising workforce plan. The interviewees were asked to give their opinion on each of the WFP phases. The information gathered was analysed, summarised and circulated again to the same experts for further comment including whether they wanted to modify their ideas in the light of the other experts' opinions (see chapter 5 sections 6.2).
The third set included the theoretical model on work force planning and was derived from literature. Experts from the hotel sector, HEIs and government officials were given an opportunity to state their opinion on the individual elements of the initial theoretical WFA model (i.e. figure 3.8 also see chapter 5 section 5.3 for the first round of opinions). Again, these opinions were analysed, summarised and circulated to the same experts for further comments so as to build consensus on the actual elements to be included in the best practice WFA model that suits the Libyan context (see chapter 5 section 5.6.). In the initial round of the interviews, the interviewees concurred on the four steps of WFP and the need for government involvement as reflected by the situation in Libya. The respondents were, however, not consistent on the role of the government. This led the researcher to the second stage which involved further interviews.

Second Stage:

In the second stage, the researcher only focussed on the best practice WFA model and the role of government. In this stage, the interviewees agreed that the government should play a key role in co-ordinating activities of the hotel sector, but were not clear on how the government could co-ordinate between the key stakeholders of WFP.

Third Stage:

In the third stage, interviewees concurred on how the government could co-ordinate between the key stakeholders and some respondents were of the opinion that other
elements such as implementation strategy and evaluations of the model were necessary to address the HRD issues in the hotel sector. This led to the final stage of questioning.

Final Stage:

In the fourth and final stage, the interviewees were able to reach a consensus on the extra elements i.e. implementation and evaluation strategy of the WFP model. This led to the development of the best practice model.

Table 4.1 below shows a break down of interviewees, number of iterations to achieve consensus and average duration of interviews.

**Table 4.1: Number iterations before a final consensus on the best practice WFA model.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experts drawn from key stakeholders</th>
<th>Number of interviewees</th>
<th>Iterations to consensus</th>
<th>Duration of interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel managers</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEI staff</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government officials</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All the Delphi interviews were conducted in Libya (Tripoli). The interviews were conducted and transcribed in Arabic, after which they were translated into English. To ensure the accuracy of the translation, transcripts were verified by an independent translation expert.
The development of the best practice WFA model is seen as the greatest contribution of this research. Appropriate conclusions were drawn and recommendations made for future study.

One main challenge of using the Delphi technique is the selection of the panel. Critcher and Gladstone’s (1998) advice is that that researchers should ensure that the panelists are actually interested in the study. Mitchell (1991) in addition observes that care should be taken to minimise ‘acceptance bias’. Mitchell (1991) argues that panelists who accept the offer to participate may be more favourably disposed to the Delphi technique and what it seeks to achieve unlike those less inclined to participate. Mitchell (1991) therefore recommends initial careful planning in the endeavour to minimise this bias.

4.7 PRACTICAL APPROACH: OBJECTIVE FOUR

The discussion in this section will illustrate the methodology used to achieve objective four: To identify HR issues facing the Libyan Hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEI and government views on these issues. This research used various case study methods as suggested by Yin (1994) and Saunders et al. (2000) particularly, document analysis and semi-structured interviews.

4.7.1 Document analysis

Document analysis involves the study of existing documents, either to understand their substantive content or to illuminate deeper meanings, which may be revealed by their style and coverage (Hodder, 2000; Gray, 2004). These may be public documents (such
as media reports; government papers or publicity materials), procedural documents (such as minutes of meetings, formal letters and financial accounts) or personal documents such as diaries, letters or photographs) Document analysis is also used in cases where the investigation of events may not be possible through observation or interviews (Ritchie, 2003). Besides, Hammersley and Atkinson (1995 cited in Ritchie and Lewis; 2003:35) state that:

> Documentary analysis is particularly useful where the history of events or experiences has relevance, documentary sources may be needed when situations or events cannot be investigated by direct observation or questioning.

In effect, this research used document analysis to address the first and second research objectives, i.e. (i) to explore tourism development in Libya and critically analyse the LTMP's proposed strategy for human resource development (HRD) for the Libyan hotel sector and (ii) to carry out a critical review of literature to identify HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as alternative models of workforce analysis (WFA) to inform the adaptation of a unified theoretical model for the research.

Various documents, including textbooks, journals, government reports, academic research findings, consultancy reports, and other published and unpublished materials, were used. The most frequently used documents included: The Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) (1998); WTTC Reports (2001, 2002, and 2003); Libyan government employment and wages law; HEIs curriculum; Libyan Ministry of Economics report, 2002. The researcher also analysed the post-colonial tourism development plans and policies in Libya that were offered by the Libyan government. The justifications for utilizing document analysis within this research are:
• The researcher is sponsored by the Libyan Government to conduct this particular research;
• The researcher is guaranteed access to the available official documents;
• In addition, document analysis is a cost-effective method and other researchers can, in most cases, easily check data extracted from the documents.

4.7.2 Semi-structured interviews

Yin (1994) regards interviews as one of the most important sources of case study information. There are several forms of interviews that are possible (Yin, 1994; Finn et al., 2000; Fontana, 2000 Saunders et al., 2003): unstructured, structured and semi-structured. In unstructured interviews, research participants are asked to comment about certain events, where, they may propose solutions or provide insight into events. In this situation the interviewer needs to have a clear idea about the aspects that he wants to explore, since there are no determined questions to work through (Saunders et al., 2003).

Conversely, structured interviews are used to gather data in cases, such as neighbourhood studies. Normally, the questions are detailed and developed in advance, much as they are in a survey (Yin, 1994). In other words, a researcher prepares a set of questions specified in what it is called an ‘interview schedule’, where the same wording and order of questions are used (Kumar, 1999). These interviews are based on a pre-determined and standardized or identical set of questions (Saunders et al., 2003).
In semi-structured interviews, the researcher has a list of themes and questions to be covered. These may vary from interview to interview depending on the organizational context that is encountered in relation to the research topic. Mason (2000) identifies three characteristics of semi-structured interviews:

i. A relatively informal discussion rather than formal question and answer format;

ii. No need for the researcher to have a structured list of questions, the researcher could have a range of topics, themes or issues to cover;

iii. The data are generated via the interaction.

Semi-structured interviews encompass many advantages over structured and unstructured interviews (Flick, 1998). For example, semi-structured interviews can avoid many disadvantages encountered with unstructured interviews such as:

*As the researcher gains experience during the interviews, the questions asked of respondents change, hence the type of information obtained from those who are interviewed at the beginning may be markedly different from that obtained from those interviewed towards the end.*

(Kumar, 1999:119)

Semi-structured interviews can provide uniform information similar to that provided by structured interviews without missing the flexibility and freedom encountered with structured interviews through pre-determined set of questions prepared by interviewer.

Semi-structured interviews allow for the flexibility that may be required because the researcher cannot ask the same questions exactly at each interview. Also, semi-structured interviews can be most appropriate for situations where the questions are
either complex or open ended or where the order and logic of questioning may need to be varied from one interviewee to another (Saunders et al., 2000). Most importantly, in the semi-structured interview the researcher can clarify doubts and ensure that the respondents understood the questions and the responses are also understood by the interviewer (Sekaran, 2000).

One of the key research objectives (Objective 4) was to identify human resource (HR) issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and to establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEIs and Government views on these HR issues. Semi-structured interviews were deemed to be an ideal instrument to accomplish this research objective because of the afore-mentioned reasons.

Following a pilot study, this objective was achieved in three stages. During the first stage the researcher carried out a semi-structured interviews with hotel managers whereas the second and third stages involved semi-structured interviews with HEI staff and government officials respectively. Adscription of the process is as follows:

1) Pilot study

The aim of the pilot study was to give the researcher an idea about the problems likely to be encountered during the actual research. Also, to test the flow and content of the questions as well as the appropriateness of the interview schedules developed for the field interviews. For example, respondents misunderstanding the questions, the need to repeat questions and the length of questions. Furthermore, the pilot study led the researcher to define the stakeholders who are involved directly or indirectly in subject
matters of the research. This made it possible for the researcher to rectify any mistakes or problems before main fieldwork.

Again, the pilot study enabled revision and strengthening of translation of the interviews questions from English to Arabic language before the actual research was conducted. Two Arabic postgraduate students, studying in UK universities were selected to revise the questions’ translation. Both students have a good understanding of English language and are doing research in subjects related to linguistic. English was the preferred mode of conducting interviews in the field. However, as was expected that all interviews had to be carried out in Libya, Arabic was used, as it is the national language of Libya and a language in which the majority of Libyans can communicate as the use of English would be problematic. The researcher has a good command of both English and Arabic. Hence there was no need for a translator. However, an independent source verified the accuracy of the resultant English translated transcriptions.

The main reason for this was to enable the researcher to make appropriate modifications in the interview schedule. In addition, piloting enabled the researcher to effectively manage the delivery of the interviews.

2) Stage One:

Eighteen Libyan hotel managers were interviewed using a set of semi-structured questions relating to HR issues in the hotel sector (Appendix 4). According to the official statistics published by the Ministry of Tourism, there are 123 hotels in Libya, of which 58 hotels are located in Tripoli (Abu Zaid, 2002). This research was conducted in
Tripoli and a snowball sampling approach was chosen (Saunders et al., 1997).18 (public and private) hotels were chosen from across Tripoli (see appendix 5). The hotels were chosen according to their location in the capital city; their classifications (i.e. whether they are first, second or third class and the number of rooms) (see Table 4.2).

Table 4.2: Classification of hotels in Tripoli, Libya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classifications</th>
<th>Number of rooms</th>
<th>Average Occupancy</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First class</td>
<td>50 and more</td>
<td>70-80%</td>
<td>Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second class</td>
<td>From 30 to less</td>
<td>60-70%</td>
<td>Around the city centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>than 50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third class</td>
<td>Less than 30</td>
<td>50-60%</td>
<td>Suburbs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seven of the sampled hotels had been in operation for over 20 years, while eleven had been in operation for less than 20 years. The period for which the sampled hotels had been in operation was considered critical, as managers in hotels which have been in operation for a longer period of time were better placed to comment on HR issues, taking into consideration their experience in the hotel sector. Ten hotels were drawn from the public sector and eight from the private sector. The involvement of hotels from both public and private sectors in this study offered a complete picture of HR issues, from public and private sector perspectives.

The selection of hotel managers to be interviewed was straightforward – once a hotel manager in a particular hotel agreed to be interviewed, the researcher asked him to recommend other hotel managers in Tripoli who would be willing to be interviewed. Patton (2003) notes, consequently helped narrow the sample into the key cases thus
ensuring the quality of data collected. Snowball sampling allowed the researcher to identify further cases who could be interviewed. It was the hotel managers who directed the researcher to speak to the HEIs. This seemed to be the ideal strategy due to time and monetary constraints. The interviews were conducted between the months of July to August 2004.

3) Stages Two and Three

As mentioned above, these stages involved semi-structured interviews with HEI staff and government officials. The questions for the interviews covered a range of themes relating to HR issues facing the hotel sector from HEI and government perspectives (See Appendix 6 for semi-structured interview themes used). Currently, Libya has three HEIs, (Hotel Professions Institution in Tripoli, Hotel Professions Institute in Misurata and Hotel Professions Institute in Shahat) all of which were included in the research sample. One senior member of staff from each institution was invited to participate in a semi-structured interview. The senior staff were selected because they were thought to possess relevant knowledge of the institution and the problems facing the hotel sector. Furthermore, the senior staff interviewed had served in their respective institutions since the opening of the institutions. In addition, four senior government officials were interviewed. These included: in the Ministry of Tourism in Libya; the Manager of Tourism Investment and Promotion Board; the Manager of Investment and Marketing and the Head of the Department of Tourism Planning.

Access to both HEIs and government officials was negotiated well in advance by telephone. As the research involved interviewing hotel managers, government officials
(Minister of Tourism and Manager of Tourism Investment and Promotion Board (TIPB) and the Manager of Investment and Marketing in the Tourism Sector) and senior staff of HEI, authorisation to carry out the interviews was required from the Libyan government. A research permit spelling out regulations and conditions to be met was issued to the researcher. As the study is sponsored by the Libyan government, it was relatively easy to gain access to both government institutions and officials.

The majority of interviews were conducted in Libya. However, some interviews with the Minister of Tourism were conducted during the 2005 World Travel Market exhibition in London. Other suitable places for both the researcher and interviewees were chosen when deemed necessary, such as hotels and HEIs in Libya.

4.7.3 Recording and Transcription of the interviews

The following techniques were used to record interviews:

- Note-taking;
- Audio-recording.

The respondents were free to choose any of these methods of recording. The majority of the respondents were however, happy with note-taking and audio recording. However, there were some respondents who were initially resistant to recording. The researcher overcame this problem by using the note-taking method.

The interviews held with the hotel managers, senior staff in HEIs and government officials were recorded, transcribed in Arabic and then translated into English. The accuracy of the resultant English translated transcriptions was verified by an
independent expert to ensure that the translation accurately represented the views and opinions of respondents. The figure 4.5 below illustrates the process that was followed in transcribing the interviews.

**Figure 4.5: Process of interview transcription**

![Process of interview transcription diagram]

### 4.7.4 Data analysis

After the transcription of the interviews, all the information gathered was categorised into themes. This was done manually by sorting and grouping similar items together. A suitable theme for each group of items was identified. Constant scrutiny of items in each theme was exercised to ensure that each item was placed in the right theme.

Although there are several software computer packages for analysing qualitative data, such as NUD*IST, which have a number of advantages; e.g. they are fast and can handle large volume of data; none of these programmes perform automatic data analysis, meaning that they all depend on input and the output as defined by the
researcher (Dey, 1993). In addition, they are time consuming, particularly inputting data into the analysis packages. Considering both the advantages and disadvantages of software computer packages, the researcher felt it was more appropriate to use manual analytical procedures. It was the feeling of the researcher that constant examination of the transcribed information to extract key items to inform emergent themes provided an opportunity to acquire deeper understanding and interpretation of the data. Table 4.3 is a summary of the research design.
### Table 4.3 summary of research design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Research Objectives</th>
<th>Methods used</th>
<th>Number of interviewees</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Formative outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Objective 3 | To develop a best practice WFA model appropriate to the needs of the Libyan hotel sector. | Delphi technique with hotel managers, HEIs staff and government officials | 22 | Libya | 1. Emerging insights on WFA issues.  
2. Led to the development of best practice WFA model and strategy development. |
| Objective 4 | To identify HR issues facing the Libyan Hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEI and government views on these issues | 1. **Stage one** Semi-structured interview with hotel managers plus document analysis | 18 | Libya | Emerging insights on HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector |
| | | 2. **Stage two** Semi-structured interview with HEIs staff plus document analysis | 3 | Libya | Emerging insights on HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector |
| | | 3. **Stage three** Semi-structured interview with government officials plus document analysis | 4 | Libya/London | Emerging insights on HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector |
4.8 RELIABILITY, VALIDITY AND TRIANGULATION

4.8.1 Reliability

Reliability refers to whether a particular research technique will yield the same results if applied repeatedly to the same object (Babbie, 1995). Similarly, according to Yin (1994) reliability is the extent to which a test or procedure produces similar results under constant conditions on all occasions. The goal of reliability is to minimise errors and biases in research (Amaratunga et al., 2002). To ensure reliability in qualitative research, examination of trustworthiness is crucial. Seale (1999:266), while establishing good quality studies through reliability and validity in qualitative research, states that the 'trustworthiness of a research report lies at the heart of issues conventionally discussed as validity and reliability'.

To ensure reliability of the information collected in the current research and to reduce subjectivity, 22 different interviewees were identified across the sectors (Hotels, HEIs and government) and asked the same questions or issues for their judgments about what are, and are not, representative information/ views. Pilot studies were employed to reduce reliability errors in conducting interviews. These pilots were used to test and assess the patterns of the semi-structured interviews. The feedback from these trials was then reflected in the revised research design.

4.8.2 Validity

Validity is concerned with whether the findings are really about what they appear to be about (Saunders et al., 1997). According to Babbie (1995), validity refers to the extent to which an empirical measure adequately reflects the real meaning of the concept under
consideration. Validity may be considered as internal or external validity. Amaratunga et al. (2002:29) point out that internal validity 'refers to what or not what are identified as the causes actually produce what has been interpreted as the 'effect' or 'response' and checks whether the right cause-and-effect relationships have been established' whereas external validity 'refers to the extent to which any research findings can be generalised beyond the immediate research sample or setting in which the research took place'.

Many validity standards were applied in the present study; for example: during the personal interviews, a tape recorder was used to reduce the risk of wrongly-interpreted answers during transcription of interviews, and to be able to double-check the answers after the interview. In addition, follow-up questions were used during interviews, to make sure that the respondents understood the questions and to allow collecting more data.

It is worth mentioning that the validity during the semi-structured interviews may be lowered due to the fact that interview patterns were translated into Arabic language and accordingly answers were again re-translated into English during transcription. In the translation process words can unintentionally acquire the wrong meaning. To overcome this, the interview patterns and transcription of results were sent to an authorised translation specialist to check the translation and edit the transcription.
4.8.3 Triangulation

Triangulation is the strategy that allows different qualitative research methods to be combined (Yin, 1994). It is typically a strategy (test) for improving the validity and reliability of research or evaluation of findings (Golafshani, 2003). The term triangulation has been applied to research strategies intended to serve two distinct purposes, confirmation and completeness. Yin (2003) notes that such an approach can overcome the problems of construct validity as multiple sources of evidence provide multiple measures of the same phenomena.

Six types of triangulation are presented in the literature (Keyton, 2001; Guion, 2002):

- Data triangulation: involves the use of different sources of data/information;
- Investigator triangulation: involves using several different investigators/evaluators in an evaluation project;
- Theory triangulation: involves the use of multiple professional perspectives to interpret a single set of data/information;
- Methodological triangulation: involves the use of multiple qualitative and/or quantitative methods to study the programme;
- Environmental triangulation: This type of triangulation involves the use of different locations, settings and other key factors related to the environment in which the study took place, such as time of the day, day of the week or season of the year.

In this research, data triangulation was employed through investigating the same phenomenon from three different perspectives, i.e. hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials.
4.9 GENERALISATION OF RESULTS

The main concern of most studies is whether the resulting conclusions can be generalized to the wider population. This puts pressure on the sample to be representative of the whole population researched. While some researchers have claimed emphatically that generalization is impossible in interpretive research (Denzin, 1983; Guba and Lincoln, 1994), some have taken a milder stance and argued that there could be issues about the generalisability of the qualitative-based interview studies (Saunders et al., 1997). Yin (1989) questions the term because of its association with a population. He points out that results in a qualitative study are intended to be general in respect to theory, not to population. A case in a case study is in no way a 'sample'. Confusion arises when qualitative researcher criticise their own work by discussing 'the small sample of cases', which implies that they view it as a quality problem 'as if a single case study were like a single respondent in a survey or a single subject in an experiment' (Yin, 1989:40). Williams (2000:215) argues that 'generalisation is inevitable, desirable, and possible and makes a case for 'moderatum' generalisations' He suggests that 'moderatum' generalisations are a form of generalisation made in interpretive research, either knowingly or unknowingly by the researcher. Williams (2000) suggests three possible meanings of generalisation:

- Total generalisations: where situation ‘S’ is identical to S in every detail;
- Statistical generalisations: where the probability of situation S occurring more widely can be estimated from instances of S;
Moderatum generalisations: These generalisations are made in interpretive research and refer to a situation ‘S’ whose aspects can be seen to be instances of a broader recognisable set of features.

This does not mean that there are no limits to generalisation but what is proposed here is that the generalisations made in interpretive research need to be moderate generalisations. The limits of generalisation are the limits of interpretivism. Williams (2000) argues that making statistical generalisation has never been part of the agenda of interpretivism and it should not be regarded in methodological isolation of other strategies, such as the survey. Thus, interpretivism:

*can make clear the meaningful experiences of actors and specifically why they believe the world the way it is and if these experiences can become moderatum generalisations then they can form the basis of theories about process or structure.*

(Williams, 2000:221).

At the outset of this research, the limitations and context of the present study were established. The units of analysis and the research models clearly and narrowly defined the scope of this study to generate a generic model for WFA for the hotel sector in Libya to identify its problems and find solutions to overcome them. Also the different theories used gave a clear picture of the key issues regarding HRD generally and specifically in the hotel sector.

**4.10 SUMMARY**

The research methodology of this thesis is summarized in figure (4.6). This chapter has detailed the research process followed in this study and presented the epistemological and theoretical perspective of the research. It has further detailed the methodology, data collection methods used in addressing the different objectives of the research.
Specifically, semi-structured interviews were chosen as the main tool to collect the data, together with documents analysis and Delphi technique. To enhance the validity and reliability of the responses, the data collected was triangulated by seeking responses from key stakeholders of the Libyan hotel sector. The results of this research are presented in chapters 5 and 6. Specifically, chapter 5 utilises the Delphi technique (Pill, 1971; Linstone and Turnoff, 1975; Green et al., 1990) to analyse opinions and responses from experts in the hotel sector HEIs and government, about various elements of workforce planning in an attempt to develop a best practice model for WFA, which suits the Libyan context, whilst chapter 6 presents results on the human resources issues facing the Libyan hotel sector;

**Figure 4.6:** summary of research design.
CHAPTER FIVE: WORKFORCE PLANNING FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

5.1 INTRODUCTION 5-2
5.2 WFP MODEL 5-3
5.3 PROBLEMS FACING WORKFORCE PLANNING (WFP IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR) 5-5
5.3.1 Awareness levels in relation to the concept of WFP in the Libyan hotel sector 5-6
5.3.2 Preliminary planning, implementation and evaluation 5-7
5.3.3 Co-operation and co-ordination between stakeholders 5-11
5.4 CRITICAL ISSUES ARISING FROM THE INITIAL WORKFORCE ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK 5-16
5.5 BUILDING CONSENSUS ON THE WFP MODEL 5-21
5.6 PROPOSED BEST PRACTICE WFP MODEL FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR 5-23
5.6.1 The government 5-25
5.6.2 Demand analysis 5-29
5.6.3 Supply analysis 5-32
5.6.4 Gap analysis 5-35
5.6.5 Workforce development plan (WFDP) for Libya 5-38
5.6.6 The implementation strategy for the WFP for Libya 5-42
5.6.7 Evaluation of the WFP implementation strategy 5-44
5.7 SUMMARY 5-46
5.1 INTRODUCTION

As discussed in the previous chapters, the main aim of this study is the development of a workforce planning (WFP) model for the Libyan hotel sector. It must be noted that implementation and evaluation of this model are beyond the scope of this thesis. The first step towards the development of the WFP model was undertaken in chapter three where a critical review of the literature on WFP was conducted. The WFP framework developed in chapter three is used within this chapter to assist the development of a best practice WFP Model for the Libyan hotel sector (research objective 3). The Delphi technique, a widely-accepted method that provides a rapid, effective way of collecting expert opinion and achieving consensus from a group of knowledgeable people – experts - on various unknown factors or complex problems specifically relating to the context of the Libyan hotel sector (Pill, 1971; Linstone and Turnoff, 1975; Green et al., 1990), was used to build consensus on the best practice WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector.

