Interpreting the new lower primary art and craft component of the Creative and Performing Arts, the Botswana National Curriculum. Case studies of four primary schools in the South Central and Central North Regions. An illuminative evaluation.

Magdeline Chilalu Mannathoko

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Cardiff School of Education

University of Wales Institute Cardiff

June 2009
Declaration

This work has not previously been accepted in substance for any degree and is not being concurrently submitted in candidature for any degree.

Signed………………………………………………………………………………………………
Date………………………………………………………………………………………………

STATEMENT 1

This thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. Where correction services have been used, the extent and nature of the correction is clearly marked in a footnote(s).

Other sources are acknowledged by footnotes giving explicit references. A bibliography is appended.

Signed………………………………………………………………………………………………
Date………………………………………………………………………………………………

STATEMENT 2

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and summary to be made available to outside organisations.

Signed………………………………………………………………………………………………
Date………………………………………………………………………………………………
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the following:

My parents Marotsi and Kelebetse who had the drive to meet our needs and ensure that we all get educated. My daughters Maria and Portia and brother Phibion for the support and encouragement. Sister mentors, Gaba Tsayang and Dudu Mogobjwa who encouraged me to pursue academia. Sello Modimoopelo and Marotsi Mannathoko who assisted on the video and photo shooting. Michael Gaotlhobogwe and Bogadi Toteng for giving design technological assistance. My gratitude to all my relatives and friends who supported me in their own way. Above all, almighty God as nothing would have been possible without God’s blessings.

My Director of studies Prof Janet Laugharne and supervisor Dr Derek Stears for the fastest marking of drafts and their robust and scholarly supervision of my research. Dr Ruth Wright for peer editing of my research document. My research advisor Prof Tim Coward and other staff of the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff School of Education and technical assistance from my supervisor Dr Derek Stears and friend Nigel Davies throughout my study.

Case study teachers for allowing me to join their class lessons and interview them and for their patience with my many requests for additional information. Pupils for discussing their interesting art and craft work with me.

The University of Botswana for the generous sponsorship and support I received through the Ministry of Education.
Abstract

This thesis seeks to examine how lower primary school teachers in the South Central and Central North regions of Botswana have met the recommended learning outcomes of art and craft, as a discipline within the Creative and Performing Arts programme that was introduced in 2002. The study took place in four geographically and socio-economically representative schools. The literature review provides insights into history and current practices regarding teaching art and craft in primary education, in Botswana and comparatively throughout the world. The review material conditions the content of the study in terms of the aims and objectives of the subject in varying contexts, and establishes potential research methodology to be used in the recovery of essential data.

The research methodology was framed within Parlett and Hamilton’s concept of ‘Illuminative Evaluation’ accompanied by classroom participant observation additionally recorded on video, semi-structured interviews recorded by audio-recorder and case studies. Government documents were considered in this study as they inform the curriculum developers on the country’s requirements in each sector. The retrieved and recorded data was analysed across the four schools in terms of responses to interviews and first-hand classroom observation of art and craft lessons.

The findings focus upon the key issues and problems identified and discussed that include curriculum planning, national and local interfaces, integration within the arts, resources, time allocation to the arts, and teacher ownership of schemes of work and their significant lack of confidence in teaching art and craft in which they remain marginalised because of inadequate prior training or guidance. Since participants were not all art and craft specialists some expressed concern about difficulties of content in the curriculum and referred to a lack of knowledge, understanding and skills in art and craft. The study concludes with a summary and recommendations that provides ways forward in the future for stimulating the teaching of art and craft in primary education in Botswana.
Abbreviations and Operational Definitions

The following abbreviations and key terms have been used in this thesis. They are in two categories. Some are used as they relate to the education context in Botswana and the government policies whilst some are more general.

Abbreviations and operational definitions in relation to Botswana policies and education context.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art and craft panel</td>
<td>A group of art and craft teachers/lecturers/administrators gathered to plan issues of art and craft activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Batswana</td>
<td>Botswana citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPA</td>
<td>Creative and Performing Arts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Class level e.g Standard one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course</td>
<td>A series of lessons in art and craft as a subject discipline.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>A particular or single subject in a syllabus with a set of planned activities and a specific purpose. In this case art and craft module ‘Communication’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
<td>Administrative divisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EO</td>
<td>Education officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EO centre based</td>
<td>Education officer who identifies the needs of teachers and organises workshops for in-service training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EO field</td>
<td>Education Officer whose role is to visit schools and assess by observing lessons in progression and the school administration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Found objects</strong></td>
<td>Waste or recycled materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HoD</strong></td>
<td>Head of Department.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In-service teachers</strong></td>
<td>Student teachers who join training in colleges of education or the University of Botswana from service to upgrade themselves.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inspector area</strong></td>
<td>A specific area where a number of schools are grouped and assigned to a specific Education officer to supervise. They are usually named or identified by names of districts and cardinal points, for example Kweneng East. inspectorial area. Kweneng is a district in the South West part of Botswana.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>JC</strong></td>
<td>Junior Certificate. This refers to the first three years of secondary education according to the Botswana education process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kagisano</strong></td>
<td>Social harmony.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Level</strong></td>
<td>Class, e.g standard one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lower level</strong></td>
<td>Standards one to four in a primary school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Man-made materials</strong></td>
<td>Items or objects made by people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Module</strong></td>
<td>Subjects disciples (art and craft, music, design and technology, physical education, dance and drama).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MoE</strong></td>
<td>Ministry of Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NDP</strong></td>
<td>National Development Plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peri-urban</strong></td>
<td>Semi-urban.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Pre-service teachers** | Student teachers who join colleges of education and the University of Botswana from completion of their...
secondary education.

**Programme**
A particular subject in a syllabus which derives its content from different subject disciplines and in this study it refers to Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA).

**RADP**
Remote Area Development Programme.

**Region**
Extended spatial area/location of schools.

**Remote**
Outside villages

**Remotest**
Inaccessible and sparsely populated area.

**Rural**
A countryside which is less developed.

**RNCE**
Report of the National Commission on Education

**RNPE**
Revised National Policy on Education.

**Setswana**
A vernacular language which is a national language in Botswana.

**Stream**
Sub-divisions of pupils with a year group or according to their level of study e.g. standard two and standard four.

Each is a stream

**Syllabus**
A document which comprises different subjects such as mathematics, science, art and craft and their plans which state what students at a school should learn in a particular subject. This study refers to lower primary document.

**Teaching approaches**
Teaching strategies or how to go about teaching topics in the curriculum e.g. taking children to the museum or visiting the art/craft studio.

**Teaching methods**
A systematic way or orderly logical arrangement of
delivering the lessons.

**Theory** Learning and expressing knowledge and understanding of a subject discipline through oral and written mode of communication. E.g art and craft concepts and the language of art.

### General abbreviations and operational definitions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Art criticism</strong></td>
<td>Describing, analysing, interpreting and judging art/craftwork.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DBAE</strong></td>
<td>Discipline Based Art Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discipline</strong></td>
<td>Subject area e.g art and craft, music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instruction</strong></td>
<td>Teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NACCCE</strong></td>
<td>National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NDP</strong></td>
<td>National Development Plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stages of art development</strong></td>
<td>Characteristics shown by pupils in their drawings at different ages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TETAC</strong></td>
<td>Transforming Education Through the Art Challenge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Urban</strong></td>
<td>A developed countryside (town or city).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Visual arts</strong></td>
<td>Art, craft, design and technology subjects.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 1            Map of Botswana showing South Central and Central North Regions.
Figure 2            Statue of the late Sir Seretse Khama.
Figure 3            L4 pupils seated in rows
Figure 4            S2 pupils seated in groups at tables
Figure 5            B2 pupils seated in groups at tables
Figure 6            B2 pupils seated in groups at tables
Figure 7            Man-made and Natural drawings
Figure 8            Natural and Man-made drawings
Figure 9            Incomplete collage 1
Figure 10           Incomplete collage 2
Figure 11           Incomplete collage 3
Figure 12           Coloured-in collage
Figure 13           Regular Shapes Pattern 1
Figure 14           Regular shapes pattern 2
Figure 15           Regular shapes pattern 3
Figure 16           Regular shapes pattern 4
Figure 17           Group 1, drawing of a person and stones
Figure 18           Group 2, drawing of a bicycle and a window
Figure 19a          Group 3, drawing of horizontal, vertical, diagonal lines and oval shapes
Figure 19b          Group 3, Circular drawing of Shapes
Figure 20           Group 4, Elephant and Hare drawing
Figure 21           Objects Drawing 1
Figure 22  Objects Drawing 2
Figure 23  Objects Drawing 3
Figure 24  Drawing with exaggerated proportions
Figure 25  Drawing with private symbols 1
Figure 26  Drawing with private symbols 2
Figure 27  Drawing of natural objects 1
Figure 28  Drawing of natural objects 2
Figure 29  Drawing of natural objects 3
Figure 30  Drawing of natural objects 4
Figure 31  Drawing of natural objects 5
Figure 32  Pattern Making 1
Figure 33  Pattern Making 2
Figure 34  Pattern Making 3
Figure 35  Collage with limited materials 1
Figure 36  Collage with limited materials 2
Figure 37  Collage with limited materials 3
Figure 38  Collage with limited materials 4
Figure 39  Collage with limited materials 5
Figure 4  Wool Tapestry from the Botswana Society, National Museum and Art Gallery
Figure 41  Movement drama scene
List of Tables

Table 1  Sources on Botswana CAPA and art and craft research studies
Table 2  Standard 1 – 4 Allocation of time to subjects
Table 3  Teachers’ Qualifications
Table 4  Respondents’ academic and professional information
Table 5  Key words for table 3
Table 6  Teachers’ names, initials and classroom codes
Table 7  Art and craft extracts from the 2002 lower primary national curriculum pg. 11, 12, 23.
Table 8  Extracts from teachers’ scheme of work
Table 9  Teachers’ lesson plans
Table 10  L4 lesson observation notes
Table 11  S2 lesson observation notes
Table 12  B2 lesson observation notes
Table 13  X 4 lesson observation notes
Table 14  Loso primary school participants
Table 15  Selepe primary school participants
Table 16  Budzi primary school participants
Table 17  Xai primary school participants
Table 18  Abbreviations for participants’ professions
Table 19  Participants’ gender, age and teaching experience
Table 20  Respondents’ qualifications
Table 21  Participants’ responsibilities in school and art and craft experience
Table of Contents

Declaration ........................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................................. iii
Abstract ............................................................................................................................................... iv
Abbreviations and Operational Definitions ..................................................................................... v
Abbreviations and operational definitions in relation to Botswana policies and education context .................................................................................................................................................. v
List of Tables ....................................................................................................................................... xi
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................................... xii
CHAPTER 1 ........................................................................................................................................ 1
BACKGROUND .................................................................................................................................... 1
1.1 Preamble ........................................................................................................................................ 1
1.2 Botswana in context ....................................................................................................................... 2
1.3 The education system in Botswana .............................................................................................. 4
1.4 Background information about art and craft education in Botswana ........................................ 8
1.5 Concluding summary .................................................................................................................... 14
CHAPTER 2 ........................................................................................................................................ 16
CONTEXT OF THE STUDY .................................................................................................................. 16
2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 16
2.2 Statement of the problem ............................................................................................................. 20
2.3 The purpose of the study ............................................................................................................. 24
2.4 Research questions ....................................................................................................................... 24
2.5 Hypothesis .................................................................................................................................... 26
2.6 Significance of the study ............................................................................................................. 27
2.7 Delimitations of the study ........................................................................................................... 28
CHAPTER 3 ........................................................................................................................................ 33
LITERATURE REVIEW ....................................................................................................................... 33
CHAPTER 1
BACKGROUND

1.1 Preamble

This study seeks to investigate how teachers at primary school in Botswana interpret the art and craft lower primary curriculum, six years after the introduction of the new national curriculum. The research study is presented in eight chapters, commencing with chapter 1 which provides the context of Botswana, its education system and the background information on art and craft in Botswana. The second chapter describes the context of the study. It defines aspects which motivated me to carry out the study and the beneficiaries of the research. The third chapter is the literature review which includes discussion of relevant related documents that include other studies in the art and craft curriculum and an analysis of the Botswana Creative and Performing Arts programme at lower primary. This is followed by chapter 4 as a methodology chapter, which identifies the methods used to collect and analyse data for the study together with the justification for selecting these methods. Chapter 5 constitutes a full presentation of the class-observation findings and interpretation of the data for individual case study classes with brief reflective comments; while chapter 6 deals with interview findings, and presents and analyses data referring to the class-teachers and school administrators with brief reflective comments. This is followed by chapter 7 which involves the overall considerations and evaluation of the findings including critical discussions and conclusions for the final findings presented in chapter 5 and 6. Chapter 8 finally provides a brief summary, recommendations and suggestions for further studies. I would like to first provide the context of Botswana (which is the site of the study), its education system and the background information on art and craft in Botswana prior to defining the statement, purpose, rationale and significance of the study in order to clarify the context of the research. In some
instances I will talk about ‘art and craft’ and sometimes only ‘art’ where issues involve only artwork. The other reason is that some of the documents refer to the subject as ‘art’ while some refer to it as ‘art and craft’.

1.2 Botswana in context

The Republic of Botswana, formerly the British Protectorate of Bechuanaland, is situated on the Southern part of Africa. It adopted its new name Botswana upon independence in 1966 (Ndaba, 2008). Botswana is a landlocked Country nestled between South Africa, Namibia, Zimbabwe and Zambia (Moalosi, Popovic and Hudson, 2004 and Brennan, 2006) as shown in the map in chapter 2. Botswana is a country with many fascinating cultures, due to the ethnic diversity of the country. It has a rich history and a unique culture. The country is made up of numerous ethnic groups, though the Batswana are the most numerous (http://www.gov.bw/government/ retrieved 16 March 2009). Thus, ethnicity and social groups are not the same. Botswana means "place of Tswana" in the dominant national language (Setswana), and the citizens are called Batswana, or Tswana people. The term Batswana, however, bears a double meaning. In government rhetoric, it refers to all citizens of Botswana. But the word also refers to ethnically "Tswana" people, as distinct from the other ethnic groups present in the country. This double meaning allows for both the expression of strong civic national sentiments and debate about the dominance of Tswana people and ideology over the broader population.

English is the official language and Setswana the national language. This means that the language of government and higher education is primarily English, but that Setswana is the dominant language spoken in the country. Ninety percent of the population is said to speak Setswana (http://www.gov.bw/government/ retrieved 8/05/2009). The term Setswana refers both
to Tswana language, and to Tswana practices/culture, and there has been increasing resistance to the dominance of Setswana as national language by speakers of other languages in the country; language-revival movements have also emerged. Most speakers of other languages are multilingual; some, however, have weaker competence in Setswana and have complained of disadvantages in primary schooling (Khudu-Petersen, 2008).

There are a few European, Asian, Indian and African region speakers in the country. Apart from the various languages the richness of the various ethnic groups in Botswana is being explained in poems, songs and dances, designs on products such as pottery and basketry, styles of traditional activities such as weddings, funerals, healings, religion, traditional games, shelter designs, food and greetings. For example the young Ikalanga ethnic group kneel down when greeting elders or giving them food, and sometimes clothing. Christianity is the religion of most of the population, while Islam, Hindu and indigenous beliefs are also represented. An example of the indigenous religion is that of some members of various ethnic groups’ beliefs who maintain ritual and holy places; for example, BaKalanga locate Mwali (God) in the Matopo Hills to the east, and BaHerero maintain a "holy fire," or okuruo in their compounds.

In terms of developments, the government of Botswana set up a nine person presidential task group in August 1996 to define Vision 2016. The task force produced a booklet in 1997 entitled “A framework for a Long Term Vision for Batswana”. This booklet described a national manifesto for the people of Botswana which is discussed in detail in chapters 6 and 7. The document reflects views of many different parts of Botswana. According to the government of Botswana, it is a statement of long term goals that identifies the challenges implied by those goals and proposes a set of strategies that will meet them. The year 2016
was chosen as Botswana will be in its 50th year of independence. “The development plans of Botswana have always been based upon the four national principles, which are democracy, development, self-reliance and unity. These principles are still valid today, and must be refocused to embrace change and relate to Botswana’s current level of development” (Botswana Vision 2016 Council, 2004, p. 1).

1.3 The education system in Botswana

Since Botswana’s independence in 1966, it has had two major educational reforms, in the form of Education Commissions that reviewed the state of education in the country in 1977 and 1994 (Republic of Botswana, 1993/97). Reference to these commissions will be made in the subsequent sections of this chapter and other chapters as the need arises. Botswana gives education high priority to meet its goals of having an educated and informed nation by 2016. Every child from primary (7 – 13 years) to secondary (14 - 19 years) has the right to education. In his 2005 budget speech, the Minister of Finance and Development Planning, Gaolathe, said pursuant to the Vision 2016’s pillar of ‘An Educated And Informed Nation’ and the Millennium Development Goal of ‘Achieving Universal Primary Education’, the government remains committed to provide opportunities for learning at every stage of life. He further explained that:

to be successful in the century, an economy must be powered by ideas, imagination and innovation. Knowledge is the road, both to economic progress and individual opportunity, and education is the bridge to take us there. In this connection, Government will continue to invest substantial funds into human resource development with emphasis on education and training. It is as a result of the substantial investment in education that Botswana attained 100 percent access to primary education in 2000…Government will continue with the implementation of the Revised National Policy on Education, in line with the commitment of Vision 2016 of “an educated and informed nation. Government will have safety nets to ensure that children who come from needy backgrounds are not denied education (p. 17-23).
The RNCE (1997) discusses the national educational goals which emphasizes the raising of educational standards in line with a set of national principles that Botswana possesses. These principles are seen by leaders as the foundation for building the country. The four national principles are democracy, development, self-reliant and unity.

In combination these four principles produce the national philosophy of Kagisano, meaning social harmony, and embracing the concepts of social justice, interdependence and mutual assistance. ... Given this firm sense of national direction, the commission’s first task has been to reflect on how the education system of Botswana might help to produce a society whose major characteristics are democracy, development, self-reliance, and unity, and which expresses the idea of Kagisano. ... Assuming that these goals have been correctly identified it will be for policy makers, administrators, curriculum developers and teachers to more specify the more immediate classroom and course objectives that the high level goals imply (RNCE, 1997, p. 23-24).

Kagisano which means ‘social harmony’ has been described by the first President of Botswana as the totality of the four national principles outlined above. All the departments in Botswana develop their aims and objectives based on the country’s national principles. Vision 2016 bases its targets on these principles. Art and craft education is among the subjects which can build social harmony among the societies as it encourages the communities to identify their identities and that of others so as to understand and appreciate each other. Art and craft educationists such as Venet (2002), Andrew (2005) and Dash (2007) encourage art and craft educators to observe culture in their teaching as they deal with people of different cultures. The Botswana education system is in three structures which are primary (7-13 years old), junior secondary (14-16 years old) and senior secondary (17-19 years old). Primary is seven years, Junior Secondary three while Senior Secondary is two years. It is a 7+3+2 system. The Government adopted a ten-year Basic Education, that is, seven years primary and 3 years junior secondary education. The aims of this ten-year Basic Education Programme are discussed in chapter 3. Primary and junior secondary education are made
available for all students because the government considers access to basic education a fundamental human right with the belief that education system must develop moral and social values, cultural identity and self – esteem, good citizenship and desirable work ethics (RNPE, 1994).

Among these phases, primary school is believed to be the national priority by the government of Botswana. RNCE (1997) tends to confirm this view by stating that “of all the levels and types of education it has been asked to consider, the commission feels bound to accord the highest priority to improvement and reform at the primary level” (p. 53). This is because it is seen to be the foundation of other stages of learning. This is emphasised by Phuthego (2007) who observes that:

Of all the levels of education, primary education is paramount since it provides the foundation on which subsequent educational development is built. There is, therefore, a need to ensure that such a foundation is firm, as a way of ensuring that whatever is to be built upon it, by way of secondary and tertiary education curricula, stands on firm ground (p. 2).

It is for this reason that I investigated the extent to which teachers interpreted art and craft curriculum at the first level (lower primary) of learning in primary school in Botswana.

To address the basic education manifesto which requires all children to attend a ten year-basic education, the government of Botswana has made efforts to promote education for children of people that the state has designated as Remote Area Dwellers (RADs).

In Botswana government terms, remote area dwellers are those people who are defined on the bases of their (1) spatial location (remote areas outside villages), (2) sociopolitical status (marginalized), and (3) socioeconomic status (impoverished and subject to discrimination). The numbers of people designated as Remote Area Dwellers in Botswana vary, depending on the
source of the information, but an estimate of the numbers of people living in remote rural parts of the country range from 60,000 – 100,000. Of these numbers, some 50,000 are San or Bushmen. One of the major problems of RADs in Botswana is that some of them live in areas not only outside of gazetted villages (those villages with 500 or more people) but also outside of remote area settlements where there are schools (Hitchcock, 2005, p.1) cited in http://www.kalaharipeoples.org/documents/Educ-san.htm.

These are people living in rural agricultural areas known as ‘lands’ settlements in Botswana or those living on cattle-posts as well as those living on freehold farms. According to Hitchcock (2005) cited in http://www.kalaharipeoples.org/documents/Educ-san.htm in most cases, the San in these places get little opportunity to go to schools. The government provides funds for physical and social infrastructure including schools, clothing and transport for these communities. Examples of such activities in place are two schools Selepe and Budzi from the remote and remotest areas included in my study.

The medium of instruction in standard one is Setswana except when teaching English as a subject. The lower primary syllabus provides a basis for teaching and learning for standards one to four and are categorised into six subjects: cultural studies, creative and performing arts, environmental science, mathematics, Setswana and English (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). This department further stipulates in the lower primary syllabus that standard four diagnostic tests will be administered for the purpose of remediation. The upper primary syllabus involves mathematics, Setswana, English, social studies, science and creative and performing arts, which draws its content from art and craft, design and technology, physical education, music, drama, dance, business studies and home economics. It is compulsory for every student in the primary school to study all the subjects in the curriculum. However, there are those which are termed as ‘core’ in which students sit their examination at the end of lower primary and upper primary. At the end of their fourth year at a lower primary, children sit attainment tests on mathematics, English and Setswana.
If one does not pass these subjects, they are given a chance to repeat the fourth year once before proceeding to the first year of the Upper Primary which is the fifth year in a primary education. This individual will sit a further examination at the end of primary education which is the seventh and covers the five core subjects which are: mathematics, English, Setswana, social studies and science.

1.4 Background information about art and craft education in Botswana

Art and craft plays an important part in the cultural heritage of Africa. Examples include rock paintings which are more abundant in the Southern African area than in any part of the world. They are located in over 2,000 sites throughout the region (Botswana society, national museum, monuments and gallery, 1993). In Botswana art and craft has always been part of the people’s lives and it was used to communicate their ways of lives. Local cultural heritage in Botswana includes the Basarwa rock paintings, decorative architecture, pottery and basketry. “The paintings are believed to have been made using natural stains from plants, animal blood, or chalk. … The paintings record important information about the social and cultural activities of the Basarwa as well as the migration of other groups of people into the area” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 1992, p. 159).

Chanda (1999) notes that, through the ages, art and craft in African countries has integrated and celebrated different aspects of life, politics, religion, personal beliefs and ways of responding to the outside world. In Africa all sorts of activities have been integrated together in the art and craft making process such as music, dance, literature, pottery and cinema. Art and craft activities in the past in Botswana were passed from one generation to another through informal oral and practical education. Girls could learn pottery and weaving from
their grandmothers and aunts and boys learnt wood carving from their grandfathers and uncles to create objects such as stools, wooden spoons, wooden plates.

Despite the fact that art and craft in Botswana was taken seriously by the communities in the past, it was not recognised as an important subject in primary schools. Today it still remains a low status non-compulsory subject in secondary education, often taught in primary schools to keep children busy or used as therapy in primary school (Ndaba, 1990 and Dichaba, 2002). The government newsletter Art Mo Botswana (1988) says the arts and crafts were considered by teachers to be for low achievers in schools. As a result, teachers have not been committed to teaching art and craft as a subject in which there is valuable knowledge, understanding and skills to be acquired. The Report of the National Commission on Education (1993) states that art and craft as a discipline was then offered as an optional subject but without a syllabus. The same commission recommended that immediate initiatives should be taken to develop the art and craft syllabus. Suggestions for improving the primary curriculum covered three broad areas, among them “the need to make the curriculum more practical; … the need to make the curriculum to inculcate cultural and moral values in children; … (Report of the National Commission on Education, 1993, p. 104). This resulted in the introduction of Creative and Performing Arts programme for lower primary in 2002 and the upper primary in 2005.

Initially in 1992 when art and craft was first introduced to the Botswana educational curriculum, this only took place at junior and secondary school levels, primary schools being an exception. It started off delivered by only a handful of the junior and senior secondary schools (Dichaba, 2002). However, Mpowe (2002) was concerned that it was offered as an optional subject because it was a non-examined subject and hence parents too perceive the
subject as preparing their children for manual jobs rather than white-collar jobs. Additionally, because art and craft was not formally assessed in Botswana, teachers and students put comparatively little effort into it. Since 2000/2001, art and craft has started to be an examined subject at junior secondary schools. It was later introduced to primary schools in 2002. The popular impression of art and craft education has been either that of a subject to entertain children particularly those who are not academically inclined, or as a subject for talented individuals who can draw, paint, or sculpt (Ndaba, 1990).

According to Dichaba (2002) the introduction of art and craft in junior secondary schools before primary schools created an ambiguity that was later felt at junior secondary school. He showed concern that “most of the students who later choose to take art as an optional subject at this level always find themselves lacking the art foundation upon which to build in their new experiences because they would be meeting the subject for the first time” (p. 8). Failing to argue for art and craft education by teachers could have been due to their inability to formulate a case to justify and clarify the importance of art and craft in the curriculum, as they may have had comparatively limited knowledge and understanding of the subject. Even at the time there were few teachers trained in the art and craft discipline not enough initiation was done to convince the Education Ministry of the important function art and craft perform in the curriculum. Emphasis in the primary school curriculum was on formal and cognitive forms of education. There was no allowance for the expressive form of education where children could draw, paint or sculpt to express their feelings. As a result, art and craft education in Botswana is still in its infancy at all levels within Botswana’s educational system. Before the introduction of art and craft in primary schools, teaching art and craft was a matter of choice. In others opportunities depended on schools’ attitudes and approaches to the various forms. Boys did woodwork and girls tended to do home economics, as already
Woodwork was taught from standard five to seven in primary schools and these classes included children of twelve to fourteen years of age as the starting age for primary schooling was eight according to the Botswana Education Policy. The woodwork curriculum included crafts such as wooden spoons, wooden dishes, wooden chairs and wooden toys in the shape of for example, the country’s wild and domestic animals.

There was also a lack of continuity in activities. If properly managed, schools would have been monitoring pupils’ work giving them a chance to continue with what they had not completed in the lower classes. By so doing this might have covered the aspect of progression which is emphasised by the newly introduced standard one to four syllabus for lower primary. Scarcity of good practice and unfavourable school attitudes to art and craft restricted opportunities for children to learn through art and craft (Dichaba, 2002 and Mpowe, 2002).

“In 1983, a panel of concerned art educators was convened to address major problems confronting the subject of art and since then, there had been some progress. Hence a programme of study was designed at the University of Botswana and other institutions” (Mpowe, 2002, p. 14). This programme was in teacher training colleges for secondary education and the University of Botswana. The University of Botswana at that time introduced an art and craft curriculum as a foundation course on elective modules and which was only taught for a semester. It was in 1994 that it was introduced as a specialist course, where students could choose to study it for three years as their area of educational focus. More development was introduced by the University of Botswana with the Ministry of Education as distance-learning in 2000, but that time art and craft was not taught due to unavailability of teaching materials and limited lecturers in that area. An art and craft programme for distance-learners was introduced in 2001 as lecturers worked under pressure
to develop modules. At primary level which runs for seven years, the art and craft programme introduced in January 2002 is compulsory for all students. The curriculum was a response to the requirement of the 1994 Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) which recommended that “a wide range of practical subjects be included in the primary curriculum in order to help students develop an understanding and appreciation of technology, manipulative skills and familiarity with tools, equipment and materials” (Curriculum Development Division, 2002, p. 1).

Cleave and Sharp (1986) emphasise the importance of a curriculum in primary school teaching. They advise that primary school teachers should have guidelines giving a supportive framework to help them develop confidence in their art and craft teaching. Cleave and Sharp explains that “the aim of such guidelines would be to contribute to curriculum cohesion, sequencing and continuity in the arts throughout the school” (p. 44). However, these guidelines could only achieve their goals if educators had sufficient knowledge, understanding and skills to translate or implement the curricular in relation to the government policies. Dorn (2002) recommends that art and craft teachers must recognise that educational policies which include the national educational goals are framed as public policies that are for the most part unrelated to the aesthetic or artistic goals of the education programme. He notes that “these national goals as public policies have mostly to do with the social, political, and economic goals of local, state and federal governmental programmes. As public policies they are more concerned with issues such as law and order, employment and commerce. While art and craft may contribute to realising some of these goals, they may not necessarily or sufficiently for the purposes of art and craft, or address what art and craft does best.

Before 1997, teacher trainees could meet untrained lecturers and had limited facilities in colleges of education. Eventually these students graduated and became art and craft teachers
with very little knowledge of the subject they were supposed to teach. Current facilities are still a concern according to the results of this study, but there is improvement in staff development as the government had sponsored teachers to study art and craft masters’ degree training to prepare them to lecture in colleges of education. Each primary college of education has a maximum of two art and craft lecturers with a master’s degree.

Art and craft was and still is examinable at the secondary school level though it is still considered as optional or elective. “The resulting status, then, of art education includes a gap that exists between the primary and secondary school programmes. The senior secondary schools programme have been using the Cambridge O level School Certificate art syllabus up until 2000, when the examination became localized” (Dichaba, 2000, p. 9). Nevertheless, in the newly introduced art and craft curriculum for lower primary in Botswana, it is indicated that “teachers are required to construct termly tests for each standard to assess what learners have attained throughout the course” (p. 2). It is also mentioned that a national test, based on the attainment targets will be conducted at the end of standard 4 by the Examinations Research and Testing Division (ERTD). This shows that there is some progress in the recognition of the subject by the Ministry of Education. However, unless the school administrators and parents understand the status or the value of art and craft in the schools, their attitudes towards the subjects may well remain the same. This is a big challenge for the country’s art and craft specialists which include teachers and professional artists, to convince people about the rationale of teaching art and craft in schools. Art educators must be equipped to inform administrators and school boards with evidence of the validity, necessity and significance of the art and craft in education (Hicks, 2004).
1.5 Concluding summary

- It is essential to look at the context of Botswana’s public education in a broader spectrum to better understand how the current educational structure affects art and craft and education in primary schools.

- Botswana is one of the democratic countries which values education as the government considers access to basic education a fundamental human right with the belief that for the country to develop peacefully, it needs citizens who are educated and informed; citizens who have moral and social values; citizens who are aware of their cultural identities and self-esteem and citizens who have desirable working ethics.

- The country has stipulated its policies and visions as targets for the year 2016 when the country will be celebrating its fiftieth anniversary since it declaring its independence from the British protectorate.

- All departments derive their working habits, rules or code of regulations from the government policies which include the national principles and the country’s visions.

- The Government adopted a ten-year Basic Education, that is, seven years primary and three years junior secondary education. These two phases are made available for all students.

- Among these phases, primary education is believed to be the national priority by the government of Botswana.

- For too long, art and craft education had been badly served by the Botswana institutions before the introduction of its curriculum. Elders used art and craft to communicate and improve community life such as home interiors. The potential educational value of the subject was seldom recognized or valued.
The subject was first introduced in the secondary schools in 1992 and later in primary schools in 2002.

The result is an apparent lack of continuity within the public school programme.

The fact that art and craft was not formally taught at primary school due to lack of an appropriate curriculum, although it may have been offered as an optional and non-examinable component of the school curriculum made it difficult to give the discipline a secure and viable footing.

It is also essential to realise that art and craft as a discipline, since its inception, has been categorised under the optional subjects in secondary schools and is compulsory in primary schools.

As with any other new subject in the school curriculum, art and craft has, since its inception in 1987, suffered from a chronic shortage of trained teachers. The curriculum development and evaluation department personnel are responsible for and ensuring the full professional development of the subject on the curriculum.

The next chapter will discuss the context of the study. It includes issues which motivated me to carry out this research.
CHAPTER 2

CONTEXT OF THE STUDY

2.1 Introduction

This chapter describes issues which led to the study. It includes the purpose of the study, research questions (which guide the study), its hypothesis, significance and delimitations (which describe the geographical set up of the regions of study) and the case study school contexts.

The government of Botswana constituted a commission for education in 1976 and it submitted its report in 1977. “This report has been a source of concern for many with an interest in the development of education” (Phuthego, 2007, p. 2-3). The concern heightened with the introduction of a revised syllabus for primary education following the (RNPE) of 1994 (Republic of Botswana, 2002). Of particular interest to me is the introduction of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) in 2002 which according to Wright, (1995) draws its content from the following four areas: art and craft, music, design and technology and physical education. This is primarily because I come from an art and craft education background and I am concerned about the extent to which it is implemented within the CAPA programme and how its implementation as a new subject in the syllabus is progressing. Botswana primary education syllabus has been split into levels, namely, lower primary which includes standard one to four and upper primary which involves standard five to seven.

As already mentioned, in 2002 a new programme called Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) was introduced in Botswana primary schools. CAPA according to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation department (2002) is a programme that draws its content from
art and craft, design and technology, drama, dance, music and physical education. These subject disciplines are termed modules. Art and craft is called ‘communication’ module, design and technology is ‘designing and making’ whereas, music, drama, dance and physical education have been packaged as one module named ‘listening, composing and performing’. Each module has its own separate topics, general and specific objectives. Considering that the foreword page of the lower primary syllabus includes a general statement which indicates that some subjects in the lower primary syllabus were put together to facilitate project teaching and integration, one would assume that these three subjects were seen to be closely related and therefore put together for easy access for integration although there is no evidence of integration in the organisation of the modules. The challenge posed by the diverse nature of the subject matter in the Creative and Performing Arts programme, especially to the teacher who might be a specialist in only one specific area or not specialised in any of these subject disciplines, is paramount.

According to Phuthego (2008) neighbouring countries South Africa and Namibia have closely similar structures of the arts curricular to that of Botswana which include dance, drama, music and visual arts. The two countries’ arts curricular emphasise integration of the arts subject disciplines or their activities. The arts curricular for all these countries advocate the assessment of the arts subjects and keeping detailed records which clearly define pupils’ progression in these subjects. This has been discussed in detail in chapter 3 and 7. Unlike in Botswana, where art and craft education is at infancy, Bamford (2006) states that Senegal (among other African countries) has long introduced arts education which has contributed to the education of artists and the public. Education administrators in Senegal, according to Bamford’s research findings, are equipped with knowledge and skills in art and craft and hence come up with quality decision making in arts education.
The CAPA programme’s “main aims among other things are to help students develop their creativity, aesthetic skills, psychomotor skills and the love for the arts” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p. 1). Prior to this, art and craft, music and physical education appeared in primary school timetables and were taught without a curriculum or centrally controlled guidelines. Design and technology was not included in the primary school timetable and was not taught at that time. The introduction of the CAPA programme in Botswana primary schools came as a result of the first National Policy on ‘Education called Education for Kagisanyo,’ which was introduced in 1977. This policy observed the lack of orientation of primary education to the world of work. To address this problem, the second National Commission on Education, which was introduced in 1993, recommended a review of the primary curriculum to incorporate practical subjects. This recommendation was adopted by the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE, 1994) of the Republic of Botswana which maintained that immediate initiatives should be taken to develop syllabuses for art and craft, home economics, music and physical education.

Two reports compiled by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department on their findings on the CAPA dated July 2004 and July 2005 indicate that the lower primary syllabus was first taught in 2002 with the introduction of standard one and two. Standard three started operating in primary schools in 2003 whereas standard four was introduced at the same time with standard five in 2005. This means that at the time of my data collection, standard one and two had operated for five years, standard three for four years and standard four for two years. The art and craft curriculum I am evaluating therefore is a very recent edition to the Botswana education system.
The study sets out to investigate class-teachers’ and school administrators’ practices and their opinions on the teaching and learning of art and craft using this newly introduced Creative and Performing Arts programme. The main reasons for choosing to undertake a study in art and craft among other CAPA disciplines are threefold:

- As an art and craft lecturer and primary school teacher-trainer, I have identified issues of concern in art and craft as a discipline which prompted me to analyse the workings of the new curriculum. These issues are discussed later in this chapter.

- Considering that I have comparatively limited understanding and knowledge in some of these disciplines I was not confident to research them all as I could not sufficiently make a secure case argument on their content and strategies of teaching and learning.

- The study might be at risk of being too broad if it covered all the CAPA disciplines requiring a significantly longer period of study with concomitant administrative and practical problems.

The research took place in four selected Botswana primary schools, with special reference to lower primary composed of standards one to four. These schools were selected from two regions of various geographical settings called South Central and Central North and this is discussed in detail in chapter 4. The children of these classes are aged from seven to ten years. The need for this study is of paramount importance to Botswana where according to Ndaba (1990) and Mpowe (2002) art and craft had not been sufficiently taught before the introduction of the CAPA programme by most schools, mainly due to the absence of an appropriate curriculum and the lack of knowledge and skills in the subject by the majority of primary school teachers. The study has examined how teachers in each of the case study schools were attempting to meet the aims, objectives and learning outcomes of the Botswana art and craft curriculum in the lower primary classes, with reference to the status core stipulated in section 2.5. Two classes, standard two and four were observed during art and
craft lessons in each school. In addition four lower primary teachers including the ones observed teaching art and craft lessons and two art and craft administrators were interviewed in each case study school to make a total of twenty-four respondents.

2.2 Statement of the problem

According to the various reports compiled by the Botswana art and craft panel and art and external examiners for colleges of education for primary school teacher-training between 1998 and 2008, it has been observed in some instances that the provision of art and craft has not been well dealt with. The discipline had always been less of a priority than the languages, mathematics and sciences in both colleges of education and primary schools and it has been further downgraded (Dichaba, 2002). Issues of concern about art and craft as a discipline had been identified as too few teachers being trained to teach the subject, lack of a convincingly designed curriculum or guidelines to use for planning and teaching the subject, lack of resources and exclusion of the subject from the national examinations. It became evident that art and craft had been appearing in primary school timetables to be taught without an appropriate curriculum or guideline until the introduction of the standards one to four syllabus in 2002 and standard five to seven in 2005 by the Ministry of Education. This was evidenced by the Report of the National Commission on Education (1993) when it stated that art and craft as a discipline was to be offered without a syllabus. Teachers tended to treat this subject as a therapy or leisure activity whereby, for example, children were told to draw when the teacher was not prepared to teach or when attending school meetings.

According to Nthomang and Paul (2006) due to limited knowledge in art and craft, most primary school teachers did not evaluate or assess pupils’ work and hence any educational feedback on what children had accomplished was severely limited. This resulted in most of
the children losing interest in the subject and not taking it seriously. I have witnessed these problems over a period of seventeen years when teaching in primary schools ten of which as an administrator. I also observed it when working with primary school teachers during my time assessing student-teachers in their teaching practice in primary schools while I was a college lecturer for five years; and when assessing student teachers for colleges of education on their final teaching practice as an external examiner. Teachers had consistently related art and craft as a discipline with drawing and little else. Those few teachers who had been trained and eventually specialised in the subject used their notes, handouts and textbooks from their respective colleges to plan and teach the subject in primary schools.

In Botswana, there are children who come from low socio-economic backgrounds who cannot afford to take their children to pre-schools or English Medium schools where most of art and craft activities are commonly practised. These are those who are further disadvantaged by living in remote areas where there is no access to mass media or nursery school education and hence they may be comparatively less motivated to consider art and craft as a vocational opportunity. Moreover, Botswana is one of the African countries which is often faced by problems of drought due to lack of rains as between 2004 and 2006. It is an African society depending on benevolent climate, its people rely on farming and suffer from droughts such as that declared in 2005. To try to address this problem, the government of Botswana introduced schemes whereby people could get money from the government to run businesses seen to be of benefit. As many people lacked skills of creating self-reliant activities which could benefit them, funds were tied up with the government while these people lacked food and other basic needs. Yet ‘self reliant’ is one of the country’s four national principles. This principle is emphasised by the Vision 2016 document which advocates for a prosperous, productive and innovative nation by 2016 (Republic of Botswana, 2005). Many of these skills could be
developed at a younger age through art and craft lessons as the subject encompasses practical skills and encourages problem solving and the use of self-reliant opportunities. Havens (2002) an American, who once taught in Botswana colleges of education advises teachers to inform pupils of the benefit they could gain from skills developed when learning art and craft in the primary school. There is a growing concern from all political parties in Botswana that university and college graduates roam on the streets jobless, because they had been not sufficiently sensitised to the world of work by being offered courses which introduce, maintain and develop entrepreneurial skills in schools and which could help them to be self-reliant.

One of the strategies adopted by the policy to address the problem of orienting primary education specifically to the world of work included the reviewing of the curriculum to incorporate practical subjects. Thus, the Creative and Performing Arts for standards one to four programmes was introduced between 2002 and 2005. This was a response to the Revised National Policy on Education (1994) recommendation that “immediate steps should be taken to develop a continuous basic education curriculum with Junior Certificate curriculum building upon the primary curriculum” (p. 17). The RNPE (1994) idea was an adoption of the 1993 Revised National Commission on Education (RNCE, 1993) strategy of incorporating practical subjects in the curriculum to address the problem of orienting primary school education to the world of work. After the introduction of the 2002 lower primary syllabus, I was concerned about the structure of the arts programme as art and craft was put together with music, physical education, drama, dance and design and technology to be one faculty under the umbrella ‘Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA).’ The reason for putting them together according to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department was to facilitate project teaching and integration. I questioned how teachers might teach these
subjects. Secondly, the CAPA programme seemed to be congested especially in the art and craft aspect. The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department recommended that the whole CAPA programme be allocated at least five hours a week and I anticipated that this would not be enough to cover all the topics by the end of the year. In addition, when assessing colleges of education student teachers final teaching practice as an external examiner in 2004, I observed that they had difficulties in approaching the CAPA programme due to the combination of subjects and congested objectives.

The research was also prompted by my close involvement in the writing of primary school art and craft materials. These included CAPA text-books and teachers’ guides for both lower and upper primary classes and the art and craft distance-learning module for year 3 diploma in primary education which is used by primary school teacher trainees. As these reference books and art and craft module for distance-learners were written for primary education, it was of significance to visit the CAPA programme to make sure that the content addresses what pupils were expected to learn and what teachers were expected to teach to pupils. The content on professional studies sections in that module suggests how teachers could approach specific art and craft topics when teaching primary school children.

Given this contextual feature, I was keen to investigate primary school teachers’ and their administrators’ opinions on the delivering of art and craft, following the newly introduced curriculum. The study was expected to determine whether strategies used in the teaching of art and craft addressed the aims and objectives of the curriculum and whether art and craft as a discipline was integrated or taught as a separate subject. Government documents such as the long term vision for Botswana called ‘Vision 2016 – Towards Prosperity for All’ introduced in 1997 were consulted and incorporated prior to development of the research instruments
and collection of data considering that every department in the country is expected to operate within the requirements of the government policies, visions and missions. The country’s emerging issues were also observed in relation to art and craft education to identify the role of the subject in addressing such issues. The key pillars of the long term vision 2016 document are that:

> By the year 2016, Botswana will be an educated and informed nation. All people will be able to have good quality education that is adapted to the needs of the country… Botswana will be a prosperous, productive and innovative nation” (Presidential Task Group, 1997, p. 5-6).

According to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) the curricula changes had also taken recognisance of the long term vision for Botswana (Vision 2016), and the challenges posed by emerging issues such as HIV/AIDS and environmental concerns.

2.3 The purpose of the study

The aim of this study was to investigate how primary school teachers in the four selected schools in two regions in Botswana interpreted the art and craft curriculum at lower primary. The study examined how far and how well they met the aims, objectives and learning outcomes guided by the key research questions stipulated in section 2.4.

2.4 Research questions

The final research questions were modified and refined during the course of the planning procedure, as my understanding of the theoretical and methodological complexities involved in my particular topic and approach deepened and became more focused. The research originated from concerns over the situation in which art and craft currently found itself as a curriculum subject, particularly its combination with the four disciplines listed in the opening
section of this chapter, the apparent congestion of objectives and concern about reports indicating teachers failing to teach the CAPA, people’s negative attitudes towards the subject and indication of limited resources including staff and facilities. Ndaba (1990) and Ziga (1997) have raised concerns that art and craft was not being seriously taught in Botswana primary schools due to the lack of trained teachers. The original intention therefore, was to explore the changes art and craft curriculum had brought to the education system in the primary school and to identify those factors that might help or hinder its implementation. Thus, the fundamental research question guiding this study was ‘What changes and challenges have been brought about by the new art and craft curriculum at lower primary?’ The question focused on primary school teachers’ instruction in art and craft at lower primary level. Specific questions that develop from the general or broad research question were as follows:

i) To what extent do the subject matter, methods and approaches used in the teaching of art and craft address the attainment targets of the CAPA programme and the aims and objectives of the art and craft curriculum?

ii) Is art and craft taught as a separate subject or integrated with the other arts?

iii) To what extent do teachers evaluate pupils’ performance in art and craft through formative and summative assessment emphasised and required by the CAPA programme?

iv) Is the time allocated to the art and craft discipline adequate to cover all topics by the end of the year?

v) Do schools have adequate facilities to teach the art and craft curriculum?

The study passed through several stages of refinement and refocusing and I have discussed these interesting developments in chapter 4. In particular, the interview instruments for the
study were re-defined after a pilot study was carried out in two regions with pupils of the multicultural groups of Botswana. I considered operating within Parlett and Hamilton’s (1972) theoretical model of ‘Evaluation as Illuminative’ when employing a case study method as a qualitative approach since it addresses the need to recognise flexibility of participants in approaching the curriculum. This model “takes account of the wider contexts in educational programmes function. Its primary concern is with description and interpretation rather than measurements and prediction” (Parlett ad Hamilton, 1972, p. 11). These theorists further explain that pupils do not respond merely to presented content and tasks assigned, rather they adapt to and work within the learning context taken as an interrelated whole. They refer to Syder (1971) who believe that pupils pay close attention to ‘hidden’ as well as ‘visible curricula’. According to Parlett and Hamilton illuminative evaluation is not a standard methodological package but general research strategy aiming to be both adaptable and eclectic. They submit that “characteristically in illuminative evaluation there are three stages: investigators observe, inquire further, and then seek to explain…Since illuminative evaluation concentrates on examining the innovation as an integral part of the learning milieu, there is definite emphasis both on observation at the classroom level and on interviewing participating instructors and students” (p. 16). This idea informed my research methodology strategies both in classroom observation and interview methods as it tallies with the adopted qualitative approach. The procedure on how this particular method was adapted and adopted is discussed in detail in chapter 4.

2.5 Hypothesis

- The putting together of art and craft with the three disciplines, music, physical education and design and technology, to be interpreted within one curricula system could be confusing for teachers considering that most of them did not specialise in all these areas.
Some might well be focusing on areas where they were most confident virtually ignoring the other subject areas.

- The congestion of art and craft specific objectives to be covered in each academic year might result in some of the topics not being covered sufficiently by the end of an academic year.
- There could be a problem of time constraints for teachers arising from teaching all the four disciplines with an allocation of around five hours per a week.
- There could be inadequate human and physical resources, considering that this was the first time that an art and craft curriculum had been introduced in the country.

2.6 Significance of the study

The study has been undertaken as a result of my professional concern as a teacher-trainer being involved in training teachers to teach in primary schools, colleges of education and administrators in a number of different educational institutions. My experience, formal and informal discussions with teachers in primary schools, trainees and colleagues indicated that the teaching and learning of art and craft needed to be improved. This study is therefore, potentially significant in identifying strategies for improving the teaching, learning and administering of art and craft in Botswana.

The study is expected to contribute to research documentation that might be addressed to the Ministry of Education especially the policy makers, the Teacher Training and Development (TT&D) and the Curriculum Development and Evaluation departments with the accurate and informative current feedback on how teachers interpret the art and craft curriculum. These departments might interpret and operationalise some or most of the findings of the research.
study as needs assessment for improving the art and craft education in Botswana. Moreover, I will specifically use the opportunity to obtain feedback on those art and craft teachers who graduated from the University of Botswana. This research study may provide important and useful information and guidance to primary school text-book publishing companies on the strengths and weaknesses of the CAPA prescribed materials for future development. Art and craft practitioners, the Ministry of Education and individual primary schools are expected to identify and recognise the need for the introduction of artists and crafts-people in residence in primary schools to promote the subject for the benefit of the pupils, teachers and the community at large. Finally, the introduction of the art and craft curriculum as monitored by this research study is expected to be viewed as a way forward for the country. Art and craft educationists, the Ministry of Education and stake holders would gain new educational insights and knowledge about the discipline’s application in primary schools. The study aims to alert its readers to the value of art and craft to society in general and primary pupils in particular. Lastly, the education system is expected to recognise the importance of the community to the learning of art and craft as a discipline and the other arts.

2.7 Delimitations of the study

This section deals with geographical and delimitations sectors of the study. Botswana Education Department has divided all the districts in the country into six regions for an appropriate allocation of schools to education officers and education offices in the councils. These are: West Region, Central North, Central South, South, South Central and North. It further divided regions into inspectoral areas to be managed by the education officers and council offices which supply materials to primary schools. The study was conducted in the South Central Region and Central North regions shown in red and green in the map of Botswana below:
South Central Region is divided into ten inspectorial areas and Central North into six. South Central region was chosen because it is the biggest in both size and number of primary schools. This provided the opportunity to choose from of a variety of case study schools. It has 195 schools compared with the South Region that has 179, Central South with 162, Central North with 120, and West Region with 87 and North with 73 schools.

These regions were also chosen because they had remote, remotest, sub-urban and urban locations, which was representative of all characteristics and variables of the country as a whole. The Central North region includes a greater variety of ethnic groups than other parts of the country therefore it was included to represent various ethnic groups in the study. Hannaway and Talbert (1993) are of the view that researchers in effective schools should recognise differences between schools’ various attributes such as location, socio-economic status and learner ethnicity. Kumar (1999) seems to share the same view as he says that:
In selecting a method of data collection, the socio-economic-demographic characteristics of the study population play an important role: you should know as much as possible about characteristics such as educational level, age-structure, socio-economic status and ethnic background. If possible, it is helpful to know the study population's interest in, and attitude towards, participation in the study. Some populations, for a number of reasons, may not feel either at ease with a particular method of data collection, (such as being interviewed) or comfortable to express opinions in a questionnaire. Furthermore, people with little education may respond differently to certain methods of data collection compared to people with more education (p. 105).

The subjects of the study were drawn from four primary schools named for the purpose of the study Loso, Selepe, Budzi and Xai which were coded as L, S, B and X respectively during data collection for this research. Codes attached to schools were the first letters of the schools' names given to them during the study. The issue of environment and culture was considered when selecting schools as Botswana schools are based in different settlements which could influence the teaching and learning of art and craft. “... Innovatory programmes, even for research purposes, cannot sensibly be separated from the learning milieux of which they become part” (Parlett and Hamilton (1972, p. 12). Thus, the study was conducted under four geographical locations known as urban, rural, remote and remotest according to the Botswana statistics division. The four concepts are defined under the operational terms section.

There were 1043 pupils in Loso primary schools on roll, 652 in Selepe, 558 in Budzi and 562 in Xai at the time of this study. Pupils from the two schools in the remote and the remotest area came not only from the locality but also included pupils from the surrounding areas of the locality, and these children from the outskirts had boarding facilities. There were 130 boarding students in Selepe, 63 girls and 67 boys while Budzi had 307, 191 girls and 116 boys. These pupils were of multicultural ethnic groups. Unlike those pupils from other case study areas, all in the urban school classes (Loso) wore a school uniform. About 85% in a
rural school and very few in remote and remotest areas were in school uniform. This is because these pupils were from families of different socio-economic status and these aspects have been discussed in detail in chapter 1. These schools were some of the Botswana government primary schools which offer basic education to pupils at the ages between seven and fourteen. One major component of the Botswana education system is basic education. “This was initially of nine–year duration, but subsequently increased to ten years, in consonance with the prescriptions of the UNESCO – Sponsored World Conference on Education for All, Jomtien, Thailand, 1990” (Ajiboe and Adeyinka, 2007). As it is the case in other government primary schools, two ministries were responsible for these schools, one being the Ministry of Education responsible for curriculum issues and the other, financial activities such as teachers’ salaries and other expenses. The other ministry was the Local Government and Lands which was responsible for the purchasing of books and other materials and school buildings.

