The Impact of Training on the Performance of Dubai Government Organisations within the Context of Financial Stringency

Submitted By
Ahmad Al-Nuseirat

To: CARDIFF METROPOLITAN UNIVERSITY

As a Thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

4\textsuperscript{th}. November 2013
Abstract

The financial crisis that hit the world at the end of 2007 has impacted not only the banking systems and private sector companies, but also the public sector. The government of Dubai responded effectively to the repercussions of the financial crisis, and provided ample support to its entities to minimize the effects of the financial crisis on its performance. One of the main reasons for the superior performance of the government of Dubai is its investment in its human capital. Providing sufficient funds for training and bringing international experts to deliver high quality programs was one of the main drivers of top performance. However, the financial crisis has undoubtedly affected the ability of the government to provide the same quantity of training programs, and this might affect the overall performance of the employees within its realm.

The purpose of this study is to examine to what extent the financial crisis has affected the budget allocated to training and its subsequent impact on the overall organizational performance of government entities within the Emirate of Dubai. The study tests three hypotheses: 1) the impact of the financial crisis on training effectiveness; the variables look at the level to which the financial crisis influenced training effectiveness. 2) Impact of training strategy on training effectiveness; the variables look at the influence of training strategy of the government on training effectiveness. It achieves this by measuring variables that look at the elements embedded in the training strategy like the involvement of the employees in its preparation, implementation and its design. 3) Impact of training effectiveness on organizational performance; the variables test the relationship between the quality of training under the restricted budget and the effectiveness of training.

The main finding is that contrary to expectations perceived, training effectiveness did not decrease as a result of the reduced budgets. Those responsible for training and development responded creatively to the financial stringency by finding alternative and more cost-effective methods of delivering their programmes.

More specifically, the 1st hypothesis H0: Financial crisis and Training effectiveness are unrelated. HA: Financial stringency is negatively correlated with Training effectiveness. The simple regression result shows that financial stringency is not significantly associated with Training effectiveness. Hypothesis 2 H0: Training Approach and Training effectiveness are unrelated. HA: Training strategy is correlated with Training Approach. The results show that Training Approach and Training effectiveness are positively associated with a strong relationship. Hypothesis 3 H0: Training effectiveness and Organizational performance are unrelated. HA: Training effectiveness is correlated with Organizational performance. The results show that the Training effectiveness and Organizational performance are positively associated.

The study provides recommendations to policy makers in the UAE on how to better improve the quality of training and at the same time reduce the costs involved in running them. The findings of this study provide a clear picture of the challenges that face organizations in Dubai as a consequence of the financial crises and subsequent pressure on training budgets.
Acknowledgement

This is my PhD thesis and one of the most significant accomplishments in my life and it would have been impossible without the people who supported and believed in me.

I am deeply indebted to my supervisors, Dr. Omar Masood and Dr. Rajendra Kumar, whose help, stimulating suggestions and encouragement helped me all the time of research for and writing of this initial draft of the thesis. Special recognition is rendered to Professor Don Harper, Professor Eleri Jones and Dr. Bernadette Warner for their support and guidance.

I would like to give my special thanks to my family whose patient love enabled me to complete this work. I want to thank my friends and colleagues for all their help, support, interest and valuable comments.
Special Dedication

To the soul of my father ‘Abdullah”

That wise Bedouin for insisting to educate all his children although he never went to a school.

To the soul of my mother “Maryam”

That great Bedouin for raising us to have dignity, manhood, generosity and kindness.

To the soul of my brother “Mashoor”

That brave and ambitious man for taking care of us after our father’s sudden and early death.

To the soul of my brother “Mohamad”

For being a father a brother and a friend. Who motivated me to work harder. I had a wish that he could attend my graduation ceremony but because of God’s will he can’t.

To my beloved wife “Um Waleed”, my children; Waleed, Waffa, Mariam, Farah and Kinda, I dedicate this achievement.
Declaration

I hereby declare that, except where explicit attribution is made, the work presented in this thesis is entirely my own.

Name:  

Signature:  

Date:  

Thesis Availability

I hereby declare that, the University has the right to make this Thesis available for inter-library loan or photocopying (subject to the copyright) and that the title and summary may be available to outside organizations. Also, the University has the right to store electronically, copy or translate the Thesis to any approved medium or format for the purpose of future preservation and accessibility. Once the Thesis is deposited in the digital repository, it will be accessible to a wide variety of people and institutions, including automated agents and search engines via the World Wide Web.

Name:  

Signature:  

Date:  

Page 5 of 239
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. 2
Acknowledgement .................................................................................................................. 3
Special Dedication .................................................................................................................. 4
Declaration ............................................................................................................................... 5
Thesis Availability .................................................................................................................. 5
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................. 6
List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... 7
Key Words ............................................................................................................................... 9

Chapter 1: General Introduction ......................................................................................... 10
1.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 10
1.2 The Study Problem .......................................................................................................... 10
1.3 The Context of the United Arab Emirates ....................................................................... 14
1.4 Human Resource Management in the 21st Century and the Importance of Training .......... 19
1.5 Strategic Human Resource Management ......................................................................... 21
1.6 Human Resource Management and Training in the UAE .............................................. 22
1.7 From Traditional Public Administration to Public Management and its Implications on HRM .......................................................................................................................... 25
1.8 Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 26

Chapter 2: Literature Review ............................................................................................. 27
2.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 27
2.2 Training and Development ............................................................................................. 29
2.3 The Financial Crisis influences training effectiveness (training budget and training approach) .................................................................................................................................. 38
2.4 Training Strategy Influences Training Effectiveness ....................................................... 44
2.5 The link between Contextual Factors and Training Effectiveness ................................ 51
2.6 Leadership and Training Effectiveness .......................................................................... 61
2.7 Effective Training Influences Organizational Performance ......................................... 66
2.8 Conclusion and initial model for Dubai’s context ............................................................ 84

Chapter 3: Research Methodology ..................................................................................... 87
3.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 87
3.2 Objectives, Hypothesis and data collection ................................................................... 89
3.3 Study Limitations .......................................................................................................... 96
3.4 Ethical Issues .................................................................................................................. 97
3.5 Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 97

Chapter 4: Analysis of the Data, Discussion and Conclusions ............................................ 98
4.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 98
4.2 Descriptive Statistics Results ....................................................................................... 98
4.3 Socio Economic Profile ................................................................................................. 99
4.4 Training Strategy .......................................................................................................... 101
4.5 Training Approach ....................................................................................................... 116
4.6 Financial Crisis Impact ................................................................................................. 131
4.7 Training Impact on Organizational Performance ......................................................... 139
4.8 The Main Insights and Observations ........................................................................... 151
4.9 Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 160

Chapter 5: Recommendations and Discussion ................................................................... 161
5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 161
5.2 Research Limitations .................................................................................................... 161
5.3 Research Recommendations ......................................................................................... 162
5.4 Contribution to Knowledge ........................................................................................... 178
5.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 181

Chapter 6: Future Policy Considerations – The Way Forward ........................................... 182
6.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................... 182
6.2 Proposed Model ............................................................................................................ 182
6.3 Review of the Objectives of the Study ......................................................................... 188
6.4 Opportunities for Further Research ............................................................................ 190
6.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 191

References ........................................................................................................................... 192
APPENDIX 1: Questionnaire .............................................................................................. 212
APPENDIX 2: Interview Questions ...................................................................................... 220
APPENDIX 3: Data Collection Schedule ............................................................................ 231
APPENDIX 4: Ethics Form ................................................................................................. 232
APPENDIX 5: Statistical Analysis and Variable Measurement ........................................... 235

Page 6 of 239
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ser. No.</th>
<th>Figure Number</th>
<th>Brief Description</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Political map of the UAE</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Population: Dubai vs. World 1900 - 2001</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Population of UAE from 2000 - 2011</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>UAE GDP (purchasing power parity) (Billion $)</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>GDP per capita in the UAE and other countries</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>The structure of Dubai Government</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>Total US training industry expenditure (2005 to 2009)</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Annual Training Hours per Learner (2006 – 2009)</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Budget change by industry in 2010 in the US</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Training Expenditures 2005 - 2010</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Conceptual Framework for Training Effectiveness</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Figure 4.3 (a)</td>
<td>Socio Economic Profile (Gender, Age and Nationality)</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Figure 4.3 (b)</td>
<td>Socio Economic Profile (Position in the Organization)</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Figure 4.3 (c)</td>
<td>Socio Economic Profile (Length of Relationship and Number of Employees)</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (a)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (b)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (c)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (d)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (e)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (f)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (g)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (h)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (i)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Figure 4.4.4 (j)</td>
<td>Training Strategy Survey Results</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (a)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (b)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (c)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (d)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (e)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (f)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (g)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (h)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (i)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (j)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (k)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (l)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (m)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Figure 4.5.2 (n)</td>
<td>Training Approach Survey Results</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures/Cont’d

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ser. No.</th>
<th>Figure Number</th>
<th>Brief Description</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (a)</td>
<td>Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (b)</td>
<td>Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (c)</td>
<td>Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (d)</td>
<td>Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (e)</td>
<td>Training Expenditure from 2005 to 2011 across Dubai Government Departments</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Figure 4.6.3 (f)</td>
<td>Training Expenditure and Costs Over Time</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (a)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (b)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (c)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (d)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (e)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (f)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (g)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Figure 4.7.3 (h)</td>
<td>Training Impact Survey Results</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Classification and prioritization of the recommendations</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Figure 6.1</td>
<td>Proposed Model for Effective Training in Dubai Government</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Words

Chapter 1: General Introduction

1.1 Introduction

This chapter covers the research problem, its importance and describes the justification of conducting this research. It also illustrates the organizational structure of the government of Dubai showing the organizational relationship among its entities. This study shows the importance of human resources in the 21st. century and the role of training as an effective tool to enhance the performance and skills of employees with the emphasis on the Human Resource management and training in the United Arab Emirates.

Finally, this chapter addresses the transformation from the traditional Administrative Model to Public Management Model and its impact on the management of Human Resources.

1.2 The Study Problem

Today’s public sector organizations have applied new managerial techniques to run their organizations and institutions. The New Public Management model has reshaped and changed our understanding of public management and added techniques, procedures and new requirements for the public sector entities. The selection of employees, assessing their performance and determining their contribution to the growth of their entities has all witnessed significant change in the last fifteen years. The world has become a very competitive place and it is increasingly serving a very demanding customer that requires standardized service and high quality work output. Thus, most government entities are focusing on recruiting and retaining top quality staff who are able to deal with these challenges to ensure good public service delivery. However, the rapid change of public sector and different requirements to perform a better job and the speed with which our world is advancing results in many employees who need to enhance their knowledge skills and competencies.
The challenges the governments face today do not only stem from internal challenges, but also external ones. Globalization, new technologies capturing employees’ knowledge, employee retention and growth are some of the issues affecting Human Resource departments and affecting training practices in government organizations.

Dubai Government Entities have to take steps to attract, retain, and motivate their work forces. Otherwise, there is always the risk of these employees going to other countries or even Federal Government Institutions where they can improve their learning and enhance their productivity.

Training has become one of the most natural and reliable responses to most of the above challenges and the proper identification of training needs is of paramount importance to ascertain that government organizations are performing with the best capacities they have.

Public Sector Organizations are established to achieve specific goals that justify their existence and serve the broad interest of the public. As long as an organization is in business, it should continuously work hard to enhance the quality of its services for its beneficiaries. Public organizations strive to achieve effectiveness and efficiency in public service delivery. However, achieving this objective requires the availability of a set of conditions and various organizational strategies, namely a coherent and clear training program.

Since 1980, the researcher has worked in the fields of HR, training and government organizational development. He has also worked in international organizations such as the United Nations Development Program assigned to Dubai Government, he worked as Administrative Affairs and HR Consultant for the Department of Economic Development-Government of Dubai. Currently, the researcher is working as a Coordinator General-Dubai Government Excellence Program which has achieved a quantum leap in the performance, services and results of government departments in Dubai. The researcher has contributed effectively in the quality movement in Dubai and UAE Based on more than 30 years of experience in the field, the researcher noted that in the Arab world some large organizations and leaders don’t believe in
training as a tool for organizational improvement. Another facet of the problem is that those leaders and organizations may send people for training for the sake of training without true identification of the training needs which are tied to the individual performance appraisal and the organizational improvement goal. The researcher believes that people are the greatest asset in any organization, he also recognizes training as one of the main tools of building people’s capacity in acquiring the skills and knowledge enabling them to effectively perform their assigned functions at all times. The researcher chose this research subject to show how effective training can contribute to the overall organizational performance in Dubai Government Departments.

Therefore, this study will look very closely at the Government of Dubai and assess to what extent the recent financial crisis has affected the training budget allocation, its impact on training effectiveness, and finally on the organizational performance of Dubai Government entities.

- Availability of sufficient funds is one of the main factors that determine the outcomes of training programs, and their unavailability affects the quality of training programs, their return on investment and more importantly, on organizational effectiveness.

- A successful training effort, activities and objectives should directly be linked with organizational performance.

- HRM practitioners or relevant departments need to focus on key variables of an effective program that contribute to the planned positive change in organizational performance.

- As such, the study will attempt to investigate and identify those major variables that can be considered vital for any training program.

The researcher confirms that the outcomes and recommendations of this research were based solely on the results of the personal interviews, research questionnaire and the literature review and were not based on the researcher's personal opinion or his practical knowledge of the research subject.
The Importance of the Study

This study covers one of the most critical challenges that face the Government of Dubai after the global financial crisis. The reduction in the allocated training budget has impacted the performance of the public organizations and their efficiency in the short and long run. However, till today, there is no single study in the context of the UAE and the Arab World that tackles the triangular relationship between budget allocation, training effectiveness and their implications on the organizational performance.

Hence, this study aims to enrich the available literature and knowledge and empirically demonstrate how the financial crisis has affected the training budgets of public organizations and pushed them to cut their spending on the professional development of their employees.

The above mentioned aim of the study can be further cascaded into the following main objectives, the first is to investigate the possible impact of training efforts including the different training strategies and approaches on organizational performance, and the second is to develop a model describing the relationship between effective training and organizational performance taking into consideration training strategy, training approach and training budget. The University of Pretoria published a paper which extensively explains what is meant by a public sector model and its implications on the performance of governments. (http://upetd.up.ac.za/thesis/available/etd-07212007-130132/unrestricted/05chapter8.pdf) It is meant to facilitate cooperation among the various entities within the public sector and create synergies of cooperation and collaboration.

To achieve these research objectives three research hypotheses need to be addressed:

1. The first is, the financial crisis has implications on the training effectiveness in the Government of Dubai
2. The second research hypothesis would be, training strategy and approaches have influence on the training effectiveness
3. Effective training has influence on organizational performance

The study is supported by a wealth of primary data gathered by reliable questionnaires, focus groups and in-depth interviews with the HR directors and training managers across the Dubai Government. The response rate was very high (81%) and a series of interview meetings took place where HR and training specialists shared useful and insightful remarks on the challenges that face the government entities after the financial crisis.

This study will be a reliable reference for both professionals and also policy makers in the Arab world in general and the Gulf area in particular. It will emphasize the importance of keeping the training budget intact in case of crises because training keeps the performance of the organizations superior and implements the best practices of human resource training and development.

1.3 The Context of the United Arab Emirates

The United Arab Emirates consists of Seven Emirates that were united in 1971 under the leadership of the late Sheikh Zayed Al-Nahyan. The unification of the seven Emirates led to the centralization of political power and creation of a Federation that is headed by Abu Dhabi, the biggest in size and where 90 percent of oil in the country is concentrated.

_Figure 1: Political map of the UAE_
The UAE shares borders with two countries, Saudi Arabia in the West and Oman in the East and the Gulf of Oman separates the boundaries between the UAE and Iran. Since the 1970s, the country has witnessed significant changes towards establishing a strong economy. The oil revenues are used to build the infrastructure of the country and provide opportunities to its citizens to live a comfortable lifestyle. More importantly, the population of Dubai in particular witnessed significant increase from 1970s till 2010 as Figures 2 and 3 demonstrate. This is due to the sharp increase in the numbers of expatriates who were attracted to the lucrative opportunities Dubai’s and UAE’s economies in general offered to them. The population growth in the Emirates of Dubai witnessed unparalleled and unmatched growth compared to the rest of the world as Figures 2 and 3 demonstrate.

Figure 2: Population: Dubai vs. World, 1900-2001

![Population: Dubai vs. World, 1900-2010](image)

*Source: World Bank Data Bank 2011*

However, although the population growth witnessed a sharp increase over the last ten years, one of the main challenges the UAE faces is that 80% of this population is composed of foreigners while only 20% are National Emiratis. The 80% of foreigners population actually comprises 90% of the workforce in UAE as some foreigners are working in UAE without residing their families in the country. (Dubai Statistical Bureau 2011).
This challenge poses various risks to the social, economic and also cultural aspects of the country whose identity is at stake because of the predominance of the expatriates in the country. The nationals also face other challenges of competing with a well-qualified workforce.

As demonstrated, GDP Purchasing Power Parity increased substantially from $60 billion in 2004 to $240 billion in 2010 as Figure 4 shows.
The Financial Crisis which the UAE has undergone also hit the economy and created other challenges to the performance of the economy and its sustained growth. The influence of the crisis was also clear on the GDP per capita which also witnessed a downward stream. As Figure 5 shows, GDP per capita fell from $60,000 in 2008 to $50,000 in 2009. However, the GDP per capita in the UAE is still better than other Arab and OECD countries (CIA World Fact Book 2011).

**Figure 5: GDP per capita in the UAE and other countries**

![GDP per capita in the UAE and other countries](image)

*Source: World Bank Data Bank 2011*

In fact, the UAE needs to focus on strengthening its human capital and making sure that the local population is equipped with the necessary skills that can make it independent from relying on the knowledge and experience of expatriates. This challenge has been felt in the UAE especially after the financial crisis, when a substantial number of expatriates left the country. Therefore, training the national workforce and preparing them to take managerial posts is a prerequisite for sustainable development and progress.
Dubai Government Structure

The Government of Dubai has a well-structured process with executive and judicial bodies as Figure 6 demonstrates clearly. The Ruler of Dubai, H.H Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al-Maktoum is on the top of the Government hierarchy. He receives policy recommendations from The Executive Council (TEC) which is the executive arm of the Government of Dubai.

Figure 6: The structure of Dubai Government

All government entities report to the TEC which reviews their recommendations, studies them and then upon approval, forward them to the Diwan’s Office (Ruler’s Court).

The TEC has four main committees:

1. Economic Development Committee
2. Social Development Committee
3. Social Justice Committee
4. Infrastructure and land Development Committee.

Authorities and departments sometimes propose some policies to the relevant committees for review and consideration. When the committee studies the policy proposal, it endorses it if it is relevant and meets the needs of the government. Each Committee receives policies and recommendations from relevant authorities and branches of the local government, which are then forwarded to the Chairman of the Executive Council for review. H.H. Sheikh Mohammed then takes the necessary steps to approve or disapprove a proposed policy.

1.4 Human Resource Management in the 21st Century and the Importance of Training

A growing body of literature has focused on the influence and impact of HRD on organizational performance (Truss and Gratton 1994). One of the most important aspects of HRD is its focus on training as a means to improve organizational performance and capacity. The recognition of human skills as the source of competitive advantage in the 21st century, and the less reliance on natural sources forces modern public and private organizations to invest more in their human capital.

According to Drucker (1986), the new role of human resources in the modern production systems has changed the focus of the traditional field of human resource management and its models.
Cleveland (1985) states that the traditional societies of the early industrial era focused on human labor rather than skills.

The need to extract raw materials and produce manufactured goods made it essential to focus on human labour for production and goods. However, Drucker (1969) argues that from the beginning of the 21st century, there has been a significant shift from reliance on labor to skills and intellect of the human resources. The new working, post industrial, environment is no longer reliant on specialized tasks and standardized line operation, but rather on the knowledge of the employees (Ducker 1969). Hence, it has become essential to enhance the knowledge and skills of employees by investing in their training in order to secure more organizational productivity.

There are numerous benefits that can be drawn from the implementation of training programs, mainly improvement in job performance (Satterfield and Hughes 2007). For example, Arthur et al (2003) conducted a comprehensive meta-analysis for 1152 effect sizes from 165 sources and found that compared to the organizations that had no training programs, performance increased significantly and the behavior of employees also showed positive improvements.

Also, in a study that covered the use of machines in Northern Indiana, Barber (2004) found that job training led to improved competency of the use of machines and also greater innovation in their use. Moreover, other studies conducted in the European context found positive relationship between training and organizational performance. For example, Aragon-Sanchez et al (2003) surveyed 457 small and medium size companies in the UK, Finland, Netherlands, Spain and Portugal to measure the impact of training on the effectiveness of job related indicators and also on the profitability of these companies.

The results of the study found that training was an instrumental component that positively affected both the levels of the organizations’ effectiveness and also profitability. Garcia (2005) conducted a study in Spain in which he surveyed 78 organizations with more than 100 employees to determine the influence of training on organizational performance. He evaluated four main
aspects of the organizational performance: employee satisfaction, customer satisfaction, owner satisfaction and the employees’ levels of productivity. The results of this study found strong positive correlation between training and each of the four mentioned variables. In fact, these studies confirmed that organizational training is a critical element that can positively drive the performance of both public and private sector organizations and update their knowledge and competencies to be able to compete internationally.

Numerous studies have been conducted in both private and public sector organizations and have proved that implementing an effective human resource management model was the key for achieving organizational effectiveness (Baird and Meshoulam 1989). Apparently, the management of people has become both a strategic concern and priority for organizations that wanted to significantly improve their performance and competitiveness.

1.5 Strategic Human Resource Management

Strategic Human Resource Management (SHRM) is different from the traditional HRM in the fact that it focuses more on the output and results rather than only on theories and their implications on the organizational development (Welbourne et al 1996). Its objective is to link human resources with the organization’s strategic goals and objectives and achieve the desired organizational excellence and performance.

However, there are certain conditions that need to exist within the realm of the organization to achieve these positive outcomes. Aktouf (1996) argues that strategic management is a continuous process that requires three significant elements: (1) commitment and involvement of senior management, (2) a supportive organizational environment, (3) availability of human and financial resources. These three elements are essential to provide the necessary platform for the SHRM to operate successfully within an organization. SHRM ensures that the organization aligns its long term objectives with the strategies it implements and adopts in the long run (Baird and Meshoulam 1989). The human resource department works very closely with the strategy
department to set up the parameters to push the organization forward to achieve the desired strategic outcomes. This can be achieved also by incorporating technology and other tools to facilitate the jobs of both HR and strategy departments to work with high levels of efficiency and effectiveness. Guest (1991) explains how the transformation from the traditional HRM to SHRM has reshaped the organizational performance and established new mechanisms and priorities for the organizations. Barney et al (1991) go further to argue that SHRM has become the source of competitive advantage for organizations.

In an increasingly competitive world, which is the reality for most organizations today, few would disagree with the view that a link should exist between the training that organizations undertake and their business strategy.

Personnel are now widely regarded as ‘human resources’ with the implication that, like other resources, they are to be valued and carefully managed. The amount of financial resource available for the training of employees is not unlimited, necessitating decisions about where to deploy training activity to the maximum effect. Such decisions can only be made if those responsible for Human Resource Development are clear about the organization’s strategy and priorities. An alignment between strategy and training is now commonly regarded as good business sense.

### 1.6 Human Resource Management and Training in the UAE

The paucity of research regarding human resource management, negatively impacts the Gulf countries’ strategies to improve the skills of their national human capital. In fact, what makes this kind of research very important in the Gulf is the dominance of the expatriate workforce over the national one. In the UAE, for example, the foreign workforce accounts for more than 90% of the total workforce. (Dubai Statistics Office 2010) This is a very critical issue since the UAE’s government has implemented nationalization or Emiratization policies (Al Ali 2008) that aim to integrate the national workforce in the job market. However, with the lack of studies that
examine the strengths and weaknesses of the national workforce, their training needs and career development orientations, it will remain a hard and challenging issue for the government to successfully implement its Emiratization policies (Al Ali 2008). More importantly, the advent of the financial crisis and its re-shaping of the economic and financial foundations of the world economies resulted in numerous negative impacts on the Gulf countries. It caused a negative impact on turnover and the departure of skilled workers from the UAE and specifically the Emirate of Dubai which was severely impacted by the crisis. Hence, there is an urgent need for a study that examines all these issues and analyzes the impact of the financial crisis on the training effectiveness in Dubai and its overall impact on organizational performance.

‘Nationalization’ processes are typically initiated as a result of a nation’s confrontation of the challenges posed by waves of globalization and the increasingly easy movement of goods and human capital from one place to another. Abdelkarim (2001) provides a succinct definition of what nationalization means: “A multi-level process through which dependency on the expatriate labour force is reduced and nationals are prepared to take up jobs performed by expatriates. Such preparation entails enabling nationals to perform their jobs equally as good, if not better, than expatriates in the shortest possible period” (p. 38). Such experiences thus typically threaten the exploitation of national resources by indigenous people, their access to job markets, and risk compromising their national identity (Al Dosary 2004, Mellahi and Wood 2002).

As it is stated in the National Human Resource Development and Employment Authority’s (Tanmia) website, the emphasis on nationalization in the UAE (Emiratization) is a result of “serious thinking and careful policy making that sets targets with a long term vision” (p.3). Tanmia has been established mainly to address issues related to the nationalization of the UAE’s workforce and recommend relevant policy options to the government, as well as assisting Emiratis in matching skills to job placements. Rees et al (2007) examines the relationship behind the adoption of this policy in the UAE from a human resource management perspective, discussing issues related to the implementation and evaluation of these policies and the
involvement of expatriates in the process. Some of the main findings indicate the broadness of these policies, that they have not been context specific, are not well implemented, and result in tensions with non-Emiratis in the work environment. They focus on the inclusion of Emiratis in some sectors like the banking and customer services, while they do not prepare the skills and capacities of the nationals for them to be able to join other sectors in the private sector. However, it is worth mentioning that Rees et al’s (2007) study is one among the very few studies that tackle the issue of Emiratization and its implications on the national economy and society.

Training has traditionally been a functional division of the personnel department concerned with carrying out the identification of training needs, planning and designing training, implementing training and evaluating (Welbourne et al 1996). This notion of a systematic approach to training is widely accepted among practitioners. The education and training of the workforce requires the involvement of the entire organization if training is to be effective in improving the performance and profitability of our organizations. Effective training uses instructional systems to design process and operate as a highly performing work team in partnership with the rest of the organization.

Training has emerged as both an art and a science enhanced by new and exciting tools and technologies. This research focuses on providing a reflection on the design issues that affect the development and delivery of training as we know them today and as it might look like in the future. The seasoned training professionals are willing to share their wisdom and knowledge by describing the experiences that shape the way they look at training within the global context of human performance. Hence, this research focuses on assessing the training practices followed in Dubai government organizations. It will primarily focus on the training methods applied in Dubai and emphasize on improving the skills and knowledge of employees to enable them to meet the current and future work challenges.
1.7 From Traditional Public Administration to Public Management and its Implications on HRM

This section is very important to articulate and clarify why training and equipping public sector employees with different managerial skills is important. The Emirate of Dubai is very renowned for its application of the international best practices and methods. Over the last few years, its public sector has been classified as one of the 30 best in the world (World Economic Forum).

This is a result of the continuous investment in improving the performance of the public sector and equipping public servants with different skills and practices. The shift from the traditional model of public administration to the public management was a smooth and successful experience in Dubai and the UAE. This section will highlight the main differences between the two models and how public management was in the best interest of Dubai’s government to bear the fruits of a modern and efficiently running public sector.

This section tried to demonstrate the differences between the traditional model of public administration and public management, both in theory and practice.

The conclusion that this paper draws from this research is that:

1. The differences between the two models are tremendous in theory and in practice.

2. The public administration model was effective and reliable till the global circumstances changed and a new model was needed to cope with the new challenges of the new century.

3. The public management model has achieved significant results in managing the public sector in developed countries and has been more responsive and aware of the public’s needs.

However, many criticisms and questions arise: First of all, the model is not “universal” or transferable to all geographical contexts.

It has been successful and adaptable mainly in the Anglo-Saxon world; while the rest of the world still adopts the traditional model (Osborne, 2006). Secondly, there are critics who argue that PM is to advance the career life of elite groups rather than the mass public (Hood, 1991).
Thirdly, the PM model has many deficiencies and unpredicted consequences. David and Rhodes (2002) mention various “unresolved” issues regarding this model like “fragmentation”, “steering” and many other problems.

1.8 Conclusion

This chapter realized the importance of this research and the justification of its conduction; it also realized the importance of building the employees' capabilities enabling them to perform their assigned duties and responsibilities in the highest levels of efficiency and effectiveness. It drew the attention on the importance of the implementation in Dubai and the Arab region of modern systems and methodologies in the management field in general, and in training management in particular, taking into consideration that the human capital is the greatest asset of nations. It is very clear that what was applicable to implement in the past is not applicable in this ever changing world.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

Training effectiveness is contingent upon numerous factors that interchangeably co-exist to improve the managerial, professional and personal skills of employees in a certain institution, and eventually lead to enhanced performance and productivity which positively affect the organizational development. The examination of each of these factors, becoming aware of their importance, taking their pros and cons into consideration, is the first step organizations take towards achieving organizational excellence and effectiveness. The objective of this literature review is to conduct a comprehensive investigation into the available literature pertinent to the topic of this study and to demonstrate the correlations that exist among three variables: (1) the training budget and its impact on the implementation of training programs, (2) training strategy and how it influences the training effectiveness and (3) the impact of effective training on organizational effectiveness. The causal relationship among these three factors determines to a large extent the success or failure of implemented training programs. This literature review looks at a wide range of studies that have been conducted in western countries and also in the Middle East, although there are fewer studies in the latter.

The first part of the literature review identifies to what extent the allocated budgets affect training programs in general. Generally speaking, financial and budgetary issues affect the interest of government stakeholders in implementing and running training programs at a time when dwindling budgets restrict the flexibility of organizations to prioritize various issues including training. It specifically examines the context of the United Arab Emirates and how the recent financial crisis has caused the government to reduce the budget it used for training its public sector employees. In fact, there are very few studies on this topic in the context of the UAE. Wilkins (2001) confirms this point when he indicated that government entities and institutions in the UAE do not conduct major surveys nor comprehensive studies on training strategies and their
effectiveness in the public sector. Most of the government sponsored studies deal specifically with issues pertinent to Emiratization policies and investment in local human capital. This restricts studying the issue from a comprehensive perspective which would provide insights into the overall human resource challenges in the country which is dominated by majority expatriate workforces. Hence, the objective of this study is to enrich the available literature, and aims to address the paucity of research in this area by providing a comprehensive view on the current practice of the government in this regard.