This chapter begins by presenting the problems facing WFP in the Libyan hotel sector, which include: lack of awareness of the concept of WFP (section 5.3.1); lack of preliminary planning, implementation and evaluation (section 5.3.2) and lack of cooperation and co-ordination between the stakeholders (section 5.3.3). The chapter then presents the results of consensus building on the best practice WFP model (section 5.5).
Finally, the chapter concludes with a proposed WFP best practice model, which incorporates the requirements and the expectations of the key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector.

5.2 WFP MODEL

The development of the WFP model began with a detailed review of the literature on WFP. Chapter three looked at existing WFP models and the phases of development of WFP. This was conducted in order to get a clear understanding of elements in WFP to develop a unified theoretical framework, which would be adapted for the research.

The WFP phases proposed by the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000:5) and Garrant (2004:6) (figure 5.2) were used as the initial basis for understanding the WFP process.
Figure 5.1: Phases in WFP (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000 and Garrant, 2004)

Although the four basic phases of WFP remained the same, this research puts more emphasis on the second phase (workforce analysis) so as to address the key problems facing the Libyan hotel sector identified by the key stakeholders interviewed (see chapter 6).

There are four key steps to the workforce analysis phase of the WFP model identified by the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) and Garrant (2004):

- Demand analysis
- Supply analysis
- Gap Analysis
- Strategy Development
These four key steps formed the initial theoretical framework as shown in figure 6.2.

**Figure 5.2:** Initial workforce analysis framework (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000 and Garrant, 2004)

*Demand analysis* deals with measures of future activities and workloads, and describes the competency set needed by the workforce of the future. It identifies the workforce needed to carry out the mission of an organization (Morrish, 2000).

*Supply analysis* focuses on identifying and analysing the existing workforce and projecting future workforce supply (Garrant, 2004).

*Gap analysis* deals with identifying the workforce of today and the workforce that will be required in the future.
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

Strategy development is the final step of workforce analysis and its purpose is to address future gaps and surpluses.

Chapter three discusses the literature on HR issues and WFP. Chapter five details the results of the interviews conducted with key Libyan stakeholders and helps the researcher to identify the main HR issues. The following section will present the key WFP issues facing the Libyan hotel sector.

5.3 PROBLEMS FACING WORKFORCE PLANNING (WFP) IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

This section presents the results of interviews conducted with eighteen hotel managers, three senior staff in Libyan HEIs and eight government officials under three themes:

- Awareness levels in relation to the concept of WFP;
- Preliminary planning, implementation and evaluation, and
- Co-operation and co-ordination between the stakeholders.

5.3.1 Awareness levels in relation to the concept of WFP in Libyan hotel sector

The research findings revealed that all government interviewees had some level of understanding of the concept of WFP. As the manager of Investment and Marketing in tourism comments:

I am aware of workforce planning... until now, we have not put in place any workforce plan... not even for our hotel sector.

However, the majority of interviewees in the hotel sector and HEIs had little or no knowledge of WFP. Most of the questions raised and comments made by interviewees
during the research period attest to this, for example "You mean WFP...what does it involve?" (Hotel 1), "Am not aware of anything of that sort" (Hotel 3) "I have heard about it but I do not know what it involves" (Hotel 5) "I read once about it, I think it is something worth doing" (Institution 2). However, there was consensus among the interviewees who had some knowledge about WFP that it is a key factor in both the manufacturing and service sectors, such as agriculture and hotel sectors. Commenting on this issue, a hotel manager said:

We do not have any workforce plan in place...we need such a plan...it is an important document for any sector, including the hotel sector.

(Hotel 17)

The majority of interviewees supported the fact that the action plan should recognise WFP as a powerful tool to improve productivity in the Libyan hotel sector. This was expected, considering that: firstly, Libya is preparing to shift from oil industries to a service-based economy as a means of achieving economic diversification; secondly, the Libyan hotel sector suffers from a shortage of skilled workforce (see chapter 6); thirdly, Libyan HEIs are insufficient in terms of capacity and quality of training (see chapter 5).

Furthermore, WFP is seen to be a powerful tool for any sector's effective human resource management and success (Saliba, 1993). It is also seen to be useful in identifying potential workforce issues such as staff shortages and skills requirements (Selden et al., 2001). In addition it is essential in maintaining any sector’s competitive advantage locally, nationally and internationally (Andrews et al., 2002; Bill and Jones, 2003; Joan, 2004). The quality of the workforce in the Libyan hotel sector will be crucial in achieving service excellence. In a sector where the skilled workforce is
limited, as in the Libyan hotel sector, the sector cannot produce excellent service quality.

5.3.2 Preliminary planning, implementation and evaluation

Analysis of existing documents related to workforce supply and demand in the Libyan Ministry of Tourism revealed that preliminary planning took place for a period of six months but was never implemented. According to one government official:

The latest preliminary planning on human resource in the tourism industry was conducted in 1999...it ran for less than six months...the results of the planning are too scanty to rely on...we will have to start the process [planning process] again.

(Manager of Investment and Marketing)

Basically, time spent in pre-planning is important to identify key information sources. Preliminary planning provides an opportunity to identify resources required to support the WFP process, as well as for the key stakeholders to be involved in the planning process. Although the majority of interviewees felt that the duration for preliminary planning should depend on the nature of the organisation, there was general agreement that six months to one year is adequate for preliminary planning. Four of the interviewees gave estimate for the period for preliminary planning: “six months” (Hotel 17); “I think six months to one year” (Institution 2); “well, one year” (Hotel 9); “nearly one year” (Hotel 13). Another hotel manager added that:

Our real problem is that we do not allow enough time for the preliminary planning. It is absolutely difficult to discuss and come up with a good WFP within a period of one or even three months... I think six months to one year is an ideal time for preliminary planning.

(Hotel 3)
Most of the hotel managers felt that the government had not given the development of human resources in the hotel sector a high priority. As a hotel manager said, "human resources in the development process of hotel sector is a neglected area" (Hotel 10). Furthermore, the HRD element of the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) had not been systematically accomplished, as illustrated by one government interviewee:

*Implementation and the action plan have not been systematically specified.*

He added:

*The government spent most of its time thinking about how to solve the immediate problems, rather than planning.*

According to the majority of key stakeholders, the LTMP does not clearly state what tourism supply and demand exists, hotel workforce requirements and how tourism policies and plans are to be implemented. Commenting on this, one hotel manager said:

*In my opinion the LTMP does not provide clear strategies to deal with the present human resource issues facing the hotel sector... the plan does not mention any thing to do with workforce planning.*

(Hotel 8)

Above all, there is lack of a WFP model for the hotel sector. In addition, no single organisation is responsible for WFP and HR development for the Libyan hotel sector. Most of the interviewees agreed that, in general:

*Despite the different Ministries involved (directly or indirectly) in human resource development for hotel sector, including Ministry of Tourism, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Work, no efforts have been made to co-ordinate their activities...no single body (no appropriate mechanism) is responsible for co-ordinating the activities of all stakeholders.*

(Hotel 18)
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

Usually, a combination of private and public sector interests affects the co-ordination of WFP implementation, particularly in the absence of a single umbrella organisation (Amoah and Baum, 1997). Consequently, there was a strong feeling amongst the interviewees that Libya requires a central organisation responsible for WFP and development in hotel sector to match the needs and requirement of both the hotel sector and the HEIs. In support, one of the hotel managers asserted that:

*We need a single body or central organisation for WFP and development in the hotel sector in particular and the tourism industry in general... and there should be an independent organisation with powers to help all the key stakeholders to work towards a common goal.*

(Hotel 3)

In particular, all interviewees agreed that the hotel sector needs the involvement of an independent organisation for WFP and development. As stated by one of the hotel managers:

*This organisation should be responsible for co-ordinating all the activities of the HEIs and the Ministry of Tourism to ensure that they work towards a common goal. Such an independent organisation should be supported by the government to be able to execute its mandate efficiently and effectively.*

(Hotel 5)

In addition, the roles of the responsible body should be reflected in any suggested WFP model. As noted by one of the hotel managers:

*If you compare this [WFP] model to our [the hotel sector’s] suggestions you will find that our requests focus on the role of government [the responsible body], and the need for co-operation and co-ordination between HEIs and the government itself for WFP implementation and evaluation.*

(Hotel 1)
In general, there was a consensus amongst key stakeholders that a detailed implementation plan is required. In support of this one of the hotel managers said:

*An implementation framework for WFP needs to be formulated to guide the direction of the supply and demand of the workforce. The implementation plans should provide guidelines on the roles of the different tourism stakeholders.*

(Hotel 3)

An implementation plan would ensure consistency in all the activities undertaken by different stakeholders in their attempts to meet the WFP objectives. Again all the key stakeholders believe that WFP evaluation is critically important, particularly in assessing the achievement of the WFP aims and providing improvements for the success of the Libyan hotel sector.

### 5.3.3 Co-operation and co-ordination between stakeholders

The research findings revealed that the Libyan government plays a central role in nearly all the major economic sectors. The Libyan government provides for the needs of all of society as well as planning, implementing and financing all development programmes. This differs from what happens in the majority of the developed countries, where the private sector occupies the central role in most of the manufacturing and service sectors, with the government’s role being to oversee their functioning.

It is important to mention that the introduction of different laws over the years witnessed the abolition and reinstatement of the private sector in Libya (see chapter 2). All economic activities in Libya were subject to the control and management of the government. The private sector, including the hotel and tourism sector was restricted to
some activities or marginal services, which represent no great importance to the national economy or the global product.

Although new laws, such as Law No. 8 (1988), were issued to reorganise the private sector, it is still too weak to function independently, without strong government involvement. Therefore, the government is looked upon to make a significant contribution to the economic environment, provide business information and support and provide tax exemption for education and training in the hotel sector. The government is expected to establish co-operation with international organisations, such as UNWTO, in order to obtain tourism expertise and advice. With regard to this, a hotel manager commented: "the government must create links with international corporations and facilitate an exchange of experts to support the hotel sector" (Hotel 13).

Again most of the interviewees, especially from the private sector, were of the opinion that it is the government's responsibility to educate and train the workforce for the hotel sector. As a result, the majority of private hotels do not collaborate with HEIs or provide opportunities for students' internship. The analysis showed that new and emerging private hotels in Libya are much more willing to pay higher salaries to attract highly qualified staff because they do not have sufficiently qualified staff and do not have enough time to train new employees and because they recognise the importance of highly trained staff to their overall product and service quality. Commenting on this a hotel manager said:

*We as private sector don't have the ability to train an adequate labour force...instead we look for skilled persons from the labour market locally and overseas.*
Also, most hotels do not believe in developing their staff because there is a tendency for employees to switch to another organisation offering a better pay package once they have been trained. There are notable employee turnover rates in the hotel sector, where the average working duration in one hotel was approximately two to three years. This is considered a high turnover compared to the oil sector where employees work for many years without switching to other sectors. Such turnover rates exacerbate the problem of employee shortages in the hotel sector. One hotel manager said:

Well-on-job training is a good idea. Initially we used to support some of our staff to attend short courses. But they never used to hang onto the job for long after their training. They would switch to better paying jobs. It became a worthless investment. We decided to stop.

Furthermore, most employees find working in tourism more challenging and demanding, particularly in terms of working conditions and wages, in comparison to other sectors of the Libyan economy.

It was frequently mentioned that strong co-operation and co-ordination was missing between the key hotel sector’s stakeholders:

There is no effective link and communication between government, hotel sector and HEIs. The absence of such links has resulted in the present inability to achieve the required integration between the three bodies. This is considered to be one of the important drivers for achieving high performance, in the hotel sector and the hospitality institutions in particular, and in the tourism industry in general.
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

The majority of interviewees supported collaboration between the public and private sectors, especially in relation to workforce production and development. One of the hotel managers mentioned that:

> There is lack of co-operation between the public and private sectors in producing and developing the tourism and hospitality workforce.

(Hotel 1)

Further, the analysis indicated that the HEIs lag behind developments in the hotel sector. As a consequence, HEIs produce graduates who are not qualified to deal with the hotel sector’s ever-changing requirements. As one of the hotel managers said:

> Co-ordination between the government, hotel sector, and HEIs is necessary for workforce planning and developments for Libyan tourism to carry on...the hotel sector needs strong communication especially for product [graduates] from the labour market and to keep the new employees working in our sector.

(Hotel, 4)

Increasing competition in the Libyan hotel sector, co-operation and intensive consultation are required to improve training programmes. One government interviewee stressed that:

> As one of the heads of the department in the Ministry of Tourism, I can say that currently the fundamental relationship between key stakeholders is missing. There is a gap between key stakeholders’ requirements, particularly in the hotel sector demand and supply.

Moreover, the research established that there is lack of regular review arrangement between the government, HEIs and hotel sector as well as a lack of employee involvement in curriculum development.
It is also important to note that the General board for Tourism (GBT) (GBT is an committee within the Libyan Ministry of Tourism), whose work is to represent and co-ordinate the hotel sector in Libya, was found to face financial difficulties and lacked permanent staff to execute its responsibilities efficiently. As such there was minimal co-ordination of the hotel sector’s activities, which impacted negatively on the quality of services provided. These findings support Amoah and Baum’s (1997) assertions that lack of collaboration between the public and private sectors gives rise to poor quality of products (i.e. graduates) and service to hotel customers.

The existence of a gap in human resource planning in the Libyan hotel sector between HEIs and government suggests the need for co-operation and co-ordination amongst the key stakeholders. This approach is supported by Alexander (2006) who is a supporter of strong co-operation between the hospitality industry and HEIs. Ruona and Gison (2004:8-1), for example, assert that human resource scholars and practitioners are “converging in an evolving approach to management of human resources”. O’Donnell et al. (2006) consider scholars (HRD) and practitioners (HRM) as twins not independent entities. According to Bartlett et al. (2006), such co-operation and co-ordination moves in human resource management requires that all efforts/activities are viewed as contributing to an organisation’s competitive advantage on short-term and long-term basis.
The main problems facing WFP in the Libyan hotel sectors are summarised in Figure 5.3 below.

Figure 5.3: Main WFP problems facing the Libyan hotel sector

5.4 CRITICAL ISSUES ARISING FROM THE INITIAL WORKFORCE ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK

The Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) and Garrant (2004) advocate four steps in workforce analysis (figure 5.1). Within the Libyan context, all the interviewees from the hotel sector, HEIs and government agreed with all the four steps
in workforce analysis, i.e. identifying demand, determining supply, identifying the gap and strategy development (to solve the problems). The majority of the interviewees described the four steps in workforce analysis using words like “adequate” (Hotel 6) “very good” (Institution 3) “appropriate” (Institution 1) “relatively good” (Hotel 10) “comprehensive” (Hotel 9) “suitable” (Hotel 2). However, there were additional suggestions from the interviewees. The majority of the interviewees felt that there was need for an umbrella body, which would be responsible for workforce analysis:

*We need a single body or central organisation for HRP and development in the hotel sector in particular and the tourism industry in general... and there should be an independent organisation with powers to help all the key stakeholders to work towards a common goal.*

(Hotel 3)

Initially there were mixed feelings amongst the interviewees on the main body responsible for workforce analysis. While some interviewees suggested GBT, others suggested government. The following comments demonstrate mixed feelings amongst interviewees, “personally, I believe the government should be responsible for workforce analysis” (Hotel 2). A HEIs staff added, “definitely, the government should be responsible for workforce analysis. It is in a position to mobilise all the resources needed for the exercise (i.e. workforce analysis)” (Institution 1). Other interviewees thought differently: “I think GBT should be responsible for workforce analysis” (Hotel 10); “Well...GBT should be mandated to carry out workforce analysis” (Hotel 5); “Am not sure, perhaps, GBT” (Institution 3).

However, further discussions with the hotel sector and HEIs, showed a change from GBT to government as the main body responsible for workforce analysis. The majority
of the experts in both the hotel sector and HEIs felt that there was a need for strong government involvement in, and support for, workforce planning, considering its vital roles in the Libyan hotel and tourism sector. Commenting on this a hotel manager said:

*GBT is limited in its capacity... it does not have qualified staff. We need a strong body... with the necessary capacity and mechanism to enable us to adopt workforce plans for our hotel... to enable us to put the right people in the right place at the right time.*

(Hotel 17)

One hotel manager briefly commented:

*We need government support as much as we need a workforce plan.*

(Hotel 3)

As mentioned earlier (chapter 2), Libyan tourism is not fully developed. For this reason, the active involvement of the government is essential if tourism is to succeed as an alternative development strategy for Libya. Furthermore, frequent abolition and reinstatement of the private sector in Libya, following the enactment of different laws over the years left it unstable, unable to assume a leading role in the hotel sector development.

Thus, the majority of the interviewees argue that no body is better placed than the government for the rapid development of the human resources required in the hotel sector. There was a general feeling amongst the interviewees that strong government support will ensure the implementation of the articulated human resource development strategies and plans of action, as well as facilitate the hotel sector development. Commenting on this a HEI staff member said:
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

We have seen tremendous changes in sectors where there is strong government support, including the oil sector. Personally, I believe if government can support us adequately, we can make remarkable progress.

(Institution 2)

Also, in the opinion of most of the interviewees, the government is in a position to provide services that cannot be provided adequately or efficiently by the private sector, such as: planning and formulating human resource development policy and strategies; setting standards; assisting small, local hotels; and providing the necessary infrastructure and training facilities. Commenting on this observation a hotel manager said:

Most hotels are not in a position to carry out workforce analysis on their own. I know the majority of the private hotels have been in operation for a very short time. They are in their initial stage of development. Some are quite small. Some do not have qualified personnel to carry out proper workforce analysis. Some are using all the resources at their disposal to try and develop basic hotel facilities. I believe that their success relies very much on the government policies and strategies.

(Hotel 12)

Following suggestions from the interviewees, the initial framework was expanded to incorporate the government in the workforce analysis as shown in figure 5.4.
Figure 5.4: Modified workforce analysis framework
5.5 CONSENSUS BUILDING ON WFP MODEL

The Delphi Technique (Pill, 1971; Linstone & Turnoff, 1975; Green et al., 1990) was utilised to build consensus, where initial expert opinions were gathered, analysed and circulated to the experts for comments and to gain consensus on the best practice model. Basically, four main phases are considered to make a workforce plan, i.e. setting strategy, analysing workforce, implementation and evaluation (see figure 5.1). A comparison of the viewpoints of the three key stakeholders (hotel sector, HEIs, government) showed that the WFP process should go through all the four suggested phases in WFP (figure 5.1): The following quotations confirm this:

Yes, I think these four phases reflect generally what should happen when setting an action plan for workforce planning in the hotel sector.

(Hotel 5)

One of the problems facing the hotel sector is lack of awareness of the WFP process. Having looked at the information you gave to me on phases of workforce planning, I believe the four phases offer a good road map to the drawing up of a good workforce plan.

(Institution 3)

I agree... if we follow the four phases, we will be able to come up with a good workforce plan.

(Hotel 4)

Of course I have no disagreement with the four phases. In my opinion... they are adequate. We can adopt them.

(Hotel 10)
TIPB and HEIs will not be able to deliver to the expectations of hotel sector" (Hotel 11)
"one of the main obstacle facing TIPB and HEIs is finances. If TIPB and HEIs are not fully funded they cannot achieve meaningful progress” (Hotel 8).

5.6 PROPOSED BEST PRACTICE WFP MODEL FOR LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

The best practice WFP model was formulated from synthesising all the research findings considered to be applicable to the hotel sector in Libya. Special consideration was made on interviewees' opinions on the phases of WFP process (figure 5.2) as well as the inclusion of the government as the main body responsible for workforce analysis (figure 5.4). Specifically, the best practice WFP model represents the steps that need to be followed in order to develop and implement the workforce plan in the hotel sector.

The model comprises seven main elements, that is, the government, the demand side (Hotels), the supply side (HEIs), the gap issues, workforce development plan, implementation strategy and evaluation (figure 5.5).

Further consideration of interviewees' opinions on the roles of the government, the HEIs and the hotel sector in WFP, led to the modification of arrows in the first box to reflect a more interactive, collaborative and co-operative relationship amongst the government, the HEIs and the hotel sector. Moreover, a workforce plan will be incomplete if it does not take into consideration implementation and evaluation elements. The next section provides detailed discussion on each of the seven elements of the proposed best practice WFP model, illustrating their relevance in the Libyan hotel sector.
Figure 5.5: Potential WFP Model for the hotel sector in Libya
5.6.1 The government

A lack of strong government support has been found to cause grave concerns in the Libyan hotel sector. Comments such as: "we need the government to study and address our needs and establish a long-term plan for HRD to support both private and public hotels" (Hotel 17) underline the need by the hotel sector for strong government support.

Another hotel manager commented on the same point:

*Support from the government is crucial in WFP...the government needs to commit itself to establish a comprehensive workforce plan for the hotel sector...to cover both private and public hotels.*
These findings are consistent with studies by Lu and Chiang (2003) in Ontario hotels, where they found that the majority of hotels did not register significant growth due to lack of government support. Even in circumstances where Ontario hotels have guidelines on how to conduct WFP, they have been unable to implement their activities due to lack of resources (Lu and Chiang, 2003).

As shown by the proposed best practice WFP model, the government is expected to play a central role in WFP for the Libyan hotels sector. As noted by one of the HEIs staff:

*I would want to re-emphasis that strong involvement of government is very important in the success of WFP in particular and the hotel sector in general.*

(Institution 4)

Overall, the government is expected to be responsible for initiating WFP, implementing the WFP strategies and monitoring the ongoing effectiveness of the Workforce Development Plan (WDP). Specifically, the government must support human resource development through funding of HEIs and active participation in education planning and curriculum review as well as formulating favourable education and training policies to meet the socio-economic needs for a qualified and skilled Libyan hotel sector workforce. Similarly, the government must support the hotel sector through funding and involvement in preparing HRD plans, which reflect priority HR requirements in the hotel sector. In fact, when asked to comment on the role of the government in WFP, most interviewees mentioned: “funding” (Hotel 5, Institution 2); “development and review of HEIs curriculum” (Hotel 10, Institution 2, Institution 3); “formulating
favourable policies” (Hotel 12, Hotel 3, Institution 1, Institution 2, Institution 3); “providing the necessary infrastructure” (Hotel 1, Hotel 3, Institution 1); “providing political and administrative support” (Minister for Tourism, Hotel 3, Institution 3).