Just by coincidence I learnt during the meeting with the South Central Region internal school administrators that there was a piloting project in primary schools going on whereby specialisation of subjects was piloted in seventy-eight out of seven hundred and twenty-eight primary schools in Botswana and that their school was among those schools. According to the information from the Ministry of Education and the school head the school was among the six primary schools chosen by the Ministry of Education to pilot subject specialisation out of 71 in that region. I was informed that teachers were teaching their area of specialisation. This pilot only included three levels standard four, five and six therefore the standard four class to be observed was among the piloting group. I got so interested in observing how they do it with the CAPA syllabus at lower primary, which is packed with four trends in which art and craft is inclusive but having teachers who have specialised in only one, if not two, of
these subjects. But, all the three primary schools in the Central North Region under my study were not involved in the project therefore each teacher taught all the subjects in the primary school curriculum as required by the Ministry of Education Department. This did not affect my study as my focus was not on piloting teachers but on how any standard two and four lower primary teacher handled art and craft lessons.

According to one of the Education Officers in the South Central region and Loso staff, the project started the first term of the school in 2007 and involved standard 4 - 6 classes. It was about four months in place when I started my research. It was an implementation of one of the recommendations of the 1994 Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE). It is important to note that in lower primary syllabus, all the subjects except English, Setswana and mathematics are combined, but separated in the upper primary syllabus. For example, moral education and social studies are aspects of cultural studies in lower primary but separated at upper primary. In contrast, art and craft, music, physical education, drama, dance and design and technology are put together as CAPA subjects in both lower and upper primary. In an upper primary CAPA programme, two more disciplines are included, home economics and business studies to these six disciplines under the umbrella CAPA programme. The CAPA programme then derives its content from these eight disciplines. The following chapter reviews the relevant literature related to the study.
CHAPTER 3
LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 Introduction

This chapter critically reviews the relevant literature concerned with the development and implementation of art and craft education. Focusing on the primary school level, this study provides an overview and analysis that might contribute to an understanding of, and provide a critique for the teaching and learning of art and craft at lower primary in Botswana. The chapter provides an interpretation of the practices of art and craft education with particular reference to mainstream Western education in general and which, in some instances, may be relevant to and inform the Botswana education system. As there is limited literature including research studies in the CAPA programme and art and craft education in Botswana, information will mostly be drawn from Western research, resources and literature. This provides a reasonable working context, since Botswana educators and authors depend on Western education books in both writing and the nature of pedagogized instruction. This is because:

the history of art and craft in Botswana education has evolved in a unique way and reflects its British colonial history and post-independence development. It has involved constant exchange and dialogue with other countries through the employment of teachers, teacher trainees and university lecturers from a variety of European, Asian and other African countries. This dialogue has continued as locally trained art teachers pursue their degrees overseas and return with new ideas and influences (Brennan, 2006, p. 318).

Brennan further confirms that books on European and Early African art are more readily available in bookshops and libraries than publications on contemporary African art. Furthermore, information from the Ministry of Education in Botswana confirms Brennan’s
findings that most art and craft lecturers in the teacher-training colleges in Botswana and the University of Botswana did their post-graduate courses in Western countries. Phuthego (2008, p. 1) also adds that “the Botswana primary schools Creative and Performing Arts syllabus as a curriculum subject draws from Western culture, primarily due to the proliferation of literary sources for such content.” Another Western influence in the planning of curriculum and its CAPA content is because an agency from one of these countries was involved in the process of developing the CAPA programme. In 1995, the Botswana government conducted a joint project by the Botswana Ministry of Education (MoE) and the United States agency for International Development administered by the Academy for Educational Development, University of Massachusetts and the Aurora Associates (Phibion, 2006). Phibion (2006, p. 1) further explains that:

at the end of the exercise, a report known as the Cream Wright (from the name of the consultants) was released to assist in practical subjects packaging. … The Cream Wright consultants grouped the practical subjects under the general heading of Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) also referred to as integrated projects (non – core).

To account for this grouping Wright (1995, p. i) says “this in turn would contribute to the critical task of transforming Botswana’s educational goals and aspirations into viable programmes that promote high quality basic education in the country.”

The main sections of the chapter include:

- Definitions and discussion of art and craft.
- Art and craft in Education.
- Art and craft education in Botswana and internationally.
- Summary.
3.2 Definition and discussion of art and craft.

Different art theorists have given different definitions of art. Art may refer to the creation of artworks based on original ideas from the artist. It is interpreted by most art educationists as a process rather than an artifact. Art is something which can be recognised only in its entirety or unity, but which can be best defined by describing its main facets. Art educators such as Taylor (1992) believe that art operates through sensation, emotion, memory, association and inference. Craft on the other hand has been defined by the Botswana Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) as works of art that have a functional purpose such as printmaking, pottery, jewellery, leatherwork and weaving. Art and craft are aspects of the visual arts (Robinson, 1982). The visual arts refer to the variety of creative activities that focus on the way images and objects look.

In our modern environment, other notable forms of visual arts that help to communicate ideas are drawing, paintings, sculpture, photography, graphic design and films. It is important to note that the visual arts have always been a vital part of culture expression in traditional African communities. In other words the images and objects produced are not only created for their beauty – they are useful. Examples include basket weaving, pottery, textiles and furniture design. Even traditional wall and floor decorations can be described as visual arts (Havens, 2002, p. 3).

These examples will help us realise the extent to which art and craft influence our lives. An orthodox interpretation is that artists express their feelings, dreams and emotions through images or objects. In addition, it helps communicate history, culture and values of various communities. Eisner (1972) notes that:

…art, especially visual arts, has been used to give expression to man’s most sublime visions. Through the ages art has served as a means of making the spiritual, especially in religion, visual through the image. When the artist takes an idea such as the divine and transforms it into a visual metaphor, he creates not only a specific object worthy of attention in its own right, he also creates a
form within which man’s most cherished values can be embodied. When art performs this function it transforms the personal and ineffable into a public form in which others may participate, thus, the ideas of a culture can take on corporate significance that they would not otherwise have. Art not only functions as a vehicle for the articulation of sublime visions, it also takes those vision most characteristic of man, his fears, his dreams, his recollections, and provides these too with visual metaphors (p. 10-11).

Art has also served as a way of recording the culture of humankind and the first known examples are the rock art found on the walls of caves. Examples of these works can be found throughout Africa. Some of the best known examples of rock art in the world are in Southern Africa.

Craft has also made a historical impact, leaving us a legacy of our past in the form of spears, pots, musical instruments and a variety of other tools that represent a society’s culture. In Botswana, baskets and pottery were an important part of traditional life because Batswana relied on agriculture for their livelihood. Some of these artefacts can be viewed at the National Museum in Gaborone (Havens, 2002, p. 10).

However, with the modernisation of societies and the widespread use of manufactured goods, the need for such traditional objects has lessened. Instead of spending days constructing pots to store maize meal and sorghum, today people go to shops and buy storage containers (Mahloane, 2003). In traditional African cultures, art is not created for art’s sake, for collectors, or to be placed in museums. The form and functions are synthesized as one (Venet, 2002).

Art expresses the life force, interwoven with daily activities and spiritual beliefs, the sacred and profane, mind and body, natural and supernatural. … Ancestors are commemorated; living elders are respected, for, after death, they will continue to influence deities (Klotman, 1977 and Welsh-Asante, 1993 cited by Venet, 2002).

Sculptures have become an important form of decoration in and around buildings throughout Botswana depicting famous people in Botswana’s history, such as the late Sir Seretse Khama.
who was the first president of the country (Havens, 2002). This sculpture can be found in the government enclave in the capital city Gaborone and in the main mall in Selibe-Phikwe as seen in the example below.

![Statue of the late Sir Seretse Khama](image)

*Figure 2: Statue of the late Sir Seretse Khama (Havens 2002, p. 147)*

According to Havens (2002) craft has also made an impact on the lives of Batswana. “Craft centres have been created to boost the craft economy of Botswana and create jobs” (p. 149). Barnes (2002) also makes a case for art and craft that it is an effective component of communication modes that provide information through teaching aids, posters, newspapers and magazines. In many cases, images help us to understand information better because it is often said that ‘one picture is worth a thousand words’. Different artists use the art elements
and principles of design such as line, value, rhythm to move our sensibilities. Ragans (2000) elaborates this by stating that wavy lines may be a form of visual language that can engage a viewer’s interest and attention because of their rhythm and charm. This idea shares the same consensesus with Donald and Fisher (2002) who echoes that art making and appreciation serve to uniquely stimulate the senses and provide direct active pathways to the world around us. Images are created to depict events such as war. In this theme pictures or figures may communicate the negative consequences and burden of war. Donald and Fisher add to this by saying that artists through the ages have used art and craft to express the values they cherished and to provide pungent statements about our condition, the nation and the world. Work in art and craft therefore, might serve to provide a tool to critique the society in which they were made and hence bring to our attention visual metaphors through which values are conveyed. They also frequently present to our senses both positive and negative values. These art educationists further confirm that art and craft can either be used to praise or condemn, but they can also be a vehicle through which to comment and to encourage viewers to engage with the subject they depict. This is to say artists frequently function as social critics and visionaries. Their artwork helps others to learn to see what they had hitherto not. In addition, art and craft contributes to the working creative mind by enabling us to innovate. Richardson and Bowden (1983) and Barnes (2002) explain that we can put old ideas together in novel ways or create new ones to offer new sources of insight and illumination and to afford new visions about the world and the human condition.

3.3 Art and craft in education

Defining art and craft education and explaining why it is an important part of general education are challenges that many art and craft educators face on a regular basis. Erickson (2002) notes that:
in spite of decades of advocacy, many stake-holders are all too often naïve, misinformed, or swayed by popular romantic stereotypes. In an era of educational reform, art educators need not only clarify their own understanding of art and the goals of art education, but also examine the beliefs about art and art education held by those in positions to make and affect policy (p. 11).

Eisner (1972) believes that “the problems that are encountered by anyone attempting to understand and facilitate the educative process in any realm, but perhaps in the realm of art, are enormously difficult ones. …because artistic learning and aesthetic experience are among the most sophisticated aspects of human action and feeling …” (p. 1).

Uncritical acceptance of current practice in art education has dominated to point where the subject is in danger of becoming an anachronism. The vital energy require to jolt it forward into 21st century is so lacking that the subject neither meets the needs of students and wider society nor keeps pace with professional practice (Steers, 2004, p. 1).

Botswana is still at its infancy stage in art and craft education as the primary school curriculum was introduced in 2002 with limited human and physical resources as identified by Dichaba (2002) and Brennan (2006). There is still a lot to do by those with art and craft education background to convince Educational Departments and other stake holders such as the community to appreciate the role played by the subject in the school curriculum (Phuthego, 2007).

3.3.1 Art and craft as a subject in the curriculum

Art and craft educationists such as Dichaba, (2002) and Eisner (2002) argue that art and craft has been largely ignored when their national educational priorities are being asserted.
Art was seen as an add-on—a elitist preserve for the artistically or, conversely, a holding room for those misfit kids who could not handle the regular curriculum—certainly not a “basic” not something for every student (Walling, 2000, p. xi).

Batswana (meaning Botswana citizens) are among those who have typically seemed to have viewed art and craft as less important to the education system and hence have given the subject less comparative attention (Ndaba, 1990) until the introduction of Creative and Performing Arts curriculum. Barnes (2002) also contends that art and craft is taken recreationally rather than seriously to the extent that it may be taught when pupils are tired and exhausted by other subjects to relieve them. His argument is based on the fact that many teachers know too little of the value of art and craft. However, in Botswana not only was art and craft marginalized but all the arts disciplines tended to be viewed as peripheral rather than central to the educational process (Phibion, 2006 and Phuthego, 2008). Those who value the arts and have recognised the quality of experience and insight have needed to think through the grounds on which their place in the school’s programme can be secured. Most importantly, many art and craft educationists argue that art and craft is a vital means of self-realisation within the framework of education for it assumes that personal experience can be generally transmitted and utilised. Children need to discover themselves, but they also need to find out how their main interests, obsessions, needs, and abilities relate to others and society in general. This understanding must come through experience, and it is one of the major rationales of art and craft education to achieve this.

At lower primary, art and craft play a role in developing children’s manipulative dexterity and perceptual skills (Lindstrom, 2006). According to Pitri (2003) children need to be enabled, not only to have ideas about the world, but to act in it. Work in art and craft can lead to the development of a range of qualities and skills with a wide application and value. Argro
(2004) and Szekely (2005) elaborate this statement by stating that through continual response to sensory experiences the child will increasingly become aware that relationships, differences and similarities are part of the world and hence develop problem solving skills. Hickman (2005) maintains that one of the rationales for art education ought to be concerned with noticing. He suggests that “visual education must surely concern itself with drawing attention to the subtleties of the visual world, which includes the intriguing, the interesting, the arresting and the beautiful” (p.137-138).

Hardy (2006) and Hallam, Lee and Gupter (2006) believe that art and craft builds fine motor skills through manipulation of tools such as scissors and paint brushes. They explain that through manipulation of materials and tools they develop the finer muscles and hence improve their coordination. This justification of the place for art and craft in education is particularly relevant to nursery education and those year one pupils in Botswana primary schools who did not go to nursery.

Stiggins (2001) also made a contribution to the value of art and craft to the curriculum by positing that art and craft education is very important to young children as it enables them to develop problem solving and creativity skills. According to Borg (2007) art and craft develops the ability for creative thought and action on pupil’s education.

Creative individuals may display a range of characteristics that extend beyond some assumed general capacity of divergent thinking. For example this might include: a tolerance for ambiguity and a certain playfulness with ideas, materials or processes; an ability to concentrate and persist, to keep on teasing and worrying away at a problem rather than seeking premature closure. They are likely to recognize, or have a willingness to explore, unlikely connections, juxtapositions (Steers, 2004, p. 6).
However, Kalin and Kind (2006) express concern about untrained teachers in art and craft, who may hold specific views on pupils’ creativity. They also believe that some teachers may also hold certain preconceived, even stereotypical notions about art and craft, teaching, learning and children. On this note, Steers (2006) argues that creative pupils need creative teachers with the confidence to take creative risks.

Unfortunately, this takes exceptional commitment and vision in our increasingly high stakes education system with its pressures to conform created by the standardised curriculum, standardised assessment tasks, targets … inspection, limited resources … and large teaching groups in schools (Steers, 2006, p. 4).

Steers adds that “if we want to promote and firmly establish creativity in the school curriculum then providing the proper opportunity, the right environment and motivation will be crucial” (p. 1).

In addition to creativity, Jones (2000) is of the view that art and craft stimulates children’s imaginative capacities and powers of observation and broadens children’s appreciation of the beauty of nature and development of respect for their environment. Artists refer to this as aesthetics. According to Shusterman (2006) aesthetics is very valuable because without it we can hardly understand the extraordinary power and history of art. On the other hand Ndaba (1990) observes that much of what has been done in art and craft periods in countries such as Botswana before the introduction of the art and craft curriculum was not deeply aesthetic in nature. Many of the activities undertaken lay virtually outside what is defined as the aesthetic field. In aesthetic education pupils move from one position to another making, responding, performing and evaluating the artwork (Dhillon, 2006).
The educational temptation must not therefore be resisted to overlay this stage with too much theory, explanation, knowledge for, in isolation from aesthetic experience; this can block the sensuous, physical, dramatic and imaginative indwelling aspects so crucial to artistic response at this essentially pre-verbal stage. The point and purpose of the arts lies in the field of its action (Taylor, 1992, p. 4).

Schirrmache (2002) observes that young children are aesthetic experts and explains that they demonstrate the aesthetic attitude in their spontaneity, wonder and amazement at things adults may take for granted. As young children grow, they continue to exercise their aesthetic senses while observing lines, textures, shapes, colors, and designs found in their environment which includes images in picture books, artworks found in museums, and in the popular media. These aesthetic experiences provide a starting point for understanding that there is a language of art (Danko-Mcghee (2006). For the success of this development, Danko-Mcghee advocates that teachers should be trained on how to construct environments and activities that keep motivation, experimentation and curiosity alive as well as how to facilitate children’s natural learning processes. Schirrmacher observes:

when children express preferences for colors, shapes, sounds, tastes, and textures, they are actually making aesthetic choices. These aesthetic experiences can promote language development, while also improving upon the quality of young children’s own artmaking experiences. For aesthetic development to occur, children need exposure to fine art and as they get older, they need opportunities to discuss art and beauty with thoughtful adults (p.21).

When viewing artworks, teachers therefore, play a vital role in determining what pupils notice about a particular work and how they feel about the very process of encountering the artworks (Merwe, 2007). Teachers who encourage pupils to talk about art and craft objects, who the artists and craft-persons are and how the objects are made, generates their interest in making art and craft and nurtures their art language development.
Art and craft also has a role of helping pupils express their feelings. Most art and craft authors, among them Milbrandt (2002), believe that art and craft has a value in expressing someone’s feelings and emotions. He contends that children like art and craft because it is their way of expressing their feelings. He believes that children who express themselves honestly become confident in their own independent thinking. Piri (2003) emphasises that “children should be encouraged and guided to move beyond the level of making symbols into a level of inventing different means of expression and communication” (p.19).

Venet (2002) comments on the the value of art and craft in the curriculum by noting that pupils can be encouraged to communicate personal ideas and beliefs that reflect their own cultural experiences instead of creating variations on another’s theme. There already may be public sculptures in pupils’ communities that commemorate historical events or people (Moalosi, Popvic and Hudson, 2004). It would be useful for pupils to create their timeline ranging from the first known history through to today’s events (Brennan, 2006). Similar sentiments are expressed by Venet who says as pupils recreate their own history, they will be able to identify some of the important people of the past and present, the first inhabitants, what happened to them and why, important events which occurred in their communities and how they affected their towns or villages and shaped the way they look now. Pupils should be exposed to past cultures to study and recognise the importance of history through artefacts. Dash (2006) believes art and craft helps pupils to understand cultural change and differences because they are characteristic expressions of any culture and evolve as part of it. Bridget Riley cited by the National Curriculum for England (1999) adds that art develops spiritual values and contributes a wider understanding to the experience of life, which helps to build a balanced personality (p.14). Art and craft is not separate and different from pupils’ experiences inside and outside school, but emerges from them (Hickman, 2006). If this idea
can be adopted, art and craft will be found to have two significant kinds of value to the curriculum. First, it is valuable in its own right as indicated in section 3.2. Secondly, it has a range of explicit applications across the curriculum, particularly in social studies (Pitri, 2003).

Barnes’s (2002) contribution to the rationale of art and craft in primary schools is that art and craft can be used as diagnostic therapy to enable children to express emotions whereby teachers may detect personality problems. It can have valuable therapeutic functions in the treatment of some physical and/or emotional disorders (Nthoi, 2000). Similarly, Peter (1996) believes that art and craft releases tension. He further advocates that the overlap between art therapy and art education should be recognised and acknowledged in practice.

It is important to discuss the general skills from the lower primary CAPA programme which are relevant to art and craft curriculum which is the focus of the study. Botswana Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002, p.1) has devised the rationale in the form of a number of aims to account for the implementation of the lower primary Creative and Performing Arts programme. I have extracted those I believed related particularly to art and craft. They are:

- Psychomotor skills in the use of materials, tools, instruments/equipment;
- Problem solving skills through designing and making products;
- Awareness of the effects of art on a society in everyday life;
- Awareness and appreciation of pre-vocational skills in Creative and Performing Arts;
- Critical thinking, inquiry, creative, initiative and interpersonal skills;
- Positive attitudes towards practical work and productivity;
- Knowledge, skills and values that contribute towards individual development;
• The ability to express themselves through the media of visual arts; and
• A spirit of self-reliance and self-sufficiency.

The National Curriculum for England (1999) has a similar view of the importance of art and craft in the primary school curriculum. It notes that “art and design stimulates creativity and imagination; …provides visual, tactile and sensory experiences and a unique way of understanding and responding to the world” (p. 14). The document further emphasises that through art and design pupils learn to make informed value judgement, and aesthetic and practical decisions, becoming actively involved in shaping environments. “They learn about the diverse roles and functions of art, craft and design in contemporary life, and in different times and cultures” (The National Curriculum for England, 1999). The CAPA aims are closely aligned with the role of art and craft in education and its aims that have been put forward by Clement (1992). Similarly to Clement (1992), Gardner (1990) and the National Curriculum for England (1999) the CAPA curriculum developers view art and craft as a vehicle for promoting self-expression, imagination, creativity and knowledge of one’s affective potential as well as a craft to be mastered or as a conventional scholastic subject. Introducing pupils to these possibilities in schools may help them to prepare more fully for future problems, opportunities and needs while opening a wide spectrum of interests in the present (Hickman, 2005).

On the other hand, Allison cited by Barrett (1979) emphasises the role of art and craft education as helping the school leaver to fulfill their community role as a public representative. This individual, according to Allison, will be involved in making decisions about artists and designers’ plans, architects’ proposals, museums and art gallery
commitments and other matters requiring informed and educated aesthetic judgement and discrimination.

Accessing art and craft education on a global scale can be done through Bamford’s (2006) global research compendium on the impact of the arts in education. In 2004 Bamford (2006) conducted the first international analysis of art and craft education research for UNESCO in partnership with the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies (IFACCA) and the Australia Council. She compared data and case studies from more than sixty countries and her book analyses the differences between ‘education in the arts’ and ‘education through the arts’ (Bamford, 2006). While appreciating that art and craft programmes are embedded in their unique social and cultural contexts, she develops internationally comparable standards for high quality art and craft education. She also identifies a number of concrete educational, cultural and social benefits of art and craft. Bamford’s findings reveal that art and craft education is part of education policy in most countries. She further notes that:

arts education is a compulsory part of school education in 84% of countries. Within this countries, 94% of the respondents stated that arts education was taught as freestanding subject in its own right … Of those countries where arts education is a compulsory part of general education, 78% examine or assess arts learning, while 18% of countries do not examine arts education (p. 59).

Section 3.5 describes various strategies of evaluating and assessing pupils’ art and craft work suggested by art and craft educationists worldwide. The research is conceived from Bamford’s range of arguments on the value of art and craft in the curriculum. She argues that “… the arts, more than any other area of education, has been subject to waves of passing educational practices, that rather than building strong programmes, have detrimentally resulted in scattered approaches with little educational merit” (p. 47). She criticises the idea of non-
interventionist approaches to children’s art and craft learning, which are advocated by Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) and asserts the importance of active teaching. She says that a non-interventionist approach to the subject characterises in many schools as being a series of experiments or experience with little cogent direction or planning. “The children rarely have an opportunity to develop the skills and understandings needed to work well in any one or more disciplines that build an art-rich programme” (Bamford, 2006, p. 48). The issue of nature versus nurture is argued by Barnes (2002) and other educationists as indicated in chapter 7 of this study. Bamford’s concerns have been raised by many educators including those in Botswana such as Phibion (2006), Moalosi and Molwane (2008) and Phuthego (2008) who argue that the arts in Botswana are not taken seriously in primary schools.

Bamford’s research indicates common factors considered as inhibitors to the success of an arts-rich programme. Such concerns are frequently raised by primary school teachers throughout the world such as those specifically identified in Botswana which include lack of art and craft knowledge and skills, lack of time, funds, inadequate space and resources and rigid structures. Bamford says this is evident in developing countries such as Bangladesh. Most interestingly her findings reveal that more than half (56%) of the countries involve artists and the community in the teaching of art and craft as 85% of the teachers are art and craft generalists. This observation has been keenly made in this study since most teachers in Botswana have not been trained to teach art and craft. Further issues identifying and discussing the similarities and differences of the art and craft curriculum in Botswana with other countries especially post colonial neighbouring countries such as Namibia, South Africa and Senegal have been discussed in section 3.4 and chapter 7 of this study.
Bamford’s (2006) findings also reveal that some countries had no arts education policy. She gave an example of the small Pacific country of Tuvalu which had no standard art and craft curriculum or syllabus but embedded within their ideas of education is the need for a child to have an ‘open mind’ and to build the skills for a bright future. Similarly to other African countries such as Botswana, Namibia and South Africa, Senegal and Nigeria indicated in Bamford’s study that they considered art and craft and the other arts to be a tool used to unite the nation through exposure to diverse art and craft forms within the community.

3.3.2 Art and craft across the curriculum

Educators use art and craft often in schools as an educational tool without fully realizing they are integrating it with other subjects (Ziga, 1997). Books, charts and even teaching aids that we create show this interrelationship. Walling (2000) states that concepts, methods, activities and materials that are used in art and craft can also be used in other subjects. Moreover, within the integration of environmental sciences in the primary syllabus, art and craft is a way to create objects from recyclable, or reusable, materials (Silo, 2006).

Ziga researched into ‘Integration of Art to Social Studies’ in Botswana primary schools and his findings indicate that teachers unconsciously integrated art and craft with social studies. For instance, he said they used maps as part of their content and pupils sometimes were asked to identify the key issues such as rivers and mountains by shapes, texture and colours. Moreover, the findings show that pupils were sometimes asked to illustrate maps which include for example, physical features such as the rivers, trees and mountains of Botswana and paint or shade the features. Illustration is an aspect of art that involves line, shape, texture and colour, which are among the formal language of art (Mahloane, 2003).
Ohio State University Transforms Education Through the Art Challenge (TETAC) Mentors, (2002) present the role of art and craft in an integrated curriculum as a way of providing powerful vehicle to investigate and to express an understanding of our social and cultural life, and it is intimately connected with all other school subject areas. They believe art and craft works always stand at the centre of cultural struggles or express complex understanding of vital issues. Pupils can make art and craft work to express their best understanding of key ideas. For these reasons, the Ohio TETAC mentors advised that art and craft culture should not be taught as an isolated school subject as it can play a significant and central role in an integrated curriculum.

CAPA supports a multi-disciplinary approach to learning. Thus integrating different disciplines helps students to combine their logical, scientific, linguistic, artistic and social knowledge to make their lives and interact with the world meaningful (Moalosi and Molwane, 2008, p. 28).

Supporting the idea of integration of art and craft with other subjects, Forrest (1987) notes that art and craft is not necessarily a subject completely separated from other school subjects. It can be used effectively to give further emphasis to lesson content. This has been particularly supported by Lancaster (1990) and Nthoi (2000) who explained that, art and craft is a subject which has an inbuilt facility for linking well with other areas of curriculum work. Arnheim (1989) and Dewey, (2001) point out that, art and craft should operate as one of the central areas of learning intended to equip the young mind with the basic abilities needed for coping successfully with every branch of the curriculum.

3.3.3 Art and craft within the combined arts

Integration is one of the approaches which need to be emphasised in primary schools considering that it represents the life of various communities. The arts could be integrated in
lessons where possible because they involve various disciplines such as art, drama, dance and music and need not be taught as separate subjects exclusively (Phibion, 2006). Phibion further argues that many of the arts products such as paintings, plays, music, dancing, literature and printing are integral features of the social culture. Integrating them would also clarify their relationship as ‘arts’. Cavelti and Goldberg (1997) cited in Walling (2000) emphasise that:

the arts are the embodiment of human imagination, the record of human achievement, and the process that distinguishes us as human beings. We form human communities and cultures by making art-through stories and songs, drama and dance, painting and sculpture, architecture and design (p.xii).

However, Taylor (1992) maintains that the creative arts should not be conceived as forming a single community in the curriculum and does not necessarily mean that they should be taught in an integrated way in teaching. He suggests that they should rather be seen as serving similar aesthetic processes and purposes, as they belong together under the category of the aesthetic.

Because each of these disciplines has different and distinct histories, having come into the curriculum ... for different reasons, arts teachers do not always recognize what it is they share in common, to the overall detriment of aesthetic education (Taylor, 1992, p. 2).

Grouping of all the arts is a representation of the life of any community and talk of its culture is to represent the whole network of habits, customs, beliefs, attitudes and forms of behaviour which hold it together as a community (Ohio University TETAC mentors, 2002). Not taking account of the creations of the past would be to fail to understand some of the more powerful forces that have shaped it and added richness and quality to its existence (Moalosi, Popvic, Hudson and Kumar (2005). However, this does not mean that some subjects should be
overwhelmed by others as teachers might emphasise some subjects giving less attention to their counterparts. Taylor (1992) and Mannathoko (2004) emphasise that the concepts and process unique to each discipline should be maintained for example; masks, costumes, sculptures are to be created in art and craft classes, music and dance in music classes.

Historically, in the United Kingdom, differences of opinion have arisen out of debates on the integration of the arts. The arguments stemmed from perceptions of artificial boundaries around arts activities (Gulbenkian Foundation, 1982). This debate was the catalyst for an approach to the arts which followed shortly afterwards, called the ‘Assessment of Performance Unit’ (APU) (1983). Writers such as Best (1983) argued that: “it is worth emphasizing again that the arts are not autonomous activities. They draw from and contribute to the concerns of society in ways which are unique” (APU, 1983, p.7). A key idea of this unit was of both the link between the arts and to society in general. Interpretations of the role of aesthetics in the integration of the arts have been keenly contested. Best has strenuously sought to separate the aesthetic from the artistic and certainly to confront any misconception of there being a generic aesthetics for all the arts, just as he opposed the notion of a generic arts across all the sub-disciplines. Best’s role for aesthetics as ‘deepening, extending, sensitising our understandings and feelings about an immense variety of issues in life’ (Best 1992, p. 166) was not about pleasure or beauty, both of which he claimed trivialised the arts. Just as the artistic is not the same as the aesthetic, so, claimed Best, were the various arts sub-disciplines related but different and therefore had to be taught separately, each to their own strengths. Best was very firm about the integrity of each art-form’s medium.

Abbs adopted a different approach to the issue:
Aesthetic derives from the Greek word *aesthetic* meaning things perceptible through the senses, with the verb stem aisthe meaning to feel, to apprehend through the senses. Here in this small cluster of words: perception, sensing, apprehending, feeling, we begin to discern the nature of the aesthetic mode (Abbs, 1987, p. 53).

This issue has formed one of the main theoretical underpinnings of cross-curricular approaches to the arts in education to the present day.

### 3.4 The art and craft curriculum in Botswana and internationally

This section involves the analysis of the art and craft education curriculum in Botswana in relation to the lower primary CAPA programme. It also considers the organisation and goals of the lower primary syllabus in Botswana where the aims and objectives of the CAPA programme and the art and craft curriculum were derived from. In addition, literature from other sources was considered such as books and studies of art and craft education in Botswana and other countries which are of significant importance to this study. More importantly to consider in this literature will be reference to the England art and craft curriculum as already stated that Botswana education is influenced by England’s educational system. This will be specifically on Key Stage 2 which involves pupils of similar age as those of Botswana lower primary.

Although extensive literature searches were conducted, just thirteen relevant studies were found concerning art and craft education in Botswana schools. One study by Nthomang and Paul (2006) on art and craft was conducted after four years of the implementation of the study but it was not specifically for lower primary level. In addition the researchers did not recognise the assessment requirements stipulated in the CAPA programme during their discussion except just mentioning the assessment procedures, ‘formative’ and ‘summative’.
without any explanation or reference to them in relation to their findings. Nine of these research studies concentrated primarily on the CAPA programme, but not specifically the art and craft curriculum. Three (which includes the two reports) were on the general findings of the CAPA disciplines, four focused on music and two were on design and technology. Seven of these nine studies did not specifically focus on lower primary CAPA but generally addressed both lower and upper primary CAPA programme in primary school. The remaining two were formative evaluation reports which addressed standard three and four among the lower primary levels. These were the research studies conducted by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2004/2005) to inform them on the next stages of the curriculum development. They were not published to be accessed by the public.

Two among the remaining three research studies focused on art and craft for the whole primary school education and did not emanate from the CAPA programme. They were researched before the introduction of the CAPA programme therefore played an important and significant role in the background of art and craft education in Botswana primary schools in comparison to the new curriculum. The remaining research was conducted by a British art and design lecturer who taught in one of the colleges of education for secondary education in Botswana between 1999 and 2002. She wrote to share her experiences in secondary teacher training education in Botswana specifically on the history of art and craft education and its development and the interrelations which have evolved over the last two decades. The present study will rely more on the research done after the implementation of the CAPA programme. More details about these studies are compiled in a table below for clarity.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus/Title</th>
<th>Author (date)</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What’s in a name CAPA? A case study of design and technology education within the CAPA programme in Botswana primary schools</td>
<td>Gaotlhobogwe, M. and Mannathoko, M.C. (2008)</td>
<td>7th International Primary Design and Technology</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As this is the first version for the art and craft curriculum there are issues of concern which the study revealed. It is hoped this will aid future development, particularly by eliciting problems teachers might be having in implementing the curriculum. The main segments of the section include: the structure of the lower primary syllabus, the CAPA programme, the art and craft curriculum and global issues on the impact of the arts in education.

3.4.1 Structure of the lower primary syllabus in Botswana

Botswana’s lower primary syllabus is packaged together into a single document with all the subjects in the lower primary (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). The reason given by this department for putting subjects together is to enable ease of access by all teachers as they teach the whole spectrum of the lower primary subjects. This document is divided into two parts, the first one consisting of information that is common to all the different syllabi (aims of the basic education programme and aims of primary education). There is also an extract from the Philosophy of the Revised National Policy of Education document called ‘Government Paper No. 2 of (1994)’ which advocates promotion of the development of moral and social values, cultural identity and self esteem, good citizenship and desirable work ethics. “Primary Education is the first seven years of the Ten-Year basic education programme; it is therefore pivotal for the realization of these intents” (Curriculum and Evaluation Division, 2002, foreword page). The second part addresses each subject area, following a general pattern that has the following main sections: subject introduction, rationale, aims of the subject, attainment targets and recommended teaching
methods. Each curriculum is organised around modules that outline the coverage of what the curriculum intends to provide in the teaching and learning environment at the school level. Moreover, “each module is divided into topics, general objectives and specific objectives to generate relevant activities to address the intended goals” (Curriculum and Evaluation Division, 2002, p. ii).

3.4.2 The lower primary CAPA programme in Botswana

The government of Botswana decided to develop the arts programme after conducting a needs assessment and consultation with an American agency as stated in section 3.1. One of the influences was from the Botswana’s Vision (2016, p. 18) observation that:

education has not been adequately geared to the needs of the country, and the job market. The challenge is to place greater emphasis on technical and practical subjects, and business skills that are most needed.

According to Moalosi and Molwane (2008, p. 29) “CAPA is a programme composed of modules”. They further note that the lower primary CAPA programme is organised into four areas which are then sub-divided into topics of different modules. The areas being: health and safety, communication, listening, composing and performing (music, dance, drama and physical education) and design and making. As indicated in chapter 2 these different modules in a lower primary CAPA programme comprise of content drawn from art and craft, music, physical education, design and technology, drama and dance (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002).

Bamford’s (2006) research indicates that there is general agreement on some aspects of what should be included in primary school curricula under arts education. In over 90% of countries
she surveyed, music and drawing were part of arts education. Painting and craft were also widely accepted as part of the arts curriculum by 80% and 88% of the case study countries respectively. Dance, drama and sculpture were included in arts education in over 70% of the countries. The results also revealed that “in a number of countries, the arts were very culture specific and embedded in the history and heritage of a country” (Bamford, 2006, p. 48). In addition, the study shows that similarly to the Botswana CAPA programme, Fiji has included physical education as part of the arts disciples in their curriculum. The other finding was that within Bhutan, a parallel curriculum in the arts exists with both modern and traditional arts being taught. But it could be argued though that despite the very extensive curriculum in this country, it does not cover drama, dance and music. “Conversely, in Cambodia, a similar focus on both traditional and modern arts practices has led to a curriculum that is strongly focused on music, performance, poem and dancing” (Bamford, 2006, p. 51).

The Namibians in Southern Africa according to Bamford see the arts as being a united whole. The arts curriculum structures in Namibia, South Africa and Australia are closely similar to that of Botswana as they consist of dance, drama, music and visual arts (Phuthego, 2008); who notes that the Australian arts curriculum also includes media in addition to the aspects of dance, drama, music and visual arts. Bamford’s study reveals that arts education in one of the African countries Senegal, has existed a long time and has largely contributed to the education of the artists and the public. “Thus any policy aiming at the promotion of arts benefits-directly or indirectly-is influenced by this well protected heritage” (Bamford, 2006, p. 64). Unlike in Botswana where most education authorities have limited knowledge in art and craft, Senegal have authorities with high quality art and craft education who take part in decision-making along with the highest governmental authorities.
CAPA bridges the different gap between primary and secondary education, thus providing a sound foundation for conglomerate disciplines that are offered at later stages of the formal education school curriculum as different entities and subjects (Moalosi and Molwane, 2008, p. 28).

The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) gives the rationale for the CAPA programme as providing pupils with the opportunity to develop creativity, critical thinking, practical skills, problem-solving skills and basic knowledge related to arts, technology and the environment. This according to the document enables pupils to acquire skills in designing, of performing and realising using a wide range of materials. “Products and performance will be the outcomes of their creative thoughts, aesthetic and socio-cultural awareness” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department 2002, p. 1). The programme according to Moalosi and Molwane offers a lot of flexibility to accommodate project teaching and integrating all the different modules.

The recommended contact hours for CAPA from the Ministry of Education are five hours but some schools only offer it one and half hours per week. This might be an indication that some schools give less importance to CAPA as opposed to other subjects in the curriculum (Moalosi and Molwane, 2008, p. 29).

This can be traced to the old misconception that practical subjects are more appropriate for less intelligent students (Moalosi, 1999). However, to promote CAPA, Phibion’s (2006) research findings reveal that respondents mentioned that CAPA has increased the amount of practical work done in schools without necessarily increasing the number of subjects in the curriculum. To strengthen this point one respondent says the programme helped them empower learners with skills and promoted early realisation of individual talents. At this stage of the learning process in Botswana primary schools, these views fulfill the idea expressed in the quotation below:
Vocational training generally begins early, often by the stage of 7 or 8 when the child accompanies an adult to the workplace – whether farm, market or workshop – to learn by observing, listening, imitating and gradually taking a more responsible part in work activities (Callaway, 1973, p. 13).

Moreover, “through teaching subjects in the form of CAPA packaging, learner develop their creative, aesthetic, psychomotor skills and the love for the arts in general” (Phibion, 2006 p. 10). Phibion believes it also helps pupils develop an understanding of modern technology and familiarize them with tools, equipment, media and materials used in practical subjects. This is in concurrence with vision (2016, p. 5) which states that:

the education system will empower citizens to become the best producers of goods and services. It will produce entrepreneurs who will create employment through the establishment of new enterprises. Public education will raise awareness on skills needed for life.

This Vision 2016 pillar is similar to the previous prime minister of Britain, Tony Blair’s vision for the 21st century who said:

our aim must be to create a nation where the creative talents of all the people are used to build a true enterprise economy for the twenty-first century – where we compete on brains, not brawn (NACCCE, 1999 cited Steers, 2004)

According to Phibion, some of his respondents believe that through this kind of education pupils would be in a position to explore their practical skills and utilise them fully for their life experiences. However, they are those respondents Phibion says they argued that the introduction of CAPA was too early without preparations of guiding materials first. He says they emphasised that the introduction of CAPA cannot be effective if there are no purpose-built classrooms appropriate for CAPA subjects and teaching equipment. This has been identified by the Botswana Vision (2016:18) which stipulates that “many schools across the country are not equipped, particularly primary schools. … These are major challenges that
must be met by the year 2016”. However, the issue of lack of materials in practical subjects area seems to be a globally problem as Steers (2005) observes that space, time and access to art and craft centres such as museums and galleries are widely cited by teachers as inhibitors of teaching and learning of the subject. In sharing personal experiences, Swann (2005) made reference to art and craft lessons that:

children learn more thoroughly when they represent the same concept in different media. … a range of materials and tools enables children to develop a wide range of expressive and problem-solving repertoires in two and three dimensional work (p. 44-45).

Pitz (2003) also contributed to this debate by noting:

…when children come in contact with new materials and situations, they learn to ask questions and become self-motivated investigators. Being receptive to new situations, objects and materials leads to problem finding” (p. 21).

3.4.2.1 Aims of the lower primary CAPA programme

The national lower primary syllabus has devised aims of the lower primary CAPA programme and some of these rationales have been described in section 3.3. An important aspect identified within the Creative and Performing Arts programme as a strength is its relationship with the philosophy and aims of the Revised National Policy on Education, aims of the basic education programme and aims of primary education. That is the aims of the lower primary Creative and Performing Arts and its attainment targets tally with these areas. Areas where the attainment targets were derived from are recognisable. For example, the aims of the 1994 RNPE and all these other areas emphasise among others the awareness of culture, practical and problem-solving skills, critical thinking, self-reliance, creativity and the awareness of emerging issues.
According to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) the whole lower primary syllabus has taken cognisance of the Long-Term Vision for Botswana (Vision 2016) and the challenges posed by emerging issues such as HIV and AIDS and environmental issues. This will encourage pupils to communicate problems and solutions on daily experiences to the community. They could be exposed to art and craft beyond the classroom, such as visiting art and craft centres and attending art and craft exhibitions so as to gain experience in communicating their community problems by studying examples from local artists and craft-workers. An example would be someone like Obed Mokhuhlani who is from Sechele village in the North East region. He explained during his June 2006 art exhibition that his work covers a wide range of topics depicting what he has experienced and observed in art. He further comments that his paintings “show, among others, the bad things that occur in midst, which are also problematic to Africa as a continent. These include poverty and HIV/AIDS” (Botswana Daily-news, June 16, 2006, p. 1). Mokhuhlani contends that his statement is based on Anthony Harrison Barbet’s book, ‘Mastering Philosophy’ which states that the function of a painting is no longer to define the object but to serve as medium for the expression of the artist’s feelings. After designing the aims for CAPA, the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) further developed the attainment targets which are also expectations required to have been attained by pupils at the end of the lower primary programme. These are discussed in the section which follows.

3.4.2.2 The attainment targets for CAPA lower primary

The Creative and Performing Arts programme is divided into four attainment targets which include: Knowledge and Understanding, Practical/Manipulative Skills, Creativity and Attitudes. These attainment targets are said to cover all the four disciplines termed Creative and Performing Arts (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). Each
attainment target has objectives learners are expected to achieve at the end of the lower primary education. The last attainment target ‘attitude’ emphasises culture as one of the main emerging issues both in Botswana and globally. According to Moalosi, Popovic and Hudson (2004):

Botswana’s culture has been shaped by colonialism and it has started to decolonise but the process has not yet gone far. The country needs to decolonise its education, values, language, religion, technology and social organization which were heavily influenced by colonialism (p. 2).

Culture identity is still a concern for the people of Botswana (Khudu-Petersen, 2008 and Pansiri, 2008). Few of Botswana children recognise their culture and few accept other ethnic groups. Some ethnic groups feel superior to others and others feel inferior to their counterparts (Pansiri, 2008). If culture identity could be emphasised in the art and craft school curriculum, this might change children’s attitudes to accept and appreciate each individual irrespective of racial origins as they will understand appreciate cultures and traditions of different ethnic groups (Dash, 2006 and Khudu-Peterson, 2008). It would also build self-esteem of those who view themselves as inferior as they will be appreciated by their colleague. This could be the reason why Phibion (2006) notes that “CAPA was introduced to try and address the historical mismatch between the academics and social expectation of the school, home and community” (p. 2). Pansiri’s (2008) PhD research findings in one of the remote areas in Botswana reveals that identity stereotypes appeared to be the greatest issue that affected all other factors related to problems of school retention in that area. He said the community made reference to their ethnic identity in their conversations with concerns that they were discriminated by the skin colour as other citizens called them by the skin colour to distinguish them from other ethnic groups. This seems to concur with Khudu-Petersen’s (2008) research findings from the Kweneng West Sub-District of Botswana which revealed
that “the comparatively poor academic performance of learners was caused by the circumstance that the schools’ Setswana-based cultural discourse leaves the community members of the non-Tswana groups disadvantaged, as their cultural capital remains at best unrecognized, at worst disparaged” (p. i). She therefore, advocates for the ‘Intercultural’ Arts Education in primary schools as a possible solution to improve education. Her argument is that although English and Setswana languages unify media of communication in schools, the intercultural arts education leaves room for the representation of community cultures in the particular subjects ‘Arts’ by calling pupils, teachers and community members into collaborative participation in teaching, incorporating cultural aspects of the communities including linguistic aspects. Intercultural collaboration in the intercultural arts education project bares the chance of reducing stereotyping between the different cultural groups... Intercultural arts education may promote minority cultures by preventing them from being exoticised, seen as inferior or backward (p. i).

The CAPA attainment targets for lower primary are closely similar to the England art and craft curriculum requirements for Key Stage 2. They both set out the ‘knowledge’, ‘skills’ and understanding that pupils are expected to have gained by the end of the lower primary and Key Stage 2 level. Both the CAPA programme and the England National Curriculum emphasise knowledge and understanding of the basic principles and concepts and practical skills. Creativity, use of materials and tools, and techniques or processes of making the products are the key components to both the documents although in some instances Botswana curriculum focuses more on materials than techniques and processes.

Although the National Curriculum for England had not put together art and design, music, design and technology, physical education, drama ad dance subject disciplines to be one subject, its art and design curriculum encourages teachers to consider exploring a range of starting points for practical work and this includes: images, stories, drama and music (The
National Curriculum for England, 1999). The next section will look at art and craft in particular as a component of the CAPA subject.

3.4.3 Art and craft curriculum for lower primary in the CAPA programme in Botswana

The art and craft curriculum is organised into topics, general objectives and specific objectives. Botswana art and craft curriculum developers for lower primary devised general global statements about meeting needs such as self-expression and creativity under general objectives which they further sub-divided into specific objectives (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). Similar topics are allocated to each level of learning in lower primary except that standard one does not have the topic ‘Construction’.

3.4.3.1 The place of Botswana’s emerging issues in the art and craft curriculum

Despite the fact that the country’s emerging issues are emphasised by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) and they say they should be observed in the teaching of the CAPA modules, as indicated in section 3.4.2, the aspects do not arise clearly from the art and craft curriculum general and specific objectives. For example, culture is one of the main emerging issues in Botswana and clearly promoted in attainment target 1 of the CAPA lower primary programme, yet it is not included in module 2 (Communication) which refers to art and craft. It does not appear under the topics, general objectives and specific objectives for art and craft. It is only covered in module 3 (listening, composing and performing) which represents physical education, drama, dance and music. When comparing it with the England art and craft section for Key Stage 2, the English art and craft education encourages pupils to investigate “art, craft and design in the locality and in a variety of genres and traditions in original and reproductive form” (The English National Curriculum, 1999, p.
The curriculum further notes that as pupils work on their art and design activities, “they increase their awareness of the roles and purposes of art, craft and design in different times and cultures” (p.18). This is a response to the general requirement of the English National curriculum which advocates the inclusion of multicultural groups in all the subjects in the curriculum.

Recent journals, books and conference presenters address culture in their studies. For example, Brennan (2006) observes that Botswana teacher-trainees’ knowledge of art history or contextual studies often reflects more knowledge of European art history than African world cultures.

This is largely due to the problem of accessing contextual resources, particularly in rural areas. The vast geography of Botswana, the dual existence of contemporary technology in urban centres along with other resources such as museums, bookshops and libraries, contrast sharply with the lack of resources in rural-based communities. In addition, books and slides on European and Early African art are more readily available in bookshops and libraries than publications on contemporary African art (Brennan, 2006, p. 322).

We should be aware that we have no proper understanding of our contemporary world and our society without having some knowledge and understanding of the roots of traditions and the institutions which we inherit (Chanda, 2000, Steers, 2005 and Dash, 2006). We can only appreciate the meaning of the present and grasp the possibilities of the future by connecting to the frameworks of the past. Dash (2006) argues that:

merely … making art with ‘multicultural’ material culled from the local communities in different sites may provide initial starting-points for making, but cannot describe the subjects’ fullness of inheritance or their complex histories (p. 265).
Cultural art and craft work can be studied by teachers and pupils in local museums. Taylor (1992) also pays heed to the significant of culture to art and craft curriculum and he commends Norma Tait, a ceramicist member of the Artists in Wigan Schools Scheme for valuing culture in art creation. He says Norma shared with the public that she was inspired by Pre- Colombian, Oriental, African and Aboriginal artifacts which often have symbolic or ceremonial significance. She mentioned that she liked a lot of African pots and carvings because, although they are highly decorative and quite ornate they still have that feeling of powerful simplicity and she was also striving to do the same.

Neglecting local, regional and national culture has also been criticised by artists such as Johnson cited by Taylor (1992) who was the member of the Black Artists Alliance. During the exhibition in the Wigan Schools Loan exhibition where he featured his two sculptures, he made his feelings felt both verbally and practically. He emphasises that “it is really sad that minority groups can’t feel proud to be who they are, that we should make them want to be white like us” (Taylor, 1992, p. 148). Botswana is also a good example, because most of the pupils are deprived of an understanding of the high achievements in the arts their ancestors have made to world culture. Steers (2005) has also contributed to the debate centred on the culture and education philosophy as viewing culture to be important and significant to art and craft education. He explains that:

art, craft and design education is concerned with the transmission of cultures. Thus students should learn to appreciate, value and be tolerant of images and artifacts, western and non-western, contemporary and from other times, and to understand the contexts of their production. They should develop the capacity to work confidently and creatively with a range of traditional media and new technologies, appreciating and enjoying competent and intelligent making. They should learn to reflect critically on their work and that of others, making reasoned judgements about value and meaning, while developing a life-long interest in the visual arts (p. 13).
At the lower primary level art and craft history and culture could be taught by the use of folktale stories, for example, African folktales which our grandmothers and grandfathers related to us to communicate the past (Mannathoko, Gaotlhobogwe, Soko and Moruisi, 2006). Similarly, an older person from the community could be invited to the classroom, and could cover the past work of local artists and craft-workers some of which no longer exist. Pupils may later be asked to illustrate folktale stories they have just been told (Mannathoko, Gaotlhobogwe, Soko and Moruisi, 2006). Use of folktale stories or poems will stimulate and motivate pupils for creative work. Nthoi (2003) argues that it is often thought incorrectly that our pupils at a lower primary stage can not talk about artwork. We also often interpret art history to be to art from other countries, forgetting that we also have a past and current local artists, craft-workers and designers with work which our pupils recognise and value (Brennan, 2006).

In making the case for the inclusion of culture in education, Paterson (2004) also views culture in art and craft education as of profound importance as she says:

> through the study of art and culture, students learn to gain confidence in their own human ability and they gain an understanding of how art has contributed toward the cultural capital of nations in a range of context and historical periods (p. 32)

Venet (2002); Milbrandt, Felts, Richards and Abghari (2004); and Andrew (2005) are of the same view as they emphasise that much more must be done in schools to make all pupils aware of other beliefs and to extend their understanding of the multi-cultural nature of contemporary society. Teachers and parents should help them to understand and appreciate both traditional and contemporary works of art and craft. According to Robinson (1982) pupils, during their early schooling years, are genuinely curious about their culture or custom
and how it operates. Conceptual and formal knowledge about art and craft is an important constituent of this cultural legacy and pupils should be sensitised to it as early as possible to make them comfortable with these forms of knowing (Cox, 2003). “It is worth noting that, for students with weak visual-spatial skills, talk about art may provide a welcome, powerful linkage to the artistic tradition…” (Gardner, 1990, p. 40). Gardner suggests that as pupils work on their own projects, they ought to be introduced to notational and formal aspects of artistic analysis gradually and sensitively. He further explains that as they are experimenting with various colours, they may, as well, be primed to learn something of colour theory and in producing variations on a theme; they may find other such variations undertaken by distinguished artists to be interesting for example, Vincent van Gogh’s bright colours.

However, Gardner (1990) sees some risk in employing such frameworks, especially if one fails to assume a developmental stance or if teachers are not sufficiently knowledgeable about art and craft. “There is a strong possibility that this talk will be acquired and evinced without integral relationship to the child’s own art-making activity.” (p. 40). Gardner urges a measured introduction to conceptual and formal knowledge about art and craft during the early school years. The problem of untrained teachers being able to handle art and craft lessons has been identified by many art and craft educationists including Nthoi (2000), Whitehurst (2002) and Carpenter (2005). These educationists adopt the position that the teacher should have experienced specific education in art and craft as it is unique as a learning tool and requires a special approach. Every subject has its own professional expectations and teachers need as far as possible, to be fully acquainted with every subject they deal with.
To the contrary, Eisner (1998) believes that there is no need to have an art and craft specialised qualification if one is an experienced teacher, as teachers can transcribe the same approach that they use in other subjects. The Ministry of Education – Educational Statistics (2008) in Botswana shows that over ninety percent of the 18,225 primary school teachers who have been trained for primary school teaching, have not been trained in art and craft education which resulted in them encountering problems of teaching the subject before the introduction of the CAPA programme. These teachers were not able to use their experience of other subjects to help them to teach art and craft as a discipline. Moalosi and Molwane’s (2008) research findings also indicate that teachers are ill-prepared to teach CAPA and they emphasise that it is only through extensive in-service training that such challenges can be addressed.