The second part of the literature review examines very closely the impact of training strategy on training effectiveness. Organizations strive for success and efficiency by relying on a set of organizational strategies, and especially by empowering their human capital and providing it with strong personal and organizational skills to achieve higher outputs to their organizations. However, research has constantly proved that, although organizations implement training programs and strategies, their positive or negative outcomes are primarily reliant on the effectiveness of the training strategy.

Research indicates that only ten per cent of training expenditures have shown positive change in the behavior of employees in performing their tasks (Georgeson 1982, Holton and Baldwin 2000, Kupritz 2001). Both researchers and practitioners have been trying to understand why some training programs are effective and others are not, and how to make sure that they are relevant to all the contexts where they are applied (Baldwin and Ford 1988, Wexley and Baldwin 1986). Hence, Tannenbaum and Yukl (1992) suggested a “paradigm shift” to the available research and looked at the issue of training effectiveness as of “… why, when, and for whom a particular type of training is effective.” (p. 433). Training effectiveness is strongly contingent on the availability of certain contextual and individual factors that are important to establish the necessary platform for effective training (Facteau et al 1995). Contextual factors are those related to the organization and the way it manages and implements its training programs. For example, is there sufficient support from the top management and especially from the supervisors? Are the employees and
their supervisors involved in setting the goals of the training and its objectives? Are the employees' needs well assessed and their training programs and strategies designed to fill the identified gaps in the skills of the employees? On the other hand, individual factors are those related to the trainees in general (Colquitt et al. 2003). The questions that help identify these factors are like: Are the training programs and strategies formed in a way that motivates and encourages employees to participate in the training programs? Are these training programs goal oriented and have specific targets?

The third part of this review looks at the impact of effective training on organizational effectiveness. It examines to what extent effective training correlates with organizational performance by looking at the findings of major studies in this field. Also, it identifies the requirements for successful training programs, and the techniques and tools that should be adopted by human resource managers who want to improve the quality of their training programs, especially in the context of public sector organizations.

A growing body of literature has constantly proved that organizational performance is interlinked and significantly determined by the amount of efforts made by the organization to enhance training programs offered to their employees. The more training sessions employees receive at their institutions, the stronger they become related to their organizations, and the more productive they become as well. This is mainly due to the fact that the globalizing nature of the world and the competitive landscape in which organizations operate makes adopting the latest and most effective managerial practices an inescapable option. However, fewer training programs also mean that productivity levels can also decline and more turnover rates can be witnessed at the organization. Importantly, some actual case studies will be discussed to demonstrate how effective or ineffective training programs affect the employees' and organizational performance in general. These cases will be the source of the lessons learned and will also support the third hypothesis of this study that effective training influences positively organizational performance.
2.2 Training and Development

What is training and why is it important for public sector organizations?

The modern era of continuous, rapid and accelerating high-technology changes forced organizations to provide training programs on a regular basis to update their employees on the latest developments and improvements in the field (Adler 1991). Kaufman and Guerra (2001) state that: “we have entered a new era in which both achieving useful results and proving that they add value to the organization and our shared society are required (p. 219). This makes training one of the crucial strategies that organizations can rely on to meet the challenges posed by the globalizing and fast growing world economies, and a tool that, if it is used properly and efficiently, can yield the desired results of enhanced productivity and improved effectiveness (Rosow and Zager 1988).

Training refers to a planned effort by a company to facilitate employees' learning of job-related competencies. These competencies vary from knowledge, managerial skills, or behaviors that are critical for successful job performance. The ultimate goal of training is to successfully allow the employees to master the knowledge, skill, and behaviors emphasized in training programs and to apply them to their day-to-day activities. Leonard (1984) defines Training as a learning experience that is provided in order to improve performance on the present job. A person's performance is improved by showing them how to master a new or established technology. The technology may be a piece of heavy machinery, a computer, a procedure for creating a product, or a method of providing a service. The existing management literature provides various other definitions of organizational training. The most cited ones are by Noe and Schmitt (1986) who defined training as: planned learning experience designed to bring about permanent change in an individual’s knowledge, attitudes, or skills” (as cited in Campbell et al 1970). Also, another prevalent definition in the literature defines it as “…planned intervention that is designed to enhance the determinants of individual job performance” (Campbell and Kuncel 2001, p. 278).

All these definitions actually agree that training is a “planned process” that aims to modify the
attitudes, knowledge, skills and behavior of employees in a certain organization through learning. Its objective is to achieve effective performance in an activity or range of activities and develop the abilities of the individual employees to satisfy the current and future needs of the organization (Manpower Services Commission, 1981).

There are numerous benefits that can be drawn from the implementation of training programs, mainly improvement in job performance (Satterfield and Hughes 2007). For example, Arthur et al. (2003) conducted a comprehensive meta-analysis for 1152 effect sizes from 165 sources and found that compared to the organizations that had no training programs, performance increased significantly and the behavior of employees also witnessed positive improvements.

Also, in a study that covered the use of machines in Northern India, Barber (2004) found that in-job training led to improved competency of the use of machines and also greater innovation in their use. Moreover, other studies conducted in the European context found a positive relationship between training and organizational performance. For example, Aragon-Sanchez et al. (2003) surveyed 457 small and medium size companies in the UK, Finland, Netherlands, Spain and Portugal to measure the impact of training on the effectiveness of job related indicators and also on the profitability of these companies. The results of the study found that training was an instrumental component that positively affected both the levels of the organizations' effectiveness and also profitability. Garcia (2005) conducted a study in Spain in which he surveyed 78 organizations with more than 100 employees to determine the influence of training on organizational performance. He evaluated four main aspects of the organizational performance: employee satisfaction, customer satisfaction, owner satisfaction and the employees' levels of productivity. The results of this study found strong positive correlation between training and each of the four mentioned variables. In fact, these studies confirm that organizational training is a critical element that can drive positively the performance of both public and private sector organizations and update their knowledge and competencies to be able to compete internationally.
Finkelstein et al (1998) explain that for organizations to gain a competitive advantage in the competitive global markets, their training programs have to involve more than just basic skills' development. That is, to use training to gain a competitive advantage, training should be viewed broadly as a way to enhance the creation of intellectual capital. Intellectual capital includes a range of skills (skills needed to perform one's job), advanced skills (such as how to use technology to share information with other employees), an understanding of the customer or manufacturing system, and self-motivated creativity. But estimates show that 85 percent of jobs require extensive use of knowledge.

This requires employees to share knowledge and creatively use it to modify a product or serve the customer, as well as to understand the service or product development systems. Zager and Rosow (1988) stress the fact that effective continuous learning requires employees to understand the entire work system including the relationships among their jobs, their work units, and the company. Employees are expected to acquire new skills and knowledge, apply them on the job, and share this information with other employees.

Thonburg (1994) argues that to facilitate the sharing of knowledge, managers may use informational maps that show where knowledge lies within the company (for example, directories that list what a person does as well as the specialized knowledge) and use technology such as groupware or the Internet that allows employees in various business units to work simultaneously on problems and share information. Hence, improving and updating the employees' knowledge is a critical component of training programs. However, it is imperative to ascertain that the training programs that are implemented in a given organization meet the best standards. Carnevale (1990) stressed that high-leverage training should be linked to strategic business goals and objectives, and organizations should use an instructional design process to ensure that training is effective, and compare or benchmark the company's training programs against training programs in other companies. High-leverage training practices also help to create working conditions that encourage continuous learning.
However, despite the significance of training programs in enhancing organizational performance from various aspects, research on training effectiveness is still more theoretical than empirical, and also has focused on the trainees more than the aspects of the working environment where they operate (Clark et al 1993, Baldwin and Ford 1988). Clark et al (1993) clearly demonstrates this point by stating that:

“Unfortunately, research on training has generally been theoretical and faddish. Researchers have frequently attempted to increase the effectiveness of training by focusing on training techniques. Special attention has also been paid to the arrangement of training environments. But without a theoretical basis for studying the techniques and training environments, researchers are often at a loss either to explain why they are effective or to predict their effectiveness in other settings or for other trainees (p. 293).

This statement demonstrates to what extent the focus has been less on the empirical part of research on the impact of training on organizational effectiveness and urges researchers to rely more on quantitative analysis in this regard. The theoretical part of the available literature is crucial to drive and guide the empirical work, but is not sufficient by itself to provide patterns and recommendations for better performance. Moreover, research focuses on very limited aspects of training programs and not on all of them. Rouiller and Goldstein (1993) share Clark et al’s same argument regarding the limited scope and focus of research on few components of organizational training studies since 1960s. He stated that: “…in nearly all studies of training outcomes, the emphasis has been on identifying and examining the characteristics of training programs and individual learners and relating these factors to training and job performance” (p377). This approach totally disregards the important role that the environment where the employees work affects their motivation and willingness to improve their skills and productivity. Philips (1997) argues that the difficulty associated with measuring the impact of the work
environment on enabling employees to fully utilize the training benefits can be attributed to the difficulties to quantify these measures.

Most of the available literature on the impact of training effectiveness on organizational performance is centered in the western countries. The United States and Europe conduct comprehensive theoretical and also empirical studies that test the relationship between the various variables and relationships that affect training and organizational effectiveness. The Arab world; however, significantly lacks studies with this nature and scope which makes it difficult to understand the performance, context and maturity of this subject in the Middle East (Medhat 1998). The Gulf countries, which enjoy abundant revenues accumulated from petroleum resources, also do not invest sufficiently in research and development related to human resource and management. Furthermore, Wilkins (2001) confirms that the Gulf countries in general and the United Arab Emirates in particular suffer from acute paucity in the available research pertinent to training practices and organizational development.

The paucity of research regarding human resource management negatively impacts the Gulf countries’ strategies to improve the skills of their national human capital. In fact, what makes this kind of research very important in the Gulf is the dominance of expatriate workforces over the national ones. In the UAE, for example, the foreign workforce accounts for more than 90 per cent of the total workforce. This is a very critical issue since the UAE’s government has implemented nationalization or Emiratization policies that aim to integrate the national workforce in the job market. However, with the lack of studies that examine the strengths and weaknesses of the national workforce, their training needs and career development orientations, it will remain a hard and challenging issue for the government to successfully implement its Emiratization policies. More importantly, the financial crisis and its re-shaping of the economic and financial foundations of the world economies resulted in numerous negative impacts on the Gulf countries. It caused a negative impact on turnover and the departure of skilled workers from the UAE and specifically the Emirate of Dubai which was severely impacted by the crisis. Hence, there is an
urgent need for a study that examines these issues and analyzes the impact of the financial crisis on the training effectiveness in Dubai and its overall impact on organizational performance.

What are the training approaches?

Training within public organizations takes various forms, and many training approaches have been introduced to the public sector to enhance the effectiveness of its workforce. The objective behind the variety of the training approaches is to give people better opportunities to learn given the differences in personality and character. This literature focuses on reviewing 4 forms of training methods: (1) coaching, (2) mentoring, (3) on job training, and (4) workshops.

(1) Coaching: is an essential intervention method designed to firstly assess and then improve the performance of a single employee or a team. It occurs when an individual trainer intervenes to change and improve the behavior and thinking of his team by assessing their weaknesses, providing advice and possible techniques they can adopt to become more efficient in their jobs (Burr 1995, Marton and Saljo 1976). In fact, Honey and Mumford’s (1992) study examined various training approaches and the reactions of individual trainees towards them. They found that individual learning differs from one person to another, given their learning styles and preferences. Also, they found that most of their subjects confirmed that coaching was an effective tool that gave them the chance to observe closely their performance and behavior, and get the necessary advice from their coach to improve and correct the shortfalls in their performance.

Training programs through coaching give the opportunity to employees to move from ‘testing’ methodologies to ‘asking’ ones which gives them the chance to improve their critical thinking skills. Moreover, trainees become no longer consumers of the training material, but also participants in its development. The more questions they ask, the more challenging players they become in the improvement of the training material and its effectiveness.

The other positive element that coaching offers is motivation (Mann 1987). Participants in various training programs stated that their coaches provided not only technical advice on how to
enhance their skills, performance and productivity, but offered also a motivation and empowerment which are essential not only in their work environment, but also for their personal life (Honey and Mumford 1992). This is mainly due to the fact that motivation strengthens the building of a positive mindset that adopts optimistic approaches towards work and avoids negative ones. In the available literature, this has proved to be extremely helpful in training employees to adopt positive behavior while solving problems related to their work.

(2) Mentoring: is another training method that is largely used by public sector organizations to improve the performance of their employees. Mentors are essential in the career development of individuals within any organization. Unlike coaches who provide specific and limited guidance to trainees, mentors are involved with employees in a constant and continuous basis (Kram 1985). Mentors provide feedback on the quality of work, its weaknesses and strengths and guidance on how someone can improve their performance in general. Mentors generally play multiple roles to achieve the desired improvement in the employees’ professional, personal and psychological developments. They sometimes play the role of models to follow, advocates, advisors, guides, listeners, hosts, friends, facilitators and developers of skills and intellect.. etc (Cohen 1995). Kram (1985) examined the different phases of a mentor’s relationship with his employees from psychological and organizational perspectives. She states that there are four major mentoring phases:

1. The first phase may last for six months to one year, and it is the time when both the mentor and mentee form a sound relationship. The importance of this phase essentially resides in the fact that it determines the overall success of the relationship between the two parties. If the relationship is a healthy and steady one, then the mentee will get the best advice and outcome from his mentor. However, if the relationship is characterized by conflicts and disagreements of opinion and direction, then most probably the results would not be as positive as expected (Brookfield 1990, Daloz 1986).
2. The second phase is called the cultivation phase and can extend from two to five years. This is a decisive phase since both the mentor and the mentee realize the positive or negative aspects of their relationship. If the two parties have things in common that can keep their relationship going, then they extend their prospects and establish stronger ties that will ultimately allow the positive results of the mentorship to flourish. However, if their relationship is characterized by tension and constant disagreements, then most likely the two might decide to stop their relationship and look for others to work with.

3. The third phase is called the separation phase. This is the phase when the mentee can work independently from the direct supervision of the mentor, and start to develop independent judgments as to how to proceed within the organization in general. After a few years of mentorship, mentees develop enough skills and learn enough from their mentors to be able to function independently.

4. The fourth and final phase is called the redefinition phase. It is when the relationship takes a final shape and, hence, it becomes essential to decide either to continue with it if it is pea-like and yields positive outcomes, or ends it if it is characterized by hostility and resentment (Brookfield and Daloz 1986). If the mentee receives enough advice and direction from his mentor, then it would be a wise decision to move ahead and work independently, or approach another mentor to develop other skills.

(3) On job training (OJT): this takes place whenever one person transfers new skills and knowledge to another during their work (Brookfield and Daloz 1986). This training method is widely used within public organizations given the informal format it takes. Whenever new employees do not know how to get their work done, they usually seek the advice of their superiors or managers. This informal training mostly takes place on an “as-needed basis” without any preparation, material or evaluation.
However, if the job environment fosters sharing knowledge and appreciates the value of collaborative work, then this form of training will significantly improve the performance of employees and enhance their skills.

(4) **Workshops:** research has proved that using training workshops is one of the most reliable forms of training. Workshops create a platform that enables trainees to learn directly from the experienced trainers, listen to their lectures and then apply what they learn and discuss it. It allows the participants to directly interact with each other and exchange ideas and information which help them to absorb, grasp and apply them in their jobs. Moreover, it gives them the chance to test what they have learned and benefit from it. Most governments worldwide recognize the significance of training workshops and have made them an essential component of their internal or external training projects.

**2.3 The Financial Crisis influences training effectiveness (training budget and training approach)**

**Budget allocated to training: a global perspective**

The rapidly changing business climate in the fast globalizing world forces organizations to train and update the knowledge of their employees to match their skills with the ones needed in the market place (Manthrope et al 2009). However, success of training programs and their efficiency are contingent on various factors that are associated with the design of their strategies and the importance that is given to them by top management (Manthrope 2009). However, one of the critical aspects behind the success of training programs is the allocation of a sufficient budget that covers the high costs of training programs (Mathieu et al 1992, Manthrope et al 2009). Training represents a very expensive investment that the organization makes to enhance the competencies, capabilities and knowledge of its workforce (Cascio 1989).

McKenna (1990) estimated that organizations spend almost $200 billion dollars annually on the training expenses of their employees in the United States of America. The average training
expense on each employee in the 1970s was around $75 to $100 annually, but that jumped to reach as much as $2,000 annually per employee (Wexley and Latham 1991).

Lake (2008) argues that severe budget cuts which take many shapes such as layoffs of employees, hiring freeze and reducing the training budgets have all affected the way the public sector operates. The lack of funding has created restrictions in offering training sessions and classes to the employees in the government sector and poses many challenges as to how to go forward. In the USA, the trend is a continuous cut of state budgets especially as in the case of California where the Governor proposed cuts on education that reached 10 per cent (Paddock 2008).

Tightening budgets and the various financial crises the world has gone through, affected negatively the budgets that organizations allocated for training annually (Murray and Efendiglu 2007). The latest report from the National Professional Organization for Trainers (NPOT) estimated that organizations spent around $109.25 billion annually on various training programs and on workplace learning and performance (WLP) (Murray and Efendiglu 2007). The average annual expenditure per employee according to the estimates of the NPOT was around $1,424 per employee in 2005, showing an increase of 4 per cent from the previous year. These high costs of training should normally yield significant positive impacts on the work environment and effectiveness of service delivery within the organizations. However, the actual estimation of the impact of training on organizational performance has worried organizations and made them wonder if the costs of training make significant returns to the organization (Ketter 2006). As Figure 7 shows, from 2005 to 2009, there was a clear decline in the total training spending from $51.1 billion to 48.2 billion. The same downward trend was seen in the numbers of training staff.
Payroll which dropped from $37.5 billion in 2005 all the way to $27.5 billion in 2009. This is a significant drop of $9 billion in only four years.

Mamoukaris et al (2009) developed a new “Training Budget Management” (TBM) model which can supply human resource managers with analytical plans and components that can allow them to align the training plans with the strategic and personal goals of the organization and its employees as well. This model not only allows the organizations to form a specific and exact training budget, but also shows them how to manage the three key components of the training which are: efficiency, effectiveness and compliance (Mamoukaris et al 2009).

The dwindling financial resources urge organizations to identify mechanisms that can sufficiently allocate resources. Hence, the TBM provides training and human resource managers with techniques and components that help them predict the actual budget focusing on: users, selected goals, and construction of business proposal, training costs and final budget policy. These factors will contribute to efficiently utilizing the expenditure related to training in general.
The percentage of the organization’s payroll and the number of training hours offered to employees are determined by various factors but mainly the affordability of these costs by the organizations.

Financial difficulties and crises force organizations to give up their training initiatives to cut costs. This has tremendous negative consequences on the organizational performance and overall sustainability of their goals and objectives (Murray and Efendiglu 2007).

*Figure 8: Annual Training Hours per Learner (2006 to 2009)*

![Annual Training Hours per Learner (2006 to 2009)](image)

*Figure 8* clearly demonstrates the significant drop in the annual training hours per learner from 2006 to 2009. The decline was from 32 hours to 13 hours in less than three years. And it is likely that this declining trend will continue since the American economy is not witnessing any signs of recovery any time soon. In fact, the world is worried about entering another financial crisis due to the debt issues in Europe.

*Figure 9: Budget change by industry in 2010 in the US*

![Budget Change by Industry](image)

In order to get a closer idea about which sectors were more influenced by the decrease in training budget, a very recent study conducted in the US shows that the training budget of the government and military decreased by 49 per cent in 2010 due to the implications of the financial crisis, as can be seen in Figure 9. However, the majority of private sector organizations managed to keep their budgets at a relatively stable scale.

Figure 10: Training Expenditures 2005 - 2010

![Training Expenditures 2005-2010](chart)


Figure 10 shows the trends in training staff payroll which decreased from $37.5 billion in 2005 to $25.7 billion in 2010. This is a dramatic decrease of $12 billion in less than 5 years.

Undoubtedly, this decrease in training budgets will affect the performance of the employees and their ability to be creative and compete in a global market which relies on innovation as a means of competition.

The Gulf countries and the impact of the financial crisis – overview of the financial crisis in the UAE and training

The Gulf countries and the United Arab Emirates, especially the Emirate of Dubai, have suffered from severe repercussions resulting from the international financial crisis. The crisis hit these countries at a time when they were achieving significant economic growth and were on track towards reaching their strategic economic objectives (Woertz 2008). What started as a subprime crisis in the US contaminated the region and brought dramatic consequences to the region (Brach...
and Loewe 2010). Given its strong ties and wide exposure to the western markets and credits, Dubai’s economy which relied heavily on real estate suffered tremendously during the financial crisis. Its property markets burst when it could not pay back its debts and publicly announced its intentions to re-structure its debt and also publicly owned companies like Emar and Dubai World (Brach and Loewe 2010). 2009, was not an easy year for Dubai as it went through financial problems. The credit crisis actually caused Dubai to stop some of its projects, delay the start of others and even cancel some other projects that were planned for the next few years. However, it is not only the private sector which was considerably affected by the crisis, but also the public sector. Many governmental institutions and entities were merged with others to cut and minimize expenditure. Others live with tight budgets that do not allow them to pursue the same optimistic and rapid growth.

In this context, Dubai’s public sector became unable to afford spending money with the same pattern as in its early developmental days. A dwindling and tight budget that is slashed by almost 10 per cent each year, and outstanding debt that needs to be paid back, made Dubai’s public sector reconsider its priorities. One of the areas that witnessed and experienced this reconsideration is the training departments within the government of Dubai. According to a study that is conducted by the Dubai School of Government about knowledge management in the Dubai’s public sector entities (2011), and which surveyed 66 per cent of public sector organizations, 60 per cent of these surveyed government entities saw cuts in their training budgets due to the financial crisis. Although Dubai government entities are considered one of the world’s top service providing agencies, by implementing international best practices in management and administration, their current ability to finance training programs and keep up the same high standards of service delivery are at stake. What helped Dubai maintain the high quality in service delivery was its ability to afford training services that updated and improved the knowledge and skills of public servants on a very regular basis.
When the global financial crisis started in the US, the government of Dubai was not internally immune from the repercussions of this crisis, given its high dependency on external liquidity. The government was obliged to restructure its debts, mainly those associated with Dubai World (IMF 2011). This covered mostly the real estate industry which needed to improve its performance and gain the confidence of investors. The main restructuring plan which was announced in March 2010 and agreed upon by the government and its external creditors in October 2010 covered US$24.9 billion of debt. Around US$ 14.4 billion was owed to 90 domestic and foreign banks and the remaining US$ 10.5 billion was owned to the government of Dubai (IMF 2011).

There is not a single study that examines the impact of financial crisis on the training practices of government entities either in the UAE or Dubai in particular. In fact, there is an evident paucity even in studies that look at the training strategies and approaches in the public sector in general.

The financial crisis re-shaped the developmental model of Dubai and questioned its ability to continue with the same growth rates. It is not only the private sector which was considerably affected by the crisis, but also the public sector. Many governmental institutions and entities were merged with others to cut and minimize expenditure. Others live with very tight budgets that do not allow them to pursue the same optimistic and rapid growth.

2.4 Training Strategy Influences Training Effectiveness

Why is training strategy important for training effectiveness?

Given the fast evolving and changing nature of the work environment, and the constant need for changing the strategies and frameworks that organizations apply to compete in the global markets, it is important to implement training strategies that reflect the necessities of the time (Howard 1995). If the training strategy is sound and well-designed, then one can expect positive influence on the behaviors and attitudes of the employees and then on organizational performance as a whole (Holton and Baldwin 2003). However, researchers found that although
organizations implement various training strategies, they do not always result in significant improvements in the behavior and attitudes of their employees (Martineu 1997). Hence, a rich body of literature has been investigating the factors that can impact the effectiveness of training strategies and proposed a set of training models (Baldwin 2003). This part of this literature conducts an extensive review of the available studies on the topic and discusses in detail the prerequisites for establishing an efficient and well-targeted training strategy, and its overall impact on the training effectiveness.

The literature reveals that one of the most reliable approaches and methods to evaluate training effectiveness is Kirkpatrick’s (1976) four level approach (Clement 1987, Fromkin et al 1975, Latham et al 1975). It assesses (1) the trainees’ reaction towards the overall experience during the training program and its content, (2) The knowledge and skills that the employees develop during the training sessions, (3) the behavior of trainees during the training sessions and their reactions towards the material, (4) the perceived positive change in the behavior of employees and its impact on their productivity and the level of its impact on organizational effectiveness. These four approaches are summarized in Hamblin’s statement which declares that: “training leads to reactions, which leads to learning, which leads to changes in job behavior, which leads to changes in the organization, which leads to changes in the achievement of ultimate goals.”(p. 15). There is a causal relationship between each of these variables and every element influences the others. If employees receive a training program that they deem is related to their needs and expectations, then they will make extra efforts to get the best outcomes from it. This will enhance their knowledge about the material they learn from and reflect on it to identify their weaknesses and strengths and address them. Therefore, if effective training is provided, positive reactions, improved levels of learning, positive behavior change and improved job performance will be witnessed from the trainees (Noe and Schmitt 1986).

HRM recently recognized the fact that human capital is not only one of the sources of production, but rather an essential part of the competitiveness of the organization’s success.
(Alinaitew et al 2009). Therefore, investment in this human capital is the main building block for a successful operation of both private and public organizations. However, the implementation of a good training strategy is important to secure the effectiveness of training and its success in building the required skills of the employees and filling the gaps in their performance (Alinaitew et al 2009).

Since the financial crisis has created a barrier to investment in training, governments around the world have been creative in identifying cheaper, effective and reliable sources of training (Paddock 2008). E-learning and training has become an accessible tool to provide quality training. Holmes and Gardner (2006) state that e-learning provides us with access to resources that facilitate learning in an affordable and easy manner.

Shaw et al (2009) conducted an extensive study to determine what factors help the employees benefit the most from the on-line training programs they attend. They ran a survey over 1000 employees who participated in training programs online. The results indicated that learners who had adequate and sufficient knowledge about the training programs before they started them performed much better than the ones who did not. Also, the learners who had text material were able to perform better since they had the material in front of them and were able to look at it whenever they needed. The learners who benefited the most were the ones who had access to multimedia material and performed better at all levels. This study is very important since reliance on e-learning has become an essential alternative to classical teaching methods since the outbreak of the financial crisis in 2007.

It is very critical that employees transfer the knowledge they have gained during their training sessions in order to maximize the benefits for themselves and also for the organization (Nikandrou et al 2009). The study of Nikandrou et al (2009) relied on in-depth interviews with 44 employees who participated in a training program. The interesting finding of this study is that most of the participants' goals and objectives in participating in the training were not to improve
their performance in their current organizations, but to rather improve their skills for their next move to other organizations. This serves as a clear hindrance to applying what they have learnt in their current organizations and also from transferring the learnt experience to their colleagues. The knowledge of the employees can only be transferred to others when the organizational culture supports it and encourages its application.

The link between Individual factors and training effectiveness

Numerous studies have stressed on the critical role of individual factors in deciding the overall effectiveness of training programs. One of the most significant components in this regard is training motivation (Tracey et al 1995). Employees’ training-related-motivation proves to be significant in bridging between the organization’s working environments and training outcomes (Tracey et al 1995), and also plays a major role in determining the overall effectiveness of the training programs. Campbell (1988 and 1989) argues that there was a strong relationship between trainees’ motivation and training effectiveness. He stresses that researchers and practitioners should address and study the “individual and situational” factors that impact the motivation of trainees and their interest in attending training programs that are offered either in their organizations or other training institutions. In fact, Noe (1986) states that training effectiveness improves significantly if its strategies target enhancing the trainees recognition of its significance for both their personal and career developments. According to Noe, three elements enhance trainees’ motivation: (1) if they believe that high efforts result in higher performance in the training sessions, (2) if they are convinced that high performance in training ultimately leads to better job performance, and (3) high job performance is linked to opportunities for promotion and acquisition of opportunities for personal and organizational growth. Keeping this triangle in mind is instrumental to achieve the desired outcomes from training programs. More studies established a positive correlation between the trainees’ individual perceptions and the effectiveness of training programs. Dunette and Pritchard (1973) found that the trainees’ positive approach towards the importance of attending training programs and their motivation to attend them was
instrumental in the positive outcomes of these training programs. Most importantly, when the trainees are convinced that the training sessions pave the way towards achieving their career goals, they get more motivated to get the most out of them.

The other element that training strategies should reflect is the levels of the employees’ involvement in their jobs and how the tasks they perform are identical to their personalities (Blau 1985). The more involved employees are in their jobs, the more they appreciate any activities that are related to it as Noe and Schmitt (1986) proved in their study which found a statistically significant relationship between trainees’ job involvement and pre-training motivation. Motivation is essential in this regard since it is the vehicle that drives the interest of trainees to pay attention to the training material and sessions and get the best out of them for their career development. To further support this argument, Philips and Freedman (1984) found empirical evidence for the relationship between trainees’ motivation and training effectiveness. When the trainees believe that the training sessions will be instrumental for enhancing their knowledge and the way they conduct their jobs, their attention and learning experience from the training increase significantly. Hicks and Klimoski (1987) and Clark (1990) also proved empirically that the link between the trainees’ motivation and their experiences with the learning material. Therefore, to ascertain that the training strategy leads to training effectiveness, it is crucial that organizations assess their employees’ sense of organizational belonging before they assign a training session or program for them. Employees who are the most comfortable in their jobs are the ones who will get the most from the training programs.

Training strategies that take into consideration the motivation of their employees proves to lead to effective training. This can take many forms like motivating trainees by saying that the training program would enhance their performance and hence, their chances of being promoted in their jobs. Baldwin, Magjuka and Loher (1991) found in their study that trainees with higher motivation in a training program that aimed to improve their skills and knowledge about the assignments they conducted at work, were the ones who learned the most from the program.
Other studies like Mathieu, Tannenbaum, and Salas (1992) confirm the same finding and indicate that the motivated trainees were the ones who participated very actively in the training sessions and learned the most, compared to other trainees who just attended the training to satisfy their supervisors’ will to attend it. Hence, while designing a training strategy, human resource managers or training managers should ascertain that they provide enough motivation and convince the trainees about the significance of attending the program on their personal and career development.

There are many factors that affect the motivation and enthusiasm of employees to attend a training program. The first thing that is important to take into consideration is the employees’ past experience with training programs. If they were useless and not informative, then the trainees will have lost interest in attending them, and even if they did attend them, their motivation would have been very low (Facteau et al 1995). Employees’ general beliefs about certain training have a strong positive relationship on training effectiveness. The reputation of the training program plays a key role in triggering the motivation of the trainees, as they ask their co-workers about their previous experiences with the program and so form ideas about it even before they take part in it. The other element that can determine training effectiveness is the rewards that trainees are given upon successful completion of the program (Noe 1986). These rewards are crucial to trigger the motivation of employees to learn from the material and to try to apply it in their work place.