However for the Libyan government to function efficiently there is a need for it to coordinate and cooperate with HEIs and the hotel sector. The government needs to collaborate with the hotel sector to enhance its expansion and growth. Again, the government and other sectors such as education, planning and the economy need to work in partnership with the HEI to strengthen training and education programmes.

One of the heads of a HEI recorded that:

There is no trained cadre with proficiency that the Hotel and Tourism sector in the country can rely on to provide good quality services. Accordingly there should be some sort of joint coordination between the public manpower sector and education bodies to improve the quality and quantity of training in this matter.

(Institution 1)

Both HEIs and the hotel sector are required to provide the government with their long-term planning needs to overcome the aforementioned problems. In addition, the HEIs and hotel sector should create an interdependent and cooperative relationship through the exchange of education and training plans, sharing of information and the exchange of expertise. Commenting on the role of the hotel sector in WFP, a hotel manager said:

I believe, as hotel sector, we have a role to play to ensure the success of WFP. We are in a better position to identify our weaknesses, our strengths, our needs. We can facilitate WFP process by providing information on these issues to the government.

(Hotel 6)
Another manager added:

*We can provide information to the HEIs on what our needs are, what we can offer for their students...I believe this will foster mutual understanding between us and the HEIs.*

(Hotel 15)

Currently, such a fundamental relationship is lacking; consequently there is a gap between the hotel sector’s labour/HR demand and supply. As mentioned in the preceding sections, one of the main issues facing the hotel sector is the lack of trained Libyan employees in the sector, which has resulted in the importation of expatriates or foreigners from other countries such as Egypt, Morocco, and Tunisia to fill the gap. The opportunity for educational output in the hotel sector is limited. The hotel sector is challenged by the governmental policy and the current state of HEIs, e.g. employment law, capability, and supply. Generally, favourable employment policies would ease recruitment and retention of staff in the Libyan hotel sector, whereas, unfavourable policies would increase recruitment and retention difficulties. Commenting on this, a hotel manager said:

*We can get skilled labour from overseas but the current government regulations prevent us from employing them...especially in the highest management positions.*

(Hotel 7)

Thus, the government should formulate or review employment policies governing workers, in particular, foreign workers.
5.6.2 Demand analysis

The demand analysis for the Libyan hotel sector must involve identifying the future activities and workload in the hotel sector and the competencies needed by the hotel workforce. Specifically, the demand side involves; first, determining the existing and expected demand of the workforce in hotel sector, the demand on labour force of all basic vocational, auxiliary and complementary specializations arising out of the demand for utilities or the improvement in visitor numbers, turn-over rates, identifying the future workforce needs and capabilities and current hotel staff capabilities. Second, the profile of future workforce- that is, staffing levels and competencies needed to carry out the hotels future functional requirements. Third, the structure of hotels- for example, bigger hotels (five-star hotels) would require more specialized staff than small hotels.
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

This information will help in decision-making, particularly with regard to employee recruitment, employee training, retraining and performance management to ensure that the Libyan hotel sector is able to meet changes in skills needs or growth in future demands.

In regard to demand analysis some of the hotel managers had this to say:

We need to look at the number of our current employees, their qualifications and their job descriptions.

(Hotel 4)

I think demand analysis should involve some sort of...identifying the kind of employee present in our hotels and trying to predict what we may require in future.

(Hotel 14)

Demand analysis must involve...definitely analysis of our employees’ capability, their skills and the skills required by the hotel...I think.

(Hotel 1)

The above quotations demonstrate a narrow view of what is involved in demand analysis from the hotel managers’ perspective. This could be attributed to lack of sufficient knowledge of WFP amongst the majority of hotel managers (see section 5.2.1).

Previous studies, e.g. the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) demonstrate that an important part of the demand analysis process is examining not only what work the organisation will do in the future, but how that work will be performed.
Studies by Morrish (2000: 22-23) provide possible questions, which could help the Libyan hotel sector carry out an informed demand analysis:

- *How will jobs and workload change as a result of technological advancements and economic, social, and political conditions?*
- *What are the consequences or results of these changes?*
- *What will be the reporting relationships?*
- *How will divisions, work units, and jobs be designed?*
- *How will work flow into each part of the organization? What will be done with it? Where will the work flow?*

Most importantly, demand forecasting should be about the functions that an organization must perform and not just on the people (Garrant, 2004). This may provide the Libyan hotel sector with a chance to re-examine long-standing assumptions about the purpose and direction of its activities in the light of changes that are taking place in the external environment. Furthermore, the Libyan hotel sector demand analysis should take into consideration both workforce changes brought by changing work, and workforce changes brought by changing workload and changing work processes. Thus, hotel managers need to identify emerging trends and changes in working patterns and practices in order to align the hotel sector’s mission and changes occurring within the hotel sector’s external environment.
5.6.3 Supply analysis

The supply component of the WFP model involves an analysis of workforce supply, that is, both local and foreign workers. The main focus is to identify workforce competencies, organisational competencies and employment trends in the hotel sector and the existing and expected supply in the future of workforce in the hotel sector. In the Libyan hotel sector, the main workforce sources are institutions for learning, including HEIs. Thus graduates from these institutions are the future workforce for the hotel sector. However, these institutions are also sources of workforce of other sectors within the tourism industry. With regard to supply analysis, HEIs staff identified the
following issues to be considered: “needs of the hotel sector” (Institution 1, Institution 3); “needs of the HEIs” (Institution 1, Institution 3 and Institution 2); “needs and aspirations of the students” (Institution 3); “contents of the curriculum” (All the interviewees) “training facilities” (Institution 1); “qualification of the staff” (All the interviewees) “trends in the market demands” (Institution 2 and Institution 3).

Generally, the supply side must involve analysis of HEI workforce supply in terms of the number of employees, competencies, job occupation, demographics (age, sex, etc), level of education, salaries and employment status. The benefit of carrying out this analysis is to ensure that HR training strategies can be developed to meet the future needs of the Libyan hotel sector.

Garrant (2004:9) mentions three steps in supply analysis:

1. Creating an existing workforce profile;

2. Reviewing trend data that provide both descriptive and forecasting models describing how turnover will affect the workforce in the absence of management action. This kind of trend analysis is essential to the solution analysis phase;

3. Projecting Future Workforce Supply.

These steps could also be applied to the Libyan hotel sector to identify and analyse existing workforce and project future workforce supply. The Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) observes that conducting an actual assessment can get very complicated depending on which approach is taken. For example, some organizations conduct thorough job analyses and individual employee assessments by
multiple sources, including the employee. However, the degree of precision needed by the organization, its culture, and time and resource availability are some of the key factors influencing which approach to take (Washington State Department of Personnel, 2000).

As mentioned in Chapter 6, HEIs suffer from shortages of training facilities. Practical experience is very important in the hotel sector. Thus practical experience should be gained at the HEIs before graduates join the hotel sector. Thus analysis of physical facilities in HEIs would be an important element of supply analysis.

Since supply analysis deals with identification of skills development and training requirements to ensure that future workforce requirements are met, there is a need for cooperation and collaboration between the hotel sector and HEIs to identify the industry needs and develop training programmes to address these needs. In other words, this would help identify development options (formal training and re-training, refresher training, on job training, coaching opportunities) to ensure that the HEIs’ programmes are in line with hotel sector’s needs.
5.6.4 Gap analysis

Gap analysis is a process of identifying the differences between the workforce of today and the workforce that will be needed in the future. These differences may either reflect competencies that will be needed in the future to a greater extent than they are present in the current workforce, or they may identify competencies that are more overflowing in the current workforce than in the future workforce. In other words, gap analysis is the process of comparing information from the supply analysis and demand analysis to identify the differences ‘the gaps’ between the current organizational competencies and the competencies needed in the future workforce. Most of the interviewees seemed to be very willing to participate in gap analysis:
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

As a manager, I am very much willing to work with HEIs...it is important we exchange ideas...make clear our situation (hotel needs and requirements). We need to understand from their side (HEIs side) what they can offer and what they cannot offer. This will enable us to make informed decisions on appropriate actions to bridge any skills gap.

(Hotel 3)

The gap analysis in the WFP model will assist in comparing the present workforce skills/competencies with future needs to identify skill/competency gaps and surpluses and to inform workforce development plan (WFDP). Also gap analysis will guide the setting of recruitment strategies, training and retraining needs, staff retention strategies, outside sourcing and restructuring to address any future gaps and surplus. It will allow remedial action to be taken like recruitment freezing or retraining to minimise the potential costs of redundancies thereby enhancing opportunities to control costs. Gap analysis may identify positive or negative gaps in relation to supply and demand. Therefore there is a need to be flexible to address the gaps. This would support Sullivan’s (2002b) assertions that workforce plans need to be more flexible and that organisations prepare for all eventualities. While rigid plans may add consistency Bechet (2000) comments that there exist dangers of different organisational units adopting parameters that are not appropriate.

There are specific problems in undertaking gap analysis in the Libyan hotel sector, which needs to be acknowledged:

1- Determining the actual existing demand process on the hotel and tourism workforce is difficult since it requires one to:
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

a. Undertake extensive quantitative and qualitative research from all the tourism and hotel related institutions such as hotels, restaurants, coffee shops, tourism villages, shore villages and archeological sites among others;

b. Analyse the actual needs of the workforce in the hotels and tourism institutions according to the professions and to make a comparison between the actual need and the existing professions in these institutions.

2- Determining the actual supply of the tourism and hotels workforce is difficult because of the following:

a. Education limitations, particularly with regard to quality and quantity of graduates from HEIs;

b. Limited qualitative and quantitative information on people willing to work in the hotel and tourism sectors (job seekers), who are non-employed and classified according to economical professions stated in the united manual issued by international labour organization or The United Nation;

c. Analysis of actual and expected supply of hotel, tourism labour force according to the professions division.

3- Determining the gap in the labour market requires comparison between the existing supply and demand for, in order to determine the existing gap in the labour market and the internal gap in the offer itself.
Whilst acknowledging the difficulties involved in acquiring a well-defined and complete data set, Bechet (2000) suggests that workforce planners should make sure that they fully utilise the data that does exist.

5.6.5 Workforce development plan (WFDP) for Libya

This will involve the development of strategies and action items to address needed or surplus skills. The following six stages will be crucial in the workforce development plan (WFDP).
First stage: This stage will involve studying of economical, comprehensive, partial, provisional or localities plans in order to determine:

i. The relative importance of different economical sectors, the role of the hotel sector in general and its relation to the other sectors in the implementation of the plan;

ii. The policies, legislations, directions of economy, finance, investment, cash, employment, residence, entry and others, and their impact on the hotels sector;

iii. The funding and budget allocation for the hotel sector;

iv. Targets of works and the objectives of the hotel sector;

v. The actual and future demand extent on the hotel sector, which will be determined through the work targets of Libyan hotels.

Second stage: which will involve studying the current labour market in Libya in general and specifically the hotel sector in terms of:

i. size and quality of the national and foreign labour force;

ii. size of the labour force flow in the short-term;

iii. size of the workforce flow in the long-term.

Third stage: will involve studying the actual demand on the labour force in the Libyan hotel sector. The 2006 census could be used to determine:
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

i. The size of existing hotels and HEIs to determine existing labour force demand and supply;

ii. The future demand of hotel and HEIs to match WFDP strategies with future labour force demand.

Fourth stage: which will involve studying the actual situation and future expectations of supply and demand within the previous three stages to determine the following:

i. The existing gap in the labour market or the internal gap in supply and demand;

ii. The future gap in the labour market or the internal gap in supply and demand.

Fifth stage: which will be meant for studying the existing and future gap under the shadow of a comprehensive Libyan hotel sector’s plans/ targets to determine:

i. Reasons and sources of the gap;

ii. Remedy approaches of the gap, where for example:

a. A total negative gap in labour market (demand = more than supply) will require:

- Transfer of training of the excess in labour market from other specializations, meaning that there will be need for the expansion or addition of HEIs.
- Admittance of large numbers in the existing institutions
• Recruitment of more overseas workers, which will imply amendment of labour and employment policies and wage legislations.

b. A positive gap in labour market of hotels (demand = less than supply) will require:
   • Transfer training of the excess in labour market to other sector, which will imply amendment of labour and employment policies.

c. A internal gap in demand, that is, an increase or a decrease in demand on one of the specialisations within the hotel sector. This will require:
   • Transfer training on the positions within the hotel through re-training, refresher training, on job training, coaching opportunities;
   • Recruitment of more overseas workers, which will imply amendment of labour and employment policies and wage legislation.

d. An internal gap in supply, that is, an increase or decrease in the supply from one of the specializations. This will require:
   • Transfer and qualification training on other positions inside the HEIs, amendment of employment policies, amendment of labour and employment legislations.
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

Sixth stage: this last stage will involve determining the appropriate standard for achieving the appropriate individual measurement in the appropriate place and time.

5.6.6 The implementation strategy for the WFP for Libya

The implementation strategy for WFP must involve the following:

- Ensuring management support for the plan. It is top management, including the government, hotel and HEIs administration support, which will determine to a large extent the success of the implementation process. Furthermore, the extent
of WFP integration with the management framework is important for its implementation. Also, there will be a need for strong cooperation and coordination amongst key stakeholders, as well as definition of roles and responsibilities of each key stakeholder in the implementation process;

- Allocating necessary resources to execute implementation strategies. Ideally, funding and other resources are vital for the implementation of workforce planning. There is therefore a need to allocate sufficient resources to ensure smooth implementation of the workforce development plans;

- Setting a time-frame for the implementation process;

- Defining of output measures which will be used to monitor and evaluate the implementation process;

- Communicating about the plan to ensure that all those involved in the implementation, particularly the managers and employees, know how and why WFP benefits them and seek suggestions for improvement.
5.6.7 Evaluation of the WFP implementation strategy

The Libyan government, in collaboration with the hotels and HEIs, should use the WFP as a map to ensure that there are the right people with the right skills in the right job positions. WFP is an ongoing process hence it should not be viewed as a one-stop shop but should be reviewed and monitored regularly. This would ensure that the workforce model remains valid and that objectives are being met in support of the hotel sector’s performance goals. This would involve:

- Reviewing of performance using a set of output indicators;
- Assessing what is working and what is not working;
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

- If necessary adjusting the WF plan and WFD strategies.

The following set of questions would assist the Libyan hotel sector’s key stakeholders, particularly the Libyan government to carry out effective evaluation of the WF plans and WFD strategies:

- Are the skills gaps being closed to ensure that hotel sector’s objectives are being met?
- Are the staff skills and jobs appropriate to meet hotel sector’s objectives?
- Are the HEIs training programmes meeting hotel sector’s objectives?
- Is there sufficient flexibility within the planning process to accommodate changes in both the internal and external environment?
- Did the WFD strategies achieve the required targets and outcomes?
- What worked well and why?
- Are there areas that need improvement?
- Are the WFD plans still valid?

The WFP process can be evaluated through use of a variety of methods, including interviews, surveys, focus groups and review of the quality of the workforce plan. A feedback mechanism between the key stakeholders (government, hotel sector and HEIs) should be established to allow for timely and constant communication on any changes in the WF plans or WFD strategies to inform changes in the work programmes. Appropriate actions needs to be identified for any identified shortfall or inefficiencies.
Chapter Five: Workforce planning for the Libyan hotel sector

5.7 Summary

This chapter investigated the phase of the fieldwork where the WFP model and WF analysis framework (figures 5.2 and 5.4) were reviewed by the key stakeholders (Hotel sector, HEIs, Government), through semi-structured interviews associated with the Delphi technique.

The chapter presented the problems in relation to WFP issues that the Libyan tourism sector is facing. Whilst the government interviewees had some level of understanding of the concept of WFP, the majority of interviewees in the hotel sector and HEIs had little or no knowledge of WFP. There was a consensus amongst key stakeholders on the need for a detailed implementation. The discussion highlighted the powerful role of the government in relation to planning, implementing and financing key development programmes. The need for co-operation and co-ordination among stakeholders was highlighted. Critical issues arising from the initial workforce analysis framework and discussions with the key stakeholders helped the researcher to modify the workforce analysis framework.

Delphi Technique was utilised to build consensus, where initial expert opinions were gathered, analysed and circulated to the experts for comments and to gain consensus on the best practice model. The key stakeholders were asked to identify the modifications required, if any, to inform the best practice WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector. The semi-structured interviews resulted in identification of the Libyan government as the body responsible for WFP. In addition, to the suggestions made for the WFP model, experts from different key stakeholders (i.e., the hotel sector, the HEIs and the
government) gave their overall recommendations touching on various issues. The next chapter provides a detailed discussion of the results from interviews with key stakeholders of different organisations in relation to the HR issues facing Libyan hotels, i.e. the hotel sector, HEIs and the government.
CHAPTER SIX: HR ISSUES IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

6.1 INTRODUCTION 6-3

6.2 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR 6-4
  6.2.1 Recruitment and selection 6-4
  6.2.2 Employment conditions 6-10
  6.3.3 Hotel sector view of Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) 6-11
  6.2.4 Graduate training 6-12
  6.2.5 Overseas workers in the hotel sector 6-15
  6.2.6 Skills gaps 6-18
  6.2.7 Public versus private hotel operators 6-21
  6.2.8 Roles of the public and private sector 6-22
  6.2.9 Poor image of the hotel sector as employer 6-24

6.3 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN HOSPITALITY EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS (HEIs) 6-26
  6.3.1 Shortage of qualified academic staff 6-26
  6.3.2 Curriculum 6-29
  6.3.3 HEI’s view of Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) 6-32
  6.3.4 Funding in Libyan HEIs 6-33
  6.3.5 Co-operation between hospitality industry and HEIs 6-37
  6.3.6 Leakage of graduates and academic staff 6-39

6.4 THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE LIBYAN GOVERNMENT 6-39
  6.4.1 LTMP 6-42
  6.4.2 Image 6-44
  6.4.3 Culture and feminization 6-45
  6.4.4 Training deficiency 6-48
  6.4.5 Libyan government efforts to address HR issues 6-49

6.5 CONGRUENCE AND DISSONANCE BETWEEN KEY STAKEHOLDERS’ VIEWS ON HR ISSUES FACING THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR 6-51
  6.5.1 Common issues raised by all the key stakeholders 6-52
6.5.2 Issues raised by the HEIs staff and hotel managers
6.5.3 Issues raised by the hotel managers and government
6.5.4 Issues raised by the government
6.5.5 Issues raised by the hotel managers
6.5.6 Issues raised by the HEIs
6.6 SUMMARY
CHAPTER SIX: HR ISSUES IN THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

6.1 INTRODUCTION

Analysis of the transcribed interviews resulted in the identification of a number of themes. This chapter provides a detailed discussion of the results from interviews with key stakeholders of different organisations in relation to the HR issues facing Libyan hotels, i.e. the hotel sector (see section 6.2), HEIs (see section 6.3) and the government (see section 6.4). These themes include: recruitment and selection; skills gaps; hotel sector view of LTMP; inadequate vocational training; minimum promotion opportunities for overseas workers; the role of the public and private sector in HR development; the shortage of qualified academic staff; outdated curricula; the inadequacy of the LTMP; funding of Libyan HEIs; lack of co-operation between the hotel sector, HEIs and the government; leakage of graduates and academic staff and poor image of the industry. Section 6.5 presents a discussion of the three sets of views from the hotel sector, HEIs and the government, to reflect the congruence and dissonance as there were a lot of common themes which cut across the three sectors. Figure 6.1 presents the main subjects discussed in this chapter and the linkages identified.
Figure 6.1: Structure of discussion

6.2 THE PERSPECTIVES OF THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

Interviews with 18 hotel managers resulted in the identification of nine main themes: recruitment and selection; employment conditions; graduate training; overseas workers in the hotel sector; workforce productivity; skills gap; public versus private hotel operations; the role of the public and private sector; poor image of the hotel sector as employer.

6.2.1 Recruitment and selection

The quality of hotel services is directly dependent on the quality and performance of its employees and the provision of high-quality goods and services begins with the recruitment process (Richardson, 2005). Thus, recruiting and selecting the right people
is important to the success of the hotel sector in Libya. However, despite the wide range of possible employee recruitment and selection methods such as word-of-mouth (Thomas et al. 1998 cited in Walmsley, 2004: 276), advertising in newspapers and using recruitment agencies (Lashley, 2005), analysis of the interviews with hotel managers in Libya revealed that hotels use mainly two methods of recruitment and selection. The first and major source of employees is through recommendations from skilled employees who are already working in hotels. Their opinions regarding potential new workers’ skills and abilities to satisfy the job requirements are viewed by the hotel administration to be very important. In fact managers stated:

We trust skilled employees who work in this hotel when they recommend new workers to be recruited in the hotel.

(Hotel 9)

The second main source of recruitment and selection is through the recommendations of people who have social relationships with the hotel manager (e.g. friends and relatives) as illustrated by one of the hotel managers:

A group of new workers have been employed in the hotel based on the recommendations of some managers’ friends. Consequently, this impacts negatively on the quality of services provided by the hotel.

(Hotel 4)

Eleven out of the eighteen managers stated that the majority of new workers are recruited through the first method of recruitment and selection, i.e. recommendations from skilled workers. However, seven out of the eighteen managers confirmed that most new workers have been employed through the second source of recruitment and selection (recommendation from friends and relatives). Previous studies (Richardson, 2005) show that such informal methods of recruitment are unlikely to attract a large
pool of qualified staff, consequently the quality and performance of the hotels is affected. This, therefore, helps to explain the current problems of service quality and poor performance in the hotel sector in Libya, where most of the workers have been found to be unqualified for their jobs. Indeed, one of the hotel managers estimated that over 60% of the workers in various job positions in the Libyan hotel sector are not qualified for their jobs (Hotel 10). However the same manager was quick to point out that the majority of the workers learn basic skills as they do the job (i.e. on-the-job training). Over and above this, preliminary research carried out as part of LTMP the preparation process revealed that:

Standards (in some hotels) are so poor and the condition of the hotels are neglected...these hotels are giving Libya a bad name with one internationally published tour guide book describing at least two hotels as ‘filthy’...the staff in them seemed to have little concept about what their duties were or even of basic standards of cleanliness.

(Libyan Government, 1998:1/63)

Despite the shortcomings of informal recruitment methods, many tourism-related sectors in developed and developing countries continue to embrace these methods. In their research, Haven et al. (2004) noted that 74% of employers in the tourism and related sectors in Wales use word-of-mouth and personal recommendations for recruitment. A survey of Scottish hotels revealed extensive reliance on informal methods, specifically, referrals from existing staff, in recruiting and selecting front-line staff (Lockyer and Scholarios, 2004). In China, Qui and Lam (2004) observed that general managers of state-owned hotels had been assigned to their jobs by the State, rather than hired as the result of a search for the right candidate for the right job. According to Richardson (2005) recommendations (referrals) constitute an informal
hiring method and are mainly used because they are relatively inexpensive and can be implemented quickly.