3.4.3.2 Objectives of art and craft curriculum in the CAPA programme

The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2004/5), Phibion (2006), Moalosi and Molwane (2008) and Phuthego’s (2008) findings show that primary school teachers in Botswana were concerned that the CAPA programme was congested with specific objectives and this programme additionally includes the art and craft curriculum. According to Moalosi and Molwane (2008), apart from teachers’ little knowledge and scarcity of teaching resources in the CAPA subjects, one of the constraints cited by the parliamentarians during their debate on primary school teachers’ inability to teach CAPA subjects, was the breadth and depth of the subject which seems to be covering a wide array of content across different practical subject disciplines such as art and craft, design and technology, music and physical education. These problems, according to these educationists led to:
lecturers from the University of Botswana, Tlokweng and Lobatse colleges of education to conduct a workshop to get first hand information on the challenges facing teachers in teaching CAPA at schools and on how best they can be assisted (p. 27).

With reference to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) in Botswana and Moalosi and Molwane’s (2008) findings, that the CAPA is prescriptive with specific objectives which direct or prescribe teachers with what to do, it differs with that of art and design in the English National curriculum. The English National Curriculum (1999) provides broad descriptions of items which could guide teachers when making judgement of pupils’ performances. It does not prescribe specific objectives. This is an observation of Eisner’s (2002) idea that the context and environment where the school is situated and pupils’ needs should better determine the nature of the teaching and learning. In addition, Argiro (2004) argues that art and craft curriculum should attempt to provide full scope for diverse responses by not over-prescribing specific objectives, as the diversity of the pupils will be matched by flexibility of the teachers. She suggests the following broad attainment outcomes which she believes can advise primary school teachers to design activities and locate learning within them: using materials, techniques, skills and media; expressing feelings, ideas, thoughts and solutions and evaluating and appreciating. However, she is concerned that the generalist teachers would find them difficult to apply especially evaluation and appreciating. This is a view shared by Hope (1994) cited by Walling (2000) who also questioned the prescription of the specific objectives and suggests that the curriculum developers should place emphasis on what pupils should know and be able to do. He contends that “the national art standards should not prescribe processes, methods or resources. They should be generic goals, rather than lists of specifics or, even less desirable, a national curriculum” (p. 7). He further suggests five general standards for art and craft as follows: The student understands and applies media, techniques, and processes related to the visual arts; the student knows how
to use the structures (for example, sensory qualities, organizational principles, expressive features) and functions of art; the student knows a range of subject matter, symbols, and potential ideas in the visual arts, the student understands the visual arts in relation to history and cultures and the students understand the characteristics and merits of their own artwork and the artwork of others (p. 7).

However, there are certain behavioural objectives which Hope believes could be defined in advance, such as the development of craft skills and the ability to manipulate materials as they do not contradict teachers’ flexibility allowed by most of the art and craft programmes. Botswana adopted Criterion Reference Testing (CRT) in 1996 whereby teachers are required to teach and examine each individual child in relation to each specific objectives stipulated in the curriculum (Republic of Botswana, 1997). The Ministry of Education according to the document requires each question asked by the teacher in a test or examination to be addressing a specific objective and teachers are expected to record each child’s performance in relation to the examined criterion which is the specific objective. Teachers are required to explain in the pupils’ performance record, the extent to which each pupil has achieved specific objective stipulated in the national curriculum (Republic of Botswana, 1997). This approach might hinder teachers’ flexibility in tackling the art and craft topics. Botswana’s curriculum is thus mainly test and examination oriented. This observation has been argued by Steers (2004) in relation to the United Kingdom education system. He referred to Henry Giroux of the Penn University who questions the thrust of these reforms in a way that seems just apposite in the United Kingdom as Giroux says merit pay, a standardized curriculum, raising test scores, evaluation criteria and the like

... is just another version of the technological fix that ignores the philosophical questions. It is quantifying the educational process in the belief
that the outcome will be some kind of excellence or economic competence. ... those who are pushing these reforms have no educational philosophy at all. We have to ask what the purposes of education are, what kind of citizens we hope to produce (Groux, 1988, in Steers, 2004, p. 1).

Steers gave an example of teachers in England who teach to satisfy examination grades following objectives and satisfying appraisal for their payments. “Professional confidence to teach a subject rather than just what an examination requires has plummeted. We are a nation obsessed by assessment, particularly external examinations” (Tattersall, 2003, p. 4). Barrett (1979) had foreseen this development when he argued that “in most cases specific objectives should be set aside and the activity should be evaluated post facto in terms of its results and how these benefit self or society” (p. 5).

3.4.3.3 Content, teaching strategies and resources

Eisner (2002) advocates for the curriculum developers to build sufficient flexibility into the designing of the curriculum to permit the teachers an individual and personal interpretation of its content. However, there are important guidelines within which each teacher must locate their particular approach or attitude. These guidelines are always stipulated in the curriculum or syllabus. Curriculum developers at various levels can tailor the standards, range of subject matter and potential ideas to match cultural, community, and individual needs and interests (Walling, 2000 and Dorn, 2002). These educationists suggest that the national art and craft education standards should be interpreted as very general but powerful, ensuring, for example, that a pupil understands art and craft in relation to their history and culture. They further say that specific standards should be created in the local curriculum. These will provide teachers with a challenge. “That challenge in the best situations can help to invigorate teaching and to awaken students’ interests through a more rigorous curriculum” (Walling, 2000, p. 8). Nthoi (2000) believes that the national curriculum helps the non-
specialists teachers to focus on different aspects of art and craft and encourages them to offer a wider range of art and craft activities in the classroom.

The Botswana Curriculum Development and Evaluation Division (2002) has observed such recommendations in its recognition of the need for flexibility in the planning and teaching of all the subjects in the lower primary syllabus. The national syllabus for lower primary (2002) indicates that the main thrust of the revision of the syllabus has been the development of curricula which are related to the needs of pupils and the nations at large. It further stipulates that “schools should continue to be responsible for detailed teaching schemes and plans as the syllabi are only providing guidance for teaching and learning” (p. ii). This encourages teachers to consider their pupils’ needs and environment as advocated by educationists such as Eisner (1972) and Robinson (1982). Kahn and Ullah (2008) give a broader view that a rich, meaning-centred curriculum requires a close collaboration of all stakeholders in education reform such as teachers, students, administrators, parents, business community, curriculum specialists and technology developers.

Although the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) mentions in this syllabus that part two of this document consists of the content for each subject and the teaching methods to provide guidelines to assist teachers, there is a general statement which says that “the methods described are only the suggestions and teachers should not be restricted only to those outlined” (p. ii). The syllabus further indicates that a number of methods have been suggested, but there is no content and methods suggested specifically for teachers in art and craft. Teachers decide what to teach and approaches/methods to apply guided by the objectives considering the statement which explains that “the teacher is to use the specific objectives to generate relevant activities to address the intended goals”
Hope’s (1994) and Argiro’s (2004) recommendations that the national syllabus should not prescribe specific objectives, teaching strategies or resources to teachers. However, there is some contradiction regarding flexibility as the specific objectives in art and craft curriculum dictate the activities teachers should give to pupils rather than formulating general objectives or goals for teachers to develop their own specific objectives and activities which will determine their teaching strategies and subject matter.

Nevertheless, the aims of the lower primary CAPA programme include an element of a spirit of self-reliance and self-sufficiency as one of its goals. This calls for a child-centred method which is also viewed by most art and craft educationists as an effective approach in teaching, especially, for young learners. Since the mid-forties there has been a continuing debate in education regarding the alternative benefits of subject-centered and student-centered approaches. According to Swann (2005) subject-centered approaches are concerned with instruction that is based on transmission of knowledge and skills. This has been contrasted with learner centered education, which is generally concerned with facilitating creative expression or ‘procedural knowledge’. Swann (2005) promotes a learner-centred approach by saying that it allows pupils to share in the teaching of studio techniques and processes.

### 3.4.3.3.1 Enquiry method

Enquiry-based teaching appears to be very effective because it is problem-centred, as it is concerned with the process by which knowledge is acquired and applied. Gruber and Hobbs (2002) say the instruction in this type of approach is solution-centred as it sets out to transmit the products of inquiry in as efficient a way as possible. Mannathoko (2005) and Swann (2005) view a thematic approach as effective in the teaching of art and craft. Mannathoko has
emphasised in her art and craft Audio Script for Botswana Diploma by Distance Learning that teachers should use a ‘Thematic Approach’ in their teaching of art and craft whereby pupils are given a broad topic to mind-map upon in order to identify sub-themes. She believes this approach promotes independence in pupils and encourages those with low level of confidence in creating art or craft work to gain confidence.

This is a view supported by Chanda (1998) who recognises that:


It is evident that learning in the arts is largely enquiry-based and therefore, exposure to learning in the arts positively influences students’ inclination to and acquisition of critical thinking (Lampert, 2006). Critical skills and problem-solving skills are high priorities among the purpose of including the arts in the lower primary CAPA programme of Botswana (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). Contemporary scholars according to Lampert (2006) have defined the construct of critical thinking as reflective thinking focused on the evaluation of various alternatives. “Thus students who develop critical thinking deposition are inclined to employ critical, reflective, thinking when engaged in problem solving and analysis across various domains” (Giancarlo and Facione, 2001 cited by Lampert 2006).

In advocating for the enquiry method, Borg (2007) says works of art and craft may appear to be problematic because they can be understood and evaluated in different ways. The first
thing the teacher should do is to introduce a situation in which the individual pupil can identify and work on the problems which interest them. “The development sequence here should be one which gradually clarifies the situation and gives pupils increasing responsibility for distinguishing their own problems and exploring ways of solving them” (Field, 1970, in Barrett, 1979, p. 51). Woolfolk (2001) adds that learners have different learning preferences, and hence learning from doing can make students fully enjoy the subject and raise their participation. Nevertheless, this does not negate the value of the instructional teaching mode. If the teacher is in possession of the knowledge or technique and the object of teaching, transmitting to the learner as efficiently as possible; it does not necessarily put the learner in neither a passive role nor does it rests simply on talk and chalk methods. A variety of visual aids and audio-visual aids can be employed to good instructional effect.

However, Whitehurst (2002) and Carpenter (2005), Kalin and Kind (2006) are concerned that teachers untrained in the art and craft discipline will have difficulties as they claim that many of those teachers tend to think of the teacher as sole expert and the act of teaching as entirely detailed planning in advance rather than as a response to pupils’ inquiries and interests. Sharing the same sentiment, Velempini (2002) a lecturer in one of Botswana’s colleges of education is concerned that on entering colleges, more students lack confidence and knowledge in art and craft than in other curriculum areas such as mathematics and English. Her findings concur with those declared by Rogers and Plaster (1994) for the study conducted by Sharp and Cleave (1984) in Goldsmiths College in England. According to Sharp and Cleave (1984) this was because the majority of students may well have dropped most or all arts subjects in key stages 3 and 4, which would have made it more difficult for them to maintain their art and craft knowledge. In this regard, Kalin and Kind (2006) note that
previous conceptions about the role of a teacher, what constitutes teaching, and how pupils learn are being currently redefined in educational literature and new, creative visions of what constitutes teaching continue to be explored.

3.4.3.4 Integration within the combined arts in the Botswana CAPA programme

There is a long history of the arts being regarded as a group of disciplines united by the fact that they are all concerned in some way with capacities such as imaginative creativity and self-expressiveness; there are taken to be the characteristic features of the aesthetic realm of experience and meaning. Over the past thirty years several educators and professional bodies stand out as being particularly influential in promoting the idea of unity of the arts as a basis for curriculum design and practice (Philpott and Plummeridge, 2001, p. 132).

An integrated approach has been promoted in Botswana primary schools for over twenty years. An approach called a Project Method was introduced in primary schools in the 1990s to emphasise problem-solving skills through an enquiry method and the integration of subjects. Cleave and Sharp (1986) view integration as a preferred approach in the teaching of art and craft. Having discussed the issue with some of their teacher trainee tutors in their community they note that one of them stressed that “teachers should see in all areas of activity links and overlapping areas which can be exciting and perception-enhanced, such as symmetry in printmaking, mathematics, dance/movement, science; and to see art as the centre of a pool – ripples extending to include other subject areas” (p. 44). Nthoi (2003, p. 73) identifies the benefits of integrating art and craft with other areas of school curricula as follows: help finding relationships between subject areas; build awareness of similarities of art and craft and other subjects; recall past experiences and skills learned in art and craft lessons and apply them in other subject areas; where verbal or written explanations fails to render the message, art and craft images or illustration can improvise; help in classification of
things; encourages logical thinking and enhances other subjects in the sense that content presented would not only be audio oriented but also visually oriented.

In sharing his experience Ziga (1997) says many teachers in Botswana seem to have believed that art and craft can only be integrated with subjects like social studies and not think of them being integrated. According to Phibion (2006) the Cream Wright consultancy (1995) also emphasises that the CAPA subjects can be used “through integrated activities and projects to reinforce the teaching of certain topics in social studies” (p. 6). To give an account of why the CAPA subjects have been put together, Phibion explains that the Ministry of Education (MoE) discovered that all practical subjects are related and that they link, so CAPA reflects this. The arts have always been integrated in African Societies’ cultural activities such as social events performances and many art and craft educationists had long advocated this approach (Chanda, 1993 and Havens, 2000). They believe culture cannot be separated from the arts and define the arts as art and craft, drama and dance including music. Mahloane (2003) and Phuthego (2008) argue that these aspects of education are aspects of process, and ignoring their integration will harm their progress. According to Phuthego, the fundamental aspect is drama, that is the unfolding drama of creation and discovery and it involves craft, design and dance as necessary co-operative activities.

Moalosi and Molwane (2008) also share their Botswana experience by asserting that:

when CAPA was introduced in schools, the teaching approach recommended to teachers was supposed to be integrative. Since teachers lacked background in this approach, they taught each module separately thus defeating the initial aim of the subject. (p. 34).
During their study these researchers gave sixty participants an integration exercise whereby they worked in groups of five to try and integrate the teaching of the Upper primary CAPA modules under a given theme ‘Wedding’. Groups were required to link the theme to the specific objectives in the programme. According to Moalosi and Molwane as the theme was of open-ended and overarching nature, it:

provoked teachers to be creative; thinking about possible solutions of the activities of the theme, planning their making and continually evaluating the activities and contribution of their group members. Teachers were very actively involved, exchanging views, drawing ideas and modeling the outcome before settling for their best answers for presentations. Most teachers’ level of awareness was raised through the workshop activities through the week and they left the workshop feeling enriched (p. 35).

It could be useful to have examples in the CAPA programme or teachers’ guides to indicate where themes could be brought together for integration rather than completely separating them. Examples would guide teachers in all these disciplines as art and craft specialists might also lack knowledge, understanding and skills of the other three areas in CAPA. When comparing Botswana CAPA with other programmes, Phuthego (2008) notes that the Australian arts curriculum encompasses the five subject areas of dance, drama, media, music and the visual arts. The structure of the arts curriculum consists of three organizers namely, Creating, Making and Presenting, Arts Criticism and Aesthetics and Past and Present Contexts. A similar packaging of subjects is to be found in one of the African countries in the Namibian arts curriculum structure which consists of primary arts core and includes dance, drama, music and visual arts (Mans 1997). In contrast, the National Curriculum for England (1999) has separated them but encourages teachers to can use activities from music and drama as starting point for practical work to motivate pupils. According to Phuthego (2008) there has been some resistance and opposition to integration of the arts in the classroom. He says that:
in the case of the generically-based arts model adapted for the Australian schools, to some people 'this implied a weakening of each individual subjects in favour of an integrated approach' (McPherson 1997:173). Stephens (1997a: 61) notes that 'those who argue for integration may point to the direct and indirect benefits that arise from considering similarities between areas of the curriculum – of discovering common denominators which not only enrich understanding within subjects, but also open up possibilities beyond the immediate sphere of activity' (p. 7).

3.4.3.5 Evaluation of children’s growth and progress in art and craft

Evaluation according to Havens (2002) is a process of examining a situation in order to determine its worth or quality. To elaborate on this perspective, Merwe (2007) views evaluation as “a qualitative value or merit determination that is used to make judgements about a learner’s level of competence, his/her knowledge, progress and values” (p.51). Without invalidating the foregoing definition, Scriven (2001, p. 302) clarifies that:

evaluation does not always involve judgement measurement against established standards – for example, in performance in high jump and other track and field events. So evaluation is not, as it is often said to be, simply the domain of value judgements.

This clarification according to Phuthego (2008) sheds light on the complexity of evaluation, and also helps view evaluation in a much broader perspective than we usually do. Adding to our understanding of evaluation is the distinction between utilisation- focused evaluation and general evaluation as made by Patten (1997) who explains that utilisation-focused evaluation is “done for and with specific, intended primary users for specific, intended goals” (p.23). General evaluation lacks that specificity. Ortegren (2007) concurs and explains that:

formative evaluation … is part of the project’s ongoing process, and is measured first of all in relation to operating methods. In formative evaluation, part of the purpose is not only to study the results of a process, but also to contribute to that process … in other words: one of the aims of formative evaluation is to use methods of evaluation during the process which
contributes to strengthening the operating methods of said project. In formative evaluation, we check how the process is proceeding, and determine how we can build in options designed to make slight changes in the aim of the project (Ortegren, 2007, p. 110).

In contrast summative evaluation involves examining the activity once it has been produced to determine its final effectiveness (Savenye, 2004). Ortegren’s rationale of evaluation contradicts the evaluation purpose which was practiced in the mid-19th century as Eisner (1972) states that evaluation for too long was used as a means for distributing rewards and punishments to students. He says it was used as a mechanism for approving or disapproving what students did. In drawing a distinction between formative and summative evaluation, Preedy (2001) states that formative evaluation involves examining the activity during development to provide information to be used in improving the product. It enables adjustments to be made during the course of an activity or project, while summative evaluation examines the activity in its entirety after it has been presented or finished.

The Botswana national CAPA curriculum for lower primary requires teachers to construct tests and quizzes to assess pupils’ performance throughout the course. It further emphasises that “it is important that teachers keep a record of these tests and summarised them as part of the term’s work for summative assessment” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p.2). Teachers should further construct termly tests for each standard to assess what learners have attained throughout the course. “A national test based on the attainment targets will be conducted at the end of standard 4 by Examinations Research and Testing Division (ERTD).” The Botswana art and craft curriculum has not suggested that pupils should be involved in the assessment of their work as in the case of art and design for Key Stage 2 of the England National Curriculum (1999). It is stated in the England National
teaching should ensure that investigating and making includes exploring and developing ideas and evaluating and developing work. Knowledge and understanding should inform this process… Pupils should be taught to compare ideas, methods and approaches in their own and others’ work and say what they think and feel about them. …adapt their work according to their views and describe how they might develop it further (p.18)

This was found to be lacking in Botswana primary schools by Nthomang and Paul (2006) who note that teachers lacked skills of assessing art and craft practical activities. They say pupils were not involved in creative strategies of evaluating their artwork and hence assumed pupils did not get sufficient art and craft skills which could enable them pursue relative careers in the area in future. One of the responses according to Nthomang and Paul was that “it is difficult to assess art, craft and design as learners’ responses are personal and therefore might not be measured.” (p.31). According to the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) in Botswana, lower primary forms the first four years of primary education in Botswana which seeks high quality learning experiences and prepares pupils for the world of work, further education and lifelong learning. Thus, involving pupils in their own assessment will help them cope with problems they face in future. This section therefore focuses on pupils’ involvement in the evaluation of their art and craft work in which the teachers can use their portfolios to assess them through the art and craft curriculum standards or criterion.

3.4.3.5.1 Involvement of pupils in evaluation procedures

In the art and craft discipline, the evaluation is usually formulated with small items of evidence gleaned from continual interaction between the pupil, resources, artifact, other
pupils and the teacher (Bensur, 2002). That is, a marking sheet or criteria for the child’s evaluation is designed to judge how they respond to these aspects. Barrett, 1979, p. 57) also credits the involvement of pupils in the evaluation of their work as he argues that:

any form of external evaluation tends to prescribe the activity to be evaluated. In some cases, the evaluation process is defined before the activity is described. In art evaluation there is no external standards which the process or artifact can be assessed. Some people believe that artistic standards exist, although they have never been able to formulate them effectively. It is essential that we, as art teachers, approach formative and summative evaluation carefully and avoid formulae and strategies which others, from different disciplines, insist that we adopt so that they can achieve a unified standard (Barrett, 1979, p. 57).

This seems to concur with Black et al (2004), Borg (2007), Lindstrom (2007) and Stears (2008) who advocate that teachers should negotiate the evaluation and educational objectives with the pupils so that they evaluate their work against their own implied or explicit objectives. They say this will make evaluation an inseparable part of the process of art and craft and design education and not an external post facto exercise. Borg (2007) further emphasises that:

the criteria for evaluating any learning achievement must be made transparent to students to enable them to have a clear overview both of the aims of their work and of what it means to complete it successfully. Students should be taught the habits and skills of collaboration in peer assessment both because peer assessment can help develop the objectivity required for effective self-assessment. Students should also be encouraged to keep in mind the aims of their work, to assess their own progress towards meeting projects aims, as they proceed with their own work and thus become independent learners. Peer assessment and self-assessment secures aims that cannot be achieved in any other way (p. 89).

Ortegre (2007) supports this idea as he suggests that to be clear about what degree of effort is necessary to obtain a certain grade, often requires a dialogue between the teacher and the
pupil. Thus one can say the evaluation is partly linked to assessment criteria concerning reaching certain goals, completing certain courses and subjects (Lindstrom, 2007).

The function of criteria in art is to disclose its meaning and illuminate its answers. These criteria are not revealed by specification or by technical use of materials but only by the observation of art in action. An art teacher is entitled to approach the art work of his pupils with declared attitudes, but he can not apply these without witnessing art in action. The object of critical evaluation should be to disclose the meaning of the work of art rather than to assess its worth. An art teacher’s real ability is revealed in his capacity to develop sensitive criteria appropriate to the concepts, procedures, and products of his pupils’ activities (Barrett, 1979, p. 58-59).

Thus, Barrett and Lindstrom recommend that the value of the educational experience should be assessed in terms of its total impact on the pupils’ skills, qualities and personal development not by attainment targets alone. For this strategy to be effective, pupils need to be encouraged to keep logs or a record of their progress together with their teachers (Lindstrom, 2007).

In developing pupils’ confidence about art and craft critique, David Ecker cited by Eisner (1972) suggests the following procedures in an effort to help students avoid impulse judgements of works of arts and craft.

First, get the students to report freely their feelings, attitudes, and immediate responses to a given artwork (their own or a master piece). Second, point out to students that there are differences in how people (including their teacher) respond to what is apparently the same stimulus, and that this is a consequence of different experiences and learning. Third, get them to distinguish psychological reports which are true by virtue of their correspondence with physiological and psychological states, with value judgments which are true-or better, justified-by virtue of arguments and supporting evidence. Fourth, broaden their experiences with contemporary and historical works of art and develop their ability to justify their independent judgments or the merits of art objects, whether or not they initially happen to like or dislike them (p. 223).
“The conversations that take place between the children and their teachers help to shape and define children’s approaches to learning art and craft” (Watts, 2005, p. 1). Borg (2007) advises teachers that “feedback at several occasions, which is understandable for the students, is very important when using formative assessment” (p.87). Taylor (1992) sharing his experience on art criticism strategy and strategies for evaluating art and craft work, notes that numerous models have been developed in an attempt to aid the process of evaluation. Feldman’s (1994) Description, Analysis, Interpretation and Judgement is probably the most widely used. These models are discussed at length in chapter 7. Taylor contends that:

in practice, though, many art educators confess that they find it useful but rather rigid and unnatural to apply to many situations. Equally, it is not lost on pupils that it carries with it an in-built assumption of them being expected to move from a stage of assumed lower artistic significance – that of describing – to the higher ones of making judgments in a sequential manner; in other words, the model itself carries overtones of being judgmental one with pressures on the pupils to move to the making of judgments. This suggests for an additional gallery model for engagement in which each of the elements is equal and can be addressed by pupils of all ages and levels of experience in this field. Feldman’s model is ideal for use in conjunction with this, but as tool for subsequent analysis and evaluation of what was done in the gallery (Taylor, 1992, p. 67).

It is clear from these comments that self-evaluation might be considered as an essential appraisal in art education. It reinforces the relationship between the pupil and their work and places the teacher outside the evaluative process and gives them greater credence in the learner’s eyes as the advice is open and therefore not seen as a means to a prescribed end (Taylor, 1992 and Borg, 2007). Swann (2005) says “this arrangement fosters greater interaction among the student artists, bringing more ideas into the classroom, and creates an atmosphere of enthusiasm and creativity” (p. 39). Probably the best way of doing it is by recording the process of self-evaluation in a progress sheet. This will help the pupil to be always in touch with the continuing activity and hence more able to understand the meaning
of what they are doing (Lindstrom, 2007). Teachers are urged to introduce their pupils and
give them confidence in a self-evaluation method. However, Swann (2005) advises that
pupils should start evaluating their work from the process not only the product. She is of
Richardson and Bowden’s (1983) view that the process of art and craft making is more
important than the product because it could and should involve thinking and problem-solving.

However, this does not exclude the teacher from evaluating pupils’ work with reference to
educational objectives. There has to be on-going formative evaluation of the concepts,
procedures and criteria being used by the teacher in the course of teaching (Lindstrom, 2007).
In this regard, Stears (2008) notes that much of what happens in classrooms is evaluative and
thereby considered as assessment due to the fact that pupils demonstrate their knowledge,
understanding and skills through tasks and discussion while making. Taking Ortegren (2007),
Lindstrom’s (2007) and Stears’s (2008) contention that evaluation is linked to assessment, the
evaluation approaches discussed could help inform Botswana teachers on their formative and
summative assessment. They could use the evaluation progress to inform them on pupils’
overall performances. That is they could use evaluation information on the performance of
specific projects to inform their formative and summative assessment drawn from the
attainment targets, aims and objectives of the curriculum.

3.4.3.5.2 Pupils’ progress profiles in art and craft

A significant amount of information has been generated about the value of evaluation in art
and craft education and how it is done and it is very important to analyse what teachers do
with such information when the child progresses to another school or a higher level of
learning. Is there sufficient and accurate handover of their progress to the next teacher?
Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) and Barnes (2002) believe that as the child grows, so does art.
This, therefore, calls for the smooth handover of pupils’ progress from one level to another. The teacher needs to keep a record of a pupil’s progress and convey this to the next teacher. There is a common habit of regarding the primary and the secondary school child as two different people for whom different processes should be provided. This is the same child whose education should be a single undivided process (Dichaba, 2002).

The Ministry of Education in Botswana directs teachers to keep pupils’ profiles which provide an in-depth assessment of each pupil (Ministry of Education and University of Botswana, 2002). In this regard the Botswana National Curriculum (2002), like the England and Wales National Curricula considers progression to be of importance in the child’s education as it stresses that “schools are required to plan their teaching and to develop appropriate assessment … Very clear reporting procedures must be developed at school level to allow for proper monitoring of progress” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Division, 2002, p. ii). This is supported by Treacher (1989) who advises that records for children’s progress should be meaningful to others and as unambiguous as possible. She stresses that they should assist the teacher in recognising problems, identifying low and high achievers and promoting the organising and planning of constructive, development issues. This means that records should not be seen as designed for handover to the teacher who takes over the child in a higher level only but also to help the teacher as they teach to refer back to their records time again to check where individual children excel and where they need help (Hardy, 2007). This type of record is also practised in South Africa according to Merwe (2007).

3.5 Summary

This section intends to summarise the key aspects of this chapter.
It is clear from the literature review that the Creative and Performing Arts programme, including art and craft education curriculum content, has been informed by Western education since both historical and recent times Botswana has constant exchange and dialogue with these countries concerning education.

Most definitions of art given by art theorists are to do with inner and imaginative worlds, profound thoughts, feelings and emotions whereas, craft is described as an art work that has a functional purpose.

Art and craft is also said to help communicate history, culture and values of various communities.

Art and craft educationists believe art and craft education aims to develop pupils’ visual perception; communicate cultural experiences; help pupils express their feelings and emotions; develop aesthetics and manipulative skills and to release tensions.

Most emphasis was on creative and critical skills that art and craft education develops creative and critical thinking skills which place equal emphasis on being able to think and act creatively. It can also be used to promote pupils’ interpersonal and international understanding.

The authors cited in this chapter further share a common ground that art and craft activities develop the pupils’ understanding of the academic subject areas, especially the social studies, and hence should be used as an important resource in teaching those subject areas.

Different researchers cited in this chapter offer some common ground in their understanding of art and craft as a subject in the curriculum and the interrelationship between the different forms of the arts. Most importantly, they share a common view of the value of arts education and some emphasise integration of the arts subject disciplines.
• The fact that some of the researchers argue against their integration emanates from the concern that individual subjects will be weakened.

• The issue of integration of the arts has been debated since 1983 engaging art and design educationists such as Best (1983) and Abbs (1987).

• The general structure of the lower primary syllabus, CAPA programme and art and craft curriculum has also been reviewed and the literature review observes the notion that schools should be viewed as social institutions hence reflecting the values and needs of the communities they serve. We have a rich cultural life in Botswana, and schools should be a window to this world.

• Our communities and cultural organisations also have a responsibility to work with schools to place young people and education at the heart of all the cultural activities they practice. It should be in the interest of the government to see children from all backgrounds having chance to use their creativity and imagination in a productive and fulfilling way.

• The goals and content of art and craft education programmes should be determined by the needs of pupils, shaping the content, the needs of the community and the problems the larger society is facing. An education which sets out to help people make sense of, and contribute to the world in which they live, must be concerned with helping them to investigate their own values and those of others.

• Based on this argument, Botswana educational researchers stress that if the government is to promote creative and cultural education in schools, it is necessary to minimise prescription and provide teachers with better initial education and continuing professional development, resources and vastly more autonomy.

• The researchers cited in this chapter have the same view that the key aspect is to cherish multiple visions of teaching and learning in art and craft and the other arts, to enable
healthy cross-fertilisation of ideas and to view art and craft centres and the community art and craft experts to be part of the teaching and learning strategies.

- Research findings for CAPA have demonstrated that teachers are facing challenges when attempting to teach the lower primary CAPA programme. In terms of background training, teachers need training in some or all components of the CAPA programme modules. The main problem is that the primary school teachers who may have had little training in some aspects of CAPA may be unaware of how to make the most of learning opportunities by linking the broad CAPA modules together. Lack of resources also causes some limitations in the teaching of the programme.

- Most researchers have emphasised that materials and techniques should be at the service of the pupil and the teacher's role being to introduce the themes. This will be the area in which the problems are to be found. They say as pupils grow and are taught in a learner-centred mode, they are able to identify their own problems and become independent. Critical thinking is enhanced by independent enquiry, problem-solving, interactive discussion and analysis.

- The similarities and differences of assessment and evaluation have been observed. These two aspects have been argued with reference to the involvement of pupils in creation of evaluation criteria. Evaluating pupils' progress has been described as effective means of improving art and craft teaching and learning; and self-evaluation is believed to be an essential assessment tool.

- There was emphasis on progression in learning as researchers believe it is very important and need to be considered in all levels.
CHAPTER 4
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

4.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the qualitative methods and the strategies followed to conduct an in-depth investigation that explored the teachers’ practices or instruction and their perceptions of the first art and craft curriculum in Botswana primary schools. It also describes data analysis strategies for this study. To my knowledge this was the first research since the introduction of the 2002 syllabus for Botswana lower primary. Researchers from other areas, that make up the Creative and Performing Arts programme could equally well have been interested in carrying out a similar study on the syllabus since it also directly concern their areas. Unlike the ten studies mentioned in chapter 3, which focused either on art and craft for both lower and upper primary education, the whole CAPA programme or music and design and technology as aspects of CAPA, I concentrated on one aspect of CAPA which is art and craft for lower primary. Focusing on art and craft as an individual discipline would specifically inform the subject educationists on how the subject is interpreted at lower primary. The curriculum developers could also get feedback on an individual subject area (art and craft) as their study generalised the results for the four CAPA subjects. The constraints given by teachers for implementing the CAPA programme could have been a result of one or two subjects and not all the CAPA subjects.

Secondly, data for the two studies conducted by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit (2004/2005) and Phibon (2006) on the implementation of the whole CAPA programme was collected through questionnaires and interviews. The other difference of my study with that of the Curriculum Development and Evaluation unit is that its rationale was to inform the
intended curriculum to be developed (standards four and six) whereas my research was concerned with all the educationists as beneficiaries in Botswana not excluding educationists worldwide. During the department’s study, “CAPA was cited as the subject most unlikely to be completed … The reason given was the congestion of objectives and their practical nature” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation standard 3 monitoring report, 2004, p. 9).

But when analysing the lower primary art and craft curriculum, I could identify the same problem in standards one to four level specifically in art and craft, I assumed teachers could still be encountering the same problem therefore wanted to find out how they translated the curriculum into practice to complete the curriculum. In both the 2004 and 2005 reports, shortage of instructional materials and equipment for CAPA was a central cause for concern coupled with lack of knowledge, requisite skills and the multi-skills nature of the subject and this made the teaching of CAPA very difficult for the standard 3, 4 and 5 teachers according to the 2003 report.

The last observation is that Nthomang and Paul’s (2006) research focused on the assessment of art and craft in primary schools while my study included various aspects of the art and craft education as a discipline within the CAPA programme. These aspects will be described later in this chapter. Nthomang and Paul’s study used one instrument, questionnaire, to collect data. I triangulated my study by analysing the art and craft curriculum for lower primary and investigated how class-teachers and school administrators interpreted the document through observation, interview and analysis of pupils’ art and craft work. What follows are details, presented under specific sub-headings, regarding the research strategies. This includes: population of the study, sampling design, research design, qualitative approach, case study, observation methods, interview methods, illuminative evaluation, documents, archival and physical artifacts, validity and reliability, the process of data
collection, data analysis procedures, limitation of the study and concluding comments. I will first describe the population and sampling procedures of the study as in some instances, reference will be made to them when discussing the specific methodologies within the qualitative research design.

4.2 Target population

According to Walliman (2001) population in research, is a collective term used to describe the total quantity of cases of the type which are the subject of the researcher’s study. He says it can consist of events, people, objects and others. This study focused on lower primary and the art and craft lower primary curriculum. The target population comprised the standard two and four pupils who were eight to ten years of age at the time of study, standard one to four teachers, practical subject’s senior teachers and lower primary heads of department for four chosen primary schools from South Central and Central North Regions respectively. The reason for choosing these two regions are mentioned in chapter 2 under delimitation section. The study included only those pupils who attended formal education in Botswana government primary schools but excluding special education classes for children with special needs requiring special education which was not part of the research intention for this study. Lower primary pupils were included in this study as they were the recipients of art and craft lower primary programme. These pupils were from the classes which were observed in progress. However, their data has not been presented separately, but was used to support the main data which is the findings from the classroom observation and teachers’ interview. One class in each school was observed making a total of four for all the four schools. These were two standard twos and two fours. Standard two classes had been preferred to standard one to represent Infant classes since the pupils in standard one were only about five months in school and so not much could be collected from them.
Standard four classes were preferred to standard three to represent the middle classes because of their familiarity with the school’s lower primary programmes as they were in the last year of lower primary preparing to begin upper primary, thus were thought would serve as “information rich cases” (Patton, 2000). These pupils were hoped to demonstrate the extent to which they have acquired lower primary skills required by the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) at that level, according to the Botswana primary curriculum. They were also preparing for the ‘attainment tests’ given at the end of lower primary as a diagnostic test to proceed to upper primary. Collecting data from them was expected to be of benefit to my research with specific focus on progression and continuity in the learning of art and craft.

Last but not least, teachers are the instructors who are expected to read and understand the syllabus and curriculum and interpret those using approaches, methods and activities which can help pupils achieve goals or aims and develop skills prompted by the curriculum. Internal school administrators who also participated in the study were involved because they were accountable for the general management of the school which included supervision of teachers to ensure that pupils get an appropriate education. They were also expected to provide information on the preparedness of lower primary teachers to teach art and craft curriculum for lower primary.

4.3 Sampling design

In research, samples should be chosen so as to be representative of a carefully defined population. “If the sample is not typical of the total set of units in which you are interested it will fail to serve its purpose” (Lynn in Greenfield, 2002, p. 185). The sampling process can be summarised through the following steps: defining the population, developing a sample
frame, determining the sample size, selecting the sample and selecting the respondents. These steps have been followed in this study.

I selected one school from the South Central Region and the other three from the Central North region under three contexts. Each had its own culture and economic and socio-political environment which exerted influence on the lives of learners. The difference of number of pupils in classes and number of streams in each level was not expected to disadvantage the study as the main focus of the study was on how teachers interpret the curriculum through teaching. However, because of the low enrolment in some of the remote areas I thought that there could be a possibility to find one teacher for each level of studies which could disadvantage the study if that teacher could be absent from school due to different reasons. To avoid such difficulties, two schools from a remote area in the Central North Region were studied to supplement each other. However both the class-teachers availed themselves for both the classroom observation and the interview sessions therefore their responses were both considered in data analysis to represent the remote area context.

People who live in the Central North remote area in which two primary schools were studied were designated by the government of Botswana as Rural Area Dwellers (RADs). These people were seen by the government as disadvantaged as their villages were less developed because of their financial status and the government gave them support which includes food, clothing and transport and encouraged parents to send their children to school for free specifically those who could not afford school fees. One of these two schools was more advantaged than the other as this other school was about 79 km gravel road from the main tarred road and there was neither network for mobile phones nor landline facilities in the area not even a shop at the time of the study. The second school was fortunate to be just beside the
tarred road to one of the cities and nearer to a small restaurant just about 3 minutes walk from
the school where they could pick up recycled materials such as newspapers, plastic bags and
containers to use in art and craft lessons although teachers mentioned that not enough could
be found as the shop sold few items.

Just like the other school, the second school in the remote area was also occupied by the
RADs who got the same services from the government as the other school. The school did
not have a telephone at the time of the study and there was also no mobile network in the area
which the school head believed was hindering communication between the school staff and
other Education Departments. One school chosen in the South Central region was in the
capital city and one among the three in the Central North region was from one of the bigger
villages in Botswana therefore, these two were expected to have large population which more
than one class in each level which could allow shifting from one class to another if there was
any problem with one class. The school in the village was in an area of more developments
compared to the remote one with more than five shops, tarred road to the other city and only
50km from one of the Education Offices in the district.

The sampling frame was one teacher from each category in each school specifically from
standard one to four classes to make a total of sixteen teachers. These teachers had different
qualifications in which some held certificates, diploma and first degrees in the teaching
profession. Some were working on their diplomas and degrees through distance learning
mode in Botswana and South Africa Universities at the time of the study. Among the twenty-
four informants who were teachers and their administrators, no one stated that they
specialised in art and craft in their teacher training except two who mentioned that they were
on their final year in Diploma specialising in art and craft through distance mode which is
facilitated by the University of Botswana through the Colleges of Education and fully sponsored by the government of Botswana. These two teachers were among the twenty three who mentioned that they did art and craft as generalists in their teacher training some in certificates and some in diploma and only one was a temporary teacher who said she had not trained for teaching. She held the General Certificate in Secondary Education (GCSE) but stated she had never studied art and craft in her schooling.

All the informants (teachers) were Botswana citizens and employed by the government of Botswana on permanent and pensionable basis except one who was temporary. The study included one teacher from standard one, one from standard two, one from standard three and one from standard four in each school. I selected teachers who were willing to take part in the study. These teachers were asked to volunteer if interested to take part in the study and they did without any problem and this could have been because they were first briefed about the study, its purpose, rationale and procedures. In qualitative inquiry, the dominant sampling strategy is purposeful sampling (Patton, 2000). The other reason for having interest in the study could have been because they were allowed to be flexible in language either responding in Ikalanga, Setswana, English languages or mix them when responding to the interview questions because I knew the languages therefore could translate statements when presenting or analysing data. They also appreciated the fact that they were promised to have access to their classroom observation findings if they wished.

In addition, among the informants, there was one senior teacher and a head of department for lower primary from each school to give information by virtue of their positions. Thus, each school was represented by two internal school administrators making a total of six teachers in a school and twenty-four for four schools. However, I discovered that they were two heads of
the lower primary department in all the four schools, one for infant and the other for middle classes, and they were also allowed to volunteer to take part in the study as only one was to take part considering that they play the same role in the supervision of teachers. The total population for the study was twenty-eight including classroom observation sessions.

One school from the South Central Region and three from the Central North Regions were selected among others as a result of the information from the Education Officers for those regions. However, it was determined which schools to choose in the Central North Region in consultation with my brother and cousin who worked in that area, the relevant experts from the primary school directorate and regional education officers for approval. These people were involved principally because they were able to identify those schools with better roads in remote areas as I did not have much experience in driving in sandy and very corrugated roads and also considering the issue of accommodation during research. Thus, they advised on the schools closer to where I could stay safely during my study and the ones which I could not have much difficulty to reach. I first thought that if I could involve Education Officers for the areas only, they would influence me to select schools they think are better than others in terms of facilities and art and craft instruction therefore I engaged different sources even those outside the Education system to reduce biasness to the study. It was interesting to discover that all those involved suggested exactly the same schools which they mentioned were easier to access considering roads and lodging places.

The school from the South Central Region was purposefully chosen from the list offered by the Education Officer for the area because my daughter attended her primary school there for two years. I had a bit of experience of what was taught in art and craft in that school before the introduction of the art and craft curriculum as I had previously followed my daughters’
progress in all the subjects she did including art and craft. Like the school in the South Central Region, one of the three schools in the Central North Region which is in the big village was selected among others suggested by the EO for that area because of the ease of access to the site. I had been a teacher at one time at the school and as it was the first school I taught immediately after my completion of certificate in the teacher training college, I had just developed love for the school. It was my first time to meet all the current teachers when doing my study. I found it vital to choose the school as I had experience on how art and craft was taught in that school in the 1980s when the primary school had a general syllabus which included a subject called ‘Manual Work’ which included craft work and needlework only. Thus, I could compare teachers’ experiences with my 1980s and 1990s experience and what transpired during lesson observation sessions. Moreover, May to July was the period when Botswana Colleges of Education for primary school education place their second year students in primary schools for internship. Some of the primary schools in South Central and Central North regions were among the ones involved in accommodating student teachers for internship therefore the school directorate in those areas, were in a better place to assist me with schools not involved in the internship at the time of the study.

4.4 Research design

This section gives an overview of the design of this study. Research design sets up the study in a way that it produces specific answers to specific questions so as to make the problem researchable. It should therefore determine who is to be interviewed or observed or documents to be interrogated, questions to be asked and research approaches to be used to generate and collect data. There are varieties of qualitative methods available to researchers depending on the type of issues to be investigated. Kane (1984) relates research techniques to fishing flies as he says when fishing, you choose the right one for the fish you want to catch.
and that no fisherman would use the same kind of fly for twenty varieties of fish, just because it was the first kind they ever tried or even the one they felt comfortable with. Thus, each research domain “represents a fundamentally different approach to inquiry; the choice of which approach to use reflects the researchers determination about the methods needed to appropriately address a particular research question” (Makwinja-Morara, 2007, p. 54). Considering this advice, I am of the view that the qualitative domain is the most suitable technique for this study as an overall methodology.

4.4.1 Qualitative approach

Qualitative approach was chosen because of a number of reasons. It allows the researcher to interact with the subject of the research and therefore enables the researcher to focus on complexities and qualities in educational action and interaction that might be difficult to attain through the use of standardized measures. This methods attempt to capture and understand individual definitions, descriptions and meanings of events while quantitative methods count and measure occurrences. It involves explanation and understanding of events as both the interviewer and the interviewee has opportunities to explain and understand given statements or content. This approach may give deeper insights of the events unlike the quantitative methods, which give objective questions and answers.

As I used the qualitative methods, I was able to gain considerable detailed information about informants’ experiences and perceptions of the implementation of the art and craft curriculum for lower primary and what I learnt came from the participants themselves. They used their own words and voiced their own experiences. This is evidenced by Waddington (1994) and Creswell (2003) who explain that in Participant Observation which is one of the qualitative approaches, the researcher has a first hand experience with participants and has the
opportunity to record information as it is revealed. In addition, the approach also allowed me
to vary the emphasis and tone of the questions with different informants and to modify the
question when I deemed it important as I was not confined by structured interviews thus had
the leeway to ask probing questions when requiring clarification. Furthermore, using
qualitative methods allowed me to interpret respondents’ responses on the basis of the
emerging understanding of the circumstances confronting them. It was not difficult for me to
realise that my informants had different world views and personal experiences from my own
and that their reactions to events in their lives were guided by those views and experiences.
The choice of qualitative methods also enabled me to acknowledge my personal views and
their inevitable influences of my interpretations of respondents’ perceptions and experiences.

In addition, Lofland and Lofland (2001) and Creswell (2003) give their own point of view on
the approach. They note that qualitative research takes place in the natural setting. They
explain that qualitative research employs a naturalistic approach that seeks to understand
phenomena in context. The assumption is that this enables the researcher to develop a level of
detail about the respondent or venue and that the researcher will be more highly involved in
actual experiences of the participants. The other characteristic is that qualitative research is
fundamentally interpretive because the researcher makes an interpretation of the data. “This
includes developing a description of an individual or setting, analysing data for themes or
categories, and finally making an interpretation or drawing conclusions about its meaning
personally and theoretically, stating the lessons learned, and offering further questions to be
asked (Wolcot, 1994 cited in Creswell, 2003 p.182). Thus, personal interpretation is intrinsic
to qualitative data analysis.
Burns (2000) adds by noting that qualitative researchers understand that human-beings are conscious of their own behaviours therefore, the thoughts, feelings and perceptions of their informants are vital. It is important for researchers to understand that social reality is the product of meaningful social interaction as perceived from the perspectives of those involved, and not from the perspectives of the observer. Thus, the central data-gathering techniques of a qualitative approach are participant observation and unstructured interviewing” (Burns, 2000, p.388). On the other hand, Creswell (2003) believes that emerging methods, open-ended questions, interview data, observation data, document data and audio-visual data, text and image analysis are the procedures for qualitative approach. Like Burns and Creswell I view qualitative methods such as unstructured interviews and participant observation to be those which allow access to individual meaning in the context of the ongoing daily life. Qualitative research is concerned with the truths as the participants perceive them and not with objective truth. This is witnessed by Abercrombie (1988) cited in Burns (2000) who argues that social science research can never be objective because of the subjective perceptions of those involved, both participants and researcher. This is because all propositions are limited to their meaning to different language context and particularly social groups.

Qualitative approaches involve different aspects which include ethnography, survey, case study and action research. Creswell (2003) identifies strategies associated with qualitative approach as ethnographies, grounded theory, case studies, phenomenological research and narrative research. All these represent different research strategies and each is a different way of collecting and analysing empirical evidence following its own logic. Each strategy has its own strengths and limitations and to get the most out of using the case study it is necessary to appreciate all these differences. This is supported by Yin (2003) who observes that:
Each strategy has peculiar advantages and disadvantages, depending on three conditions: (a) the type of research questions, (b) the control an investigator has over actual behavioral events, and (c) the focus on contemporary as opposed to historical phenomena. In general, case studies are the most preferred strategy when “how” or “why” questions are being posed, when the investigator has little control over events, and the focus is on a contemporary phenomenon within some real-life context (Yin, 2003, p. 1).

4.4.2 Case study

The case study among the other types of qualitative methods mentioned in the opening section of this chapter, has been chosen because of its strengths and suitability for this study which will be discussed later in this chapter. It has a long history in educational research and can be usefully employed in most areas of education. It is one of the various ways of doing social science research, including experiments, surveys, histories and the analysis of archival information. The case study is the most challenging among all the social science strategies and they are used in many situations to contribute to our knowledge of individual, group, organisational, social, political and related phenomena. The need to use case studies arises out of the desire to understand complex social phenomenon in all of these situations.

It will be appropriate to briefly describe a case study approach before discussing its strengths. A case study involves the observation of an individual unit such as a school, a class, a community, family group or even an entire culture. Stake (1995) cited in Creswell (2003) describes case studies as an approach in which the researcher explores in depth a programme, an activity, a process, or one or more individuals. He further states that, “the case(s) are bounded by time and activity, and researchers collect detailed information using a variety of data collection procedures over a sustained period of time” (p.15). Thus, it is an approach for studying a social phenomenon through a thorough analysis of an individual case whereby the case may be a person, community, episode, process, or any other unit of social life. All data
relevant to the case are gathered and organised in terms of the case. Burns (2000) also mentions the implementation of a particular programme among others as the study suitable for the case study unit. He also advises that even though a case study can be quantitative or qualitative, most case studies lie within the realm of qualitative approach. In agreement with Creswell (2003), Makwinja-Morara (2007) states that a case study method involves an in-depth examination of events and she defines this method as “an intensive study of events taking place at a particular site” (p. 63).

4.4.2.1 Advantages and disadvantages of a case study

A case study like any other approach has its own strengths and weaknesses. It provides an opportunity for the intensive analysis of many specific details often overlooked by other methods. Thus it is used to gain in-depth understanding replete with meaning for the subject, focusing on process rather than outcome and on discovery rather than confirmation. In brief, the case study method allows a researcher to retain the holistic and meaningful characteristics of real life events. Denscombe (1998) concurs with this idea as he emphasises that case studies focus on relationships and processes. He supports himself by contending that:

relationships and processes within social settings tend to be interconnected and interrelated. To understand one thing it is necessary to understand many others and, crucially, how the various parts are linked. The case study approach works well here because it offers more chance than the survey approach of going into sufficient detail to unravel the complexities of a given situation. It can deal with the case as a whole, in its entirety, and thus have some chance of being able to discover how the many parts affect one another. In this respect, case studies tend to be ‘holistic’ rather than deal with isolated factors. It follows from this that within case studies there is a tendency to emphasise the detailed workings of the relationships and processes, rather than to restrict attention to the outcomes from these (p. 31).
This description covers the nature of qualitative method which I have chosen to use and matches the qualities of my subject specialisation which is art and craft education. Art and craft educationists value both the process and the product but believe that the development of process and thought requires more attention than the end-product alone as it involves a lot of thinking and research. However, the case study researcher may be interested with end-products, outcomes and results but if attention was not given to the process which led to those outcomes then the value of the case study would be severely limited. The main value of a case study is that it offers opportunity to explain why certain outcomes might happen more than just finding out what the outcomes are. Gray (2004) views the case study method as ideal when a ‘how’ or ‘why’ question is being asked about a contemporary set of events over which the researcher has no control. The decision to use a case study approach is a strategic decision that relates to the scale and scope of an investigation, and does not dictate which method or methods to be used. It allows for the use of a variety of methods depending on the circumstances and the specific needs of the situation. The other strength for case study is that, unlike the survey approach which tends to go for large numbers, the case study tends to prefer small numbers which are investigated in depth.

Despite all these strengths, the case study method, is criticised for the amount of time they take and the volume of documentation they generate. According to Yin (2003) this complaint may be appropriate if we look at the way case studies were conducted in the past. He claims that things have changed and that there is no need to write lengthy narrative case studies which take a long time. However, Yin concedes with only one argument that conducting case studies successfully is an uncommon skill. He supports his argument by saying that:

perhaps the greatest concern has been over the lack of rigor of case study research. Too many times, the case study investigator has been sloppy, has not
followed systematic procedures, or has allowed equivocal evidence or biased views to influence the direction of the findings and conclusions. Such lack of rigor is less likely to be present when using the other strategies possibly because of the existence of the numerous methodological texts providing investigators with specific procedures to be followed. In contrast, few if any texts (beside the present one) cover the case study method in similar fashion. The possibility also exists that people have confused case study teaching with case study research (p. 10).