There are generally three types of the training incentives:

1. Intrinsic incentives, which are the skills the training program provides for trainees and to what extent they help them improve their performance and behavior within their organizations.

2. Extrinsic incentives, which is the extent to which training programs can lead to promotions, salary increases and growth opportunities within the organization
3. Compliance, which is simply the fact that employees participate in a training program because it is mandated by the organization (Facteu et al. 1995).

Studies have proved that the first two factors are positively associated with training effectiveness, while the last element (compliance) is negatively associated with it since trainees usually go to programs they did not choose, and hence do not have enough motivation to pay attention to the material studied in these programs. Baldwin et al. (1991) found that trainees who attended the training programs they requested reported higher motivation and learning outcomes than the trainees who were assigned to go to a training program they did not want.

The available literature reveals that the management and supervisors along with the employees should all play a significant role in designing the training strategy to make sure that it is comprehensive and inclusive of all the organizational needs (Baldwin and Magjuka 1991). The involvement of management in designing the training strategy and involving the employees has significant and positive outcomes on the training effectiveness. Feldman and March (1981) and Pfeffer (1981) proved that trainees’ motivation to maximize their learning experience from the training programs and transfer the learned lessons to their jobs is highly influenced by the managements’ “intentional or unintentional” signals such as involving them in the design of the strategy and listening to their feedback on what to include and what not to in the training strategy. As Baldwin and Magjuka (1991) argue, the involvement of the trainees at this stage enhances their knowledge about its importance for their career and personal development. Evidence from Hicks and Klimoski (1987), and Baldwin and Magjuka (1991) prove that inclusion of trainees in the design phases of the training strategy is a very important element that enhances the effectiveness of training programs. This gives the trainees the chance to be involved in identifying their training needs on the one hand, on the other; it fosters their understanding of the importance of the training program in improving both their performance and improving their chances of getting promotion opportunities.
2.5 The link between Contextual Factors and Training Effectiveness

Determining the organizational training needs and training effectiveness

One of the most critical elements that are related to training strategy and determining its effectiveness is the evaluation of the organization’s training needs. Some organizations spend tremendous amounts of money and resources on training programs that deliver little of what their organizations initially need (Barney 1991, Filipczak 1994). Hence, they actually consume significant financial resources and produce nothing in return of relevance to their organizations. Therefore, it is crucial that a careful and systematic analysis of the training needs is conducted before investing in any training activities, and before structuring any training strategy. Arthur and Bennett (2003) argue that the training strategy should be aligned with the vision, mission and long term goals of the organization. The training needs assessment is a vital component of an effective training strategy and design since it determines both the strategic goals of the organization and its operational weaknesses, and steers its attention to the specific skills it needs to develop (Goldstein and Ford 2002, McGehee and Thayer 1961).

Morano (1973) suggests that there are three methods that can assist in deciding the actual and urgent training needs of the organizations. (1) surveys, (2) manpower analysis, and (3) organizational analysis. Morano (1973) argues that it is important to identify the best people in the organization who know what the training needs of the organization are and then survey them to identify the most important and urgent training needs. These are normally human resource or strategy managers who are familiar with the weaknesses and strengths of their human capital and are in the best position to tackle them. Relying on their opinions and suggestions of what the organizational needs are will guide and direct the training strategy towards the overall objectives of the organization and align them. Hence, the training strategy comprises of the crucial components and elements that the organization wants to reach. After identifying the basic organizational needs, conducting a manpower analysis is the second step. It will give a holistic micro-picture on the important skills that the employees lack and the areas that the training
programs can focus on. Employees should be consulted on their training needs and their supervisors are the main players who could help them identify their major weaknesses and direct them towards relevant training sessions. The third element that can assist in determining the training needs of organizations is organizational analysis which is described by Bass and Vaughan as: "...[it] involves a study of the entire organization- its objectives, its resources in meeting its objectives, and the total socio-economic and technological environment within which the organization exists. This kind of analysis helps answer its question of what is to be taught in terms of broad content areas.” (p. 76). This is probably the most difficult part in the process of assessing the organizational training needs. It looks from a macro-level at the overall strategic goals of the organization and its long term goals and determines what strategic training needs can lead to those objectives.

Kirkpatrick and Kirpatrick (1998) argue that training strategies should identify the needs of both the organization and the employees who take place in the training programs. There are five major steps that should be taken to determine organizational needs: (1) Asking the participants directly. Kirkpatrick and Kirpatrick (1998) recommended that participants should be directly asked either through interviews or surveys about their training needs. The questions should simply determine what employees can do to better perform a job and what new skills they need to develop for that purpose. More importantly, the content of the training program should be constructed based on the employees’ needs. (2) Ask the bosses of the participants. This provides an objective view on the qualitative, quantitative or technical skills that employees need to develop in the short and long terms to achieve better performance and enhance their productivity. (3) Ask customers, peers and other stakeholders who are involved in one way or another in how the organization operates and what they think it still needs to improve and develop to take the organization a step ahead in its performance and operation. (4) Test the participants’ knowledge and skills through simplified tests that assess the employees’ acquisition of the required analytical and technical skills to perform their jobs. The results of these tests will be a significantly reliable element to
direct their training interests towards the areas that need further development and improvement. (5) Analyzing performance appraisal forms is another reliable measure to determine the training needs of the participants. They generally reflect both the strong and weak areas of each employee at the end of each year. Hence, organizations should consult these resources before they come up with a training strategy to enhance their chances of aligning organizational needs with training goals and; therefore, achieve the desired outcomes from the training programs.

Brown (2002) identifies four reasons why organizations have to clearly indicate in their training strategies the training needs that they need to address. (1) To identify the specific problem areas in the organization and address them: The top management and human resource management should pinpoint what the weaknesses of the organization and employees are and what would be the best training programs that can fill in those performance gaps. (2) To obtain the management’s financial support: if human resource management can prove to the top management the weaknesses that inhibit better performance and justify how the relevant training programs will solve these performance gaps, the top management will provide the necessary support to conduct the training program. (3) To be able to determine the costs and benefits of the training program: Brown (2002) makes a strong point with regard to the financial involvement of the training programs and how a coherent and well-designed training strategy can serve as a positive link between the top management and the human resource and line managers. Usually, it is hard for the HR managers to convince top management that training costs are actually an investment rather than a nuisance. However, in the absence of concrete and tangible evidence that shows both the cost analysis and cost benefit of training, and potential changes in the organizational performance, it is hard for top management to provide necessary financial support. The value of the training program should be aligned with the vision of the organization, and the judgment of the line managers.

Conducting needs assessment and making it an integral part of the organizational training strategy can be based on three steps according to Brown (2002). (1) Conducting an
organizational analysis that examines carefully the areas in which training should be performed and determines what exact skills, knowledge and new techniques employees should be acquainted with to perform their jobs more effectively and efficiently. Also, it is imperative to know the innovative practices that other competing organizations have implemented in order to be able to compete against them. This will require the introduction and implementation of new managerial techniques that employees should be trained for. (2) Task analysis focuses on the employees’ current skills, the requirements of the jobs they perform and the necessary skills to better perform that job. This further specifies the employees’ needs to improve their performance in the organization. (3) Individual analysis is the last element that Brown (2002) recommends to organizations and stresses on its adoption. It looks at the issue from a micro-level and assesses the needs of each employee and guides them towards the right training programs that can fill the gap in their skills and performance. Since employees differ in their strengths and weaknesses, individual analysis will satisfy the needs of each employee and provide them with an opportunity to enhance their productivity.

Supervisors’ role in motivating employees and its influence on training effectiveness

Various studies have found positive links between the managers’ support and role in motivating employees to effectively benefit from the training programs (Cohen 1990, Facteau et 1995), and also a positive one between training motivation and training outcomes and effectiveness (Tracy et al 2001). The more supportive the role of supervisors, the more focused, and goal oriented employees become. Weiss et al (1980) conducted an empirical study that investigated the impact of supervisors on subordinates’ attitudes towards their training programs. The findings of the study stated that employees with strong orientation and direction from their supervisors were more eager to participate in the training programs, and had specific targets they wanted to reach. Their supervisors helped them identify the weaknesses in their performance, and showed them what parts of the training program could strengthen these weaknesses.
Similarly, Farr and Middlebrooks (1990) argue that since supervisors are the closest to and most knowledgeable people about the employees’ performance, since they conduct the end of year review, they can easily pinpoint what their training needs are and how they can achieve the best outcomes from them. This direction towards the right training tools and mechanisms is a primary component in determining a successful strategy. Hence, supervisors are influential in convincing their employees that attending the training programs would be beneficial for their career development. As Noe (1986) argues, the employees’ level of motivation determines the training effectiveness. The higher the motivation of employees, the better their approach towards taking the most from the training sessions.

To better understand the influence of supervisors on employees’ motivation, Chaburu and Takleab (2005) conducted a comprehensive study in a US based organization which trained 119 employees. The objectives of these training programs were to improve the communication skills, and the implementation of best practices in running the services that were required to perform within their organizations. The surveys that were administered to these trainees targeted variables like the support of their supervisors and its influence on their motivation to attend the training programs. At the end of the training, another survey was undertaken, this time to gauge their learning experience from the training sessions. The findings of this study were consistent with the findings of other studies in the literature. Employees who were supported by their supervisors and were motivated to take part in the training sessions, benefited the most from the training programs. The results of these studies are robust and indicate that one of the most important training strategies that can strongly influence training effectiveness is the moral and psychological support of supervisors. The more motivating they are to their employees, the more influential the training programs become.
Training programs in the UAE

There is one major study that conducted a comprehensive research on the UAE’s private sector’s training programs (Wilkins 2001). This study found that more than 82 per cent of UAE private sector companies conducted an effective needs’ assessment which was significantly comparable to other European countries in which the range was estimated to be around 80 to 85 per cent (Wilkins 2001, Holden and Livian 1993). More importantly, the UAE companies relied on the same methods that were found to be the most reliable to effectively assess the training needs of the employees. These ranged from business plan analysis, direct requests from employees to attend trainings and address weaknesses in their skills, training audits’ results and line management requests (Wilkins 2001). These results form a very positive image about the ability of these private companies to assess the needs of their employees, improve their overall performance and strengthen their weaknesses.

How to develop a comprehensive and effective training strategy?

Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (1998) provide a set of criteria and steps that organizations should take into consideration while putting together their training strategy. If these steps are followed closely, the training strategy will result in an efficient and successful training program. The objectives target three areas: (1) to start with, the training strategy should have clear objectives and the results that the organization wants to accomplish. This is normally the overall return on investment that the organization expects from the training. (2) The strategy should explicitly reflect the new behaviors that need to be reflected in the behavior of the employees after they finish their training sessions. (3) The knowledge and skills that are significant to lead to achieving the desired results. Therefore, the clearer the training strategy, the more effective and focused the training programs become, and following these three measures will enhance the organization’s chance to improve its overall performance in the long run.
The other significant pillar of an efficient training strategy is the inclusion of specific subject contents. Content development should be put together with feedback and consultation with the supervisors and human resource directors, and should directly reflect the needs and objectives of the organization (Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick 1998). The training strategy should indicate the criteria that should be available in the trainers who deliver the training programs. This is equally important compared to content development. Trainers should have a strong command of the course they deliver and be able to demonstrate previous experiences in teaching the course and achieving high outcomes.

To ensure positive results and effective training, training strategies should emphasize the compatibility of the learning environment with the work setting (Goldstein 1984). The new skills that the trainees are taught during the training programs should reflect the needs within the organization and should enable the trainees to demonstrate and apply them in their daily operations. The ability to transfer learned lessons to the working context is essential, and it actually motivates trainees to exhibit and transfer them to others. Otherwise, it will just be a loss of time and resources. Noe (1986) calls this phenomenon the "environmental favorability" of training programs. If the training strategy covers the applicability of the organization’s work environment to the nature of the training programs, then it is highly probable that the training strategy will positively and significantly affect training effectiveness.

Quinones (1998) argues that the degree of participation given to employees and potential trainees in constructing the training strategy and discussing the organizational needs is crucial to establishing efficacy and positive returns of the training program. The same point is shared by Cotton (1988) who even goes further to suggest that participation in framing the training strategy should take both formal ways (like in meetings, brain storming sessions..etc) and informal (through phone calls, meetings in the hall...). This will ascertain that employees are an integral part of the decision making mechanism and their opinions and suggestions are fully taken into
consideration. This will reflect the comprehensive and multidimensional nature of the training program.

**Strategy design and Training Effectiveness**

The last thirty years have witnessed a significant increase in the number of publications related to training effectiveness and the design of training methodologies and strategies. There are six major reviews on training in the literature mainly those by: Goldstein (1980), Sales and Cannon-Bowers (2001), Wexley (1984), Tannenbaum and Yukl (1992), Burke and Hutchings (2007), Campbell (1971) and Latham (1988). Careful review of these studies provides sufficient knowledge about the issues that have to be taken into consideration while designing the strategy and conducting an evaluation of the training program. Generally speaking, this literature identifies the main elements that have to be included in any training strategy. In order to have a comprehensive design of a training strategy, it should be comprised of the following main components: (1) the evaluation criteria, (2) targeted skills or characteristics, and (3) delivery method and its applicability with the training delivery method (Edens and Bell 2003).

Planning for a coherent and clear training strategy is one of the first necessary steps that training managers take into consideration while creating a training strategy. As Tucker et al (2009) argues, the planning should start with the complete understanding of the objectives and reasons why an organization wishes to invest in training. Identifying the needs of the employees and their expectations should be clearly indicated in the training strategy as the first pillar. The second important factor Tucker et al (2009) mention is technology, the availability of adequate and pertinent technological devices. In fact, Ramirez (2008) argues that training and learning can be further facilitated by technological instruments that deliver the content in a more illustrative and clear manner. After the implementation of sufficient technological devices comes development. It focuses basically on the performance of the learning activities and the cost that it involves. Two other important steps follow which are implementation of the training programs and control
of their performance and overall operation. Shaw et al (2009) argue that training effectiveness is determined by the implementation of effective training strategy that takes into consideration the needs of the employees and their weaknesses.

The evaluation criteria are a critical component of any training strategy. Training evaluation should be a pivotal element in designing training strategy. It is an instrumental component in determining the effectiveness of the training programs (Ford and Salas 1993). It is the main deciding factor behind the success of the training programs that are delivered. There are various evaluative approaches that have been developed since the 1960s to measure the effectiveness and success of training programs (Kraiger et al 1993, Arthur and Gettman 2001). However, Kirkpatrick's (1996) four level model of training evaluation and criteria has been found to be the model that is widely used in the literature given its comprehensive and holistic approach in evaluating the results of a training program. Moreover, its simplicity is its distinctive feature from other approaches since it disseminates to people in a simple way training evaluation criteria that are comprehensive and inclusive. His methodology assesses the learning criteria of trainees (how much did they learn from the program?), behavioral criteria (what changes have been witnessed in their behavior when they came back to their jobs), results criteria (what are the overall influences of the training program on the organization) (Alliger and Janak 1989, Arthur et al 2003, Noe and Schmitt 1986). In fact, behavioral criteria are more reliable in identifying the influence of training on employees and the organization than the learning criteria, as Tannenbaum and Yukl (1992) argue that "trainee learning appears to be a necessary but not sufficient prerequisite for behavior change (p. 425). This is mainly due to the fact that the behavioral elements are determined by the environment where the trainee works. So if that environment is supportive and encouraging, then the trainee can transfer most of what he learns from the training program and vice versa (Sego and Smith 1995, Quinones 1997 and Facteau et al 1995).
Another critical aspect that the training strategy should consider in order to enhance training effectiveness is the way in which trainers present the training material. Available research ascertains that the way in which verbal presentations are conducted and the content of the material is put together affects significantly the outcomes of the training programs (Ware and Williams 1975, Van Dijk and Kintsch 1983). Trainers who influence trainees are those who are “expressive and organized” (Towler and Dipboye 2001). They have the ability to convey ideas in a coherent, eloquent and straightforward way and communicate effectively with the trainees (Meier and Feldhusen 1979). This might seem a minor issue, but it has proved to be an essential element in providing quality training and, therefore, should be considered while designing the training strategy.

Towler and Dipboye (2001) conducted a laboratory experiment where they tested to what extent the trainers’ expressiveness and lecture organizations influence the training effectiveness and outcome. The sample size was around 135 individuals who listened to two different kinds of presentations. One which was well-designed, the material well organized and prepared, and the presenter was very eloquent and exciting. The levels of interest in listening to his lectures and understanding the material were very high. Participants indicated that he motivated them to go along with his lecture, and the organized material made it much easier to focus and follow with the presenter during all the time of the training. However, the same group, on a different day, attended another training lecture by a different trainer who was less eloquent, inexpressive and disorganized in his presentation of ideas and arguments. Moreover, the material he had prepared was not systematic and lacked coherence and clarity. The levels of interest and excitement of this group fell significantly and they were very bored and uninterested in the material. This experiment proves that it is important to select trainers who can deliver the training programs in an effective and coherent way because this affects dramatically the levels of participation, motivation and involvement of the trainees in the sessions. Likewise, this affects the overall training effectiveness and its outcome on the behavior, thinking and knowledge of trainees.
Therefore, training strategies need to clearly specify the selectivity of trainees and the levels of their eloquence and delivery.

2.6 Leadership and Training Effectiveness

The existing managerial literature for both the public and private sector indicates that leadership plays a major role in guiding organizations towards achieving their goals (Chiaburu and Lindsay 2008, Clark et al 1992). The twenty first century is a century of substantial changes in the managerial and operational practices within both the public and private institutions (Yankelovich 1991). Competition in the global economy and among countries in general, leads to competition among governments in the way they manage their resources and try “to do more with less” (Vass 1985). Lercel and Field (1998) state that in order to be competitive, organizations in general and public ones in particular have to have leaders at every managerial level. This will allow a streamlined process whereby leaders influence their colleagues and empower them to give the best they have to their organization.

Hence, training and preparing capable leaders has become one of the first priorities of the modern governments, especially in the United States and Europe. This part of the literature review will shed light on two issues that are closely related and significantly affect training effectiveness: (1) the importance of building the leadership skills of trainees within public organizations and its influence on the overall effectiveness of the training programs, (2) the role and the support of the organization’s leadership in the success and effectiveness of training strategies and programs. Effective leadership plays an instrumental role in framing the training strategy and also in setting a clear and coherent strategy. Gilley et al (2009) prove in their research that organizational leadership is instrumental in setting the direction of the training programs and also helping the organizations reach their full potential. Their study relied on a sample of 513 employees in a private organization which reflected that leadership is one of the essential elements to secure the success of the training programs.
Scaduto et al (2008) indicate that the social exchanges in the work environment have not been examined or given importance in the same way the organizational and technical issues have been looked at. Their study focuses on examining to what extent leaders play an important role in motivating the exchange and transfer of knowledge among each other. The reason why the social aspects are given priority now is that many training programs did not lead to the results that were expected from them. The study Scaduto et al (2008) conducted relied on a sample size of 495 employees and tried to capture the impact of motivation, the existence of effective leadership and the support of the organization to its employees to attend training and, more importantly, transfer their learning to other employees in their organizations to maximize their benefits. The study concluded that there was a strong positive correlation between the leaders' motivation for training and knowledge transfer within the organization.

Leadership and Organizational Effectiveness

Leadership is defined in different ways by various scholars. But before indulging on how leadership has been defined in the existing literature, it is important to point out that the term leadership has sometimes been used in different contexts to represent different things (Chiaburu and Harrison 2008). A comprehensive study conducted by Rost (1991) relied on a sample size of 587 workers who used the term “leadership” and tried to identify what exactly they meant by it. The findings of his study indicate that 366 employees did not associate any specific meaning to the word. The other 221 employees in his sample generally meant by the word “leadership” the leader’s behavior, characteristics and capability to influence others. Lohman (1992) considers leadership as the “formulation of a vision, developing a climate of trust within the organization, and empowering others” (p. 59). Leaders are unique individuals who take the lead within their organizations and are driven by their vision to make their working environment a better place of interaction and continuous learning. They share their knowledge with others and ascertain that they establish trust and a spirit of empowerment among their colleagues at work. Northouse (1997), defines leadership as a “process” that allows individuals to influence each other in a
positive way in order to achieve the desired outcomes for the organization and, at the same time, improve the skills of individuals within that organization. Avolio (1999) provides a slightly different definition of leadership as he focuses more on the change in the attitudes of those the leader leads. He defines leadership as a "systematic relationship in which no leader leads without followers" (p. 3). Therefore, measuring the effectiveness of a leadership program should be achieved by measuring the change and improvement in the behavior of the followers and not on that of the leaders. This is an important point since most of the available studies in the literature focus on the leaders and their capability to acquire the necessary skills and requirements of leadership and transfers them to their teams.

Traditional training programs focus merely on filling the minds of trainees with concepts and facts that they would need to be accustomed to in order to get their work done effectively (Hutchins and Burke 2007). However, they did not invest in building their leadership skills and equipping them with the necessary skills to take prudent and responsible decisions within their organizations (Fiedler 1996). Recently, organizations have recognized the lack of leadership skills in their employees and started to invest in capitalizing in these skills by sending their employees to training and educative programs where they can learn how to become leaders in their workplace (Conger and Benjamin 1999). They have reached the conclusion that "average persons" can be taught interpersonal relationship skills to take leadership positions and demonstrate their ability to lead in their job. Lippit (1993) points out that the objective behind leadership training programs is to strengthen the personal skills of employees and increase their performance. It targets two skills: (1) what should be done, and (2) how to do it. Public organizations have reached the fact that effective leaders are one of the most significant competitive advantages that they should create (Fiedler 1996). Krohn (2000) argues that "people are the only assets with the creativity and adaptive power to sustain organization’s success in today’s dynamic business world" (p. 63).
In fact, Gibler et al (2000) predict that organizations’ leadership training budgets would increase gradually during this decade. This reflects the significance of leadership skills in the new managerial environment, especially of the public sector. Cogner and Benjamin 1999 argue that leadership education is a collective rather than an individual undertaking as “teaching and educating leaders is “no longer focused on individual learners but increasingly on shaping the world views and behaviors of cohorts of managers and even on transforming entire organizations (p. xii). Moreover, Herling (2000) considers developing a workforce and working environment that fosters the spirit of leadership as a criterion for improving the overall organizational effectiveness. He states that: “it is the development of workforce expertise that is becoming vital for organizations to adapt to change and maintain optimal organizational performance (p. 9). Research has constantly proved that the existence of strong leadership in public sector organizations provides a higher quality of delivered services, and for the organization it achieves: “...a sense of cohesiveness, personal development, and higher levels of satisfaction among those conducting the work; and it provides an overarching sense of direction and vision, an alignment with the environment, a healthy mechanism for innovation and creativity, and a resource for invigorating the organizational culture” (Wart 2003, p. 214).

This is an indication that implementing a spirit of leadership in training programs and training employees accordingly achieves positive results for both the organizational performance and higher personal development for its employees. Furthermore, Bruke and Day’s (1986) conducted a comprehensive research that was based on 70 studies which proved that leadership and managerial training was a very effective tool that significantly improved the performance of organizations and provided clarity in the way things were conducted.

Bass (1985) enumerates the characteristics of the transformational leader and argues that this leader adds substantial value to the organization. This leader has four unique aspects that make him influential in his organization: (1) charisma: which provides the sense of vision and pride for the leader and makes others respect and appreciate him within the organization. (2) Inspiration:
instills in the others the energy and self-confidence required to get their work done. This is a crucial component to empower and encourage others to give the best they have. (3) Intellectual stimulation: encourages critical thinking and makes his team think out of the box and improve their problem solving skills. (4) Individual considerations: provides personal advice and coaching to each employee and makes them feel that they are important and deserve time and attention. In fact, these characteristics of transformational leaders are prerequisites for organizational success and will empower the workforce to offer the best they have.

Despite the positive results of the leadership training programs, it is crucial to indicate that some of the available literature about leadership training produces conflicting and sometimes confusing results. This was voiced by numerous authors in the literature. For example, Klenke (1993) argues that leadership was still a field that is “riddled with paradoxes, inconsistencies and contradictions”. Campbell (1971) describes it as “voluminous, non-empirical, non-theoretical, poorly written and dull” (p. 565). Also, Porter and McKibbin (1988) observe that “leadership education has been less effective than instruction in quantitative areas” (p. 65).

Other studies that have been conducted to review the relationship between leadership training effectiveness or organizational performance have concluded that the results are not robust enough to determine the existence of a strong positive relationship between managerial leadership training and organizational effectiveness (Burke and Day 1986, Bass 1990 and Gordon 1985). Lippit (1993) discusses the problems that he thinks hinder the effectiveness of training programs and their success; he outlines the following reasons for that:

1. The available time frame for the instructors is not enough to transmit the desired leadership qualities. Hence, this creates a significant limitation in achieving the training programs’ objectives.
2. The exercises that trainers use do not reflect the everyday life situations and also, the trained leaders find it hard to apply what they have learned in their jobs.
3. For trainees, leadership training is considered as a “pre-leadership” exercise since they were preparing themselves to take the bigger leadership responsibilities.

4. Leadership training does not necessarily add much value to the personality of the trainee which has been shaped over years of personal and societal development. Therefore, it is difficult to quantify the real additions and values of the leadership training.

5. Real life is not an ideal place where new leaders can practise their newly acquired leadership skills since they are confronted with other people’s egos and personalities. In fact, Lippit’s (1993) arguments are direct and shed light on the most mentioned and discussed issues in the available literature regarding the value add of leadership training programs to the organizations.

2.7 Effective Training Influences Organizational Performance

How are Training programs linked to Organizational Performance?

The 21st century has witnessed dramatic political, economic and managerial changes. One major shift is the one into knowledge economy (Powell and Snellman 2004). Competition among countries and organizations is no longer determined by who owns more natural or financial resources, but who acquires more innovative and creative ideas. Therefore, it is crucial that public organizations equip their employees with the skills that will allow them to be creative and innovative members of their organizations and contribute to their overall success and excellence in service delivery.

A recent study was conducted by Alexandros et al (2008) to see what factors affect training effectiveness and organizational performance. This study covered around 134 employees and evaluated the impact of training on the performance of employees. The results of the study indicated that there was a strong correlation between their training effectiveness and their job commitment, job satisfaction and motivation. They found a very strong relationship between
motivation, commitment and job satisfaction which is very similar to other previous studies that reached the same conclusion and findings as Tsai et al 2007, Pool 2007 and Sirota et al 2005).

One of the main attributes of training programs is to build strong, competent and qualified personnel in the private and more importantly the public sector (Healy 2001). The main core of any organization is its human capital, and the strength or weakness of this capital is immediately mirrored in the overall performance of the organization and its success or failure at the end of the day. Mentz (1997) argues that improving public service and the quality of its delivered services is strictly contingent on the effectiveness of the training programs that are provided to its employees. In fact, globalization not only came up with new technologies and organizational changes that facilitated the way employees get their work done, but also with a fast pace with which change occurs. Organizations have to constantly introduce new managerial practices and instruments in order to be more competitive and successful. Hence, both private and public organizations have to constantly compete in order to provide the cheapest products or the best services to the general public. That in turn relies not only on the provision of training programs, but significantly on the effectiveness and quality of these training programs.

Both developing and developed countries suffered from the ineffectiveness and low quality of their training programs. There is a significant body of literature which discusses the reasons why training programs in developing countries do not lead to the desired outcomes. Reilly (1987) and Hulum (1990) both argue that most training programs in developing countries have failed to achieve their expected results due mainly to their inability to design a training program that targets specific objectives.

Healy (2001) states that various training programs were offered at government organizations in some developing countries but they were very ineffective in the sense that they were very theoretical and too broad, and were not directed towards achieving any specific objectives. The training programs were not responsive to the needs of the employees since there was no
identification of their needs or the weaknesses they had, and there was no coordination among the different stakeholders within the organization. Therefore, as Zinyemba (1994) argues, significant financial resources, time and efforts were wasted in a training program that was not well-designed, inefficient and did not conduct a prior analysis to identify the shortfalls in the knowledge and experience of public servants in Zimbabwe to, therefore, address these weaknesses and strengthen them with a well-focused and targeted training program. In order to maximize the effectiveness of these training programs and ultimately organizational effectiveness, Binsted and Stuart (1979) proposed three main elements that have to be taken into consideration in future training programs in Zimbabwe: (1) content of the training programs, (2) process and (3) environment. These three components have to be carefully scrutinized, especially during the design phase, since the training program has to be closely aligned with the context of the organization, the needs of the employees and the areas of development they want to strengthen, and the overall environment within the organization.

The evaluation of the program and to what extent it succeeded or failed to achieve the desired changes within the organization was measured by 4 factors that McCourt and Sola (1999) identified: (1) the immediate reaction of the participants in the training session and whether or not they felt that the training helped strengthen the weaknesses they previously had. (2) The lessons learned from the training and whether or not they have advanced their knowledge about their area of specialization and if they learned something new. (3) If the participants in the training witnessed any change in their behavior towards identifying and solving problems. (4) Evaluation of the impact of the training program on the overall performance of the organization. These four steps contributed significantly to determine to what extent the training was effective in addressing the objective it had been set up for, and also helped recognize the shortfalls in the existing program and what Zimbabwean public servants suggested to make the program more effective.
The field of human resource management has continuously focused on the role of individual employees in determining the overall performance of their organization (Schmitt and Schneider 1984). The concentration on the micro-level of performance allows human resource managers to identify the strengths and weaknesses of their most valuable resources—which are humans—and strengthen them to enhance their output. Wexley (1984) makes a very important remark regarding the link between effective training and organizational performance when he said that: “...research is needed to develop a better understanding of how inefficient organizational units should be pinpointed and, when they are, how to determine whether training is the optimum solution to the performance problem” (p. 521). This indicates the importance of developing new tools to identify ineffective units in an organization and whether or not their ineffectiveness can be a result of a malfunctioning workforce. This in turn can be attributed to a variety of reasons such as their skills no longer match the new requirements of the organization or the selection process did not successfully assess their contribution to the organization. Yet, Wexley (1984) states that it is also important to determine whether training can be a reliable tool to address the identified shortfalls in employees’ skills within the organization. Various studies answered Wexley’s question and found that effective training can be a formula to improve the employees’ poor performance. For example, Goldstein (1980) and Campbell, Dunnette, Lawler and Wick (1970) provided ample evidence in this regard and demonstrated that organizations are actually the first and last components to blame for the active or negative performance of their employees. If they consider training programs as an investment and not a cost and bring experts in the field to coach and update the knowledge and capacities of their employees, then this will undoubtedly be reflected in the way they get their assignments and work done. They would rely on the most efficient practices and avoid redundancies and repetitions, and value quality over quantity in their work. Therefore, they end up saving the organization both money and costs of operations and, more importantly, the time required to finish a certain assignment. Campbell et al’s study (1970)
proves that individuals’ behavior within an organization is something that can be changed if the right training programs are provided and their shortfalls are rightly identified and addressed.