As indicated by the interviewees' results, the sampled hotels are far from adopting systematic and formal methods of recruitment and selection. Formal recruitment and selection methods involve searching the labour market more widely for candidates with no previous connection to the organisation (Thomas et al. 1998). These methods mainly include advertisement via electronic and print media and employment agencies. Such methods are thought to reach a wider audience and may generate a greater number of potential candidates (nationally and internationally) from which the hotel can select the most appropriate candidate.

One of the hotel managers noted that:

*the lack of co-operation and co-ordination between the hotel administration and Ministry of Media leads to the absence of efficient advertisements for seeking new skilled workers. So, people have no information about vacancies in the hotel sector.*

(Hotel 5)

Another hotel manager suggested:

*there should be an integration between different departments in the hotel sector, where the Ministry of Media should be responsible for such issues, but unfortunately this ministry is unable to exploit the effectiveness of the media towards realizing the hotel sector’s goals including recruiting qualified staff.*

(Hotel 8)

Lack of awareness of available vacancies is linked to the dominant source of recruitment and selection, i.e. social relationship recommendations. Consequently, little
attention is given to selecting skilled people to fill these vacancies. It can therefore be argued that the second source of recruitment and selection in the Libyan hotel sector, that is, referrals and recommendations from friends and relatives, contributes to a lack of qualified staff in the Libyan hotel sector.

Conversely, the majority of hotel managers report that they pay no attention to formal employment application processes, regardless of the qualifications and skills of the applicant because of the hotel managers' previous experience of the Libyan education system. It is apparent that the hotel sector does not trust the higher education system and its graduates, as illustrated by one hotel manager:

*Despite the academic qualifications of people who apply for new occupations in hotel sector, most of the employment applications applied by them did not match the vacancy requirements, particularly those who need specific skills, for example chefs. Unfortunately this strengthens our mistrust towards the qualifications of graduates who comes from educational institutions.*

(Hotel 12)

Also:

*It should be noted that the hotel sector [is] facing difficulties in recruiting qualified workers from academic and vocational point view. Most of the graduate workers who seek a job in this sector have graduated from HEIs run with curricula and training facilities too weak for the labour market and to satisfy of the job requirements.*

(Hotel 9)

The above quote reflects the weakness of the curriculum and training provided by Libyan tourism and hospitality education institutions. It also indicates that there is a gap
between the outcomes, i.e. the graduates from these institutions, and the real needs of the hotel sector. This situation has led to frustration of enthusiasm towards working in the hotel sector, as people who apply for new occupations might have academic qualifications and skills, but these qualifications and skills do not necessarily satisfy the needs of the hotel sector.

A minority of hotel managers referred to bureaucratic employment procedures as being an obstacle. One of the hotel managers said:

*The bureaucracy and centralisation of recruitment process [in] the hotel sector administrative system is a strong hindrance to recruiting and employing new workers, in general and foreign workers, in particular.*

(Hotel 9)

In support, another hotel manager said:

*We are facing problems in recruiting skilled Libyan workforce and specific skilled overseas workers in the hotel sector. The Libyan administration system encounters centralisation and bureaucracy problems where recruiting new employees takes a long time. This hampers the hotel sector from recruiting the right person at the right time.*

(Hotel 1)

Usually, the application procedure for new employees is relatively long and complicated. The applications are required to go through different levels of administration and the hotel managers report that this complicates the whole recruitment procedure, as well as frustrates the job applicants, forcing them to look for jobs in other sectors.
6.2.2 Employment conditions

In comparison to the oil sector, the hotel sector provides low and unattractive payment packages compared to other sectors, e.g. the oil sector. For example, whilst the lowest paid employee in the hotel sector receives a salary package of LD 120 per month, the lowest paid employee in the oil sector receives a salary package of LD 450 per month. The oil sector, on the other hand, offers additional lucrative benefits to its employees such as insurance, medical cover and training, which help it to attract and retain highly qualified employees. In addition, the low wages offered by the hotel sector force many hotel employees to seek work in alternative sectors.

The low wages offered in the public hotels can be considered as a reflection of the deficiency in the Libyan employment and wages law as stated in Article 15/1981. One of the hotel managers stated:

*Low wages are considered to be one of the problems hampering the hotel sector from employing skilled people either from Libyan side or overseas side. The law as stated by the Libyan government, Article 15/1981, which govern public hotels in Libya is seen as the reason for low wages. This leads to many skilled employees to look for alternative jobs in other sectors, particularly in the private sector where high salaries could be obtained.*

(Hotel 2)

Despite the fact that it is difficult to get qualified people from the Libyan workforce due to their lack of qualifications and skills, it is equally difficult to recruit from overseas, due to the centralisation and bureaucracy of the Libyan administrative
system. Consequently, hotel managers find it very difficult to overcome the lack of job-specific skills amongst their employees.

Comments from the hotel managers demonstrate that the sampled hotels do not comply with the regulations as stated by the Libyan Workforce Ministry (LWM), which specifies that the workforce should be recruited and oriented to appropriate occupations. As an alternative, the hotel managers use informal methods of recruitment, particularly recommendations from friends and relatives.

The findings reveal some of the important labour market and education issues in the Libyan hotel sector, which are considered to be the key problems facing the sector. This has serious implications for workforce development, which needs to be tackled by addressing these problems evident in the existing differences between skills requirements in the hotel sector and higher education system.

6.3.3 Hotel sector view of Libyan Tourism Master Plan

The majority of the Libyan hotel managers were interviewed and the findings of this research showed that in addition to the LTMP not having been implemented to any extent, the HRD aspects of the LTMP are not seen to be appropriate to the needs of the hotel sector and it is not perceived that they will significantly enhance service quality, which is a key issue for destination competitiveness (Walker, 1990; Tsang and Qu, 2003; Nadiri and Hussain, 2005). Indeed one of the hotel managers pointed out:
Most of the hotel managers reported to the government that LTMP are not appropriately matched to the real needs of the hotel sector. In addition, there should be more co-operations between us in order to prepare HRD plans efficiently to fulfill the needs of the labour market.

(Hotel 18)

The following comments demonstrate the hotel managers’ views of the LTMP: “Personally, I believe the LTMP does not cover salient aspects of human resource development in the hotel sector” (Hotel 1). Another hotel manager added, “We were not consulted...we were not involved in development of the LTMP...I don’t think the HRD aspects covered (in the LTMP) suits our needs” (Hotel 13). Furthermore, two of the hotel managers felt that HRD aspects as addressed in the LTMP are “inadequate” (Hotel 4) and “sketchy” (Hotel 3).

6.2.4 Graduate training

Analysis of the interviews indicated that for most of the hotel managers, practical experience is the key element required from new staff, over and above English language skills. In addition, French, German and Italian language skills were also considered desirable. As one of the hotel managers stated:

*It is important for us to employ new workers who have received good training and experience in addition to the English language.*

(Hotel 14)
A recent study by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) suggests that practical training and experience is more highly valued than formal accredited training qualifications (ILO, 2001). There was consensus from the Libyan hotel managers that the majority of graduates from HEIs lack ‘hands-on’ experience and a positive attitude toward the hotel sector:

There is total lack of practical experience... it appears that practical training offered in HEIs is not sufficient to enable graduates to take up jobs in the hotel sector.

(Hotel 10)

According to one of the hotel managers:

Practical skills are very important [in the hotel sector]...we try as much as possible not to employ workers with limited practical skills...it is difficult to cope with various tasks in hotels...particularly technical tasks... if one does not have sufficient practical skills.

(Hotel 2)

The views from hotel managers suggest preliminary confirmation of other studies. For example, Connolly and McGing’s (2006) study of managers’ attitudes towards higher education for hospitality management in Ireland found that 90% of the managers preferred graduates with good practical skills. Again, 100% of managers in Ireland ranked practical skills four and above (on a Likert scale of 1 to 7, where 1= unimportant and 7= very important), indicating that practical skills were important or very important.

Despite the desire by the sampled hotels to employ skilled workers, the majority of the hotel managers mentioned that they generally employ low skilled college graduates
due to the lack of alternatives in the local labour market. This was summarized by one hotel manager:

*College graduates comprise the only choice for recruiting workers in our hotels provided by the local labour market and this is considered an obstacle towards achieving our objectives in an effective way.*

(Hotel 18)

Generally, the Libyan hotel managers believe that the lack of required skills by college graduates is due to the following reasons:

- Weakness of the curriculum provided by HEIs in Libya;
- Lack of practical training in these institutions;
- Lack of foreign language skills amongst students.

At the same time, the hotel managers agree that it is difficult to recruit qualified and highly skilled staff because of:

- Low salaries provided by hotels in relation to the demands of the job compared to other sectors, e.g. oil;
- The poor image of the tourism sector generally and hotels in particular, within the Libyan culture;
- Lack of support from the government to encourage people to work in the hotel sector.

Whilst most of the above reasons for recruitment and selection difficulties are frequently referred to in the tourism and hospitality literature, one of the most comprehensive surveys by Thomas et al. (2000 cited in Lashley, 2005:185), established that "the level of pay on offer was not perceived to be a major reason for recruitment difficulties" in the UK. In Libya, both the hotel and oil sectors are governed by the
same employment law. However, the oil sector does not seem to be experiencing recruitment difficulties as the employees in the oil sector have access to additional benefits, such as insurance and medical cover, which is seen to compensate for the low salaries. The employees in the hotel sector, on the other hand, do not receive such benefits and as a result, the sectors’ low wages are an additional cause of recruitment problems.

6.2.5 Overseas workers in the hotel sector

Generally, the hotel sector views the recruitment and employment procedures as stated by the LWM on the employment of foreign workers as an obstacle to recruiting highly qualified staff who could deliver better service in the sector. There is a strong belief across the hotel sector that foreign workers possess the necessary skills and abilities to provide a quality service compared to the Libyan workforce. The hotel sector considers workers from other countries, particularly Egypt, Malta, Tunisia and Morocco which have similar Mediterranean locations to Libya, to be well trained and educated. Furthermore, these countries have well-established tourist markets and much experience in the hotel sector.

The research findings revealed that the hotel sector follows the recruitment regulations pertaining to the recruitment of overseas’ workers as specified in the LWM regulations. For example, overseas’ workers are employed on one of three different types of contracts:
Temporary contracts, which are offered when a need arises within a hotel, and hence provided less job security, as the contract can be terminated at anytime;

Seasonal contracts, which are mainly offered during spring and summer periods.

Annual contracts, encompassing the majority of overseas employees in the sampled hotels. Unlike the temporary and seasonal contracts, annual contracts offer employees the opportunity to transfer their salaries to their home country through the Central Bank of Libya (CBL), and this save them resources, including time wasted in making arrangements to transfer money through other means. Annual contracts are considered to offer job security because they are governed by LWM regulations;

Temporary contracts and seasonal contracts comprise the minority of overseas employees in such hotels. As one of the hotel managers stated:

In our hotel usually we sign annual contracts with skilled overseas staff in specific positions. When our hotel encounters a shortage in these positions, e.g. chef and restaurant service, such contracts are often extended or renewed for another year. This is consistent with the Libyan employment regulations.

(Hotel 10)

He continued:

Some jobs, for example housekeeper and cleaners, are not easily accepted by Libyan workers because such jobs are seen to be inconvenient and considered difficult compared to the salaries offered. This forces us to look for overseas staff to cover the shortage and fill the gaps in such jobs. In such cases, temporary and seasonal contracts are signed.

(Hotel 10)
Furthermore:

*As a hotel manager I find difficulty to recruit Libyan workers in some positions which need professional skills including expert cooks, waiters and receptionists. Most Libyan workers are not capable of doing such jobs effectively, because they are not trained well. As a result, we turn our attention to overseas workers to fill these positions.*

(Hotel 1)

Generally, a number of departments, including reception, housekeeping, restaurant and kitchen, which require language skills, job experience, customer service skills and the ‘right’ attitude are usually quick to employ overseas workers, who are considered to possess such skills. However, for managerial and supervisory positions in public hotels, overseas workers cannot be recruited, because the Libyan employment law does not allow overseas workers to take up managerial or supervisory positions in public organisations. Qualified staff at all levels of hotels and in particular at the management level (strategic level) is crucial in creating sustained competitive advantage. Paradoxically, the results revealed that the managerial posts in the Libyan hotels are dependent on local people who are generally less well-qualified. This has far reaching consequences on the Libyan hotel sector’s performance particularly, on aspects of general management of the hotels, which in the long-run would impact negatively on the performance of staff at lower levels.
6.2.6 Skills Gaps

There was general agreement amongst managers that there are many skills gaps in the hotel sector. These include foreign language skills, particularly employees in housekeeping and food and beverage departments. As a consequence, the majority of employees fall short in foreign language skills. Moreover, the majority of the managers held the view that in-house courses to produce middle and top managers are deficient in the hotel sector.

Another important observation made by managers was the increasing unwillingness by most Libyan students to study housekeeping. 16 out of 18 hotel managers pointed out that "housekeeping is the last option students would choose to study", the reason being "it is regarded as a low-paid and low-level occupation". For example, the minimum annual salary for the junior staff in the housekeeping department (e.g. cleaners) is LD 1,020 and the maximum is LD 1,380 (see appendix 7).

Similarly, there are skills gaps in other positions, such as restaurants (where professional waiters are required) and kitchens (where trained chefs are needed). According to one of the hotel managers:

"...our hotel encountered shortage in these positions, i.e. in the chef and restaurant service."

(Hotel 10)
As a result, the hotel sector is forced to rely on overseas staff to fill these gaps. Similar skills gaps are reported in other countries. Haven et al. (2004), for example, noted that getting a qualified chef is a problem in Wales, consequently, some hotels opted to “de-skill menus so that less skilled staff can be recruited” (Haven et al., 2004:164). Surveys by Hospitality Training Foundation (HtF) (2001a, 2001b, 2001c cited in Lashley, 2005) indicated that the main areas of staff shortages included; chefs/cooks, followed by bar staff, waiters/waitresses and finally catering assistants. Likewise, study findings by Brien (2004) indicated that chef’s positions were the hardest to fill in the hotel sector in New Zealand.

The importance of problems in skills shortages in the hospitality sector is well illustrated by Zhang and Wu (2004:425) who observed that in China:

...there are too few suitable and qualified candidates; hoteliers have had to promote employees before they are ready to take on supervisory and/or managerial responsibilities.

In an attempt to deal with problems of skill shortages, some companies resolve to remove unskilled tasks from skilled workers already in the company thus allowing them to concentrate on their skilled tasks, whereas others change their emphasis from finding the skills to fit the job towards fitting the job to the available skills (Vinten, 1998).

The status of education and training for the hotel sector in Libya is not sufficient to fulfill the changing hotel requirements associated with the growing demand of hotel services to suit the growing tourism market (the LTMP estimates that there will be approximately on 80% increase in demand for people to work in tourist accommodation to meet the needs of future development by the year 2018). This situation is explained
by the limited funding and the shortage of capable HEI graduates to meet the requirements of the hotel sector. As a result, the hotel sector has been forced to employ large numbers of poorly-educated and unskilled employees. The interviews revealed that the majority of the labour force in the sampled hotels had either high-school qualifications or lower. A similar scenario has also been reported in China, where hotels have been forced to recruit employees with rather lower education attainments in efforts to address labour shortages (Zhang and Wu, 2004).

Analysis of the interviews showed that the majority of hotels carry out training needs analysis through: observations by general managers or departmental heads; guest comments and complaints; regular meetings amongst senior and middle level managers and informal discussions between department heads and employees. However, according to one hotel manager, such training need analysis exercises are "just a formality...nothing is done on the outcome of the analysis...instead the results of the analysis are filed and locked in cupboards" (Hotel 13). One manager linked lack of implementation of training need analysis results to "insufficient funds and lack of commitment to employee training by hotel top management" (Hotel 2).

To completely tackle the problem of skill gaps, the majority of the managers felt that the government needs to offer more tourism education and training courses. At the same time, hotels need to continue training their staff particularly in the required positions.

One of the managers said:

_Our hotel faces many problems related to training and skills in the top level...the government should give the graduate chance to training to get_
appropriate skills to enable them work in different department in hotel sector.

(Hotel 3)

6.2.7 Public versus private hotel operators

The results showed some significant differences between public and private hotels. For example, unlike public hotels, there was widespread awareness across private hotels of the vital role of service quality, particularly in satisfying and retaining customers, achieving competitive advantage and increased productivity. Whilst public hotels in Libya are strictly governed by the LWM regulations, private hotels have to abide by the regulations but are allowed some flexibility. For example, salaries offered by public hotels are ruled by Article 15/1981 of the Libyan Employment law, but those offered by private hotels are not. Therefore, private hotels are better placed to offer better salaries and attract more highly skilled employees. At the same time, private hotels have an opportunity to hire qualified supervisors and managers from overseas. This flexibility offers private hotels the opportunity to enhance their services by recruiting qualified staff. One of the hotel managers pointed out to the current challenges facing public hotels as a result of Article 15/1981 and commented that:

Despite ineffective training programmes being provided by public hotels, some employees in these hotels find an opportunity to train themselves and acquire the required experience, and then they decide to work in private hotels, since such hotels are not committed to apply Article 15/1981, where high salaries could be offered. So, public hotels face difficulties on retaining those skilled or semi-skilled employees.
Therefore, this give up the efforts provided by public hotels in training aspects and will not be able to offer good quality services.

(Hotel 1)

6.2.8 Roles of the public and private sector

Interviewees of the sampled hotels stated that the government has established four main training institutions for the tourism industry, i.e. the Institute of Tourism in Tripoli, the Institute of Tourism in Shahat, the Institute of Tourism in Mosurata, and the Institute of Tourism in Benghazi. However, educational programmes provided by these education institutions do not meet the needs of the hotel sector in Libya. Indeed one of the hotel managers pointed out:

As hotel managers, we reported to the government that educational programmes and curriculum provided by the education institutions are not appropriately matched to the real needs of the hotel sector. Also, it has been recommended in our reports that we should be involved in the course design provided by such institutions, where the links between theoretical and practical aspects could be balanced and strengthened. In addition, there should be more co-operation between us in order to prepare graduates efficiently to fulfill the needs of the labour market.

(Hotel 12)

Hotel managers emphasised the importance of the government’s role in developing effective and efficient training programmes offered by educational institutions, which should be more consistent with their labour market needs and linked to the aims and
objectives of the LTMP. Furthermore, appropriate budgets for education and training for the hotel sector should be considered. Education will enable career progression for the Libyan population. Therefore, the government should establish a long-term plan for HRD in the hotel sector including both public and private hotels. One of the hotel managers pointed out:

_We need the government to study and address our needs and establish a long-term plan for HRD to cater for both private and public hotels._

(Hotel 17)

Most of the interviewees emphasised the need for each hotel to train its own staff. In fact, according to the ILO (2001), training may be used as a means to address difficult working conditions and low wages. From a theoretical point of view, private hotels in Libya should contribute to their employees’ training. Yet, this is not the reality as private hotels are able to offer high salaries to attract skilled workers hence many of them do not require training to fill skills gaps. Therefore, from the perspective of the private hotels, there is no need to provide any training programmes. This enables them to reduce costs whilst still offering high quality service. Moore (2005:199) observes that “the hotel and catering industry generally does not invest properly in training and development, and operates a ‘take, take, take’ rather than a ‘give-and-take’ attitude when it comes to employment”. Baum et al. (1997) made similar observations. However, in Libya with the ever-changing needs of customers, the hotel sector needs to reconsider employee development if they are to compete nationally and internationally. A lack of training is thought to result in the inability of a person to use existing knowledge (Baum, 2002). In addition, Ghebrit (2004) states that well-trained individuals are able to add building blocks to their professionalism as they progress
through their careers. ILO (2001) asserts that in organisations where employees are recognized as valued assets and receive the training needed to assume greater responsibility and where their opinion is sought with regard to operational changes, turnover rates are lower.

6.2.9 Poor image of the hotel sector as an employer

In general, the research findings showed that the hospitality and tourism industry (private and public hotels) in Libya suffers from a poor image as an employer in terms of employment conditions and benefits, demonstrated by the low social status of hotel jobs, long and unsocial working hours, poor salaries, few social welfare benefits, and a lack of knowledge of the importance of tourism for Libya. Despite the small number of graduates produced every year, many graduates do not work in the industry after graduation, instead, they join other well-paying sectors, including oil sector. In addition, the hotel sector is losing skilled personnel to other industries because of its poor salaries (see appendix 1). One of the hotel managers admitted:

The public hotels must adjust salary levels to be in line with other service industries, however, it is difficult to do so at the moment because the rooms are not full and there is high competition from private hotels.

(Hotel 16)

ILO (2001) notes that while, the working conditions within the tourism and hotel industry include a number of potentially problematic areas, such as unequal working hours and general absence of overtime payments and wage levels, hotel and restaurant workers earn less than workers in socially comparable occupations, such as the banking sector. Like the case in the Libyan hotel sector, Zhang and Wu (2004) found that in
China, the hotel and tourism sector is considered a poor employer, consequently, the majority of graduates tend to prefer working for prestigious sectors, such as IT and banking, which offer better paid positions and benefits, and are thought to motivate people. The ILO (2001:55) notes that:

*As long as other jobs offer equal levels of pay, but more advantageous working and employment conditions, the problem of turnover will persist in the hotel and restaurant sector, unless the industry can create equivalent conditions or compensate in other ways.*

The majority of the Libyan hotel managers raised their concerns. The following comment was typical:

*If salaries in the hotel sectors continue to remain low, the sector would not be able to solve the current problem of staff shortage...the government needs to identify incentives other than salary to be able to recruit and retain high quality employees.*

(Hotel 9)

Wood and Jayawardena’s (2003:152) observations from Cuba underlines the importance of attractive salaries:

*Managers from other sectors, with excellent academic qualifications and professional experience, are attracted to the tourism sector, particularly the hotel industry, to quickly attain much-sought-after US dollars and higher income than in other sectors.*
6.3 THE PERSPECTIVES OF THE LIBYAN HOSPITALITY EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS (HEIs)

The following section presents the results of interviews conducted with senior staff in Libyan HEIs under six themes: shortage of qualified academic staff; curriculum; HEIs' views of the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP); funding in Libyan HEIs; co-operation between hospitality industry and HEIs; leakage of graduates and academic staff.