On the other hand, Kumar (1999) argues that “a case study approach rests on the assumption that the case being studied is typical of cases of a certain type so that, through intensive analysis, generalisations may be made that will be applicable to other cases of the same type” (p. 99). He concurs with Yin (2003) who points out that a common concern about case studies is that they provide little basis for scientific generalisation and that they give generalisation to a single case. Nevertheless, Yin defends case studies by arguing that case studies just like experiments are generalisable to theoretical propositions and not to population or universes. This therefore, means that the case study like the experiment does not represent a sample and you conduct a case study with a goal to expand and generalise theories that is, analytic generalisation and not to enumerate frequencies which is statistical generalisation.

Yin (2003) believes that, somehow, the skills for doing good case studies have not yet been defined and as a result, most people feel that they can do a case study, nearly everyone believes they can understand one. Since no view is well founded, the case study therefore receives a good deal of approbation it does not deserve. This is surprising because even researchers from a different field such as the five prominent statisticians Hoaglin, Light, McPeek, Mosteller and Stoto cited in Yin (2003) recognise the challenge of doing good case studies and they believe that people who view a case study as inappropriate approach for research are the ones who lack skills of using that approach.
To cover the research questions set in chapter 2, I have used more than one method within the context of a case study. According to Kane and O’Reilly-De Brun (2001):

\[\text{no one technique duplicates exactly the function of the rest. Each technique yields information that only it can obtain, but it also reinforces the other techniques and verifies the research findings. Using as many techniques as possible is part of an approach known as ‘triangulation’ which means examining the same data through different strategies, in order to verify and strengthen the validity of the research design (p.51).}\]

However, they further explain that, methodological triangulation refers not only to using different research techniques, but also to using different forms of the same technique, such as, applying two or more different questionnaires to the same data. This technique was adopted in my study as I have interviewed two different groups (teachers and administrators) for the same data. The case study method helped me understand the conditions that existed and the practice that prevailed in Botswana primary schools in three contexts including some emerging trends. Gray (2004) also believes that the case study approach requires multiple sources of data collection. However, he advises the researchers not to be overwhelmed but to be focused in some way. Taking the advice into consideration, the qualitative methods used in the study are outlined and critically discussed. Combination of observation (participant, face to face), interview (unstructured, semi-structured), technological recording (videotape) and documentary analysis were used and the advantages and procedures of each method are discussed in sections 4.4.2 and 4.4.3.

**4.4.3 Observation method**

Observation is the most appropriate method of collecting primary data. According to Kumar (1999) “observation is a purposeful, systematic and selective way of watching and listening to an interaction or phenomenon as it takes place” (p. 105). It is the most appropriate method
in many situations such as when one wants to learn about the groups’ interaction or study the behaviour traits of an individual. Observation methods can be classified as participant and non-participant. Kumar (1999) defines participant observation as the one whereby a researcher participates in the activities of the group being observed in the same manner as its members with, or without their knowledge that they are being observed while a non-participant observation is viewed as the one when the researcher does not get involved in the activities of the group but remains a passive observer, watching to its activities and drawing conclusions from this.

Participant-observation is one of the methods of qualitative data collection therefore in the context of this study; it was one of the adopted techniques to collect data from the four primary schools within the chosen areas of Botswana. The method was chosen because it allows observers to embark on interactive processes of observations characterised by note taking. The idea was to experience and simultaneously acquire data on how teachers teach and how children learn art and craft. This was enhanced by individual in-depth interviews with observed class-teachers, standard one and three teachers and school administrators. Art and craft resources such as equipment, tools and materials which include textbooks used in art and craft teaching were also examined as they contribute to the planning and teaching of the subject and without them might hinder the effective instruction. Participant observation is claimed by most researchers to be the most appropriate for research projects emphasising “the importance of human-beings, interpretations and interactions, where the phenomenon under investigation is … little understood and … an insider’ perspective would enhance … existing knowledge.” (Waddington, 1994, p. 108 cited in Mannathoko, 2000). Creswell (2003) seem to concur with Waddington that, in participant observation, the researcher has a
first hand experience with participants and has the opportunity to record information as it is revealed.

The other strength is that rather than working from rigid predetermined data categories, these categories emerge from the data including the linkages between the issues. Thus, observation offers flexibility of insights into new realities from analysing data that can be viewed in a new light. Furthermore, Yin (2003) observes that participant observation like direct observation covers events in real time and context of events. That is, it covers reality and contextual aspects. He adds that the method is insightful into interpersonal behaviour and motives. In addition, observation as in the context of the researcher's multiple methods research design, offers the combined methods rigour culminating in triangulation, further enhancing reliability and validity of the observation findings.

Despite all these strengths, Kumar (1999) warns that the use of observation as a data collection method may suffer from a number of problems. Nevertheless, he does not suggest that all or any of these problems necessarily prevails in every situation. The first problem is that when participants become aware that they are being observed with or without the use of video tape, they may change their behaviour. This change could be positive or negative depending on the situation. It may occur for a number of reasons and could increase or decrease their productivity. The use of observation approach in such a situation is distorted because what is observed does not represent people's normal behaviour. This was experienced during classroom observation sessions as some of the pupils posed for the video camera and it could be that they thought that they will see themselves appearing on Botswana television but I told them the purpose of the video camera. However, as only few did that for
a short time, it did not disrupt the teachers’ presentation of the lesson who were the focus of the study.

The second problem with the observation method is that there is a possibility of bias from the observer. The observer can easily introduce bias and there is no easy way to verify the observations and the inferences drawn from them. The third disadvantage is that the interpretations drawn from observations may vary from observer to observer and lastly, the observation and / or recording may be incomplete. Kumar, (1999, p. 107) says that, “an observer may watch keenly but at the expense of detailed recording. The opposite problem may occur when the observer takes detailed notes but in doing so, misses some of the interaction.” Nevertheless, in my study, the use of a video-camera helped capture the whole classroom scene. Yin (2003) also identified some of the weaknesses of participant-observation. He says like direct observation, participant observation is time consuming and costly considering hours needed by observers. Yin is also concerned that the method may be biased due to investigator’s manipulation of events. The adopted model of ‘illuminative evaluation’ helped alleviate the problem of bias in data because open-ended questions were used without fixed standards to test situations. The instruments were designed to cater for all contexts without comparisons and judgements. The video camera and chronological presentation of classroom data also helped present data as revealed by participants.

Technology recording is one of the approaches which were used in this study as one of the observation techniques as it is recommended by most qualitative researchers to be most appropriate for research triangulation. Technological systems of recording comprise still photographs, video-recorder and audio-recorder and among others digital video-recorder, audio-recorder and digital photo camera were used to supplement eye capturing observational
These systems were used as additional tools to help in gathering, organizing and presenting research materials. Recording on video just like other methods has its own advantages. ‘Although some choices must clearly be made concerning the events which are actually filmed, the video does offer a relatively ‘unfiltered’ record of all behaviours and transactions which occur in front of the camera and a permanent, detailed record is provided.’ (Simpson and Tuson, 1995, p.52). Thus, a situation that would otherwise take pages to describe can be recorded in a single picture. That is interviews and observations can be taken ‘live’ without the interference, possible inaccuracy or incompleteness of written notes and sequences of ongoing action can be caught as they happen. Moreover, “in terms of presentation, verbatim aura or visual materials can both illustrate a piece of research, giving it immediacy and authenticity, or in itself provide a documentary text to be accompanied, where required, by a verbal commentary” (Kane, 1984, p.136 – 137).

The other strength in video recordings is that, they may be re-run in order for a detailed systematic record, descriptive record, or narrative record to be made. Simpton and Tuson (1995) comment that alternatively, they could be treated as narrative records and a first level of analysis conducted on what is seen by running over the tape and noting or recording events as they occur. That is they can be used as an aid to analyse in depth of what an interviewee’s perceptions or intentions were in a specific situation. In addition, if used the video tape may increase the reliability and validity of the data. In the case of this study, the video camera was used to capture the natural situation of the classroom setup and lesson presentation focusing on the teacher and this was later used to assist me when analysing observation data. As the video camera records all behaviours and transactions which occur in front of it, it was revisited several times during observation data analysis to help recall all what transpired in the classroom.
Two portable audio-tapes were used during both classroom observation and interview sessions so as to capture all the information in the process. One audio-tape was a back up in case something happened to the other and this gave me chance to concentrate on conversation not writing notes during interview sessions as this could have interfered with the conversation and hence disturbing continuity of the questioning and discussion. It also helped save time which would have been utilised to write notes and hence less duration for the interview sessions. This technology was found to be adequate and more comfortable for use as it is generally more portable and unobtrusive. Considering that some of the areas to research were remote and could not have electricity, spare packs of batteries were taken in case there was no direct current available. This indeed helped as one of the remote schools did not have electricity facilities at the time of study. Places to be interviewed were visited in advance to check the following: power sources, types of plug sockets, and position of respondents so as to bring the appropriate equipment.

A digital photo camera which was recommended by experts to be producing quality images was used to take photos in the observed classroom. Some of the pictures taken were samples of teachers and pupils’ artwork on the observed lesson. These pictures were referred to when analysing data from observation and interview methods on the strategies and activities schools engaged in when teaching and learning art and craft subject in relation to the curriculum’ objectives and attainment targets. The video camera which was used to record the classroom observation was also taken as a backup for the digital camera to supplement data in case the still shots could have presented a problem. A professional assistant in this area was identified to take photos and video footage but only helped in South Central Region and could not make it to the Central North Region. Nevertheless, I got one research assistant in the area who had experience in taking photos and video recordings and this did not affect
my study except that I had to extend the data collection period by a week to give my nephew chance to pilot the equipment. The work produced therefore was of good quality.

4.4.3.1 Observation schedule design and procedures

The observation items were designed to attempt to examine whether the methods, approaches and activities suggested by the teachers address the CAPA attainment targets and the aims and objectives of the art and craft curriculum. Moreover, the schedule was designed to investigate teachers’ ways of presenting their art and craft lessons. It was designed in a way that it helps to investigate the extent at which teachers coped with the curriculum and the extent at which the methods and activities given to pupils develop their knowledge, skills and understanding as required by attainment target 1, 2 and 3 of the CAPA syllabus for lower primary, which include art and craft discipline.

Observation took place in all the four schools chosen for case study. Teachers were asked to volunteer because I believe that participants can enjoy the study when they are willing to participate and hence could be committed and actively involved in the study. This has been thought to be the best method for the research to obtain relevant data as other methods such as random selection could lead to disappointment selecting teachers with busy schedules who are not interested in the study and hence not available.

From one week which was spent in each school, the two days were allocated for class observation and collection of data from documents such as scheme of work, lesson preparation and pupils’ assessment files which were referred to when analysing data. This provided a chance to interview the observed teachers immediately after classroom observation to target those issues identified during lesson observation which might add to the
interview questions. This also allowed time for the collection of data from other documents. An observation criterion was designed and used in the lesson observation (See appendix 1). Teachers did not have access to the observation instrument as I thought it could influence them in the preparation of their lessons following the structure of the instrument. However, this was shared after the lessons for teachers to have access to the type of data collected from them. Flexibility in the developed criteria for observation was considered, depending on the situation or what had arisen during the observation. This is because the observation method offers flexibility of insights into new realities due to emerging issues rather than working from rigid predetermined data categories.

The informants who were standard two and four teachers were seen before the observation to discuss the process of the sessions. As it is procedural, I first met with the administrative staff who later introduced me to the staff to communicate to them about my study. This is explained in detail in section 4.4.4. Teachers were also made aware of the technology equipment which was used in the process of observation sessions such as video camera, audio-tape and digital camera. Notes were also taken during the observation of lessons but more concentration was on observation as the video camera was used to later assist in data analysis. The schedule was then drawn as per agreed dates with the participants and their administrators and distributed to the concerned teachers, through their supervisors and school heads, well in time a week before the visits so that they are able to include it in their class teaching timetable.

Where pupils were given activities to work on during the observation, I moved around in each class to observe them but making sure I did not obstruct the classroom session. Opportunities were taken to talk to three pupils in each observed class about their work where
possible when they work on their activities. For example, discussing the materials, processes for creating that particular art and craft work and the strengths and weaknesses of the product the child has created which were identified by the child who was the creator. Their responses were recorded under the observation guide comments column where data about pupils’ contribution to the lesson is sought. This was to discover the knowledge and understanding and skills the child had gained in that particular topic as identified and developed by Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) attainment target 1, 2 and 3. I had conversation with pupils because Participation Observation method allows researchers to embark on interactive processes of observations. Thus, this was done to experience and simultaneously acquire data on how pupils learn art and craft at lower primary.

Although I had hoped teachers to have some influence on the selection of pupils, I discovered that they had limited knowledge on the basis of stages of art development aspect which I wanted them to use to select pupils for my study. I therefore decided to request for a class list from the class teachers and numbered it to help select pupil-participants. This list was alphabetically arranged. I then divided the list into three thirds and selected the last child from each third to a total of three in each class. This method is believed to be appropriate as it reduces bias. Among the selected pupils, some were able to respond to my questions on what they had created, whereas some had some difficulties. The interesting thing was that most pupils were free to talk to me about their work including those who had difficulty with questions except few from the remote and village schools who seemed to be shy or not confident enough to talk about their work compared to the ones in a city. I tried to communicate to them in their language but despite all the efforts they were still uncomfortable. I then shifted to different pupils without using any system of sampling as I did not have time, choosing the nearest ones who at least contributed as they were not that
shy. This was in accordance with the qualitative approach which allows flexibility. Creswell (2003) asserts that there is flexibility in every stage of the qualitative study considering the situation one is in at each stage of the study. He says forcing pre-set instruments, techniques or items, could result in invalid data as the situation could be not the one which was thought to be at the time of formulation of instruments.

Teachers were requested to provide the scheme of work and lesson plans which they did without any problem. Permission was sought to photocopy them and take photos of samples of pupils’ products of the observed lesson. Teachers also allowed me to take some of the original pupils’ work for the observed lessons in each observed class. These samples of work included the ones from the pupils interviewed on that same work from the four classes observed in four schools. Pupils’ art and craft work was scanned as some were delicate so could be easily destroyed before use. Some of the pupils’ art and craft work for the observed lessons (but not for interviewed pupils) were taken photos and some of it was used as references during observation data analysis and discussions. Both the data collected through observation of pupils’ activities, interviewing them and samples of their work were used as references when analysing both observation and interview data. That is samples of pupils’ work were matched with the lesson presentation, the Creative and Performing Arts Curriculum attainment targets and the art, and craft objectives for the lesson observed. Schemes of work and lesson plan documents were also used as reference information when analysing data. In this way data for the study was hopefully validated.

4.4.4 Interview method

“An interview is a verbal interchange, often face to face, though the telephone may be used, in which an interviewer tries to elicit information, beliefs or opinions from another person”
(Burns, 2000, p.423). Kumar (1999) defines it as any person-to-person interaction between two or more individuals with a specific purpose in mind. It is one of the most commonly used and effective modes of collecting qualitative and quantitative data. The approach has been adopted to be one of the research methods for this study because it allows for supplement of information obtained from responses with the one gained from observation hence reducing the problems of its limitations. Most qualitative researchers believe that an interview is the most appropriate method for studying complex and sensitive areas because the interviewer has the opportunity to prepare interviewees before asking them sensitive questions. In this way, researchers can simplify, repeat misunderstood and explain complex questions to respondents. The other strength is that it is suitable for any type of population such as, children, the illiterate, the very old or special needs people in contrast with the questionnaire approach. Furthermore, unlike in questionnaires especially posted ones, the interviewer can observe the setting in which the interview is taking place which may have enormous bearing upon the responses. In addition Yin (2003) comments that interviews focus directly on case study. He also states that they provide perceived causal inferences.

However, the interview method is time consuming and expensive when potential participants are scattered over a wide geographical area such as the circumstances of this study. Nevertheless, this was alleviated by interviewing most of the population in one setting, such as pupils and their teachers in a school. The other limitation is that the quality of the data collected in this method is likely to be affected depending on the quality of interaction between an interviewer and respondents. “Also, because the interaction in each interview is unique, the quality of the responses obtained from different interviews may vary significantly” (Kumar, 1999, p. 115). Lack of experience, skills and commitment by the interviewer may also affect the quality of data.
In my case I feel advantaged because of the opportunity to work very close with my supervisors and advisors. I met with my supervisors monthly to give me feedback of progress and discuss problems encountered in the process. There is also a possibility of bias in the framing of questions and the interpretation of responses in this approach. This could be caused by researchers getting tempted to formulate leading questions which give responses they expected to answer their hypotheses and misinterpreting data to come up with responses which agree to their hypotheses. This problem was addressed in this study by sharing the framing of questions with a support team to check their reliability and piloting them with the relevant people in Botswana primary schools and education offices. The use of different instruments to supplement interview such as audio-recorder and video camera was also evidence.

Interviews are categorised according to their degree of flexibility. Kane (1984) concurs with Mckernan (1996) that there are three types of interview in terms of content and organisation and those are: structured, semi-structured and unstructured. He further argues that, the form of interview one selects among these three depends upon one’s research, the subject, the kinds of information needed, the setting of the research and the characteristics of the subjects who are being interviewed. However, one interview may involve various forms which means, one part of the research may require one kind of interview while other parts may require another.

4.4.4.1 Unstructured interview

In unstructured interview category, there is no set order of questions or schedule and the researcher here is not looking for the same information from each person. Mckernan, (1996) emphasises that, in this approach the issues and topics to be discussed are left entirely to the
respondent. Nevertheless, it is advisable for the interviewer to formulate questions spontaneously within this structure during the interview to probe for more information. This type of interview can be done with individuals or with a group of respondents. Mckernan (1996) claims that this stage is preferred during the initial stage of inquiry because it allows participants to raise issues which may not be tapped by other styles of interviewing. Thus one can interview informants informally using this method to check pieces of information, to fill in details or to explore new areas as they arise and to take advantage of unexpected opportunities. The interviewer can only ask an interviewee a question or to explain and expand on his or her answer if he or she has touched upon an issue or topic. This method was used when education offices including the four primary schools studied were visited. The general question was posed on how they perceive the implementation of the art and craft curriculum introduced in 2002. At the time of study the curriculum was in its fifth year of operation. The information gathered influenced me to look attentively to some of the issues raised and I probed for more information during the initial interviews following what different educationists mentioned during the informal conversations as semi-structured interview allow the researcher opportunity to probe more deeply.

Asking the widest, most general questions and allowing the interviewee to develop the subject the way he or she wishes may enable the interviewer to get a sufficient general picture that he or she can then decide which specific topic of study you would like to follow. Thus, the unstructured interview is described as asking the most general and widest questions.

The flexibility allowed to the interviewer in what he or she asks of a respondent is an asset as it can elicit extremely rich information. As it provides in-depth information, many researchers use this technique for constructing a structured research instrument. On the other hand, since an interview guide does not list specific to be asked of respondents, the comparability of
questions asked and responses obtained may become a problem (Kumar, 1999, p. 109).

During the conversation with the respondents, questions may change as the researcher gains experience and hence the type of information obtained would vary from one participant to another. In addition, unstructured or open-ended interviewing is advantageous for obtaining second hand accounts and allows for deep insights of the events hence the term in-depth interviews unlike structured interviews where the researcher has less scope to find out the beliefs, feelings or perceptions of the respondent that do not fit into the pre-ordained response categories hence the name standardized interviews. As a result qualitative researchers prefer to use unstructured or semi-structured interviewing techniques. The problem with this method is that its openness and flexibility can easily accommodate the researcher bias into study. This explains that using unstructured and semi-structured interview guide to collect data requires much more skill than using a structured one.

**4.4.4.2 Semi-structured interviews**

There are variations of semi-structured interviews. Some of these are face-to-face interview and telephone interview. Face to face interview was used whereby the researcher interviewed teachers, art and craft senior teachers and heads of department for lower primary to obtain their views on the teaching and learning of art and craft curriculum at lower primary. This approach is the most suitable for the particular study undertaken as it allows people’s perception of issues in the teaching and learning of art and craft discipline (Drever, 1995). These types of interviews are also known as ‘open-ended method’ because they use open-ended questions. They give the researcher opportunity to probe more deeply using open-ended questions in order to obtain in-depth information. The method is further useful when it is impossible to physical observe participants in action; secondly, the response bias is usually
low as the interviewer has more control of the response situation and can probe for more information where necessary. Rapport also enhances co-operation of the respondents. The third point is that complex questions can be clarified on the spot in face-to-face interviews as it:

... allows the respondent to raise issues and questions as the interview progresses. It is important that these are not tacked on to the end of a pre-set list of questions, but are allowed to occur naturally throughout the course of the interview. In addition to the ‘fixed choice’ type of question, the interviewer may wish to ask ‘open-ended’ questions (Micker, 1996, p. 129).

One other advantage is that respondents are interviewed in the comfort of their familiar school or office environment and they may be able to consult their records. Most importantly, it permits greater flexibility than the close-ended technique and also permits a more valid response from the informants’ perception of reality. Burns (2000) says, “it is the making public of private interpretations of reality” (p.424). This is confirmed by (Drever, 1995) when he says face-to-face approach is a very good technique for gathering information and opinions and exploring people’s thinking and motivations. It also yields rich information and guarantees good coverage. The technique is also sound in the sense that it can be used along with other methods. In this context, it was used as a follow-up of classroom observation which was covered by both eye capturing and video recording so as to capture the natural classroom scene in order to verify the teachers’ responses. Using both the techniques served to increase the validity of the study.

Semi-structured interview in each school was carried out during the initial weeks of research. It was allocated four days of the research week. As the first and third days of the week were for classroom observation sessions, the second day of the week was for standard twos interview, the fourth day for standard fours, the fifth day for standard ones and threes and the
sixth day for the school administrators. The seventh day of the week was to seek and go through relevant documents making notes and photocopying when need be. I had familiarised myself with the schools when meeting interviewees to arrange for visits and during class observation period. Where possible, I tried to have informal conversations with the teachers I met in the schools so as to get an idea on how they viewed art and craft curriculum. However, I could not forget my role as a researcher. I was carefully not to embark on discussions which could lead to teachers having information on the specific questions in my observation and interview instruments as I thought they would discuss with informants and interfere with my research.

As I informally met teachers around school especially during their break time, I posed a question “what are your views about art and craft curriculum for lower primary?” and most of them mentioned its congestion and difficulty without materials. In some instances I attended extra-mural activities such as music and ball practices when invited and used the opportunity to find out how they perceived and approached art and craft curriculum for lower primary. This resulted in administrators and their subordinates having trust in me because sometimes just being a lecturer at the University could make some of the teachers uncomfortable and not trust that one will secure their information as confidentially as they promise.

The other type of semi-structured interviews, communicating by telephone, is also vital because the participants can use the mode to provide information. A telephone mode was used where there was missing information in the data collected especially where there was no access to emails as it was difficult for me to go back considering distance and transport expenses. As I reviewed my data, I observed that I had some gaps and called the informants to collect more information through the phone.
4.4.3 Interview schedule design and procedures

Unstructured and semi-structured interviews were designed and carried out in the four primary schools in Botswana where the class observations were taking place. The interview instrument was used to generate views about art and craft curriculum in lower primary (standard one to four) from all the interviewees depending on the role of each informant in the school system. Permission was sought to use audio-recorder during the initial interviews to avoid note taking so as to capture everything said by the respondents and not take much of the teachers’ time writing notes. As these were semi-structured instruments many probes were involved on both class-teachers and school administrators depending on their responses and their school portfolios. Similar data was sought from the school administrators as they had the same role of assessing teachers and assisting them to develop in their instruction. (See appendix 4). Thus, their interview dealt with their findings of the assessment of teachers and their input to help teachers in their teaching.

An unstructured interview was conducted at those schools when making arrangements for research visits through informal discussions and notes were taken. This mutually acquainted me and the prospective interview respondents. As already noted, a general question on the teachers’ perception of the introduced art and craft lower primary curriculum was posed when introducing the research theme to familiarise myself with the informants and the school heads in order to prepare for the initial research. Responses from informants gave me an idea on how teachers general feel about the art and craft curriculum and equipped me with ideas on what to probe when using a semi-structured instrument as they evoked new ideas relative to the study.
When I mentioned the area of my study most of the teachers were not happy saying they would prefer to be observed and interviewed on subjects such as English, mathematics or Setswana not art and craft as they had a difficulty with the subject. However, after explaining the purpose and the procedures of the study some were free to volunteer to be included in the study. I also met with one of the Education Officers in the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit when asking for documents related to my study in their office who shared her experience on the CAPA programme with me (see chapter 7).

This Education Officer was concerned that most teachers were not knowledgeable in art and craft. She explained that although teachers lacked skills in CAPA subjects, the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department had to respond to the 1994 RNPE. She added that they thought of implementing the curriculum so as to push other departments such as the TT&D to training teachers. “The 1994 Revised National Policy on Education requirement was long overdue therefore could not wait any longer, we had to play our role of implementation.” She emphasised. The education officer further noted that the workshops they held to launch the syllabuses were usually attended by the senior teachers and they were usually not specialists in art and craft or any other practical subject therefore failed to carry out in-service with the other staff when they reached their schools. This information influenced me to also look closely to the extent at which teachers mastered art and craft content during observation of lessons to be able to match what they said about their knowledge of the subject. As Kumar (1999) advises that the interviewer should develop a framework or interview guide within which to conduct the interview, a framework was developed (See appendix 2). Interviewing teachers enabled me to examine the match between teacher response and lesson monitoring.
As the teachers’ interview included questions on pupils’ art and craft assessment, they were requested to provide records of pupils’ profile to help evaluate teachers’ interview comments regarding the records and the curriculum requirements. Unfortunately, not even a single teacher provided the profiles some claiming that they did not have materials and that they only recorded marks without comments at the back of their scheme books or exercise-books unless when they wrote terms like good, better, beside the mark in the exercise-book or hardcover. When requesting to see those records from the ones who claimed to have them in their scheme books some told me they had not yet assessed the subject. Among all the four observed teachers, only two showed me marks recorded at the back of their scheme books as pupils’ progress report but no comments were attached to those figures. In addition, three samples were requested from each observed class. This came to the total of twelve samples for the four schools. Pupils’ profiles were expected to supplement class-teachers’ interview responses on pupils’ art and craft assessment including criteria for assessment and involvement of pupils in assessment of their art and craft progress. All these terms are discussed in chapter 3 of this study. This was seen to be the right time of collecting such data as the study was done during the second term of the year when standard four pupils were approaching the period of writing their attainment tests in the third term which is the last one for their lower primary.

School administrators were also hoped to provide important information for the study through their considered deliberations of teacher accomplishment of the art and craft curriculum. They gave their views about the changes and challenges made by the art and craft primary curriculum to primary school teachers, primary school administrators and pupils. School administrators’ records of their findings when assessing lower primary class-teachers in art and craft subject were requested but I could not get any as over ninety percent of the
administrators said they had never assessed the subject and those who claimed to have assessed it could not produce any record. I also attempted requesting for any record of art and craft workshops held in the four schools, to see what it covered to prepare teachers for the new curriculum but could not get any even from those who said they once had workshops. The assessment record was hoped to supplement the information which was given by the administrators when interviewed on what they assess in art and craft subject in lower primary and their findings in the assessment.

The contents and procedures for the semi-structured interviews were organised in advance and given to supervisors for review. The main advantage of semi-structured interview is that although it provides a frame of reference for responses, the interview does not greatly restrict the contents or manner of respondents’ answers hence providing valuable information that might not be obtained from questionnaires and other written materials. Most of the interview questions for both class-teachers and administrators were designed to be open-ended so as to allow me some degree of freedom to probe deeper, depending on circumstances as regard to rapport, cooperation and level of knowledge of respondents. Each class-teacher was interviewed immediately after classroom observation before visiting the next class concentrating on those issues which might have arisen during the observation session. The findings for each individual respondent were treated as individual perceptions of the curriculum as they were no fixed standard for the study and hence ‘illuminative evaluation’.

4.4.5 Illuminative evaluation

The observation and interview strategies followed were adopted and adapted where necessary from Parlett and Hamilton’s 1972 model of ‘illuminative evaluation’ which takes account of the wider contexts in which educational programmes function. According to the ‘Evaluation
Wiki Website’ last modified January 2008, this approach is still in use. The technique is used by various researchers from different areas of specialisation. For example, recent studies taken by:

- Sloan and Watson in 2001 titled: Illuminative Evaluation: Evaluating Clinical supervision on its performance rather than the applause;
- Macfarlane, Greenhalgh, Schofield and Desombre in 2003 titled: RCGP Quality Team Development Programme: an illuminative evaluation;
- Russell Greenhalgh, Boynton and Rigby in 2004 titled: Soft networks for bridging the gap between research and practice: illuminative evaluation and

According to Draper (1999) the illuminative evaluation approach aims to uncover the important factors latent in a particular situation in use. It “seeks to examine and explore the process of educational intervention. The techniques, as such are therefore more qualitative, some might say, more subjective in nature as they call on judgements.” (Crompton, 1999, p. 2). It would therefore have been naive to ignore the fact that an instructional system when adopted undergoes modifications that are highly significant when evaluating the teachers’ lesson presentations. The instructional techniques teachers displayed during classroom observation were seen as shared ideas, methods and approaches held by individual institutions and class teachers. I recognised the fact that teachers had different characteristics which included different styles of teaching, experience, personal or private goals and professional orientation. Pupils’ individual perspectives and preoccupations in art and craft lessons were keenly recognised. Thus, acknowledging the diversity and complexity of teaching and the learning context was seen as an essential pre-requisite for a serious study of
the art and craft curriculum under the CAPA programme. Innovatory curricula cannot be sensibly separated from the learning setting or milieux of which they become part. I was very careful when analysing and discussing the classroom observation data to recognise each teacher as an individual in a different specific environment and with unique individual needs and interests to other interested parties. Judgement could not be made as to comparative teaching performance according to a set standard.

Each learning community or classroom has its own dynamic, and teachers need to select practices that they believe are most beneficial for each group of students (Richards, Felts and Abghari, 2004, p. 24).

As illuminative evaluation is characterised by ‘open learning’, I expected participating teachers to teach different content, use different teaching and learning styles and aids depending on the school environment the school was in; and to display different approaches, methods and techniques of teaching to address the required Attainment Targets, aims and objectives of the CAPA syllabus and hence achieving specific objectives stipulated under art and craft curriculum for lower primary.

The guideline was designed to help collect relevant data emerging from the research questions and hence sharpen the focus of what could be usefully observed and questioned within the time-scale of the research programme. Although the study adopted an illuminative evaluation approach, I could not ignore what led to the study and concentrate only on what teachers could manage, ignoring other aspects which art and craft educationists could question or challenge, such as the relevancy of art and craft concepts to the topic taught to pupils as those are facts and foundation of the subject. For example, the art elements and principles of design which art educationists term ‘the language of art and design’ were important to evaluate. Thus, individual independent case studies were attempted to provide an
accurate account of what transpired in each class. A general view of the teachers’ interpretation of the art and craft curriculum at lower primary in Loso, Selepe, Budzi and Xai primary schools will be presented by discussing the findings from all the classroom observations in relation to the interview responses and the CAPA Curriculum requirements from Botswana. For example, the CAPA curriculum has stipulated the aims, objectives and skills pupils are to acquire at all the levels of art and craft learning in lower primary which are discussed in chapter 3 such as: knowledge and understanding of art and craft media; knowledge and understanding of basic principles and concepts applied in all the CAPA subjects, skills in a range of practical processes to produce useful products, creativity, problem solving and self-reliant spirit.

The themes under interview instruments were designed to cater for the teachers’ capabilities in teaching and managing or administering art and craft education and factors that teachers could identify as contributing to some of the problems in the teaching of the art and craft discipline in their schools. The reason to include this component was to minimise assumptions and bias that might lead to professional criticism during the discussion of both the observation and interview findings. This recognises Parlett and Hamilton’s (1972) identification of a key problem in most traditional methods of evaluating a programme or curriculum. They argue that a traditional more conventional form of evaluation might build a study around a set of elements arranged in a new curriculum by examining “the blueprint, or formalized plan and extracts the programmes’ goals, objectives, or designed outcomes. From these, in turn, … derives the tests and attitude inventories” (p. 10) the researcher will administer.
The preferred approach adopted here is to look at how the curriculum operates; how it is influenced by various school situations in which it is applied; what those directly concerned regard as its advantages and disadvantages and how pupils’ intellectual tasks and academic experiences are most affected. Thus, this study aims to discover the teachers’ experiences, beliefs and practices and in the process discern and discuss the curriculum’s most significant features considering the participants’ past and present experience in art and craft education. Education documents such as the Education Policy, the Primary School National Curriculum, Botswana National Principles and Vision 2016 were considered in the discussion, as it is procedural for all the departments in the country to adhere to the government policies when developing an operation document within its system.

4.4.6 Documents, archival records and physical artefacts

Yin (2003) suggests the following sources of data collection as the most important and commonly used in case studies in addition to interviews and observation methods. There are: documentation, archival records and physical artefacts. He identifies documentary information which includes letters, memorandum, agendas, announcements and minutes of meetings and other written reports of events to be relevant to all study topics. All these sources were seen to be appropriate to this study therefore, were adopted but not as the main data rather to refer to them where necessary when analysing data. The document which was used as the main source was the lower primary Creative and Performing Arts programme which included the art and craft curriculum. Access to documents such as the minutes of the meetings which might be addressing the new CAPA curriculum, administrative documents such as assessment reports on the teaching of the art and craft, scheme of work, lesson plans, pupils’ assessment records or profiles, samples of tests and exam papers and criteria for
artwork assessment documents were thought to be of the importance to this type of study as references during data analysis.

I could not get access to some of them for example, the schools’ minutes of the meetings which might be addressing the new CAPA curriculum, administrative documents such as assessment reports on the teaching of the art and craft, pupils’ assessment records or profiles, samples of tests and exam papers and criteria for artwork assessment documents. I also visited the office in-charge of evaluation of programmes at the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit to investigate and ask for reports on the evaluation of CAPA syllabus. I had access to the 2004/2005 formative evaluation reports for standard 3 to 4 levels which are discussed in chapter 3 and in the introductory section of this chapter. The purpose of the evaluation was to obtain feedback on the implementation of standard 3 to 5 primary school syllabus by assessing the availability of syllabuses at upper primary, determining the availability, access and usefulness of the standard 4 and 5 instructional and support materials, identifying the major constraints in the implementation of the standard 4 and 5 programmes and to provide feedback to inform the standard six implementation programme (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Report, 2005). The intentions of the department’s evaluation were of good use to the development of these new programmes. CAPA programme which includes art and craft was among the programmes already evaluated and the findings had played a significant role to my study with background information about the whole CAPA programme although not specifically addressing art and craft curriculum. With the permission of the panel members, I also managed to get minutes from the art, craft and design panel meeting whose agenda included the CAPA programme issues which art and craft was part of. This meeting was in May 2007.
The panel included primary school representatives, primary and secondary colleges of education art, craft and design trainers, University of Botswana primary teacher trainers, the Curriculum Development and Evaluation art, craft and design education officers, and the Teacher Training Department practical subjects education officers. I was able to have informal conversations with nine members which was more than half of the members of the art, craft and design panel. All the members met were concerned that the curriculum was implemented when all the stakeholders were not ready especially teacher trainers, field education officers and primary school teachers as they were not informed nor involved in the process. When I checked the CAPA programme under acknowledgement section, I discovered that indeed one of the members of the University of Botswana art, craft and design lecturer was among the acknowledged people to have contributed in the development of the art and craft curriculum but none from the primary colleges of education art, craft and design discipline. The acknowledgement was further extended to the primary school teachers for the feedback on the curriculum which the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department said they gave at the Regional Consultation workshops held in all the regions between April and May 2001 (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). All the primary school teachers I met including those who were not part of the study but just had informal conversation with, said they were not consulted or involved in the process of the development of the art and craft curriculum and now they are having difficulties with the document. This information was taken into consideration when having interviews with participants.

The study also led me to an inspection of the archival records to check on the old Botswana National Curriculum which is the pre 1993 one because the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, primary schools and educational offices did not have any copy. The
information from this document was to be used in the background and in the data analysis to discuss information from the interview item which requested teachers and their administrators to state the changes brought by the new art and craft curriculum.

Yin (2003) highlights the strengths and shortcomings of Documentation, Archival Records and Physical Artefacts. He notes that documentation like archival records is stable and therefore, can be viewed repeatedly. It is also unobtrusive because it is not created as a result of the case study. It contains exact names, references and details of events and broad coverage of events as it includes long span of time, many events and many settings. Its disadvantages according to Yin (2003) are that like archival records, documents may have biased selectivity if collection is incomplete and also biased reporting as it will reflect unknown authors. Moreover, access to the documents may be deliberately blocked. Apart from the strengths of the archival records already mentioned when discussing documentation, they are also precise and quantitative. But there might be a problem with accessibility due to privacy reasons. Physical Artefacts allow insights into cultural features and into technical operations according to Yin (2003). However, he is concerned about the problem raised by selectivity and availability. Taking into account the disadvantages of various methods, problems may be encountered in some of them. Nevertheless, using more than one method was hoped to reduce disadvantages because different methods supplemented each other. This is stressed by many research scholars and they advise that we should consider all sources’ strengths and limitations and that, investigators should note that no single source has a complete advantage over others. In addition, various sources are highly complementary, and a good case study will therefore incorporate an appropriate range of sources.
As with interviews, access to Botswana archives to search for old education documents which are no longer in circulation in education departments was secured at an early stage. It was communicated with the relevant people in that department about the archival files I intend to use and dates for the visits arranged in May 2007. Grix (2004) advises that researchers intending to use the archives unit need to make an exploratory visit or make “a thorough reading of the archive’s website, checking the content of the archive (scouring the indexes of files) narrowing down and selecting the material you wish to order” (p. 132). As per my appointment, I visited the Botswana archives several times to look for the art and craft curriculum which came before the introduction of the 1992 one to get information for the background of my study but could not find it. I also visited the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department library to search for the document but once again it was not possible to find it.

4.4.7 Validity and reliability

Spector (1981) emphasises that “validity and reliability go hand in hand and are two crucial properties of instruments” (p.15). He explains the principles of the two aspects that an instrument can be reliable but not valid and that to be valid an instrument must be reliable. Thus, the level of reliability sets a limit to how valid an instrument can be. According to Burns (2000) reliability is concerned with giving the same result consistently under the same conditions while validity is concerned with an assessment or judgement measuring what it is supposed to measure. “When we are dealing with human beings, rather than inanimate scientific material, it is easy to realize that while we can measure something reliably, it may not be valid” (Burns, 2000, p.390). To clarify his argument, Burns gave an example of a questionnaire given to students attempting to find out why they absent themselves from school, that it may produce consistent or reliable results all claiming that they were ill. He
said if you bring in some in-depth unstructured interviewing, you would discover that many of these illness responses were not true therefore invalid. The question now is: ‘How do we know what is reliable and valid in qualitative research or any other research?’ The best way is triangulation as we can argue that if different methods of investigation produce the same results, then the data are likely to be valid. Thus, reliability and validity both need to be established if an interview schedule is to be considered a valid research instrument.

The interview questions and observation strategy were given to supervisors to assess their reliability. Furthermore, when formulating all the items in both instruments (interview and observation), several meetings with supervisors were carried out discussing the focus and relevance of items to the research question and themes discussed under section 4.4 (Research Design). Peers were also involved in the process. The multiple methods using the mentioned research instruments were used to assess validity and reliability, for example, semi-structured questions which were used in an interview, observation parameters, video-recorder, and audio-recorder. In addition, documentary and pupils’ work references justified the validity of this research as the teacher’s lesson plan, what is taught and said by the teacher was matched with the pupil’s art and craft products created during the lesson observation and all these activities related to the art and craft for lower primary requirements during data analysis. The instruments were then piloted in two primary schools in Botswana, one from urban and the other from rural areas. Four education officers were also given interview instruments to comment to check their reliability. The procedure and results yielded are discussed in the next section (Pilot Studies). After receiving feedback from the respondents and several consultations with supervisors, improved interview and observation schedules were designed.
4.4.7.1 Pilot studies

Piloting refers to the “… process whereby you try out the research techniques and methods which you have in mind, see how well they work in practice and, modify your plans accordingly” (Blaxter, Hughes and Tight, 2001, p. 135). Therefore, before the study takes place, the instruments to be used should be pre-tested on a small number of people to check their reliability. Two multicultural primary schools in the South Central region, one in the city and the other from one of its outskirts were chosen for ease of communication, transport and accommodation as they were nearer to my residence. As one school was from a city and one from a village, they covered different geographical contexts and this was the interest of my study. These schools also had children from different ethnic groups and cultures because many people from different parts of the country who work in the capital city of Botswana rent houses in that village to avoid higher rentals in the city. This therefore, convinces that the pilot schools were relative to the four schools of the study.

Two classes, one standard two and one standard four were observed in one of the primary schools in the South Central region in the outskirts of the capital city of Botswana. This was to get data from one infant and one middle class as they are the two categories of the lower primary in Botswana and these gave good assessment results of instruments as both levels of lower primary were represented. Observation of lessons could not be done in one of the schools in the capital city of Botswana as intended because it was not available for study at that time. However, this did not have any effect on my piloting as the school was included in piloting of interviews.
During observation, five pupils were selected from each of the two observed classes to be asked questions about their art/craft work. These pupils were randomly selected without any formal format followed. The guide used seemed to have covered most if not all of the important elements suggested by the Creative and Performing Arts programme for lower primary such as, knowledge, understanding and skills pupils are to acquire through art and craft lessons at lower primary. The guide was designed in a way that it investigates whether pupils display knowledge and understanding of their activities and hence evidence to address Attainment Targets stipulated in the CAPA syllabus for lower primary. For example, pupils were required to describe activities, materials/tools and processes of the work at hand. It also required pupils to evaluate their work identifying the strengths and weaknesses and come up with suggestions on how they would improve if given chance to work on them again.

The pupils’ responses showed that none of the ten pupils understood why they used certain materials or tools and applied certain processes. Instead they referred me to their teachers saying, “The teacher told me to do it like this” and hence no evidence was produced of their direct involvement in the process of achieving attainment target one which seeks them to display knowledge and understanding of what they learn. However, it was interesting to hear them using art and craft concepts taught in that lesson when responding to the questions. As the items in the conversation guide served their purpose by helping me probe pupils to talk about their art and craft work, they were incorporated in the observation schedule to avoid too many guidelines as the information was used to complement the teachers’ lesson presentation (See section D of the observation schedule). Observed teachers and four Education Officers in the South Central were given the guide to comment and suggest changes but they felt that it covered everything they could think of.
A video camera and audio-recorder were used to visually document the results in support of the observation. Photos of products children created during the observation were taken in each observed class for reference during data analysis exploration. The piloting was helpful here as few amendments were made on the observation schedule to simplify the schedule after revisiting it with the supervisors. The interview was piloted in the same schools but this time it included the school administrators (head of department-lower/middle classes and the senior teacher-Practical Subjects). After formulating the interview schedules, they were piloted in order to verify their reliability and validity for their intended purposes. Teachers were asked to respond to the questions asked and allowed to have an input in the design of the questions. Suggestions made by interviewees were taken seriously and changes were made where necessary. For example, some questions were seen to be difficult and had been simplified. Some were seen to be too demanding and had been rectified to suit the teachers’ level. The teachers’ and administrators’ schedule was seen to be too long by the informants as I also experienced that during the interview. They have therefore been reduced so as not to take more of the participants’ time because it could have led them to lose interest or patience and hence not giving all the information needed. The first edition of the interview instrument required administrators to describe the attainments targets stipulated in the CAPA programme for lower primary and the question was very difficult for them then it was changed to now find out whether teachers’ instruction addressed the attainment targets according to the administrators’ observation. However, the quality and intention of the schedule was not compromised.

Like the observation guide, the piloting of the interview instruments also included four Education Officers, two field ones and two Principal Education Officers in the Teacher Training Department one for in-service training and the other for programme delivery. The
Education Officers in the Teacher Training Department were chosen because their role included in-servicing teachers both primary and secondary. Like teachers, they found the instruments for the teachers and senior staff to be too long and some of the questions difficult to attempt. This was taken into consideration when reworking on the two instruments. It was hoped that the school administrators would help with the choice of teachers as they were able to identify teachers who were most likely to show an interest in this type of study but fortunately, as afore mentioned they volunteered to take part and these reduced the possibility of biasness in selection of participants.

The instruments were pre-tested on the country (Botswana) of study and on subjects of a similar type to be studied as suggested by Walliman (2001) who comments that “it is best to test it on people of a type similar to that of the intended sample, so as to anticipate any problems of comprehension or other sources of confusion” (p. 238). An audio-recorder was used in the interview session with the approval of teachers and their senior staff so as to capture the whole conversation as writing everything said could take more time and hence disturb the informants’ day activities. It could also distract the conversation as they will be a time when conversation will break while concentrating on note taking. Some of the important information could also be missed during note taking and hence wrong interpretation given to the study. Research instruments were edited and new versions were created and the second pilot was done in the schools and education offices previously piloted in May 2007. Amendments were made where necessary before, the initial collection of data beginning of June, 2007. This was hoped to increase the reliability of the instruments.

Consultation with the supervisors before and during the second pilot was done. Although, the second pilot was in the schools previously piloted it excluding the teachers who were
involved in the first pilot because they could recall what they mentioned before and give similar responses. Then the piloting is hoped to have served its purpose. The second piloted interview instruments proved to be easy for teachers to understand as they did not have any difficulty in attempting any question and took less time than the first one. The observation instrument was also easy to use as before and collected the intended information with the support of the technology equipment therefore no amendments were made to the instrument. The equipment (digital and video cameras) were also perfect because they were operated by the trained personnel from the University of Botswana therefore no edit was made. The supervisors and the advisor for this study were involved in the whole process of pilot procedures.

4.4.8 The Process

This section looks at the overall process of the study and the specifics are discussed under each specific method of the study under sub-sections 4.4.3.1 and 4.4.4.3 to give a clear picture of the study’s procedure and protocol. The study took place during the second term of the school calendar. The second school term for primary schools in Botswana was seen to be the best time of my research considering the research question because teachers were expected to have spent at least a term with their pupils therefore, could give more detailed up to date information on their teaching, their pupils’ learning and their assessment. The first and third term of a Botswana primary school calendar were full of activities such as final teaching practice by colleges of education, final examination for primary school leavers and other classes, sports and music competitions and could lead to schools preferring not to cooperate. The appointments for all the preliminary meetings with participants and art and craft centres were made during the third and fourth week of April 2007. This was followed by meetings with participants and other stake holders such as Education Officers and internal school
administrators for the schools of study beginning May 2007 up to the 25th of the same month.
Although permission was granted by the permanent secretary for the Botswana Ministry of Education, I requested the education officers to write letters to schools to officially inform them about my visit as I found it necessary to do so despite the permission letter from the MoE in which I also submitted the copy to both EOs and the concerned schools.

Participants were also given consent forms and sufficient time to read and understand them and explanation made where necessary and they completed and signed the forms without any problem. The school heads signed as witnesses for the teachers. Parents were not made to sign consent forms for their pupils as the pupils were not key participants but participated indirectly as they were recipients of what was taught by the teacher who was observed as a key informant. The pupils' art and craft work and any other information collected from them was used as an example of the outcome from the lesson observed and what the teacher said about the curriculum and not as the main data as my interest was to investigate how teachers coped with the curriculum through class observation and interview therefore I hope this was covered by the permission from the Ministry of Education.

The informants were met before the observation of lessons and interviews, to make appointment for the visits, explain the purpose of the visit and the rationale to art and craft educators, consumers in this case pupils and stake holders such as the Curriculum development and Evaluation Department and Teacher Training Department. The participants were informed about the reason to have chosen the population, methods of collecting data and sampling procedures for this study. And lastly, they were told what to expect from the visit. This was done to convince them to participate in the study as not understanding the
purpose might lead to the targeted population not being interested and hence this might affect the validity of the data.

They were also asked to make any comment concerning the study and most of them said they appreciated my research as they had many problems with the subject. The opportunity was used to visit classes to be observed prior to the initial data collection so as to familiarise myself with pupils before the observation sessions and hence make them comfortable to talk to me about their art and craft work rather than seeing me for the first time when I needed data from them. I had time to talk to them about what they were working on although no art and craft was taught that time but different subjects. This helped me because the time I visited the classes for the initial classroom observation sessions, pupils could remember me and were so welcoming. Moreover, because of the transparency of my intentions, I got a very positive feedback from both teachers and administrators and did not have any problems of choosing participants as they volunteered. This could have been because they had clearly got the purpose and rationale of the study.

I also followed the protocol that is required by the government of Botswana before anyone could embark on any research in the country. I completed forms provided by the research section in the Ministry of education as per Botswana government policy and attached letters seeking permission and explaining the purpose of the study in specific schools and other Education Departments one from me and the other from my university (University of Wales Institute Cardiff). These letters were submitted to the Ministry of Education (MoE) early October 2006 to allow time for response so that piloting can start beginning November 2006 for at least one and a half months and this was successful. I was required to submit the approved proposal from my University and my Curriculum Vitae which I did. I was granted
permission within a period of a week to continue with my study. (See Appendix 6, Permission letter from the MoE, Botswana). When I paid pre-visits to schools I had already been granted permission to conduct research and to meet the Education Officers.

The education officers and the school heads were very receptive and accommodating. The school heads for all the schools for my research introduced me to the three administrators (senior teachers - practical subjects, heads of department lower and middle) who were responsible for the lower primary in their schools. Those were the ones who introduced me to the staff teaching the lower primary classes whereby I was given chance to address them on my intentions and most of them were very much interested in the study after understanding the purpose and procedures of the study and volunteered to participate. In that meeting, I could sense that most of the teachers wanted to share something in art and craft with me as when I was addressing them some kept on saying, “hey, art and craft ke mathata” in setswana language meaning that “art and craft is a problem”. Some even asked if they could be assessed in English or mathematics but after explaining the purpose of the study they now relaxed and were ready for the study.

In May I visited additionally art and craft centres such as the museums and art and craft studios. The May activities included the second piloting of the equipment and instruments. I then started collecting data both observation and interview in the South Central primary schools on the 28th of May to the 6th of June 2007 and everything went well as planned. Teachers had tight schedules as they were preparing for the “Teachers’ Day” activities, music and sports competitions but they compromised and found time for me. Some allowed me to interview them during their break time and some lunch hour. They asked their colleagues to serve meals for their pupils as primary school pupils have meals offered by the Botswana
government at break times and this was served and supervised by class-teachers. I then spent the 7th to the 8th of June preparing for Central North Region. I left for the Central North Region in the remote area on the 10th of June 2007 to collect data from the two selected schools. The research in remote area was from the 11th of June to the 3rd of July 2007. The technological equipment were piloted with the second video camera operator in the Central North Region to check his competency. The research in the Central North Region like in the South Central Region went well. Similarly, the teachers were very busy with music and sports competitions but they devoted their break and lunch time to my study. Although some of the days were disturbed by the holidays and other school activities including extra-mural and meetings, I was able to reschedule the time and managed to collect all the data I wanted with the support of the teachers who cooperated a lot.

I left to Xai school still in the Central North Region which was the third and last school on the 4th of July to collect data from the 5th to the 13th of July 2007. I then left to the South Central Region on the 15th of July 2007 and I had few days to make a follow-up of the documents I needed from the education offices such as Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit before coming back to the Britain. I left Botswana for the United Kingdom on the 26th of July 2007 and believe I had collected almost all the data I intended to collect. I then transcribed, organised, presented, analysed and discussed the data.

4.4.9 Data analysis procedure

Data analysis involves the process of making sense of the data gathered in a research study. According to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2002), “data analysis involves organizing, accounting for and explaining the data; in short, making sense of the data in terms of participant’s definitions of the situation, noting patterns, themes, categories and
regularities” (p.147). However, Makwinja-Morara (2007) emphasises that “if the researcher fails to analyse data in a way that produces meaningful findings, the study becomes less valid that it might otherwise have been” (p. 73). Thus to increase the likelihood that data analysis will yield meaningful findings, researchers make use of thorough and systematic procedures. Adopting this description, data collected was analysed using mainly the qualitative research method. It was discussed in a descriptive form including references to direct quotations from the interview statements in appendix 5 in some instances and expressions shown by informants as they respond to questions. As the data was descriptive, it was hoped to provide future researchers with a sense of reality, as it is describing exactly what the informant felt, perceived, and how they behaved. Information collected through audio-recorder and video-recorder was transcribed. I listened to the audio-recorder with my research assistant to transcribe data identifying the emotions of the respondents, their voice pitches, when they stressed or emphasised the points to assist in the analysis and some of the emphasis were written as direct quotations to give the readers the real feeling of the respondent at the time of the conversation during the interview session. As few statements from interviews were in Setswana, I translated them to English as my research was to be in English and I did that with my research assistant and verified with some colleagues in the department of languages in the University of Botswana but not disclosing the names of my participants or delimitation of my study. I just showed them the statements to confirm whether they were correctly translated from Setswana to the English language. I also viewed the video cassettes several times during classroom observation data presentation and analysis so as to record everything that was believed to be relevant and important to the study so as not to miss any important information. This helped when presenting the classroom observation data chronologically as the video-recorder captured every situation which was in front of the camera during the data
collection. The video-cassettes also enabled me to design the classroom organisation sketches for each class observed as it was during the observation.