Organizational effectiveness can also be achieved by aligning the objectives of the organization with those of the training programs. This achieves focus and direction to the training programs and ensures that they specifically target the objectives of the organization rather than being so general and unfocused. The alignment of training objectives with those of the organization is a strategic way to ensure that the employees acquire and learn the skills the organization needs in order to enhance their efficiency in service delivery and also to support the growth and sustainability of their organization. Steer (1977) did a comprehensive research in this regard and managed to identify specific steps that organizations need to set up before designing their training model. There are three major steps which are: (1) goal optimization, (2) a systems perspective, and (3) the desired behaviors and skills of the employees are clearly articulated in the training plan and are aligned with the broader goals of the organization. This ensures that the organizations benefit fully from their training programs and maximize the gains from them, and, at the same time, provide the opportunity for their employees to improve their skills and get the chance to work within a well-structured and balanced system.

Moreover, Likert (1967) provides a list of other requirements that have to be considered with training programs which include motivating employees to be active players in the training programs and maximize their learning, open communication channels to facilitate the learning experience and share the newly acquired knowledge and techniques with other employees in the organization, and inclusion of employees in the decision making process regarding what training programs should be provided. Basically, the general context and environment of the organization has to be taken into consideration in order to make the best out of the training programs and to secure a better performing organization as Baumgartel and Jeanpierre (1972) argue.
Russel et al (1985) conducted an important study that examined the relationship between the importance of training in certain units within organizations, their implementation of best practices in training and the overall performance of the whole organization. This allowed them to compare and contrast among the units who had effective training practices and the implication of that on their positive or negative performance. Russel et al's study is of great significance since it fills a big gap in the existing management literature by focusing on individual employees' performance and its implication on the whole organization. They relied on Hinrichss (1976) approach in looking at the influence of training from a holistic perspective and targeting the performance of the whole organization as a result of implementing specific training methods and practices. This method addresses one major point which is: weak-performing organizations are those who do not consider training as a significant component of their strategy. Their study relied on a sample of 62 retail stores that belong to the same organization in the United States to which they administered a comprehensive survey that captured and measured three components: (1) The extent to which the organizations emphasized training programs as a strategy to enhance performance, (2) the satisfaction of employees from the training they received and (3) the overall performance of the organizations in terms of improvement of sales for each employee. The results of this study found considerable positive links between the effectiveness of training programs and the overall performance of the organization. They found that the performance of each unit within the organization achieved different performance scores based on the availability or absence of training programs. Those which achieved high performance had also positive correlations between the effectiveness of their training programs and their sales volumes.

Numerous studies previously confirmed that the training programs which give the trainees the chance to get enough constructive feedback and have their performance evaluated tend to bear more positive results (Irwin 1993). Olivero et al (1997) examined how training and coaching of public sector managers and executives improved their performance and that of their organizations. The contribution of their research to the available management literature is that it
assessed the impact of one-on-one executive coaching and determined to what extent that practice was useful in strengthening the skills and addressing the weaknesses of these public sector managers. The sample size of this study consisted of thirty one managers who went through a conventional training program and eight weeks one-on-one coaching program. Both the training and coaching program were designed to have various measures to secure their effectiveness. They emphasized: (1) goal setting, (2) collaborative problem solving, (3) practice, (4) feedback, (5) supervisory involvement, (6) evaluation of end results, and (7) public presentations. These seven elements which comprised this training program aimed at achieving the highest levels of efficiency on the one hand, and on the other, targeting various aspects of the psychological and intellectual traits of the managers (Olivero et al 1997). This training program had two phases:

1. The first phase consisted of three days of classroom activities, workshops, exercises and debates. The subject matter of these activities was determined by the objectives of the organization from these trainings and the expected skills they wanted the managers to acquire. Therefore, they were taught the best managerial practices and were trained to reflect on their current positions, the skills they had, the weaknesses they suffered from and how they could improve their knowledge and transform their weaknesses into potential strengths. This exercise allowed them to strategically direct their attention towards empowering themselves and recognize the shortfalls they had. At the end of the training program, they filled in a questionnaire that measured to what extent the program was helpful in identifying their weakness and in helping them to address these weaknesses.

2. The second phase of the training program consisted of providing individual coaching to each manager. These coaching sessions emphasized on enhancing the quality of their performance, improving their productivity and overall effectiveness in getting their work done. These individual meetings between the coach and the managers allowed coherent,
straightforward and easy communication between the managers and their trainers who supervised their performance and guided them towards achieving their full potential (Olivero et al. 1997). The effectiveness of this training program and its influence on the performance of their public sector organizations is significantly important. Assessment of their performance after attending the training program indicated that it improved by 22.4 per cent. More importantly, when coaching was combined with training, productivity increased by four times reaching 88 per cent (Olivero 1997). This very substantial increase in productivity is mainly due to the well-designed training program that targeted the seven most important factors that trainees need to address. Also, personal coaching was an essential part of the program as it gave every manager that chance to discreetly discuss his weaknesses with the coach and get precise advice on how to tackle them. Accordingly, the effectiveness of the training program affected very positively the public organization as the productivity of these managers was assessed to have increased by 80 per cent, which is an extremely important improvement.

During the early twentieth century, public organizations figured out that they needed to adopt various "performance-enhancing" and "progressive" human resource techniques to be able to compete nationally and globally (US Department of Labor 1993). Hence, this gives a push towards more investment in Research and Development especially in the management perspective. Pfeffer (1994) argues that employee empowerment, inclusion in decision making within the organization and provision of excessive training programs improve not only the performance of the individual employees and strengthen their feeling of belonging to the organization, but also secures the overall excellence of the organizational performance and its growth. Moreover, MacDuffie (1995) and Arthur (1994) reported significant positive relations between training and organization performance in US organizations. The more employees are equipped with updated managerial skills the more their impact on organizational performance increases. Hence, they strongly advise public sector organizations to re-evaluate their HRD
strategies and emphasize the provision of more training opportunities for employees, regardless of their rank or contribution to the organization where they work. Public organizations begin to witness substantial improvement in their performance once they consider their human capital as the driving force behind the success of the organization, and also consider investment in their capacity development as an investment and not a cost.

The HRM literature is rich with abundant studies that have constantly examined specific aspects of HRD, especially the impact of effective training programs on organizational performance. Bartel (1994) and Knoke and Kalleberg (1994) stated that it is pivotal for organizations to regularly conduct a review of their employees’ needs and provide annual training sessions that strengthen their weaknesses and update their knowledge of the latest managerial practices. In what concerns the relationship between training and organizational performance, Delney and Huselid (1996) conducted an extensive study that covered more than 590 public non-profit organizations in the United States to determine the correlation between Human Resource Management practices, mainly training and staffing effectiveness, on the overall performance of these organizations. They believe that it is important that organizations make the right selection during the hiring process to employ the best qualified and best performing individuals. And since it is sometimes difficult to distinguish between a well and non-performing candidate among ones who all have the same qualification, they suggest that training is the only effective measure to improve their skills and address the gaps in their performance. However, they warned that if the motivation level of employees is not kept at high levels, then their performance would not necessarily witness any improvement in the short or the long run.

The main hypothesis that Delney and Huselid (1996) have tested in their research is their assumption that there is a strong positive relationship between individual HRM practices, mainly effective training, and the firm level outcomes. This positive relationship is further strengthened by selecting the right individual employees for the right training programs. The results of their extensive research confirmed the fact that: “...people are the pre-eminent organizational resource
and the key to achieving outstanding performance” (p. 964). This is in relation to the positive correlations and relationships they found between the organizations’ adoption of progressive HRM practices, especially selectivity in staffing, provision of targeted training programs and motivational incentives, and the performance of the organizations that was assessed by the increase in their productivity and the efficiency of public service delivery.

Saari et al (1988) surveyed 611 public organizations in the United States and measured the effectiveness of the training programs that were offered to their employees, and also the education opportunities that were given to the best performing individuals within the organization. Their evaluation specifically addressed issues such as the criteria of selection of employees for appropriate training programs and also whether or not there was any kind of assessment of the results of the training sessions. The training programs that were provided differed from: executive MBA degrees, open enrollment short courses and customized programs that were determined by the organizations. Careful selection of training programs and their effectiveness in addressing the needs of the employees are crucial factors to determine the success of the training programs and achieving the desired positive change on the overall organizational performance. The authors found that one third of the 611 organizations conducted some sort of needs assessment and that the main criteria for the selection of employees for the training programs were their needs. The human resource management of these companies was responsive to building the skills the employees lacked and supporting their career development. In most of these companies, employees actually enrolled voluntarily for the programs they thought would add value to their competencies and would enhance their roles within their organizational units. The assessment of the effectiveness of the training programs at the end of each session and consulting the employees on what they thought would contribute to better training programs, identified the areas that needed to be involved in the future training programs. These were strategic planning, managing people and functional skills especially in IT areas (Saari et al 1988). The effectiveness of the training programs and the assessment tools undoubtedly
affected the way the organization performed in the short and long runs. The main lessons learned from this experience, like the previous ones presented in this literature review, is that effective training programs that mirror successful human resource management operations are one of the fundamental keys for the enhancement of organizational performance. The more solid, well-targeted and focused the training strategies are, the stronger the human caliber that forms these organizations and the faster they grow and perform.

Ownes (2006) establishes a coherent relationship between training and organizational outcomes. He states that training is considered a “vital function” for all organizations regardless of their specialization or size. But, at the same time, he reminds us that the evaluation of training programs is not an easy task. In his paper, he investigates the relationship and the impact of training programs on variables like job satisfaction, organizational commitments, organizational justice and turnover. His study seems to be more comprehensive and inclusive compared to the other studies conducted on the same topic. The variables he uses to measure the impact of training on the overall organizational performance give us a clear image and a more detailed analysis concerning the variables that are more specifically affected by the training programs. In this study, he expected that all the correlations would result in statistically significant positive relations among these variables and organizational performance. The sample size he relied on consisted of 218 employees from a US local government entity. The statistical analysis performed confirmed that there was a strong positive relationship between effective training and organizational success. Training also affected organizational justice since employees were trained on how to respect the rights of their colleagues and appreciate them. The contribution of his study to the available literature is significant since, unlike other studies, Owen’s demonstrated how training can affect the employees’ job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover rates and organizational justice which all showed a positive relationship with organizational performance.
Another interesting study was conducted by Klein and Weaver (2000) in which they examined the impact of attending an orientation-training program and the ability of employees to socialize and interact effectively with their colleagues at work. Effective socialization among employees in the public sector has been identified as one of the most effective ways to enhance their organizational commitment, productivity and; hence, affect organizational performance as a whole (Allen and Meyer 1990, Fisher 1986). The sample size of the group consisted of 116 new employees in various departments in public sector organizations who were assessed in their ability to socialize before and after attending the orientation training session. These training programs are different from other traditional training programs in the sense that they introduce new employees to their job and their colleagues and ascertain that they are acquainted with the general atmosphere where they will conduct their jobs. The effectiveness of these programs in improving the effectiveness of organizations in general has been supported by numerous studies (Chatman 1991, Saks 1996). The first hypothesis that this study tests is that employees who attend the orientation training day will be more sociable and get along more easily with their peers at work. The second hypothesis predicts that the employees who attend the training will be more productive, have a strong sense of belonging to their new working environment and positively influence organizational performance. The findings of this study indicate that attending the training program enhanced the attendants’ awareness about their organization’s vision and mission and the direction it wanted them to take. Results also show a strong positive relationship between the training session and the organizational commitment and productivity of the employees.

In fact, the careful selection of the content, material and instructors who deliver the program is an essential step towards securing the effectiveness and success of these training programs. Focused programs ensure that they familiarize the employee with various aspects of his job description, share past experiences of other employees who were there before him, and provide moral and psychological support, especially during the first months of the job.
This will give the employee a good start in the organization and encourage him to provide the best he can to the organization. This is where the effect of the training on organizational performance appears.

**Training and Organizational Effectiveness in the Arab World: Aspects and Realities**

The Middle East and especially the Gulf countries also believe that the introduction and implementation of new managerial models would result in positive outcomes for their organizations (Zoubi 1982). The discovery of abundant oil revenues allowed the Gulf countries to build modern states in less than thirty years, which is an unprecedented developmental achievement. They managed to utilize their financial surpluses to attract and implement the best managerial practices in their public and private organizations and sustain an increasing level of development. Other Middle Eastern countries have also been trying to move from the traditional and bureaucratic models, towards more managerial and result-based ones. Hence, the late 80s were called “the decade of administrative development” (Zoubi 1982). It is important to indicate at this point that although there is a huge body of literature that addresses the causal relationship between training programs and organizational effectiveness, there is a dire paucity and dearth in such research within the Middle East and North Africa region. This is mainly due to the lack of importance given to research and development on the one hand, and also the absence of skilled human resource managers who would implement these practices within both public and private organizations (Atiyyah 1991, Ali and Maglhaes 2008).

Among the few studies that exist on the topic, Abdalla and Al-Hamoud (1995) conducted an interesting and comprehensive study in the state of Kuwait. They surveyed both public and private organizations and identified the prevalent trends in human resource management practices. Precisely, they looked at the training needs of the employees, the selection criteria of the employees who participated in the training courses and the evaluation of training programs in general. Conducting such a research project helps to survey the existing HR practices in the
region and provides recommendation on how to move ahead. The authors built their theoretical framework from the existing literature and the experiences of countries in the west, notably the United States. They carefully scrutinized its model and drew from it what they thought was applicable and consistent with the region of the Middle East. The research methods adopted in this study were mainly surveys that were administered to 69 public organizations and comprised items that assessed: (1) to what extent the training programs corresponded to the needs of candidates for the training programs, (2) the selection of employees for the training, (3) the types of training programs that were offered and the goals they targeted, (4) what participants suggested in the future to improve the quality of the training programs.

The results of this study were not consistent with the results of most studies conducted in the West. Authors found that in almost all the government departments that were surveyed (96 per cent), there were no particular procedures that would identify the training and educational needs of the employees. Authors consider these results as “strikingly low compared to the situation in the United States”, where organizations made sure that the training needs of their employees were assessed properly to make the training programs both efficient and effective. The authors ascribe this low performance to the cultural, political and economic uniqueness of the region of the Middle East in which new managerial and training practices were still newly introduced. Actually, Abdalla and Al-Hamoud (1995) rightly argue that the absence of “systematic” needs assessment is a serious issue that jeopardizes the success of the organizations’ efforts to improve their management practices and enhance their overall performance. This is basically the case because the right people were not placed in the right programs as their needs were not objectively assessed against the provided programs. Hence, these organizations risk spending huge amounts of money for training programs that most likely would not bear any positive fruit, either for the individuals who attend them or for the organization’s performance. Moreover, in what concerns the selection of appropriate training programs, it was found that the executive educational
programs that were highly utilized and proved to be very efficient in the west were not adopted in the state of Kuwait.

Another strong shortfall that this study identified in the experience of the Kuwait government in applying effective training methods is the absence of evaluation mechanisms for the effectiveness of the training programs. 93 per cent of organizations indicated that they had not developed any tool to assess the success of the training sessions in addressing the goals they were established for. This, according to the authors, was mainly due to the fact that the design of these programs did not follow the systematic and procedural steps that were followed in the west. Training programs are implemented just to imitate the western experience in improving organizational performance without really believing in achieving the same thing in the state of Kuwait. Therefore, these organizations not only missed the opportunity of evaluating the results of their programs and the worthiness of the funds they spent on it, but also missed opportunities for improving these programs and identifying the reasons behind their underperformance (Abdalla and Al-Hamoud 1995). The last part of the study targeted the future trends that employees within these organizations wished to enhance and these were: strategic planning and performance appraisal, improving their technical skills such as report writing and presentation skills.

The importance of this case on Kuwait is that not only does it reflect the status quo in the government of Kuwait and the way training programs were managed, but is also the case in the rest of Arab countries. The identified deficiencies were particularly significant in the training needs assessment and in the evaluation process of the training programs. The authors tried to interpret these mediocre results by referring to the overall Middle Eastern culture that did not attribute much significance to the crucial role of education and training in forming the behaviors and attitudes of employees and strengthening their managerial weaknesses.

The United Arab Emirates stands as an exemplary case within the Middle East and North Africa region. The vision of HH Sheikh Mohamed Bin Rashid Al-Maktoum, the Ruler of Dubai and the
Prime Minister of the UAE enabled the government entities in Dubai to adopt the best training techniques and methods (Al-Sabri 2006). Dubai implemented various organizational practices that enhanced the quality and effectiveness of training programs and attracted consultants from various parts of the world to deliver world-class quality programs. The adoption of international best practices added more efficiency and effectiveness to the programs delivered to public sector officers and allowed them to maximize the utilization of their skills and unleash their potential. Al Sabri (2006) indicates that training effectiveness is ensured and monitored by the UAE’s Institute of Administrative Development. It adopts a very systematic approach in identifying the training needs of all government entities in the country and even provides technical support in satisfying those needs. Moreover, to achieve the desired quality from the training programs, instructors were selected based on their seniority and also capability to develop well targeted and designed programs that match the global level in quality and effectiveness. The effectiveness of the training programs was reflected in the improved performance of the public sector organizations in the whole UAE, as the number of government entities who were awarded ISO (9001-2000) increased significantly due to well performing workforces in these organizations. These training institutions focus also on evaluation of the training as a whole and ensure that it meets the best international standards, and also evaluates the trainees and their attendance, participation and attention to the programs, and their suggestions are taken into consideration in order to improve the overall quality of the training programs in the future.

Despite UAE’s image as the third biggest supplier of oil in the world, and a country with world class Emirates like Dubai and Abu Dhabi, there is a drastic scarcity of research related to both private and public sector organizations’ management. Very few studies have been conducted on the training practices in the private sector which are mainly by Wilkins (2001). He conducted a comprehensive study in the UAE that surveyed private institutions and investigated their organizational policies and strategies, their training strategies, educational development, methods of training that were used, selection criteria for trainees, and evaluation of training programs. The
survey was sent to 99 companies with a response rate of 22 per cent. The reasons behind the low response rate were mainly due to confidentiality issues and policies that did not allow the surveyed companies to fill in the survey.

This study revealed some interesting insights concerning the training practices in the UAE. The budget spent on training varied significantly among the surveyed companies and was less than what companies spend in other western countries. 22 per cent of surveyed companies spent less than 0.5 per cent of their payroll on training, 22 per cent between 0.5 and 1 per cent, 17 per cent spent over 2.5 per cent and only one company declared that it spent more than 3 per cent (Wilkins 2001). Comparing these Figures to European countries reveals that France spends 32 per cent of its payroll on training, Sweden 25 per cent, the Netherlands 19 per cent and Germany 16 per cent (Wilkins 2001, Horwitz 1998, Brewster and Bournois 1993). Therefore, it is clear that the UAE’s companies are not competitive internationally in the percentage of wage bill spent on training and stand way too below international rates regarding the number of employees who receive training in these companies, Wilkins (2001) found that one third of the companies train less than a quarter of their employees, one-third gave training to a quarter and up to half of their employees, and the remaining one-third of the companies gave training to half of the employees (Wilkins 2001). These Figures are also significantly low compared to other western countries where more than half of the employees are trained annually (Horwitz 1998, Wilkins 2001).

Moreover of the training used within the companies; 91 per cent of companies chose to bring experts to deliver in house training sessions, while only 64 per cent relied on external institutions to deliver the training programs at their institutions. 59 per cent of respondents indicated that they regularly send their employees to conferences and seminars which they believe build their skills and contribute to professional development.

Concerning the content and evaluative processes of the training programs, the results of Wilkins’ (2001) paper reveal interesting findings. He found that 95 per cent of surveyed companies delivered skills development programs, 86 per cent of surveyed companies delivered training
programs that were job-specific, and that their main reason for investing in these trainings was to improve organizational effectiveness. In fact, these companies varied in their possession of evaluative processes to determine the effectiveness of the training programs. Some 86 per cent of the companies actually conduct evaluations for the in-company training programs, while only 59 per cent conduct a similar approach towards the externally provided training programs (Wilkins 2001).

The importance of leadership commitment in supporting and promoting training strategies

Leadership commitment to training programs is one of the fundamental elements for their success (Collins 2002). This is reflected in many aspects that this part of the literature review will discuss briefly. The commitment of top management is essential in, first of all, securing the necessary budget for the training (Ulrich et al 1999). This is one of the main obstacles that hinder training programs. It is hard to convince the top management of the outcomes of the training programs and their return on the efficiency and effectiveness of the service delivery mechanisms in the public organizations. Unlike private organizations which are the most concerned about keeping their productivity levels high, and do whatever it takes to ensure that. Public organizations, however, are not pressured to maintain high performance levels since they deal with the public and not customers (Hooijberg and Choi 2001).

Leadership support and commitment to training programs is important not only in the managerial and hierarchical aspect of the public organizations, but also in terms of establishing close and friendly relationships between the managers and their employees. It facilitates the knowledge transfer from supervisors to other employees through various techniques like monitoring, lecturing, observations and evaluating the improvement in the behavior and performance of employees (Bass 1997). The inclusion of leadership training practices and the support of the organizations, management and leadership are crucial elements that can significantly contribute to the effectiveness of training programs and lead to the promised organizational effectiveness.
2.8 Conclusion and initial model for the Dubai’s context

This comprehensively conducted literature review has resulted in two major conclusions: First, the available literature supports this study’s three hypotheses; (1) financial constraints and budgetary limits affect training effectiveness. This is a direct consequence of cutting down the allocated training budgets and sacrificing the quality of offered programs. It is crucial to conduct a thesis in this area as it illustrates the impact of such a crisis on a part of the world that is ill represented by the literature review. All studies are focused on studying the western part of the world and completely ignore the Middle East and North Africa region. Therefore, this thesis is a significant contribution to knowledge on the one hand, and the experiences of the Gulf on the other hand. This will be a valuable addition to the available literature in the MENA region and be a contribution also to the scholarly work in human resource management and training. Therefore, it is important to recognize its value as a future training material.

The applicability of this in the context of the government of Dubai is that it witnessed one of the worst financial crises in its history. This crisis limited the available funds for training and personal developmental projects and also affected the priorities of the government of Dubai. Hence, training could be one of the sacrificed projects. Moreover, the existing literature on the influences of financial crisis on training effectiveness, especially in the Gulf region, is extremely limited in quantity and quality. Therefore, this study will contribute to the available literature by filling this void and presenting the case of Dubai and UAE in this respect. (2) the available literature confirms that the training strategy and approach are both instrumental in deciding the overall training effectiveness. A precisely drawn and focused strategy will have positive implications on the training effectiveness. This will be investigated in the context of Dubai government, and the survey and focused groups will identify to what extent government entities in Dubai focus on establishing a coherent and comprehensive training strategy.
Again, there is a noticeable paucity of studies in the Gulf region that discuss and analyze this issue, and it is the objective of this study to play a role in enriching the available literature by focusing on the context of Dubai and the UAE, which share various characteristics with the rest of the Gulf region. (3) The covered literature also supports the hypothesis that effective training positively influences organizational performance. Skilled and knowledgeable employees play a dynamic role in improving the performance of their organizations and support their vision. Again, while conducting this review, it was very difficult to identify experiences from the Arab World in general and in the Gulf region in particular. Hence, conducting this study in the context of the UAE will further illustrate and prove either the positive or negative relationship between training and organizational effectiveness. Based on the previous assumptions and as per the results of the conducted literature review, I recommend the following Conceptual Framework to be used as the base Framework for this study. This Framework can be summarized as follows:

Effective training which has a positive impact on organizational performance can be achieved through visionary leadership committed to building and developing human capital. The leadership commitment should be translated into two folders: The first is “Strategy Development” in which training should constitute an essential element in the organizational strategy. The second is “Resources Allocation” in which leadership assures the provision of adequate resources (HR and Finance) to achieve the training strategy. Having the right strategy and the right resources in place will lead to development of proper training systems and approaches which, in turn, will ensure conducting effective training. This will eventually lead to improved organizational performance because trained HR will perform in a more effective manner and will be in a better position to achieve individual and organization objectives with continuous improvement and feedback.
Figure 11: Conceptual Framework for Training Effectiveness

Conceptual Framework for Training Effectiveness

- **Leadership Vision and Commitment**
- **Resource allocation (HR & Financial)**
- **Strategy Development**
- **Systems and Approaches**
- **Assessment and Review**
- **Effective Training**
- **Effective Organizational Performance**

Feedback

Continual Improvement
Chapter 3: Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction

The methodology adopted was to obtain information on training strategies and training effectiveness through the perception and evaluation of staff employed in the human resources and training department in Dubai government agencies.

The agencies involved in the study and the number of employees in each is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serial Number</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Annual Budget</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dubai Municipality</td>
<td>More than 5,000 employees</td>
<td>More than one Billion AED</td>
<td>Big Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dubai Electricity and Water Authority</td>
<td>More than 5,000 employees</td>
<td>More than one Billion AED</td>
<td>Big Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dubai Roads and Transport Authority</td>
<td>More than 5,000 employees</td>
<td>More than one Billion AED</td>
<td>Big Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Dubai Health Authority</td>
<td>More than 5,000 employees</td>
<td>More than one Billion AED</td>
<td>Big Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dubai Customs</td>
<td>500 - 5,000 employees</td>
<td>500,000 - one Billion AED</td>
<td>Medium Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Dubai Airports</td>
<td>500 - 5,000 employees</td>
<td>500,000 - one Billion AED</td>
<td>Medium Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Dubai Courts and General Prosecution Department</td>
<td>500 - 5,000 employees</td>
<td>500,000 - one Billion AED</td>
<td>Medium Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Community Development Authority</td>
<td>Less than 500 employees</td>
<td>less than 500,000 AED</td>
<td>Small Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Dubai Economic Department</td>
<td>Less than 500 employees</td>
<td>less than 500,000 AED</td>
<td>Small Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Dubai Land Department</td>
<td>Less than 500 employees</td>
<td>less than 500,000 AED</td>
<td>Small Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Dubai Tourism Department</td>
<td>Less than 500 employees</td>
<td>less than 500,000 AED</td>
<td>Small Size organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Knowledge and Human Resource Development Authority</td>
<td>Less than 500 employees</td>
<td>less than 500,000 AED</td>
<td>Small Size organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These represent the main government organizations shaping the future of Dubai. Their employees comprise 80% of the government workforce and they spend 85% of the training
budget of Dubai. Those organizations serve most of Dubai government customers and represent all the government and economic sectors.

In these organizations all managers in the human resources and training departments were selected for interviews. Thus there was no sampling procedure. The aim was to obtain information from all of the management personnel involved in the management of training and development activities. The number of management personnel in this category was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serial Number</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Number of HR and Training Managers</th>
<th>Number of Managers Completed the Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dubai Municipality</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dubai Electricity and Water Authority</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dubai Roads and Transport Authority</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Dubai Health Authority</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dubai Customs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Dubai Airports</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Dubai Courts and General Prosecution Department</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Community Development Authority</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Dubai Economic Department</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Dubai Land Department</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Dubai Tourism Department</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Knowledge and Human Resource Development Authority</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus 82% of the questionnaires sent were completed and returned.

This is a high response rate that leads to a high confidence level in the generalisability of the result. The high response rate is partly explained by the fact that the researcher is employed in the same organizations and has professional links with many of the target groups.
3.2 Objectives, Hypothesis and Data Collection

The questionnaire covers the following areas identified as relevant through the literature review and the pilot study:

1- Personal information (6 questions)
2- Organizational information (2 questions)
3- Training strategies employed (16 questions)
4- Training methods and approaches (29 questions)
5- The impact of financial stringency on training activities (9 questions)
6- The impact of training on organizational performance (11 questions)

The full questionnaire is to be found in Appendix 1. The questionnaire adopted a 5 point Likert scale measuring the strength of agreement with a series of questions relevant to the areas under study. The methodology selected was a structured questionnaire preceded by a pilot study and supplemented by 19 structured interviews with managers in human resources departments.

Thus the methodology adopted combines the advantages of a quantitative study which permits the assessment of the strength and frequency of opinions with the richness of the qualitative data derived from the interviews.

A second decision regarding the questionnaire was whether to complete the questionnaire in a face-to-face situation where the interviewer reads the questions and records the answers or to use a self-completion questionnaire sent to the selected respondents and returned by post.

Whilst the interview has a distinct advantage in allowing questions to be explained and a greater depth of response to be obtained (Reeves and Harper 1991 pp 89-92) and facilitates the establishment of a rapport which can enhance the quality of data, the self-completion method was adopted on practical grounds. Face -to-face interviews are time consuming and difficult to arrange when the target group is managers with heavy work schedules. Efforts were made to
ensure the quality of the responses to the self-completion questionnaire by talking to the respondents whenever possible by phone or face-to-face to engage their interest and to motivate them to complete the questionnaire. The high response rate is evidence of the success of this

3.2.1 The Pilot Study

The initial identification of the areas to be covered by the questionnaire and the preliminary formulation of the questions were informed by the experience of the researcher as a practitioner in the field and by the background and information from the review of previous research.

The draft questionnaire was discussed with 10 practitioners and academics in the HR field to refine and add to the questions and areas covered. This process led to the clarification of the questions to ensure that respondents would have a clear understanding of the questions in the self-completion questionnaire. It was considered that this preliminary work provided a sound basis for the formulation of the final questions.

3.2.2 The Main Survey

The fully developed questionnaire was sent by mail to the managers identified in each organization.

A phone call or personal contact a few days later was made to check that the questionnaire had been received, to answer any queries, and to ensure the cooperation of the respondent. Another phone call was made to the respondents who had not returned the questionnaire. As a result of the procedure identified earlier a response rate of 82% was achieved.

3.2.3 The Qualitative Phase: The In-depth Interviews

Supporting qualitative data was collected by means of 19 extended interviews with HR directors and managers. These managers had completed the main questionnaire. The interview centered on developing a discussion around the four key areas of the questionnaire but also encouraged them to speak more broadly about their work within the context of the financial stringency measures.
This qualitative data was valuable in interpreting and discussing the results of the analysis of the quantitative data.

3.2.4 The Timing of the Research

The pilot study was carried out during June 2011 and the result incorporated in the main questionnaire. The main survey was initiated at the beginning of July 2011 and completed by August. The qualitative stage consisting of the 19 extended interviews was carried out during the last week of September 2011.

3.2.5 A Note on the Sample

The study is based on organizations operating in Dubai and may not therefore be representative of the other six emirates which have their own characteristic government organizations.