6.3.1 Shortage of qualified academic staff

The quality of academic staff, the curriculum and the physical facilities, such as training kitchens and restaurants, all impact on the quality of the graduates produced. The majority of hospitality academic staff interviewed felt that they had sufficient theoretical knowledge but lacked practical experience. The interviews showed that only a few industry-experienced staff teach in the HEIs and mainly on a part-time basis:

_In our institute we have a remarkable shortage of qualified full-time staff; this pushes us to get help from the industry in the form of part-time staff because they are deemed to have theoretical and practical experience needed to cover the required courses effectively and efficiently._

(Institute 1)

However, the average salary of full-time academic staff is so low that many competent academic staff abandon teaching to work in other industries. On average, a full-time academic staff member earns LD 230 per month. This is way below the amount (i.e. LD 450) earned by a cleaner in the oil sector.
One of the managers commented on the issue of staff retention and how staff retention might be improved by amending the strict legislation relating to salaries in the public sector:

*The low salaries offered by education and training institutes for their qualified academic staff pushes them to seek alternative jobs where they can get better salaries. Consequently, this has impacted negatively on the level of education and learning processes in such institutions.*

He adds:

*In my opinion in order to retain our qualified academic staff, it is important for the government to be aware that providing high wages to our academic staff should be considered as one of the critical success factors to improve and develop such institutions. This could be achieved by amendment of article 15/1981 of the law on wages.*

(Institute 1)

There was general agreement amongst interviewees that the hospitality industry should be involved in the training programmes provided by HEIs, which could be achieved through participation in curriculum design and providing industrial placement opportunities for students. Increased opportunities for industrial work experience in the hospitality curriculum will enhance and support the balance between theory and practice essential for the delivery of service quality in the hospitality sector.

The majority of the interviewees emphasized the need for HEIs to request feedback (employer surveys) on the quality of graduates and to collaborate with public and private hotel sectors in developing new courses and improving existing ones. The majority of interviewees felt that the development of new courses as well as improving existing ones should take place as soon as possible. Most of the comments made by
interviewees attest to this, for example "we are ready to review and improve our training courses any time...only if we get sufficient financial support" (Institute 2), "Well, we are living in a dynamic world, we need to update our courses to match with the changing trends" (Hotel 1).

Again, the interviewees noted that:

It is necessary to establish a clear policy between education and training institutes and the hospitality industry in order to build a bridge, where the gap between practical and theoretical knowledge could be reduced. Also, this bridge will help support education and training programmes and provide the necessary integration between educational institutes and the hospitality industry.

(Institute 3)

In addition, self-development opportunities should be offered to the academic staff by offering them special on-the-job courses to improve their skills and abilities.

Our full-time academic staff need to be trained by offering them specific training programs that match the contemporary and international standards in order to develop our institutes and fulfill the market place requirements.

(Institute 1)

More emphasis needs to given to post-graduate studies, to expand the recruitment pool of academics. This could be achieved by:

Proving the necessary facilities and creating hopeful research environment. Also offering scholarships to encourage students to take up postgraduate studies.

(Institution 2)
6.3.2 Curriculum

The majority of interviewees emphasised that the curricula provided by their institutes are out-dated and are not able to develop competent and knowledgeable personnel to meet the hotel sectors’ needs. The majority of the curricula have not been developed or reviewed for at least ten years, which is contrary to the contemporary curriculum development review cycles found in developed countries, such as, UK, where curricula are reviewed after every four to five years and sometimes more regularly. In this context one of the managers stated that:

*In my opinion, the curriculum offered by our institute is traditional... old-fashioned in its content. It has not been assessed nor reviewed since 1995.*

*It addresses mainly the theoretical aspects rather than providing a balance between the theoretical and practical aspects. This indicates that there is a lack of the integration needed by the curriculum nowadays in such institutions.*

(Institute 2)

Indeed:

*The current curricula and training approaches used in HEIs are out of date. They cover general topics, rather than particular subjects.*

(Institution 3)

Lewis (1993 cited in Jayawardena, 2001) noted that most hospitality curricula are based on what the hospitality industry needed in the past and not what it needs today. Consequently, most academic staff find themselves out of touch with the contemporary hospitality industry and continue to provide solutions for past problems.
The present Libyan curricula are based on those developed across Western Arab Union (a collective which includes: Libya, Tunisia, Algeria, Morocco and Mauritania) and fails to recognize wider international issues. The curricula fail to give clear directions as to how education should be delivered in terms of time input and evaluation criteria. Consequently academic staff tend to emphasis the topic areas in which they are confident and skip over topics about which they have little knowledge or experience. As stressed by one HEI manager:

*It should be noted that the curriculum provided by our institutes was adopted from the Western Arab Union, which in my opinion does not consider the differences between us and other countries in this union, which are thought to have more experience than us in this field. In addition, we were neither involved in, more contributed to the design of such a curriculum.*

(Institute 3)

The Libyan government (1998), for instance, asserts that the Institute of Tourism at Susah obtained its curriculum from the Arab Union for Technical Education based in Alexandria. These findings are consistent with previous studies by UNESCO (2003), which point out that higher educational curricula in Arab universities do not meet the demands of rapid changes in the world in terms of the needs of the labour market or the needs of the societies in which these universities operate.

Such situations necessitate the need for open communication channels to facilitate and encourage transfer and exchange of knowledge, information and experience, locally (between Libyan HEIs), nationally (with Arab HEIs) and internationally (with foreign
HEIs). According to one of the managers, such objectives could be achieved through “visits, committees, conferences, shared projects and research” (Institute 2).

Due to the low standards of education resulting from the existing curricula provided by HEIs, the hospitality industry is not confident enough to recruit Libyan hospitality graduates. This leads to an increase in the number of hospitality graduates who are unable to secure jobs within the Libyan hotels sector. When asked to provide rough estimates of hospitality graduates who are not employed in the hotel sector, two of the interviewees (Institution 1 and 3) mentioned “60-70%” whereas three interviewees (Institution 1, Institution 2 and Institution 3) mentioned “above 70%”.

In addition, some senior HEI staff believe that apart from the poor quality of hospitality qualifications and skills levels of graduates, many hotel managers feel threatened by graduates because they themselves do not have the minimum qualifications to match their position. This may be a major factor in the rejection of new graduates from employment in the Libyan hotel sector.

There is also general agreement among HEI interviewees that they have not received sufficient support and encouragement from the government to develop and improve their institution’s curriculum. They commented on the urgent need for enhanced budgets to support development of physical facilities (e.g. dedicated to equip their training restaurants and kitchens) for effective curriculum delivery, and to enhance the learning resources which they can access. Also, they felt that the government, through the HEIs, should encourage the translation of foreign learning support materials and
offer Arabic language textbooks and training for tourism industry. Thus, academic staff and students would have a wider range of reference materials to develop and improve their knowledge. Currently there is a heavy reliance on what has been translated by individual academics into lecture notes. In addition, there was a perception that HEIs should have access to a library and information resource for hotel-training shared across all Libyan HEIs. This would give HEIs an opportunity to work with each other and at the same time develop a bridge with government departments.

6.3.3 HEIs view of Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP)

The current LTMP does not take into consideration the important role played by HEIs in the development of a qualified workforce, which is necessary for the enhancement of the Libyan hospitality industry, as illustrated by a senior member of HEI:

*Despite the LTMP being issued in 1998, it was only recently that I received a copy and I found that it does not consider HEIs as important players or as a critical factor for human resource development in the tourism sector. Also, it does not address the development issues of HEIs and the co-operation and integration between the tourism industry and us.*

(Institute 3)

Furthermore, the HEI managers were not invited to participate in the development of the LTMP as a group of key stakeholders. Consequently, none of the HEIs education and training programmes offered are mentioned in the LTMP. Nevertheless, the graduates emerging from these HEIs are potentially the most important resource for the enhancement of the Libyan hospitality industry. However, personal observations during the field research revealed that the majority of these HEIs lack a well-equipped library,
text-books and other teaching materials. The teaching process is based on traditional approaches to learning, i.e. teacher-centred approaches with minimal student participation. Similar observations were also made during preliminary research carried out during the preparation of LTMP (Libyan Government, 1998).

Clearly, no emphasis is laid on the importance of HEIs and the potential contributions of the HEIs in the development of the human resources necessary for the Libyan tourism industry. This is very disappointing, particularly, at a time when the development of the tourism industry is being considered to be one of the key economic diversification strategies for Libya (Libyan Minister of Tourism, 2003). As the blueprint for the success of the Libyan tourism industry the importance of the LTMP cannot be underestimated and it is critical that it addresses HR issues and the role of the HEIs in producing the high-quality, highly-qualified staff essential for the success and achievement of an internationally competitive hotel sector.

6.3.4 Funding in Libyan HEIs

Despite current funding being provided by the Libyan government to a number of HEIs, the majority of these institutions still experience financial shortages and are not able to sufficiently develop new teaching materials or to purchase necessary equipment and other facilities needed for effective curriculum delivery, as noted by one interviewee:

At the end of the month salaries and other benefits are deposited in the banks. However, what is more important is the continuous financial support for training programmes. I think all institutions face similar
problems in this regard... because the government does not pay attention to such issues.

(Institution 3)

It was observed in all the HEIs, that the equipment and general facilities available for teaching and supporting learning processes are very poor. The buildings were built without adequate consideration of the specific requirements of hospitality education. For example, most of the institutions have only general-purpose classrooms, and lack basic specialist facilities, such as training kitchens and restaurants or library and learning resource centers to enhance effective delivery of the hospitality curriculum. One member of senior staff in one of the institutions said:

There is complete absence of appropriate training strategies for staff and faculty members. There are no facilities and not enough resources to provide students with the necessary theoretical and practical knowledge.

(Institution 2)

These findings are consistent with previous studies (e.g. Alfinash et al., 1998), which found that the teaching and learning processes in Libyan HEIs are based on traditional ways of lecturing.

In recent years, the Libyan higher education system has witnessed increases in the number of students, leading to increased number of students per lecture. For example, a lecture hall in one HEI, which previously could accommodate approximately thirty students was thought now to accommodate more than seventy students. However, no additional lecture halls were built; instead more seats were added to each lecture hall. At the same time, no more staff were recruited to accommodate the increased numbers of
students. This has had a negative effect on student learning as it is not possible to give personalised attention, thus denying students the opportunity to maximize the benefits derived from their teachers. Also, there was consensus amongst the HEI senior staff that the current increase in the number of students per lecture hall has negatively impacted on delivery of services to students. One interviewee said:

*It is my responsibility to ensure that students understand all my lessons. At the moment, this is not possible. I cannot provide individual attention to each student.*

(Institution 3)

Another interviewee added:

*As an institution, we have problems. We have witnessed an increase in the number of students over the last two years... we have not expanded our training facilities. The lecture halls are too congested...textbooks are too few to meet the demand.*

(Institution 3)

For the majority of HEI senior staff, the current problems can be linked to a lack of government planning. As illustrated by one interviewee:

*In comparison with other sectors, I can say that one of the main obstacles facing the hotel and tourism sector is the limited number of educational programmes and training institutions. This is due to lack of prior government planning with regard to these sectors.*

(Institution 2)

Again, there is considerable bureaucracy and long procedures are encountered in the process of obtaining the annual HEI budget. This is demonstrated by the complex procedures and the routine stages involved in the general government budget, which
commences with the preparation of the general budget project during the last months of the previous year or the first months of the current year (usually, the Libyan financial year runs from January to December). Then the budget proposals are passed to the Public People's Congress to approve before the budget law is issued. Thereafter, the budget is transferred to the general treasury or to municipalities, which then allocate budget to each of the sectors and then on to the HEIs.

Such tedious budget allocation procedures impact negatively on the training plans and programmes and, occasionally, some training programmes are either delayed or cancelled. In the long run, the quality of services provided by the HEIs is affected. In relation to this point, one of the HEI managers states:

*The delays encountered during budget allocations transfer procedures cause a major problem in relation to the provision of services. For example, there is always delay in purchasing of books, teaching materials, training equipment, and other necessary facilities. Therefore, the entire training process becomes weak and our objective of achieving high quality training is affected.*

(Institute 1)

Generally, there was a consensus amongst senior HEI staff that the government should allocate more funds to HEIs. This is seen to help and support them and facilitate effective and efficient delivery of their programmes and services provided in a more effective and efficient way. The interviewees felt that the government should see such funding as a long-term investment, in the sense that it will enable HEIs to realize a greater improvement in their performance through the provision of higher quality services. Most importantly, the government should establish better criteria in relation to
Chapter Six: Human Resource Issues in the Libyan Hotel Sector

financial transparency and accountability by the HEIs to enable them to monitor financial plans and expenditure more effectively.

6.3.5 Co-operation between hospitality industry and HEIs

Porter and Yergin (2006) that the strong links between HEIs include Hospitality education institutions and business which are typically seen in developed countries do not exist in the Libyan economy. Also, Porter and Yergin (2006) mentioned that Libya is ranked 97th out of 111 countries in university/industry research collaboration. They added that this indicates a serious disconnection between the HE system and the economy awaiting its graduates.

This means that there is no link between educational processes provided by Libyan educational institutions and labour market needs. On the other hand, responsible bodies should understand the implications of such problem. This might be achieved through adopting an approach where expectations and desires of industry can be investigated and addressed. Several methods could be exploited to realize this issue for example; focus group, questionnaire, meetings, cross-functional teams, and involving employers in course design offered by HEIs. Hence, sharing the ideas and exchange information between Libyan HEIs and tourism industry could be enhanced. This leads to strengthen the educational programmes offered by HEIs and become more related and fulfilling the expectation of tourism industry.
The success of any vocational educational or training plan depends on full co-operation between HEIs and the hotel sector. Such co-operation allows for exchange of information on the existing and emerging needs of the sector to inform development of appropriate education and training programmes. Similarly, co-operation between the government, the hotel sector and the HEIs is crucial for workforce development for the Libyan hotel sector to deliver high quality internationally competitive products. However, the research findings revealed that there is no regular consultation between the government, HEIs, and the hotel sector in Libya. As a result, there has been a great loss of opportunities, which could otherwise be used for the mutual benefit of the sector, the government and the HEIs. For example, it was noted that over the years, no representative from the sector has ever been invited to give a guest lecture to the students in these institutions. Again, most of the hotels do not accept students for training in their establishment, which would provide students with practical experience. There is also a lack of awareness amongst the HEIs, the government and sector about the important role that can be played by effective co-operation and co-ordination between them to develop and improve the workforce specifically for the hotel sector and the tourism industry in general. There is agreement amongst all interviewees that:

There is no effective link and communication between government, hotel sector and HEIs. The absence of such links has resulted in the present inability to achieve the required integration between the three bodies which is considered one of the important drivers for achieving high performance in the hotel sector and the hospitality institutions, in particular, and in tourism industry in general.

(Institute 3)

To overcome this problem, there is a need for open effective communication channels to promote dialogue between the government, the hotel industry, and HEIs so that
education and training programmes can match the actual needs of the hotel industry and the whole society. Furthermore:

*We should extend the hospitality training programmes and open the doors for the private sector to participate actively, to consult widely with international expertise in order to upgrade and enhance the experience of both the teaching staff and employees in HEIs.*

*There should be some sort of joint co-ordination between the public manpower sector and education entities to improve the quality and quantity of training in this matter.*

(Institution 1)

Such links will enhance knowledge-transfer and sharing of information necessary for the development of human resources and improvements in the quality of services delivered in both the hotel industry and the HEIs. Also, the hotel industry should be involved in the design of education and training programmes provided by HEIs. Moreover, HEIs and the hotel industry should place themselves internationally, through exchange of expertise and knowledge with partners in countries with more developed hotel and tourism sectors. HEIs like all professional education should lead the industry rather than follow it. Opportunities should be given to HEIs and the hotel industry to keep up-to-date with international developments in the fields of hospitality and training.

### 6.3.6 Leakage of graduates and academic staff

The lack of statistics and figures regarding the employment of graduates from HEIs in the hotel industry is an obstacle to obtaining robust information about this issue. The majority of the interviewees from HEI estimated that less than 40% of hospitality
graduates manage to secure employment in the Libyan hotel sector. Furthermore, following interviews with hotel managers in Tripoli it is clear that the qualification levels of graduates from the Libyan HEIs do not meet the minimum requirements needed by the hotel industry and chances for them to be considered for employment in the hotels are slim. Consequently, the majority of graduates who cannot find a job in hotels seek employment elsewhere, mainly in other sectors or occupations or join the ranks of the unemployed.

The increasing low level of graduates’ qualifications means that the Libyan hotel sector will continue to rely on overseas workers. However, there are dangers associated with long-time dependence on overseas workforce. For example, Al Dosary (2004) and Wilkins (2001) note that prolonged dependence on a foreign workforce in Saudi Arabia created an ever-increasing feeling of discomfort for the government as well as for the local labour force, with high levels to youth unemployment. Al Dosary (2004) adds that the major drawback of overseas sourcing of employees is the negative impact on developing local expertise.

The majority of institutions relying heavily on expatriate labour, staff turnover tends to be relatively high (Wilkins 2001). At present, the Libyan hotel industry suffers from a sizeable leakage of its workforce and often finds difficulties in retaining its human resources. As stated by one of the hotel managers:

"Lots of people are leaving the hotel sector and the turnover of the staff is very high.... This is due to poor pay, long working hours, fewer benefits being given to employees compared to the oil and banking sector"
According to HEIs managers, some Libyan graduates perceive employment in the hotel industry as easy. In reality it is hard work and puts considerable pressure on employees. Some graduates grow to understand the difficult realities during industrial work experience opportunities and decide to leave the industry.

Another reason for leakage is that the average salaries provided by the hotel industry are lower than those in other sectors, e.g. oil and finance. In addition, these sectors are able to offer employers a better career structure with effective and efficient training that can support them in their roles and enhance their experience giving them good opportunities for self-development and increasing their chances of promotion and salary enhancement. As one of the HEI managers emphasized:

*Despite the small number of graduates who find a job in the hotel sector, this number is counteracted by the leakage, which is mainly due to the low salaries they receive, besides the absence of adequate training and encouragement from the hotel sector. Also, employees face more hard work and pressure in the hotel sector as compared to other sectors.*

(Institute 3)

Walmsley (2004) observes that staff turnover disrupts the continuity of operations and team spirit. As a result, the quality of service provided is destroyed and customer satisfaction levels affected.

It can therefore be argued that the government, HEIs and other bodies responsible for curriculum development and delivery need to pay special attention to career-counseling and guidance and provide accurate information about the hotel sector to enable students to be aware of the real working situation that they are likely to encounter. In relation to
the problem of lower salaries, the hotel sector must adjust its salary level in line with other industries. Finally, continuing professional development opportunities for the hotel sector should be jointly developed and promoted by the government, HEIs and the hotel sector for the wider industry.

6.4 THE PERSPECTIVES OF THE LIBYAN GOVERNMENT

The issues that emerged from the interviews with key government officials relate to: LTMP, image, culture and feminisation, training deficiencies and Libyan government efforts to address HR issues in the hotel sector.

6.4.1 LTMP

An interview was conducted with the Libyan Minister of Tourism. In the interview, the Minister pointed out that in the current strategic development plan, the government has given tourism top priority as an alternative vehicle for economic development in the Libyan economy, with the LTMP underpinning tourism development. As noted by the Minister:

> Despite costs and criticism associated with the LTMP, it is the first step towards understanding, learning and planning for this sector based on a contemporary way.

However, in the context of the private sector, the Minister agrees that:

> The LTMP does not take into account the private sector as a competitor to the public sector in order to realise the required competition which is necessary to achieve better quality services, and to attract and sustain customers. However, we believe that the private sector in the tourism field is able to contribute effectively and efficiently to the Libyan economy. The private sector will be considered one of the main pillars of tourism development in any future plans.
This statement from the Minister clearly demonstrates that the government sees the private sector as an important entity in the tourism industry, which can enhance and support future tourism development.

Although the LTMP is seen as a good attempt towards enhancing tourism development in Libya, the Minister believes that the LTMP was not implemented mainly because of shortcomings in the previous administration (1998-2003), which did not put more emphasis on the implementation of LTMP. According to the Minister:

The previous administration did not communicate efficiently with the other institutions, including hotels (public and private) and HEIs as key stakeholders of tourism industry regarding LTMP.

Similar weaknesses have been noted in Kenya. Manyara and Jones (2005), for example, observe that despite being in existence since the 1990s the National Tourism Master Plan (NTMP) is yet be implemented due to lack of clear guidelines for implementation.

The Minister continues:

Though hotels and HEIs have some responsibility for achieving the LTMP, they seem to play a passive role. They do not attempt to ask about or investigate LTMP, which has important implications and impacts on them in one way or another.

Regarding the future of the tourism industry in Libya, the Minister states:

In order to improve and develop the sector, the Ministry of Tourism is preparing a plan (2006-2010); this plan is expected to take to in account many issues that have been missed by LTMP. For example, it focuses on the role that can be played by the private sector and its ability to enhance, support and drive the tourism sector towards achieving a good level of quality. This will open the doors to the international market and allow Libyan tourism institutions to realize their competitive advantage.
Reaching high standards of service quality is the key to achieving an excellent tourism industry.

6.4.2 Image

The hotel sector in Libyan suffers from a poor image in terms of employment conditions and benefits, such as: low social status of hotel jobs; long working hours; low salary; lack of understanding of the importance of tourism for the country. However, poor industry image and the negative attitude of students towards hospitality jobs impacts negatively on the attitude of graduates, resulting in many of them not working in the hotel industry after graduation. The Manager of the Tourism Investment and Promotion Board (TIPB) emphasised:

Because of the poor image, we are not able to convince students as well as employees in the hotel sector to stay on to the job. I mean to see employment in the hotel sector as a long-term job.

The same problem was also raised by the Manager of Investment and Marketing in the tourism sector:

Till today, the hotel careers still don’t have a good and acceptable reputation; it is viewed as low class jobs people don’t want to be employed as chefs in hotels.

Consequently, most Libyans do not seek employment as waiters, chefs, or receptionists. Ultimately the hotel sector suffers from workforce shortages and this forces them to rely
heavily on foreign workers, which means that the hotels have to pay additional costs, particularly in terms of higher salaries.

6.4.3 Culture and feminisation

The structure of the Libyan society and culture is governed by Arabic traditions as well as Islamic principles, which have impacted negatively on female involvement in the hotel sector and tourism activities. Consequently, the number of female employees in the hotels sector as well as students in HEIs is very low. According to Ibrahim (2004:9-9):

Islamic societies are of a patriarchal nature with dominance for men who are responsible for the maintenance of the family and providing it’s economic needs. Religion-wise, wives ought to obey their husbands even if the husbands’ orders are against the desires and will of the wives. Women’s domestic functions as wives and mothers are regarded as their sacred role in the society. These functions take precedence to any other interests.