The information I gained from the various sources, in particular the standard one and three teachers and school administrators helped me to verify the information I heard from the standard two and four class-teachers. Thus, the use of multiple sources of data enabled me to be more certain about the findings that I derived through the process of data analysis. Moreover, throughout my field work, I continually reviewed the data from observation and interview sessions, the accumulating collection of documents and field notes, as advised by Goetz and LeCompte (1984) cited in Makwinja-Morara (2007). This approach provided me with an impressionistic feel for the data and when seeing consistent themes emerging from this informal analysis of my data transcripts, I reviewed the education documents and probed for more information from teachers through informal conversations when still in their site to explore more insights about the participants.

All the data collected were then organised, classified and categorised according to the themes in the research instruments which include personal details, teachers’ views on art and craft in general, teachers’ views on the implementation of the art and craft curriculum for lower primary, teachers’ preparedness to teach art and craft and general comments on the implementation of the art and craft curriculum. These themes were formulated with the guidance of the research questions of the study and responses were discussed in relation to the Creative and Performing Arts attainment targets, aims and objectives of art and craft curriculum for lower primary syllabus requirements and relevant literature because the study mainly seek to investigate how the first art and craft curriculum for lower primary in Botswana is translated into practice. The adopted method of analysing data is supported by
Kane (1984) and Yin (2003) who contend that in analysing your information, whether on your own, or if appropriate, with the help of a computer, you will be probably categorising information, examining to try to see patterns and relationships, tabulating, or recombining the evidence to address the initial propositions of a study, discarding the irrelevant, summarising and drawing conclusions. Categorising or coding and sorting visual images according to Creswell (2003) is a vital approach to reduce data because he believes that not all information is used in qualitative study and that some may be discarded. Simple tables which are recommended by Greenfield (2002) to be the best and simple for the readers were used in some instances, for example, when recording Section A, for both the instruments used in the study which requires the informants’ personal information. The results were then interpreted and implications drawn from the results in relation to the hypotheses drawn and research questions of the study. For clarity, interviews were analysed question by question and general implications drawn in relation to the formulated themes. The same process was followed in classroom observation findings as items in the observation guide were categorised according to thematic sections discussed under data collection section (4.4.3.1).

To avoid confusion, each region was given an identity number and records coded to indicate position of the participants because the interview for school administrators is the same and hence they hold different positions. The school in South Central Region was coded Loso, and the Central North, as it had three schools, the school in the village was coded Xai while the two from the remote areas were coded Budzi and Selepe respectively. The coding was further expanded to observation and interviews sessions of different participants. Loso classroom observations were coded as L2 for standard two class and L4 for standard four. The interviews in the same region were coded as L1 for standard one teacher, L2 for standard two teacher, L3 for standard three teacher, L4 for standard four teacher, LS for Senior
Teacher and LH for Head of Head of Department. Xai classroom observations were coded as X2 for standard two class and X4 for standard four. The interviews in the same region were coded as X1 for standard one teacher, X2 for standard two teacher, X3 for standard three teacher, X4 for standard four teacher, XS for Senior teacher and XH for Head of Department.

Selepe classroom observations were coded as S2 for a standard two class and S4 for standard four. The interviews in the same region were coded as S1 for standard one teacher, S2 for standard two teacher, S3 for standard three teacher, S4 for standard four teacher, SS for Senior teacher and SH for Head of Department. Budzi classroom observations were coded as B2 for standard two class and B4 for standard four. The interviews in the same region were coded as B1 for standard one teacher, B2 for standard two teacher, B3 for standard three teacher, B4 for standard four teacher, BS for senior teacher and BH for Head of Department.

This allowed comparison to be made between the teachers, senior teachers and the heads of department when appropriate. The data collection procedure which was adopted allowed each of these categories of response to be recorded uniquely for future evaluation. However, Yin (2003) is concerned that analysing case study evidence is the most difficult aspect of case study because the strategies and techniques have not been well defined in the past.

Nevertheless, this has been alleviated by developing analysis approaches as part of the case study protocol, as Yin highlights that most case study investigators depend on their own style of rigorous thinking, along with the sufficient presentation of evidence and careful consideration of alternative interpretations. “No formula exists for such a transformation” (Makwinja-Morara, 2007, p. 72). Marshall and Rossman (1999) supports that the proposal should present initial strategies for analysis as they emphasise that “the proposal section on research design should include plans for recording data in a systematic manner that is
appropriate for the setting, participants, or both … (p. 148). By so doing, analysis will be facilitated. When data collection was completed in a pilot study, I attempted analysing the material I have collected as researchers like Blaxter, Hughes, and Tight (2001) advice, so as to see how long the process will take and this helped me see whether I will have enough time to collect and analyse all the data I have envisaged. I discovered that teachers’ and school administrators’ interview instrument were too long and too demanding and reduced the scope of what was planned as already mentioned under the pilot study section. All the processes involved in this study considered the research ethics which follows in the next section.

4.5 Ethical considerations

“The ethics of research concern the appropriateness of the researcher’s behaviour, in relation to the subjects of the research or those who are affected by it” (Gray, 2004, p. 58). Thus, since, research in the real world deals with people and objects that affect them, ethical issues should be considered as they can arise at the planning, implementation and reporting stages of research. Burns (2000) concurs with this idea as he notes that “ethical problems can relate to both the subject matter of the research as well as to its methods and procedures, and can go well beyond courtesy or etiquette regarding appropriate treatment of persons in a free society” (p. 17). Therefore, as this study involved human participants, ethical considerations are of paramount importance. British Educational Research Association’s (BERA) ethical guidelines were consulted and incorporated into the planning of the research design. The association considers that all educational research should be conducted within an ethic of respect for the person, knowledge, democratic values, the quality of educational research and academic freedom (Furlong, 2004). The committee dealing with research ethical issues in my university (UWIC) approved my research proposal after assessing the ethical consideration of my study as per the university policy. After UWIC’s approval of my
research proposal, I sent the approved proposal which included all the methodological
instruments and procedures of the study, education documents and policies to the Ministry of
Education and a letter from my University to confirm their approval for my study in
Botswana primary schools. These documents were submitted to the personnel responsible for
research within the ministry who requested me to also complete the form they use to assess
whether I meet the country’s requirement. Permission to record observations and interviews
using audio tape and the use of video camera during classroom observation was also sort
from the Botswana Ministry of Education, school heads and participants themselves. This
research process was followed primarily to avoid accusations of conducting an unethical
study.

As I was also concerned about the informants’ confidentiality, I made sure I obtained
consent from the participants. Letters were written to the concerned informing them about the purpose
of this study, its rationale the population to be involved, the kind of information being sought,
that data will be protected and that anonymity of respondents will be protected. Furthermore,
letters of consent granting permission to carry out the study in their places using the
aforementioned technology systems was sought from all authorising personnel or their
representatives after consulting them verbal and through writing. The participants were
assured of strict confidentiality and anonymity and that materials from their classroom
observations and interviews would not be used in any way that would compromise their
privacy and dignity. They were assured of the use of pseudonyms for their school names and
individual teachers. Documented materials were obtained from government institutions and
schools with the permission of the government of Botswana and the concerned institution
personnel. During the preparatory stage or the study in May, I also appointed and visited the
Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department and two of the four primary colleges of
Botswana and other art and craft centres such as the museum and studios to have informally conversation with officers and collect documentary information on issues relating to my study. Still in May I visited the Colleges of Education libraries to seek information relating to my topic. Codes and pseudonyms were used to protect the identities of my respondents and did not share the information I gathered with anyone. My video camera and photo assistants signed confidentiality papers to ensure they would not divulge the information from my participants with anyone. The notes, tapes and video cassettes were secured in a lockable place. Names and faces from pupils’ images were removed so as not to be identified. There were limitations to the study which were reduced by various means which will be described in the following section.

4.6 Limitation of the study

There are a number of factors which affected the study. As some of the areas data was collected from were extremely rural or remote, it was particularly difficult to access them because of transportation difficulties. Communication was a very big problem in two remote areas as they had no phone networks. One could not make phone calls to confirm or postpone the appointments with the informants. This is one of the concerns raised by our third president Festus Mogae. He was responding to questions on Botswana’s HIV/AIDS pandemic on BBC World television, BBC World service on radio and BBC news on line on the internet through talking point (phoning) programme broadcasted by Roger Hearing and he was concerned that the communication on the pandemic might not be as effective in remote areas as around cities and towns. He highlighted that “… in a developing country about the size of Kenya and a population of 1.7 million people there are a lot of remote areas where some of the things that are happening in the bigger settlements will probably not be reaching these communities as well as they should” (bbc.co.uk updated 29 November, 2003).
Instruments used also had their own limitations. As with all visits from external agencies, the teaching could have been atypical adjusted during the observation of lessons, therefore not necessarily presenting a true picture of the normal type of instruction. Some of the participants in some instances seemed to have been responding less freely to some of the interview questions until assured of the confidentiality of their responses. However, this effect was not taken into account in the sense that there was a triangulation of classroom observation and interviews for lower primary class-teachers who were observed teaching and those who were not observed. All levels of learning in lower primary were represented. To strengthen the validity and reliability of the data, two administrators for lower primary in each school were included in the interview participation.

The lack of a previous centrally designed and controlled curriculum in art and craft had limited discussion with teachers and administrators in comparing the old and new ways of approaching the subject. I searched for any evidence of a primary school curriculum from Botswana archives to find out what they say about the arts. During my primary school study up to early 1970s and teaching in early 1980s there was a subject called ‘manual work’ whereby girls were taught textiles, especially knitting and sewing, while boys were taught wood carving. Limited art and craft documentation in Botswana such as books and research studies also resulted in restricted information about the subject. The study relied mostly on available Western literature. There was little prior documentation available about the CAPA programme especially art and craft as a discipline because this is the first study in Botswana to evaluate the art and craft curriculum. What was available was work from those authors including myself who have attempted writing textbooks for primary schools addressing the newly introduced CAPA programme from 2001 when the curriculum was still a draft.
Finally, and most importantly, the limited knowledge of art and craft education by some of the participants might have hindered them from responding fully to some of the questions as anticipated. Nevertheless, the semi-structured interview method was designed to alleviate this problem as it gives the interviewer appropriate access to the interviewee to clarify any difficult or misinterpreted concepts. In cases where some participants were either absent or busy on the agreed date for the interviews, sessions were re-scheduled for alternative meetings. Such problems restricted intentions to re-visit some of the participants in order to have informal discussions on general issues which had arisen from the interview data which was checked every evening after the sessions. However, the opportunity was taken to make second visits to have additional informal discussions on those issues with the school heads. Those issues that may have provided problems for the study during the field-work were catered for by a successful triangulation of instruments.

4.7 Summary

- The main sections discussed in this chapter includes the target population who are standard one to four teachers, standard two and four pupils who were sampled from four primary schools in Botswana and internal school administrators, research design and research procedures.

- A case study method was adopted within the qualitative approach considering its suitability to the nature of the study because it seeks for informants’ perception of the art and craft teaching and learning and hence in-depth insights.

- Parlett and Hamilton's (1972) model of illuminative evaluation was adopted and adapted where necessary as it allows flexibility and hence ‘open learning’ considering the contexts of the study.
Two types of interview, unstructured and semi-structured, observation method, technological systems, documents, archival records and physical artefacts were discussed and opted for in this study to supplement each other because of their limitations which could threat the reliability and validity of the study.

Finally, the process of data collection and data collection analysis were also addressed.

The classroom observation data for each case study class was presented chronologically and analysed separately.

Brief comments which included all the four case study classes were made in relation to the teachers’ preparatory notes and the art and craft curriculum requirements for the topics presented.

Interview data was analysed under each theme, each response specifically described below its item/question and brief comments combining all the responses were made in relation to the themes stipulated in the interview schedule.

This strategy was followed to avoid repetition of data from different respondents.

Both the classroom observation and the interview data were later discussed in relation to the research questions.

What follows is the first chapter (classroom observation) of the data presentation and analysis. The chapter begins by introducing both the two chapters of data presentation and analysis.
5.1 Introduction

Data for this study will be presented and analysed in two separate chapters. Chapter 5 presents classroom observation data whereas, chapter 6 involves interview data. Both the two chapters present collected and interpreted data on Botswana primary school teachers’ practice and opinions regarding the implementation of a national art and craft curriculum at lower primary. A brief description and analysis of the case study schools according to the government documentation, staff and the school prospectus has been discussed in Chapter 2 and 4 prior to the presentation of data, to provide an understanding of the environment investigated. This was an adoption of Parlett and Hamilton’s (1972) model of ‘illuminative evaluation’ who argue that the curriculum evaluation or innovation can not be examined in isolation, but in the school context or learning milieu. Data from each chapter is presented and analysed. A full discussion for both chapter 5 and 6 guided by the research questions outlined in chapter 2 will follow in chapter 7.

I felt it was vital to contextualise the discussion of the research questions, in order to attempt to provide a basis of validity and reliability for the data presented through a process of elaborated description (Luria, 1976, cited in Wright, 2006). This therefore has prompted me to first present a picture of the schools as drawn from documentation and from both formal and informal discussions with teachers involved in the case studies. I will present and analyse my lesson observations initial data, subsequently discussing them with reference to the research questions, drawing upon excerpts from interviews and documentation evidence, which includes the Botswana national syllabus and art and craft curriculum for primary
schools. This is designed to triangulate the findings of the case studies. Like Wright (2006), I am of the view that presenting the initial data before discussion will make it possible for the readers of this thesis to form their own opinions more easily for interpretations placed upon issues and to judge the validity of my claims.

The qualitative data presented was generated from first hand observation of lessons in four lower primary classes from Loso, Selepe, Budzi and Xai primary schools. Four teachers, two from standard two classes and two from standard four were observed teaching the subject of art and craft from the Creative and Performing Arts programme in these schools. The reasons for selecting these classes are stipulated in chapter 4. The observation method which is interpreted by most of the researchers who have used an illuminative evaluation strategy to be a most effective mode of collecting data because of its identification and delivery of first hand information was reinforced by video-film documentation. Data from each class is presented and analysed separately as two standard two teachers taught different topics and used different approaches. The two standard four teachers who taught the same topic also approached their lessons differently according to their professional training and interests.

Although it is impossible to depict everything happening in the classroom, I attempted to identify most of the key activities the teachers and pupils were engaging in within the one hour lesson but with most of the focus on the teacher, considering the research question. This was to ensure that all the activities involved in the observation sessions were included in the presentation such as, the processes each teacher followed which includes: (i) the approaches and methods used (ii) pupils' activities (iii) materials and teaching aids and (iv) evaluation of the lesson. These four elements provide as comprehensive picture as possible of what transpired in each class. All the components focused on were drawn from the observation
schedule. As mentioned in chapter 4, some examples of pupils’ art and craft work as outcomes of the activities in the observed lessons have been included in the presentation of data to complement the classroom observation information. I also observed how pupils evaluated their art and craft class work. Their evaluation would be likely to display their knowledge and understanding of the concepts and content they learnt during the lesson through describing, analysing and interpreting their art and craft class work. This might show how they develop skills of appreciating both their work and that of others as advocated by the Attainment Targets 1 and 2 of the 2002 Creative and Performing Arts programme for lower primary.

The parts of this section include the following:

i) the organisation of the study schools;

ii) a description of the respondents in some instances using tables and descriptions;

iii) chronological teaching strategies with reference to the six areas used in the observation schedule (appendix 1): teaching approaches and methods, appropriateness of subject matter, pupils’ involvement in the lesson, evaluation of pupils’ work and the time factor;

iv) analysis of the findings;

v) comments on the key issues of the lessons presented;

vi) summary.

5.2 The organisation of the study schools.

There was a master timetable in the school head’s office available for teachers in all the four case studies showing allocation of time to all the subjects for all the levels in school. Information for standard one to four levels was gathered as shown in the tables below:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Loso</th>
<th>Selepe</th>
<th>Buzi</th>
<th>Xai</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Streams and teachers level 1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams and teachers level 2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams and teachers level 3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams and teachers level 4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Maths level 1 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.5 | 4.0 |
| Maths level 2 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.5 | 4.0 |
| Maths level 3 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 |
| Maths level 4 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 |

| English level 1 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 4.0 |
| English level 2 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 4.0 |
| English level 3 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 5.0 |
| English level 4 | duration (hours per week) | 5.0 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 5.0 |

<p>| CAPA level 1 | duration (hours per week) | 3.0 | 2.0 | 2.5 | 2.5 |
| CAPA level 2 | duration (hours per week) | 3.0 | 2.0 | 2.5 | 2.5 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Duration (hours per week)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPA level 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.0 3.0 3.5 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPA level 4</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.0 3.0 3.5 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Science level 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0 1.0 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Science level 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0 1.0 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Science level 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0 1.5 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Science level 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0 1.5 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setswana level 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.0 4.0 5.0 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setswana level 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.0 4.0 5.0 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setswana level 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.0 4.0 4.0 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setswana level 4</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.0 4.0 4.0 4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural Studies level 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.5 1.5 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural Studies level 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.5 1.5 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural Studies level 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.5 2.0 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Duration (hours per week)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural Studies</strong></td>
<td>level 4</td>
<td>2.5 2.0 2.5 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guidance counselling</strong></td>
<td>level 1</td>
<td>n/a 0.5 0.5 0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>level 2</td>
<td>n/a 0.5 0.5 0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>level 3</td>
<td>n/a 0.5 0.5 0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>level 4</td>
<td>1.0 0.5 0.5 0.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above tables show each school allocated varying duration to the seven subjects in the national lower primary syllabus. Initially, each subject was allocated one period of 30 minutes but some were doubled which made them 1 hour per day. Standards one to three classes in Loso primary school were allocated the equal duration for each subject per week. The same system was followed in the other three schools but standards one and two had equal duration for all the subjects while standards three and four were also allocated the same time. However, in some instances one similar subject was allocated the same duration for all the levels of learning across the lower primary classes (standard 1 to 2). These were mathematics, environmental science, cultural studies, Setswana and English in Loso primary school; mathematics, Setswana English and Guidance and Counselling in Selepe; English, Cultural Studies, Guidance and Counseling and Environmental Science in Budzi and Mathematics, Environmental Science, Cultural Studies, Guidance and Counseling and Setswana in Xai primary school respectively. On the other hand, different levels/classes were allocated varying duration in some of the subjects such as in Loso primary school where standard fours
were allocated more hours in CAPA, Selepe where standards one and two were allocated more time in mathematics and standard four more time in CAPA and environmental science, Budzi standards one and two more time in mathematics and Setswana and standards three and four CAPA and lastly, Xai’s standard two and four CAPA and English.

A further observation was that Loso primary school did not offer Guidance and Counseling subject for the first three levels of lower primary but started at standard four classes as shown in the table. This was confirmed by the school head. This subject was allocated the least duration (30 minutes per week) among others by all four case study schools, in contrast with English, maths and Setswana which were allocated the highest duration ranging from 4 to 5 hours per a week followed by CAPA with the minimum of 2 hours and maximum of 4. Cultural studies ranges from 1.5 hours to 2.5 hours coming after CAPA while Environmental science is the second from the least (Guidance and Counseling) ranging from 1 to 2.5 hours per a week. The table also shows that there were four streams (classes) for standard one to three level with four teachers for each stream in Loso primary school for example; standard 1 category was divided into four classes each allocated a teacher coming up to four teachers in all. This was the same for standard two and three classes. In the last level, standard four, there were five streams and five classes in that school. Selepe had four streams and four class-teachers for standard one, three and four and 3 streams with three teachers for standard two; Budzi four streams, four teachers for standard one, two streams, two teachers for standard two; three streams, three teachers for standard threes and fours. Xai had three streams, three teachers for level one three and four and two streams, two teachers for standard two.

There was a chart mounted on the wall in the school head’s office in each case study school identifying the names of teachers, their teaching experience and highest qualifications. The
total number of teachers’ qualifications under different categories of education in each case study school was recorded as shown below. The education background for the participants has been recorded in section 5.3.

Table 3: Teachers’ Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Masters in Education</th>
<th>Bachelor of Education</th>
<th>Diploma in Education</th>
<th>Certificate in Education</th>
<th>Untrained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loso</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selepe</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budzi</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xai</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results revealed that out of 95 teachers in four case study schools, 99% of the teachers had gone through the primary teacher training courses. The latest record on education statistics showed that in government primary schools, 97% were trained to teach in primary schools, 2% trained to teach in secondary school and 1% not trained to teach. Most (47%) of the participants were Diploma holders, followed by certificate holders which was 41%, Bachelor of Education 11% and 1% untrained. The highest level of education was Bachelor of Education. The untrained teacher in Loso primary school was covering for a maternity absence which means the school was initially 100% equipped with trained teachers from certificate to first degree level. This was also the case in the other 3 schools. Three of the school heads were among the Bachelor of Education holders, while one held a Diploma. Most teachers in Loso and Xai primary schools were Certificate holders whilst Selepe and Budzi had more Diploma holders than any other qualification.
5.3 Description of respondents

This section sets out to describe those class-teachers who participated in the classroom observation sessions in standard two and four classes in the case study classes in South Central and Central North Regions. Four out of twenty-six teachers from these two levels were involved in the study. The standard two level had a total of eleven classes for all the four case study schools and was staffed with eleven teachers while standard four was staffed with 15 teachers for 15 classes as shown in table 2. However, only two teachers from each level were observed to make a total of four observations in lower primary from all the four case study schools. The respondents were both male and female and ranging from 27 to 38 years of age respectively. These will be referred to as Mr Datha, Ms Nkwita, Ms Mokwalo and Mr Karee for the purpose of this study. More information about these participants is shown in the table below:

Table 4: Respondents’ Academic and Professional Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Academic</th>
<th>Year of completion</th>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Year of completion</th>
<th>Years of teaching experience</th>
<th>Training in art and craft</th>
<th>Post of responsibility</th>
<th>Class taught</th>
<th>Number of pupils in class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr Datha</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>NK</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Senior teacher (ii)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Nkwita</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>DPE (Gen)</td>
<td>Class teacher</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Mokwalo</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>HOD</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Karee</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>DPE (Gen)</td>
<td>Class teacher</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to table 4, two of the respondents held a Primary Teacher’s Certificate (PTC) while the other two, Ms Nkwita and Mr Karee held a Diploma in Primary Education (DPE) in which they completed between 1990 and 2005 respectively. Mr Datha and Ms Mokwalo were pursuing further education. Mr Datha was a pursuing Diploma in Primary Education (DPE) through a Distance learning mode organised and sponsored by the Ministry of Education. He mentioned that he was specialising in physical education during the interview. Ms Mokwalo was pursuing a first degree in Primary Education through her own initiatives, including tuition payments. The respondents’ years of teaching experience ranged from 1 to 22. Mr Datha had 16 years of experience in teaching, Ms Nkwita 3, Ms Mokwalo 22 while it was Mr Karee’s first year. This means that Ms Mokwalo was the most experienced teacher among others. Three respondents completed their General Certificate in Secondary Education (GCSE) in the late 1990s while the other studied for a Junior Certificate (JC). Ms Mokwalo was the Head of Department for Middle classes (standard 3 and 4), Ms Nkwita and Mr Karee class-teachers with no post of responsibility except teaching, while Mr Datha held a position
of Senior Teacher which according to one of the administrators, was a post of responsibility not as a member of the administrative staff, but treated like any other class teachers apart from the difference of the salary scales.

There was little difference in the teacher pupil-ratio as Mr Datha had 34 pupils, Ms Nkwita 30, Ms Mokwalo 33 and Mr Karee 27. Two teachers with DPE had done art and craft as generalists in their training while PTC holders mentioned that they did not have any art and craft experience and that they had never studied art and craft in either their primary and secondary schooling or teacher training colleges. Information about the teachers’ personal details, qualifications and their responsibilities was seen to be vital to this study, as elements such as teaching qualification, teaching and subject experience and teacher-pupil ratio may affect the teaching and learning process either positively or negatively. For example, teachers who trained in Botswana Primary Colleges of Education in the past fifteen years could have studied only a little art and craft or not done it at all, depending on whether it was offered during certificate training. Specialisation of the subject started when Diploma courses were first introduced in primary school colleges in the late 1990s.

5.4 Classroom observation findings

Initials have been created for the teachers’ names used in this report to simplify reporting findings more especially when using tables. The initials were the first letters of their names. The word pupil(s) was also shortened to ‘PP’. Simple Codes were also used for each case study class as seen in the key words box below to ease classroom identity.
Table 6: Teachers’ names, initials and classroom codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher’s name</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Classroom code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ms Nkwita</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Mokwalo</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>B2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Datha</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>L4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Karee</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>X4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The numbers ‘2’ and ‘4’ on the codes represented the level of the classes. ‘2’ represented standard two classes while ‘4’ was for standard fours. The word ‘pupils’ has also been abbreviated as PP when presenting classroom observation data. All the pupils in the case study classes except Mr Datha’s class (L4) were seated in groups of 5 to 8 with chairs around their tables as shown in the sketches below: Mr Datha’s pupils were seated in rows.

Figure 3: L4 Pupils in rows
Figure 4: S2 Pupils in groups at tables

Figure 5: B2 Pupils in groups at tables
Three of these classes had their pupils seated in mixed ability groups while in L4 class they were seated in rows comprising of mixed ability and social groups facing the board without any grouping or special sitting arrangement. However, when they were working on their drawing activity, some grouped to share coloured pencils. Some teaching aids for different subjects, including art and craft, were displayed on the classroom walls in all the case study classrooms except S2, as the teacher mentioned that she did not have any adhesive to mount her teaching aids, so she kept them in the boxes in the classroom storeroom. The teaching aids for the three classes on the wall were indicated by the names of the subjects.

Prior to presenting findings on lesson observation sessions, I have presented the extracts from the art and craft curriculum on the topics taught. Furthermore, the schemes of work and lesson plan notes were gathered and noted exactly as they appeared in the teachers’ preparation/plan books for all the classes. Reference will be made to them when analysing and discussing the findings and relating to the teachers’ instructions in conjunction with the
A review of the teachers’ prepared goals, both general and specific objectives, content, teachers’ and pupils’ activities shown in their schemes of work and lesson plans is provided in relation to those stipulated in the art and craft curriculum. I consulted the scheme of work and the lesson notes for the lesson to be taught 10 to 15 minutes prior to each lesson observation. Teachers had made a scheme of work for the whole term and prepared lessons for a week. The information about the lesson to be observed has been extracted from this information to refer to during the lesson presentation sessions. I assumed they would have significant influence on the teachers’ instruction, since they were prepared to guide them during their lesson presentations. Although teachers had indicated their objectives in both their scheme of work and lesson plans, they were additionally approached prior to their lesson presentations to introduce and share their objectives for the day to confirm those appearing in their written lesson plans. In addition, the number of pupils in each class was recorded during the observation sessions to facilitate analysis and discussion of data in relation to teacher–pupil ratio and classroom organisation. Each observed lesson was allocated 60 minutes as a double period. All the teachers observed used both English and Setswana language in their instruction in accordance with the Ministry of Education policy. They led their instruction in English and only spoke in Setswana when pupils had difficulties in understanding the content in English.

5.4.1 Teachers’ preparation notes

According to the teachers in the case studies, the format they followed in preparing their schemes of work and lesson plans was designed by the Ministry of Education. They were supplied with scheme books with the designed format and they were requested to complete the required information under each sub-heading as shown in tables 8 and 9. Teachers were required to complete additional information about the modules they were to teach, such as the
date for the last day of the week they were teaching the topic, the subject, topic, time the lesson will take, the subject period per week, reference materials to use when teaching the topic and the objectives. Teachers extracted their schemes of work information from the master timetables displayed in their school heads’ offices and the CAPA curriculum for lower primary except the weekending which was determined by the teachers’ suggested duration the topic could take and the references they were to use.

All the four teachers wrote objectives in their lesson plans as they appeared in both the art and craft lower primary curriculum and their schemes of work. Mr Datha indicated in his lesson plan that Creative and Performing Arts subjects which comprised of art and craft, music, design and technology and physical education disciplines were allocated five periods per a week which means that the four subjects shared those five periods of thirty minutes each period totalling two and a half hours per a week. The other three teachers did not indicate the number of periods in their planning. I observed a double period in each class which was allocated one hour respectively. Information of the extracts from the lower primary art and craft curriculum and the teachers’ plans are recorded in the three tables below:

Table 7: Art and Craft extracts from the 2002 lower primary national curriculum pg. 11, 12, 23.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>General Objectives</th>
<th>Specific Objectives</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Students should be able to:</td>
<td>Students should be able to:</td>
<td>Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3.1 Gain experience in working with different materials in collage</td>
<td>2.3.1.1 Use natural materials to create a collage. 2.3.1.2 use waste materials to</td>
<td>P. 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>General/Specific Objectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S 2</td>
<td>Collage</td>
<td>2.3.1 Gain experience in working with different materials in collage making.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.1.1 Use natural materials to create a collage.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3.1.2 Use waste materials to create a collage.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>Pattern Making</td>
<td>2.7.1 Explore and discover patterns.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.7.1.1 Identify and differentiate man-made and natural patterns.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.7.1.2 Use repeated lines to create patterns.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>2.1.1.1 Draw the structure and composition of natural and man-made objects.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X4</td>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>2.1.1 Develop awareness of the complexity, beauty of nature and man-made environment.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.1.1.1 Draw the structure and composition of natural and man-made objects.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 9: Teachers’ Lesson Plans

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Teaching/ Learning Aids</th>
<th>Lesson Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>Draw the structure and composition of natural and man-made objects</td>
<td>- Pupils will draw structures and composition of natural and man-made objects.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>Natural materials soil leaves seeds grass Waste materials egg shells papers saw-dust</td>
<td>- Singing a song ‘We are building up the temple’. - Questions from the song. - Listing natural materials and stating how they can be used. - Naming waste materials and where they could be found. - Defining natural and waste materials and identifying them. - Explaining a collage. - Class discussion on collage. - Showing pupils a collage item. - Demonstrating how a collage is made. - Going outside the classroom to collect materials for a college. - Individual work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X4</td>
<td>Create natural and man-made drawing.</td>
<td>Pupils will create natural ad man-made drawing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4.2 Schemes of work and lesson plans data analysis

Having read and discussed the scheme of work with the four class teachers, I discovered that there were no columns to note content to be taught, lesson activities and teaching aids in the
ready-made scheme of work format. Teachers copied the topic and objectives from the art and craft curriculum as they were into their scheme books as shown in table 7 and 8. Although the four case study class-teachers told me that they were supposed to record the duration each topic was to take in terms of days, weeks or months in their scheme of work notes, all their schemes of work were blank in that column. Three teachers gave reasons that they had not yet completed their schemes of work while one said he forgot. The schools had resumed first week of May 2007. The ‘Record’ column under the topics observed was also blank (See table 9) because according to the class-teachers, the record information was to come after the lessons had been taught indicating the strengths and the weaknesses of the lessons and the suggestions to alleviate the problems encountered. Like the record column under the schemes of work, the lesson evaluation was left blank with the explanation that it would be completed after the lessons to record the strengths, weaknesses and suggestions for improvement.

Under the content column in the lesson plans the three class-teachers except Ms Nkwita had written what pupils were required to do as activities during the lesson. Ms Nkwita listed examples of natural and waste materials as preparation for what to teach and hence tasks pupils would be doing under the activities column in her lesson plan. The information under the content column for B2 and L4 was a duplicate of their specific objective statements but this time leaving out codes. There was no difference between the content and activities stated under those columns in Mr Datha and Mr Karee’s lesson plans. Mr Karee mentioned the two types of drawing he was to teach under the activities column. Ms Mokwalo’s preparation notes for the two columns (content and activities) differed although they were both activities. The other observation was that Ms Mokwalo had listed materials to use in her lesson
presentations under the teaching/learning aids column whereas the other three teachers left the column blank.

5.4.3 Lesson presentation

The notes for the observation findings were chronologically recorded in line with the observation schedule themes used during classroom observations.

5.4.3.1 Case study class L4: Drawing (Field notes 6 June 2007)

(a) Teaching strategies/approaches

The lesson was taught indoors throughout. The teacher used both teacher and child-centred methods as shown in the presentation of data below whereby he used question and answer strategy and engaged pupils in practical activities:
Our topic today is “Drawing” (while writing the topic on the board). First let us define “drawing”. “Drawing is lines and marks” (while writing the words “lines” and “marks” on the board).

We have got shapes, then we have got drawing tools (writing the words “shapes” and “drawing tools” on the board).

When we talk of drawing tools, we talk of tools that we can use when drawing for example, coloured pencils. What else?

Charcoal, chalk, paint, pen, paint brush, felt pens, scissors. (As pupils listed the drawing tools, the teacher wrote them on the board and accepted all the answers).

Good! We also have drawing techniques.

Lines and shapes (while writing the two words on the board).

Lines can be?

Slanting, curving, horizontal, vertical, straight, zigzag. (Pupils listed the lines in chorus and Mr Datha drew a curved line on the board when pupils mentioned it).

Straight lines can match squares and …?

Rectangle.

Curved lines can match circles and …?

Oval.

When we talk of man-made objects we are talking of objects made by man. When we talk of natural objects we talk of objects made by?

God. (Pupils responded in chorus):

We are going to list natural objects and later man-made. Let us start with natural objects.

Rainbow, clouds.

Those are natural objects, now I want man-made.

Roads, cars, books.

Now you are going to draw man-made and natural objects. I will give you papers. You should only draw one object. (He supplied pupils with papers and later crayons and pupils drew various pictures. Mr Datha moved around quietly as pupils worked on their tasks. He did not say anything to pupils concerning their tasks)

Are you through? Pass on your papers. (He collected pupils’ drawings and piled them on the table)
(b) Pupils’ involvement in the lesson

I approached some of the pupils as they worked on their tasks to discuss their work and they told me they were drawing natural and man-made objects. When asked why they chose to draw what they drew they told me that the objects were important for example, saying houses give shelter. None of them could respond to the question “Which lines and shapes have you used in your drawing?” When asked whether their drawings were from observation, memory or imagination, they looked puzzled and still could not respond. However, pupils seemed to be coping with the demands of the task and enjoying it.

(c) Teaching aids, materials, tools or equipment

Tools (pencils, crayons) were used for the drawing lesson but there were no plain papers as the teacher had to improvise (recycle) supplying pupils with papers which had written information on one side for them to use the blank sides. However, they did not have any difficulty in using any of the tools or materials supplied to them.

(d) Time factor

The lesson was planned to take one hour which it did. The discussion of the lesson concepts orally with pupils lasted for twenty minutes while the practical activity took forty minutes but most of the pupils finished earlier and were noisily waiting for others to finish.
5.4.3.2 L4 Lesson observation analysis

Mr Datha started his lesson by introducing the topic “drawing” and later defined it. He mostly used a question and answer method in his instruction. On several occasions he gave his pupils responses before they attempted to answer the questions. The lesson emphasised the types of lines and natural and man-made objects. After defining the concept ‘drawing’ to his pupils, he introduced the other two concepts related to drawing at the same time ‘shapes’ and ‘drawing tools’ and immediately defined ‘drawing tools’ and gave its example as coloured pencils leaving out ‘shapes.’ He further asked his pupils to list more examples of drawing tools which they did and he accepted all the answers pupils listed and noted them on the board. He then mentioned to his pupils that ‘We also have drawing techniques’ and immediately continued to say ‘lines and shapes’ writing those two words on the board. There was no elaboration on the drawing techniques or mention of any specific ones. Shapes were not discussed. Pupils were asked to give examples of lines they knew which they did in chorus.

Mostly, he required his pupils to respond to questions in chorus. He chose a curved line among other types and illustrated it on the board. He further discussed with his pupils what these lines can match, for example, curved lines were said to match circles while straight lines were said to match squares and oval shapes. I assume this meant the lines which could be used to draw various shapes. For example, curved lines to create a circle and vertical or horizontal lines to create squares. Then he introduced pupils to the differences between natural and man-made objects before asking them to list examples of the two types. He later gave his pupils a practical activity to draw either natural or man-made objects. He supplied them with plain papers and coloured pencils. They were to share coloured pencils as they were not enough for each individual to get his or her own packet. The instruction required
each pupil to draw only one object either natural or man-made although some drew more than one including both natural and man-made as shown on figures 7 and 8.

Figure 7: Man-made and Natural drawings

Figure 8: Natural and Man-made drawings
5.4.3.3 Case study class S2: Collage (Field notes 12 June 2007)

(a) Teaching strategies/approaches chronologically

S2 lesson was conducted both indoors and outdoors because at one stage pupils were asked to move out to collect materials for their collage. Ms Nkwita used both teacher and child-centred methods as shown in the chronological presentation of data below.

Table 11: S2 lesson observation notes

| N:   | We are going to do CAPA. (She wrote the words ‘CAPA’ and ‘Collage’ on the board). |
| N:   | Say Collage. (She pointed at the word collage on the board and asked pupils to say it twice in chorus) |
| PP:  | Collage |
| N:   | Stand up and let’s sing the song ‘Re aga tempele’ (meaning, ‘Building up the temple ’). |
| N:   | Do you know the song? |
| PP:  | No |
| N:   | I will teach you. (She taught pupils the song and they grasped it quickly singing with body actions to express the words; bending and standing up to show the development of the built temple) |
| N:   | Our topic in CAPA is collage. Let us state materials we use to build houses. |
| PP:  | grass, soil (Every time each child mentioned the material, the teacher asked pupils to repeat the answer in chorus) |
| N:   | The other thing is ‘decoration. We can decorate our houses the way we like after building them, for example making pictures of a lion on the wall. Who knows how to draw? |
| PP:  | No response. |
| N:   | You know how to decorate, isn’t it? |
| PP:  | Yes (Pupils answered in chorus) |
| N:   | What can you use to decorate? |
| PP:  | Flowers, papers, stones, zebra. (The teacher did not accept a zebra answer) |
| N:   | How can you decorate with a zebra? (She raised up her voice asking the pupil who mentioned zebra) |
| PP:  | Drawing on paper. |
| N:   | What else? |
| PP:  | Leaves, branches, fruits. |
| N:   | How can you decorate on paper with fruits like orange? (She did not want the child to respond but was just commenting to show the child she was not accepting the answer. Most of the pupils were not raising their hands and they seemed confused presumably because the teacher did not say whether they were to list materials or techniques of decoration and whether they were to talk of decoration on
buildings or surfaces such as papers)

N: What else can we use? We can use egg-shells. *(She asked the question and answered it herself)*

N: If you have a picture of a person, what could you use for eyes?

PP: Eye. *(No response from others except one pupil who said ‘eye’)*

N: What could you use for the eyes? *(She repeated the question and then said “I mean waste material”. There was still no response from pupils).*

N: ‘Ke raya dilo tse di kontle’ – ‘I mean things outside’ *(She probed in Setswana language and went back to point at the picture of the cow asking them what can be used on the cow’s eye).*

PP: Watch for eyes.

N: Yes, you can put a small watch for the eye. What else can we use on this picture?

PP: Bottles

N: ‘Yes’. *(Pupils facial expressions showed confusion and frustration)*

N: This is a collage and it was made by materials such as feathers, can you see it? *(Ms Nkwita opened a page on pupil’s CAPA textbook and pupils an example of a collage)*

PP: Yes *(Pupil responded in chorus).*

N: Now open page 34 (standard 2 CAPA textbooks) Can you see a collage?

PP: Yes *(They responded in chorus)*

N: Yes, this is a collage; different materials were used to create this collage. Now open page 33. These are materials used to create a collage. I said in a collage we can use different types of materials to show something.

N: You have seen the materials and a collage, now close your books.

N: Now look at what I have. *(She pasted a sample of a collage made on a piece of manila paper on the board).*

N: What materials have I used on this collage?

PP1: Sticks

N: They are not sticks but scraps that you throw when sharpening your pencils.

PP2: Stones.

N: Yes, I have used stones to write ‘Forgive Me’ on my collage. *(The collage had ‘forgive me’ written in the centre).*

N: Now you are going to draw. What are you going to draw?

PP: Cow, goat, sheep, etc *(Pupils listed animals only).*

N: *(She drew a picture of a hut on the board in a rectangle frame drawn to represent the paper surface and asked ...). What can you use to make a collage of a hut?*

PP: Soil, grass.
N: Now you are going to move outside to collect materials for your collage. (Before pupils went outside, Ms Nkwita created an example of a collage. She drew a hut at her table with a door and a window asking pupils if they see what she was drawing. Although not all pupils saw what she was drawing especially the ones at the back, they said ‘yes’ to the question. She later pasted the picture on the board and asked pupils materials she can use to make a collage for her hut).

PP1: Grass.

N: Now I am going to use glue (pasting grass for roof). Look at me. You should be watching, do you all see?

PP: Yes (but some of them could not see as they were too far away).

N: What else can I use? (Pasting the hut on the board as she asked pupils).

PP2: Soil.

MP: Good, I should use soil. (She then removed the sample from the board and put it back on her table in front of the class and continued sticking the soil on the wall outline and on pictures of animals drawn below the hut. The classroom was very quiet at that moment no one talking including the teacher who was concentrating on sticking soil.

N: I have used soil for the wall and grass for the roof; what can I use for the window? (Few pupils raised their hands)

N: Look at the window, what is it made of? (She probed)

PP: glass.

N: Yes, I can use glass. What is a window made of? (Pupils did not respond).

N: It is made of glass. But because I do not have a glass, what can I use?

PP: Bottle.

N: Who has a bottle? (One pupil gave her a piece of glass from a broken bottle and she stuck it on the window).

N: What is left now; I used grass, soil, and glass?

PP: Door.

N: Door, What can I use to make the door?

PP: pen, balls, plank.

N: Tell me, if I paste a plank on paper, what will happen?

PP: It will fall.

N: What can I use then?

PP: Cardboard paper, paper.

N: We have created a collage of a hut. (Ms Nkwita pasted the cardboard paper and showed pupils the completed collage of a hut).

N: Now you are going to make your own thing. You are going to draw your own pictures and later make a collage. You will go outside to collect materials for your collage. (She made outlines on edges of each paper to be distributed to pupils as pupils were quietly watching. She distributed papers to
**pupils one by one as she drew outlines on them while others were waiting for their turn to get papers. When asked what the outlines were for after the lesson, she said they were to make pupils’ work neat and attractive.**

**N:** Those who have papers; start writing up your names and draw. Then go outside to collect materials for your drawing. *(She kept on drawing outlines on pupils’ plain papers. When she finished, she went outside in front of the classroom together with her pupils for about 15 minutes to collect materials such as soil, grass, leaves and sticks.)*

**N:** Don’t copy from each other; everyone should draw what he or she likes. No one should make the hut that I made. *(Teacher silent for about 5 minutes)*

**N:** Don’t draw the hut; you can draw people dancing, animals, crops in the field, people from the cattle-post, boys milking cows, etc. *(She was moving around giving comments to pupils such as advising them to draw bigger pictures which are visible, avoid drawing many pictures which could make it difficult to paste materials, use rulers for straight lines. Despite her advice to draw larger pictures, some of the pupils continued making small pictures.)*

**N:** If you are through, glue is here if you want to paste, but let me have a look at your drawing first.

**N:** If you want what I have here, you can come and get it. *(She was cutting papers into small pieces and also had various seeds on her table. She continuously reminded pupils to consider materials she had.)*

**N:** There are many things you can draw. Glue is also here *(moving around her class).*(Some pupils took crayons to colour their pictures before pasting materials.)*

**N:** You don’t colour, I want you to draw and paste materials.

**N:** I said if you want to use a certain material but not having it, let me know. I have sorghum, beans and maize seeds. You can come for them if you need them.

**N:** I want all of you to make only one drawing. *(She later discovered that pupils were drawing more than one item and mentioned it in passing that they should draw one item only. Some pupils were erasing many times and drawing the same thing, removing other items and taking them back several times. Some pupils were anxious to see what other colleagues were doing to get ideas but their teacher told them to sit down and not to move to other tables.)*

**N:** If you are through, bring your paper. *(She called pupils’ names to go back to their seats when they wanted to see what their colleagues have created.)*

**N:** Now, I want each of you to tell us the types of materials he or she used when creating a collage. What did you use? *(Asking few pupils in class.)*

**PP:** Leaves, Seeds, paper, soil.

**N:** Now discuss your collage with your friends. Tell them what materials you used to make your collage.
(b) Pupils’ involvement in the lesson

Pupils answered questions on materials used to build houses and items which could be used to decorate. Some seemed confused when they were to list materials for decoration. They later created their collage and some of the examples of the items included:

- Outline of a butterfly pasted with small pieces of white and pink manila paper.
- Outline of a goat pasted with soil.
- Tree (Soil was pasted on a tree outline to represent the roots and the stem, grass for branches and natural leaves for leaves)
- The whole outline of a tree shape pasted with soil.
- A rectangular shape pasted with maize and sorghum seeds.
- Outline of a tree (stem pasted with soil and branches and leaves with yellow natural fresh flowers).

After completing their tasks, they discussed with classmates, materials they used when creating their collage.

(c) Teaching aids, materials, tools or equipment

Materials for the collage were limited as pupils collected them during the lesson. Pupils were told to collect materials in front of their classroom where not much could be collected. The glue pupils used was not enough for pupils as they shared the little office glue which seemed unsuitable for pasting the materials they had collected except paper. This resulted in some of the materials not sticking to the paper surface used as background and causing pupils to take a lot of time to finish their work.
The teacher demonstrated to pupils how to make a collage by creating a hut collage with grass, soil, glass and cardboard. The materials were pasted scantily on a hut outline illustrated on paper. The teacher had a collection of three types of seeds (bean, maize, sorghum) and a collection of materials she used to demonstrate. Other materials were prepared during the lesson such as drawing of borders on the edges of plain papers pupils used, collection of materials pupils used for their collage and scraps or small pieces of papers the teacher had cut for pupils to use. Although pupils were working with glue, grass and soil, there was not much guidance for handling the materials.

(d) Time factor

The lesson was planned to take one hour but it took one hour twenty minutes which was sequenced as follows: thirty-five minutes for discussion and demonstration of the collage activity, fifteen minutes to collect their materials outside, twenty-five minutes to work on their activity and five minutes to discuss their finished products. Although pupils claimed to have finished their work when the teacher asked them, some of the shapes they drew were blank without objects pasted on them. Some of those who illustrated more than one picture were not able to create collage designs on all of them. The following images (9-11) show a cross section of outcomes:
Figure 9: Incomplete collage 1

Figure 10: Incomplete collage 2
5.4.3.4 S2 Lesson observation analysis

S2 lesson was conducted both indoors and outdoors. Pupils moved outside to collect their collage materials. Pupils were asked to stand up and were taught a short hymn with words leading to the construction of the collage as an introduction of the lesson. The hymn was called ‘Building up the temple of the Lord.’ They sang the hymn showing actions to express the words with their bodies for example imitating someone, building the temple developing from low to higher levels of building steps. Pupils were later asked to read the word ‘collage’ on the board in chorus. The teacher’s initial emphasis was on a question and answer method followed by giving pupils a practical activity to create their collage after discussion and demonstration of the collage activity which lasted for thirty-five minutes. This includes time
for making borders on pupils’ plain papers before they were distributed to them. Pupils had about fifteen minutes to collect their materials outside, twenty-five minutes to work on their activity and five minutes to discuss their finished products.

After introduced to the topic, pupils were asked to list the materials for building the houses which they readily responded to. Then pupils were asked to state what they can use to decorate and this introduced some confusion to some of the pupils who seemed not to be sure whether the teacher referred to decoration of houses or any other object or material. Among the list given by pupils on what can be used to decorate was a ‘zebra’ and ‘fruits’ which the teacher rejected and left some of the children more confused as they was no explanation to why the answers were not accepted. The teacher tried to give an example of a collage of a human figure picture with probing questions, for example; asking pupils to list materials that can be used in certain parts of the picture but most of the pupils still had difficulties. She later referred pupils to the pictures in their Creative and Performing Arts textbook which helped some of the pupils to have an idea of what was taught. Discovering that her pupils had difficulties she demonstrated how to make a collage in front of the class showing each stage. Some pupils further away from her table seemed not to see what she was doing. She took a lot of time demonstrating which helped those close enough to her to understand although those who could not see well seemed to become bored by the activity.

She later asked pupils to collect materials for their collage activity outside the classroom. Returning to class with her pupils, she took her time drawing outlines (borders on the edges) on plain papers that she gave pupils to use for their collage as the surface. She moved around her class as they worked on their activities and advised them where necessary such as ‘to draw larger and one item’. Despite that, some of the pupils still showed that they were not
sure of what was expected of them as they coloured-in their pictures rather than paste materials with glue as seen in figure 12 below:

![Figure 12: Coloured-in collage](image)

Most of them were anxious to see what their colleagues had created but were not allowed to view other pupils’ work. The teacher advised those who coloured to paste materials rather than colour. Some of the pupils did not grasp the instruction the teacher gave as she moved around that they should draw one item only for their collage. Instead, they went on making more than one item. She also collected various seeds and cut outs of papers for pupils to use if they wished.
5.4.3.5 Case study class B2: Pattern making (Field notes 21 June 2007)

(a) Teaching strategies/approaches

Ms Mokwalo conducted her lesson indoors throughout. She mostly used a child-centred method as shown in the presentation of data below:

Table 12: S2 lesson observation notes

| M: Do you remember this word? (She pasted a flash card with the word ‘Materials’) |
| PP: Materials. |
| M: What are materials? (Pupils gave examples but Ms Mokwalo clarified that she wanted the definition and no one responded to the definition question). |
| M: ‘They are things we use to make other things.’ (She wrote the definition on the board before saying it loud). |
| M: Give the examples of materials that we collected and stored there (pointing at the collection box). |
| PP: matchbox, sticks, tins, bottles, papers, plastic. (One child mentioned chairs but the teacher ignored him not showing any sign of accepting or rejecting the answer although some of the pupils giggled). |
| M: We are starting a new topic. (She pasted a flash card on the board with the words: ‘pattern making’ and ‘lines’ and asked pupils to read them). |
| M: Give examples of lines you know. |
| PP: straight lines, slanting lines, zigzag, curved. |
| M: I want to see whether you remember these lines: (drawing vertical, horizontal, curved, zigzag and diagonal lines on the board) |
| PP: slanting, curved, horizontal, vertical, straight, zigzag. (They said out the types of lines in chorus as Ms Mokwalo drew them on the board): |
| M: What is the word? Read it out. (Pasted a flash card written the word ‘Colour’ and asked pupils to read it out). |
| PP: Colour (Pupils read the word out in chorus). |
| M: Which colours do you know? |
| PP: red, blue. |
| M: What about this one? (Pasted a flash card written the word ‘Shape’ and asked pupils to read it out). |
| M: Give examples of shapes you know. |
| PP: Circle, square, rectangle, triangle. |
| M: Some of the shapes are pasted on our wall (pointing at shapes of circle, rectangle, square and
triangle pasted on the classroom wall under mathematics teaching aids).

M: We have another word (Past a flash card with the word ‘Pattern’ and its definition but this time read it out to pupils). *Pattern – A design from shape, colour, lines.

M: Show me any pattern in the classroom – Something made of lines, colours and shapes.

PP1: Zebra.

M: Who can pick out the picture of a zebra from the ones there? (pointing at the pictures on the classroom wall pasted under the science teaching aids. One child was chosen and he was able to identify the picture among others, removed it and gave it to the teacher).

M: Does this zebra have patterns? (Showing the picture to the whole class).

PP: Yes (in chorus)

M: How are the patterns made?

PP: Lines

M: Which ones?

PP: Slanting.

M: What else? (No one responded).

M: There are many lines in this animal, for example, horizontal and vertical. Any other pattern in our classroom? (Asked pupils to identify those animals from the wall and remove them)

PP, 3 and 4: Giraffe, tortoise, and lion.

M: How are the patterns made?

PP: Giraffe patterns are made by the brown colour, lines and shapes for example, square. Tortoise patterns are made by lines, shapes and colour (Ms MK and other learners did not agree with one learner who said that the lion have patterns).