Directors and managers in the government sector are largely Dubai nationals with only 5% of expatriates from countries like Lebanon and Egypt. This study is therefore a study of the views and responses of Dubai Nationals.

3.2.6 Reliability and Validity

Validity referrers to the extent to which the results of the study are a true picture of the area under study. With a study of this kind validity cannot be established with reference to independent criteria.

However it is hoped that the careful pilot work and the efforts to engage the respondents in the research process have led to responses and expression of views that are a true representation of the underlying state of affairs.

Reliability in a study of this kind is closely related to the concept of validity in that it refers to the extent that a measure taken at one point in time is capable of replication. It can be capable of replication only if it is a true representation of the underlying phenomena that the research is intending to capture. The most that can be said in the case of a study of this kind is that every
effort was made to ensure the validity of the questions, and cross referencing to the replies was carried out to ensure the internal consistency of the data.

The criteria for the selection of participating organizations were:

- These organizations represent an important sector to the present and future development of the Emirate of Dubai. The government of Dubai is seeking to build one of the most advanced and prosperous economic centers in the region and the world. Considering this ambition can only be realized by grounding every effort on solid scientific bases, the government encourages and assists in training efforts that meet the prerequisites of such an objective.

- The organizations that were sampled are important components of the government sector and serve the interests of the public. For example, The Executive Council, Dubai Chamber of Commerce, Road and Transportation Authority, Human and Knowledge Development Authority...etc.

- The geographic proximity of public organizations within Dubai is an important factor in conducting this study within the time constraint, and other requirements that facilitate the process of the study's survey questionnaire, interviews, and relevant data collected.

The analytical methodologies and statistical, descriptive and qualitative research methods used in this research are covered thoroughly in Johnson (2007). Descriptive statistics are used to show the trends in training, the impact of the financial crisis on the training in the public sector, the choices the majority of government entities used to reduce the impact of the crisis on their budgets. Moreover, the descriptive statistics methods, according to Johnson are essential to knowing what most of the training directors chose as an alternative for training.

Also, multivariate statistical methods were used this time to identify the relationship between variables.
ANOVA has been used in most of the analysis to test relations among more than one variable. Since there are three variables with sub variables, ANOVA has been applied with other analytical methods such as Cronbach’s Alpha.

3.2.7 The Construction of the Indices

The *Training strategy* variable is an index consisting of the 16 items of section 2 of the survey (variables V211_1 to V211_16 of the dataset). The Internal reliability of the variables was checked through Cronbach's Alpha, indicating high reliability (.881). For *Training Approach* variable, the index was based on the 27 items of section 3 of the survey (variables V215_1 to V215_27 of the dataset) Cronbach's Alpha indicated high reliability (.943). The *Financial crisis Impact* index variable was created from the 7 items of section 4 of the survey (variables V217_1 to V217_7 of the dataset). The Internal reliability is high (.820).

The index variable *Organization performance* was constructed from 11 items (section5). Here Cronbach’s Alpha indicated that the internal reliability is high (.947).

3.2.8 The Hypothesis

1st. hypothesis

First of all, we will check the relationship between different variables with the training strategy individually. Then we will check the relationship controlled by other variables.

H₀: Training Strategy and Training Effectiveness are unrelated

Hₐ: Training Strategy is correlated with Training Effectiveness

2nd. hypothesis

First of all, we will check the relationship between different variables with the Training Approach individually. Then we will check the relationship controlled by other variables.

H₀: Training Approach and Training Effectiveness are unrelated

Hₐ: Training Approach is correlated with Training Effectiveness
3rd Hypothesis:

H0: Training Effectiveness and Organizational Performance are unrelated

HA: Training Effectiveness is correlated with Organizational Performance

3.2.9 Basis of the Questionnaire:

The Questionnaire has been developed based on:

- Study Hypotheses

Three hypotheses were identified, they are:

a. Financial crisis influences training effectiveness (training budget)
b. Training strategy and approach influences training effectiveness
c. Effective training influences organizational performance

The empirical and original data part of the study was conducted in two parts: a general survey questionnaire and a series of follow-up interviews. The interviews involved 19 HR directors/managers who were broadly representative of the study's sample of the public sector at large. Interviews provided the qualitative data that was necessary to understand the situation on the ground. Furthermore, questions and answers allowed the researcher to have a better idea of the challenges that were actually facing the public sector at this time in Dubai government.

The survey questionnaire was addressed to directors or those in charge of HR with a cover letter explaining the research objectives and inviting and encouraging participants' response (See Appendix 1).

In general, the study concluded that the majority of respondents were HRM in charge of training activities, possessing the necessary requirements of this profession in terms of qualifications and skills.
This careful selection guaranteed that the questionnaire was targeted to the right people who were mainly involved in the preparation and design of training programs. Moreover, they were significant to determine the general impact of the financial crises on the annual training budget they received. 60 questionnaires were sent to all government departments in Dubai, and 49 questionnaires were returned with a response rate of 81%. This is an extremely high response rate given the difficulty researchers face in gathering data in the region. Usually, researchers get around 20% response rate. The very high response rate of this study confirms the accuracy and reliability of the data gathered from this questionnaire. This high rate is due to the reputation of the researcher and his well-established position in the government of Dubai.

A pilot questionnaire was sent to HR directors, consultants and training managers for their input, and also to academics outside the government. Most of their comments and opinions were useful and adopted by the researcher to enhance the quality of the questionnaire in its final form. Also, the researcher sought the advice of specialists in computer and statistics regarding the appropriate statistical techniques, and applied packages to this end. The survey has three major sections: The first captures the level of influence of the financial crisis on the government of Dubai and its various entities, especially on their training budgets. The second one asks specific questions about the way in which the training programs are designed and implemented in addition to the extent of the involvement of the top leadership in the process. Carefully designed training programs have strong influence on the results of the program and its effectiveness. The third part of the survey assesses the impact of training programs on organizational performance. This way of structuring the survey assisted in compiling significant data from these organizations and analyzing it to determine to what extent the financial crisis has influenced the training budgets and, hence, organizational performance.

In general, the questionnaire adopted the 5-points scale of Likert to measure the levels of agreement and disagreement of respondents to the different statements of the questionnaire.
- Interviews

The second tool used to get primary data was through in-depth interviews with 19 relevant stakeholders in the public sector during the period from 21st. to 28th. of September 2013. Mainly HR managers in Dubai’s government were contacted and interviewed to identify the current practices, trends and challenges that face the training after the crisis. The interviews were a very valuable tool as they allowed face to face conversations and question and answer methodology.

3.2.10 Data Collection Plan and Analysis Timeline

As shown in Appendix 5, the data collection and analysis timeline reflects the major steps taken by the researcher to collect and analyze the qualitative and quantitative data for this research. 25th of May 2011 was the date when the final survey was produced and approved by the supervisor and was ready to be sent to professionals and academics for their review and comments on June 10th 2011. Then on July 1st 60 questionnaires were sent to all government entities in Dubai, along with a letter that explained the objectives of the study and ensured the confidentiality of the answers. The researcher managed to get back 49 questionnaires starting from 15th of August. Then face-to-face interviews were conducted during the period from 21st to the 28th of September 2011.

3.3 Study Limitations

This study focuses only on one Emirate: Dubai, rather than making the sample size cover the rest of the other six Emirates (Abu Dhabi, Ras Al-Khaimah, Ajman, Sharjah, Um-Alkuwain and Fujairah). Again, the reason to focus only on Dubai rather than the whole Federal system of the UAE’s government was the restriction of time and availability of resources. Hence, this study just covers one Emirate among the total of seven that comprise the UAE. In terms of resources and references, the researcher found it hard to identify a lot of published material on the impact of the financial crisis on training.
The study has mainly focused only on the Emirati government officials as they are the only ones allowed to work as directors of HR and training. However, some of them around 5% were expatriates from countries like Egypt and Lebanon. However, the majority of the chosen sample were Emiratis.

Some of them conduct some training programs designed for high level government officials, but their main job description is in training, directing and following up the training programs that they have implemented. The study; however, did not include other Emirates of the UAE, but focused on Dubai.

3.4 Ethical Issues

This study respected the ethical guidelines for qualitative and quantitative research methodologies. Before the participants in this study filled the surveys or answered the interview questions, they were made aware that their names and the organizations they represented were not going to be revealed if the research was published. Also, they were given clear guidelines about the way in which the university is strict about the confidentiality of their answers and statements.

3.5 Conclusion

In this chapter, research techniques and tools, namely questionnaires and one-to-one interviews were explained, including the verification process.

A high response rate of 81% was achieved by receiving responses from 49 HR and training managers in the government sector. It was evident that the research technique that was used in all stages of the research was based on a sound scientific basis, including the questionnaire design, review, validation, piloting, dissemination, collection of responses and data analysis. Also ethical issues were reconfirmed based on Cardiff Metropolitan approved regulations. This confirms the high degree of reliability and level of confidence that this research, outcomes and recommendations have.
Chapter 4: Analysis of the Data, Discussion and Conclusions

4.1 Introduction

This part of the study focuses on identifying factors that are perceived to contribute to the effectiveness of training and to enhance organizational performance. The research results presented have been compiled from an empirical quantitative survey on a sample of (n=49) respondents all employed at Dubai Government organizations, and also from a qualitative survey conducted with HR directors and heads in various departments of Dubai Government organizations.

The quantitative results and the qualitative input are explained presented in this chapter. A questionnaire was developed in 4 sections each containing a set of questions to be answered based on the actual practices in the respondents’ organization. The survey was self-administered on-line and each respondent was asked about his opinion and the level of agreement / disagreement on sets of statements using 5 point scales; where 1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree. The qualitative research used a guide elaborating the same range of topics but explored in more detail the actual practices in the different departments. The outcome of the two sources of data are integrated and presented in the report.

4.2 Descriptive Statistics Results

The first part of the data analysis presents descriptive statistics of the findings of this research. These results will show the trends, behaviors and influence of various variables on both organizational training and performance.
4.3 Socio Economic Profile

About 25% of the sample were aged below 30 years, and nearly half were mid-age 31-40 years, as can be seen in Figures 4.3 (a) and (b).

Figure 4.3 (a): Socio Economic Profile (Gender, Age and Nationality)

![Gender Distribution](image)

![Age Distribution](image)

![Nationality Distribution](image)

Total Sample N = 49

Figure 4.3 (b): Socio Economic Profile (Position in the Organization)

![Position Distribution](image)

Total Sample N = 49

The sample was almost equally split on the size of staff base. As Figure 4.3 (c) shows, 37% of respondents belong to organizations below 500 employees, 31% of respondents belong to organizations with 500 to 5000 employees, and 33% of respondents belong to organizations with over 5000. Nearly 71% have been in their position for up to 4 years. Overall the sample
represents a young, dynamic, empowered and eager workforce to harness the power of change in a bustling economy that is characteristic of Dubai.

Figure 4.3 (c): Socio Economic Profile (Length of Relationship and Number of Employees)

![Length of relationship and Number of employees chart]

Total Sample N = 49

Overview of the Qualitative Data

Social Economic Profile for Interviewed Professionals

The in depth interviews targeted a diverse range of directors & managers in HR and training. The sample included 12 women (63% of the overall participants) and 7 men (36% of the overall participants). All the 19 respondents were senior HR managers, heads of HR or training departments, or talent management officers and all of them completed also the main questionnaire.
The 19 interviewed respondents represented the major 16 government entities in Dubai and have working experience of at least 8 years in the government.

4.4 Training Strategy

4.4.1 Importance of a strategy for training and development

The strategy for human resources development and training is perceived to be extremely important by the majority of respondents. A comprehensive strategic training sponsored and cascaded from government level is deemed to provide holistic inputs to different government organizations. The overall vision and mission of Dubai government is respected in the elaboration of training at the implementation level.

The interviews provide clear and coherent images of the challenges and opportunities that the training programs offer. All the 19 respondents indicated that the implementation of appropriate and similar training guidelines to all government organizations is believed to offer good guidance to the local management of the organizations. They all stated that the training should have aligned purposes to be applied among different governmental departments to maintain consistency and cost effectiveness. From their position, each governmental organization will have to manage the knowledge and share the knowledge among its different departments. Yet, learning and growth strategies of each organization should be tailored and linked to the Dubai overall strategy.

All interviewees stressed the importance of the central Dubai strategy, and considered it to be the basis and the pillar of Dubai government departments. The strategy of government departments is described as a reflection of the overall Dubai strategy. Each department is required to cascade the central strategy in terms of objectives, action plan, rules and responsibilities, as well as implementation. They stressed the importance of
working together in the same direction to ensure alignment on key deliverables to reach the overall government’s goal.

It is worth mentioning that there was also some emphasis on promoting Dubai’s image as a leader in adopting such developments and the need to ensure that their departments would add value to this vision of central government. There is an emphasis on leadership, competency, innovation and excellence as the key core policy. Also, the opinion was expressed that a clear strategy has an impact on the overall outcome of training. Central government strategy is perceived to be concerned with the subjects of policies, guidelines and budgets rather than the details of courses and content, assessment of employees, effectiveness of work that are the main concerns of the HR departments. In effect, central government training strategy should ensure the alignment of local training objectives with central government policy.

All the participants were of the view that money resources and efforts of government departments must be budgeted and spent in an appropriate way and effectively when developing their own specialized activities. The focus should be on promoting growth and high performance. Hence, there should be key performance indicators to monitor the efficiency of the adopted strategy in all government departments to ensure appropriate budget allocations.

Nevertheless, a certain amount of flexibility is required in the execution of the training in each government organization, based on its needs and requirements. A margin of freedom is to be allowed for each organization to implement its own training plan in the frame of Dubai vision and mission. In the absence of a clear knowledge sharing management platform, it would be very hard to utilize the lessons learned from the training and share them with the participants and the organizations.
In this context, it was proposed that the highest levels of employees in each governmental entity attend suitable training and development programs. They will then find the appropriate way to apply it among employees. However, others suggest organizing training on different levels; the first level targeting the senior management, followed by a leadership program and finally, technical skills training. It was also recommended that there should be encouragement of initiatives that follow a clear and systematic procedure in order to effectively share knowledge, and to allow as many people in the organization as possible to benefit from it.

Some respondents placed stress on the role of the Human Resources Department in each governmental organization. They considered that the responsibility of this department should not be limited to taking care of employees’ records but must be aware of the government strategies and work in collaboration with the Dubai government regarding each organization’s budgets and plans, to be able to achieve the government’s goals. They have ultimately to lead to the enrichment process of the government employees in general.

The majority of respondents agree that each government department should have a strategy for human resources development and training cascaded from the central government vision to ensure the overall harmony among different governmental organizations. It was suggested that the creation of a comprehensive centralized database for best training practices would be an excellent opportunity that would allow trainers and trainees to benefit from the lessons learned from each other and expand their knowledge and experiences.

The view was also expressed that if best practice is spread among different government departments it would form a holistic strategic training plan. This would contribute to the establishment of Dubai as a business hub. The HR development and training strategy was seen to be a part of a long term organization strategy aimed to
guaranteeing real development and effectiveness of the training programs. It is perceived as the core department in any organization. It was commonly agreed during the interviews that the main responsibilities of the HR department are to ensure the development and improvement of the human capital of the organization, to clarify and organize the work flow and to set a clear strategy, a proper action plan and rules in order to ensure that the organization can meet its objective on time, to a high quality standard and in a professional way.

Participants also stated that each of the Dubai government departments should have its own strategy for Human Resources development and training, but within the government objectives and views through specific governmental training guidelines. Only a few respondents do not believe that each department should have its own strategy for human resources development and training, as they consider that the government strategic plan should be a unified training, serving the same goal. The accomplishment of the above mentioned propositions is believed to positively affect the government and to increase its benefits.

4.4.2 Development and implementation of a comprehensive and integrated “Training Strategy”

The majority of respondents believed that the success of any organization is measured by the training strategy adopted and effectively implemented by the responsible parties. The objective of the training strategy should be focused on improving the current performance in the organization, as well as making sure that skills exist among employees for future competencies required by the organization. Prior to developing and implementing the training strategy, the wide majority of respondents confirmed that it is essential that the training strategy is aligned and adapted to the organization’s
strategy, vision and mission. It is only then that the training strategy will achieve the best results.

4.4.3 How is the Training Strategy Developed and Implemented?

The careful and precise analysis of the interviews revealed a clear understanding of the training challenges and opportunities for the government of Dubai. A training strategy can be developed by establishing development areas, setting organizational training objectives, creating a training plan, monitoring and evaluating the training. The steps that need to be taken in this regard were seen to be the following:

1. There should be a clear analysis of the current state of government employees and their training needs.
2. Qualitative data has to be gathered through interviews, informal talks and other means to gather the specific training needs of the government employees.
3. Definition of the budget and training methods.
4. Identify the main target behind the implementation of the training program.

S.M.A added the importance of having a clear vision and design of measurable goals behind the training program. The goals and strategic targets will allow these entities to measure their success in attaining the results they wanted to achieve. As for the implementation of the training strategy, it was critical to keep training programs aligned with the government strategy, and link the design and implementation of the training project with the real needs of the organizations.

Following is a detailed list of activities pointed out by respondents as the core of any successful training strategy (both on the level of development and implementation). This list is based on the statements made by the participants and reflects their opinions, ideas and insights regarding the topic. Remarks are summarized to facilitate the
identification and analysis of the pertinent issues that should be addressed by HR specialists and managers:

✓ Define the current state and needs for a training strategy from the individuals and the organization’s point of view. This can be acknowledged from the following key performance indicators:

- Qualitative studies or interviews with the concerned employees and their management. Focus groups with directors and senior supervisors
- Survey results
- SWOT analysis that pinpoints the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats to the organization
- Experts consultation
- Customers’ feedback
- Employees and Customers’ satisfaction surveys
- Managers’ points of view
- Employees’ points of view
- ROI (Return on Investment)
- PESTLE analysis
- Benchmark with the leading organization

✓ Setting a budget for the training is also one of the major criteria to take into consideration. It is very important to cost the training accurately.

✓ Training strategy should be communicated to all leadership members in order to create a comprehensive training plan. In other words, the top management should be committed towards the established strategy.

✓ Define the training tools and methods.

✓ Identify and target the appropriate training providers.
✓ Review the man-power plan to ensure what areas require talent management.
✓ Assign the right candidates to the right training sessions, yet, all employees without exception should be enrolled in the training sessions.
✓ Encourage employees to attend the trainings sessions.
✓ Ensure that the quality of the training material is up to the latest international concepts/ alignment to quality standards.
✓ Make sure there is a practical transfer of learning.
✓ Implement the best practice of training.
✓ Make sure that career planning is addressed.
✓ The plans of government to make the process of training effective and well documented should include:
  o Plan training, schedule attendees, monitor performance and measure results before and after training, then report outcomes to the involved team with recommendations for future progress and development based on the organization's competency framework.
  o Conduct a yearly follow up to the training strategy.
  o Make sure that the implementation of the training strategy is systematic and based on the training plan with specific key indicators.

4.4.4 Analysis of the data obtained from the quantitative survey:

With reference to the training strategy, it is noticed that the majority of respondents (78%) in Figure 4.4.4 (a) agree or strongly agree that the organization has a training strategy that is implemented to enhance the knowledge and skills of employees; only a very few (6%) disagree, whereas 16% sit in the middle and neither agree nor disagree, though the overall impression is positive with a general average of 4. In addition, the majority of respondents (79%) in the top 2 boxes agree or strongly agree that training
strategy is based on the internal customer needs, vs. only (8%) who disagree; the overall impression is quite strong with an average of 3.9.

This is a positive indication of the government entities' possession of a coherent and well implemented strategy.

Figure 4.4.4 (a): Training Strategy

As per Figure 4.4.4 (b), the training strategy is perceived to be linked to the overall vision and strategies of their organization: (78%) of respondents in the top 2 boxes agree or strongly agree, very few (4%) who disagree, concluding positively with an average of 4.0.

The alignment of training strategy to the overall vision of the organization ascertainment that the organization is on the right track towards achieving excellence in building capable cadres to provide good services.
Moreover, the statement “there is a link between training strategy and the organization’s recruitment policies” shows a remarkable gap in opinions, with 29% disagreeing compared with 36% in the top 2 agree boxes and a large segment sitting in the middle, neither agreeing nor disagreeing. The overall impression scores an average of 3.2.
It is observed from Figure 4.4.4 (c) that three quarters (75%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the leadership of their organization is sponsoring the training strategy, vs. a few (10%) who disagree, with an overall average of 3.9. In addition, more than half the sample (54%) agree or strongly agree that the leadership of their organization has been involved in preparing the training strategy, vs. (14%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.6 and a large segment (33%) who did not take a position on either side of the scale.

The support of the leadership adds to the chances of more focused and directed training approaches and strategies.

Figure 4.4.4 (d): Training Strategy

As per the findings in Figure 4.4.4 (d), around (61%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that their organization’s training strategy is comprehensive and considers all related factors, vs. (14%) who disagree, with an average of 3.6. The awareness of HR professionals about the significance of these elements is what drives their motivation to have a clear and comprehensive view of the requirements of such training programs.
The previous four figures indicates clearly that the training strategy is a crucial and existing component within the government entities in Dubai. Its existence within these organizations guides their efforts and strategic plans to achieve the required and desired results.

Overall, it seems that the HR specialists in the Dubai government have been aware of significance and relevance of clear training strategies within their organizations.

**Figure 4.4.4 (e): Training Strategy**

It is clear from Figure 4.4.4 (e) that (61%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that their organization's training strategy is comprehensive and integrates with other related policies of their organization, vs. (10%) who disagree, with an average of 3.6. However, similar percentages of agreement (39%) and disagreement (36%) are seen, where (29%) agree and (10%) strongly agree that the training strategy was developed using SWOT analysis tool, vs. (24%) who disagree and (12%) who strongly disagree, with an average of 3.
Figure 4.4.4 (f): Training Strategy

Figure 4.4.4 (f) indicates that (47%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the employees have participated in preparing the training strategy, vs. (20%) who disagree, scoring an average of 3.5. (64%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that their own supervisors have participated in preparing the training strategy, vs. (14%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.8. Obviously, the majority of respondents support the statement that their opinions are taken into consideration while drafting the training strategy and updating its components to reflect their training needs.

Figure 4.4.4 (g): Training Strategy
A large majority of (79%) of respondents (as per Figure 4.4.4 (g)) agree or strongly agree that the comments and remarks of the organization’s employees and supervisors are respected and taken into consideration, whereas (2%) strongly disagree, with an average of 4. A slightly lower proportion (73%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the training strategy is reviewed and updated regularly, vs. (10%) who disagree, having an average of 3.9. Listening to the needs of the employees and their training priorities is a focal point to direct their training needs.

More importantly, reviewing and updating the training strategy on a regular basis provides an opportunity to re-arrange the organization’s training priorities and prioritize the direct needs of the employees.

*Figure 4.4.4 (h): Training Strategy*

![Chart showing the impact of a clear training strategy on training effectiveness]

Total Sample N = 49

The *Figure 4.4.4 (h)* above shows that almost all of the respondents (92%) agree or strongly agree that preparing and implementing a clear training strategy has a positive impact on training effectiveness, vs. only (2%) who disagree, with an average of 4.5.
This is a positive approach towards the importance of acquiring a clear strategy that is aligned directly with training effectiveness. More importantly, it reflects the awareness of the respondents that in the absence of a relevant training strategy, there is less hope from the training programs to reflect the needs of the organizations.

Figure 4.4.4 (i): Training Strategy

In Figure 4.4.4 (i), it is indicated that two thirds (62%) of the respondents expressed their agreement with the statement “Our investment in learning from international best practices is negatively impacted by budget limitation”. The same statement is met with disagreement from a quarter of survey respondents (24%) who expressed disagreement or strong disagreement, lowering the overall average to 3.7. This is a natural and normal proactive reaction government entities take when faced with a sharp cut in their budgets. They limit spending on sectors like training to ensure that they meet the urgent financial needs first.
In fact, *Figure 4.4.4 (j)*, shows that (79%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the training budget has been severely reduced because of the financial crisis, vs. (12%) who disagree, with an average of 4.2. (58%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the number of conducted training programs has been reduced due to the financial crisis, while another (29%) disagree or strongly disagree, at an average of 3.5.

The last five Figures demonstrate the close connection between the training strategy and training effectiveness, but also indicate the negative impact of the financial crisis.

*Figure 4.4.4 (j): Training Strategy*

4.4.5 Conclusion on Training Strategy

The statement that received the highest agreement from almost all the respondents is “preparing and implementing clear training strategy has positive impact on training effectiveness” scoring the highest average of 4.5 over a 5 point scale. Followed by “our training strategy has been reviewed and modified as a result of the financial crisis” scoring 4.2 over a 5 point scale, followed by “Our organization has a training strategy to enhance the knowledge and skills and capabilities of the employees, “Training strategy is linked to overall vision and strategies of our organization” “The comments and
remarks of our employees and supervisors regarding the training strategy, are respected and taken into consideration” with an average of 4.0 for each. The lowest was the statement of “Training strategy was developed using (SWOT) analysis tool” with an average score of 3.0 out of a 5.0 point scale.

4.5 Training Approach

4.5.1 Types of Training Implemented by the Organizations

When probed about the types of training implemented by the organizations they are engaged in, the majority of respondents agree on the “On-The-Job” or “In-House” or “Internal” training as the most recognizable and most applied type of training across the different organizations. The main advantage of this type of training is its being held locally in the workplace, which proves to be time and cost effective. It was indicated that in addition to the “On-The-Job” training, “Off-The-Job” type of training where employees are taken away from their place of work to be trained. Off-the-job training can take several forms such as conferences, workshops, lectures, seminars.

It was indicated by a number of respondents that they rely on a variety of training methods and types of training that are implemented by their organizations as listed below:

1. Coaching
2. Mentoring
3. E-learning / Web-based training
4. Role play
5. In-basket training
6. Case study
7. Group exercises/ Knowledge sharing
8. Training games
9. Group discussion  
10. Focus groups  
11. One-to-one/face-to-face training  
12. Individual training (specialized and technical)  
13. Cross-functional Training  
14. Job shadowing  
15. Benchmarking training  
16. Simulation training  
17. Class room lectures  
18. Independent learning (through books)  
19. Visual learning (with the usage of images and techniques)  
20. Brainstorming sessions  
21. Duty visits to governmental and private sector entities  
22. Emerging training (unplanned training needs)  
23. External programs/ Activities  

Actually, 15 out of the 19 respondents stressed the significant and imperative role that the selected types of training have in meeting the training needs, and hence bring about changes and improvement in the employees’ abilities and performances. Three respondents along other respondents add that, in most of the training plans, use is made of a combination of different types of training. For instance, the class room lecture, role play, group discussion and case study might be pooled to produce a comprehensive training methodology.  

Concerning the scope/subjects where these types of training are applied, respondents mentioned the following:  

1. Administration and behavioral training
2. Organizational training
3. Soft skills programs
4. Management skills
5. Specialized courses for the different professions
6. Finance-related courses
7. Safety and first aid training
8. Awareness training
9. Auditing training
10. Legal training
11. Time management training
12. 360 leadership training
13. Building technical competency
14. Building behavioral competency
15. Self-development training programs

When the employee does not meet the required standards of his/her job description, the need for training arises. It is very hard to just dismiss the employees when their actual capacities do not meet the expectations of the employers. Hence, the easiest way to fill in the gaps in their knowledge and capacities is to provide suitable training opportunities. This was indicated and supported by almost all the interviewed professionals. Also, respondents involved in the research stated that there are different ways or methods through which an organization at large or the concerned departments specifically can define the training needs of their employees. Below is a comprehensive synthesis of the results of the interviews:

✓ It was indicated that it would be critical to test the training needs among the target group to be trained. This could be done either through the direct input of
employees themselves or through the **performance appraisal reviews and individual contracts feedback** where the employer / top manager / line manager / direct supervisor notices the gap between "how the job ought to be properly done and how the employee is doing or can do the job right now. In this sense we are referring to the training needs assessment (TNA)

✓ The performance and productivity of the employee him/herself is another indicator for the training needs. An employee showing low productivity is surely in need of training.

✓ Defining employees' training needs can be also based on the following:
  
  o Departmental strategy/ needs
  
  o Organizational and job task analysis (Organization strategic plan, Job description and Job specifications)
  
  o Employee/ individual needs analysis
  
  o Annual organization performance indicators
  
  o New business related needs such as training on new services or systems
  
  o The budget set for the training plan
  
  o The employees’ satisfaction assessment also helps define the needs for training. Employee satisfaction can be tested either by face-to-face / one-on-one interviews where the concerned person meets each and every employee, listens to his complaints and suggestions and then sets the selected areas of improvement.
  
  o Via surveys and questionnaires.
  
  o Qualitative focus group discussions - where people sharing some characteristics are brought together and asked for their opinions on certain issues- are also thought to serve this end.
Very few mentioned the role of the Dubai Government Excellence Award feedback in defining the training needs of employees.

Based on the considerations above, the majority of respondents reaffirmed the eminent role of the employees and their direct supervisors in defining the formers' training needs analysis (TNA) due to the fact that line managers or supervisors are in direct contact/day-to-day dealings with the employees, supervising and appraising their work and performance. Hence, they know them better than any other department in the organization. Also direct contact is ensured through the discussions that take place between both sides during the Personal Development Plans (PDP) where employees communicate their aspirations, strengths or competencies, their weak points and the critical development areas to be worked on in order to lift them to the next employment level. This is mainly of use when dealing with the technical skills of employees.

It was stated that getting the employee involved in the training needs' identification process generates an enthusiastic atmosphere of participation and commitment towards the organization.

Additionally, this grants employees more self-confidence as their opinions are taken seriously. However, the role of employees in defining their planning needs should not be treated as the only factor in the training plan, but rather one component to be considered in addition to other factors.

After all, it is the direct supervisor who identifies the detailed specifications of each employee and reports them to the HR department and the training manager who can implement a training strategy that meets the strategies and objectives of the organization.
The direct feedback from supervisors proves to be time and cost-effective as it tailors the training of employees, thus avoiding any unnecessary training. Nonetheless, few respondents emphasize their experience of the direct supervisors transferring data on the actual needs of their business units.

However many employees resorted to alternative solutions to keep the training program alive and on track.

**4.5.2 Further insights on dispositions and practices are obtained from the quantitative survey related to the training approach**

*Figure 4.5.2 (a): Training Approach Survey Results*

As shown in *Figure 4.5.2 (a)* the support to the statement that training is an investment in people is high. Around (82%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training is a means by which their organization invests in people, yielding a high average of 4.2.

This is an indication that investment in human capacity development is a priority to the government entities and an investment they see as worthwhile.
In **Figure 4.5.2 (b)** it is demonstrated that (68%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization considers the training as investment and not a cost, vs. (8%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.8. Moreover, nearly 9 in 10 (88%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that all employees from different grades and levels participate in the training programs, vs. a very small (4%) who disagree, again scoring an average of 4.2.