Moreover, Arabic and Islamic culture considers women as being able to contribute effectively and efficiently in some areas, such as education, medical and pharmacy, engineering (design), arts and law, rather than in others, such as production lines and heavy industry, which are thought to put more of a burden on women. Arabic and Islamic culture considers women’s physical abilities and their natural characteristics. Though the tourism industry is not seen as a heavy industry, the whole issue is centered on cultural interactions. Usually the hotel sector involves interaction of people from different cultures, and Libyan society is often afraid that their women will be treated
inappropriately, which would impact negatively on their family's reputation. Accordingly, the majority of women avoid getting involved in such activities. According to the manager of the TIPB most parents discourage their children, particularly female children, from taking up jobs in the hospitality sector. He used this example to support his argument:

There was one girl who got a job in the hotel sector.... she liked the job she liked working in the hotel sector. However, her parents used to complain to me every time. They didn’t want her to continue with the job because our culture does not allow frequent interactions with other cultures.

He adds:

This type of job is still not acceptable in our society....our culture and religion does not allow it.

As mentioned earlier in Chapter 3, according to Islamic doctrine, familial obligations, which include taking care of husbands, maintaining households, bearing and raising children to follow religious values are the main functions of women in the society. Consequently, women seeking employment should obtain approval of their husbands or male guardians.

Again, the working conditions in the hotel sector, for example long working hours and night shifts do not fit in with the prevailing Islamic norms and traditions in relation to women's work. In fact, according to Islamic traditions women are expected to be at home before sunset. Any job (as is the case with the majority of jobs in the hospitality industry) that includes delays after the regular daytime working hours is often unacceptable. Consequently, the majority of Muslim women decline from taking jobs requiring long working hours.
In addition, Islamic customs include wearing of veil. However, some hotels require women to wear uniform. As observed by Ibrahim (2004) some of the women’s uniforms are too tight or extremely short. Thus, some Muslim women opt to quit the job rather than wear such uniforms.

Other researchers also identified cultural values as stumbling blocks to women’s involvement in the hotel sector. In China, Qui and Lam (2004) noted, for example, that while the hotel industry is about serving people, in China serving people is considered as losing face. Consequently, parents do not encourage their children to join the hotel sector.

In contrast to the existing situation in Libya, previous studies have indicated that over the years women have been found to play an important role in the hotel, restaurant and the tourism sector in other countries (ILO, 2001). Woods and Viehland (2000 cited in Kattara, 2005) found that the majority of top managerial positions, including general manager, director of sales and marketing, food and beverage manager, were occupied by females in the USA.

Possibly, appropriate strategies need to be put in place to deal with the issues of the feminisation of the workforce if Libya is to develop its tourism industry and compete on the international stage. Otherwise, Libya will be forced to continue to rely on foreign workers, which would accelerate the need to review the employment laws to allow better terms of service for foreign workers.
6.4.4 Training deficiencies

There was a general consensus amongst government officers that HEIs are currently unable to meet the hotel and tourism industry’s expectations. This was thought to be as a result of students’ lack of commitment to the hotel industry as many complete a hospitality course with no intention of entering the hotel industry upon graduation; students also lack basic knowledge of English, Mathematics, Arabic, Politics, Economics and History. Furthermore:

There is lack of continuous evaluation of education and training curricula, which is important to ensure continuous improvement and to match training with changes and developments taking place in the tourism industry.

(Manager of Investment and Marketing)

The lack of sufficient appropriately qualified academic staff with practical experience was also mentioned. It was noted that there was no efficient link between HEIs and the hotel industry, which reflects the absence of effective communication between them. Moreover, there is a lack of awareness in both HEIs and the hotel industry regarding the need for collaboration and integration of their activities. Apart from the current HEIs’ inability to provide adequate training to meet the industry needs, most of the HEIs do not offer training programmes for academic staff. As a consequence, the majority of academic staff lack the opportunity to enhance their skills and to obtain new knowledge. Lack of employee training opportunities in HEIs raises important questions on the commitment of such institutions to human resource development. Green (2005) argues that if an organisation does not value the development of staff and if the core values of
the organisation do not focus on people, skills and knowledge improvement will not be supported. Again, there is a lack of information and data that could help in establishing management systems to enable managers to make the right decisions at the right time.

It is important to realise that whilst other training institutions such as business management institutions, are widely distributed across the country, HEIs are located only in the large cities, i.e. Sirt, Tripoli, Muserata and Bengazi. Thus the majority of potential students who live outside these cities find it difficult to study in these HEIs. Furthermore, family ties are very strong within the Libyan culture, hence the majority of students prefer to study in institutions located near their house, so as to enable them to stay with their families.

6.4.5 Libyan government efforts to address HR issues

There was a general agreement amongst government interviewees that the government has taken measures to tackle the problems confronting the hotel sector. Some of the measures taken by the government as articulated by the government interviewees include:

- Promoting communication between different institutions involved in hotel sector, e.g. HEIs, hotels (public and private) and the Ministry of Workforce (MOW). This is seen to help build a bridge and facilitate the formation of a strong link between the parties, where the representatives involved can work as a team to realize better
understanding of the problems facing them. In this context the manager of TIPB states:

There is awareness by the government that open communication is crucial between stakeholders in the tourism industry; we have translated this awareness into action through establishing different committees comprising all the stakeholders in the tourism sector. I believe that such committees will give the opportunity to all of them to discuss the challenges facing this sector from different experiences. Also, exchanging information, knowledge and skills will improve their ability to solve the existing problems. Thus, top management will be able to take the right decisions and actions that are built on facts.

- Increasing the salaries in some fields, for example, the salaries of the instructors of chefs and cooks in HEIs were increased by 125% above their initial salaries, that is, from LD 1653 to LD 3720 per year.
- Establishing new HEIs to cover most Libyan cities in order to encourage and give opportunity to students from different places around the country to engage in the field of tourism. This measure is expected to contribute effectively to filling the skills gaps experienced within the hotel sector, due to workforce shortages. Currently the HEIs can only supply less than 10% of the workforce required in the hotel industry.
- Encouraging higher studies in the field of tourism through provision of scholarships to students to study abroad in specialised institutions around the world. This is thought to give opportunities for students to share experiences, information and knowledge in different countries with a well-established and strong tourism industry. Such higher studies will encourage research in the hotel sector, to investigate and analyze the problems facing it and find the appropriate solutions for further development and improvement.
- Enhancing awareness of tourism in the curriculum provided by Libyan schools. This will increase the students’ awareness and appreciation of tourism, such as the significance of the Libyan tourism industry, tourism’s contribution to the economy, society and local community, and careers in the tourism industry.

6.5 CONGRUENCE AND DISSONANCE BETWEEN KEY STAKEHOLDERS’ VIEWS ON HR ISSUES FACING THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

Figure 6.2 graphically illustrates the similarities and differences between the hotel managers, HEIs staff and government official’s views on the main problems facing the Libyan hotel sector, which are further discussed in the subsequent sections.
Figure 6.2: Key HR issues identified by hotel managers, HEIs staff and government officials

6.5.1 Common issues raised by all the key stakeholders

i) Labour market

Staff shortages were identified by the majority of hotel sector interviewees. This problem was linked partly to existing methods of recruitment and selection and partly to
the gap between the qualifications of HEI graduates and the real needs of the hotel sector. Other factors mentioned as contributing to staff shortages include: low wages and unfavourable government employment laws, which hamper efforts to recruit overseas workers and to retain qualified staff. HEIs and government official concurred with hotel managers’ view on staff shortages in the Libyan hotel sector.

Issues on skills gaps in the hotel sector were mentioned by all the key stakeholders interviewed (hotel sector, HEIs and government officials). Departments which were deemed to be most adversely affected include housekeeping and food and beverage departments. Skills gaps were also identified in relation to basic skills, including proficiency in foreign languages, such as English. This problem was associated with firstly, the inability of HEIs to provide graduates with relevant skills to meet the demands of the hotel sector, secondly lack of government funding, thirdly, poor training facilities in HEIs; lack of on-job training in hotel sector and fourthly, an increasing unwillingness by Libyan students to study housekeeping. Furthermore, the government officials thought that most students lacked commitment to the hotel sector and many complete a hospitality course with no intention of entering the hotel industry upon graduation.

ii) Staff leakages

This problem was identified by the hotel sector and HEIs and was linked to low salaries and deficiencies in the Libyan employment law as stated in Article 15 (1981). Although the hotel sector and other sectors, such as the oil sector, are governed by same
employment legislation, the oil sector offers additional benefits to its employees, which helps the sector attract and retain highly qualified staff.

iii) Lack of co-operation and co-ordination

All the key stakeholders identified a lack of co-operation as one of the main problems facing HEIs. Whilst government officials felt that there is a lack of awareness in both HEIs and hotel sector on the need for co-operation and collaboration, the HEIs felt that the lack of awareness of the need for co-operation is a problem facing all the key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector, including the government. Lack of co-operation is evident in the lack of hotel sector involvement in HEIs curriculum development and the lack of HEI and hotel sector involvement in developing the LTMP.

iv) Outdated curricula

There was a general feeling amongst the hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials that the outdated curriculum is a major problem confronting the Libyan HEIs. Indeed, hotel managers identified the lack of required skills by graduates as a result of the weak curriculum provided by HEIs. In addition, the government officials assert that there is lack of constant evaluation of curricula to match training needs and changes taking place in the hotel sector. Furthermore, there is complete absence of appropriate mechanisms to ensure periodic review of curricula. Thus, due to low standards of
education resulting from outdated curricula, the hotel sector is not confident enough to recruit Libyan HEIs graduates.

v) Deficiency in LTMP

The majority of hotel managers indicated that they were not involved in the development of LTMP, they were not very assertive about its deficiencies, instead they emphasised the need for the Libyan government to develop training programmes that are consistent with the aims and objectives of the LTMP. On the other hand, HEIs asserted that the current LTMP does not take into consideration the important role of HEIs in the development of hotel sector workforce. Furthermore, none of the HEIs programmes are mentioned in the LTMP.

The government officials view the LTMP as a good attempt at enhancing tourism development in Libya. However they recognize that LTMP was not implemented as expected due to shortcomings in the previous administration. In the current strategic development plan, the government has given tourism top priority as an alternative vehicle for economic development in the Libyan economy; this could see the review and implementation of the LTMP.

vi) Poor image

According to the hotel managers interviewed, the Libyan hotel sector suffers from a poor image as an employer in terms of employment conditions demonstrated by long
and unsocial working hours, poor wages and few social welfare benefits. Similar views were expressed by government officials. However, the government officials emphasised that the majority of the Libyan students view hotel jobs as low class and do not want to be employed as, for instance, chefs. While none of the hotel managers mentioned the influence of Arabic and Islamic culture, government officials highlighted that the majority of parents discourage their children from taking up jobs in hotel sector, as it was considered culturally unsuitable, especially for women.

6.5.2 Issues raised by HEIs and hotel managers

i) Lack of sufficient government support

There was a shared view amongst the hotel managers and HEIs that the Libyan government has not given enough support, particularly in terms of funding of HEIs and development of up-to-date curricula. Specifically, it was noted that due to the lack of sufficient funding, HEIs are not able to develop new teaching materials or to purchase necessary equipment and other facilities needed for effective curriculum delivery. This problem was not mentioned by the government officials.

ii) Leakage of graduates and academic staff

Graduate and academic staff leakage was associated with low salaries offered in HEIs as compared to other sectors, including oil and banking sectors. While the problem of low salaries was frequently mentioned by both the HEIs and hotel sector as a major
cause of academic staff leakage, the government officials asserted that the lack of career development opportunities in HEIs was a major cause of academic staff leakage.

iii) Recruitment of overseas workers

The hotel managers and HEIs staff shared similar views on the recruitment of overseas workers. Both key stakeholders considered the recruitment and employment procedures outlined in the LWM on the employment of foreign workers as an obstacle to recruiting highly qualified staff from overseas countries.

6.5.3 Issues raised by hotel managers and the government

i) Lack of trust in Libyan HEI graduates

The interviews with hotel managers and government officials showed that it is clear that the qualification levels of graduates from the Libyan HEIs do not meet the minimum requirements needed by the hotel industry and chances for them to be considered for employment in the hotels are slim. In addition, continuing professional development opportunities for the hotel sector should be jointly developed and promoted by the government, HEIs and the hotel sector for the wider industry.

6.5.4 Issues by the government

Common HR issues raised by government officials include: Arabic and Islamic culture in relation to feminisation of workforce. The hotel sector involves interaction of
people from different cultures, and Libyan society is often afraid that their women will be treated inappropriately, which would impact negatively on their family’s reputation. Accordingly, the majority of women avoid getting involved in such activities. According to the manager of the TIPB most parents discourage their children, particularly female children, from taking up jobs in the hospitality sector.

6.5.5 Issues raised by hotel managers

i) Recruitment and selection

The majority of Libyan hotel managers identified the use of informal methods of recruitment, such as recommendation from friends as one of the main problem facing hotel sector. As a result the quality of services offered in these hotels is negatively affected as the majority of the workers are unqualified for their jobs. However, this problem was not mentioned by HEIs and government officials.

6.5.6 Issues raised by HEIs

i) Lack of funding

There is considerable bureaucracy and long procedures are encountered in the process of obtaining the annual HEI budget. This is demonstrated by the complex procedures and the routine stages involved in the general government budget, which commences with the preparation of the general budget project during the last months of the previous year or the first months of the current year (usually, the Libyan financial year runs from January to December). Then the budget proposals are passed to the Public People’s
Congress to approve before the budget law is issued. Thereafter, the budget is transferred to the general treasury or to municipalities, which then allocate budget to each of the sectors and then on to the HEIs. The majority of these institutions still experience financial shortages and are not able to sufficiently develop new teaching materials or to purchase necessary equipment and other facilities needed for effective curriculum delivery.

6.6 SUMMARY

This chapter has revealed the key issues facing the tourism and hotel sectors from the hotel sector, HEIs and government perspectives. The chapter has indicated that:

- Both hotels and HEIs suffer from high employee turnover, leading to severe staff shortages;
- There is a lack of a system for the recruitment of appropriately qualified staff. Consequently, the hotel sector has not been able to attract highly qualified staff;
- There is a shortage of educational and training establishments specialising in tourism and hospitality education specifically. At the same time, the curricula used in existing HEIs is old and does not cover the needs of the hotel sector;
- There is a lack of adequate and up-to-date training facilities in HEIs. Consequently graduates from these institutions are not sufficiently trained to meet the needs of the hotel sector;
There is inadequate funding of HEIs. This is further affected by the considerable bureaucracy encountered in the process of obtaining annual budgets for HEIs. This results in under-funding for the development of teaching materials, equipment and other facilities;

- The regulations pertaining to labour, employment and salaries are unfavorable and discourage many people from working in the tourism and the hotel sector;

- The LTMP does not take into consideration HR development in the hotel sector;

- There is lack of co-operation between the key stakeholders in the tourism and hotel sector in Libya.

Furthermore, there is consensus amongst interviewees that there is a need to improve human resource development in the hotel sector in particular and more generally across the tourism industry. This could be achieved in many ways, such as:

- Involving the public and private hotels in curriculum design and development, and in industrial work experience placements;

- Building a strong collaboration between the hotel sector and the HEIs;

- Enabling foreign human resources to work in all levels of specialisations, in the hotel sector, including supervisory and management levels. It is thought that this would help to form a nationally qualified and skilled workforce, thus enabling the hotel sector to compete at an international level;
Chapter Six: Human Resource Issues in the Libyan Hotel Sector

- Creating open communication between HEIs, the hotel sector (public and private sector), and government to address common labour market and HRD problems in the hotel sector;
- Emphasising the need for training within the hotels;
- Reviewing regulations governing wages and other benefits; otherwise, the tourism and the hotel sector will remain poor employers;
- Increasing public awareness of the importance of the hotel sector and tourism in general to the Libyan economy, not only through school curricula but also Libyan society in general.

These research findings provide an insight into the way key stakeholders in the hotel sector feel about human resource development. The majority of the interviewees presented negative view of the quality of the labour market and the quality of training received offered by HEIs. The significance of HR problems faced by the hotel sector requires all stakeholders, including the government, hotel industry and HEIs to look for solutions. One of the possible ways to tackle these problems is to adopt an appropriate workforce development plan.
CHAPTER SEVEN: RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION 7-2
7.2 GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS 7-2
7.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR 7-4
7.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HEIs 7-6
7.5 RECOMMENDATIONS LIBYAN GOVERNMENT 7-8
7.6 WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT PLAN (WFDP A SOLUTION) FOR WORKFORCE PLANNING ISSUES IN LIBYA 7-13
CHAPTER SEVEN: RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION

As a result of this study a number of recommendations are made which, if adopted, will help to improve the Libyan hotel sector’s human resources problems. This chapter begins with general recommendations to all the key stakeholders (hotel sector, HEIs and government) in the Libyan tourism industry (section 7.2). Next, the chapter provides recommendations for each stakeholder, that is, the Libyan hotel sector (section 7.3), the Libyan HEIs (section 7.4) and the Libyan government (section 7.5). Finally, the chapter provides recommendations for the stakeholders through the development of a WFDP implementation strategy (section 7.6).

7.2 GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- The current LTMP does not give significant attention to HRD in the hotel sector in particular and in the tourism industry in general. Thus, the plan needs to be reviewed in order to match the HEIs’ programmes with current trends in the hotel sector both nationally and internationally.

- The success of any human resource development initiatives depends on full cooperation between policy makers, practitioners and academics. Thus a closer relationship needs to be built between the Libyan government, the hotel sector and HEIs to enable them to respond to the changing demands in the hotel sector and to deliver high quality, internationally-competitive products. Furthermore,
the existing skills gap in the hotel sector would be reduced by involving the hotel sector and the government in HEIs curriculum design.

- There is a need to establish communication links and dialogue between the Libyan government, the hotel sector and HEIs. Such a networking approach will enhance knowledge-transfer and information-sharing, necessary for the development of human resource and improvements in the quality of service delivered in both the hotel sector and the HEIs. Also, there is a need to evaluate the roles of each (hotel sector, HEIs and the government) in human resource development for the hotel sector. The main aim here is to build strong partnerships and collaboration to enhance HEIs in order to meet the ever-changing needs of the hotel sector and society at large.

- Conferences, seminars and workshops should be organized by the General People’s Committee for Tourism (GPCT) and other national and international institutions to identify and disseminate “good practice” in promoting entrepreneurship. There is a need for holding conference involving the hotel sector in Libya, the tourism companies, the competent authorities and bodies related to tourism and the hotels sector specialised scientific and training institutions, and the planning and training councils, in order to discuss and set up a scientific and studied plan to develop tourism in Libya, provided that priority be given to human resource development.
7.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HOTEL SECTOR

- All hotels should include in their internal organisational structure training or HRD. A certain percentage of the hotels’ operational budget should be set aside to train and develop human resources. Refresher courses for on-the-job training can be designed to develop and increase the competencies of employees in different job positions. HEIs should also assist hotels in training supervisors and managers by setting up evening courses for managers, and providing qualified instructors. On-the-job training will help hotels to fully utilise talents of its employees.

- Wide use of informal recruitment and selection in the Libyan hotel sector was identified as one of the main obstacles to getting qualified personnel who would deliver quality services. Also, the failure by the Libyan hotels to utilise different communication channels such as television, local newspapers and radio to advertise job vacancies, means that suitable and qualified people are often unaware of job vacancies in hotels. Thus the hotel sector needs to embrace formal methods of recruitment, searching the labour market more widely for candidates with no previous connection to the organisation. The hotel sector should adopt systematic and administrative methods for employing staff in all the required professions and specialisations by determining sound conditions and criteria. The use of an employment manual which outlines recruitment criteria in the Libyan hotel sector would help the hoteliers to recruit the right people.
• The hotel sector should develop incentives to attract and retain qualified employees. This can be through introducing a range of benefits over and above salaries, adequate compensation-particularly for long working hours-commitment to staff development and on-going training and providing opportunities for career-progression within the hotel sector.

• Students need the opportunity to study in a hospitality environment where they can apply their theoretical knowledge and develop understanding of the tensions between theory and practice. Increased opportunities for industrial work experience will enhance and support the balance between theory and practice essential for the delivery of service quality in the hotel sector. The hotel sector needs to provide placement opportunities for HEIs graduates. Properly designed integrated industrial placement schedules, emphasizing skills that are most important to jobs in the hotel sector, need to be developed. Also, the industrial placement schedule should reflect the conditions and duration of the placement. Provision of such a placement schedule would require unity of efforts between the hotel sector and HEIs.

• There is a need to develop and increase the efficiency of the senior management in the hotel sector, by changing the administrative leadership of those hotels to give opportunities for new graduates to gain experience.
Chapter Seven: Recommendations

- The hotel sector need to lobby the government to reconsider laws governing labour and employment and other legislation relating to workforce and wages and other restrictions in the tourism and hotel sectors.

- The hotel sector needs to lobby the government to raise the annual allocations for the hotel sector in the State's general budget to match the relative importance of the sector in the national economy.

7.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN HEIs

- HEIs need to pay attention to the analysis of problems and issues confronting the tourism sector to inform curriculum development (the market-driven curriculum). The curriculum needs to provide room for wide and diverse courses to cater for students’ desires and interests on one hand and society’s needs on the other. Moreover, practical and applied components need to be emphasised in the curriculum. The teaching methodology in HEIs needs to be developed to support both the practical and theoretical components of the curriculum. For example, the teaching timetable should allow for students to have sufficient practical training through part-time jobs in hotels. A diverse range of courses coupled with strong practical and applied components will instill confidence into HEI graduates, to enable them to compete effectively for hotel job opportunities locally, nationally and internationally.
The hotel sector will have more confidence in Libyan graduates and be more willing to employ them. Regular assessment, evaluation and review of curricula will ensure that fundamental local, national and international changes in, for example, technology and science, are taken into consideration. However, for significant progress to be made there is a need for a considerable level of flexibility in legislation and regulations, which would go along way to enable HEIs to effectively address its own needs and goals within the general HEI policy framework and to react quickly to the changing circumstances.

Apart from theoretical and practical skills, HEI graduates are expected to have basic skills in foreign languages and communication. In fact, the research revealed that the majority of HEI graduates lack foreign language skills, which are essential in the hotel sector. Thus, HEIs need to look into the best ways to take into account these competencies within their goals and objectives.

To improve curriculum delivery, HEIs should enhance their training facilities, including lecture halls and laboratories. Up-grading HEI facilities will not only allow for better delivery of training services but will also allow students to take an active role in their learning. The research revealed that the majority of HEIs do not have adequate training facilities, particularly training kitchens and restaurants. As a result much of the training is theoretical rather than practical. If the issue of training facilities is not addressed, HEI graduates will continue to suffer from a shortage of practical skills. Consequently, the existing image of
HEIs graduates is unlikely to change. Also, the credibility of HEIs will be questionable.