M: There are two types of pattern, ‘natural’ and ‘man-made’. Natural patterns are not made by a person such as those on animals.

M: Who make those patterns? (No response from pupil and the teacher did not give pupils the answer on who makes the natural patterns as they failed to answer it and went on to say: ‘Man-made means anything made by people’).

M: Give examples of man-made patterns.

PP: Cup, tiles.

M: Look at that tile. (Referred pupils to the picture of a tile in class with brown squared pattern. However, both the teacher and other pupils did not agree with the pupil who said that the cup in class had patterns)

M: What about the clothes you are wearing? Do they have patterns? (One child identified a pattern on a classmate’s jersey and mentioned that the pattern was made of lines, shapes and colour).

M: What is the name of the shape on his jersey? (Asking the pupil who identified the pattern)

PP: Square.
M: We are going to look at our textbooks. Open page 46 which has pictures of patterns for example, the giraffe. We are going to look at the natural and man-made pictures and I am going to ask you questions.

MK Identify the natural patterns from these pictures.

PP1: Picture A is a zebra.

PP2: Picture F is a giraffe.

M: Identify the man-made patterns from these pictures.

PP1: Picture D is a pot with pattern decorations.

M: What shapes are used for decorations? (Asking the same pupil).

PP: Triangle.

PP2: Picture E is a floor. (This response introduced an argument because the picture in the textbook was not clear. Some pupils thought it was a tile).

M: Yes, it is difficult to tell what it is. (She accepted both the responses). It could be a picture of cloth with decorations. It has lines, shapes and colour. Tell me the lines you can see.

PP: horizontal, vertical, and slanting.

M: It has triangle shapes. (Nothing was said about Picture C).

M: We learnt about patterns made by repeating lines, colour and shapes. (She summarised the lesson before giving pupils the activity to work on)

M: I am going to give you papers to draw your own patterns and crayons to decorate. (She distributed papers and asked pupils to write the date before drawing).

M: You should not trace from books. You should create your own patterns using lines, colour and shapes. (She emphasised).

M: Have you finished? Bring your papers. (She collected the papers and put them on the table and promised pupils that she will display them).

(b) Pupils’ involvement in the lesson

Pupils answered questions on pattern making, identifying items with patterns in their classroom and identifying how those patterns were made in terms of lines and shapes. They seemed to be enjoying the lesson as they actively participated. The teacher mostly presented her lesson in English and her pupils were able to respond in English, except in few instances where she had to translate when they had difficulties. For example, what natural and man-made patterns meant in Setswana, “natural patterns” were said to mean “diphetheni tsa
"tlholego" in Setswana while “man-made patterns” were translated as “diphtheni tse di dirilweng ke batho.” Although the lesson seemed accessible to pupils when discussing types of patterns with their teacher and classmates, most of them seemed confused when they were to create their own patterns. Instructions to create patterns seemed not to have been clear to most of the pupils although at one stage the teacher had stopped them to clarify both verbally and with illustrations on the board. They created their own patterns which were almost of similar designs dominated by shaded regular shapes such as circles, rectangles and triangles. Examples of these patterns are shown below in figures 13-16.

![Figure 13: Regular Shapes Pattern 1](image)
Figure 14: Regular Shapes Pattern 2

Figure 15: Regular Shapes Pattern 3

Figure 16: Regular Shapes Pattern 4
Considering the concept, “pattern” to mean repetition of art elements such as line, colour, shapes, it is very difficult to identify what pupils had repeated to create the above patterns. I could only identify the repetition aspect in figure 13 on the fourth, fifth and sixth row where the rectangular shapes were created and patterns created by alternating two colours in each row. Presumably, pupils understood the activity to require them to make any shapes of their choice and colour them. Maybe this could have been clear if the teacher had an open discussion with pupils as self-evaluation of their outcomes. They could have interpreted their patterns and identify the process of creating them. One could have expected pupils to describe how they repeated various art elements especially “line” which was the emphasis of the specific objective (2.7.1.2) to create patterns.

(c) Teaching aids, materials, tools and equipment

Pupils used pencils, crayons and A4 plain papers to create their patterns. The teacher had patterns of animals with patterns pasted on the wall prior to the lesson which were pasted under the science teaching aids and referred to them when discussing patterns with pupils. The teacher also referred to the pictures showing various patterns in the standard two CAPA textbook. She demonstrated the activity by making illustrations of shapes repeated in a pattern on the board with a piece of chalk.

(d) Time factor

The lesson was planned to take one hour which it did although about half of the class had not completed their work when their teacher stopped them and collected their work. Nothing was said about not finishing. The oral discussion of the lesson before practical work took about
thirty minutes and pupils were given half an hour to do their practical activity. It took some of the pupils who did not seem sure of what to do significant time to decide what to create.

5.4.3.6 B2 Lesson observation analysis

B2 lesson was taught indoors throughout the one hour period and mostly child-centred as pupils were actively involved in both oral and practical activities. The teacher introduced the lesson by asking pupils to read the key words on the flash cards and define them. The oral discussion was through a question and answer method. After introducing the key (new) words ‘pattern making’ and ‘lines’ to pupils she asked pupils to list the types of lines they knew and pupils were able to list them. She then introduced the concept of ‘colour’ and asked pupils to list the ones they know and again pupils showed an appropriate awareness of elementary. In addition, she introduced the concept ‘shapes’ and asked for the examples which pupils easily listed. As there were many items including pictures in the classroom wall, she asked pupils to identify patterns in them and how each pattern was created and again pupils readily responded. She further discussed the types of patterns as ‘natural’ and ‘manmade’ with pupils first defining the concepts and later listing examples of each type. The discussion also included the description of each pattern looking at the lines, shapes and colours used to create various patterns.

The next stage was asking pupils to identify the natural and man-made patterns from the patterns illustrated in their CAPA textbooks. One picture from the textbook provided some confusion on what the picture was, some saying it was a tile while others said it was a piece of cloth. However, the teacher accepted all the answers and concentrated on describing its pattern to pupils. One picture labeled ‘C’ was not discussed or mentioned. When summarising the lesson, the teacher defined the concept ‘pattern’ which she introduced at the
beginning without a definition. Pupils were later supplied with plain papers and coloured pencils to make their patterns using lines, colour and shapes. Pupils’ work was dominated by regular shapes such as rectangles, triangles and circles as shown in figures 13 to 16.

5.4.3.7 Case study class X4: Drawing (Field notes 6 July 2007)

(a) Teaching strategies/approaches documented chronologically

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 13: X 4 lesson observation notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> What is drawing? (<em>Few pupils raised up their hands</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP1:</strong> Drawing is ‘drawing a person.’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP2:</strong> A line or a mark. (<em>Teacher approved the definition and wrote it on the board while saying it out but with additional information</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Drawing is lines, marks or even shapes made with drawing tools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Who can come and draw any type of line on the board? (<em>3 pupils drew vertical, horizontal and diagonal lines</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> What are these lines examples of? (<em>No response</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> All these lines are straight lines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Give examples of drawing tools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP:</strong> pencil, paper, ruler, pen, crayons, rubber.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> How many of you know how to draw? (<em>Few pupils raised their hands and Mr Karee demonstrated how pupils should hold pencils when drawing emphasising that they should not press the pencils hard on paper so that if necessary they would be able to erase their marks</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> We have two types of drawing that you once learnt about. What are they?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP1:</strong> Natural materials. (<em>The teacher was not satisfied with the response and asked the question for the second time</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP2:</strong> Natural drawing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Yes, natural drawing is the type we find from natural environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Give examples of natural drawing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PP:</strong> Tree, a face of a human-being.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> Correct. Who can draw the human-being face on the board? (<em>One boy drew a round shape (circle) to represent the face without any features</em>).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>K:</strong> The second type of drawing is man-made drawing which is created by a person.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
K: Give examples of man-made drawing.

PP: Chair, duster, car.

K: Now you are going to draw natural and man-made drawings in groups. (As pupils seated in groups, they worked in those groups. However, most of the pupils did not participate. One child in each group drew as they were drawing on A4 papers. The teacher was moving around quietly as pupils worked on their activity. He did not discuss anything with groups when they were working in their activity except to ask them if they have finished drawing)

K: Now stop and present your work. One from your group should come in front of the class with the groups’ work and tell us the material, product you created and type of drawing you created. (They were to do it in turns).

The table below gives information about pupils’ presentation of their group work tasks:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Type of drawing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pencil</td>
<td>Face</td>
<td>Natural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Crayon</td>
<td>Bicycle and window</td>
<td>Man-made</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Pencil</td>
<td>Straight line</td>
<td>Man-made</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(A representative from group 4 went to the front of the class with his picture like the other 3 representatives from groups 1-3 but did not present. He stood in front of the class hiding his face with a paper. The teacher asked him to present but he could not convince him as he just stood there quietly. The teacher presented for the group) This group created a picture of an elephant and a hare.

K: You will re-draw these items sometime and paste them on the wall. Bring your work.

(b) Pupils’ involvement in the lesson

Pupils were asked questions on drawing types before engaging in the practical work and they actively participated. For those who drew images to represent their groups seemed to have been enjoying the activity. After completing their activity they shared their work with other groups stating what they have drawn, the type of drawing they did and materials they used. All the groups presented except one which the teacher presented for them because their representative seemed shy to talk in front of his classmates. The images pupils drew are shown below in figures 17-20:
Figure 17: Group 1, Person and Stones drawing

Figure 18: Group 2, Bicycle and Window drawing
Figure 19a: Group 3: Horizontal, vertical, diagonal lines and oval shapes drawing

Figure 19b: Circular Shapes drawing
(c) Teaching aids, materials, tools and equipment

Pupils used pencils, crayons and A4 plain papers to make their drawings. Three groups did not colour their drawings as seen in figures 17, 18 and 20. The pupils in group 3 shaded their work. The teacher demonstrated how pupils should hold their pencils when drawing by holding a piece of chalk pointing with it on the board.

(d) Time factor

The lesson was planned to take one hour and pupils finished their task before the allocated time. The teacher took about fifteen minutes discussing with the pupils before giving them
the practical activity and within twenty-five minutes, pupils had finished their drawings and took about nine minutes presenting their group work.

5.4.3.8 X4 Lesson observation analysis

Mr Karee conducted his class indoors throughout. He introduced his lesson by asking pupils to define the concept ‘Drawing’. After his pupils defined the concept ‘drawing’ and illustrated the types of lines on the board, Mr Karee asked pupils what the lines vertical, horizontal and diagonal are examples of and no one responded. He highlighted that all of them are straight lines and asked his pupils to give examples of drawing tools which they did readily. Mr Karee then asked how many pupils know how to draw and few pupils indicated by raising their hands. He went to the board and demonstrated with a piece of chalk pointing at the board how pupils should hold their pencils when drawing emphasising that they should draw lightly with pencil to enable them to erase their marks easily. Some pupils appeared to be confused as to what the teacher was saying but they did not ask for more clarification. He continued his lesson by mentioning to pupils that there are two types of drawing and asked pupils to list them. Pupils mentioned to the teacher that those types were ‘natural drawing’ and ‘man-made drawing.’ The teacher said that the pupils were correct and he described the types of drawing mentioned by pupils before asking them to give examples of each. He described natural drawing as the one found from natural sources while man-made was described as the one created by a person. Pupils gave examples of the ‘natural drawing’ as tree and human-being and ‘man-made’ as chair, duster and car and they were accepted by their teacher.

After all these processes, the teacher gave pupils a practical activity to draw the natural and man-made drawing in groups. However, in each group only one pupil in each did the task
while others observed. Some pupils in four of the groups participated in suggesting what to draw, whilst one did the drawing. In one of the groups only one child was doing the thinking of what to draw and drawing while his colleagues were observers who did not contribute. They quietly observed him drawing. Although the teacher moved around when pupils were working on their tasks, he did not encourage those who were not participating to take part in the discussion and decision making. Moreover, Mr Karee did not have an input on what the pupils were doing apart from continuously asking pupils if they had finished. Pupils’ outcomes are shown in images 17 to 20. The last stage of the lesson was when pupils were asked to present their group work in which one from each group was to stand in front of the class and share with others what his/her group had drawn including the materials they used and the type of drawing they had created for example, if they have created a ‘natural’ or ‘man-made’ drawing. One child who was to represent his group was shy and could not present despite Mr Karee’s request and the teacher ended up taking the work from him and presented for the group. The teacher’s parting comments on the lesson to pupils was that they will redraw the items sometime in future and display them on the wall.

5.4.3.9 Comments on the observation findings

I found it important to make a brief comment on the observation findings under each theme covered during data presentation and analysis. More emphasis will be on the teaching strategies, as it is the main aspect of my research question. Most of the teachers I informally talked to, claimed not to have studied art and craft in their education, although my experience as an art and craft lecturer in Botswana is that all the diploma teacher trainees in primary education colleges study art and craft as a subject as non-specialists if they are not specialising in the subject. One would therefore assume that among the 95 teachers from the four case studies schools, 45 who were Diploma holders in Primary Education had studied art
and craft as generalists (non-specialists). The results revealed that none of the four case study teachers observed specialised in the art and craft discipline. However, two of the participants confirmed that they did art and craft as non-specialists during their diploma training. I tried to identify those who could have specialised in art and craft in each school, so as to have representatives but could not find any. This finding identifies the need to encourage teachers to opt for art and craft when sent for in-service training in teacher training institutes.

(a) Teaching strategies

Quite distinctive teaching strategies were observed from different case studies classes in terms of approaches and methods of teaching. However, all the four teachers did not integrate art and craft with the core subjects despite it being combined with them in the lower primary syllabus to make the CAPA the programme. Although these teachers seemed to focus on the aims and objectives stipulated in the art and craft curriculum, three of them were flexible in their teaching and considered other aspects they saw relevant to the topics they were teaching. The standard four teachers (L4 and X4) addressed the general objective (2.1.1) which emphasised that pupils should be able to ‘develop awareness of the complexity, beauty of nature and man-made environment’ (CAPA, P.23) with its specific objective (2.1.1.1) suggesting that ‘pupils should be able to draw the structure and composition of natural and man-made objects’. Both teachers introduced the aspect of art elements such as lines and shapes during their discussion with pupils prior to engaging them in the drawing activities but could not encourage pupils to observe them when drawing.

Many art educators such as Barrett (1979) and Ragans (2000) argue that line, shape, colour, tone, space and texture are elements which comprise our experience of the visual-tactile
world. “It is through our awareness of these elements that we realize the potential of materials and the forms through which ideas are expressed” (Barrett, 1979, p. 49). In one instance Mr Datha mentioned that there are drawing techniques, although he did not elaborate more on them. The drawing techniques were also not emphasised when pupils were engaged in the practical activity in order to promote their development of the drawing skills. The emphasis when pupils were given the drawing activity was on natural and man-made objects. Mr Datha’s pupils were instructed to draw either natural or man-made objects, while in Mr Karee’s class they were asked to make either the natural type of drawing or man-made drawing. Mr Karee’s interpretation of the objective was that natural and man-made were types of drawing. The pupils’ group presentation in X4 class was also set by the teacher to state the materials they used, the product they had created and types of drawing they made (whether the natural or man-made type). There was no emphasis on those art elements which are the language of art, craft and design such as line, texture, colour, shape and tone.

My experience as an educator is that there is an implicit expectation that at the end of a subject instruction, learners will know, understand and/or be able to do something that they were unable to prior to the lesson. Thus, in art we are concerned with the acquisition of skills involved in art and craft such as drawing, pattern making and collage making. We are also concerned with the development of understanding and the acquisition of subject-related knowledge. Hickman (2005) suggests that “skill acquisition should be our priority in the first years of schooling up until the age of fourteen, with the focus for teaching being on threshold skills” (p. 36). He says as pupils progress in their skills and knowledge of art and craft, the development of understanding becomes more important and the little knowledge acquired and the low level skills expected by teachers from their pupils could be identified from each pupil’s pace. I believe this aspect concerns the teaching and learning of concepts which Mr
Datha and Mr Karee partly addressed in their drawing lesson by discussing the art elements as key concepts of the topic ‘drawing’ prior to giving their pupils’ practical work. What was seen to be lacking was sufficient guidance on the techniques of drawing which could help pupils acquire the necessary skills.

The standard four pupils were over nine years of age whom according to art educationists who studied development of child art such as Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975), Cox (1997) ad Barnes (2002), are expected to be at the schematic (7-9) and realism (10 and above) stage. A general developmental explanation for the development of child art is more global. Theorists who studied the stages of art development therefore have observed that pupils show different characteristics in their drawing at different stages of art development which are attached to different ages. At the schematic stage pupils begin to customise and individualise their personal symbols and schemas. Their symbols become recognisable to others. “There is greater concern for detail, planning and realistic rendering… Some are very concerned that the observer recognises the content or subject matter…” (Havens, 2002, p. 34). Pupils at the realism stage are very concerned with the elements and principles of art and design when drawing and hence they strive for perfection in their art work. They are concerned with shape, colour, shading, size, placement, perspective, proportion, depth and the use of details to approximate reality. Considering these advises, it is vital for teachers to motivate and give pupils the relevant guidance on practical work to promote their skills in drawing. My experience both at primary and higher institution is that pupils at these two stages tend to get frustrated and give up on art especially drawing when their products do not match reality.

Most of the pupils’ drawings in Mr Datha and Mr Karee’s classes were below their expected level in drawing according to the child art theorists. They showed characteristics which
matched that of a pre-schematic (4-7 year olds). There is evidence of pupils using symbols and codes in their drawings including distortion and exaggerated proportion. Examples are shown in Figures 21 to 23 below:

![Figure 21: Objects Drawing 1](image1.jpg)

![Figure 22: Objects Drawing 2](image2.jpg)
They seem not concerned about consideration of details which could be shown by the
observation of the art elements and principles of design. This could be a result of teachers
not giving guidance and emphasis on the drawing techniques and the use of the language of
art (art elements and principles of design) by both the teachers. Some of the pupils displayed
the potentials of drawing skills which convinces that if motivated they could go far with
drawing. This will be discussed in detail with more examples in chapter 7.

Although sometimes during the delivery, Mr Datha seemed to experience some difficulties in
teaching art and craft concepts and content, he mentioned during the interview that they had
the teacher’s guide in their school and I wondered if he had used it during his planning of the
lesson. Mr Karee mentioned during the interview that they did not have the standard four
CAPA teacher’s guide in their school. Ms Nkwita’s general objective (2.3.1) from the CAPA
programme stipulated that: learners should be able to gain experience in working with
different materials in collage making. The specific objectives: 2.3.1.1 and 2.3.1.2 were
addressed which required pupils to use natural and waste materials to create a collage. Ms Nkwita emphasised the materials for making collage which was her specific objective of the day by asking pupils to list and identify materials used in samples she brought to class and the collage she created during class lesson to demonstrate how to make a collage. As she demonstrated her activity, she did not mention the process of making a collage. She repeatedly asked pupils where the materials she had could be stuck on the outline of the hut she made before sticking each material. This approach may have inhibited a more thorough understanding of art and craft as it has long been seen as a barrier to teaching and learning of the subject. Robinson (1982) observes that tying a subject too closely to pre-specified objectives can stifle the flexibility and responsiveness on which good teaching depends. The problem could be because the teacher mentioned that she did not have the CAPA teacher’s guide, although the document did not also have content on the techniques and process of collage making. It only suggested the activities pupils could do such as: “Pasting various materials to create village scenes, landscapes, shops, clinic, police station, school, kgotla, creating a composition using natural and man-made materials and creating patterns using the collage” (Standard 2 Teacher’s Guide, p. 12).

Nevertheless, the document suggests that when teachers assess their pupils, they should consider their matching and sorting of materials for a collage project, knowledge of the processes of collage making and the use of various collage techniques or processes to create a composition. The two standard four and S2 classes’ general objectives emphasised materials to be used and excluded techniques and skills to be developed. This could have influenced the teachers to focus on materials in their delivery of lessons, not considering the techniques and processes of creating products. “A planned programme of art and design should be produced
in order to ensure that important areas of skills and knowledge are not omitted” (Mallen, nd, p. 60).

Ms Mokwalo’s general objective (2.7.1) for the lesson she was teaching stated that pupils should be able to “explore and discover patterns” and its specific objectives required pupils to identify and differentiate man-made and natural patterns (2.7.1.1) and to use repeated lines to create patterns (2.2.1.2). The teacher seemed organised in terms of both materials and teaching aids, content and sequence in her teaching of the topic ‘Pattern Making.’ However, she interpreted the objective 2.7.1.1 to mean that man-made and natural are the two types of patterns and mentioned it during her delivery. She did not introduce the types as ‘random’ and ‘planned’ patterns. The standard two CAPA teacher’s guide clearly states that there are various patterns found in the natural and man-made environment and mentioned random and planned patterns as the types of patterns. She mentioned during the interview session that she had both the pupil’s CAPA textbook and the teacher’s guide. These documents could guide teachers on their planning and instruction of the lessons if they are well presented or else they could bring more confusion to the teachers and learners. For example, the image which introduced argument in Ms Mokwalo’s class where pupils viewed the image differently. The item on the extent at which the art and craft curriculum relate with materials provided by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation department to support the curriculum was included in the interview items and the responses will be presented in chapter 6.

In class B2 pupils were actively involved in the discussion of the elements of art; line, shape and colour, which could be used to create patterns. One of their tasks was to identify patterns made by using those art elements from various materials and objects in their class. Objective 2.7.1.1 required pupils to explore ‘line’ but the teacher also introduced the concepts: shapes
and colour. This seemed to have confused pupils. The concept of repeating certain art elements to create patterns which was supposed to be the key concept for the day seemed not to have been grasped by most pupils. Factual knowledge needs to be introduced to young learners with sensitivity because if it confronts them at the wrong time, it may be ignored as meaningless and useless. “It may not fit what they need and can understand at a particular stage of their development, and if it is imposed by force, it may act as a disturbance and arouse resistance” (Arnheim, 1991, p.33).

The standard two CAPA teacher’s guide recommends that pupils should be given activities to draw objects and decorate with repeated lines and shapes and to make various patterns using lines and shapes. Pupils had a lot of items in their collection box, which the teacher could have advised them to view in order to get ideas of various patterns. This may have helped to develop creativity skills. The natural environment outside the classroom also had various interesting patterns that pupils could have been taken out to view or collect objects such as animal paw prints, butterflies, spider webs and leaves to get ideas from them. Both the standard two and four CAPA teacher’s guides include the description of the key concepts for all the four topics taught in the case study classes. It also includes drawing, collage and pattern making techniques and methods. It suggests activities and assessment for all these topics. One could argue that the techniques and methods of creating objects or products should be emphasised in the curriculum objectives and further elaborated in teachers’ guides to guide teachers on how to go about each topic or activity. The art and craft curriculum under the lower primary syllabus seemed to be emphasising materials to use and what to create leaving out techniques and methods of going about these activities as seen under objectives in tables 7, 8 and 9.
(b) Pupils’ involvement in the lessons

As pupils’ feedback in both oral and written forms can be used as evidence of how far the teaching or learning objective have been realised, I took this into consideration and observed pupils’ responses to questions and practical work. Pupils in all the case study classes readily coped with the ‘making’ activities. In theory, which is ‘knowledge and understanding’ attainment target 1 in the CAPA programme in some instances pupils had difficulties in responding to some of the questions asked by their teachers, except the ones who were in L4 who readily coped with all the activities. As mentioned earlier on in this chapter, when pupils were working on their activities, the standard four teachers did not become directly involved with what they were doing. This is what is advocated by art theorists such as Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) and Mannathoko (2003), who argue that interfering with young children’s art would result in them imposing an adult art on children. Children view art and craft as a personal matter therefore they should be given chance to produce their own art and craft work on their own. The teacher’s intervention could interfere with the pupils’ creative process.

Hickman (2005) contends that “some educators have maintained that children, if left to their own devices, develop artistically without the need for adult intervention” (p. 18). He observes that the notion of non-intervention in a child’s artistic development was developed by an Australian educator Franz Cizek in the early 19th century who encouraged children to express their personal reactions to events in their lives through art and held that all children have creative power and blossom naturally. “Because of the lack of sound pedagogical base, the idea of non-intervention in child art floundered but its legacy lives on amongst those educators who do not want to ‘interfere’ with children’s natural development” (Hickman, 2005, p. 18).
In contrast, Barnes (2002) argues that children should be motivated to promote their development of skills by teachers creating a conducive environment for their learning, such as making materials available and discussing their work with them. He encourages teachers to teach pupils how to see the objects they are drawing in order to develop their drawing skills. On the other hand, Robinson (1982) is concerned that the teacher’s role in art and craft is complicated, as the task is not simply to let anything happen in the name of self expression or creativity or to impose rigid structures of ideas and methods upon the young learners. He maintains that the need is for a difficult balance of freedom and authority. Coles (1992) concurs with Robinson stating that “one of the most difficult problems that teachers have to resolve is concerned with the balance between the pupils’ freedom to explore and respond to experiences and the need to develop the appropriate learning skills” (p. 13). This is the problem of ‘nature’ versus ‘nurture’ as nurture deals with the education and care that teachers give to pupils and the way it affects their later development and attitudes while nature deals with the natural development of the child. Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) are for the aspect of “nature” which deals with the “natural artistic development” of a child at different ages whilst Barnes (2002) is for both “nature” and “nurture” theories. Although Barnes believes that pupils develop naturally in art, he also contends that nurture should also be considered to promote the skills they naturally have as nurture concept describes that the child’s development and attitudes are influenced by his or her environment.

It is important to note that too much freedom and reliance upon personal qualitative values could leave pupils confused and culturally disoriented. On the other hand, too much control could result in prescribed art and craft and restricting opportunities for creativity. Mallen’s (nd) contribution to the idea of teacher/pupil teaching and learning in art and craft at the ages later than 8 years of age in schematic stage (standards three and four in Botswana Education)
is that pupils at this stage require a great deal of sensitive encouragement from their teachers. He calls this stage the analytic stage whereby pupils’ work show a growing concentration on finely observed details. He therefore advocates that challenges be presented to pupils which call for real analysis in the form of first-hand investigation through looking, touching, feeling and discussion. Many art teachers according to Milbrandt, Felts, Richards and Abghari (2004) routinely employ facets of constructivists teaching and they give an example of Chanda and Basinger (2000) whom they say utilise art history constructivist inquiry methods to engage primary school children in the development of contextual understandings of African artworks. They further explain that these two constructivists note that “the art history constructivists inquiry methods used in the study provided a number of processes that possibly facilitated the children’s ability to move forward into hypothetical thought and preposition construction” (p. 21)

In S2 class, pupils found it easy to list materials used to build houses but some seemed confused when their teacher required them to list materials for decoration confusing wall decoration and decoration on the paper surface. Nevertheless, most of them followed when the teacher demonstrated the collage activity and discussed materials for making a collage and an example of a collage design in their CAPA textbook, although they were those who still had difficulties as they coloured their papers with crayons rather than pasting materials to create a collage when working on their collage task. B2 pupils actively participated mostly responding in English which the teacher mainly used in the teaching especially when discussing patterns on pictures of animals displayed on their classroom walls and those in pupil’s CAPA textbook. They could not define the concept ‘materials’ and state who creates the natural patterns found in the natural environment when required to do so by their teacher. In addition, instructions on the assigned activity to create patterns seemed to have not been
made clear to most of the pupils as the teacher repeatedly clarified what she meant verbally and with illustrations on the board as she moved around checking their work. In Mr Karee’s class (X4) pupils responded to most of the questions.

The other component in the observation schedule was on pupils’ evaluation of their art and craft work. As Mr Datha and Ms Mokwalo did not encourage their pupils to evaluate their work, one could conclude that pupils did not get sufficient feedback and hence did not recognise their strengths and weaknesses. Mr Datha collected pupils’ work and piled them on the table, whereas Ms Mokwalo told her pupils that they would display their artwork later. One could have expected pupils to discuss the elements of art and drawing techniques pupils practised and shared ideas looking at their strengths and weaknesses in drawing for future improvement and development of both the drawing skills and that of appreciating their work and that of others. Not emphasising techniques and processes of creating products and not involving pupils in the assessment of their performance and monitor their progress could result in them not developing the required skills at their level of learning which includes their stages of art development. For example, some of the pupils in the standard four case studies classes were making marks using any shape they could think of when drawing because there were no techniques and processes of drawing emphasised by their teachers. This resulted in some of the drawings showing characteristics which matched that of the pre-schematic stage (4-7 year olds) according to Barnes (2002) and colleagues. More of the analysis of pupils’ work will be discussed in chapter 7. Ms Mokwalo’s pupils would also have shared different designs of their patterns discussing the art elements they repeated to create those patterns. Thus, there is no evidence of these teachers recovering information of the knowledge and understanding acquired by their pupils on the application of what they taught including art and craft concepts. The two teachers who tried to engage their pupils in the evaluation of
their products did not consider the main aspects of the topics which included the art elements, principles of design, techniques and processes of what they created in their discussions. Most emphasis was on what pupils created and materials they used.

The 2002 Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) programme requires teachers to assess pupils both in formative and summative assessment. Thus, involving pupils in evaluating their art and craft work would help teachers to assess the knowledge and understanding of materials, tools and processes in making a product that pupils have acquired (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). This could be in the form of Formative Evaluation – Pupil/Teacher Direction Interaction recommended by art educationists. This method of evaluation is the most commonly used whereby the teacher and the pupil are both involved. In one to one situation the art process can be discussed and evaluated by both the teacher and the pupil. It will be effective if it is done through the pupil’s evaluative response to the work at their own level. The child’s evaluation of his or her work could be purely subjective or call upon shared knowledge and experience.

The teacher can foster the evaluative process through questions related to the way the child works and what has been made. Successive questions should take account of previous statements and should encourage the pupil to question and explore. As the exchange of questions and answers clarifies the pupil’s involvement, the teacher will be able to decide whether to give positive objective guidance or to develop the pupil’s perception through to extension of experience. Art education can only take place when both pupil and teacher are continuously involved within the evaluation of process and product. This can then form a basis for negotiated learning allowing for both freedom and control (Coles, 1992, p. 15).

In a group work situation such as in the case of X4 class whereby pupils drew in groups, the teacher could engage in formative evaluation referred to as Group/Teacher Direct Interaction whereby the teacher engages in a continual contact with individual pupils or through group
discussion to enable him or her to evaluate how effectively the group is responding to the art and craft in hand. Some of the questions the teacher should ask themselves are as follows: Do pupils understand? Is the task within their range of ability? Are they interested in what they are doing? Do pupils need more time to work on the activity? Do they need clarification? Do they need any form of guidance? Teachers frequently tend to judge group work from the evidence of their process and product, but I believe there is also a need to recapitulate and involve the group in the formative evaluation. “This will foster the development of personal appraisal and the evaluation of their own work in process. This is necessary in an arts activity where the individuals’ opinions are open. The level of freedom or control must be carefully monitored to avoid anarchy on one hand or group conformity on the other” (Coles, 1992, p.15). These two approaches to evaluation will inform the teachers’ summative evaluation by enabling them to guide their pupils on the basis of individual or group formative evaluation coupled with an overview of the art and craft curriculum needs.

This could be expanded further to include teachers bringing other artists and craft-workers’ work to class to support and extend pupils’ work. Pupils could be asked to critique this work and hence aid the teacher in evaluating the pupils’ understanding of the art concepts. By so doing, the teacher could also promote and develop pupils’ skills’ of appreciating other artists’ work as advocated by many art educationists such as Ragans (2000) and Barnes (2002) and the CAPA programme. Barnes (2002) further advises that talking to pupils about their art work helps teachers to understand the child artist’s work as young pupils sometimes create artwork which is only understood by them. Moreover:

the teacher’s summative evaluation or assessment of the pupil’s projects should include some consideration of the pupil’s ability to appraise his or her own work. This will ensure that evaluation is seen by all as an integral part of
the process of art education and not as a ‘bolt on activity’ unrelated to the whole process (Coles, 1992, p. 15).

Coles’ comments could be seen by many as much too dated but my experience as an art and craft educator is that practically, the technique of involving learners in the assessment of their work helps them develop the knowledge and understanding of the subject and hence promote their practical skills. As mentioned in chapter 3, the CAPA programme which includes art and craft curriculum requires teachers to construct tests and quizzes to assess pupils’ performance throughout the course. The document further emphasises that pupils should keep a record of these tests and summarise them as part of the term’s work for summative assessment. In addition teachers are required to construct termly tests for each standard to assess what pupils have attained throughout the course. “A national test based on the attainment targets will be conducted at the end of standard 4 by Examination Research and Testing Division (ERTD)” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p. 2). The question now could be: Did these teachers have the knowledge and skills of engaging pupils in the art and craft self-evaluation mode of evaluation which could be extended to their assessment of their art and craft work? This question emerged from the fact that the CAPA programme does not suggest activities teachers could engage in to assess the pupils’ performance in relation to the stipulated attainment targets. Engagement of pupils to evaluate both their work and that of other artists has not been mentioned although most art and craft educationists who studied child art see it as an effective way of understanding pupils’ art and craft work. In multicultural art and craft lessons such as the ones I observed, conversations with peers who hold different views or understandings of the world stimulate the values or constructions of meaning that grant new perspectives of the world.

Through critical discussions about art, students are challenged to consider crucial human questions regarding cultural images of what is true, beautiful,
and moral … and to construct or reconstruct their own understandings and values. … Teachers can guide students to engage in higher level of thinking through a variety of processes in the art classroom. The analysis, interpretation, and production of artworks engages students in many opportunities for decision-making as well as critical and creative thinking (Milbrandt, M.K., Felts, J. Richards, B. and Abghari, N. (2004, p. 21)

More information on this issue is in chapter 7 as teachers in the four case studies schools shared how they evaluated and assessed pupils’ art and craft work.

(c) Materials, tools and equipment

In art and craft, the fundamental resources for learning are in two types; the object which excite the child’s imagination and act as stimulus for learning and the media through which pupils can formulate and express their responses to them (Robinson, 1982). There are plenty of stimuli for expressive and creative activity and the teachers need to make them both available and accessible to their pupils through the organisation of a resource bank. This might include: bones, twigs, shells, tree roots, leaves, feathers, screws, fabric scraps and seeds. All these could be collected by both the teacher and pupils; sorted according to similarities such as man-made and natural objects or any other category then stored in various collection boxes and labelled. The specific objectives from the art and craft curriculum for all the topics taught in the four case study classes emphasised the exploration and the use of both natural materials and manmade or waste materials. This meant that teachers were required to consider the two types of materials when they engaged their pupils in activities such as pattern making, drawing and collage making. Natural materials refers to materials in nature whereas, man-made refers to waste or recycled materials.
As part of analysing the extent to which the teachers handled the art and craft curriculum, I observed how they were using the materials and tools for the lessons they taught. Ms Nkwita demonstrated the tasks given to pupils and used the available materials appropriately, whereas the other three did not demonstrate with the materials that pupils used. Ms Nkwita had adequate materials to demonstrate to her pupils how to make a collage by sticking found objects (waste materials) and natural materials on paper surface to create a collage of a hut. Mr Datha did not demonstrate the activity, except to produce the types of lines which he drew on the board with a piece of chalk as pupils listed them. Ms Mokwalo also illustrated pattern designs on the board with a piece of chalk to clarify the activity and Mr Karee demonstrated with chalk on the board how pupils should hold their pencils when drawing.

All the case study classes had their materials and tools ready for the lesson and at one stage Ms Nkwita sent her class out to collect more materials for their collage during the process of teaching. She also drew outlines on A4 plain papers to be used by pupils during the lesson, which consumed part of the class time. Nevertheless, she had collected various seeds for her class to use in their collage designs. Ms Mokwalo had a card box with various objects which she said she collected together with pupils. Art and craft work may be improved by good materials and tools. Resources need not to be expensive but should serve the purpose they are intended for. Lastly I observed how pupils handled the materials and tools when working on their tasks and all the pupils from all the four classes did not have any difficulty in using both the materials and tools apart from the glue that was used by S2 class which could not stick some of the objects to the paper surface. This was because the glue was not appropriate for the type of objects stuck except light papers.
The main problem in two out of four classes observed was inadequacy of materials. For example; there was one small bottle of office glue used by the whole of S2 class. This had an effect on the pupil’s learning because at one stage some of the pupils had to wait while their classmates were still using the glue. It was so little that it was not suitable to be shared in containers to be used in groups at least. Pupils struggled to apply it to their collage surfaces or objects to paste on the paper surface. During my conversation with the teacher, she said it was the only glue in school. I discovered that she was also not aware that the type of glue her pupils used was not suitable for the materials they were sticking or pasting. L4 also had a shortage of paper to the extent that his pupils used papers written on the other side. Otherwise most pupils in all the classes handled the tools and materials adequately. Teaching and learning in all subjects can be made more effective with adequate materials and teaching aids. Teachers could also resource their pupils to support and extend the work in progress by selecting works of art and craft from a bank of resources in books, postcards, slides, and reproductions. This will motivate pupils and the teacher can then try to extend the development by presenting his or her pupils with a range of examples of the work of artists and craft-workers which may support the pupils’ response or show other possible approaches. This work could be introduced to pupils in a cultural, social, artistic or historical context depending on the objectives of the lesson and criteria for pupils’ assessment of their products.

(d) Time factor

The observation schedule also included the aspect of the time factor to find out whether pupils would complete their activities within the planned time. Although it is difficult to prescribe the amounts of time to be spent on art and craft in primary schools, due to the combination of the four disciplines under the name CAPA, it is essential that the time
allowed is adequate for the task in hand. In both L4 and X4 pupils completed their tasks earlier than the assigned time. In contrast pupils in S2 and B2 did not complete their tasks. The standard two teachers tried to address more than one objective in a lesson whereas, the two standard four teachers addressed one objective not using the opportunity to address two or three objectives which relates to each other because all the five objectives under drawing topic could be addressed in one or two lessons. Pupils could be given a picture to interpret as an introduction before they draw which is the lower primary art and craft curriculum objective (2.1.2.3), then draw either an observation, memory or imagination structure or composition from man-made or natural arrangement (objective 2.1.1.2 & 2.1.2.2) and later shade their artwork (objective 2.1.1.1) (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department 2002). One could wonder how many topics they covered in art and craft at the end of the year if at all that was the system used looking at how art and craft curriculum was congested. Robinson (1982) contends that the careful use of time to allow for development of a variety of activities by individual and by groups of pupils is one aspect of the effective teaching of art and craft in primary schools.

However, the argument for covering more than one objective in a lesson does not undermine the teachers’ own styles of approaching lessons considering that this is an illuminative evaluation, but suggests that combining objectives could help cover most of the art and craft topics in the curriculum. This is to consider that Loso had offered CAPA which contains four disciplines, 3 hours per week for standards 1, 2 and 3 and 4 hours for standard 4 classes as shown in table 2. Selepe has allocated the CAPA subjects 2 hours to standards 1 and 2 and 3 hours to standards 3 and four, whereas Budzi and Xai allocated 2.5 hours to standards 1 and 2. 3.5 and 4 hours were allocated to standards 3 and 4 respectively.
5.5 Summary

- The data collected in this study has been analysed in relation to the CAPA programme.
- Information from other art and craft educationists has also been considered during the brief discussion of the findings.
- Data was presented, analysed and discussed in relation to the main aspects of the study which include: the teaching strategies, pupils’ involvement in the lesson, materials made available to pupils and how they were used and the time distribution in the lesson delivery.
- The chapter has advised that whether one’s art and craft activities take place in a specialist area or a classroom, it is worth thinking of providing and storing materials in a suitable storage such as crates and card boxes as one of the case study class-teachers did.
- The main findings of the observation sessions are that teachers used various methods in their teaching with an initial emphasis on a question and answer method. Three teachers were flexible in their approach, as they included other components they saw relative to their topics and not only focused on the ones stipulated by the art and craft curriculum.
- Two teachers seemed to see the art elements as important during the oral discussion with their pupils but they did not encourage their pupils to apply them during their practical work.
- Teachers seemed to put more emphasis on concepts of the topics omitting the techniques and processes of creating products which could develop pupils’ art and craft practical skills advocated by many art and craft educationists.
- Two teachers seemed to maintain the principle that pupils, if left to their own devices, develop artistically without the need for adult intervention as they did not engage with what their pupils were doing. However, this needs to be re-evaluated by the advice from
some of the art and craft educationists, who advocate that the balance between freedom and control is the greatest of the teachers’ professional responsibility.

- Teachers need to be aware that the total freedom can lead to anarchy whereas total control can result in dictatorship. Literature reveals that neither of these two strategies in isolation can provide a useful guide to the process of learning.

- A further observation was that although two teachers attempted involving their pupils in the discussion of their completed work, they seemed to be emphasising listing of the materials pupils’ used and not encouraging pupils to discuss the process involved when creating products.

- This chapter suggests that observation of pupils’ work is the starting point for any evaluation or assessment and this needs to be reinforced by encouraging pupils to be aware of their own processes and outcomes.

- Concerning the time factor, two classes were able to finish their tasks earlier than the allocated time, whereas some of the pupils in the remaining two classes were not able to complete their tasks.

- Finally, the chapter indicates that the effective teaching of art and craft in primary schools depends upon: the encouragement of expressive and creative activity in the curriculum modules; providing stimulating classroom environment; providing and accessing suitable materials and tools; the careful use of time; appropriate preparation and negotiating formative evaluation.

- The Creative and Performing Arts document tells teachers what to do and what should be covered but teachers need to know how to go about it in order to help pupils attain the stipulated attainment targets and hence develop the required skills at their level of learning.
The next chapter presents and analyses the second part of the collected data which was collected through interviews.
CHAPTER 6
DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS – INTERVIEW

6.1 Introduction

This chapter presents data about primary school teachers’ opinions regarding the implementation of the first art and craft curriculum at lower primary in Botswana. For the purpose of this report, data was generated from semi-structured individual interviews in Loso, Selepe, Budzi and Xai primary schools. A semi-structured method was the main strategy of collecting data for this study while an unstructured method was used prior to the initial interviews to help modify or add information to be acquired from teachers’ interviews. This is explained in detail in chapter 4. Interviews were conducted with 16 lower primary teachers including the 4 who were observed teaching art and craft lessons and two administrators in each school who were responsible for supervising this category. Four teachers were interviewed in each school, made up of one teacher from each category. This makes a total of 24 participants out of 56 members of staff in lower primary department for the four case study schools. Interestingly, seven of the eight administrators were also teaching the lower primary classes while the remaining one was teaching upper primary (standard seven). Among the seven administrators who taught lower primary, four taught standard one, one taught standard two, one standard three and the remaining one standard four. Moreover, three of the respondents who represented standard one, two and four class-teachers were also holding post of responsibilities as administrators. This was a significant proportion for my case study as it represented 43% of the total population of lower primary staff for the four case study schools. The interview conducted with teachers sought to find out how teachers approach and perceive the lower primary curriculum. Those conducted with the senior management staff established information on the teachers’ performance in the teaching of art
and craft at lower primary, how they view the art and craft lower primary curriculum and their input as administrators in the development of teachers in this area. They demonstrated in interview how their schools interpret the art and craft curriculum at lower primary. The administrators gave extended information on their pedagogical approach in addition to their observation on teachers’ art and craft approaches, especially those who were also teaching lower primary classes. Information from all these interviews has been interwoven in this chapter to give as complete a picture as possible of how the four primary schools conduct art and craft in their lower primary classes.

Class-teachers were interviewed individually prior to the senior staff who were also interviewed independently to triangulate class teachers’ responses. The responses from all the interviewees were interesting as they identified significant suggestions with regard to teaching and administering of art and craft subject especially when I probed a little further into what they thought might improve the teaching of art and craft at lower primary. This is section E item 11 in the interview schedule. The structure of the data presentation was in accordance with the categories or themes adopted during the collection stage. The presentation of this section includes:

i) a description of the respondents in some instances using tables and descriptions (Section A of the interview schedule),

ii) teachers’ views on art and craft in general (Section B of the interview schedule),

iii) teachers’ views on the implementation of the curriculum (Section C of the interview schedule),

iv) teachers’ preparedness to teach the art and craft curriculum (Section D of the interview schedule) and;
v) general comments about art and craft curriculum at lower primary level (Section E of the interview schedule).

The same questions were asked of both teachers and the senior staff (see item 1 to 11). However, in addition to answering the request of teachers to give information about their art and craft instruction, administrators were invited to share their experiences on teachers’ interpretation of the lower primary by virtue of their positions as supervisors. This information contributed to triangulating the teachers’ responses about approaches of the subject. Follow-up questions to the responses have been highlighted in bold and in an italicised format of writing as seen in appendix 5. In addition, comments are made to provide an insight into the mood and physical expressions displayed by the respondents during the conversations. These are also written in italics. A brief description and analysis of the case study schools has been outlined in chapter 2 and 4. Data from each section is presented and analysed before presenting the next section. As in chapter 5, brief comments will be made in this chapter and a full discussion guided by the research questions outlined in chapter 1 will be combined with that of the classroom observation findings in chapter 5 in the following chapter.

6.2 Description of Interviewees

This section sought to elicit personal details of the respondents in terms of gender, age, ethnic origin, years of teaching experience, academic and professional experience, post held in school, current class taught and experience in art and craft education. The tables which follow in this section, give various appropriate information about the teachers who were interviewed in the lower primary section. The information on the number of streams and staff in each level can be viewed in table 2, chapter 5. The respondents were of different sex and ages,
different qualifications ranging from Primary Teachers’ Certificate (PTC) to Bachelor of Arts in Music (BA Mus). Four of the participants were pursuing a Diploma in Education through a distance-learning mode; one specialising in physical education and the other specialising in art and craft. One participant did not have any teaching qualification and her highest education was General Certificate in Secondary Education (GCSE). Codes were created for each school for the purpose of research ethics. As in chapter 5 codes maintained as L, S, B and X which were the first letters of the names given to schools were used for each of the participant. Each class-teacher was given his or her school code with the number of the class level they were teaching whereas the administrative staff’s codes had their school codes and the first letter of their post of responsibilities as shown below: ‘S’ in the administrators’ codes refers to senior teacher while ‘H’ refers to head of department.

**Table 14: Loso primary school participants**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>standard 1 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>standard 2 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L3</td>
<td>standard 3 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>standard 4 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LH</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 15: Selepe primary school participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>standard 1 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>standard 2 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3</td>
<td>standard 3 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4</td>
<td>standard 4 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 16: Budzi primary school participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>standard 1 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>standard 2 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>standard 3 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
<td>standard 4 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BH</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17: Xai primary school participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X1</td>
<td>standard 1 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X2</td>
<td>standard 2 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X3</td>
<td>standard 3 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X4</td>
<td>standard 4 teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XH</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The participants’ details are recorded in 3 tables which include personal details, qualification and responsibilities to avoid confusion and will later be analysed. Information about the teachers’ personal details, qualifications and their responsibilities was interpreted as significantly contributing to this study as described in chapter 5.

Table 18: Abbreviations for participants’ professions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BA Mus</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts in Music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>Diploma in Primary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>General Certificate in Secondary Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>Generalist (having done art and craft education but not specialising during teacher training course).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPDE</td>
<td>National Professional Diploma in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JC</td>
<td>Junior Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>Primary Teacher’s Course.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 19: Gender, Age and Teaching Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Teaching yrs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L3</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LS</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LH</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Four of the 24 respondents were males and 20 were females. The participants’ ages ranged from 23 to 50. The above table shows that the majority of participants (58%) had more than 10 years experience, indicating a capacity to respond from background of considerable experience. Five respondents had three to 10 years of teaching experience who were also considerate enough to respond to questions; whereas the remaining 5 (21%) respondents had experiences ranging from 5 months to 2 years.
Table 20: Respondents’ Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Academic Qualification</th>
<th>Completion Year</th>
<th>Profession Qualification</th>
<th>Completion Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L3</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L5</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>BA (Mus)</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LH</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S5</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>NPDE</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B5</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BH</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X1</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X2</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X3</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X4</td>
<td>GCSE</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X5</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1975</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XH</td>
<td>JC</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>1988</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 20 above reveals the highest academic and professional qualifications of the respondents and the year completed. This information was pertinent to this study in the sense that I gained knowledge of whether these teachers were trained to teach in primary school prior to the introduction of the art and craft lower primary curriculum and hence establishing what was their highest academic level when discussing the findings. Phibion (2006) believes that teachers’ qualifications influence their teaching strategies. According to the table, 14
respondents held the General Certificate in Secondary School (GCSE) and 10 held junior certificate (JC). A majority (50%) possessed a certificate in primary education, followed by 42% who had Diploma in primary education. One respondent held a Bachelor of Arts in Music (BA Mus) which was the highest qualification among others and the remainder was untrained for teaching. 15 among 24 participants had completed their academics in the past ten or more years while one could not remember the completion date where I have written (N/A). 11 out of 12 PTC holders had graduated the past 10 or more years while the degree holder graduated in 2006. The remaining Diploma holders’ graduation period ranged from 5 months to 4 years. Four of the respondents who held PTC were pursuing their Diploma through distance-learning and among them two were specialising in art and craft Education.

Table 21: Responsibilities in School and art and craft experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>Position held</th>
<th>Class taught</th>
<th>Art and craft qualification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>Senior Teacher (ii)</td>
<td>Standard 1</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>Senior Teacher (ii)</td>
<td>Standard 2</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L3</td>
<td>Class Teacher</td>
<td>Standard 3</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L4</td>
<td>Senior Teacher (ii)</td>
<td>Standard 4</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen) Education (In Progress)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher (i) Practical</td>
<td>Standard 7</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LH</td>
<td>HOD (Middle)</td>
<td>Standard 4</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen) in Education (In Progress)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>Class Teacher</td>
<td>Standard 1</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>Class Teacher</td>
<td>Standard 2</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3</td>
<td>Class Teacher</td>
<td>Standard 3</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4</td>
<td>Class Teacher</td>
<td>Standard 4</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Senior Teacher (i)</td>
<td>Standard 2</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH</td>
<td>HOD</td>
<td>Standard 3</td>
<td>Diploma (Gen)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21 above shows participants’ responsibilities and their experience in art and craft. The information gathered helped when discussing the findings in both observation and interview in relation to how teachers interpret the art and craft curriculum at lower primary. Three respondents held senior teacher (ii) post which unlike senior teacher (i) did not allow them access to administration responsibilities. They were awarded however, a higher salary scale benefit than other class-teachers. These teachers taught standard 1, 2 and 4 respectively. 10 respondents were class-teachers without any post of responsibility apart from teaching lower primary pupils while the remaining 11 were administrators for lower primary, holding posts of head of department (HoD) middle classes and senior teacher practical subjects respectively and hence supervisors for teachers at that level. The HoD for middle classes was also responsible for lower primary during my visit since the usual teacher was absent. She was able to capably represent the absent administrators as she was also teaching lower primary (standard 4) which was the focus of the study. The other administrator taught upper primary
(standard 7). 58% of these respondents did not study art and craft either during schooling or their teacher training course. Among them were class-teachers who were observed teaching the subject. Eight respondents among whom three were administrators studied art and craft as generalists during their training in Diploma course and one administrator and a class-teacher were studying art and craft as generalists through distance-learning. Two administrators were pursuing it as specialists. Since the study was an investigation of the art and craft curriculum at lower primary, these teachers’ opinions were central even though given the organisation of the Botswana primary school system where teachers shift from class to class, it was likely that those at other stages might have had experience at lower primary and all may have had knowledge and opinions of art and craft practices at this level.

6.3 Teachers’ responses to the interview

The participants taught all primary school subjects, which included art and craft and other Creative and Performing Arts subjects at lower primary classes as required by the Botswana Ministry of Education, with the exception of one administrator who taught an upper class (standard 7). Below is a summary of the main outcomes from responses made in these interviews. (See appendix 3 and 4). Extracts from individual participant responses under each theme are at first presented in appendix 5 and then analysed and discussed in this section as a group in relation to each theme to avoid repetition of similar responses to a question. Among these respondents, L4, S2, B2 and X4 are from the case study classes.

6.3.1: Teachers’ views on art and craft in general

The first item asked under this theme was what the respondents understood art and craft terms to mean. Eight (33%) of the respondents viewed art as the expression of feelings and
thoughts either through drawing, painting, or singing; three viewed it as work done by hands; six gave examples of artwork as drawing, moulding, painting, designing, mosaics rather than defining the concept art while the rest viewed it as, the creative subject, something practical, something which decorates, what we do in life, things of nature and to be creative in drawing, painting, singing and making paper mosaics. Like art, craft was viewed as something practical by twelve (half) respondents with nine emphasising that it is work done by hands. Seven of the respondents were of the view that craft refers to the ability to create sculptures, weaving, designs or carving. Four stated that craft is the use of scraps to create something of value, putting something together to come up with a concrete thing and to mould. The remainder said she did not know anything about craft.