When the organization considers training to be an investment rather than a cost, the top management of the organization believes that to ensure effectiveness and efficiency, it needs to assign a specific budget to its training programs annually.

This will guarantee its competitiveness in the markets.
Figure 4.5.2 (c): Training Approach Survey Results

Overall 75% agree (59%) of respondents generally agree whereas only (18%) strongly agree that training has a wide scope and covers wide development areas, vs. (6%) who disagree or strongly disagree, the views seem to remain at an overall general impression though overall a positive one with an average of 3.9. Most respondents share the view that good training starts at home: they see their own organization conducting in house training programs, it is remarkable that no respondents expressed their disagreement while (90%) of respondents agree or strongly agree to reach an overall average of 4.4.

Figure 4.5.2 (d): Training Approach Survey Results
Figure 4.5.2 (d) shows that (88%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that employees participate in external training programs, vs. (6%) who disagree, concluding an overall average of 4.1. Moreover, (70%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization uses on the job training to improve the capabilities of employees, vs. (8%) who disagree, with an average of 3.9. From the previous four Figures, it is apparent from the last two Figures that the organizations in Dubai diversify their training programs and rely on both internal and external sources to provide training to their employees. While organizations are perceived to use, when relevant, some vocational education for employee development, the e-learning process to develop skills and knowledge did not expand as yet: (59%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization uses vocational education for employees' development, vs. (12%) who disagree, with an average of 3.6.

Figure 4.5.2 (e): Training Approach Survey Results

However, the government entities in Dubai have not considered e-learning techniques as vital for their training purposes. This is evident in the fact that more respondents as shown in Figure 4.5.2 (e) mentioned their organization did not use e-learning as yet to
develop the knowledge and the skills of employees by (41%), vs. (38%) who claimed their own organization did, overall that gave an average of 3.1.

*Figure 4.5.2 (f): Training Approach Survey Results*

Almost half of the respondents in *Figure 4.5.2 (f)*, (45%) agree or strongly agree that mentoring is used to improve employees' skills and development, while about a quarter (26%) disagree or strongly disagree, overall it scores an average of 3.3. (38%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that there is a growth in the use of the internet to support training activities, vs. (26%) who view the opposite, while in the middle sit about 33% of the sample, causing the overall average to balance at 3.2.

*Figure 4.5.2 (g): Training Approach Survey Results*
As shown in Figure 4.5.2 (g), strong resistance appeared against job rotation with about 33% opposing the statement while still nearly half agree to it; (47%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that job rotation is used to enhance the employees' skills and capabilities, vs. (33%) who disagree, the overall average stood at 3.4. Nearly 64% of respondents agree or strongly agree that employees are given IT training that is seen to enable them to perform better, vs. (12%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an overall average of 3.8.

Figure 4.5.2 (h): Training Approach Survey Results

A good impression is gathered about the implementation of global training standards. Indeed it is seen that nearly 63% of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs are designed and run according to international standards, only some (8%) who disagree with the statement but about 33% cannot offer an opinion, stalling the average at 3.7. An overwhelming (84%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training subjects are found to be relevant to employees' job requirements; only (6%) disagree, the overall average stood at 4.1.
A great deal of review and advance preparations are performed in anticipation for the smooth delivery of effective training programs: (59%) of respondents in Figure (2.9) agree or strongly agree that the organization ensures training materials are reviewed and edited prior to training programs, vs. (12%) who disagree or strongly disagree, scoring an average of 3.7. An outright majority (84%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization ensures that trainers are knowledgeable and experienced, vs. only (2%) who disagree, with an average of 4.2. This directly impacts the capacity of the trainers to transfer their knowledge to the employees and provide them with the necessary support and advice.
At the base of training exists a needs assessment stage where employees participate and their views are heard on training needs and aspirations: (68%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training needs analysis which is conducted effectively in the organization, vs. (10%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.9. (64%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that employees participate in identifying their training needs, vs.(10%) who disagree or strongly disagree, at an average of 3.7.

*Figure 4.5.2 (k): Training Approach Survey Results*

![Bar chart showing survey results](image)

The involvement of supervisory staff is seen to be essential in identifying training needs and analyzing skills acquisition levels and gaps: *Figure 4.5.2 (k)* shows that an overwhelming majority (88%) of respondents registered their agreement with the supervisors participating in identifying the training needs of their employees, vs. very few (4%) who disagree or strongly disagree, raising the overall average to 4.2. (70%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training needs analysis is used to identify the skills and gaps in the organization, vs.(16%) who disagree, with an average of 3.9. The presence of supervisors in identifying training needs is very crucial for the success of these programs.
Professional training is seen as a motivator for staff members and a key area to investigate in the event of encountering staff performance problems. (72%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training is used as a tool to motivate people, vs. (14%) who disagree, with an average of 3.9. It is also indicated in Figure 4.5.2 (l) that (67%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training is considered when examining an individual's performance problems, vs. (6%) who disagree, with an average of 3.8.

Managers see training as a means of investment into people and a key driver of quality and excellence in work performance. (78%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training is the means by which the organization invests in people, vs. (4%) who disagree, with an average of 4.1.

This positive indication is supported by a number of respondents who said that investment in people is the means to organizational excellence.
According to Figure 4.5.2 (m), (69%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization updates and modifies training policy and strategy as a result of regular review and assessment, vs. (4%) who disagree, with an average of 3.9. Furthermore, (65%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the organization improves training activities and methodologies as a result of the regular review and assessment, vs. (4%) who disagree, scoring an average of 3.9. In fact, an average of 4.5 of respondents claims that effective training has positive impact on performance.

Figure 4.5.2 (n): Training Approach Survey Results
4.5.3 Conclusions regarding the training approach

In conclusion:

- The statement "Implementing effective training approaches has a positive impact on training effectiveness" scored the highest with an average of 4.5 over a 5 point scale.

- The statement that scored the second highest average with 4.4 over a 5 point scale is "Our organization conducts in-house training programs".

- "There is a growth in the use of the internet to support training activities" and "Mentoring is used to improve employees' skills and development" obtained the lowest average with 3.2 and 3.3.

However, certain concepts of mentoring and strategies and using IT and the internet in training to enhance the capabilities of employees seem to be facing some challenges their performance attains satisfactory agreement levels.

4.6 Financial Crisis Impact

4.6.1 Impact of the Global Financial Crisis on the Training budget and training effectiveness

The findings of this research revealed that budgets of the government organizations, and mainly in Dubai, have declined after the global financial crisis. Being confronted with the catastrophe that hit the economic sphere, organizations had to think of quick ways and approaches that guarantee their survival and future growth.

Before anything else, it was urgent to reconsider the organizations' needs and strategies hoping they would manage without certain supplies to help reduce expenses.
4.6.2 The Process of Determining the Training Budget

Before preparing the training budget, all participants confirm that it is mandatory for the organization to systematize a training plan based on identifying the required training needs from the training needs analysis (TNA). As per the majority of respondents, the different departments and divisions in an organization are asked on a yearly basis to set forth the anticipated needs for training programs for their employees, with the help of the training department itself, in order to come up with a training budget. After collecting the training budgets prepared by the entire divisions, it is thus the role of the training department to review what has been presented, analyze the costs and expenses, and introduce the necessary modifications to set up the final training budget for the whole organization.

At a next step, the training budget is sent to the department of finance (DOF) for authorization and financing. It is worth mentioning that one of the most important steps while preparing a training budget is to compare it with the report of spending and the budget of the training plan assigned for the previous year. And in case an increment shows up in the training budget set for the current year, then the concerned authority should be able to offer a reasonable justification.

The great majority of organizations proceeded to re-evaluate the budget set for the training plans and programs. It was stated during the interviews that, in order to lessen the severity of the crisis, organizations had to reduce their training budgets considering that the training budget absorbs a significant proportion of the organizations’ total budget. The training activities and budgets were among areas that have been influenced by the economy measures. Moreover, it was indicated that there was a need to cut down the number of employees who used to benefit from the training programs, reduce the external training programs, and also reduce the number of consultants hired every year to lecture in the training.
The following are areas that have also been also affected by the financial stringency:

- A number indicated that the training budget was reduced and HR and other concerned departments were obliged to reconsider the training budget set for every employee. Some employees did not even have the chance to participate in some training given the shortage of the allocated training budget.

- It was also stated that they might need to decrease the number of training programs allocated for each employee. This would automatically lead to a decrease in the number of training hours and training sessions. In other words, international training was reduced to the most (restricted to specialized areas only) and replaced by local training.

- It was mentioned that some organizations started thinking from a group/cluster point of view rather than giving each individual employee what he or she needs in person. They were focusing more on the development of the organization than the individual growth of employees. Also, some employees were asked to volunteer and provide training to their peer employees.

- Some respondents pointed out that minimizing the training budget also implied reducing outsourcing in terms of demanding external consultancy, or purchasing new software. Some organizations had to cut the big events they usually carry out, such as conferences with what accompanies them, from high fees to be paid for famous speakers and trainers.

- There were indications that the organizations cut the budget for attending conferences and external events, and some organizations had to let go some learning from External Best Practices which are deemed costly.

- One respondent stated that the leadership training programs were slightly minimized as they required high budgets.
Other interviewed members sensed some positivity in the financial crisis as it urged the organizations to take initiatives and think of new ways to find practical and efficient solutions to keep their employees on track. Keeping in mind the importance of training in enhancing employees’ knowledge, performance and productivity, the organizations had to find alternative training methods that promised to be cost-effective. In this sense, the majority of organizations shifted to internal, on-the-job and in-house training to make sure their employees got the needed skills and knowledge. All the 19 interviewed professionals mentioned that external training providers were replaced with local / regional expertise. Some organizations even devoted some of its qualified and talented staff members to carry out training sessions for the other employees. In other words, they tended to rely more on their internal local resources to promote a new policy of knowledge sharing and transfer.

One respondent mentioned that the use of small but promising training methods such as the E-learning and self-development training methods were taken into account in facing the demand of the required economies. Moreover, it was stated that currently the organizations are inward rather than outward focused. They rely on internal capacities to provide the training support and rely less on international experts. Regardless of how effective the alternative training methods proved to be, very few respondents, around 5 out of the 19 respondents only, believed that the quality of training has declined, especially on the level of technical and IT training. It is well-known that the IT training programs are expensive, and with the organization’s policy to cut unaffordable expenses.

One respondent clearly mentioned that the effect of the economies was tangible to the extent that many organizations had to reduce their training programs within the training department, and re-evaluate which programs were considered a priority within the government. Finally, we can say that the impact of the global financial crisis differs from one organization to another as per the potentialities of each. However, some organizations
had to apply some new training methods in response to the financial crisis. Most of the interviewed HR directors stated that the financial crisis resulted in reducing the training budget but they believe that it did not have an impact on the training effectiveness in general.

4.6.3 Insights on dispositions and practices are obtained from the quantitative survey related to training strategy as related to the financial crisis.

*Figure 4.6.3 (a): Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results*

![Survey Results Chart]

*Figure 4.6.3 (a)* shows that (61%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the financial crisis negatively affects training budget, vs. (31%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.5. (58%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the number of training programs in the plan has been reduced due to the financial crisis, vs. (26%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.6.
Figure 4.6.3 (b): Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results

The impact of the financial crisis on the on-job training is evident and robust as per Figure 4.6.3 (b) which indicates that around (62%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that on-job training and internal trainers are used more due to the financial crisis, vs. (18%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.7. Also, (47%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training objectives and topics have been modified to address new requirements due to the financial crisis, vs. (16%) who disagree or strongly disagree, with an average of 3.4.

Figure 4.6.3 (c): Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results
As Figure 4.6.3 (c) shows clearly (47%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that the number of employees participating in training has been reduced due to the financial crisis, and almost one third (30%) who disagree or strongly disagree, scoring an average of 3.3. This is an indication of the effects of the crisis on the government of Dubai and the reactions of the HR professionals to such an issue.

A similar percentage of respondents (37%) disagree or strongly disagree and (36%) agree or strongly agree that the financial crisis has negatively influenced training effectiveness, to get an average of 3.1. This could be explained by the continuous efforts of the HR officials to come up with innovative approaches for the training programs.

Figure 4.6.3 (d): Financial Crisis Impact Survey Results

According to Figure 4.6.3 (d), around (92%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that allocating a sufficient financial resource budget has a positive impact on training effectiveness, vs. (2%) who disagree, with an average of 4.3. This is an expected result since all the interviewed professionals indicated clearly that their government entities have re-examined their strategies and budget approaches as a result of the financial crisis.
Further data was gathered from the Department of Finance in the government of Dubai. 

Figure 4.6.3 (e) outlines the government of Dubai’s expenditure on training from the year 2005 to 2010. It clearly demonstrates the impact of the crisis on the budget allocated for training by the Department of Finance in the government of Dubai. From the year 2006 to 2007, the training budget witnessed an increase from AED 37,803,690 to around AED 45 Million. This was a 20 % increase over the previous year. In 2008, that amount was doubled to become 86 million AED for that year only.

However, since the start of the financial crisis in early 2008, that number would witness a clear gradual cut of 28 % in 2009, an additional cut of 14 % in 2010 to witness an additional significant cut of 13 % in 2011 to go back to the amount that was assigned for training in 2007 which was around 46 million AED. This is a clear indication of the impact of the crisis on the training budget and the allocation of training funds for the various government entities within the government of Dubai.

Source: Department of Finance, Government of Dubai (2012)
Figure 4.6.3 (f) also demonstrates the fluctuation of the allocated training budget for the government of Dubai and shows the declining of direct training expenditure.

4.6.4 Conclusion on the Financial Crisis Impact

It is clear that there was an impact on training budgets, strategies and approaches in Dubai government due to the global financial crisis which was indicated in the findings of the survey and the personal interviews with the government human resource directors and professionals. On the other hand, that it did not affect the training effectiveness has been stated by most of the participants in the survey. The following statement: “the financial crisis has negatively influenced training effectiveness” was the least ranked with an average of 3.1 out of a 5 point scale, where 37% of the total population did not agree with this statement against 36% who agree with it. Most probably, this limited effect on training efficiency was due to the persistence of training and human resources departments in the public sector to implement innovative solutions to adopt to the reduced training budget and focus mainly on internal training, instead of external training which is costly and also design training based on the real needs of the employees and not overspend on unnecessary trainings.

4.7 Training Impact on Organizational Performance

4.7.1 Impact of the “Effective Training” on the Government Organizations Performance Results

In general, respondents confirm the constructive impact of the “effective training” on the performance of the governmental organizations. They trust the relevance between both variables where a well-implemented training program, led by proper guidelines and strategies, results in enhanced and quality services and performances and vice versa. All respondents shared the view that subjecting employees to the proper and effective training will achieve the targeted objectives at different levels which in due course serves the
organizations' performance at large. Respondents agree that the impact of an effective training plan works for the benefit of employees in the first place. The most detected positivity of the effective training in enhancing employees' satisfaction - believed to be the starting point for any other area of development in the organization.

One respondent enumerated the different organizational layers in which effective training has an impact on the organizational performance. He stated that customer focus, communication, efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery and enriching internal culture are all elements that impact the organizational performance of the entities. Another respondent stressed the importance of employees' satisfaction as the outcome of a long route; receiving an efficient and resourceful training, employees' skills and knowledge will most probably witness a significant improvement, which in turn positively affects their productivity, creativity, overall performance and their position in the organization (Career enhancement). More importantly, it was mentioned that improvement of employees' satisfaction will increase their loyalty to the organization and their sense of belonging. It will also encourage them to get engaged in deciding and accomplishing certain objectives and targets.

In this context, the organization will have a pool of talents capable of achieving the objectives and goals of the organization. A well trained employee will take less time accomplishing his/her duties, which at the same time helps to cut costs.

There were indications that an effective training system helps the organization achieve its strategies and goals without sustaining high disbursements or time loss. On the contrary, it will lead to a better financial performance (in terms of capital consumption and the reserve). It also raises the ROI and promotes best practices and improves the capabilities of the employees.
In addition, one respondent agreed that proper training fortifies the employees with higher self-confidence and self-motivation, and thus a higher level of satisfaction. It will also improve relations among the different employees across the different departments, in addition to promoting a common culture among them. Being equipped with strong competencies, employees will have a sense of loyalty and allegiance towards their working environment. In other words, this will diminish the percentage of employee turnover.

Implementing an efficient training helps in moulding a better, healthier and more productive working environment. About the impact of employees' satisfaction on the Governmental Organizations' performance, respondents declare that when employees are satisfied, self-confident and skilled in their working domain, they will then reflect their confidence in their dealings with customers who are mostly from the general public. Being received and treated properly and professionally, customers in turn, will express satisfaction towards the organization and thus choose a repeated dealing with the same organization. This also leaves them in a pro-active situation rather than being mere receivers. Moreover, effective training reduces the performance and knowledge gaps in organizations and provides a healthier and stronger working environment.

It is here where we can talk about an individual growth (employees' level) that engenders organizational growth and advancement (managerial and customers' level) and encourages a competitive spirit. Looking back at all that has been said above, it can be confirmed that employees' satisfaction prompts customer satisfaction. In brief, ensuring employees' satisfaction is seen to be the success for any organization.

Some respondents argued that there would always be a margin of breakdown when the training program was not carried out properly as required. In this sense, employees would be rather de-motivated as their needs and/or gaps were not met or answered which in turn affects their manners, attitudes and performance in the work place. Then, it is all about
applying the proper type of training for the right persons at the right time. Only then will the training program have rewarding results.

4.7.2 Areas of the Organization’s Performance impacted by Effective Training

In the previous part of the research we have approached the general positive impact achieved by the effective training on the performance of government agencies. Since the government entities in Dubai are service oriented entities, the quality of their work is manifested in customer service delivery. In this current section, we shall summarize the areas that would be mostly influenced/impacted by the “Effective Training”.

According to respondents, the following areas that will attract the highest impact are an “effective training” program adopted by the governmental organization;

✓ **Employee-related area**: as we have mentioned previously, this area seems to be the focal point and the base that affects the whole body of the organization. Therefore setting an ideal and efficient training program for the employees is rather essential for the organization as a whole since it leads to many results:

- Higher level of employee satisfaction
- Better relationship among employees (promotes teamwork)
- Refined morals and principles (reduces intra-organizational conflicts)
- Reinforces the IQ and EQ of employees by applying the appropriate mentoring and coaching techniques
- Enhances performance and development of skills (soft and hard skills)
- Exchange of knowledge
- Proficiency of communication skills and mainly the English language, as most of the clients are expatriates
- Higher productivity
- Little margin of errors and mistakes
Time management: faster execution, trivial time loss, etc...

Career enhancement (senior positions) and feelings of growth in and with the organization

Promotes loyalty among employees

**Customer-related area:** Customers’ satisfaction was perceived as a vital manifestation of the effective training programs. Gaining the satisfaction and the approval of customers is of major importance as it indicates the success of the organization in meeting their needs and requirements, whether in terms of good customer service or quality products and services. Being capable of attracting customers to deal with the organization is considered a success for the organization itself.

**Organization-related area:** It was agreed that the better the performance, productivity of employees and the turnout of clients, the better is the image and the reputation of the organization. After all, well trained employees, an organized working plan, high quality services and products all enhance the image of the organization in the estimation of the general public.

This leaves the organization in a leading position facing competitors whether locally, regionally or even globally in terms of an outstanding performance and financial results.

**4.7.3 Further insights on dispositions and practices are obtained from the quantitative survey related to training impact on organizational performance**

There is an overall good understanding of the benefits in knowledge and skills of trained staff, and a good appreciation of the positive impact on the overall behavior of staff at work.
Figure 4.7.3 (a): Training Impact Survey Results

No one registered their disagreement with the perception that training programs conducted have developed and enriched the knowledge and skills of trainees. However, (83%) of respondents expressed their agreement, with an average of 4. (71%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs conducted by the organization have a positive impact on the trainees’ behavior, vs. (6%) who disagree, having an average of 3.8. The results are comparable to those in other organizations in the West, and indicate the belief of the H.R professionals in Dubai government that training is the gate to a better organizational performance.

Figure 4.7.3 (b): Training Impact Survey Results
The returns of training programs have been in the innovation and improved working methods that boost productivity. As *Figure 4.7.3 (b)* demonstrates, around (63%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs have led to the introduction of new, improved and innovative methods and systems, vs. (6%) who disagree, with an average of 3.7. In fact, (69%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs in the organization have a positive impact on the productivity of people, vs.(8%) who disagree, with an average of 3.8.

This confirms the awareness of HR professionals of the instrumental role of the training on employees' performance.

*Figure 4.7.3 (c): Training Impact Survey Results*

In fact, the results of the survey confirm that the quality of services delivered to customers witnessed significant improvement due to the training programs offered at their institutions and organizations. Around 51 % of respondents indicated their agreement with that statement (according to *Figure 4.7.3 (c)*), and 47 % agree that the customer satisfaction saw a significant improvement due to the quality of the training programs that enhanced organizational performance.
Another (78%) of respondents as shown in Figure 5.4 agree or strongly agree that training programs in the organization have a positive impact on achieving a higher level of quality and excellence, while (8%) disagree. This confirms that the role of training in organizational performance and excellence is indisputable in this respect. Moreover, it encourages the top management to generously support these training programs and to increase the level of employees' involvement in the training activities.

*Figure 4.7.3 (d): Training Impact Survey Results*

Returns on training investments pay back in better overall business performance results, encouraging regular training activities review: Around (69%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs in the organization enabled employees to achieve
better overall performance results, whereas only (2%) disagree, with an average of 3.9. This was experienced by the respondents themselves who support their employees and staff to have more training opportunities and to expose themselves to more rigorous training programs to improve their skills.

*Figure 4.7.3 (f): Training Impact Survey Results*

Training programs have been well received and are generally thought to have positively impacted staff performance on the job. 69 % of the respondents agree or strongly agree with the statement that “training programs conducted by our organization have positive impact on the trainees’ performance”.

*Figure 4.7.3 (g): Training Impact Survey Results*
A generally positive impression prevailed, boosting the overall service quality and enhancing cost and time efficiencies: *Figure 4.7.3 (g)* shows that (67%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs conducted by the organization increased the quality of employees' performance, vs. (4%) who disagree, with an average of 3.8. This reassures that training is positively linked to organizational performance. Moreover, it has a direct impact on the quality of tasks performed by employees, because (59%) of respondents agree or strongly agree that training programs conducted by the organization decreased the cost and time required to accomplish tasks, while few disagree at (4%), to have an average of 3.7 as shown in *Figure 4.7.3 (h)* below:

*Figure 4.7.3 (h): Training Impact Survey Results*

4.7.4 Role of Dubai Central Government in facilitating the departments' efforts in training its employees

Three respondents believe in the substantial role of central government in assisting the governmental organizations to achieve their training strategies and plans. First, central government's part lies in offering the financial support needed for the training budget. However, 15 out of the 19 interviewed respondents indicated that financial aid should
be firstly approved by the Executive Council to be then agreed on by the Department of Finance and finally supervised by the Auditing Division. Central government will even try to negotiate better prices for the training plans. Also, the financial support takes a relatively long procedure before reaching the concerned governmental organization as it has to go through a detailed analysis.

All the 19 interviewed professionals stated that the role of Central Government is not limited to the subsidy but rather embraces working out a common platform of policies, training strategies, rules and regulations for the different governmental organizations in a manner that complies with the Central Government’s strategies and objectives at large.

✓ Five respondents said that the presence of a unified guideline facilitates the organizations’ and departments’ performance, reduces the margin of error and opens a channel for exchanging knowledge and information between them. This is supposed to be handled by the HR department in DCG and communicated to the HR departments in the different organizations. Nonetheless, it would be of major importance to assess the suitability of the training content and methodology to the work frame it is applied in.

✓ The 19 interviewed professionals also shared their ideas about the functional level in which DCG is also involved in measuring and reporting the performance of the governmental departments. On the motivational level, DCG works on encouraging the different organizations to enhance the competencies within each department. This is rather bolstered by rewarding the best performing department.

✓ The distribution of the benchmark report and the Best Practices among the governmental organizations is also deemed one of DCG responsibilities as per a few respondents.
Moreover, few stated that Dubai Central Government should provide a central knowledge database of quality training providers in addition to conjoint central training facilities. This will act as a central bank that feeds all departments across the different organizations.

4.7.5 Role of the government leaders in the training efforts

Government leaders have a crucial and fundamental role in the training efforts. They are supposed to participate in training sessions and workshops as well as to motivate employees who have succeeded in the completion of their training session. Their role will be appreciated if they continuously support employees by being the example for them, and if they reward employees by providing them with certificates and congratulation mails. There is a commitment and dedication toward employees regarding training activities.

All the 19 interviewed professionals stressed that to be an efficient and successful training; it is recommended that HR and directors provide employees with the required resources and time. Two respondents indicated that leaders have to be the example for employees. They should reflect a positive image by giving lectures, writing books and articles. Furthermore, they are recommended to be up-to-date and to employ the new technology. So they are the source of knowledge, culture and innovation. They must occupy the position of a coach. Besides, they are perceived to contribute in personal development plans; hence they support employees in their individual development and the development of their careers. Consequently, the skills and competencies will be improved and employees will be sharing knowledge.

This strategy is defined as the “learning culture”; leaders create it in order to enhance the knowledge, competencies and skills of employees. After training, a follow up on the
impact of training is necessary. This will be an evaluation of the level of success of the training.

The training sessions allow employees to do a rotation in all departments, to increase their knowledge, competencies, performance, and productivity. It is a motivation to create a better environment at work as it responds to the needs of employees. It gives a positive morale to the employee and boosts their loyalty to the organization.

This chapter includes insights and observations in relation to the findings. It also looks into the survey results, examining their relationship to the study's assumptions. The outcomes of the face-to-face interviews with HR experts, trainers and professionals working at several government departments in Dubai are analyzed and discussed in this chapter as well.

Having worked as an HR professional in several Dubai Government departments made HR my favorite topic, and, in fact, most of the outcomes of this study did not come as a surprise to me. It is clear enough that there has been a rising awareness about the importance of employee training and the role it plays in building organizational capabilities, and creating a highly talented and professional workforce that enables government organizations to attain their vision and objectives. The following points provide insights and observations on the study results:

4.8 The main insights and observations.

4.8.1 Training Strategy Qualitative Data

1. There has been a great emphasis on the importance of having a well-defined training strategy which has evolved from the overall strategy of the respective organization. This demonstrates the maturity of the excellence culture in Dubai Government
departments which requires them to have a comprehensive training strategy aligned to central government strategy.

Around 80 per cent of the interviewed specialists and HR directors indicated clearly that training strategy is the road map that leads any training program to a successful end.

2. There has been a consensus among those interviewed about the central role the Dubai Government plays in preparing and propagating general training policies and guidelines. However, flexibility is given to each department to design and manage its day-to-day training operations.

More than 50 per cent of the interviewed people share their views that the government of Dubai, represented by the Executive Council, guides the formulation of training strategies.

3. Around 90 per cent of the respondents affirmed that training must target all employees from all organizational levels. This also applies to top leadership positions which need to attend specific trainings provided by the Government. However, leadership employees are less likely to attend training programs due to their busy schedules or, in some cases, due to the embarrassment of being in the same training as their subordinates.

4. Despite the great emphasis on conducting a “SWOT” analysis when developing training plans, it was obvious that many government departments have not fully performed this.

Survey results showed that only 39% of government departments have conducted “SWOT” analysis as part of the training plan development and preparation. This underpins the gap that exists between actual practice and best practice.
5. According to those interviewed, the successful implementation of the training plan is key and, hence, it is essential to have key performance indicators to measure and track training implementation and effectiveness. All the 19 interviewed specialists confirmed this fact and that they were trying to have well planned efforts that would achieve its results. All interviewees' experiences and face-to-face interview outcomes, with respect to training strategy, demonstrate the practical knowledge of developing a strategic training plan aligned with the organizational vision, strategy and objectives that training managers and experts in government departments have with their varying areas for improvements. Moreover, they confirmed that if a good training strategy is not implemented, the organizations run the risk of investing generously in programs that would not see any fruit.

4.8.2 Training Strategy (Survey Results)

1. Around 78% of respondents indicated that their organizations had a strategy in place to develop employees’ knowledge and skills. This is a positive outcome which is aligned with the Dubai Government’s requirement to each department to have a comprehensive training strategy in line with its own vision and mission, a practice that has always been encouraged by the Dubai Government Excellence Program. In this respect, 78% of the responses confirmed that their training strategy is linked to the overall mission and vision. However, only 29% of respondents felt that training is directly linked to recruitment policies which focus on hiring Emirati nationals.

2. The highest scoring answer was found on “the leadership’s view of the human resource as a competitive advantage”, with 80% of respondents answering “yes”. This came with no surprise given the special attention Dubai Government Leadership, especially through H.H. Sheikh Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktoum, Vice-President, Prime Minister of the UAE and Ruler of Dubai, is paying to the
human resource development. Nevertheless, it is noticed that only 54% of government department leaderships engage personally in the development of the training strategy. This is another area for improvement in light of the importance of top management commitment and support to the success of the training function in general.

It is quite obvious that many Dubai Government Departments need to effectively start conducting “SWOT” analysis in the development of training strategies. This was indicated by 36% of the surveyed training managers and experts. Similarly, 47% of respondents confirmed having active employee engagement in developing training strategies, whereas this percentage increased to 64% when it comes to the engagement of supervisors and line managers. This does not contradict with the fact that 80% of the government departments do gather inputs from employees and managers when identifying and assessing training needs. Furthermore, results showed that 73% of government departments generally review their strategies and only 10% that do not regularly review and develop their strategies.

It is evident that the Dubai Government Excellence Program Award has had its own impact on all government departments through the world-class criteria and principles that help government departments to adopt modern management practices, and guide them towards more effective ways of managing people and resources.

4.8.3 Training Approaches (Face-to Face Interviews)

The main observation that is worth noting here is the great emphasis that is placed by most of Dubai government departments on the on-the-job training method which can be described as simple, cost-efficient and time-saving. Another observation is the wide variety of training methods government departments use, as some of them did really
sound new to me in spite of my long years of experience in the fields of human resource, training and quality.

4.8.4 Training Approaches (Survey Results)

1. The statements “the employees are the main asset of the organizations” and “training is an effective investment” were predominantly endorsed by most of the government departments with 76% and 72%, respectively. This proves clarity of vision and thinking and indicates that training obstacles usually come from deficiencies in the implementation phase.

2. In fact, around 88% of respondents agreed that most of the employees attend and participate in the training courses provided, while only 4% disagreed with this. In keeping with the results of the face-to-face interviews, 77% of the survey respondents admired the recent expansion and diversification of the training function in government departments.