- There is a need to establish a feedback mechanism to enable the HEIs to measure the quality of their graduates and their performance in the industry, in order to create a balance between the needs of the hotel sector and the quality of graduates.

- Review/development of curriculum should go hand-in-hand with up-grading of the HEIs staff. Self-development opportunities should be offered to staff in HEIs by offering them special in-house courses to improve their skills and abilities. HEIs staff visits should be encourage to other countries with a proven track record in hospitality (such as the United Arab Emirates and Egypt) to enhance their knowledge and experience should be encouraged. In other words, opportunities should be given to HEIs to keep up-to-date with international developments in the field of hospitality training.

- HEIs need to establish self-assessment systems to enable them to evaluate their performance. Staff performance appraisal systems need to be in place to encourage HEI staff to continuously improve their skills and knowledge in order to deliver effective and efficient teaching. All the staff members, administrators of various departments and faculties, and students, need to participate in such assessments. This would help detect any differences between these groups and develop appropriate measures to address them.
Chapter Seven: Recommendations

- There is a need to create joint planning between the public labour market sector and the education sector in order to achieve an agreed balance between labour market demand and educational output.

- There is a need for a review education curricula in general and updates to accommodate new trends in the market without influencing the socio-cultural reservations of the Libyan society.

- There is a need to develop new and appropriate methods of teaching and training to replace the old and traditional approaches.

- There is a need to expand HEIs training programmes. The private sector both local and international needs to be involved in such efforts.

- There is a need to invite international and regional expertise in tourism and hospitality training and education to enhance the proficiency level of teaching staff and employee in these sectors.

7.5 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LIBYAN GOVERNMENT

- The majority of the interviewees were confident of the poor perceptions of the hotel and tourism sector amongst student bodies and Libyan society. To change
this negative perception, the Libyan government should integrate tourism and hotel studies into the national education system at least from secondary school level in order to increase students’ awareness and appreciation of tourism, such as the significance of the Libyan tourism’s contribution to the economy, society and local community, and careers in the hotel sector. Successful hotel employees can be used as role models in order to make young people to consider a career in the hotel sector.

- Again, the government should increase public awareness of nature of jobs in the hotel sector through career education counselling and job marketing programmes. This would help students to understand why certain situations exist within hotel sector e.g. long working hours and seasonality, and prepare them psychologically for the nature of jobs in this sector.

- A campaign must be implemented to change the attitudes about hotels and tourism and to encourage more Libyan women to take up jobs in the hotel sector. At the same, there is a need to create joint understanding between the requirement of the Islamic doctrines and those of the hotel sector. Most important is the acknowledgement of the role of the media, both electronic and print, in enhancing and supporting public awareness campaigns.

- The existing legislation and regulations, particularly with regard to employment, have been a barrier to recruiting and retaining qualified staff in the hotel sector. The government should, therefore give priority to reviewing the regulations
governing wages and other benefits. At the same time, the government should work towards removing the restrictions on employing overseas staff and offer equal opportunities to all workers. This will help form a nationally qualified and skilled workforce, thus giving the Libyan hotel sector cosmopolitan appeal and enabling competition in the international marketplace.

- Existing HEIs can only supply 10% of the required labour market for the hotel sector. The government needs to implement a plan to develop human resources in the hotel sector. Furthermore, the Libyan government should establish a number of educational and training centres and institutes in the field of tourism and hotel management and, in collaboration with other stakeholders, develop educational and training curricula for these institutions. Most importantly, the government should establish better criteria in relation to financial transparency and accountability by training institutions to enable them to monitor financial plans and expenditure more effectively.

- The government needs to establish an inventory system of education and training establishments to allow for progress review of any planned expansion and upgrading of these establishments.

- There is a need to review all legislation concerning work and employment and to give the hotel sector the opportunity to compete in the market like any other economic sector.
• There is a need to give the hotel sector strong support without any limitations, and at the same time to invite in foreign investors and give them facilities, though with some limitations to protect local investors.

• There is a need to review economic and financial policies in all fields to match the existing international developments and to give flexibility in regard to hotels policies.

Overall, there was strong consensus between the key stakeholders that there is need for:

1. Regular discussions between the government, hotel sector and HEIs, so that HEIs programmes can reflect the actual needs of the hotel sector;
2. Encouragement for the hotel sector to adapt appropriate WFP strategies and HRD that ensure that workers are attracted to and retained in the hotel sector;
3. Partnerships between the hotel sector and HEIs. Individual educators need to collaborate with potential employers on curriculum development to ensure that standards fulfil the sector’s requirements in teaching, student placements, and offering joint training programmes;
4. Establishment of effective co-ordination forums for hospitality training and education where all the key institutions involved in the field are present;
5. Increased awareness amongst the hotel sector of the importance of cooperation and partnership with government and HEIs, as part of a strategy for the development of hotel sectors nationally and internationally;
6. Strengthening of GBT through the employment of professional staff and provision of sufficient funds to enable it to function more efficiently. It is thought that if GBT is made strong both financially and technically, it would foster co-operation among key stakeholders which would go a long way to revitalise the private sector, and to encourage it to take a lead in developing their staff.

- Finally, the government should establish a body for WFP, devoted only to the hotel sector, to provide it with the support necessary programmes.

7.6 WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT PLAN (WFDP)- A SOLUTION FOR WORKFORCE PLANNING ISSUES IN LIBYA

In the researcher’s opinion, the best practice WFP model developed in this study (Chapter five sections 5.6.5) can be used in the decision-making process in the Libyan hotel sector. Every action plan developed should be tied into the identified human resource need and objectives of the hotel sector. All hotel sector stakeholders should be integrated in the implementation of the WFD model. It is the support and involvement of all stakeholders, including the hotel sector, HEIs and government, which will determine to a large extent the success of the implementation process. Again, there must be strong cooperation and coordination amongst the key stakeholders, as well as definition of the roles and responsibilities of each key stakeholder in the implementation process. An effective three-way communication system should be established to ensure that all the key stakeholders understand the value of WFDP and its implementation
process. This could be in the form of seminars, discussions, conferences to increase the understanding and effectively implement the WFDP.

As discussed in chapter 5, the following stages will be crucial to the WFDP:

- Study of economical, comprehensive plans to determine the importance of different economic sectors.
- Study of the current labour market in Libya
- Study of actual demand on the labour force in the Libyan Hotel sector.
- Study of the actual situation and future expectation of supply and demand, leading to an identification of existing and future gaps under the shadow of a comprehensive Libyan hotel sectors’ plans
- Determining the fitting standard for achieving the individual measurement at the appropriate place and time.

For effective WFP and WFDP in the Libyan hotel sector to be achieved, there is a need for constant monitoring of the hotel sector labour force, through the collection of information on the hotel sector’s workforce supply and demand. Output indicators must be put in place by the government to aid the monitoring and evaluation of the implementation process. As mentioned in chapter 5, the WFA and WFD processes can be evaluated though use of a variety of methods, including interviews, surveys, focus groups and review of the quality of the workforce plan. A research based/ HR information centre should be established to keep information updated. Finally, the government in co-operation with HEIs and the hotel sector must ensure that enough
resources, including financial, human and physical are available to ensure successful implementation of WFP strategies.

It was not the aim of this research to propose an implementation strategy. However, if the key stakeholders (hotel sector, HEIs and government) comment to the proposed WFDP, priority areas for discussion and target setting could include developing managerial capacity and the skills and capacity of the hotel sector workforce, and pay and rewards (linked to employment legation)

Although the recommendations presented in this chapter cannot really be claimed to be unique, they illuminate fundamental actions which need to be taken by all stakeholders if Libya is to develop its hotel sector and compete in the international arena. Furthermore, the best practice WFA model developed in this study is envisaged as serving as a fundamental tool in the decision-making process for development HR in the Libyan hotel sector.
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSIONS

8.1 INTRODUCTION  
8.2 REVIEW OF RESEARCH OBJECTIVES  
  8.2.1 Objective one  
  8.2.2 Objective two  
  8.2.3 Objective three  
  8.2.4 Objective four  
  8.2.5 Objective five  
8.3 LINKING RESEARCH FINDINGS TO RESEARCH QUESTIONS  
8.4 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO THEORY  
8.5 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO PRACTICE  
8.6 LIMITATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH  
8.7 PERSONAL THOUGHTS
8.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter concludes this study on human resource issues and workforce planning in the context of the Libyan hotel sector. Section 8.2 presents a review of the research objectives and highlights the major research findings. This is followed by a section linking research findings with research questions (section 8.3). The significant contributions of the study in relation to theory and practice are outlined in sections 8.4 and 8.5 respectively. The study limitations and suggestions for future research are set out in section 8.6. The chapter concludes with the researcher’s final thoughts on the research process (section 8.7).

8.2 REVIEW OF RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

8.2.1 Objective one

To explore tourism development in Libya and critically analyse the LTMP’s HRD strategy for the Libyan hotel sector

To achieve this objective, a thorough document analysis was carried out. The research findings revealed that the Libyan government has identified tourism development as one of the potential and alternative sources of foreign exchange. The contents of the LTMP were analysed in-depth to establish how HRD issues relating to the hotel sector are addressed. Preliminary research was undertaken through semi-structured interviews with hotel managers to get their views on HRD issues as addressed in the LTMP.

Furthermore, according to the World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC, 2003) the Libyan tourism industry is expected to grow and gradually become more prominent
within the Libyan economy. There are increasing signs of the willingness of the Libyan government to encourage the tourism sector to develop and grow independently, without much interference from the public sector. The laws passed, and the creation of the Ministry of Tourism in 2003, are some of the indications of the intentions of the Libyan government to move in a more liberal direction with regard to the Libyan tourism industry. However, this does not relinquish the government from its major role as the provider of the infrastructure needed to develop the industry. These issues underline the main reasons behind the development of the Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP) 1998-2018.

The LTMP sets out the major plans necessary to develop the tourism industry in the country and promote it to the international community. It estimates 80% increase in the demand for people to work in tourist establishments to meet the needs for future tourism development. However, the plan does not state explicitly estimates of staffing levels (staffing rates) and competencies required to enable the tourism industry, in particularly the hotel sector, to carry out future functional requirements to meet the forecast demand. Also, the plan downplays concerns on curriculum review and practical training aimed at ensuring that the HEI graduates match the needs of the Libyan hotel sector. This is an important finding but the researcher was unable to explore it in great detail as it was peripheral to the key focus of the study. However, it may prove a interesting topic for further research.
8.2.2 Objective two

To carry out a critical review of literature to identify HRD issues in the tourism and hospitality industry as well as alternative models of WFP to inform adaptation of a unified theoretical model

This second objective was achieved through critical review of literature on human resource management (HRM), human resource development (HRD) and workforce planning (WFP). This was followed by a focused literature review on alternative WFP models to inform the adaptation of a unified theoretical model.

The literature review highlights the critical importance of systematic approaches to HRM and HRD in the development of the tourism and hospitality workforce and the enhancement of service quality and destination competitiveness. The service encounter between an organization and its customers is mediated through front-line operational staff. The knowledge, skills and attitudes of those staff is critical to the service encounter. Thus, hospitality organization have a heavy reliance on operational staff and it is key to competitive advantage that such staff are the right people with the right skills in the right place at the right time.

Notwithstanding widespread recognition of this, there a number of universal HR issues facing the industry, such as:

- The impact of changing demographics and shrinking employment labour shortages;
- Skills shortages, particularly at higher management level;
- The failure of education providers to meet the industry's needs;
Chapter Eight: Conclusions

- Poor HRM and planning information in the tourism industry;
- The hospitality and tourism industry's poor image as an employer;
- Cultural and traditional perception of the industry;
- Low pay;
- Linking HD concerns with service and product quality.

Another key issue emphasized in the literature review is that women dominate the hotel sector workforce particularly, in Western countries, such as UK. The low pay in the hotel sector has contributed significantly to the pay gap between males and females in these countries. Additionally, the majority of women in the hospitality sector do not manage to reach well-paying senior positions. On the other hand, the number of women employed in the hotel sector in the majority of Arab countries is low. Many of the work patterns in the hotel sector do not fit with the prevailing Islamic norms and traditions in relation to women’s work. As a consequence, women tend to decline or refuse to work in all anti-social work circumstances, which represent an essential component of the business activities (Kattara, 2000; Ibrahim, 2004and Kattara, 2005).

It was clear from the literature review that WFP would be a panacea to the majority of HR issues in the tourism and hospitality labour market. For example, several writers (e.g. Saliba, 1993) assert that WFP is important in managing to match people and the jobs to ensure that people are qualified to execute the jobs created or changed to reflect customer or organisational demands. Consequently, many organisations, both private and public, such as the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) have developed models to support WFP, particularly in the analysis of current labour force
situations to establish areas faced with skills deficiencies deficiency of skills in order to formulate an appropriate strategies to bridge the gap. Though there are various WFP models, all seem to progress through similar phases, i.e. setting a strategic direction, workforce analysis, development and implementation of workforce planning and monitoring, evaluation and revision.

Different elements of various WFP models were researched in detail and were brought together as a unified model (figure 3.8) which was used to study HR issues in the hotel sector in Libya. The key issue is that currently there is only a limited labour market for tourism/hospitality in Libya and the development of a WFP model would address this issue by creating a pool of qualified staff whose services the hoteliers could draw upon.

8.2.3 Objective three

To develop a best practice WFA model appropriate for the needs of the Libyan hotel sector

This objective was addressed through the application of a Delphi Technique to create consensus amongst key stakeholders (i.e. hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials) to inform the WFP model for the Libyan hotel sector. The WFP phases proposed by the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000:5) and Garrant (2004:6) were used as the initial basis for understanding the WFP process. However, more emphasis was put on the second phase (workforce analysis) so as to address the key problems facing the Libyan hotel sector identified by the key stakeholders interviewed. There are four key steps to the workforce analysis phase of the WFP model identified by the Washington State Department of Personnel (2000) and Garrant (2004):
demand analysis; supply analysis; gap analysis and strategy development. These steps were used to inform workforce analysis for this research.

The research findings revealed a complete absence of awareness of WFP or clear a WFA model for the Libyan hotel sector. No single organisation is responsible for WFP and HR development for the sector. Moreover, a review of existing documents revealed that the first preliminary WFP planning took place for a period of six months in 2002 and was never implemented. This was attributed to lack of sufficient government support for WFP and HRD in hotel sector.

Despite these shortcomings the majority of the key stakeholders supported WFP as a powerful tool to improve productivity in the Libyan hotel sector. Again the majority of the interviewees expressed the need for a central organisation to be responsible for WFP and development in the hotel sector and the HEIs to match supply and demand for the hotel sector. Although the hotel sector and HEIs proposed GBT to be the main body responsible WFP, further discussions supported a shift from GBT to government. There was a strong feeling amongst different experts that strong government support will ensure the implementation of articulated human resource development strategies and plans of action, as well as facilitate the hotel sector development. The four phases in WFP i.e. setting a strategy, analysing the workforce, Implementation and evaluation were fully supported by all the key stakeholders interviewed. The best practice WFP model formulated for the hotel sector in Libya comprises seven main elements, that is, the government, the supply side (HEIs), the demand side (hotels), the gap issues, workforce development plan, implementation strategy and evaluation (see figure 8.1).
Figure 8.1: Proposed best practice WFP Model for the hotel sector in Libya
Some of the main responsibilities of different key stakeholders in WFP and HRD are outlined below:

i) Government:

- Initiating WFP in the hotel sector;
- Overseeing the implementation of WFP;
- Evaluation of WFP process and outcomes;
- Funding of HEIs;
- Participating in HEIs curriculum review;
- Formulating favourable education and training policies;
- Formulating favourable employment policies and legislation in relation to recruitment remuneration and terms and conditions of service;
- Co-operating and collaborating with other key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector.

ii) The hotel sector and HEIs:

- Better linkage between the hotel sector and HEIs
- Participating in the development, implementation and evaluation of WFP;
- Informing the government of their long-term planning needs;
- Creating an interdependent and cooperative relationship through exchange of education and training plans, sharing of information and exchange of expertise, curriculum review and work placements.
8.2.4 Objective four

To identify HR issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and establish congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEI and government views on these issues.

This objective was addressed through semi-structured interviews with hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials. Key human resource issues facing the Libyan hotel sector and their causes and effects were identified. Careful analysis of feedback from interviews led to identification of congruence and dissonance between the hotel sector, HEIs and government views on human resource issues facing the Libyan hotel sector.

The research findings identify the problems facing the Libyan hotel sector as: recruitment and selection; skills gaps; inadequate practical training; minimum opportunities given to overseas workers; role of public and private sector in HR development; shortage of qualified academic staff; outdated curricula; inadequacy of LTMP; inadequate funding of Libyan HEIs; lack of co-operation between the hotel sector, HEIs and the government; leakage of graduates and academic staff; poor image of the hospitality sector and employment problems have resulted in poor quality service and a negative image of the Libyan hotel sector.

There were some differences and similarities amongst the key stakeholders' (the hotel managers, HEI staff and government officials) views on HR problems facing the Libyan hotel sector. However, there was a lot of common ground in their views. Some of the HR problems identified by all the stakeholders relate to: the labour market; staff
leakages; outdated curriculum; lack of co-operation and co-ordination; low salaries; deficiency in LTMP; poor image.

The significance of HR problems faced by the hotel sector requires all stakeholders, including the government, hotel industry and HEIs to look for ways to address them. One possible way to tackle these problems is to adapt a robust workforce plan.

8.2.5 Objective five

To provide recommendations for key stakeholders through the development of WFDP for the Libyan hotel sector to help them tackle HR problems facing the sector through a WFP implementation strategy

As a result of this study a number of recommendations were made to the key stakeholders in the Libyan hotel sector, i.e. to the hotel sector, HEIs government and recommendations for WFP implementation strategy.

General recommendations

- The current LTMP needs to be reviewed in order to match the HEIs’ programmes and take into account the current trends in the hotel sector both nationally and internationally.

- Closer relationship needs to be built between the Libyan government, the hotel sector and HEIs to enable them to respond to the changing demands in the hotel sector and to deliver high quality, internationally-competitive products.
• Conferences, seminars and workshops should be organized by the General People’s Committee for Tourism (GPCT) and other national and international institutions to identify and disseminate “good practice” in promoting entrepreneurship.

Recommendations for the Libyan hotel sector

• Inclusion of a department or a unit of training and developing human resource.
• Incentivise the hotel sector in order to attract and retain qualified employees.
• Providing students with the opportunity to practically apply the theoretical knowledge gained in the academic environment.

Recommendations for the HEIs

• HEIs curriculum should be driven by market needs and needs to provide room for wide and diverse courses to cater for students’ desires and interests on one hand and society’s needs on the other.
• Majority of HEI graduates lack foreign language skills, which are essential in the hotel sector. Thus, HEIs need to look into the best ways to take into account these competencies within their goals and objectives.
• Up-grading HEI facilities will not only allow for better delivery of training services but will also allow students to take an active role in their learning.
• There is a need to establish a feedback mechanism to enable the HEIs to measure the quality of their graduates and their performance in the industry, in
order to create a balance between the needs of the hotel sector and the quality of graduates.

- Review/development of curriculum should go hand-in-hand with up-grading of the HEIs staff.
- Self-development opportunities should be offered to staff in HEIs by offering them special in-house courses to improve their skills and abilities.
- Opportunities should be given to HEIs to keep up-to-date with international developments in the field of hospitality training.
- HEIs need to establish self-assessment systems to enable them to evaluate their performance.

**Recommendations for the Libyan government**

- In order to change the negative perception of the hotel sector, the Libyan government should integrate tourism and hotel studies into the national education system at least from secondary school level in order to increase students' awareness and appreciation of tourism.
- The government should increase public awareness of nature of jobs in the hotel sector through career education counselling and job marketing programmes.
- There is a need to create joint understanding between the requirement of the Islamic doctrines and those of the hotels sector.
- The existing legislation and regulations, particularly with regard to employment, has been a barrier to recruiting and retaining qualified staff in the hotel sector. The government should, therefore give priority to reviewing the regulations governing wages and other benefits.
Chapter Eight: Conclusions

- The government should work towards removing the restrictions on employing overseas staff and offer equal opportunities to all workers.

- Existing HEIs can only supply 10% of the required labour market for the hotel sector. The government needs to implement a plan to develop human resources in the hotel sector.

- The government needs to establish an inventory system of education and training establishments to allow for progress review of any planned expansion and upgrading of these establishments.

- Finally, the government should establish a body for WFP, devoted only to the hotel sector, to provide it with the support necessary programmes.

Recommendations for WFDP implementation strategy

- All the key tourism sector stakeholders should be integrated in the implementation of the WFD model. It is the support and involvement of all stakeholders, including the hotel sector, HEIs and government, which will determine to a large extent the success of the implementation process.

- An effective communication system should be established to ensure that all the key stakeholders understand the value of WFP and its implementation process.

- For effective WFP and WFD in the Libyan hotel sector to be achieved, there is a need for constant monitoring of the hotel sector labour force, through the collection of information on the hotel sector’s workforce supply and demand.

- Finally, all stakeholders must ensure that enough resources, including financial, human and physical are available to ensure successful implementation of WFP strategies.
8.3 LINKING RESEARCH FINDINGS TO RESEARCH QUESTIONS

There were five main research questions identified in section 1.5:

Q1: what are the issues that hotel managers face and how would they like to see these issues addressed in the LTMP or through a workforce development plan for the hotel sector? The following summarises the views of the hotel managers:

- The LTMP must be reviewed. All the key stakeholders must be involved to ensure that important issues facing the sector are identified;
- The LTMP should state explicitly the actual demand and supply of the labour force in the Libyan hotel sector, future expectations of supply and demand, existing and future gaps and how these gaps can be bridged, e.g. estimates of staffing levels;
- The LTMP should state explicitly the role of each of the key stakeholders in the hotel sector;
- Reassessment of LTMP’s objectives to ensure that they are realistic and appropriate for the needs of hotel sector;
- The government must take full responsibility for initiating WFP, implementing the WFP strategies and monitoring the ongoing effectiveness of the WDP.

Q21: how would hotel managers like to see the HEI’s curriculum respond to the HRD needs of the industry? The following summarises the hotel managers’ views on HEIs’ curriculum:
There should be greater involvement of public and private hotels in curriculum design and development, and in industrial work experience placements;

There is a need to incorporate strong practical and applied components in the curriculum;

The necessary mechanisms must be put in place to ensure a regular review of the curriculum;

Open communication between HEIs, the hotel sector (public and private), and the government must be initiated to help address common labour market and HRD problems facing the hotel sector.

Q3: how would hotel managers like to see the role of the government in the development of HR issues in the Libyan hotel sector and general cultural issues, such as attitudes towards careers in the hotel industry; being addressed?