Out of twenty-four interviewees, sixteen (67%) believed that art and craft can be a career and create employment; hence it can help society by earning a living by selling products that individuals have created such as paintings, drawings and crafts (item 2). Self reliant is among the four principles advocated by the government of Botswana (Ministry of Education, National Commission on Education, 1997). Four participants were of the view that art and craft communicates ideas and feelings to the community or society including maintaining and retaining culture to be transferred to the new generation. LH and X4 went to the extent of giving examples of billboards created to sensitise people to issues such as HIV/AIDS. There was evidence that respondents were informed on the issue of enabling pupils to communicate their culture and hence learning other people’s cultures from the products such as basketry, sculptures and costume included within Attainment Target 1 (1.3) of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) in the 2002 lower primary syllabus in which art and craft is inclusive and one of the aims of the Primary Education Programme stipulated in the same syllabus. The aspect of culture and tradition appreciation is also emphasised in the aims of the
ten-year basic education programme which the curriculum also included in the introduction of the 2002 lower primary syllabus for teachers to consider in their instruction of all the subjects in the primary school curriculum. Three participants were of the view that art is everywhere and gave examples of colours of clothes we choose, designs on houses and functional objects as the rationale for art in the society. The remaining interviewee (S3) could not respond to the question despite several invitations to do so.

When I raised the question on the importance of art and craft education to the primary school child (item 3), among the twenty-four respondents, 2 believed that it develops and increases learners’ creativity; nineteen (79%) were of the view that it develops pupils’ art and craft skills and talents basics at lower level which they can later use at higher stages as they progress to higher education. The acquired skills were believed to benefit pupils on completion of their primary education or higher education to create products to earn a living. One of these respondents emphasised that she had observed that there were children who were below average in other subjects but doing well in art and craft therefore, when they went to a higher institution (secondary school) they could use the knowledge and skills they acquired in primary school to make the right choices in areas of specialisation and hence develop their careers. One of them claimed that because of lack of materials and time the subject was not taught appropriately therefore children did not benefit sufficiently from it. After several prompts she mentioned that if there were adequate materials pupils would acquire various skills which they could later apply for further studies or making their own living. She was so emotional when talking about lack of materials which she saw as a big barrier to the teaching and learning of the subject. Two respondents believed that studying art and craft can develop pupils’ critical skills whereby they could later relate what they have learnt to their day to day lives. For example; ‘mixing colour to create the real colour of an
animal when painting its picture’. Says one of them. The last participant viewed art and craft as a subject which arouses children’s interest including slow learners giving an example of the ‘letter design’ lesson she had just taught that all the pupils were actively involved.

As in any other curriculum, one would expect the Botswana art and craft curriculum to have emerged or developed in line with the guidelines of the country’s education policies and other principles. I therefore asked teachers a question about one of the government’s latest documents (Vision 2016 – Towards Prosperity for all), how well they thought its pillars were represented in art and craft curriculum for lower primary (item 4). Most of the respondents could not remember any of these pillars except recounting that there was a document by that name. As I did not require them to give a list, I reminded them so that they could identify the ones they believe were addressed by the curriculum. The pillars are as follows:

By the year 2016 Botswana will be:

- an educated and informed nation
- a prosperous, productive and innovative nation
- a compassionate, justice and caring nation
- a safe and secure nation
- an open, democratic and accountable nation
- a moral and tolerant nation
- a united and proud nation

(Republic of Botswana, 1997)

As mentioned in chapter two, the government has advised all Botswana sectors to adhere to the ones relevant to their departments only in this case; teachers were advised during the interview, to only focus on the ones relevant to education. Thereafter, I went back to the
question in which twenty one (88%) respondents mentioned that the pillars were addressed
giving example of ‘an educated and informed nation’, and ‘prosperous, productive and
innovative nation’. They also emphasised ‘self-reliant’ as one of the pillars confusing the
pillars with the national principles which include self-reliance’. Among these respondents, six
were not sure whether the pillars were addressed but assumed they were; one said they were
partially addressed as not all objectives addressed them while one only mentioned that they
were addressed but could not identify any specific pillar. The remaining three did not respond
to the question appropriately despite further requests for a response, rather emphasising their
pupils’ success in art and craft competitions while the other stressed that the curriculum was
fine except that the subject was not taken seriously to the extent that they teach other subjects
during the time allocated to art and craft. She contradicted later by saying there was not
enough time for art and craft as a discipline. One among the three could not recall any pillar
and mentioned that she did not know whether the two documents relate.

6.3.2 Teachers’ views on the implementation of the Curriculum

As mentioned in chapter 4, administrators responded to these items by virtue of their
positions as supervisors to share their experiences in assessing teachers in their individual
schools. One question I asked of all respondents was how the introduction of the curriculum
improved their teaching (item 5). Twenty (83%) respondents believed that the curriculum has
made changes to the traditional way of approaching art and craft lessons by reducing the
confusion teachers had felt before its introduction since most believed that it was only about
drawing and painting, some treating it as a therapy while others used it as a vehicle for other
subjects. Some of the changes the curriculum was believed to have brought were as follows:
• There is a guideline on what to teach with teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks to refer to.

• Unlike in the past where pupils only used to be given theory in art and craft lessons and told what to do, now the curriculum advocates for learners to be allowed to explore art and craft media and techniques and hence develop their manipulative and other art and craft skills.

• Pupils below average in academic work have the opportunity to pursue further studies specialising in art and craft rather than be seen to be failures in life.

• It enables teachers and pupils to gain knowledge and understanding of the subject to the extent that teachers are able to assess pupils’ work and give positive comments rather than discouraging comments and dispensing with it unmarked.

• Teachers now understand the value of art and craft in people’s lives unlike in the past when teachers taught the subject to decorate the classrooms.

• The subject is now formally taught in classrooms and allocated more time and timetabled unlike in the past when it was taught once a week or term.

Among these respondents, L3 and B3 mentioned that they had never taught before the introduction of the curriculum. However, they shared their primary school experiences that when studying in primary schools there was no art and craft curriculum unlike now where they have guidelines on what to teach (Appendix 3, item 5). BS who was an administrator also shared her experience when studying in a primary school although she taught before the introduction of the curriculum and was of the view that the curriculum partly changed art and craft education in the primary school. Her argument was that the curriculum has improved the education system in the sense that in the past only drawing and painting were believed to be art and the curriculum included many items which they did not know to be art. On the other
hand, she felt that the way the curriculum was designed introduced a lot of challenges to teaching and needed experts in the area or else the curriculum would not be able to implement them. Three respondents (S1, X2, X3) mentioned that they never taught before the introduction of the curriculum and therefore they had difficulties in comparing the past and present; two saying they were not taught art and craft in primary school and their colleague believing the curriculum could be helpful if there were no barriers such as lack of materials. The remaining respondent (SS) an administrator felt there was no improvement at all since they lacked materials to teach the subject. These findings concur with Phibion’s (2006) findings as he stipulates that some respondents were concerned that:

CAPA has brought no difference except to combine subjects that already exist in the syllabus. Some saw no difference in the teaching of these grouped subjects because they feel subjects are taught separately like in the old syllabus. Some respondents are of the opinion that subjects need specialisation and they should be separated (p. 10).

Phibion’s (2006) findings further reveal that however, they were those teachers who believed the programme brought some changes in the teaching and learning as he says they find the CAPA being attached to the following aspects: helping pupils to identify and develop their potential in practical subjects at an early age of education; assisting teachers in channelling the pupil’s talent in the correct future field of study; equipping learners with basic generic knowledge in practical subjects’ skills so that those who do not succeed in theory could rely on them; helping pupils develop an understanding and appreciation of the arts including culture and develop vocational skills for future careers.

The question on approaches (item 6) was deliberately included because approaches teachers applied were believed to can determine their knowledge and understanding of art and craft education and hence the ability to interpret both the CAPA programme and the art and craft
curriculum in relation to other educational documents and government policies as per suggested hierarchy below:

```
National Principles
    ↓
Vision 2016
    ↓
RNPE 1994
    ↓
Aims of 10-year Basic Education Programme
    ↓
Aims of the 7-year Primary Education Programme
    ↓
Aims of Lower Primary CAPA
    ↓
CAPA Attainment Targets
    ↓
Art and Craft General Objectives
    ↓
Art and Craft Specific Objectives
```

The teaching strategies teachers used to teach art and craft therefore were expected to be planned in a way that they could enable the learners to achieve the above aspects. These characteristics have been discussed at length in chapter 7 when discussing the findings. The responses to this item indicated that most (twelve) teachers taught both indoors and outdoors depending on the topics. Examples given were that pupils were taken out in topics like
texture in order to observe texture first-hand in the environment and collage to collect materials. This was confirmed by five administrators who also mentioned that teachers used both indoor and outdoors approaches to their lessons. Four teachers stated that they only use indoors with various justifications to their approach which included because of limited time, lack of transport to take pupils outside the school, the curriculum was still new and they were still familiarising themselves with it and they had a lack of materials. This was confirmed by two administrators one (SS) saying she has never seen pupils in her school taught outside their classrooms and LS saying they were never taught outside because the curriculum was still new to them and they were not familiar with it.

However, those who stated that lessons were sometimes taught outside explained that it was only done in the school locality which indicates that none of the teachers took pupils out into the community or art and craft centres to learn art and craft except one (X1) teacher and two administrators (BS, XH) who mentioned that teachers sometimes took pupils to the community; X1 saying they were taken outside to collect traditional clay, BS saying they visited people working with leather. XH did not state the reason why pupils were taken to the community. All the respondents revealed that they had not involved artists or craft-workers in their planning and teaching of the subject although B4 mentioned that she once tried to invite two locals to work with pupils when dealing with the topic of ‘Construction’ in which they were to work with wire but could not succeed because of insufficient materials in their school. Reasons given for not involving outsiders were as follows:

- They consulted colleagues in the school for assistance.
- They did not know how to have access to the artists and craft-workers.
- Lack of transport.
They had not considered it.

They had not come across any topic that needed pupils to be taken elsewhere.

Time limitation.

The arrangement is complicated and stressful as it requires involvement of the council.

They did not know any artist or craft-worker in the locality.

Lack of funds.

The item on integration (item 7) was included considering that four disciplines (art and craft, music, physical education and design and technology) were combined as one subject called Creative and Performing Arts with attainment targets grouped together. Each subject was termed a module and each had its own general and specific objectives but it was not clear how teachers should approach the programme. Instead, there was a general statement in the foreword page which stipulates that subjects in the lower primary syllabus were put together to facilitate project teaching and integration which sounds like the purpose of putting them together was to use them as tools to achieve the project teaching and integration across the curriculum approaches advocated by the Botswana education system. However, in response to this question, nineteen (79%) respondents among twenty-four mentioned that they did not integrate the CAPA subjects. Three among them said they did not have reasons for that while the other sixteen gave varying reasons as follows:

- They do not relate.
- Teachers are not sure of what to teach and how to approach the CAPA modules.
- The modules in the lower primary syllabus had separated them.
- Not aware of the integration.
- In order to concentrate on the one to teach for the day as the modules separate them.
• If integrated there will be a mix up and pupils will not grasp information taught.
• To avoid confusion so that children master objectives for each topic before proceeding to the other.
• These subjects are different therefore can not relate well when integrated.
• Just agreed to do it in school without any reason.
• It makes it easier for both the teacher and pupils to understand rather than when combining them.
• They are individual subjects although combined in the CAPA programme.
• The objectives for these subjects are separated in the CAPA programme.
• When joining school I found it like that and I never questioned but just followed suit.
• Pupils will understand better that way because the CAPA programme is a problem and very difficult for them to comprehend and if one can mix or jumble the content they will have problems.

Six of the eight administrators (LS, LH, SS, BS, BH, and XS) were among the nineteen teachers who said the arts were not integrated when taught at lower primary level. Four respondents among them two administrators (SH and XH) stated that teachers sometimes integrate the modules when necessary; where they relate and like other respondents they gave various reasons for integration which are listed below:

• It helps pupils recall what was taught more readily.
• When taught separately some of the objectives will not be covered therefore those related need to be integrated.
• They go hand in hand; there is no difference.
Some of the objectives are similar although from different themes in CAPA and when combined, the teacher ‘had killed many birds with one stone’. When you take them one by one the year ends before finishing the CAPA topics.

The remaining respondent (L3) stated that they integrate them in their school but could not give any reason for that. A follow up question was posed to the five respondents who mentioned that they sometimes integrate the arts subjects to find out how those disciplines were integrated. These are the responses from three respondents while the other two could not explain how they integrated them:

- By following objectives of all the CAPA disciplines.
- Most of the standard two notes are pictures as they cannot read.
- It depends on the topic taught for the day. Integration is done where subjects from these four disciplines relate or else they are taught separately.

Since I was concerned to discover how the five hours recommended by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit might fit into the four CAPA subjects bearing in mind how far art and craft curriculum appeared to be congested, I included item 8 to find out from teachers the duration they allocated to CAPA especially art and craft in relation to the 5 hours minimum suggested by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation department (See the 2002 lower primary syllabus page 1). When responding to this question, all case studies teachers except two (S2 and X4) concurred that the time for CAPA was not enough as the syllabus was congested. They gave various responses on this aspect in which some of the time allocated to CAPA was said to be less than five hours suggested by the CAPA programme as indicated in the findings notes in appendix 5 item 8. Nineteen (79%) respondents shared their experiences on the distribution of the times allocated to CAPA in
their stream while three said there was no order, it was a free style. The remaining two had difficulties to explain how the time was distributed to the four subjects despite further questioning as they said they were not sure. This includes the administrator (LH) who said she did not know the difference between CAPA and art and craft except for assuming that the time was not enough by looking at the congestion of the programme. She trusted that L4 as a specialist in CAPA could not have any difficulty in distributing the time. The list below shows the statements from nineteen respondents on how the time was distributed:

- There is no order as we sometimes give one hour to one subject, the other 30 minutes and vice-versa.
- You find that one concentrates on one subject which he or she is competent and confident in and allocates it 5 hours while other subjects suffer.
- Teacher picks one topic from a module to teach in a week and allocates it 5 hours.
- Each module is allocated one hour per week and the fifth hour is timetabled on the last day of the week to cover for the module which lagged behind.
- Normally do not teach all these subjects/modules in one week. Teach music and art and craft in a week and others the other week.
- Allocates five hours to the topic taught in each week.
- Allocates five hours to one subject taught every week ‘because I teach one CAPA module every week’.
- There is no uniformity on how CAPA should be distributed in school; it is a free style.
- Teach one module for example art and craft weekly and allocate it five hours.
- In standard one and two CAPA is awarded two and a half hours therefore pick a topic and teach it for a week awarding it two and a half hours.
Teach one CAPA subject per a week and award it three hours because CAPA is awarded three hours only in their school.

Pick two topics from one module and teach it for a week awarding it three hours.

The syllabus has suggested five periods which is two and a half hours therefore standard one teachers make their own timetable and award CAPA two double periods and one single period. Some of them award it one double and three single periods as the syllabus requires it to be taught daily. ‘If the teacher teaches a module in a certain week he or she allocates it two and half hours and do the same to all the modules in the CAPA syllabus.

Teachers select a topic from one module and allocate it five hours because usually one topic lasts for a week.

CAPA is allocated thirty minutes for five days which is two and a half hours therefore one subject is taught per a day and awarded thirty minutes.

CAPA is awarded two and half hours per a week in a standard two stream and the whole of this time is allocated to one of the subjects per a week.

The school administrators have only awarded CAPA three hours per a week for standard threes in the master timetable and ‘I teach one subject for a week and then proceed to the other awarding the subject three hours’.

CAPA is allocated three and a half hours per a week and teachers pick a topic for one module and teach for a week and after covering its objectives they go o to the other module and do the same allocating the subject its three and a half hours.

Two and a half hours is allocated to standard's one to three and they allocate the time looking at the quantity of the content. They teach according to objectives picking objectives from one theme and addressing them one by one.
The two class-teachers who mentioned that there was no order on how to distribute the hours allocated to CAPA highlighted that sometimes they give one hour to one subject, the other 30 minutes to the other and vice versa and that one concentrates on one subject he or she is competent in and allocates it five hours ignoring others. The administrator (SH) who was in agreement with them about the flexibility of allocation of time said the CAPA programme suggests 10 periods which is five hours per week but they have cut it to 4 to suit their working hours so as not to overlap to two o’clock and that it is flexible, every teacher divides the hours according to his or her needs as long as the four hours are allocated to the four CAPA subjects per week. As there was a master timetable in the school-heads’ office, with the school heads’ permission, I managed to copy information which showed CAPA time allocation at lower primary level for each stream which will be referred to later when discussing the findings.

Furthermore, the question on assessment (Item 9) was asked of respondents to find out how they interpret or implement the assessment procedures (formative and summative) stipulated in the lower primary syllabus in relation to art and craft education. The requirement reads:

teachers are required to construct tests and quizzes to assess learners’ performance throughout the course. It is important that teachers keep a record of these tests and summarise them as part of the term’s work for summative assessment (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p. 2).

The results to this item revealed that all the class-teachers gave pupils art and craft activities both theory and practical but only seven said they assessed it. They concurred with SH who also stated that teachers in her school assessed both theory and practical work. Thirteen participants including five administrators (SS, BS, BH, XS and XH) contended that only theory work was assessed giving reasons such as; lack of resources such as papers, limited
knowledge in the subject, no guideline on how to do it, just because they found the school doing it and the staff having negative attitudes towards the subject. This was marked contrast with S4 and one administrator (LS), who said there was no assessment in art and craft at all except when pupils entered competitions because the subject is not basic and that teachers had limited knowledge in the subject. The remaining participant (LH) was not sure but assumed teachers assessed it monthly like any other subject in the curriculum. However she stated that she did not do it herself.

A follow up question was posed to find out how teachers encouraged their pupils to talk about their work and that of others. The question was found to be vital to the study considering requirement 1.5 under CAPA Attainment Target ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ from the lower primary syllabus which stipulates that at the end of lower primary education, learners should have “acquired knowledge and understanding of basic principles and concepts applied in Creative and Performing Arts” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p. 3). Thus, one way of assessing their knowledge and understanding of the art and craft concepts could have been through their discussion of their work and that of others for example, talking about a painting looking at warm and cool colours used, tone, and how other art elements such as line, texture, shape and principles of design are used in a drawing. As they talk about their work they would be expected to use the theory or concepts they learnt and hence teachers would have been in a position to identify both pupils’ and their strengths and weaknesses through their learners’ feedback. This technique was also expected if used to help teachers assess their pupils through formative assessment as per the 2002 lower primary school requirement under CAPA disciplines. The responses to this item showed that 63% of the respondents involved pupils in the evaluation of their work through various approaches which included open discussions, comparing and
criticising their work in groups, identifying attractive or beautiful pieces of work, discussions prompted by teachers’ questions on materials used and processes followed to make their products. However, there was no evidence in interviewees’ responses which could convince one that they were aware that art elements and principles were the language of art which should be emphasised in the description or critiquing of art and craft work.

The most common system of assessment used of pupils’ theory and practical work was grading pupils’ through figures (marks) such as five out of 10 or percentages (%) according to the results with few of the teachers saying they attached comments such as ‘good’, ‘keep it up’, and ‘excellent’ to the marks the pupils gained. L2 and B2 said they did not award marks to practical work because every work is good. B2 explained this by saying she just writes ‘good’ but when questioned further she could not come up with a clear criterion they used in assessing practical work. L2 mentioned that she did it by asking pupils questions about their pictures and then awarded them marks for their responses. Considering that the assessment procedure requirement also included that teachers should keep a record of tests and summarise them as part of the term’s work for summative assessment, a follow-up question was posed to find out how teachers keep records of their pupils’ progress in art and craft. Eighteen (75%) mentioned that they kept their records in figures (marks) mostly at the end of the scheme book. L2 was worried that some of the teachers did not keep files because of apparent lack of interest which resulted in tailoring marks for pupils that might give wrong information about the learner’s progress in contrast with her administrator LH who said all the teachers kept records of all the subject in files for any teacher to refer to when necessary. This is the administrator who mentioned that she was not sure whether teachers assess art and craft and that she was not doing it herself.
As the teachers’ difficulties in handling the subject was one of my hypotheses, I included teachers’ preparedness as a theme to identify the extent to which they were prepared to handle the art and craft curriculum (section D, item 10) and also to hear from the senior authority if indeed they had problems with this module. I did not only want to rely on the observation of lessons I did only for a day in each class because as a teacher trainer, I believe that for one to identify the teacher’s strengths and weaknesses in teaching, they should observe their lessons at least three times. The results show that twenty-two (92%) respondents mentioned that art and craft materials were inadequate. The most used reference was the CAPA pupils’ textbooks and teachers’ guides although some of the respondents were concerned that they were limited with a serious case for L4 who mentioned that they had only one copy of pupils’ textbook for standard four classes which was the teacher’s copy and some who did not have them altogether using un-prescribed textbooks from various publishers. Few teachers had additional references like art and craft modules for teachers in distant learning. Some of the problems mentioned were as follows:

- Textbooks not covering all the topics and also missing some of the information in topics they address and so pupils getting confused with the additional information from their teachers.
- Some of the textbooks either above or below the learners’ ability or level.
- Irrelevant information from some of the text-books in relation to curriculum topics.
- Some topics, objectives and content very difficult to both teachers and pupils.
- Lacking knowledge and skills in art and craft although four of them claimed not to be having any problems with the content.
- Inadequate information in both textbooks and teachers’ guides.
- Some of the illustrations not well explained.
- Pupils’ text-books not detailed.
- Some of the concepts not fully explained and the process of how to go about an activity.
- Inappropriate classrooms for art and craft.
- Time allocated to CAPA subjects inadequate to cover all the topics in the curriculum at the end of the year.

However, six participants (L2, B1, B2, X1, X3 AND X4) mentioned that they did not have any problem with the curriculum except that they lacked materials to teach the subject. Among them three (B1, X3 and X4) had done art and craft as generalists at a primary training college while the other three (L2, B2 and X1) had a primary teachers’ certificate which they gained before the formal introduction of the art and craft curriculum and so the subject had not been effectively taught or not taught at all in some colleges. Despite all the difficulties teachers had, they had never had any in-service training in art and craft except SS, SH, B4 and B4 who highlighted that they attended a workshop on the CAPA programme organised by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation unit not specifically for art and craft but for all the lower primary CAPA subjects. The workshop according to the respondents was to launch the standard one to four CAPA programme and it required them to identify problematic objectives and try to explain some of them in which they got help and developed confidence in the subject. Among the eight administrators LS and XS explained that they had organised workshops for their streams to discuss art and craft issues. When administrators were asked how much confidence they had in assessing teachers in art and craft, half (50%) of the respondents said they were confident while the other half (LH, SS, SH and BS) mentioned that there were not because they lacked knowledge and skills in the subject although only one (LS) said she had assessed her teachers in art and craft that year. LH further said it was because she was new to the school while XS said only heads of department
were required to observe teachers’ lessons while they could only check scheme of work and lesson plans.

6.3.3 General comments about the art and craft curriculum

Item 11 required informants to give suggestions they felt could help improve the art and craft curriculum or the teaching of the subject at lower primary. The item was included to give respondents a chance to suggest solutions to the problems they raised in item 10. These suggestions were also considered when making recommendations for my study. The summary of the main suggestions which tallied with problems raised were:

- Adequate materials to be supplied to schools including teachers’ references and pupils’ textbooks.
- Art and craft teachers should be sent to school to specialise because there are objectives which give teachers problems.
- In-service training for teachers.
- Simplifying content in pupils’ textbooks.
- Reduction of topics and objectives from the curriculum. That is topics appearing in one level should not appear on other levels for example if there is painting in standard one, it should not appear again in other levels to reduce the teaching load as there is not enough time to cover all topics at the end of the year.
- Reduce load for teachers by allocating each teacher one subject to teach to the whole lower primary level so as to be accountable for its results.
- Teachers to adhere to the requirement which calls for proper handover of pupils’ progress from one teacher to another so that they know their pupils better.
• Primary school teachers to be the ones developing the primary school curricula.

• More specialists teachers to be brought for each CAPA subject.

• Criteria for assessment of pupils’ art and craft work should be supplied to teachers.

• The curriculum to include more theoretical objectives than practical ones so as to help teachers when they set tests because they will be enough content to set from.

• Art and craft to be tested or examined at standard seven level like other subjects so as to be observed and effectively taught.

• Purpose-built buildings which include art and craft studios should be considered in primary schools.

• Teachers to be equipped with techniques of assessing art and craft.

• Simplify art and craft jargon in the curriculum.

• Curriculum developers to monitor the teaching of the subject to see to it that it is effectively taught.

• Pupils to be exposed to art and craft outside the classroom to see how it is applied in real life and its benefits.

• Larger classrooms to be built as there is not enough space to teach art and craft practically.

• The subject to be taken seriously just from the top people in the education system who are responsible for distributing the materials.

• Both theory and practice to be tested because art and craft is a practical subject.

• There should be more emphasis on the practical part because young children recall or learn better when they see things and touch them rather than been told about something.

• Teachers need to be shown the value of art and craft so as to take it seriously.

• One respondent did not give any suggestions saying that the curriculum was still new and she was still familiarising herself with it.
6.3.4 Comments on the interview findings.

As stated at the beginning of this chapter a brief comment will be made on the interview findings under each theme and more discussion will be included in chapter 7 looking at both the classroom observation and interview findings in relation to the research questions. More focus will be on the teachers’ views on the implementation of the art and craft curriculum and their preparedness to teach art and craft curriculum at lower primary level as they are the key components of the study. The results revealed that none of the case study teachers interviewed specialised in the art and craft discipline. However, 42% of the participants confirmed that they did art and craft as non-specialists during their diploma training. As mentioned in chapter five, I could not identify those who could have specialised in art and craft in each school, so as to have representative specialists in the subject. This finding identifies the need for the Ministry of Education to consider sending more primary school teachers for further training as specialists in this area; developing strategies which can encourage teachers to opt for art and craft when sent for in-service and pre-service training in teacher training institutes.

6.3.4.1 Respondents’ understanding of the terms, art and craft

Considering Barrett’s (1979) argument that any definition of art is by the nature of the subject incomplete and open to dispute, I take it that all respondents had an idea of what art and craft is (item 1) to the extent that some viewed art as something that can be used to communicate ideas and feelings. Some gave examples and purposes of art and craft rather than definitions as it can be seen in appendix 5 item 1. This is still covered by Barrett’s experience of how different art and craft theorists view these two terms as he says their definitions are constructed to fit any hypothesis which follows. In addition both the concepts were viewed
as something practical as respondents emphasised craft to be the use of hands. However, some of the respondents were advanced as they seemed to concur with most artists and craft workers such as Ragans (2000) and Havens (2002) who described craft as work of art that have functional purpose which includes weaving and sculptures such as pottery which are created for use. There is only one participant (L3) who viewed art and craft as a practical subject and had a difficulty of differentiating them. This is the untrained teacher who was teaching standard 3 class (see table 4).

Although the results record that none of the participants specialised in art and craft and only 42% did it as generalists, it was gratifying to learn that there was evidence that teachers valued art and craft’s potential to develop citizens who are capable of sustaining themselves and contribute to the well-being of their families and communities from the respondents either through communication through art and craft or selling created products to earn a living. All of them except one who could not respond to the question gave interesting responses on the value of art and craft both in the society and to the primary school child (item 2 and 3). More emphasis was on art and craft as of benefit to people by developing careers which could create jobs and hence lead to the citizens been self-reliant as per appeal by the Botswana government. All responses interviewees gave in these items were in relation to the educational documents and government policies listed in section 6.3.2. For example, all the documents except ‘Vision 2016’ emphasise the development of independent and self-reliant nation; ‘Vision 2016’ and the ‘ten year basic education programme’ call for the educated and informed, productive and innovative and accountable nation and all the documents advocate for the preservation of culture and tradition. However, most of the respondents seemed to be unfamiliar with some of these important documents which are addressed by all the programmes in the curriculum including all sectors outside the education
system in the country as according to government policy. This was evidenced by those who could not relate the curriculum to the latest government document ‘Vision 2016’ and could not recall any of the document’s pillars. Most of them seemed to confuse the vision 2016 pillars with one of the national principles ‘self-reliant’.

Understanding and becoming sensitive to the work of other people is important in cultural education for the reasons described by Robinson (1982) below: He describes a cultural education as one which:

- helps pupils to understand cultural diversity by bringing them into contact with the attitudes, values and institutions of other cultures as well as exploring their own;
- emphasises cultural relativity by helping them to recognise and compare their own cultural assumptions and values with these others;
- alerts them to the evolutionary nature of culture and the potential for change;
- encourages a cultural perspective relating contemporary value to the historical forces which moulded them.

My experience as a teacher and teacher trainer in Botswana primary school departments is that art and craft history and studio practice teaching have since not been observed in art and craft education. Pupils have been leaving schools probably having acquired little or no knowledge and understanding of art and craft. Although the culture issue is emphasised by government documents and the CAPA attainment targets, art and craft curriculum has excluded such aspect. One would assume that the historical or cultural aspect of this discipline has not been considered of great importance by the Botswana Curriculum Development and Evaluation Division when compared with some of the CAPA disciplines such as music and physical education which have included the components of culture and
tradition. Havens (2002) observes that art has been in existence for thousands of years and it has served as a way of recording the cultures of different people.

6.3.4.2 Changes made by the introduction of the art and craft curriculum

Most (83%) of the respondents commented that the curriculum has made changes to the traditional way of approaching art and craft lessons although one administrator (BS) was concerned that the document also brought a lot of challenges regarding its implementation as teachers had limited knowledge of art and craft (item 5). These respondents explained that they had a guideline on what to teach and what to achieve using references such as teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks. The responses indicate that the move to introduce the curriculum by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department helped teachers in primary schools. They appreciated the document since they believed that it had changed a lot of teachers’ attitudes towards the subject. They now ascribe a positive value to it by helping both teachers and pupils to gain knowledge and understanding of the subject, and to develop the necessary art and craft skills and careers for further studies and for future use, in the life-long learning.

The benefits the respondents mentioned in this item concur with the responses they gave in item 2 and 3 when asked to measure the importance of art and craft to the school children and society. They also relate to some of the aims of introducing the CAPA programme stipulated in the lower primary syllabus. For example, problem solving through designing and making products; awareness of the effects of art and craft on a society in everyday life; awareness and appreciation of pre-vocational skills in Creative and Performing Arts; critical thinking, inquiry, creative, initiative and interpersonal skills; positive attitudes towards practical work and productive; knowledge, skills and values that contribute towards individual
development; the ability for pupils to express themselves through the art and craft media and a spirit of self-reliance and self-sufficiency (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). The respondents’ responses on how they benefited from the introduction of the curriculum are also in close conjunction with the overviews provided by Barrett (1979), Gardner (1990), Clement (1992), Walling (2000) and Havens (2002), on the rationale of art and craft education and their views are discussed at length in chapter 3 in relation to the CAPA aims.

6.3.4.3 Approaches used in the teaching of art and craft

Many art and craft theorists have long appealed for art and craft teachers to be left free to decide upon the strategies to employ in their teaching. This is discussed in detail in chapter 3. Although there are always important guidelines to follow in the curriculum, it is up to each individual to decide the approach to use to address the requirements, aims and objectives of the curriculum. This concurs with the approach used by Parlett and Hamilton (1972) through ‘illuminative evaluation’ which I have adopted considering that the population under study was from different environments therefore were expected to approach the curriculum differently. The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) has also observed that teachers are different and teach in varying environments which might influence the teaching and learning of the subject. The fact that 83% of the participants among them three administrators alluded that they never took pupils outside the school either to the community, centres or inviting the expert to their schools or classrooms implies that children were mostly confined to one place and not given exposure to diverse art and craft institutions or centres where they could gain knowledge and understanding of art and craft work which could not be provided in their school environment and hence begin to appreciate their work and that of others (item 6). It also shows teachers being unaware that the council department
was supposed to be the one responsible to provide transport to pupils for their trips as some mentioned lack of funds to take pupils for trips.

Many respondents complained about the lack of funds and materials in school as being a substantial barrier to the pupils’ learning in remote areas as they could not afford to buy art and craft materials and tools for themselves due to their poor economical status and that inhibited them from involving the community experts in the area to work with them in their classrooms. One would assume that the community have not been effectively involved and sensitised to the art and craft curriculum as some of the topics in the curriculum do not need purchased materials. If parents were informed about the curriculum needs and the importance of them to play a role in the learning of their children, they could have collected natural materials to help their pupils where necessary especially in remote areas where they could gather reeds, wild fruits and clay or bring clay and dye created from wild fruits, leaves or roots and work on relevant activities with their pupils. Few teachers seem to be aware of the importance of involving the community in the learning of their children in art and craft.

Confining pupils to the classroom for most of the time could result in teachers focusing on subject-centred approaches discussed in chapter 3 whereby instruction is based on transmission of knowledge and skills which contrast with learner-centred education recommended by the lower primary curriculum which is generally concerned with facilitating creative expression. Learner-centred education is viewed by most art and craft educationists to be an effective approach to teaching especially for young learners because it involves an inquiry-based teaching. Inquiry based teaching is believed to be effective because it is problem-centred as it is concerned with the process by which knowledge is acquired and applied. This method is identified by Lampert (2006) who believes that learning in art and
craft should be largely inquiry-based. Teachers could arrange for pupils to visit artists and craft-workers locally or at centres to study and learn their processes and work with them in their studios. The artists or craftspeople could be invited to school to work with both teachers and pupils as indicated in chapter 3 within a scheme known as artists/craftspeople in residence. Inquiry method has no simple answers. Frequent trips to a museum would help pupils become familiar with the premises and feel less intimidated by museum staff and the art and craft work they encounter. “Students become more like researchers as they investigate ideas, trying to answer questions. Teachers become more like co-inquirers, advisors, research assistants” (Ohio State University TETAC Mentors, 2002, p. 14). This group advice teachers to begin by consulting pupils in a mind-mapping session about which key idea to study and this will make them more responsible for what they study.

After mind-mapping a topic, teacher and pupils together can determine what the key idea and essential questions to their project will be. Among other things, this ensures that pupils understand why the ideas are very important and that they engage their interests. “Continuing discussions about what to study are needed because the social and cultural conditions that affect our lives are constantly changing” (Burns, 1995 and Jacobs 1989 cited by Ohio TETAC group, 2002). This will help pupils to understand their cultures and to encourage them to participate in intelligent and socially responsible ways in their communities as required by the CAPA programme and all other educational and national policy documents. It would work well if included in the timetable as it does not require that pupils will visit all the time or be visited all the week. It could be twice a month. However, this would only work if teachers had sufficient knowledge and understanding of the scheme and how they with their pupils might benefit from it. Cleave and Sharp (1986) point out that a description of the professional content of art and craft courses would not be complete without some
consideration of the extent to which professional artists and practicing teachers were involved together and opportunities were afforded for learners to observe good practice and try out their skills. It is vital to invite professional artists and craftspeople as well as experts from galleries and other art and craft centres to give talks to pupils and/or hold workshops in schools. This would alleviate problems of going to the extent of hiring a resource person as one of the respondent once did and paying from her pocket because she had problems with one of the topics in the art and craft curriculum. However, Argiro (2004) is concerned that taking pupils outside school is a problem with primary school teachers because of crowded curriculum and increasing bureaucracy acting as inhibitors to educational visits to art and craft centres such as museum, galleries and artists and craftspeople studios. This is one of the concerns some of the respondents indicated by saying many education sectors are involved in the process of organising educational trips for pupils and that it discouraged them to organise visits to art and craft centres.

6.3.4.4 Inconsistent reports from teachers and their administrators

a) Subject integration

Most (79%) teachers in these four case study schools said they did not integrate the CAPA disciplines when teaching giving various reasons as noted in appendix 5 item 7. Although some of them claimed that the approach used was uniform in their streams or schools this seems unlikely since some of the respondents referred to the subject being taught separately in agreement of all the staff in their schools. Others pointed out that the staff agreed to integrate the objectives from different disciplines which they understood to relate. One of the most inconsistent outcomes of the interviews was the varying responses of teachers and their administrators. Five of the administrators were among the teachers who said the disciplines
were not integrated while three others were among those who said it was sometimes integrated, with one teacher claiming that all teachers integrated the subjects. Some of these administrators were teaching the same levels as those teachers they differed with. For example, both S3 and his administrator SH were teaching standard three but differed in responses. S3 said that they had agreed as standard three class-teachers to integrate where objectives relate while his administrator (SH) said they had agreed not to integrate. B1 and her administrators (BS and BH) taught standard one classes but differed with her administrators who said teachers did not integrate as she said she sometimes did it where objectives relate. The same thing with X1, XS and XH who also taught standard one level as X1 and XS said they did not integrate in their stream in contrast with their colleague XH who claimed that they sometimes integrated when objectives related. However, L4 and S4 concurred with their administrators (LH and SS) as they were all teaching standard four classes in Loso and Selepe primary schools that they did not integrate the CAPA disciplines in their streams.

I tried to clear up the confusion by having informal discussions with the school heads who also gave varying responses with some of their teachers. However, considering ethics, I did not disclose any information collected from their subordinates. Two school heads claimed that their school had agreed to teach one topic from each CAPA discipline each week so as not to overlook any of them. This makes one wonder whether all topics in the syllabus were covered at the end of the year if each topic was addressed separately looking at the dense programme as mentioned by one of the administrators. The third school head claimed that all teachers in his school integrated the CAPA modules while the remaining one said it was up to each individual to integrate or not. The respondents who claimed to be integrating the CAPA subjects found it problematic to explain convincingly how they did it.
With the permission from the Ministry of Education and the art and craft panel members, the informal discussion was extended to some of the art and craft panel members which included primary school representatives, college of education art and craft lecturers, University of Botswana lecturers, Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit representative specialising in art and craft and the Teacher Training and Development (TT&D) Department representative. After discussing with them, I requested for the minutes of the 14th to 15th May 2007 meeting and permission to use them in my study from the chairperson of the panel who discussed the matter with other members. The secretary later sent me the minutes through the post in the United Kingdom with the permission to use them in my study. I approached more than half of the panel members who shared their views with me about the CAPA programme as a whole rather than specifically art and craft. They were also not sure what was expected of the teachers. Lecturers said they also had difficulties when training teachers on how they should approach the CAPA programme. They differed with the Curriculum Development and Evaluation representative who told the panel in their 14th to 15th May 2007 meeting that as developers they expected teachers to integrate the four disciplines when teaching. Lecturers felt that all subjects should be taught separately as they are different with varying expectations. According to the minutes for the meeting I obtained from the panel secretary, the primary school representative in her report raised a concern that primary school teachers face problems when teaching the subject and wanted to find out whether lecturers in colleges of education link what they offer to CAPA programme when training primary school teachers. It is not clear from the minutes how lecturers responded to the question except that they tended to cast blame on the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department claiming that they were never involved in the production of the programme. More of what transpired in that meeting concerning CAPA programme will be discussed in chapter 7.
This implies that teachers had not been sufficiently prepared on how to address this packed programme with four different disciplines. It seems each had approached the subjects the way they saw most appropriate. Administrators also seemed not to be aware of what was happening in classes as they seemed to disagree on how their teachers tackled the CAPA programme which included art and craft. There was not clear information in the CAPA programme to guide teachers on how to tackle the CAPA programme, how and when to integrate or separate them. When informally discussing the curriculum with one of the education officers in the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, I asked her how they expect teachers to teach the CAPA programme and she said they were expected to integrate the objectives from different subject disciplines which related to each other. When asked whether this was communicated to the teachers, she mentioned that it was not their role to prepare teachers for the programmes. According to her this delivery was the responsibility of the Teacher Training and Development department (TT&D). She described their role as to only develop the curriculum responding to the Revised National Policy of Education (RNPE) requirement. One would expect clear information, to at least have been included in the CAPA guidelines to assist teachers on how to approach the programme considering that it was the first implementation in the country.

I further wanted to know from her whether it was not important for them to consider what is on the ground before introducing the curriculum. The response was that the RNPE requirement was long overdue so they had to implement the curriculum and urge the TT&D to take the responsibility for the curriculum by preparing teachers for it. She also expressed some concern that TT&D had not consulted them to hold workshops for teachers on the curriculum. However, some respondents mentioned that they were involved in the task force organised by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit resource in their districts on
how to tackle the CAPA programme. This officer admitted that the programme was so congested when taking account of the resources on the ground. She confirmed that they debated the curriculum in the art and craft panel and members had given different views. She raised concern that some were of the view that it should be integrated whereas some said each subject discipline and objectives should be taught separately.

One of the officers responsible for Curriculum Evaluation provided access to documents which involved the evaluation of the CAPA programme and during our conversation, he was also concerned that the combination of the CAPA programme caused significant confusion to teachers because they were identified as one subject while in actual fact each stood on its own independently in the syllabus with its own topics and objectives. He added that it could have been better for the curriculum to have been integrated for teachers. He was also concerned that the CAPA programme itself was so congested and that the teachers in primary schools had not been trained in these subjects, he felt that they would not cope with either art and craft or any CAPA subject in that syllabus unless something could be done to make it more user-friendly to the teachers. Cleave and Sharp (1986) believe that integration is a preferable approach in the teaching of art and craft although they refer to integration of art and craft across the curriculum and not specifically those subjects included in the CAPA programme. Prior to the introduction of the lower primary CAPA programme, some of the primary school teachers in Botswana associated art and craft with subjects such as social studies and mathematics and not with other arts such as music.
b) Time factor

Similarly to the findings in item 7, the results imply that there was no uniformity on how teachers go about the timetabling of the CAPA subjects (appendix 5, item 8). It was very difficult for all the respondents to explain how they distributed time allocated to the four CAPA disciplines and there was a lot of variation on what they said about time allocated to CAPA when comparing interview results from interviewees of the same schools and sometimes even the same streams. One could believe that teachers were not sure of what they were expected. Some of them were not aware that the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department suggested the minimum of five hours to the extent that one administrator argued that the time suggested by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit was five periods which was two and half hours not five hours per week. Although some of these teachers claimed to have been observing the five hours minimum duration for CAPA suggested by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation unit, the information obtained from the four case study schools’ master timetables were in marked contrast with their responses. The information collected from the charts for all the four case study schools showed the minimum of two hours and maximum of four hours allocated to the lower primary classes (see table 2, chapter 5). A further inconsistency was that L3 said CAPA was allocated one and a half hours to standard threes while the master timetable indicated three hours. SH, an administrator who was also teaching standard three said in their school they offered CAPA for four hours and the master timetable showed three hours. Some of the differences in relation to the master tables can be viewed from B3, B4, X3, and XS responses to item 8. However, they were those who gave the time matching the master timetable such as; B1, B2, BS (administrator), X1, X2 and XH (administrator).
This shows that the combination of subjects confused both teachers and their administrators and there is evidence that they were not advised on how to deal with these subjects combined to be one subject concurring with the findings in item 7. Looking at the way teachers approached the CAPA subjects for example, teaching one discipline in one week and not tackling others, indicates that some topics lagged behind. Some favoured subjects could have been receiving more attention than others as already mentioned by one of the respondents and hence denying pupils some of the necessary skills. Administrators did not only differ with their teachers but also differed among themselves on how much time was allocated for CAPA. They could only account for the classes they were teaching and were not in a position to represent the rest of the classes in lower primary although they supervised that level. Considering that 92% of the respondents were concerned that pupils proceeded to the next level of learning without access to other topics in the CAPA programme because of the congested objectives, one might ask how these pupils coped with the attainment tests given to them at the end of standard four as required by the Education Policy.

6.3.4.5 Formative and summative evaluation

CAPA programme advocates for formative and summative assessment. I had to explain the concepts ‘Formative’ and ‘Summative’ assessment to all the teachers when asking a question on this item because they seemed not to be familiar with the two concepts although they appeared in the CAPA programme as a requirement (item 9). The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department considered these two types of assessments very important for the pupils’ progression in art and craft and other CAPA subjects although only 33% of the respondents including the administrator (SH) confirmed that they assessed both theory and practical work in art and craft while 54% among them five administrators mentioned that they assessed theory mostly because of limited knowledge and resources. Although some of these
teachers claimed that there was uniformity in their school in the assessment procedures of pupils’ progression their responses show that they differed on how they did it. Moreover, the way they said they assess shows that they were not sure of how it was done, that is, what to assess, how and why. It was very difficult for most of them to explain what to look at when assessing a practical art and craft work and that is why most of them only assessed theory and graded it in figures or percentages. Dorn (2002) identifies three important aspects teachers need to assess in art and craft instruction and those are: expression, knowledge and skill and concept formation. He says:

First, we need to assess expression to answer the question of whether the instructional programme and students’ learning is philosophically consistent with the means and ends of art and whether it has sufficient validity to provide representation of the products of artistic inquiry as well as the means for that inquiry. Secondly we need to assess knowledge and skill in art to estimate the psychological validity of the curriculum, which accounts for human growth and development, learning, individual differences, and the like. This occurs through using analytic assessments that answer the question of what can be taught, when it can be taught and to whom, and how students think, how they grow and change in their thinking and in their reasoning (p. 43).

The difference of opinions given by administrators and their teachers on how they assess practical work also indicates that there was no set standard or criteria on how the assessment could be done as one claimed not to be sure whether teachers assessed it or not while some said that the staff agreed not to grade pupils’ practical projects but to just put a tick to acknowledge every child’s effort. One of the responses given which revealed that teachers did not assess art and craft at all as it was not regarded as a basic subject makes one wonder whether the school administrators really effectively monitored the subject. Most art and craft theorists believe that one effective way of assessing pupils’ understanding of their work could be through a technique called ‘art criticism’ recommended by artists such as Feldman (1994) and Ragans (2000) whereby pupils could describe their work, analyse an artwork, interpret
an artwork and judge it. Often students and the general public believe that only experienced art and craft experts have the ability to critique art and craft work and this idea can inhibit people’s enjoyment of art and craft.

However, Fowler (2002) notes that preliminary classroom work in discovering ways to look at art and craft and find meaning in its expression helps to dispel this assumption and enhances the enjoyment of a museum visit. She advises teachers to first present slide shows to pupils and engage them in group discussions centering around art and craft reproductions as this can help pupils to begin their appreciation of art and craft as a preview to viewing original works where they experience actual size, colours and textures. Gaining a basic knowledge of the elements and principles of design helps pupils understand organisational components that create a work of art or craft and through hands-on art and craft-making projects between museum visits they learn these concepts through exploration of art and craft materials. At this level of learning it is advisable for the teacher to formulate guiding questions to help pupils critique their work and that of others.

Anderson’s (1998) instructional tactic is to put students to work deriving the questions and the searching for answers, rather than teachers posing questions for the students to answer. By engaging in this process, the students also formulate theories, arguments and criteria for judgment – all activities engaged in by professional aesthetics (Walling, 2000, p. 27).

This form of assessment would help teachers to assess pupils both formatively and summatively as they will follow their progress both theoretically and practically and this would address the attainment target 1 ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ stipulated in the CAPA programme. Teachers will diagnose from their discussion the extent at which pupils had gained knowledge in the topic taught. The benefits both teachers and pupils would get from this approach and other assessment strategies have been discussed in chapter five and it
will be addressed at length in chapter 7. The other concerning issue is that of teachers who recorded pupils' progress in figures or percentages and kept it in their storerooms or the school head's office when pupils proceeded to the next level rather than handing it over to the next teacher to assist him or her to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the pupils. One would also question if those few teachers who had access of the pupils portfolios got clear progression of the children's practical work by just looking at the figures. It could be that the negative attitude towards the subject by both the teachers and the Ministry of Education was still prevailing as it was not regarded as a basic subject. The Ministry of Education (Examinations Research and Testing Division) could have been contributing to the teachers’ negativity on the subject as it did not adhere to the curriculum requirement that the subject should be part of the standard four attainment tests. The lower primary CAPA Programme emphasises that “a national test based on the attainment targets will be conducted at the end of standard four by Examinations Research and Testing Division (ERTD)” (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002, p. 2). Surprisingly teachers mentioned that since the introduction of this programme they had not been given that test and this could have been one factor which encouraged teachers to take the subject lightly like in the past.

6.3.4.6 Teachers’ preparedness to teach the art and craft curriculum

The responses mentioned under item 10, appendix 5, reveal that art and craft as a subject was not effectively taught and makes one wonder whether objectives stipulated in the curriculum were successfully achieved and attainment targets attained at the end of the lower primary programme. Some of the teachers believed that the absence of materials indicated that the Ministry of Education and the Council Departments did not value the subject as it did not support with the instruction materials even with simple materials such as plain papers and glue despite the requisition from schools. Although the most used references were pupils’
text-books and teachers’ guides they were said to be inadequate by most (92%) of the participants to the extent that some had one copy for the whole school; some using the textbooks which were not prescribed by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit while some did not have anything at all and were not aware that there were teachers’ guides for CAPA. This could have discouraged even those who would have been interested in the subject and hence depriving pupils from gaining the required skills at Lower Primary level. Whether these departments were ready for the implementation of the art and craft curriculum might be considered when investigating the concerns or difficulties most of the respondents said they had with some of the topics, objectives, time allocation to CAPA and inappropriate classrooms for teaching and learning art and craft and other aspects listed in appendix 5, item 10. Despite all these problems, those teachers had not received any in-service training, and the information gathered indicates a lack of liaison between the Ministry of Education departments, Teacher Training Development (TT&D) and Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit. In hindsight they should have met to work together to prepare teachers for this new curriculum.

Some respondents revealed that the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department mounted workshops in various districts to launch the lower primary syllabus in which four participants among them three administrators confirmed that they attended. These teachers were concerned that the workshop did not take into consideration the techniques of teaching the subject which was the main problem looking at the combination of the CAPA subject disciplines to be one subject and that it addressed the whole lower primary Syllabus within a short time. Despite that, two of them appreciated that they gained knowledge on how to assess pupils’ art and craft work and developed confidence on assessing teachers when teaching the subject. Phuthego’s (2007) PhD research findings reveal that school
administrators found it difficult to assess teachers’ performances in CAPA subjects since they were not familiar with the programme. They explained that they relied on teachers with higher qualifications such as diplomas and degrees who have specialised in practical subjects. This concurs with my findings whereby one of the Loso administrators highlighted that she did not have any idea in art and craft curriculum but trusted that one teacher who was specialising in physical education was doing a good job in art and craft education.

The other worrying aspect is that those teachers who attended the workshops mentioned that there was no follow up made to check how they had coped with the CAPA programme. One of the administrators who had attended a workshop on how to assess art and craft, seemed not to have cascaded her knowledge with the rest of the staff who regretted that they had not received in-service in art and craft. The same teachers’ responses on assessment procedures in item 9, show that they had difficulties in assessing practical art and craft work to the extent that most of them only assessed theory. By virtue of her post the same administrator was asked whether teachers assessed the subject and she said she was not sure, she said: “but what I know is that in art they can just make pictures and then the children mark”. She also highlighted that she did not examine art and craft. In this case, a follow up by the concerned department could have identified this problem and helped this administrator to assess both teachers and pupils’ art and craft progress. Nevertheless, two administrators (LS and XS) claimed to have once had an internal workshop for their subordinates to discuss issues concerning art and craft among them Botswana ‘emerging issues’.

Additional information given by all the administrators on how they assisted teachers and see to it that teachers help pupils attain the Attainment Targets and achieve objectives reveals that there is little done to motivate or assist teachers in teaching the subject effectively. Only one
among eight claimed to have assessed her teachers that year. Seven administrators mentioned that they had never assessed the subject giving various reasons as shown in appendix 5, item 10 although half of them claimed to be confident in assessing teachers in the subject. Teachers could have been planning the subject regularly as a school requirement because their planning books were checked regularly but this did not guarantee that they were taking the subject seriously when teaching it as one administrator suspected. Lacking confidence in the subject as reported by half of the administrators clearly indicates that they were not in a position to help those teachers who had difficulties teaching the subject because they had limited knowledge in art and craft. Yet they were expected to assess teachers in the subject. However, when these administrators were asked what they would analyse when assessing art and craft as a subject, their responses were sufficient to convince one that they could cope sufficiently when observing the subject. Some mentioned evaluating the content, approaches and teaching aids used in relation to the objectives of the topic presented. All these components they referred to as criteria of assessment are the general components taught in colleges of education in ‘Education’ courses where they deal with teaching approaches and methodologies. The questions one might ask are: Do school heads seek reports on the assessment of teachers from their assistants during or at the end of the term? Does the Education Officer for the area monitor all subjects including the school administrators’ reports on teachers and pupils’ progress?