3. Similar to the descriptive results, on-the-job training and in-house training scored the highest grades as the most effective training methods with 90% agreed. However, and despite the global financial crisis, 88% of respondents stated that off-the-job training courses (inside and outside Dubai) are still provided by their departments.

4. The electronic training method has yet to be more efficient and utilized in Dubai Government Departments despite the existence of Hamdan Bin Mohammed e-University (an accredited online university). This was agreed by 38% of respondents; while 41% disagreed by. A need for more emphasis on mentoring, as a means of training, is evident with 45% agreed and 26% disagreed. On the other hand, the implementation of job rotation is evident in only 47% of the departments and is missing from around 33%. Overall, mentoring and job rotation were the least used training approaches across Dubai Government departments.
5. Most respondents (84%) agreed that their departments focus on aligning training courses to the nature of the job and the employee’s tasks. Equivalent percentage was observed when asked about the attention paid to select training providers. Hourly wages of some trainers or conference speakers may reach up to $20,000. The Dubai Government Excellence Award has developed its guidelines to help government departments focus more on the training quality, effectiveness and the trainer’s capabilities rather than training costs, and it seems they are following these guidelines.

6. Around 68% of the survey respondents agreed that employees are given the chance to engage in identifying their training needs, while 88% was observed for line managers and supervisors engagement in this. This can be explained by the fact that the vast majority of government employees are on low grades, who may find difficulty identifying their actual training needs. In such cases, their more experienced line managers and supervisors could provide more valid input, being the decision maker when it comes to selecting the most suitable training approach for the employee.

4.8.5 Impact of financial stringency on the training budget and effectiveness (Face-to Face Interviews)

1. All the 19 interviewed people indicated that their training budgets were cut after the crisis and they had literally to do more with less. There is no doubt that the global financial crisis and recession have already had an inevitable negative impact on the training budget of most of the government sector departments in Dubai, as is the case with all other operational financial allocations. As a result, a shift towards department and team training budgets, instead of individualized training budgets, was seen across the government sector.
2. One respondent indicated that her organization has cut training budgetary allocations which led to a reduction in the number of training courses in general and outside training in particular. Also, the number of benchmarking visits and business trips to other countries to learn and benefit from their experiences and practices has been notably reduced. The need for external trainers (from inside and outside the Middle East) has faced the same fate. All these training approaches and practices used to consume huge amounts of financial funding and training budgets. The Gulf used to be a vibrant and dynamic place for international training companies which now find it hard to secure a profitable market in the region.

3. One respondent, for example, stated that her organization stopped a lot of training programs and decreased the number of employees who benefit from training. Another example is that before the financial crisis, a training course at Mohammed Bin Rashid Program for Leadership Development may have cost up to AED 300,000 for one individual. In general, the reduction of training budgets has affected training activities but has not necessarily affected the essence of the training process and its effectiveness.

4. Despite the above mentioned circumstances, which may sound negative, the global financial crisis and reduction of training budgets have had many significant benefits that outweigh their negative effects. According to more than 80 per cent of the interviewed people, the government entities in Dubai have shifted their training strategies from employing external trainers to developing internal ones. The focus on internal training programs, including on-the-job training and in-house training, has become the mostly used approach. According to (S.A), the second effect of the financial crisis is the great emphasis on training content, effectiveness and return on investment (ROI), encouraging government departments to take advantage of subject matter experts and specialists working in the government or the private
sector in the UAE. This has resulted in significant amounts of savings that could not otherwise be obtained in a normal situation. After all, the financial crisis had the positive effect of forcing the government entities to reconsider their spending strategies and regulate their budgets and to be innovative in spending. According to (T.A), training managers are more careful than before in utilizing the internal capabilities first before considering outside sources for training purposes.

5. All the 19 interviewed individuals confirmed that now more than ever, government departments are being asked to be more efficient in using their training budgets and resources and to understand that the time for inefficient, wasteful and misused training programs has passed. External training courses are no longer meant to be recreational or relaxing off-work moments for senior management. In fact, it was quite ironic that some private sector training providers tried to hold training courses in tourist-destination cities, such as Casablanca, Beirut, Istanbul, London and Paris and during summer so that family members could also go.

6. Respondents confirmed that the central government has realized that the years of the financial and non-financial bubble are behind us, and accordingly, has put forth a number of regulations and procedures to control budgets, expenditures and investments, including training budgets. The training budget development process has become more scientific and more comprehensive where a lot of justifications and rationales have to be made to support the approval process, resulting in better utilization of training resources and significant reduction in costs. This was the result of the strict measures applied after the financial crisis in Dubai.

7. The interviewed individuals stated that it was relatively easy before the global financial crisis to secure the wished-for training budget (mostly inflated). Those responsible for the development of training budgets used to inflate the proposed training budget because they knew upfront that the budget would be slashed by 10
to 15% in the sign-off and approval process. Even if this reduction occurred, the training budget would still be unjustifiably way larger than needed and this explains why some departments found themselves rushing so many training programs, events and conferences towards the end of the year to spend this budget. There are some promising attempts to integrate information technology and the Internet into the training process. Some participants in the face-to-face interviews attributed this to the global financial crisis and the reduction in the training budget.

For whatever reason, leveraging on information technology and the Internet will help streamline the training process and obtain better outcomes in an excellent, timely and cost-efficient manner.

4.8.6 Impact of the global financial crisis on the training budget and effectiveness (Survey Results)

1. Around 79% of the respondents agreed that training budgets have been significantly reduced due to the global financial crisis. Some other departments that were not monitored by the Department of Finance of Dubai Government, 12% of the respondents, saw no reduction in their training budget, such as Dubai Electric and Water Authority (DEWA).

2. Reductions in training budgets have led to decreased numbers of training courses (58% agreed), training participants (47% agreed), and external training / benchmarking visits (62% agreed) without necessarily affecting the essence of the training process and its effectiveness.

3. Varying responses were noted on the negative impact of the reduction of the training budget, which resulted from the global financial crisis, on the training quality and effectiveness with 36% agreed, 37% disagreed and 26% neither agreed nor disagreed.
4.9 Conclusion

Both qualitative and quantitative analysis of the data revealed that the Government of Dubai has more opportunities for improving its performance by utilizing modern techniques in training to reduce cost.

The need for developing an integrated strategy for developing employee’s knowledge and skills also emerged from this research.

The analysis also showed that, although the fact that the financial stringency has negatively influenced the training budget in the government sector, it did not affect training effectiveness. This was achieved by using innovative and creative training techniques as alternatives to the traditional techniques.

The study has also pointed out that it is very important for the government to give more attention to training and the training budget to achieve better effectiveness.
Chapter 5: Recommendations and Discussion

5.1 Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to provide coherent, purposeful and direct recommendations to enhance the training process in Dubai Government in particular and the Arab region in general. These recommendations are based on the results of analysis and conclusions stated in Chapter four of this comprehensive research, that has been completed over the last (3) years, of both theoretical and field study. This research is also based upon gathering and analyzing information in a comprehensive manner. The author confirms that his personal views and accumulated experience in the field have no influence on the research outcomes and recommendations.

This chapter includes specific recommendations addressing training strategy, approaches, budget, and financial impact. It also includes specific recommendations addressing training efficiency, aiming at elevating organizational performance.

5.2 Research Limitations

Although this research is based on comprehensive theoretical and field studies, it has four main limitations that need to be considered together with the research recommendations. The following is a discussion of these limitations.

1. The first limitation is that the scope of this research covers only Dubai government agencies as an employment environment, thus the results of the study cannot be generalised to other employment environments which will have their own characteristics and factors that can affect the effectiveness of training and hence the generalisability of the study.
2. Whilst there is a large body of research in training and development, very little specifically addresses the Middle East Region and considers its specifics. Whenever possible the Western research has been taken into consideration with appropriate regard as to its generalisability to the Dubai context.

3. The Third Limitation which is related to the model which ideally requires objective measurement of organizational and individual performance. This was beyond the scope of the current research and the perceptions and evaluations of the organization members were used as individual indicators of performance.

5.3 Research Recommendations

The importance of these recommendations stems from the fact that they will be made available to government officials and decision makers to benefit from them and implement whatever can be applied at this level. The ultimate objective of this is to improve the level of training and ensure that it makes an effective contribution to building a well-qualified generation of Government employees who are capable of serving customers, achieving the visions and objectives of their organizations and ensuring that they can sustain growth and development.

At the same time, the impact of the financial stringency on the training budgets in governmental organizations must be taken into consideration. At present, these organizations are required to manage using less financial and human resources.

In addition, these recommendations also include a number of components covering training strategies, approaches and budgets as well as their impact on the overall effectiveness of the training.

In other words, the purpose of doing this is to reach the ultimate goal of having an effective and efficient training that can have positive results on the overall performance of government bodies and organizations.
5.3.1 Recommendations related to training strategies

It is important to have a clear strategic training plan for human resources and also prepare it well. Such a strategy should be on the central government of Dubai level, which is to be prepared by the Dubai Government Human Resources Department. The strategic training plan is a guide that focuses the attention of the government officials and shows them the right path towards achieving the results they look for in terms of training programs.

This is also necessary for all stakeholders including managers of Dubai Government Human Resources Department, and human resources development in both public and private sectors experts, and educational organizations in the UAE. Also, all those benefiting from this plan or who are affected by it, to participate in the preparation of such a strategic plan.

The study also recommends that such a strategy should include a clear vision and mission, SMART objectives and identification of the main responsibilities of all those concerned with the implementation of such a plan.

The effective plan also includes clear performance indicators for measuring progress made and expectation of the necessary financial resources to implement the plan.

It is also necessary that there must be an adequate study on surrounding circumstances, opportunities, challenges and risks facing implementation of the plan in order to ensure it will be a success.

The interviews conducted with HR directors and training managers revealed that the current training strategies are general, standardized and do not necessarily take into consideration the changing working environment. Also some strategies are borrowed
from abroad and implemented in Dubai by consultants who are not very familiar with the cultural and religious contexts in Dubai and UAE in general.

Strategic plans should be prepared according to the needs of each organization and should also be explained and communicated to all government bodies through several means of communication. The aim of doing that is to explain the plan components, objectives, programs and schemes and get the feedback from it as well. To ensure that the strategic training plan is effectively implemented, it will be necessary to measure progress made in the implementation of the plan on a regular basis through certain performance indicators, to identify reasons for any delay or lack of achievement or completion (if any) and specify the parties responsible for such delay.

Thus, it is recommended that the key role of central government is to prepare a strategic plan and future vision and leave the responsibility of more detailed plans and operational plan to government organizations themselves.

This study identified that the Government of Dubai follows the international best practices in terms of implementing effective training strategies; however, there are other issues that need to be taken into consideration.

For example, at the departmental level, it is necessary to prepare a strategic human resources training plan that must be based on the strategic plan of central government. This plan must be in line with the strategic plan of Dubai Government and be operational. In addition, such a plan must be also aligned with other plans of the department and must not be in conflict with them.

This plan should also include specific goals, clear performance indicators, specific training programs and preparation of trained employees, internal and external training, training programs titles, related venues and other relevant details. Staff and supervisors’
participation in the training plan or at least expressing their opinions on the same and identifying their training needs would be very important. That is because they are more capable of identifying areas of development and opportunities for training. In addition, their involvement in the entire process would make them more enthusiastic to participate in the training.

The study also recommends that the operational and strategic plans of departments must be based on an accurate analysis of the surrounding circumstances, challenges and risks as well as conducting SWOT analyses in departments’ performance as indicated by many participants in the questionnaires and personal interviews. After preparing plans, they must be communicated to departments’ managers and team members and explained to them. Moreover, effective implementation of such plans must be monitored by performance indicators measurement. Senior officials and managers’ participation in training plans would provide these plans with bigger opportunities for success and encourage employees to participate in training activities.

Senior managers’ participation in and their commitment to training occurs by opening and closing training programs, rewarding participants for their contribution, and even by delivering lectures or attending them as trainees because this would present exemplary models for the other team members of the department.

As indicated by several participants in the personal interviews, the government and its departments must not only set and implement training plans, but they also review these plans on a regular basis, evaluate the objectives set and make the necessary changes to them if necessary. This even necessitates comparing training plans and programs with what is being implemented by advanced governments of the world such as USA, UK, Canada or Singapore. That is because it would be always better to benchmark with the best practices in this field.
The interviews conducted with HR directors and training managers revealed clearly that they were aware of the best practices in preparing a focused training strategy. However, there are other issues that need to be taken into consideration such as the importance of the culture, beliefs and social values of the region while producing a training strategy. More communication needs to be established between the managers and the employees, open and honest discussions about their needs have to take place on a regular basis to identify their training needs and the difficulties they face when they do their jobs.

5.3.2 Recommendations related to Training approaches

It is obvious for any researcher that training approaches are very important in carrying out training successfully, effectively and efficiently. Special attention should be given to the details of the approaches and mechanisms of implementation to ensure achieving the required results.

Training approaches represent the department’s view of training as a successful investment in the most important resources owned by countries and organizations and it is not an unjustifiable cost.

Investment in employees’ training is one of the key investments in an age of knowledge and modern technologies as the development of countries and organizations depends on their staff’s people skills and abilities.

The aim of the Dubai Government is to transform its economy from a resource to knowledge based which requires investment in training and human development. This is especially the case in the Dubai public sector which aims to be among the most efficient, effective and successful models of public service in the world. The training approach plays an instrumental role in this regard as it maps the road for the HR and training managers and allows them to take the shortest, safest and more secure one to
achieve targeted results. Hence, having a clear and well-adopted training approach is the first step towards organizational success and excellence.

After reviewing the current training practices within the government of Dubai, this study recommends implementing creative approaches, which could ensure that training will be effective and positive. For example, focusing on job or internal training would be cost effective. Therefore, the government must utilize the specialized expertise of professionals and experts as well as leaders working in government organizations. The principle of doing more with less within government entities, especially at the time of a global financial crisis, necessitates that internal capabilities are utilized first, then if external expertise was needed, it should be the last resort.

This would require us to start creating a database for all experts and professionals working in government so that we can benefit from them better in the field of training and development.

On-job or internal training never means that we ignore or neglect external training (outside organization or country) because this kind of training would ensure that trained staff members will keep in contact with their peers and colleagues in other countries, departments or sectors in such a manner that could be beneficial for them. However, the financial crisis taught Dubai that it is very important to increase efficiency and effectiveness and reduce the costs.

More importantly, selecting the best training that would meet the needs of employees, especially the programs that take place outside the country, is the key factor so that it can become a real added value of training rather than an external trip for pleasure. When talking about kinds of training, I recommend focusing on E-training, and utilizing modern technology and the internet much more in terms of unlimited training opportunities with minimal costs. In this context, establishing Hamdan Bin Mohammed
e-University is a good step in the right direction. It goes without saying that E-training is still at its early stages from which we have to benefit more considerably in the future.

Diversifying training methods and choosing the least costly ones is an effective approach towards saving money and reducing the training budgets, and at the same time, securing the effectiveness of the training programs. The global financial crisis had a deep impact on the organizations’ capability to benefit from external benchmarking and learning visits.

However, I recommend focusing first on organizational learning and making internal benchmarking visits to developed organizations in both private and public sectors before making external benchmarking visits. In addition, such benchmarking visits must be built on real needs. Moreover, they also must have a real impact on the performance of the concerned department, its services and its work method. This will save the organizations substantial costs that were spent on unnecessary things.

Furthermore, I also recommend establishing a Dubai Benchmarking Group so that it can serve as a real platform where development and learning experts and managers can meet. When talking about approaches, it is necessary to stress the importance that all organizations and departments must make a real identification of their training needs. It is easy to make a recommendation on that matter, but it is cumbersome to identify such needs effectively and efficiently. The efforts made on this level must be concerted and shared by human resources and departments, sections and managers, supervisors and employees whose involvement in identifying training needs is very necessary and important. That is because they are more capable and aware of identifying their training needs. In addition, I also recommend that training plans should be based on an effective identification of training needs and all must participate in training programs, especially the senior officials. Also, training and participation in training courses should include
all employees regardless of their grades, positions, nationalities or the nature of their work or responsibilities. The current practices of the HR managers and training directors in the Government of Dubai reflect to a great extent these approaches, yet, more has to be done in this regard if the Government of Dubai wants to secure its place among the best performing and most efficient government entities in the world.

I also recommend that training programs should be designed to approved standards and specific needs, which would ensure that such programs can add real value and benefit for trainees, and that they must be based upon real training needs that have already been identified. It is also important that training issues or subjects must meet the business requirements of the appropriate department or organization. They must also be modern, developed and complete so that they can serve training objectives and add value to the skills and knowledge of trainees. Hence, training needs evaluation and identification should be carried out before starting any training program to make sure that it targets specific organizational needs.

The study also recommends that the quality of the people who provide the training programs should be selected carefully while taking into consideration the needs of the employees. Government organizations also have to select efficient trainers who are capable of conveying the government's message to its employees. However, choosing recognised names of trainers might not be suitable sometimes; however, what matters most is the content and core issues rather than appearances and names. Also, it is crucial that the selected trainers reflect years of experience and exposure to training programs to be able to convey the messages and lessons to the government officials. Being the Coordinator of Dubai Government Excellence Program for years, and working in the field for a long time, I am aware of the crucial role played by trainers and their influence on the success or failure of the training programs. Even in the literature
review, it was indicated repeatedly that the trainers play an extremely important role in the success of training programs and transmitting the knowledge to the trainees.

The study recommends that human resources and training as well as finance managers should not focus on choosing the cheapest quotations provided for training. That is because it would be at the expense of quality and expected benefits. Hence, training materials should be reviewed in order to verify their originality and suitability. Besides, the government has to select the competent trainers who are more knowledgeable, experienced and educated about government work conditions even if this requires bigger investments, because the thing with the least cost does not always mean that it is the most appropriate or the best.

The study identified that with the influence of the financial crisis, the Government of Dubai tries to do more with less, and this could sacrifice the quality of the training programs if proper alternatives are not identified. Currently, internal staff conducts the training programs given the reduced training budget.

The central government should measure the impact of training on staff behavior and performance to find out how far this training is positive on the individual performance of trainees and the organizational performance of departments as well. It is not enough to measure employees’ satisfaction about training immediately after participation; we have to wait for some time in order to find out the impact of such training on their ability to apply new ideas and initiatives or develop existing work processes and services.

This study recommends that evaluations of the training programs should be conducted not only after the end of the training, but continues to measure the influence of the training on the professional development of the employees and their overall...
performance in the organization. The interviews with HR concluded that such a measure and approach is not applied in the Government of Dubai.

It is recommended that training and human resources departments should supervise training activities in a more focused manner and be concerned with trainees’ commitment to attend training programs, their active participation in related discussions, and their ability to explain their skills obtained from such participation to their colleagues and supervisors after they report back to their offices.

Sharing knowledge is the key to achieving this element. The Central Government of Dubai should institutionalize knowledge sharing and make it a requirement for all the government entities. Knowledge sharing will guarantee that what a single employee learns is shared with their colleagues at work. This will maximize the impact of the training and its influence on the employee’s behavior. Again, this practice was not identified while conducting the interviews with the HR and training managers.

This study recommends that knowledge management becomes an integral component within the training approach, and training managers should take it into consideration while putting together a training strategy and approach. This will maximize the benefits from the training and guarantee a long term impact of the training programs.

5.3.3 Recommendations related to the financial crisis impact on training budget and financial resources

This study found that training in the Government of Dubai is usually looked at as a short term investment which should yield its outcomes immediately. However, training needs to be looked at as a long-term investment in the first place in building people’s capabilities rather than an unjustifiable financial cost incurred by the government.
Therefore, training budgets should not be minimized in each financial crisis in the present or future.

As a matter of fact, the implications of the financial crisis on the training practices in the Government of Dubai are not as bad as some people would expect. Generally speaking, the impacts of financial crises on government organizations and central government presented a good opportunity to assess their financial performance and review the cost effectiveness and reasonability of training functions. Other activities of the government should be assessed in order to prevent unjustifiable spending and enormous waste of financial resources allocated for training.

Hence, the key recommendation is that the Government of Dubai should focus on a training budget that depends on the actual identification of training needs rather than the calculation of a certain ratio of total staff salaries. That is because such a ratio could be more or less than what is needed by the government organization.

The financial crisis should be looked at as an opportunity to re-assess the pre-crisis behavior of the government officials and implement stricter measures for training and spending. The government should use its own internal training resources first, and then look for external ones if the required knowledge or expertise does not exist internally.

The study recommends that the finance department needs to identify the approved financial resources as per actual needs rather than requests or estimates of government organizations that are keen on asking for budgets bigger than their real needs on a yearly basis. That is because they are aware of the fact that finance department of central government will deduct a certain ratio from the requested budgets of government organizations.
Government organizations need to review their strategies and approaches regularly at all times. However, financial crisis and budget limitations require making such reviews more important than ever.

Moreover, these organizations also have to focus on their work priorities and programs offering added value to employees and abilities in such a manner that will enable them to perform their duties excellently, anywhere anytime.

The study recommends that spending or exaggerated budgets without real justification should be avoided. It is not important to list training programs in training plans or sending a large number of employees for training. However, the important thing is to utilize optimally the training budgets in order to create a real change in behavior, skills, abilities and trends of employees. This study also recommends allocating permanent financial resources for training government employees by allocating part of the funds decided by the finance department of central government from knowledge Dirham. By definition, knowledge Dirham is around 2 dollars fee charged for every transaction made by individuals or organizations with the government, which is allocated for training and knowledge dissemination.

5.3.4 Recommendations related to enhancing the training impact on organizational performance

The study recommends that focus must be placed on the training quality provided to government employees in order to improve their skills and knowledge, enhance their satisfaction and productivity and ensure their loyalty to government organizations and proper commitment to customers.
The quality of training is measured by the content presented to the trainees, the trainers who provide the training and the capacity of the trainees to practise what they learn in their jobs.

The study also recommends focusing on excellence in customer service, organizational loyalty, work culture and employees' empowerment, as well as training programs aimed at achieving internal customer satisfaction and empowerment. That is because the capable and satisfied employee will be able to serve customers better, be more productive and loyal to his government organization, deal with others better and provide faster services to government organization customers. This was mentioned many times by the interviewed experts who stressed on the importance of a healthy psychological state of the employees to enable them to perform at their best. It is also important to remember that it is necessary to revive the role the of Dubai Institute for Human Resources Development, to ensure that it provides quality training for Government of Dubai employees with the minimum possible costs. This institution plays a critical role in responding to the training needs of the government entities in Dubai and ensuring that adequate quality is achieved in this regard.

It is also important for all government organizations to make efforts to give training to their employees through collective efforts instead of disintegrated individual efforts of this or that department, provided that this must not be at the expense of the special business requirements of departments. Many issues like these were identified while conducting the interviews with the government officials and they should be avoided in the future training programs to ensure higher quality and better outcomes.

Finally, the study recommends that effective quality training that is based upon a clear strategy and vision and actual identification of current and future training needs, will make a difference in the way organizations are run. Besides, this kind of training is to
be implemented with an effective approach and high efficiency in order to present an
added value and create a positive impact on organizational performance in terms of
productivity, employees’ and customers’ satisfaction and organizational reputation.

The following Figure 5.1 shows a summary of the previously mentioned recommendations classified per subject, priority, and proposed responsible entity in the government sector:

Figure 5.1 Classification and prioritisation of the recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.N</th>
<th>Subject/</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>Recommendations related to training strategy</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Well prepare a clear training strategy on the central government level and be based on the strategic needs of each government organization</td>
<td>Dubai Central Gov't Human Resource Dept.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Involve all stakeholders in the preparation of the strategic training plan including managers of HR departments, HR development experts and educational organizations and other stakeholders</td>
<td>Dubai Gov't Human Resource Dept.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Prepare a study on surrounding circumstances, opportunities, challenges and risks facing implementation take into consideration the culture, beliefs and social values of the people in the country and the region.</td>
<td>Dubai Gov't Human Resource Dept.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1.4 | The strategic training plan should include:
- Vision and Mission
- SMART Strategic Objectives
- Identification of main responsibilities of implementation
- Clear performance Indicators for measuring Progress
| 1.5 | Communicate the plan to all government bodies and through appropriate means of communications | Dubai Gov't Human Resource Dept. |
| 1.6 | Measure the progress of implementation according to set KPIs on regular basis and report deviation from set targets defining the reasons and responsibilities of such deviation | Dubai Gov't Human Resource Dept. |
| 1.7 | Develop detailed annual operational training plan on the Department level and align to the centralized Dubai Government Strategic Plan and own Department strategic plan | Concerned Government Organization |
| 1.8 | Involve all stakeholders in the preparation of the operational training plan including Staff and Supervisors. | Concerned Government Organization |
| 1.9 | Prepare a study on surrounding circumstances, opportunities, challenges and risks facing implementation taking into consideration the Department's performance and the culture, beliefs and social values of the people in the Department, the country and the region. | Concerned Government Organization |
### Figure 5.1/Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.N</th>
<th>Subject/</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.10 | The operational training plan should include:  
- Vision and Mission  
- SMART operational Objectives  
- Identification of main responsibilities of implementation  
- Details and Specifications of Training programs and preparation of trained employees, internal and external training, training programs titles, related venues and other relevant details  
- Clear performance Indicators for measuring Progress  
| 1.11 | Communicate the training operational plan to all Department Managers and Team Members through appropriate means of communications | Concerned Government Organization |
| 1.12 | Measure the progress of implementation of the operational training plan according to set KPIs on regular basis and report deviation from set targets defining the reasons and responsibilities of such deviation | Concerned Government Organization |
| 1.13 | Ensure the participation of Senior Officials and Managers in the training activities | Concerned Government Organization |
| 1.14 | Enhance the communication between Managers and Employees facilitating the identification of their training needs, requirements and expectations | Concerned Government Organization |

### 2.0 Recommendations related to Training Approaches:

| 2.1 | Implementing creative training approaches ensuring effective training such as on the job training, internal training and e-training | Concerned Government Organization |
| 2.2 | Effective utilization of the specialized expertise of professionals, experts and leaders working within government organizations in providing training to government organizations. | Concerned Government Organization |
| 2.3 | Create a database of the specialized government experts and leaders segmenting their expertise to the areas that they can provide training with, their performance levels and other information that enhance their selection and assignment process | Dubai central Gov't Human Resource Dept. |
| 2.4 | Implementing tools and measures within the government organizations to ensure the following:  
- Training plans are based on an effective identification of the needs of employees and organization especially in the trainings provided outside the country  
- Training programs be designed according to international standards, add value to trainees and addresses the business requirements of the organizations | Concerned Government Organization |
| 2.5 | Diversify training methods and choose less costly ones while securing the effectiveness of the training programs | Concerned Government Organization |
| 2.6 | Focus on organizational learning and making internal benchmarking visits to developed organizations in government and private sectors in the country before making external benchmarking visits while ensuring that all benchmarking visits are based on real needs of the organization | Concerned Government Organization |
## Figure 5.1/Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.N</th>
<th>Subject/Recommendation</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Establish Dubai Benchmarking Group as a platform where development and learning experts can meet</td>
<td>The Executive Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Enhance the selection process of trainers by giving more weight to practical experience and exposure to government business and training capabilities more than reputation of the trainer</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Enhance the selection process of the training programs giving more weight on the expertise and knowledge of the trainer, richness of the program satisfying the training needs and requirement of the employees and organization and not focusing only on the direct financial cost of the training program</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>Enhance the tools of measuring training impact beyond the current methods of filling and analyzing individual feedback questionnaire about the training program and the trainer capabilities to include the measuring the impact on the employees performance and their capability to apply new ideas and initiative and develop existing work processes and services after completing training</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>Ensuring the effective participation of government employees in training programs</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>Implementing tools and measure to enhance the knowledge sharing within each Department and within government Departments after conducting the training programs</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0</td>
<td><strong>Recommendation related to The Financial Crises stringency impact on Training Budget and Financial Resources</strong></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Training budgets should not be compromised in relation to financial crises because training should be addressed as an investment and not as an expense</td>
<td>• Concerned Government Organization • Financial Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Estimate the training budget based on actual needs and not as a percentage of total staff salaries cost or the usual requests for larger budgets by government Departments without valid justifications</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Consider the financial crises as an opportunity to reassess the behavior of government officials to the pre-crises training related spending and implement stricter measures for that spending</td>
<td>• Concerned Government Organization • Financial Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Conduct more frequent review of the training budget estimation measures and tools to improve them and optimize the utilization of the training budgets to create a real change in behavior, skills, abilities and trends of employees.</td>
<td>• Concerned Government Organization • Financial Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Allocate permanent financial resources to training of government employees from the Federal Government by allocating part of funds of the &quot;knowledge Dirham&quot; decided by the Finance Department.</td>
<td>• Financial Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0</td>
<td><strong>Recommendations related to Enhancing Training Impact on organizational Performance:</strong></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>More focus should be given on the quality of training provided to government employees which will contribute to improving their skills and knowledge, enhancing their satisfaction and productivity and ensuring their loyalty to government organizations and commitment to customers</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Training programs should focus on excellence in customer service, organizational loyalty, work culture and employees' empowerment and achieving internal customer satisfaction and empowerment</td>
<td>Concerned Government Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4 Contribution to Knowledge

This study comes to fill in a large gap in management studies in this part of the world which certainly lacks the availability of specialized and comprehensive studies in management in general and training in particular. The results of this study will contribute to the enrichment of management literature in the Arabic region, providing executive management and managers with insightful and reliable information with regard to the impact of effective training on the organizational performance, in addition to the role which effective training plays in prompting high performance and self-learning culture in all areas of the organization.

This will lead to a much improved work efficiency, performance and quality, making a difference not only to employees but also to external stakeholders, namely customers and society. On the other hand, paying attention to effective training even during hard times means that Dubai Government organizations are no less aware than the private sector of the importance of effective employee training and development in strategy achievement and service improvement.
To this end, this study presents a comprehensive, integrated model conceptualizing the joint responsibilities of all relevant stakeholders, including the central government, government departments and authorities, training departments, line managers and employees, in achieving effective and impactful training.

The role which top leadership and executive management plays in attaining effective training was under the microscope of this study as well. It showed that leadership involvement and commitment towards the investment in people training and development has a major impact on how other players in the organization perceive the worthiness of this investment. As we all know, leadership style has a key influence on how things are done in all parts of the organization and, of course, training is no exception. In this regard, the study results showed positive signs that the leadership of Dubai government departments is well-informed and supportive of the great value that training returns, even during the peak of the financial crisis.