The hotel managers’ views on ways to address cultural issues revolved around:

- Increasing public awareness of the importance of the hotel sector and tourism in general to the Libyan economy, not only through school curricula but also Libyan society in general;
- Creating mutual understanding between the requirements of the Islamic doctrines and those of the hotel sector through an awareness campaign.

Q4: what are the main issues that HEIs face in their endeavour to deliver high quality training to produce competent graduates? And what responsibility do the HEIs take for HRD for the hotel sector?
The HEIs’ views on ways to address HR issues revolved around:

- There is a need to creating good system for the recruitment of appropriately qualified and experienced academic staff for Libyan HEIs.

- There is a need to regulations pertaining to labour, employment and salaries, which deter people from working in this sector.

- Hotels should not employ non-qualified workforce, this leads to poor quality in hotels, therefore affecting the overall Libyan tourism industry.

- Enabling foreign human resources to work in all specializations, professions and skills that are required in the hotel sector, to help form a nationally qualified and skilled workforce.

- Opening communications channels between public and private sector hotels to address common labour market and HRD problems in the hotel sector.

- Government and education sectors should work with the hotel sector to address labour market and HRD issues and develop a strategy for implementation of workforce planning.

**Q5:** how do the government and hotel sector impact on the agenda of HEIs in preparing graduates for the hotel sector? And what responsibility does government take for HRD in the hotel sector?
The following were the government officials' views on HEIs:

- The necessary mechanisms must be put in place to ensure a regular review of the curriculum;

- Open communication between HEIs, the hotel sector (public and private), and the government must be initiated to help address common labour market and HRD problems facing the hotel sector.

- Increased opportunities for industrial work experience in the hospitality curriculum will enhance and support the balance between theory and practice essential for the delivery of service quality in the hospitality sector.

- There is considerable bureaucracy encountered in the process of obtaining annual budgets for HEIs.

- Continuing professional development opportunities for the hotel sector in most Libyan HEIs, together with the low calibre of academic staff leads to poor quality teaching which has significant impacts on the quality of services provided by the Libyan tourism industry.

- There are obvious weaknesses in the physical infrastructure for hospitality curriculum delivery, especially in relation to specialist premises and plants, e.g. dedicated restaurant and kitchen facilities.
Chapter Eight: Conclusions

- Hotel managers can play an important role in developing the knowledge and practical competences of HEI graduates.

- Hotel managers should understand the crucial role that can be played by them working in partnership with the HEIs, enabling graduates to enhance their vocational knowledge and balancing theory and practice.

- Hotel industry should be involved in the design of education and training programmes provided by HEIs. The establishment of communication channels networking the three bodies is critical for the knowledge transfer and sharing of information that will lead to the appropriate development of human resources and improvements in the quality of services in both the hotel industry and the HEIs.

8.4 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO THEORY

The study makes a contribution to the understanding of HR issues in the tourism industry in Libya in general and in the hotel sector in particular. Through its review of literature and generation of ideas, it adds to the growing academic literature about HRM, HRD and WFP. Specifically, the study contributes to the understanding of the main issues confronting the Libyan hotel sector. Also, analyses in detail employment laws and civil services in various sectors of the economy, including the hotel sector.
These laws have had implications for the performance of these sectors, as well as, for their image as employers. For example, law No. 15 (1981) regarding employment, wages and salaries, and regarding job appointment procedures and restrictions has influenced the procedures of employment and employment conditions, duration and lawfulness. The study extends existing knowledge by providing a WFP model that can be implemented in the Libyan hotel sector. The proposed best practice WFP model aids understanding of variations in actual elements in WFP, particularly with reference to Libyan’s political and sociol-cultural context. Furthermore, no previous effort has been made in this sector with regard to development and implementation of WFP within the Libyan context.

By taking note of this study contribution, particularly in terms of the WFP model, different organisations can work towards developing WFP models that suit their situation.

8.5 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO PRACTICE

The main contribution of this study to practice is its emphasis on strong government involvement in WFP for the Libyan hotel sector. In general, the Libyan government should play an important role in initiating WFP, implementing the WFP strategies and monitoring the ongoing effectiveness of the WFDP. Specifically, the government should support human resource development through HEI funding and active participation in education planning and curriculum review, as well as formulating
favourable education and training policies to meet the socio-economic need for a qualifications and skills in the Libyan hotel sector workforce. Similarly, the government must support the hotel sector through funding and involvement in preparing HRD plans, which reflect priority HR requirements in the hotel sector.

The proposed best practice WFP model, if appropriately implemented, will provide the way forward to solving the existing human resource problems in the Libyan hotel sector. The model is considered flexible and can be updated to match the trends in the market, making it possible for the Libyan hotel sector to continuously meet customer needs and expectations. The model can also be used to develop a specification for WFP, leading to a better understanding of WFP philosophy and principles in the Libyan hotel sector.

One important element emphasised in the best practice WFP model is the cooperation and coordination between the different key stakeholders, without which WFP in the hotel sector may not be a success. Building strong cooperation and coordination will enable the continuous exchange of ideas, knowledge as well as expertise amongst the key stakeholders.

As described earlier, there was a general consensus among the sampled stakeholders that such a WFP model will serve as powerful tool for effective human resource management and success in the Libyan hotel sector. It will help in identifying potential workforce issues, such as skills essential to maintaining the hotel sector’s competitive advantage locally, nationally and internationally. Moreover, this study makes a
significant contribution to understanding how the interface might be essential to Libya as it develops its hotel sector as an ‘engine’ of economic growth.

The research also highlighted the characteristic of hotel managers, HEIs and government officials within the Libyan tourism industry, their education background, experience, relationship to the tourism industry, their sources of finance and relations with other hotels and governmental organisations and institutions. Therefore, the findings of this study can be subsequently implemented through a set of good practice guidelines for inexperienced practitioners in the field.

The proposed best practice model can be utilized elsewhere, particularly in countries with similar political and sociocultural environments to Libya. Besides, new elements can be added to the model to suit different country context.

8.6 LIMITATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

It is important to discuss the limitations of this research along with suggestions for future research, as the limitations may include the focus on Tripoli for the sampling frame and the number of respondents involved in the research process. Although the research included a significant number of individual interviews (25), and the sample chosen was truly representative of a particular population that was based in Libya, it is appreciated that caution needs to be taken within the regards to generalising the findings beyond Tripoli and also Libya. Therefore, a number of different research areas can be
considered in the light of this research that builds upon its limitations. The issues of WFP in the context of the hotel sector in general and in Libya in particular are still wide open for exploration. The research findings provide some promising areas for future investigation. The most important of them are highlighted below:

- The best practice model was developed through qualitative work. Further quantitative work/research could be conducted specifically on issues of forecasting labour force demand, labour force supply and gap analysis to lend strength to the findings;

- The research highlighted important issues on culture for example Islamic Doctrine and feminisation. However, this was not explored in depth and provides an opportunity for further research as an effort to establish concrete ways to solving the existing cultural and feminisation issues;

- The research highlighted deficiencies in HEI curricula. Further research is needed to establish the actual content of the curricula (e.g. courses, credits for each course) that will suit the needs of the hotel sector;

- Students in HEIs are important stakeholders in the hotel sector. Further research can be conducted to solicit their opinions on HR issues in the hotel sector as well as their expectations;

- Future research should also aim to measure the staffing levels and demand for people to work in tourism and hotel establishments;

- Future research can be conducted to investigate the extent of workforce leakage from the tourism sector to the other sectors.

- Finally, further research needs to be directed towards the development of relationships between the public sector and private sector in Libya, and
partnership models should be developed to encourage the private sector to engage in businesses considered as risky by the hotel sector.

Nonetheless, the practical application of the best practice model may help explore new problems areas in the Libyan hotel sector. The study has found that barriers, such as government rules and regulations and financial institutions, can prevent development of the hotel sector. A careful observation and a longitudinal study is required over several years of application to evaluate the practical application of WFP model in Libya and to suggest more modifications in order to adapt this potentially applicable best practice model.

8.7 PERSONAL THOUGHTS

This study is the result of a four-year research attempt to explore HR issues in the context of the Libyan hotel sector. I hope that the proposed WFA model will facilitate the practical solution of problems identified during the study. It is also the researcher's objective that this study, through its rich sets of information, will provide support to those who will carry on further research including data gathering and analysis needed to study WFP.

In addition, this research has greatly contributed to my knowledge and research ability. I have been able to develop new and unexplored areas that I find interesting, especially those that take place during the development of the best practice WFP model and the
search for the appropriate methodology and theoretical perspective for my research. In the early stages of my research I adopted very much a bottom-up approach to the development of research methods, selecting qualitative methods, on the basis of fitness for purpose. Through my research experience I have developed my understanding of the research process and would now adopt a more holistic approach to research design recognising epistemological issues. It also helped me obtain new experience and knowledge regarding the research process itself and the system of conducting and supervising research; experiences, which I am eager to share with my Libyan colleagues and students when I return to my role as a faculty member of my university.
REFERENCES
REFERENCES


References


management in the tourism and hospitality industries. *International Journal of 
Contemporary Hospitality Management*. 9/5/6, pp221-229.


Milton Keynes, OU Press.

Development: Evidence from Aggregate Cross-Country Data. *Journal of 
Monetary Economics*. (34), pp143-173.


and Bacon: Boston.


eBizguide (2006) Libya: all you need to know to do business and have fun. World Investment New Ltd. Dublin-Ireland.


References


References

General People's Committee for Education and Vocational Formation, Education and training Progress in Libya (1999) Tripoli, Libya.


References


References


Tourism SMEs, Service Quality and Destination Competitiveness. CABI Publishing: London.


Online workshops (2004) Study design, study implementation, study result analysis, the grounded theory of research design. [online]: Available from: http://www.kelcom.igs.net/~nhodgins/grounded_theory_research_design.html. [Accessed on 04/05/2004].


References


Silverman, D. (1998) Qualitative research: meanings or practices?, *Information Systems*


References


Weiss, T. B. (1997) “Show me more than money” (Employee Retention Strategies) *HR focus*. 74 (11), pp3-2.


World Travel & Tourism Council (2001) Tourism Satellite Accounting Research-Middle East, World Travel & Tourism Council.


APPENDICES
APPENDIX 7: TABLE OF THE FUNCTIONAL GRADES AND SALARIES FOR EACH GRADE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Beginning and end of the salary grade</th>
<th>Annual increment</th>
<th>Number of increments</th>
<th>First</th>
<th>Second</th>
<th>Third</th>
<th>Fourth</th>
<th>Fifth</th>
<th>Sixth</th>
<th>Seventh</th>
<th>Eighth</th>
<th>Ninth</th>
<th>Tenth</th>
<th>Minimum years to get higher grade</th>
<th>Cost of living</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thirteenth</td>
<td>4680 5880</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4800</td>
<td>4920</td>
<td>5040</td>
<td>5160</td>
<td>5280</td>
<td>5400</td>
<td>5520</td>
<td>5640</td>
<td>5760</td>
<td>5880</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twelfth</td>
<td>4080 5040</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4176</td>
<td>4272</td>
<td>4368</td>
<td>4464</td>
<td>4560</td>
<td>4656</td>
<td>4752</td>
<td>4848</td>
<td>4944</td>
<td>5040</td>
<td>Unlimited</td>
<td>1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eleventh</td>
<td>3720 4680</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3816</td>
<td>3912</td>
<td>4008</td>
<td>4104</td>
<td>4200</td>
<td>4269</td>
<td>4392</td>
<td>4488</td>
<td>4584</td>
<td>4680</td>
<td>Five years</td>
<td>960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenth</td>
<td>3240 4200</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3336</td>
<td>3432</td>
<td>3528</td>
<td>3624</td>
<td>3720</td>
<td>3816</td>
<td>3912</td>
<td>4008</td>
<td>4104</td>
<td>4200</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ninth</td>
<td>2760 3720</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2856</td>
<td>2952</td>
<td>3048</td>
<td>3144</td>
<td>3240</td>
<td>3336</td>
<td>3432</td>
<td>3528</td>
<td>3624</td>
<td>3720</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighth</td>
<td>2340 3060</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2416</td>
<td>2484</td>
<td>2556</td>
<td>2628</td>
<td>2700</td>
<td>2722</td>
<td>2780</td>
<td>2916</td>
<td>2988</td>
<td>3060</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seventh</td>
<td>2040 2760</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2112</td>
<td>2184</td>
<td>2256</td>
<td>2328</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>2472</td>
<td>2544</td>
<td>2616</td>
<td>2688</td>
<td>2760</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth</td>
<td>1740 2340</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>1860</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>2040</td>
<td>2100</td>
<td>2160</td>
<td>2220</td>
<td>2280</td>
<td>2340</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth</td>
<td>1560 2160</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1620</td>
<td>1680</td>
<td>1740</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>1860</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>2040</td>
<td>2100</td>
<td>2160</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth</td>
<td>1440 1920</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1488</td>
<td>1536</td>
<td>1584</td>
<td>1632</td>
<td>1680</td>
<td>1728</td>
<td>1776</td>
<td>1824</td>
<td>1872</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>1260 1740</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1308</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>1404</td>
<td>1452</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>1548</td>
<td>1596</td>
<td>1644</td>
<td>1692</td>
<td>1740</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>1140 1500</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1176</td>
<td>1212</td>
<td>1248</td>
<td>1284</td>
<td>1320</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>1392</td>
<td>1428</td>
<td>1464</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>1020 1380</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1056</td>
<td>1092</td>
<td>1128</td>
<td>1164</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>1236</td>
<td>1272</td>
<td>1308</td>
<td>1344</td>
<td>1380</td>
<td>Four years</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 1: LIST OF INSTITUTES OFFERING COURSES IN HOTEL SECTOR AND TOURISM INDUSTRY IN LIBYA

Three institutions consisted of:

Institution 1- Hotel Professions Institute in Tripoli, which was established in 1990 and serves the population of the western side of Libya;

Institution 2- Hotel Professions Institute in Misurata, which was established in 1995 and it serves the population of the central part of Libya;

Institution 3- Hotel Professions Institute in Shahat, which was founded in 1992 and it serves the population of the eastern side of Libya.

The senior staff from each institution were invited to participate in a semi-structured interview. The sample consisted of:

- Senior staff A- Male, aged 45, length of time in post; Mr Azalden Makuluff.
- Senior staff B- Male aged 52, length of time in post; Mr Mohamed Al Swiah.
- Senior staff C- Male aged 48, length of time in post; Mr Abraham Alhade.

The senior staff were selected because they would possess the relevant knowledge of the institution and the problems facing the hotel sector.
APPENDIX 2: Table 8.1 INCREMENTAL STAFFING REQUIREMENTS BY SKILL CATEGORY.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Managerial</th>
<th>Supervisory skilled</th>
<th>Semi-Skilled</th>
<th>unskilled</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existing</td>
<td>762</td>
<td>2060</td>
<td>1552</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>4614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>640</td>
<td>1730</td>
<td>1404</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>3880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>654</td>
<td>1768</td>
<td>1332</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>3965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>844</td>
<td>2280</td>
<td>1718</td>
<td>271</td>
<td>5113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>1371</td>
<td>3706</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>8310</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Consultants Estimates

Source: Table 5.2

Note: figures may not add due to rounding skill category ratios based on field research.
APPENDIX 2: Table 8.2 INCREMENTAL WORKFORCE REQUIREMENTS BY LOCATION TYPE AND GRADE OF ESTABLISHMENT.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location Type</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>736</td>
<td>486</td>
<td>686</td>
<td>787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>454</td>
<td>601</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological sites</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>648</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desert Sites</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>434</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>1058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costal Sites</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>430</td>
<td>925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>399</td>
<td>896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touring Sites</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benghazi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Consultants Estimates

Source: Table 5.2

Note: Assumes following staff/room ratios = High =1.8, Medium =0.75, Budget =0.27
APPENDIX 3: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS ON WORKFORCE PLANNING

General awareness of WFP

1. Are you aware of WFP?
2. How is WFP carried out in Libya?
3. How frequently is WFP done?
4. In your opinion, is WFP necessary? If yes, why? If no, why?
5. Does your hotel have any WF plan?
6. If yes in Q3 above, what are its components? Has it been implemented?
7. If no in Q3 above, why?
8. What has government done to encourage WFP?

Phases in WFP

1. Do you agree with the proposed phases of WFP? (i.e. setting strategic direction, workforce analysis, implementation of WF plan and monitoring, evaluating and revising WF plan)
2. If yes in Q6 above, why?
3. If no in Q6 above, what would you want to see changed in the proposed phases of WFP? Why?

Best practice WFP model

1. Do you agree with the proposed elements in the proposed WFP model?
2. If yes in Q9 above, why?
3. If no in Q9 above, what would you want to see changed in the proposed WFP model? Why?
4. What do you think would be the ideal roles of key stakeholders in the development of WFP model for the hotel sector?
5. Do you think there is a need for a pubic body responsible for WFP in hotel sector in particular and tourism industry in general?
6. What do you think would be the ideal roles of each of the key stakeholders in the implementation of the proposed best practice WFP model?
7. How would you want to see the monitoring and evaluation of the best practice WFP model carried out?

8. What would be the roles of key stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the best practice WFP model?

9. How often would you want the model revised?
APPENDIX 4: INTERVIEW QUESTION FOR HOTEL MANAGERS

About your hotel:

1. How long has your hotel been in operation?
2. How would you classify your hotel? (First, second, or third class).
3. What is your role/responsibilities in the hotel?

Staff employment and retention

1. From where do you recruit new staff?
2. Have you experienced any difficulties filling job vacancies?
3. Do you only employ qualified staff or do you employ unqualified or low qualified staff and undertake post-employment training?
4. Do you employ college graduates? Why?
5. Do you think that colleges’ graduates have the right skills? Why?
6. Is there enough communication between the hotel industry and educators in terms of training people to become hotel managers?
7. When you recruit new staff, what sort of information do you want to know about them?
8. Do you find it easy to retain managers and operators with specific skills?
9. Do you employ overseas staff? Why?
10. In which occupation(s) do you employ overseas staff?
11. Do you measure labour turnover? What is the labour turnover in your hotel?

Skills gaps

1. What type of skills gaps exist and in which areas?
2. What training or development is needed to address skills gaps?
3. Have any training need analyses been carried out amongst your employees?
**Constraints on development of your hotel**

1. What are the constraints on the human resource development in your hotel?
2. What sort of actions have you taken to tackle such constraints?

**Hotel training programmes**

1. Who provides workplace training?
2. Do you provide in-house training or external day release or block release for staff?
3. How do you evaluate the existing training programmes in your hotel?
4. What is your budget for HRD? How do you estimate the budget?

**HRD problems in the Libyan hotel sector**

1. What is the main problem for human resource development in this hotel and the general hotel sector in Libya?
2. What should be done to overcome over these problems?
3. Are there any other issues?

**LTMP**

1. Do you have any idea about LTMP?
2. Does your hotel consider human resource development plan provided by LTMP for employees? If yes, to what extent has the plan been implemented? If no, why?
3. Do they meet the needs of your hotel? If they do not, what aspects would you like to see changed?

**Role of the public and private sectors**

1. What role do you consider the government should play in human resource development for the hotel sector in Libya?
2. What role do you consider the private sector should play in human resource development for the hotel sector in Libya?
## APPENDIX 5: LIST OF PUBLIC HOTELS IN AND IN TRIBOLI IN LIBYA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>Hotel Name</th>
<th>Class</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Public/Private</th>
<th>Number of rooms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>GRAND hotel</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>MAHARI hotel</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>BAB ALBAHAR hotel</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>BAB ALMADINA hotel</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>WAHAT hotel</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>ALWEDAN hotel</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>SAFA hotel</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>LIBYA BLACE hotel</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>AL JOWDA HOTEL</td>
<td>Second</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>BAB ALJADID HOTEL</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>SHATI ALNKEIAL HOTEL</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>HAITI hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>AL SHARK hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>AL YASSER hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>SHAMAL AL ATLANTI hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>TRAPOLI hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>public</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>AL NAHER</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>AL FRDOSS hotel</td>
<td>Third</td>
<td>Tripoli</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 6: THEMES DISCUSSED WITH KEY STAKEHOLDERS

Themes for HEI staff

Shortage of qualified academic staff

1. Do you face any problems in your institution? If yes, what kind of problems?
2. How and to what extent are the academic staff involved in the tourism WFP process?
3. Is there a consultative arrangement between government, HEI, and hotel sector to discuss HRD needs for Hotel sector? To what extent is any arrangement effective?
4. To what extent do your staff maintain active involvement with the hotel sector?
5. Do you have any plan to introduce new tourism and hotel courses?

Curriculum

1. In developing your curriculum for tourism/hotel education in your HEI, did you consult with tourism/hotel sector?
2. Do you assess the needs of tourism hotel sector when you design your courses?

HEI’s view of Libyan Tourism Master Plan (LTMP)

1. Do you have any idea about LTMP?
2. Does your HEI consider human resource development plan provided by LTMP for employees? If yes, to what extent has the plan been implemented? If no, why?
3. How and what extent is the private sector involved in the HRD and WFP process?

Funding in Libyan HEIs

1. Is your institution public or private?
2. From where are you getting your budget?
3. What is the governmental budget for your HEI at the moment? (Does government set aside a budget for hotel HRD?)
4. What is your budget for HDR?
Co-operation between hospitality industry and HEIs
1. Do you co-operate with hospitality industry sector? If yes, in which issues. If not why?
2. How you assess the communication between HEIs and hospitality industry?

Leakage of graduates and academic staff
1. Who should be responsible for LTMP? What are the reasons behind the leakage within graduates and academic staff?
2. Do you think that you carry a part of such reasons and why?

Themes for government officials
1. Who should be responsible for LTMP?
2. Does your Ministry consider human resource development plan provided by LTMP for employees? If yes, to what extent has the plan been implemented? If no, why?
3. What are the shortfalls between HRD and implementation? What should be the ways to overcome this problem?
4. What role do you consider the government should play in human resource development for the hotel sector in Libya?
5. What role do you consider the private sector should play in human resource development for the hotel sector in Libya?

Image
1. How you see the opinion or perspective of the Libyan society regarding hotels and hospitality careers.
2. In your opinion what are the impacts of such image on your graduates and eventually your educational programmes in general.

Culture and feminization
1. From where do you recruit new staff?
2. Have you experienced any difficulties filling job vacancies?
3. Do you only employ females staff? If not Why? What sort of information do you want to know about them?

Training deficiency
1. How do you evaluate the existing training programmes in your hotel?
2. What are the existing deficiencies in HRD in hotel sector in Libya?
3. What is your budget for HRD? How do you estimate the budget?

Libyan government efforts to address HR issues
1. What are the main HR issues in hotel sector in Libya?
2. What could be done to address these issues?