Furthermore, it was proved vital to have a considerable level of ownership and involvement of the employees themselves in the training process. This will help attain better and more effective training results, especially if supported by enthusiastic and well-educated training personnel. The latter is also influential in the training process as they are ones who should pursue and manage the training process in all its stages, and ensure that managers and employees alike are provided with the right advice and guidance at all times. The model has emphasized the importance of a continuous assessment and review process through which training departments, line managers and employees work together to ensure training results have fulfilled their objectives, and that weaknesses are taken care of for better delivery in the future. From their side, individual employees are also encouraged to actively participate in setting, achieving and assessing their learning objectives, capitalizing on all the training opportunities and resources available to help them unleash their potentials and develop their professional...
profile. At a higher level, a continuous training assessment and review process will help Dubai Government departments to keep the wheel of improvement rolling when it comes to training, which is a commitment towards continuous improvement.

In the light of the global financial crisis, this study has investigated the impact of reduced training budgets and the overall effectiveness of training in Dubai Government departments.

It was no surprise that the majority of Dubai Government departments had introduced budget cuts to their spending on employee training. However, the study showed that training effectiveness and results were not necessarily impacted by these budget cuts. This was justified by the extra attention that Dubai Government departments made on delivering quality and cost-efficient training programs to their employees and supported then by devising new training methodologies that helped to deliver training at a lower cost and better quality. As such, this could be considered as one of the few upsides of the financial crisis, not only in Dubai but also across the globe.

Having done an in-depth study about training practices in Dubai Government, it is obligatory to highlight the scarcity of similar studies which touch on training effectiveness and its role in organizational development and employee motivation. With more methodological studies, it will be much easier to convince some decision makers and managers who lost faith in the impact which training brings to the success of the organization after years and years of erroneous training management practices and inefficient training delivery in the Arabic region.

This study comes at the right time to provide all relevant stakeholders, such as Dubai Government departments, HR professionals, training experts, managers and employees, with a clear roadmap for effective training management and administration, and hence
for better results that contribute to the attainment of the strategic objectives of Dubai Government departments.

5.5 Conclusion

This chapter introduced specific recommendations regarding training strategies, techniques and approaches. It was also recommended that adequate financial resources should be assessed based on identification of the real training needs.

The recommendations also highlighted the importance of training and its impact on the organizational performance in government entities. Good training would add the required skills and knowledge to employees so that they can perform well and achieve better results.

Finally, this chapter introduced a table that summarizes all recommendations based on subject and importance.
Chapter 6: Future Policy Considerations

The Way Forward

6.1 Introduction

The uniqueness of the political context of the Dubai Emirate requires a training model that takes into consideration the role of the central government and all other stakeholders of the training function. As Figure (6) illustrates, the Dubai central government provides a set of training objectives and priorities. These are then passed into the various government organizations in the Emirate. The latter provides technical advice and support to the government entities and provides also the political and leadership support that is prerequisite for the success of any implemented training projects. This model provides identification of the roles and responsibilities.

6.2 Proposed Model

I would like to provide the Government of Dubai decision makers with a proposed model explaining the roles and responsibilities concerning the training process adopted by the Government of Dubai (see Figure 8.1 below). The proposed Model is achieved based on the results of my PhD research outcomes, deep literature reviews, in-depth readings in the field of human resources, working many years in managing human resources, and after a careful analysis of the results of the field study and the responses received from the questionnaire which was circulated to managers and HR professionals in the public sector and built on the results and observations provided by the face-to-face interviews. The proposed model can be used to achieve effective training that impacts positively on the organizational performance. This model takes into account the uniqueness of the work environment and culture of the United Arab Emirates in general and Dubai in particular.
This model has been built as per lengthy questionnaires and personal interviews conducted with a number of human resources managers and experts, and after reading many sources of literature on administrative issues in the area of human resources development and training that led to the development of the conceptual framework for
training effectiveness that was explained in chapter two. It can be considered that the proposed model in Figure 8.1 is a logical extension of the conceptual model, also it represents a summary of the outcomes of this research.

The outlined elements in the previous Framework (Figure 8.1) namely “Individual Performance Appraisal” and “Regular Organizational Assessment” will provide a proper feedback in the effectiveness of training, both individual and organizational. However, due to time and resources limitations these two elements are out of the scope of this study.

Obviously, such a proposed model shows the significance of the role of senior leadership in making successful efforts to build the qualified people and its key role in providing major political and moral support for government organizations in the field of training, and encouraging their leaders to be concerned with building and qualifying human beings.

As the literature review proves, top management plays a critical role in guaranteeing the success of any training program and in driving the process of training to guarantee positive results. Therefore, this model proposes and recommends the direct involvement of top management in the Government of Dubai to make certain that the training programs are supported, rightly implemented and their results carefully assessed.

In its future vision for Dubai, such senior leadership has determined to make Dubai the favorite cosmopolitan city to finance and business. As a matter of fact, such a vision has been explained for all concerned parties and categories. To make this vision come true, it is necessary to pay attention to building people’s capacities and to train government employees so that they can contribute to serving customers and community and perform their duties better. In addition to this, it is very important to create an organizational culture that puts employees first, empowers them, and considers them as the first valuable
asset for the organization. Achieving this vision relies on having sophisticated and well trained individuals who can drive the government and economy of Dubai to the top position that H.H Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al-Maktoum strives to achieve.

As for the central government organizations that are concerned with training, Human Resources Department has to prepare a comprehensive strategy and vision for training at the government level. In addition, this department also has to communicate such a strategy and vision to government organizations and employees, prepare general guidebooks on training, its policy, general framework, and types, as well as other related general rules. At the same time, it has to have a continuous follow-up for government organizations’ performance in terms of training, and ensure that their training efforts are concerted and harmonized so that they cannot be fragmented or undermined.

The study recommends that the machinery of the government of Dubai plays a role in facilitating the bureaucratic steps that are required to approve the training budget. The Finance Department, for example, has to study and approve the required budgets from government organizations after they have been discussed with them. The purpose of doing that is to make sure that there are actual needs for required provisions or funds and they are based on a real identification of necessary training needs. Then, the Finance Department should also provide the required financial resources fast and without any delay or waiting for time consuming bureaucratic approvals.

It is also recommended that The General Secretariat of the Executive Council and Dubai Government Excellence Program, in particular, should set and explain effective international training standards for organizations, and evaluate on a regular basis the performance of such organizations against the international standards once a year. The program is also aimed at reviewing and measuring performance indicators’ related results in comparison with objectives specified in training plans on a quarterly basis.
it is also intended to identify obstacles facing training performance at the government level and find ways and means of overcoming them as well.

With regard to government organizations, they are the key factor or part of this formula. That is because their leadership team has to exercise and represent its commitment by training human resources, supervising and adopting training strategy and ensuring that is properly implemented. On the other hand, these government organizations have to identify their training needs, implement training programs effectively and make continuous follow-ups for training activities. Besides, the training impact on performance, service and employees attitudes must be measured and the contribution it makes towards achieving their satisfaction and thus customer satisfaction must be also evaluated.

In order to successfully measure their results and outcomes of training programs, it is recommended that these government organizations should benchmark their results in area of training with the best global practices in terms of training budgets, training hours allocated for each employee and number of training programs, in addition to other results or indicators. The objective of doing that is to develop and enhance training activities in the government sector continuously and guarantee their quality. This study recommends that the role of employees should be instrumental in deciding the training programs, and their needs should be consulted before implementing any strategy or approach. The employees are the heart of any organization and identifying their needs and targeting certain skills to improve are the main conditions of the success of the training programs, and making sure that the investment in training is worthwhile. It is also recommended that employees should be committed to actively participate in training programs whether they are trainers or trainees, and to provide the accurate feedback on the training activities in which they are involved. This could include stating how far they have benefitted from this kind of training, the efficiency of training providers; the suitability and adequacy of
training materials and how far training methods and techniques are developed and diversified.

The main purpose of doing that is to ensure that government organizations do take the necessary preventive and corrective measures on the basis of feedbacks and information received from all concerned parties.

Most importantly, trainees are supposed to translate whatever they learned from such training into a positive attitude towards their colleagues, supervisors and also their customers. They also should develop whatever they have learned from training into making improvements and offering suggestions and ideas in line with their departments’ services and roles. Besides, they have to explain whatever they have learned from training to their colleagues at work.

If all these steps are implemented then this would undoubtedly result in effective and efficient training, and building capable and qualified human resources who could contribute to developing organizational performance and achieve excellent organizational results.

Dubai, with the leadership of H.H Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al-Maktoum, has made great achievements in the field of training human resources and building people’s skills and capabilities. However, it is important to continue and sustain such efforts to ensure success. In this context, the Government of Dubai may benefit from total quality management that stresses the importance of planning and then implementation of carefully designed programs. Following review, improvement and development, this is referred to as Deming Cycle (Plan-Do-Check and Act). If this is applied to training, this means good planning for training. Then, training must be implemented effectively and professionally. Thus learning and continuous improvement is a key element in the model as it was shown in figure 8.1. It can be strongly argued that training is a powerful tool for
learning, hence learning and continuous development must be considered as a general theme of the proposed mode. Another vital element is evaluation of the training impact which constitutes a key feedback channel to judge the overall training effectiveness, together with the other two elements namely, individual performance appraisal, and regular organizational assessment.

Afterwards, continuous review and evaluation must follow so that we can build on strengths and avoid negative points or weaknesses. Moreover, continuous improvement of the entire training process must take place in order to ensure that it remains effective and sustainable.

Such an approach will contribute to identifying and applying creative methods and techniques of training activities and programs that could be of real value for both organizations and their trainees. At the same time, a recommendation can be made here to optimally utilize modern technology in this field and benefit from the Government of Dubai Human Resources experience in the UAE.

### 6.3 Review the Objectives of the Study

This study is aimed at developing a comprehensive model defining the main factors that lead to effective training approaches. Taking all variables into account, including strategic and financial variables, an integrated model was set to explain these variables and to define Dubai Departments’ aspirations when it comes to training. This model is believed to be helpful for Dubai government departments, as well as training managers, in achieving the most out of the training programs they offer.
In addition, three main objectives were set for this study as summarized below:

1. The extent to which training budgets and programs were impacted by the implications of the global financial crisis here in Dubai. Results showed that most of Dubai government departments made noticeable cuts to their training budgets. However, these cuts had no major impact on the training effectiveness as explained previously in this paper (please see pages 173-177 for more details). It was obvious that budgetary constraints had a positive role in encouraging Dubai departments to take more innovative and cost-efficient ways to achieve training effectiveness.

2. Through the second objective, the significant role of training strategies and approaches on training effectiveness was undoubtedly clear, which corresponds with a number of management thinkers and practitioners across The Dubai Government who believed that a successful and well-developed training strategy, supported by effective implementation methodologies and techniques, is key to the success of any investment in people (see chapter 6).

3. Last but not least, the third objective focused on the relationship between effective training and the organizational performance of Dubai government departments. The study results described this relationship as strong which coincides again with Dubai-based management experts' and human resources managers' view.

In light of the above results, it is highly advisable for decision makers across Dubai government departments who aspire to developing to qualified human resources and improved overall organizational performance to make best use of the findings and recommendations of this study when developing and implementing training
6.4 Opportunities for further Research

This study creates a scientific basis for the impact of effective training on organizational performance, taking into consideration the impact of the global financial crisis on the training.

There are many opportunities for researchers in this part of the world for more studies and research on related areas, for example: the role and impact of leadership on organizational performance, the role of information technology on developing organizational performance.

Researchers can focus their researches on the field of employees’ performance appraisal as a basis to determine the required skills to enable the employees to do a good job with high quality outputs.

In addition, there are unlimited opportunities for study and research to answer the following questions:

- "Does training represent a solution to all organizational performance challenges?"

and

- "How organizations can increase the benefits for such training?"

Finally, I think researchers should study the impact of new information technology systems and telecommunication technologies on the training and how organizations can benefit from such technologies in developing and improving their performance and services.

I take this opportunity to urge researchers to build on the outputs of this research and take it further, especially in the field of training impact measurement.
6.5 Conclusion

An integrated model was suggested, where roles and responsibilities of government entities, government leaders, and government employees were identified, with a focus on providing a suitable working environment that encourages continuous learning across government entities, teams, and employees.

The model also emphasizes the importance of measurement, review, and continuous evaluation of training performance to enhance strengths and improve weaknesses.

In this chapter, it was confirmed that it is very important to continue research in the area of government training especially the use of modern technology in training, leading to smart government
References


Conroy, T. (2008). ‘‘Blackboard costs BSU $101,000’’, Ball State Daily News Online, September 15, available online at:


Uwe Flick (2011), Introducing Research Methodology: a beginner’s Guide to doing a research project.


In M. Keating, J. Wanna, and P. Weller (Eds.), Institutions on the Edge? Capacity for Governance (pp. 75-98). St Leonards, NSW: Allen and Unwin.


Wart, N. Pretraining context effects: training assignment as feedback. Journal of Applied Psychology, 80, 226-238.


APPENDIX 1: Questionnaire

Date: August 8, 2011

Dear Colleague,
Ramadan Kareem
As you might know, I have been doing my PHD for the last two years, thanks God my PHD proposal has been accepted, the literature review is almost done and I'm in the process of field work data collection.

I hereby seek your valuable assistance and input toward the completion and success of our proposed PhD study titled “Impact of Training on the Organizational Performance of Dubai Government Organizations within the context of the Financial Crisis” an empirical study on a sample of Dubai Government organizations.

The main purpose of this study is to investigate and identify critical factors that contribute to the effectiveness of training; hence it can enhance organizational performance. We are sure that you are aware of the need for effective Training in today’s highly changing and complicated workplace environment of modern organizations.

Your valuable effort in achieving the purpose of this study requires a frank and careful answer to all questions pertained in the attached questionnaire. While emphasizing it is not necessary to state your name or signature, we would like to assure you that the information you give will be kept strictly confidential and will appear as a gross statistical data for research purposes.

The researcher will be happy to answer any of your inquiries related to this study.

Please accept my sincere appreciation and thanks for your kind assistance in this endeavor.

Sincerely yours,

Ahmad Al Nuseirat
Tel – UAE : 0097150 - 5537888
Tel – UK : 0044757 –0776488
E-mail : a.nuseirat@yahoo.com
## Background Information

### Section 1

#### About Yourself:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong> Your Name (Optional):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong> What is your gender?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong> What is your age?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-25</td>
<td>26-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d.</strong> What is your nationality?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>Arab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>e.</strong> What is your position in the organization?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Top Management (e.g. director-general or equivalent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Middle Management (e.g. department head)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Supervisory Management (e.g. unit chief or supervisor)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other, please specify</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>f.</strong> How long have you occupied your present post?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Less than 2 yrs</td>
<td>2. 2-4 yrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### About Your Organisation:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong> Name of Organisation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong> Number of Employees:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 500</td>
<td>500 - 5000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Section 2

Please indicate the degree of your agreement/disagreement with the following statements based on the actual practices in your organisation

(1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>“Training Strategy”</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Our organization has a training strategy to enhance the knowledge, skills and capabilities of the employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Training strategy is based on our internal customer needs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Training strategy is linked to overall vision and strategies of our organization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>There is a link between the training strategy and the organization’s recruitment policies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Leadership of our organization is sponsoring the training strategy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Leadership of our organization has been involved in preparing the training strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Our Organization’s training strategy is comprehensive and considers all related factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Our Organization’s training strategy is comprehensive and integrates with other related policies of our organization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Training Strategy was developed using SWOT analysis tool.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Our employees have participated in preparing the training strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Our supervisors have participated in preparing the training strategy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The comments and remarks of our employees and supervisors regarding the training strategy, are respected and taken into consideration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Training strategy is reviewed and updated regularly.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Preparing and implementing a clear training strategy has positive impact on training effectiveness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Our investment in learning from international best practices has been negatively impacted by budget limitations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Our training strategy has been reviewed and modified as a result of the financial crisis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Section 3

Please indicate the degree of your agreement/disagreement with the following statements based on the actual practices in your organization
(1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 3 - Statements - &quot;Training Approach&quot;</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 We value our employees as the most valuable asset of our organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Training is a means by which our organization invests in people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The organization considers the training as investment and not a cost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 All employees from different grades and levels participate in the training programs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Training has a wide scope and covers wide development areas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Our Organization conducts in house training programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Our employees participate in external training programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Our organization uses on the job training to improve the capabilities of our employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Our Organization uses vocational education for employees’ development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Our Organization uses e-learning to develop the knowledge and the skills of employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 There is a growth in the use of the internet to support training activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Mentoring is used to improve employees’ skills and development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Job rotation is used to enhance the employees skills and capabilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Employees are given IT training enabling them to perform better</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Training programs are designed and run according to international standards</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Training subjects are relevant to employees’ job requirements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Our organization ensures that the training materials are reviewed and edited prior to the training programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Our organization ensures that trainers are knowledgeable and experienced</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Training needs analysis is conducted effectively in our organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page 215 of 239
Section 3 – Continued ...

Please indicate the degree of your agreement/disagreement with the following statements based on the actual practices in your organisation
(1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 3– Statements – “Training Approach”</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20 Employees participate in identifying their training needs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 The Supervisors participate in identifying the training needs of their employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 Training needs analysis is used to identify the skills and gaps in the organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Training is used as a tool to motivate our people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Training is considered when examining an individual’s performance problems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 We update and modify our training policy and strategy as a result of our regular review and assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 We improve our training activities and methodologies as a result of the regular review and assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 Implementing effective training approaches has positive impact on training effectiveness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Section 4

Please indicate the degree of your agreement/disagreement with the following statements based on the actual practices in your organisation

(1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 4– Statements – “Financial Crisis Impact”</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Financial Crisis negatively affects training budget</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Number of Training programs in our plan have been reduced due to financial crisis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 On-job training and internal trainers are more used due to Financial Crisis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Training objectives and topics has been modified to address new requirements due to the financial crisis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Number of employees participating in training have been reduced due to financial crisis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Financial crisis has negatively influenced training effectiveness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Allocating sufficient financial resource “Budget” has positive impact on training effectiveness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Section 5

Please indicate the degree of your agreement/disagreement with the following statements  
(1 = strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 5 – Statements – “Training impact on organizational performance”</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Training programs conducted by our organization have developed and enriched the knowledge and skills of trainees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Training programs conducted by our organization have positive impact on the trainees’ behaviour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Training programs have led to introduction of new improved and innovative methods and systems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Training programs in our organization have positive impact on the productivity of our people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Training programs in our organization helped us in delivering quality services to our customer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Training programs in our organization increased our customer’s satisfaction level.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Training programs in our organization have positive impact on achieving higher level of quality and excellence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Training programs in our organization enabled us to achieve better overall performance results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Training programs conducted by our organization have positive impact on the trainees’ performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Training programs conducted by our organization increased the quality of employees’ performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Training programs conducted by our organization decreased the cost and time required to accomplish tasks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Kindly submit the completed questionnaire, at your earliest, to the following:
Ahmed Al-Nuseirat
P.O. Box 72233 – Dubai – UAE

Email : a.nuseirat@yahoo.com or Nuseirat@tec.gov.ae
Fax : 009714 – 4399555
Mobile – UAE: 0097150 – 5537888
Mobile – UK : 0044757 – 0776488

Thank you for your kind cooperation in completing this questionnaire. If you have any additional comments, please feel free to indicate them.

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

Thank you
APPENDIX 2: Interview Questions

Dubai, September 24, 2011

Dear Colleague,

We are pleased to invite you to assist in the success of our proposed PhD study titled:

“Impact of Training on the Organizational Performance of Dubai Government Organizations within the context of the Financial Crisis”

The main purpose of this study is to investigate and identify critical factors that contribute to the effectiveness of Training that can enhance organizational performance. We are sure that you are aware of the need for effective Training in today’s highly changing and complicated workplace environment of modern organizations.

You are invited to kindly participate in a one-to-one/group interview with the researcher to answer to questions pertained in the attached questionnaire. The interview will take place on:

Time: 11.00 am
Date: 28.09.2011
Venue: TEC – Health Care City

While emphasizing it is not necessary to state your name or signature, we would like to assure you that the information you give will be kept strictly confidential and will be presented as data for research purposes only.

The researcher will be happy to answer any of your inquiries related to this study.

Please accept our sincere appreciation and thanks for your kind assistance in this endeavor.

Sincerely yours,

Ahmad Al Nuseirat

Tel UK: +44 75 707 76488
Tel UAE: +971 50 553 7888
E-mail: a.nuseirat@yahoo.com
### Background Information

**About Yourself:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a. Your Name (Optional):</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>b. Position in the Organisation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**About Your Organisation:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>b. Name of the Organisation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Do you think that “Effective Training” has a positive impact on Government Organizations Performance Results?

2. From your point-of-view, list the most important areas where “Effective Training” has an impact on the Government Organizational Performance?
3. How can “Effective Training” contribute to improving Government Organizations Performance?

4. From your point-of-view, how can we develop and implement a comprehensive and integrated “Training Strategy”? 
5. *Has the Global Financial Crisis impacted the Training activities and budget? How has it happened? Please describe?*


6. *From your point-of-view, what are the most significant training activities/areas in Dubai Government Organizations that have been impacted by the Global Financial Crisis?*
7. *What are the most important Training Methodologies implemented to achieve “Effective Training”?*

8. *How do you define your employees’ training needs?*
9. Do you think it is important to involve employees and their direct supervisors on defining their training needs? Why?

10. How does your organization determine the training budget? On what basis?
11. **What are the types of training your organization is currently implementing? Please sort them based on importance (starting with highest importance)?**

12. **Do you think that there should be a unified strategy for human resources development and training on the level of Dubai Government?**
13. *What is the relation between The Training Strategy on Dubai government level and the strategy on departments' level?*

14. *Do you think that each government department should have a strategy of its own for human resources development and training?*
15. **What is the role of Dubai Central Government in facilitating the departments’ efforts in training their employees?**

16. **What is the role of the government leaders in the training efforts?**
Thank you for your kind cooperation in completing this questionnaire. If you have any additional comments, please feel free to indicate them.

Thank you
## APPENDIX 3: Data Collection Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; May 2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire final review</td>
<td>As per direction of the research supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; June 2011</td>
<td>Questionnaire testing</td>
<td>With a group of 10 experts and academicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; July 2011</td>
<td>After integrating the comments received for the pilot program, the final questionnaire was distributed</td>
<td>12 government depts in Dubai. Sent to HR and training directors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; August</td>
<td>Questionnaire collection</td>
<td>Starting the analysis process immediately</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; to the 28&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;. September</td>
<td>Face to face interviews</td>
<td>Conducting face to face interviews with 19 training directors and HR specialists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; October to 15 November 2011</td>
<td>Data analysis process</td>
<td>Complete the data classifications and analyze the findings.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 4: Ethics Form

Project reference number: ITPDGO/05/2011

Title of Project: Impact of training on the performance of Dubai government organizations in the context of the financial crisis

Training is a very powerful tool to improve the organizational performance. On the other hand the global financial crisis has greatly influenced on several variables that determine training strategy.

A successful Training strategy, activities and objectives should be linked directly with organizational strategy and performance.

The underlying theme of this study is based on the importance role of training in relation to the organization's ability to carry out its objectives successfully sustain development face future challenges.

The study aims at investigating and identifying major variables that are considered vital for delivering an effective training in reference to the impact of the financial crisis.

Furthermore the research has the following objectives:

- The study will explore how training strategy could influence the training programs. This will further look at the differences between a strategy developed based on customer's needs or sponsored by powerful leadership.
- Second objective of this study is the identification of key performance indicators such as customer satisfaction levels and financial performance of organizations.
- This research will try to find out the impact of financial crisis on elements that can influence training effectiveness.
- The final objective of this research is to investigate what is the impact of effective training on organizational performance.

The study has sought to construct an image of how to manage training in the Government Sector of Dubai. Its purpose is to help in paving the ground for the design of an efficient management of Training for the Government organizations.

- This is an invitation to you to join the study, and to let you know what it would involve.
- When the project is complete we intend to send a report to all Dubai Government organizations directors, and to all the Human Resources and Human Development Directors in Dubai Government, a summary of the research findings and recommendations will be published in the quarterly specialized excellence magazine; “Resalat AlTamayoz”.
- The research is self-funded.
Your Participation in the Research Project

Why you have been asked

We are asking senior people who are currently involved in managing human resources and people development functions in Dubai Government Organizations. In addition to some other subject matter experts related to this field.

What happens if you want to change your mind?

If you decide to join the study you can change your mind and stop at any time. We will completely respect your decision. If you want to stop it would help us if you could let us know (you could send us a note from the attached form, or telephone us) and it will save us bothering you with unnecessary telephone calls. There are absolutely no penalties for stopping.

What would happen if you join the study?

If you agree to join the study, then we will ask you to complete a form asking questions about your training and human development functions in your organization. This will be specifically focusing on training strategies, training methodologies, financial resources allocated to training, and types training.

The questionnaire would last about 40 minutes and the interview is expected to take around 50 minutes from your valuable time.

Are there any risks?

We do not think there are any significant risks due to the study. We have asked a group of people the same questions we would be asking you, and they told us they were very straightforward, and were not stressful. In addition, the interview we plan to use is similar to the ones used by professionals thousands of times without problems. If you did feel that there was any stress involved you can stop at any time. Just tell the interviewer that you want to stop.

Your rights.

Joining the study does not mean you have to give up any legal rights. In the very unlikely event of something goes wrong.

Any special precautions needed?

We are asking participants to switch off their mobiles and handset devices like I-phone or BB, during the interview.

What happens to the questionnaire and interview results?

We will store all the information from the study (except names and addresses, and personal information) into a computer programme.

I will then check if things have to do with people’s jobs would affect their answers.
Are there any benefits from taking part?

There are no direct benefits to you for taking part; however this study would help improve the effectiveness of training activities leading to a better organizational achievements and results.

How I protect your privacy:

All the information I get from you is strictly confidential, and everyone working on the study will respect your privacy. I have taken very careful steps to make sure that you cannot be identified from any of the forms you complete and your confidential information would not be used.

I keep your name, address, and personal details completely separate from the other forms, and there is no information on the other forms that could include or convey your personal information.

When I finish the study and analyse the information, all the forms used to gather data will be completely destroyed.

PLEASE NOTE: YOU WILL BE GIVEN A COPY OF THIS SHEET TO KEEP, ALONG WITH A COPY OF YOUR CONSENT FORM

Contact Details:

Ahmad Al Nuseirat

Mobile (UK): 00447570776488
Mobile (UAE): 00971505537888
Email: a.nuseirat@yahoo.com
APPENDIX 5- Statistical Analysis

And

Variable Measurement

The *Training strategy* variable, an index consisting of the 16 items of the section 2 of the survey (variables V211_1 to V211_16 of the dataset), is created. The Internal reliability of the variables is checked through Cronbach's Alpha indicating high reliability (.881). For *Training approach* variable, the index variable was based on the 27 items of the section 3 of the survey (variables V215_1 to V215_27 of the dataset) Cronbach's Alpha indicated high reliability (.943). The *Financial crisis Impact* index variable was created from the 7 items of the section 4 of the survey (variables V217_1 to V217_7 of the dataset). The Internal reliability is high (.820).

The index variable *Organization performance* is constructed from 11 items (section5). Here Cronbach's Alpha indicated that the internal reliability is high (.947).

Referential Statistical Analysis Results

1st. hypothesis

First of all, we will check the relationship of between different variables with the training strategy individually. Then we will check the relationship controlled by other variables.

H₀ : Training strategy and Training effectiveness are unrelated

Hₐ : Training strategy is correlated with Training effectiveness

The results show that Training strategy and Training effectiveness are positively associated (t-test = 13.548, p=.000) with a strong relationship (R² =.796)
Table 1 Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.892</td>
<td>.796</td>
<td>.792</td>
<td>10.95332</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant), Training Strategy

Table 2 ANOVAb

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22021.700</td>
<td>183.552</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>119.975</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
<td>27660.531</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant), Training Strategy
Dependent Variable: Training Effectiveness

Table 3 Coefficientsa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>26.129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Training Strategy</td>
<td>2.296</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent Variable: Training Effectiveness

2nd hypothesis

First of all, we will check the relationship of between different variables with the training Approach individually. Then we will check the relationship controlled by other variables.

H₀ : Training Approach and Training effectiveness are unrelated

Hₐ : Training Approach is correlated with Training effectiveness

The results show that Training Approach and Training effectiveness are positively associated (t-test = 25.530 p=.000) with a strong relationship (R² = .933)
Table 4 Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.986</td>
<td>.933</td>
<td>.931</td>
<td>6.29157</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant), Training Effectiveness

Table 5 ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25800.092</td>
<td>651.784</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>39.584</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>27660.531</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Predictors: (Constant), Training Effectiveness
Dependent Variable: Training Approach

Table 6 Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>15.809</td>
<td>2.670</td>
<td>.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Training Approach</td>
<td>1.428</td>
<td>25.530</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent Variable: Training Approach

H₀: Financial crisis and Training effectiveness are unrelated
Hₐ: Financial crisis is negatively correlated with Training effectiveness

The simple regression result shows that Financial crisis is not significantly associated with Training effectiveness (p=.352) (R = -.136)

Table 7 Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>179.776</td>
<td>11.329</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Financial crisis</td>
<td>-.580</td>
<td>-.939</td>
<td>.352</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Training effectiveness
H₀: Training effectiveness and Organizational performance are unrelated  
HA: Training effectiveness is correlated with Organizational performance  
The results show that the Training effectiveness and Organizational performance are positively associated (t-test = 9.842, p=.000). The relationship is strong (R=.821).

Table 8 Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.821</td>
<td>.673</td>
<td>.866</td>
<td>3.96271</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Training effectiveness

Table 9 ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Regression</td>
<td>1521.018</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1521.018</td>
<td>96.861</td>
<td>.000²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>738.043</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>15.703</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2259.061</td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Training effectiveness  
b. Dependent Variable: and Organizational performance

Table 10 Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.500</td>
<td>3.977</td>
<td>.880</td>
<td>.383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training effectiveness</td>
<td>.234</td>
<td>.024</td>
<td>.821</td>
<td>9.842</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: and Organizational performance

H₀: Financial crisis and Financial Crisis negatively affects training Budget are unrelated  
HA: Financial crisis is correlated with Financial Crisis negatively affects training Budget  
The results show that the Financial crisis and Financial Crisis negatively affects training Budget are positively associated (t-test = 7.135, p=.000). The relationship is strong (R=.721).
Table 11 Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.721*</td>
<td>.520</td>
<td>.510</td>
<td>.847</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Financial Crisis

Table 12 ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Regression</td>
<td>36.501</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>36.501</td>
<td>50.902</td>
<td>.000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>33.703</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>.717</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70.204</td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Financial Crisis
b. Dependent Variable: 1. Financial Crisis negatively affects training Budget

Table 13 Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>-.484</td>
<td>.576</td>
<td>-.840</td>
<td>.405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial_crisis1</td>
<td>.186</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>.721</td>
<td>7.135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: 1. Financial Crisis negatively affects training Budget