These schools could explore other strategies recommended by art and craft educationists such as Robinson (1982) to consider ‘Team Teaching’ and one already discussed an ‘artist and craftspeople in residence scheme’. The primary responsibilities of teachers in team-teaching collaboration are to work closely with a manageable group of pupils. They are required to attend to their intentions and goals, offering support and assist pupils as required and
recording in detail pupils’ progress. They then discuss with their colleagues sharing the issues of pupils’ artistic growth and development in art and craft and work with their colleagues on how to understand specific artistic intentions and processes. This promotes their social skills and develops their art and craft related skills as well as increasing their knowledge of the subject as they will be learning from each other and therefore more able to do more research. This would further increase teachers’ confidence in art and craft because the results show that a major problem with the case study primary teachers is the initial lack of confidence in the teaching of the arts disciplines compared with other subjects.

The administrators were not familiar with the concepts ‘Attainment Targets’ stipulated in the CAPA programme. When asked a question on the extent to which teachers addressed the attainment targets they had sufficient difficulties which led me to define and clarify the terms for them. They were not aware that they were in the CAPA programme. In addition, all the respondents’ response to item 7 reveals that they were not aware of most of the recommendations in the CAPA programme as I could detect from their expressions that they were not informed about the minimum of five hours to be allocated to CAPA subjects per week. Each individual encountered difficulties when attempting to explain how they distributed the five hours minimum suggested by the curriculum developers or the times suggested by their schools and this brought confusion to both of us. Surprisingly, all the schools had reduced the five hours minimum suggested while they were concerned that the time for CAPA was not enough to cover all the topics. According to one administrator, the time for CAPA in their school was reduced to suit their working hours and other subjects in the syllabus retained the times suggested by the curriculum developers. This repeats the problem of the teachers’ attitudes to art and craft so that as a subject it is not seen as a valuable subject by most of the primary school teachers and the stake holders such as the
Ministry of Education. It is gratifying however, that some teachers could elucidate its rationale when asked about its importance to the society and primary school children in item 2 and 3.

6.3.4.7 Respondents’ suggestions on the art and craft curriculum

Respondents’ suggestions for the improvement of art and craft imply that teachers were not effectively prepared for the implementation of the curriculum as most teachers indicated that they had difficulties in the teaching and assessing of pupils’ progress in art and craft discipline and therefore, needed training to effectively tackle the subject (appendix 5, item 11). This included the monitoring of what has been taught to teachers and taking into consideration the environment the subject was taught in and materials and equipment available in schools relevant to the subject. Walling (2000) suggests that pupils should learn not just the facts about school subjects but should also gain an understanding of the fundamental structure of whatever subject they are taught. Concurring with this theorist, I believe pupils can only gain this knowledge if taught by experts in the subject who also understand the nature of that discipline. The implication is that there was never an effort of making a follow up after the introduction of the curriculum from the concerned departments to see to it that there was progress in what they have introduced despite efforts by the remote area teachers who claim to have requested the Curriculum development unit for assistance several times both verbally and writing but not fulfilling their promises to come and assist.

6.4 Summary

This summarises the main elements of this chapter.
• Although most teachers showed concern about lacking the knowledge and skills in art and craft, they were aware of important information on the rationale of art and craft with emphasis on careers and employment-creation and developing self-reliance skills which is advocated by the Botswana government policies.

• Respondents seemed not to be familiar with such policies although the lower primary CAPA programme relates well with them especially the Botswana national principles, Vision 2016 – Towards Prosperity for All, the philosophy and the aims of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE), the aims of the ten-year of the Basic Education Programme and the aims of the Primary school Education.

• The respondents including administrators seemed less than familiar with the concepts used in CAPA programme document such as ‘attainment targets’ and ‘formative and summative assessment’.

• Teachers found difficulty when trying to explain how they shared the time allocated for all the four CAPA subjects and how they approached those subjects as they were combined as one subject in both the curriculum and their timetables.

• Participants were concerned that although the curriculum brought changes in the sense that they had guidelines to follow unlike in the past, they still encountered problems as some of the topics and objectives were advanced, some references appearing to have limited and sometimes irrelevant information in addition to inadequate materials, references and most seriously limited knowledge and skills in the subject.

• There were contradictory reports from teachers and supervisors.

• Supervisors from the school heads to the senior teachers often had limited knowledge in art and craft but were expected to supervise teachers in this area.

• The nature of their supervision needs clarifying. This has been evidenced by the administrators who said they were not able to help teachers in art and craft and had never
attempted to assess teachers in this subject since the introduction of the CAPA programme.

- Teacher concern as to the appropriate knowledge and skills of their supervision needs to be clarified and accounted for.

- Strategies teachers mentioned they were using were seen to be of value to each individual since they were different and presented in various environments of various cultures and tradition.

- The art and craft framework does not seek to prescribe the way teachers should operate, but allow them to operate within a total framework in a way most natural to them.

- However, rather than confining pupils to the classrooms for most of the time which most of the respondents said they did although they lacked knowledge and skills in art and craft, it would be advisable for them to adopt child-centred methods which involve inquiry-based approach in their teaching by using artists and craftspeople in residence schemes where the teacher could invite an artist or pupils visiting local artists and craft-workers to work on a project; investigating the processes involved in creating their products and produce their own products incorporating ideas learnt from them.

- This approach will also benefit teachers as they will gain knowledge and skills from these practising artists.

- This could be extended to ‘team-teaching’ approach whereby teachers will work together with smaller groups of pupils to address the CAPA requirements specifically art and craft curriculum.

- Respondents listed suggestions to some of the problems they raised among them advocating for in-service training in art and craft, purpose-built classrooms and adequate art and craft materials, simplifying topics and objectives and reduction of the number of objectives in art and craft curriculum.
The coming chapter reflects on the findings of the study by discussing the findings of both the classroom observation and interview with reference to the research questions.
CHAPTER 7
REFLECTIONS AND EVALUATION

7.1 Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to reconsider the key research findings of the study in the light of the policy requirements and theoretical perspectives presented in chapter 3. In order to draw conclusions, aims and research questions will be reflected upon to examine the extent as to how far and how well they have been addressed. The findings described in chapters 5 and 6 will be identified and reconsidered according to the themes and will be discussed under the headings of the research questions identified in chapter 2. This will deal with the hypothesis of the study also outlined in chapter 2.

This study was carried out to investigate the cause of concern about the following issues:

- Combination of art and craft with the three disciplines, music, physical education and design and technology which were interpreted as one subject called CAPA.
- The congestion of art and craft specific objectives to be covered in each year.
- Time constraints arising from teaching all the four disciplines which were allocated around five hours per a week by the Curriculum developers.
- Resources, both human and physical considering that this was the first art and craft curriculum in Botswana.

The aim of this study was to investigate how teachers interpreted the art and craft curriculum at lower primary by examining how far and how well they met the aims, objectives and learning outcomes guided by the following key research questions:
i) To what extent do the subject matter, methods and approaches used in the teaching of art and craft address the attainment targets of the CAPA programme and the aims and objectives of the art and craft curriculum?

ii) Is art and craft taught as a separate subject or integrated with the other arts?

iii) To what extent do teachers evaluate pupils’ performance in art and craft through formative and summative assessment since this is emphasised and required by the CAPA programme?

iv) Is the time allocated to the art and craft discipline adequate to cover all topics by the end of the year?

v) Do schools have adequate facilities to teach the art and craft curriculum?

7.2 Discussion of results

The discussion of results is presented under research questions that reflect the classroom observation schedule and the interview schedule and the data that these sought to capture. Discussion on the classroom observation sessions, views of the teachers and school administrators and suggestions on how to improve the art and craft implementation yielded sufficient information from which tentative conclusions may be drawn to provide some answers to the research questions posed in chapter 2 and in the opening section of this chapter. Tentative responses follow below after each question. As there is no research literature available that evaluates art and craft curriculum at lower primary in Botswana, reference will mostly be made to Phibion’s (2006), Phuthego’s (2008) and Moalosi and Molwane’s (2008) findings on the CAPA programme. These do not specifically refer to art and craft as their research studies were on music and design and technology as components of CAPA and the integrated arts syllabus. They made vital contribution to the study of the
CAPA modules as the integrated arts which informed my studies on various issues of the programme.

7.2.1 To what extent do the subject matter, methods and approaches teachers used in the teaching of art and craft address the attainment targets of the CAPA programme and the aims and objectives of the art and craft curriculum?

Illuminative Evaluation has been adopted as the most appropriate method for curriculum evaluation through classroom observation and interview strategies, as it allows flexibility in approaching topics considering that “… effective teachers have an understanding of the cultural climate in their classroom, and they understand where their students come from in terms of their interests, beliefs backgrounds, and social relationships” (Bain, 2004, p. 44). Teachers can interpret and decode their pupils’ language, as well as unspoken forms of communication, such as body language. However, although teachers apply distinctive strategies in their teaching, they are required to address the curriculum requirements which include the attainments targets, aims and objectives stipulated in the CAPA programme. Reference to these requirements during the study assisted me to examine the extent to which teachers were knowledgeable in the art and craft discipline and hence their ability to interpret the curriculum in relation to both the educational documents and the government policies.

Carl (1995) cited by Phuthego (2008) observes that the part played by instructional administrators and class-teachers significantly determines successful and effective curriculum implementation. He says that a distinction can be made between the strategies that promote and those that inhibit implementation. Educators should ideally adopt promoting strategies that would ensure the success of implementation. The role of the teacher in this regard is very
crucial in ensuring a successful implementation of the curriculum. The CAPA programme requires pupils to have acquired, or developed, the following skills at the end of lower primary education:

- Understanding of the different media used in CAPA.
- Knowledge and understanding of materials, tools, equipment and process in making or developing products.
- Knowledge and understanding of their own culture and others and how they relate to CAPA.
- Knowledge and understanding of basic principles and concepts applied to CAPA.
- Knowledge and understanding of design.
- Dexterity through working with materials, tools and equipment or instruments.
- Skills in a range of practical processes to produce useful products.
- Creative skills through composing, performing and designing products.
- Project from simple themes.
- Positive attitudes towards practical activities.
- A spirit of self-reliance.
- Interpersonal skills through participation in team-work.
- Awareness and appreciation of the value of culture and tradition.
- Desirable attitudes towards health and safety practices


I have observed that these requirements tally with other educational documents and policies in Botswana such as, the Botswana National Principles and Vision 2016 pillars, philosophy and aims of the Revised National Policy in Education (RNPE 4), aims of the ten year Basic Education Programme and aims of the 7 – year Primary Education Programme, cited by
Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) in lower primary syllabus. All these documents emphasise components discussed in chapter 3 among them awareness of culture, practical and problem solving skills, critical thinking, self-reliance, creativity and awareness of emerging issues. These components were observed during the classroom observation and interview sessions.

The evidence drawn from both the classroom observation and the interview responses indicated that most teachers had limited knowledge of art and craft since none of the twenty-four participants had specialised in the subject. This concurs with Phibion’s (2006) research findings which states that during his study he observed that CAPA was taught by non-specialists primary school teachers who were generalists in the arts area. Besides the provision of copies of the syllabus, teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks; school administrators indicated that no further guidance had been given to them by the Ministry of Education. According to Phuthego (2008) the workshops organised to launch the lower primary syllabus did not include administrators and they relied on information provided by teachers who attended the implementation workshops. A few administrators did attend the workshops being invited by virtue of their positions as class-teachers. Otherwise, there is no evidence of any additional support for administrators. The workshops according to those who had attended focused on the interpretation of the objectives. Difficult terminologies and content, lack of relevant references, congested objectives with limited content in references, lack of in-service training and supervision in the subject represented most of the concerns emphasised by respondents as shown in appendix 5 item 10. This closely tallies with the reservations expressed by Moalosi and Molwane’s (2008) findings on the challenges faced by primary school teachers in the teaching of all the CAPA modules. According to these educationists, teachers verbally expressed concerns that the programme content was heavily
loaded; the specific objectives of some modules were difficult to understand; there was lack of teaching materials and other resources; teachers lacked skills on CAPA disciplines; they had problems of integrating the CAPA disciplines; some teachers were not teaching CAPA and some taught it selectively, that is they taught components that they felt comfortable in handling; CAPA as a subject was too congested; there was no in-service training and they had problems of assessing the CAPA subject. In addition Phibion’s (2006) research findings indicate that teachers were concerned that the combining of the CAPA subjects reduced the importance of each subject as it is used to be in the past and the time allocation for each practical subject. They further argue that:

the introduction of the CAPA defeats the purpose of subject specialisation which is currently taking place and emphasised in the colleges of education as stipulated in (NDP 9:289) section 15:97 as follows: provide in primary colleges of education specialist training for infant, middle, upper standards and subject specialist (Phibion, 2006, p. 13).

Although not specifically referring to lower primary and art and craft discipline these respondents were also concerned that CAPA subject components in all levels of learning are scattered in bits and pieces and that the content was shallow since these subjects had been combined.

Case studies teachers suggested ways that they believed could improve the implementation of the art and craft education at lower primary to address their problems which are also listed in appendix 5 item 11. Most of these concerns are also indicated in the standard 3 July 2004 and standard 4 and 5 July 2005 monitoring reports which were compiled by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department after identifying problems teachers encountered with the lower primary syllabus as a whole. These findings seem to concur with those of Phuthego (2008) whose results revealed that primary school administrators identified that
teachers lacked the necessary skills to teach CAPA, as the content was too advanced and hence most found it very difficult to tackle. The administrators in my study confirm Phuthego’s findings that they were concerned that they were not familiar with art and craft as a discipline and therefore were not sure of how to guide the teachers and could not verify whether teachers were doing what they claimed to be doing. Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) among many educators, note that positive feelings of confidence by the teacher, which occur in their attitudes, feelings, beliefs and self-esteem in teaching may bring about productive learning. This was confirmed by one of the respondents who was concerned that administrators in his school held negative attitudes towards art and craft because they lacked sufficient knowledge and skills in it. He said they did not assess the discipline or encourage teachers to take it as seriously as the other subjects.

Considering the argument introduced by the question raised by the primary school teacher representative in the art and craft panel meeting in May 2007 together with identical concerns which emerged both from Phuthego’s study and my study, it seems likely that teachers were not sufficiently consulted or involved as the implementers in the development of the curriculum. These results are confirmed by Moalosi and Molwane’s (2007) research findings in the case of the combination of design and technology with the other arts subjects in the CAPA programme. They raised a concern that “primary school teachers were not involved in the development of the CAPA curriculum” (p. 27). One primary school teacher wanted to know whether the art and craft college lecturers linked what they offered to student-teachers with the primary school CAPA programme. She also emphasised to the panel that topics such as ‘Graphic Design’ could not be taught by most of the teachers in the primary school, as they lacked adequate relevant knowledge in that area. According to the 14th – 15th May 2007 minutes, the panel members demonstrated their dissatisfaction
concerning the CAPA programme to the Curriculum Officer who represented the department in the panel. The college lecturers claimed that primary school teachers had problems with the programme because lecturers were not included during its production. The main concern by the college lecturers was that the CAPA problems tended to bounce back to them since they had recently been accused of not fulfilling their professional duties.

The debate and concerns of primary school teachers’ inability to teach CAPA and issues surrounding the resources required to teach the subject were topics of discussion in parliament in late 2007. The parliamentarians raised concerns that teachers in primary schools were faced with mammoth task of teaching CAPA which has been launched in schools without any resources provided and any inservice-provision (Moalosi and Molwane, 2007, p. 27).

Nevertheless, one of the high quality improvement initiatives highlighted by the Botswana president during his remarks at the 10th anniversary celebrations of Kwaudwane primary school in Botswana in September, 2008 was the ‘School Capacity Building Programme’ which he said aimed at improving instructional leadership at the senior management level of schools (Republic of Botswana Tautona Times no 33 of 2008). This was planned to be done through a management training programme targeting school administrators. He also cited the Ministry’s effort to enhance inspection and supervision as a way to improve quality and discipline. I believe this approach can be effective as long as all the subjects are targeted. This will need specialist education officers for all the primary school subjects to identify needs-assessment for each subject and give assistance through workshops where required. My concern is that the president emphasised that the inspection and supervision will be targeting the under-performing schools which seems to indicate that teachers will be inspected and supervised only in those subjects identified as basic. The CAPA disciplines may not be considered. Education officers may be required to analyse the Primary School Leaving Examination (PLSE) results to identify the under-performing schools and
concentrate on those examined subjects for improvement. This may influence teachers to ignore the CAPA disciplines and concentrate on those identified as basic subjects as was the case according to the results of this study.

The Ohio State University Transforming Education Through the Arts Challenge (TETAC) mentors (2002) note that the first step in developing curriculum is for teachers to discuss which concepts and skills they feel are most important for pupils to learn. They emphasise that:

this needs to be an ongoing discussion, revisited repeatedly throughout the year. Continuing discussion helps to maintain a good relationship between different teachers and ensure that they each understand the key ideas in the same way. Faculty discussions can also bring about further understanding of key ideas, and this can be a significant reward for teachers engaging in collaborative curriculum construction. After discussions of this kind, teachers can plan an integrated curriculum, focusing on those topics, ideas issues, and questions that can be shared between disciplines (p. 15).

If adopted, this idea could address the concerns of content difficulties raised by the respondents as they would have contributed to the development of the curriculum and own it. They could have shared ideas when they develop the curriculum and mind-map ideas for example, identifying topics from the four CAPA disciplines which could be integrated so as to reduce the load identified by the teachers. However, this could only effectively work if those teachers were experts in the four disciplines (art and craft, music, physical education and design and technology) from which the CAPA content is derived. Otherwise, the same problem would still prevail as we can see from item 11 of the interview findings that few of the administrators who claimed to have been having forums with their teachers to address issues concerning the art and craft curriculum, still had difficulties in addressing the objectives because of limited knowledge and lack of art and craft skills. Most of the
administrators did not attempt such workshops because of lack of knowledge in the discipline as they were not sure of what was expected of them. Teachers need time to reflect on their curriculum with each other, in small collaborative groups such as class streams. Critical discussions in small groups could help teachers examine how their teaching reflects the key ideas and reinforce interdisciplinary connections of the CAPA subjects.

It is important to urge the Ministry of Education especially the curriculum development department to consider Carl’s (1995) lists of determinative factors for successful implementation cited by Phuthego (2008, p.5) which when adopted and adapted could help improve teachers’ approaches to the teaching of art and craft. These factors include:

- continuous contact with curriculum implementers to give advice and help;
- clear communication to illustrate roles and to explain terminology, illustration of possible means of evaluation and to supply answers to queries and;
- provision of support service .

Teachers who were observed teaching attempted addressing the objectives mostly through a question and answer method. Although the majority of teachers focused on the objectives of the curriculum, three of these teachers additionally considered other aspects which were relevant to what they taught. These teachers seemed to be experienced on the general methods of teaching in primary schools but could not sufficiently apply them in art and craft discipline due to lack of knowledge and understanding of the discipline. These resulted in them being unable to convincingly link the theoretical part of the discipline to its practical aspect. Pupils were not encouraged to apply the art and craft concepts they learnt through their practical activities. For example, some teachers discussed the elements of art and craft but could not help pupils to identify them in their drawings. The issue of linking theory to
practical work is emphasised by Phibion (2006) who asserts that CAPA was “introduced to encourage teachers to put more emphasis on the practicality of these subjects than previously when theory was given more attention” (p. 2). Teachers should consider authentic learning which implies a purposeful, meaningful application of relevant information, as opposed to acquiring factual knowledge for itself. This influenced some of the pupils to rush their activities as there were no guidelines to observe and hence the activities seemed not to present much of a challenge to them. It also resulted in some of the pupils creating drawings with features which resembled characteristics shown by Western pupils of four to seven years of age known as pre-schematic stage as suggested by art theorists such as Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975), Gardner (1980), Cox (1997) and Barnes (2002). Most of the pupils in those classes were ten years of age and above. There were no specific drawing skills introduced to pupils for them to develop except making marks using any shape they could think of because teachers did not introduce techniques or appropriate drawing processes in their activities. This omission by teachers might have been due to the aspects not having been included in the art and craft curriculum or to their lack of subject knowledge.

Some of the characteristics shown by the four to seven years of age pupils according to these art theorists are drawings with omissions of some of the features such as the neck and nose in a human figure, misplacement of features in a drawing and the use of private symbols to represent features for example, usually a V-shape for the mouth. “The problem is to do with the actual process of drawing” (Mannathoko, 2000, p. 17). Young children of this age make little attempt to try to translate the elements of art into a representational visual image. Features have exaggerated proportion as mostly they do not attempt to draw the exact perceptual illusion. Examples of such drawings are shown below in figures 24-25: Some
other examples can be viewed from chapter 5 (figures 21–23) as they portray these characteristics.

Figure 24: Drawing with exaggerated proportions
Figure 25: Drawing with private symbols 1

Figure 26: Drawing with private symbols 2
However, there were those pupils who showed drawing features of characteristics described by Barnes (2002) and Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) to be matching children of the ages of 10 and above. For example: figure 7 in chapter 5 and the ones below:

Figure 27: Drawing of natural objects 1

Figure 28: Drawing of natural objects 2
Figure 29: Drawing of natural objects

Figure 30: Drawing of natural objects 4
Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) and Barnes (2002) further stipulate that drawings of children at ages 10 and above show evidence of close attention to detail. A baseline appears and there is simultaneous representation of plan and elevation as seen in images 27, 28 and 30. However, art and craft teachers should recognise that all pupils have the potential and the right to have their drawing skills developed. Unlike Lowenfeld and Brittain (1975) who claim that adults should not interfere with pupils’ drawings but leave them free, Barnes (2002) supports both nurture and nature approaches. He encourages teachers to observe pupils’ ages when evaluating their drawings but also argues that teachers need to assist pupils to develop their drawing skills by teaching them how to look at an art work and bring materials to class which can assist pupils understand the drawing techniques. He further advises teachers to discuss pupils’ drawings with them giving guidelines which can develop pupils’ drawing skills. Although many psychologists still acknowledge Lowenfeld and Brittain’s (1975) stages of child development some of the art and craft educationists among them Stears (2008)
have challenged this theory by arguing that many factors in the environment can also affect the child’s development such as their neighbourhood, television, culture and classroom environment. Stears (2008) notes that:

if we are responsible as teachers and educators for a child’s development, it will nearly always be within a formal pedagogized environment. We deal with lessons, projects, curricula, classrooms, materials, timetables and so on. So we are constantly looking to ‘improve’ our working knowledge of these things as they best affect the developing child” (p. 3).

Teachers could prepare pupils at lower primary by bringing teaching aids such as videos, pictures or posters to class and engaging the pupils in group discussion to identify all the items in the picture. This is the first stage of art critique that artists such as Feldman (1994) and Ragans (2000) call description. Pupils can then identify simple art elements such as types of lines, colour, texture and shapes used in the picture and explain where they are used and how. Feldman (1994) and Ragans (2000) term this as the analysis stage of art critique. Pupils then interpret the picture by sharing with colleagues and their teacher what the picture reminds them of to guess what the artist is trying to communicate to viewers. The last stage will be asking pupils their views about the image whether they like the composition or scene and offering some justification for liking or disliking the image. This step is known as ‘judgement’. Equipped with this knowledge and skills, pupils will be able to look deeply into the works of art and craft they see and critically view it with an artistic eye to obtain some purchase on the meaning of the piece of work and hence consider the art elements and principles when creating their work and talking about their work and that of others. By so doing, they will learn to appreciate other people’s art and craft work as they will be more able to interpret and obtain some meaning from it. Pupils who demonstrate such skills are able to engage in an enquiry method in art and craft projects which offers an important strategy in
teaching and learning as it involves both the teacher and pupils with interesting and worthwhile issues of evaluation.

A further observation is that lack of knowledge and skills in art and craft resulted in some of the case study class-teachers presenting irrelevant content to pupils. One might question whether the objectives were addressed for example, see table 10 and 11 (B2 and X4 lesson observation notes). X4 taught pupils that they are two types of drawing which are ‘natural’ and ‘man-made’ drawing while he was supposed to have introduced observation, memory and imagination drawing as the types of drawing. Although the B2 class-teacher discussed the types of patterns effectively in relation to the art and craft elements, she interpreted objective 2.7.1.1 to mean that ‘natural and ‘man-made’ patterns were the types of patterns while the teacher’s guide emphasised ‘random’ and ‘planned’ patterns to be the types of patterns. She could also not clearly explain the concept ‘pattern’ in relation to repetition of art elements which resulted in most of the pupils taking it that they were required to draw shapes of their choice rather than to consider the ‘repetition’ aspect to be the key concept in their lesson as seen in chapter 5, figure 15 and the following pictures below:

Figure 32: Pattern Making 1
One could argue that image 32 and 34 show repetitions of circular and rectangular shapes but the colour element might have also been considered by repeating and alternating various colours in a way that creates a pattern. Whitehurst (2002) asserts that the quality of teaching is affected by the following factors: general knowledge and ability, experience, subject matter
knowledge, intensive and focused in-service training and alignment between teacher training and standard based reforms. One standard four case study class-teacher left his pupils to work independently without involving himself in what they were doing although they did not consider applying the elements of art learnt during the discussion in their practical work. This teacher did not necessarily indicate that he underrated the subject but rather due to his lack of knowledge and skills to sufficiently guide pupils as he indicated during the interview session.

Campbell (1993) argues that such teachers “are not sure of the proper procedure to encourage participation, and therefore it may seem them safer to do nothing” (p. 216). Whitehurst’s interpretation seems to indicate that Botswana primary education colleges produce high quality teachers regarding general pedagogy of the teaching methods while most of the teachers lack knowledge, understanding and skills of subject matter in art and craft education. While these colleges design art and craft generalist (non-specialists) programmes which provide instruction of theoretical knowledge such as how pupils draw at different ages, such theory does not guarantee that student-teachers understand how to apply this knowledge in the classroom. Student-teachers need to learn more about teaching strategies, art and craft content, classroom management and pupil learning in order to provide quality education to their learners.

The teacher-training institutions, specifically art and craft departments, should work more closely with primary schools in order for student teachers to make meaningful connections between theory and practice. This will enable them to motivate and communicate with pupils and to apply their art and craft skills using specific instructional methods. Fowler (2002) suggests that when planning art and craft curricula for non-art and craft specialists, the statement, ‘A picture is worth a thousand words should come to one’s mind’. He is
concerned that teaching introductory art and craft course for generalist student teachers can be a challenging assignment because most of these students might have had brief encounters with the discipline at one point during their schooling but may have experienced negative or even humiliating situations in their art and craft-making attempts. Secondly, some might have a natural or mild interest in art and craft and could only relate it to textbook reproduction, images seen on television and visual resources found on the internet.

Teachers who studied art and craft as generalists in colleges of education indicated as many if not more problems than those who trained in the 1980s or earlier, prior to the introduction of an art and craft programme in colleges of education. One of the teachers who had difficulties with art and craft content during the observed lesson emphasised during interview that those teachers who trained before the introduction of the Diploma in Primary Education were faced with serious problems of teaching art and craft. This was not the case for everyone in this category as one of those teachers was organised and taught confidently delivering relevant content sequentially. She was unable however to encourage pupils to apply the theory they learnt relating to practice. (See B2 observation notes on table 12). The problem could be identified initially from their lesson plans as they did not include any content to be taught or clear approaches for the lessons. Teachers focused on activities pupils were to be assigned during lessons.

This teaching problem could be the result of the structure of the college curriculum which might have excluded the important aspects of practical teaching in art and craft concentrating on theory or the general pedagogy of teaching in primary schools as according to Nchabe (2008). She analysed the Diploma in Primary Education Examination items in relation to curriculum for various disciplines in Botswana Primary Colleges of Education and observed
that the topic ‘Lesson Plan’ appeared across the colleges of primary education curriculum. Content for all the disciplines in the professional studies aspect were a duplicate of one another. This resulted in lecturers asking the same question in examination papers of all the subjects. There was evidence that lecturers across different disciplines focused on the basic components of lesson plans rather than considering the important aspects of specific teaching approaches and what to teach in their areas. Teachers had difficulties in planning and teaching the art and craft discipline as evidenced from some of the case study classes. The philosophy to have a good, competent and skilled teaching cadre is also articulated in the country’s Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE, 1994) which states that ‘the success of any education system depends largely on teachers … they are crucial in the strategy to achieve a more effective and responsive education system” (p. 4). Givens (2000) further makes a point that without teacher development there is no curriculum development and conversely, where a curriculum has changed, there has been teacher development. Good teachers never stop learning, growing and searching for better ways to teach (Gehrke, 2006).

Nchabe (2008) seems to concur with Roe and Ross (2002) cited by Carpenter (2005) who note that certain components of lesson planning appear almost universally whereby student teachers are expected to learn to write lesson plans with the essential components of learning objectives, learning activities, materials needed, and assessment. Lesson plan writing provides art and craft teachers with good organisation and clear direction for teaching and can provide the inexperienced teacher with greater confidence. Teaching pre-service teachers the basic components of lesson plans which incorporate art and craft teaching, learning processes which include studio inquiry methods and art and craft assessment strategies would help teachers involve their pupils in inquiry-based approaches which could help them understand their art and craft and that of others and hence involve them in the necessary skills of art and
craft. The programme for non-specialist teacher trainees should also emphasise critical and cultural study education to prepare them to engage their pupils in critical and creative thinking activities which include self-assessment of their work or art and craft criticism strategy of art and craft evaluation. To engage with a work of art or craft, one may need to attempt to establish its context so as to more fully appreciate that piece of work. This model is also important for art and craft non-specialists because it could give them a beginning point from which to initiate and organise their thoughts when writing about an art and craft image or when verbally critiquing a piece (Fowler, 2002).

However, Pavlov, (2004) suggests that it needs to be stressed that:

at times, it is hard to distinguish between pedagogical knowledge and subject knowledge. This is because it appears that teachers’ subject matter knowledge is related to their teaching approaches (pedagogy). Teachers’ level of art specialization appears to reflect certain concepts of teaching and these tend to be in better agreement with certain approaches to teaching. (P.43-44).

When giving an official closing address at the University of Botswana 2nd conference on Basic Education in September, 2008, on the theme: Preparing Teachers for Basic Education, the Minister of Education and Skills Development mentioned that great strides have been achieved in the area of teacher preparation. One would have expected the minister to highlight the shortfall of lack of trained teachers in areas of the CAPA disciplines which are new to the primary education system and the problems encountered by primary school teachers in handling new curriculum consisting of the new subject areas. However, he listed the following questions that he suggested we should continue to ask ourselves:

- How well do the varieties of programmes prepare teachers for new curricula articulated by the Revised National Policy on Education of 1994?
What pedagogical approaches are taught to teacher trainees?

Are student teachers able to teach and use essential skills that their students will need to be successful in a knowledgeable society?

How do student teachers demonstrate that they can appropriately use a range of pedagogical approaches relevant for the 21st Century?

Are they able to adapt the curriculum to cater for the diversity of students that they teach?

Are student teachers equipped to continuously improve their own teaching in response to classroom research data on students’ learning?

What criteria do teacher preparation institutions use to determine that their student teachers are able to assist children to learn? (p. 4).

He further reminded teacher educators in the conference that the Ministry of Education expects education institutions to produce knowledgeable teachers. Zumwault (1989, p. 173) cited by Nkate (2008) said this about the knowledgeable teacher:

Knowledgeable teachers are not technicians, but professional-worthy and able to make decisions and plans based on the principled knowledge that is adapted to the particulars of their teaching situation, their students, their unique experience and their own special insights, self knowledge, values and commitments (p. 5)

One aspect of the case study teachers’ general lack of sufficient knowledge and skills in the subject, was that they seemed not to be aware of the potential role of art and craft centres to education and the benefits they could derive from the art and craft local specialists. Pupils were mostly confined to their school environment and not exposed to art and craft work in places like museums or local artists and crafts-people’s studios. Most of the teachers who said they took pupils outside the classroom confirmed that they confined them to the school
locality to explore textures in the first hand environment or to collect materials for collage. Only three respondents, one class-teacher and two administrators claimed that pupils in their schools were once taken to the community to collect traditional clay, observe leatherwork in process. Various reasons for not taking pupils outside their school locality are shown in chapter 6 which includes the lack of time, funds and transport. Pupils could be taken to local sites which do not incur financial cost for example, to visit traditional artists and craftspeople in the community if appropriate. Considerable art and craft wealth exists in the local community with respect to some of the content in the curriculum.

Schools could approach knowledgeable people about different aspects of the curriculum content and request such people to serve as resource persons at school-based workshops and possibly where appropriate to conduct demonstrations in art and craft classes. The participation by members of the local community in the implementation of the curriculum would ensure that teachers identify and pass on appropriate facts and skills. With such facts and skills, it would be possible to address objectives that teachers might otherwise omit due to either not being confident about certain aspects of the local culture, or simply not recognising what these aspects are. Confining pupils to their schools alone could also inhibit their creativity as they will have limited access to materials for their activities such as collage and mosaic. This can be seen in examples of collage created by S2 class as they were given a short period of time during the class lesson to move out and collect materials for their collage around their classroom. They ended up creating similar outcomes using materials such as grass, soil, seeds and plant stigma as seen below in figures 35 to 39 because they were limited to certain materials that were not always appropriate for what they intended to create and for the background they used:
Figure 35: Collage with limited materials 1

Figure 36: Collage with limited materials 2
When pupils are exposed to a variety of materials to explore, they will produce exciting and unexpected results and hence develop creativity skills. Limited materials for this collage lesson could have resulted from the fact that the school was in a remote area where teachers were concerned that found objects (waste materials) were a problem as there were no shops, factories or offices where they could collect recycled materials such as bottle-tops, newspapers and empty plastic containers. One other observation was that the art and craft curriculum objectives emphasised materials to be used to create items at the expense of techniques and processes. This could have encouraged teachers to concentrate on materials in their teaching as they lacked sufficient knowledge and skills in the subject. This resulted in pupils not understanding the concept and principles of collage, pattern making and drawing clearly from their teachers’ instruction.
Even those teachers who mentioned that they had CAPA teachers’ guides had difficulties in their delivery. The teachers’ guides had essential information which could have substantially helped those teachers if they had understood its content. These references suggested relevant content, techniques, processes, activities, and assessment items for each topic although some may have seemed too dense and too demanding for the level to be taught. Teachers emphasised the difficulty of concepts in the curriculum, teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks which could have led to the problem of not covering important aspects suggested in the teachers’ guides. A further problem could be that of assessment in primary education which requires ‘Criterion Reference Testing’ (CRT) whereby pupils are examined in relation to the objectives stipulated in the curriculum. Teachers therefore could have focused on the components to be evaluated ignoring other important aspects of the topics which could promote pupils’ art and craft vocabulary and practical skills.

Curriculum developers should consider programmes that promote contextual and cultural learning about local artists and craftspeople by involving the community in art and craft activities or teachers and pupils engaging in community-based art and craft education. Joining the community-based education such as the one in Shorobe on the western part of Botswana whereby craft-workers meet to share ideas and learn from each other, working together to create basketry with patterns communicating their identity, would enhance the little knowledge and skills teachers and pupils have in art and craft. This would also help them gain information about their identity. Some of the examples are Pelegano potters in Gabane and Lentswe La Oodi weavers in the Southern part of Botswana. See figure 41 as an example of a wool tapestry showing the ‘Kgotla Village Scene’ created by a group of Lentswe La Oodi weavers. A ‘kgotla’ is a place usually at the traditional chief’s dwelling where the public or people of specific tribes gather to discuss the village’s social events,
make special announcements or any other issues affecting the village. The gathering is usually initiated by the village leader who is the traditional chief of the community.

Andrew (2005) believes that when discussing art history, culture and why artists create their art, pupils can better grasp the relationship of art to the world. In support of the remote area teachers’ concern that distance to art and craft centres was one of the barriers to taking pupils there to learn art and craft as they did not have funds for transport, Coutts (2004) notes that funding and sometimes geography limits the opportunity for artists, craftspeople and
designers to contribute to the education of young people. The questions Botswana art and craft educators and practitioners should consider are as follows: What can be done to enrich our pupils’ experiences and assist the classroom-teachers? How can the increasingly significant contributions of artists, crafts-people and public art and craft be explored meaningfully in the classroom? One mode could be providing resources and archive materials; taking photos and videos and presenting them to schools for teachers to use to supplement their teaching (Wetterlund and Sayre, 2003).

However, Botswana practising artists and craft-workers especially in the capital city, usually make efforts to help teachers by conducting workshops where they invite teachers at all the levels to register and work with them addressing identified themes mostly on painting and drawing. The museum extends their invitations to tertiary education schools such as Colleges of Education and the University of Botswana art and craft department excluding primary schools when having exhibitions. They usually organise exhibitions for different artists and craft-workers to display and discuss their work with audiences which could also benefit primary school teachers and their pupils. Thus, there is a need to contemplate community-based education when the community try to support or reform school art and craft education; when teachers attend to the need to get pupils involved in real world situations and when educators, artists and craft-workers confront important social issues such as the HIV/AIDS pandemic, environmental awareness and population family life education through their artistic and craftsmanship endeavours.

Armed with a conceptual knowledge of the art and craft process, a teacher can confidently explain to students that continual exploration, reformulation, and problem solving are inherent parts of that art-making process (Carpenter, 2005). The central principle of
constructivist teaching is that information becomes meaningful when we relate it to our interests and prior knowledge because if pupils’ activities or projects focus on real life issues, they are more likely to find their learning meaningful and to be active participants in it. Constructivists view knowledge as constructed by the learner in a particular context, and not pre-existing or given from an expert or authority. Art and craft lessons should be prepared in a way that pupils become active and not passive. Their efforts and enthusiasm promote our art and craft curriculum. Andrew (2005) maintains that the teacher is no longer the sole individual championing art and craft.

Pupils in Botswana primary schools appear to have few or restricted art and craftwork experience for example, they are not often exposed to art and craft exhibitions. Visits to art and craft exhibitions by some of the schools usually consist of school trips with no preparatory or reflection opportunities. Art and craft centres such as museums and education institutions, where art and craft can be appreciated, are easily accessible in Botswana. Actual visits to these centres, however, are rare. In the case that visits are made, they are usually not linked to the pupils’ everyday classroom art and craft activities, either before or after a visit. It might have been useful if the curriculum developers had attempted help teachers to understand how art and craft centres such as the museum experience could enhance and enrich pupils’ learning. “One way to take advantage of a museum visit is to consider it as one component of a three-part unit that consist of preliminary preparation, a museum visit, and follow-up work” (Hooper-Greenhill, 1991 cited by Trimis and Savva 2004, p. 20).

According to this authority, learning art and craft encompasses three phases: creating art and craft during art and craft activities in the classroom, a visit to the art and craft centres and making art and craft after the visit to the art and craft centre. This approach enables pupils to
explore materials and techniques and to progress in developmental stages. “Recent literature refers to the significance of incorporating stimuli gained from visits to art museums and places of cultural interest into classroom practice” (Trimis and Savva 2004, p. 20). However, the challenge of getting pupils to fully appreciate and enjoy the museum environment requires specific teaching strategies. Teachers should understand that aesthetic response is cumulative and a lifelong process. The more pupils look, the more they will understand and enjoy art and craft.

Pupils at a lower level could be engaged in simple projects which require studio enquiries. Teachers and pupils would devise a theme and mind-map it to help pupils with the scope of their investigations. “Using themes can be a very good method of teaching art as it encourages children to be creative and avoid doing one and the same thing. It also gives them many alternatives in terms of choosing materials to be used” (Nthoi, 2003, p. 37). They could then visit local artists and craftspeople to interview them and learn their processes and probably work with them both in studios and at school following the art and craft in residences scheme discussed in chapter 3. Engagement of pupils in inquiry-based projects will address the aspects of awareness of culture, practical and problem-solving skills, critical thinking, self-reliance, creativity and awareness of emerging issues as advocated by the CAPA Programme, other educational programmes and government policies in Botswana as stipulated. Issues of choice and decision-making involved in inquiry-methods are central to contemporary art and craft education and are essential in the processes of analysis, interpretation and the construction of meaning for pupils when they look at art and craft. Self-determination or choice is a powerful motivational force in learning that simultaneously enhances both achievements and attitudes about learning. “Art teachers must re-work content and programmes and focus on relationships and connections to what is important to society as

314
well as what is important to art and education. When parents, administrators, and boards of education treat art programmes like reading programmes, we will know that we have become of age – in an age of ages that requires art” (Hicks, 2004, p. 16).

There is news in Botswana news-papers which informs the public about the Ministry of Education’s intention or mission to introduce ‘Subject Specialisation’ in primary schools. According to the Botswana Daily news dated July 18, 2008, Volume No. 136, the Ministry of Education intends to roll out subject specialisation in all primary schools by 2010. This paper states that the ministry’s spokesperson, Mrs Nomza Zuze explained that the move was the Ministry’s response to Recommendation 24 (c) of the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) of 1994, which reads “from Standard four onwards pupils should gradually be introduced to teaching by specialist teachers.” Mrs Zuze according to this paper further noted that,

Although the initiative was rolled out in 2007, … evaluation reports by implementing schools and their supervisors have indicated positive developments in terms of the quality of teaching and learning. Teachers are motivated to teach competitively in subjects of their specialisation and greatest proficiency … Subject specialization would improve students’ performance because teachers would be teaching subjects that they knew and could handle best. For smooth implementation of this initiative, the ministry decided that Setswana, English, science and social studies should be taught by different teachers. … There were challenges of a large number of primary school teachers who were certificate holders but did not specialise during their training. This compromises the intended quality of teaching and learning to a certain extent. The ministry would run some workshops to improve the skills of non-specialist teachers. (Botswana Press Agency, 2008, P. 8).

The Weekly Electronic Press Circular of the Office of the President ‘Tautona Times no 33 of 2008 dated 28th October, 2008 also released the statement that subject specialisation project has been piloted in some of the government primary schools. This issue was also announced by the President of Botswana Lieutenant General Seretse Khama Ian Khama on his remarks.
at the 10th Anniversary celebrations of one of the primary schools (Kaudwane Primary School) in the country. He said:

I wish to take this opportunity to share with you some of the new initiatives aimed at improving performance of the sub-sector of primary education in Botswana. The Ministry of Education and Skills Development has introduced initiatives like subject specialization and other strategies aimed at improving the results of Primary School Leaving Examinations. Subject specialization will enable teachers to teach subjects which they are most proficient in and produce better results. Currently, 273 Primary schools are implementing subject specialization from Standard Four and the Ministry aims at rolling out to all schools, in a phased manner taking into account the resource requirements” (P. 1).

This sounds like good news to instructors and learners but the arts still lag behind because according to information from the Ministry of Education (Primary Department) only those subjects identified by the Ministry to be basic and are examined or tested at the end of primary education are involved in the ‘subject specialisation’ project. This means that art and craft and the other CAPA subjects are taught by any teacher in the primary education system irrespective of their specialist training. However, as mentioned in chapter 5 and 6, one of the case study schools included the entire subjects in the project as they thought that was what the Ministry required them to do. As they did not have any teacher who specialised in art and craft, music and design and technology in this area in their school, they allocated all the standard four CAPA lessons to Mr Datha who was studying a Diploma in Primary Education (DPE) through distance mode learning specialising in physical education. He is one of the teachers who had difficulties in teaching ‘drawing’ and chose not to give pupils feedback on their work or cater for self-evaluation in his instruction (See chapter 5, L4 in Table 10).

My experience is that all the primary school teachers have sufficient knowledge and understanding of the subjects termed ‘basic’ maths, English Setswana, science and social
studies as they have studied them from primary school to their highest level of learning unlike the arts which are new to the primary school syllabus. Few (less than 10%) have specialised in this area. Leaving them out of the subject-specialisation project could influence the Ministry of Education to focus on recommending teachers who go for further studies to specialise on the basic subjects. This would also influence both pre-service and in-service teachers to opt for basic subjects possibly ignoring the arts. However, the Ministry could argue that the CAPA subjects were not included in the subject specialisation project considering the staff on the ground as few teachers were trained in the area. This indicates that the Ministry of Education may be implementing innovations before the appropriate preparation of teachers. This seems to be the case of the introduction of the CAPA programme in primary schools.

7.2.2 Is art and craft taught as a separate subject or integrated with the other arts?

Integration refers to the bringing together of subject disciplines and presenting them as a unity. Arts educationists view the term ‘arts integration’ as cross-subject activity. The issue on integration introduced many inconsistencies among teachers and their administrators during interview sessions (see appendix 5 item 7). None of the teachers observed teaching art and craft integrated the CAPA subjects in their instruction. They taught art and craft subject independently, although during interview sessions 21% claimed to sometimes integrate the arts in their CAPA lessons where they believed the objectives inter-related. Various reasons were given for integrating and not integrating the CAPA subjects. Most responses were either that the arts were integrated because they related well nor they were not integrated because they did not relate thereby avoiding confusion as seen in appendix 5, item 7. One could interpret from these responses that teachers were not sure of what was expected of them in
terms of the CAPA programme as a whole. Those who claimed to be integrating gave explanations which showed that they referred to using art and craft as teaching aids for other subjects such as using pictures to support the teaching of either the English language or social studies. There was little or no evidence of them understanding the integration of the arts or CAPA modules. This concurs with Phuthego’s (2008) findings on his study of ‘The challenges in achieving an integrated teaching and learning of the arts’ in Botswana primary schools. He highlights that:

In spite of expressing little knowledge about integration of content in their teaching, but at the same time taking advantage of situations where they feel it is possible, the teachers do not demonstrate or express a convincing understanding of specific approaches to integration. They do not describe whether they are using themes, activities or projects in the integration of content. On the integration of content, teachers use a number of almost synonymous verbs to explain their understanding of ‘integration’. Reference to integration is expressed in terms such as ‘putting together’, ‘mixing’, ‘joining’, ‘linking’, ‘combining’ and ‘bringing together’ of subjects to teach common themes or to address common objectives. Except where reference is made to common themes brought together to show relationship between subjects, it is generally not clear why integration takes place, i.e. what it is able to achieve (p. 17-18).

Case study teachers seemed relatively unable to identify some relationship between the CAPA subjects, for example, they seemed not aware that drawing can be used to express certain concepts in music such as, drawing of hand signs that indicate pitch. ‘Movement’ is based on the principles that are emphasised in both physical education and music and it also creates rhythm, which is identified as one of the art principles by artists. In addition, the topic ‘construction’ appears both in art and craft and design and technology as these disciplines both deal with construction of iron and wood relief sculptures that can later be designed with a pyrography method. An effective music activity tied to visual art might involve playing a piece of music for pupils and thereafter they can draw or paint the way the music makes them feel. As pupils are doing all these activities they develop a sense of the narrative possibilities
in all art forms and hence connect art with language and communication. There was no evidence that such attempts were being made by the teachers to relate art and craft to other content in the Creative and Performing Arts Programme. Most teachers explained that they were unable to integrate as much as they might like due to a lack of knowledge and skill on their part. In contrary, one respondent in Phibion’s (2006) research findings says CAPA has improved subject integration in Botswana primary schools. The other serious concern as to their inability to integrate content in their teaching, according to one of the school heads, was lack of resources to help them address the objectives that would otherwise lend themselves to the integration of content.

The information gathered from one of the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Education Officers was that teachers were expected to integrate the CAPA subject matter. Respondents concurred with Phuthego’s (2008) findings from administrators he interviewed about the CAPA programme, but they were concerned that it was not demonstrated to them. Judging by the common elements in the arts, one might recommend that it would make sense to teach the common aspects of the arts in the CAPA Programme in an integrated fashion. Most of the Botswana art and craft college and university lecturers were opposed to the integration idea as they believed the four CAPA subjects had different purposes and expectations which required different approaches. I am of the view that the main strategy in exploiting the common aspects between the arts provides an integrated approach to their teaching. The art and craft discipline has an inbuilt facility for linking well with other areas of curriculum work. It facilitates activities because it focuses upon ‘making’ and ‘doing’.

As indicated in chapter 1, the arts have always been integrated to communicate emerging issues and celebrate traditional issues in communities. Chanda (1993) gives examples of
African sculptures, masks and beads work which were used during tradition ceremonies to celebrate, appeal, show identity, appreciate African gods’ gifts, or recognise prestige. Ceremonies were organised at the community leaders’ buildings where people put on special costumes such as beads, skin clothing and masks, bodies painted with various colours. They could sing, clap hands and employ various dancing elements to songs which related to the occasion. The approach entails “education that is organised in such a way that it cuts across subject-matter lines, bringing together various aspects of the curriculum into meaningful association to focus upon broad areas of study. It views learning and teaching as a holistic way and reflects the real world, which is interactive” (Silo, 2006, p. 5).

Chu (2005) identifies the two basic types of integrated arts education: integration between the arts and other disciplines and integration among the fine arts disciplines themselves. However, educationists have divergent views on how to approach the teaching of the arts. Some art and craft educators emphasise that some elements in the arts are common therefore should be united, while others like Taylor (1992) oppose an integrated approach to the disciplines, arguing in support of the differences between them. The differences that some educationists identify as existing between the different arts is not clearly manifested in the literature apart from the underlying fact that the disciplines are identified as having different histories and that they came into the curriculum for different purposes. Phuthego (2008) believes that the view taken by those who wish to highlight the differences between the arts can only create problems in teaching them, as the implication is that they cannot be taught in a combined manner. He focuses on the implications of logistics that arise from such a viewpoint which include staffing, resources and accommodation of the many arts subjects in the school timetable. Stephens (1997) cited in Phuthego (2008) observes that ‘many educators, even those involved in the arts, view integrated or cross-curricular activities as a
lower-order pursuit, which remain a lateral or superficial level of investigation. Such people believe that each of the arts must be dealt with in depth which is possible through specialization’ (p. 6). It should be understood that Stephen (1997) does not object to integration per se as he goes on to propose a model for integration. He believes that a model which allows different layers of association to be explored from growing security in understanding, knowledge and skill in one or more of the arts is far more valuable than a model which advocates integration only.

Integration of the arts such as art and craft, music and design and technology address the culture-issue advocated by many artists and it is an emerging issue in Botswana. Venet (2002) notes that minority pupils need to be included fully in the curriculum because their self-esteem and ability to develop their talents are at stake. He adds by saying that for each pupil to feel a sense of belonging, art and craft teachers should research and select historical exemplars that reflect the arts and aesthetics of a variety of cultures. Botswana’s definition of ‘minority group’ is people who are excluded from the tribes identified by the government as major. The country has eight major tribes and the rest are minor. This concept had always caused some conflict among the Botswana citizens. Pupils in the areas of minority view themselves as inferior and the one from the major tribes as superior. According to Pansiri (2008) experience of schooling in these communities gives rise to the formation of cultural stereotypes and prejudices that can influence negative perceptions towards the purposes of education.

The CAPA programme requires that pupils should acquire knowledge and understanding of their own culture and others and how they relate to Creative and Performing Arts (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Division, 2002). Observation of culture and
tradition is advocated by art and craft educationists such as Dash (2007) although he recognises it as the challenge for teachers to plan and make teaching relevant to the widespread of ethnicities and cultural heritages in the classroom. One way of attaining this could be by integrating the arts from the CAPA programme where possible. Like Nthoi (2003) I believe that the best strategy to integration may be a ‘Thematic Approach’ to the arts topics. Art and craft education can focus on prevailing themes according to the local situation where within the other arts disciplines there is integration around a central theme for example, HIV/AIDS, Pollution or Ethnic groups and/or culture. A teacher could introduce a theme ‘Culture’ where pupils could mind-map it into sub-themes and work on projects such as basketry designed with cultural symbols like the ones on the Western part of Botswana. They could discuss their products communicating their culture and tradition.

Pupils could be engaged in a group project to study tradition and cultures of other people and this will promote a spirit of self-reliance, interpersonal skills through participation in teamwork, positive attitudes towards practical activities and demonstrate the skills of project method approach developed from a simple theme as required by the CAPA Programme for lower primary. According to Dash (2007) among other educationists who have studied tradition and cultural issues in detail, involving pupils in decision-making provides opportunities for them to critique ways of making sense of the world and hence prepares those pupils to challenge social structural inequalities and to promote the aim of social and cultural diversity. Thus, pupils should be educated to become analytical and critical thinkers who are capable of examining their life circumstances.

The Botswana Minister of Education during his closing remarks of the University of Botswana Basic Education 2008 conference, urged educators to infuse contemporary issues
which focus on quality teacher preparation, and gave an example of HIV/AIDS for educators to look at how best its education can be infused into teacher education programmes. This approach can begin with a theme, which then becomes the medium or focal point for all the arts disciplines to interact. Within this framework there are varied levels of integration as illustrated by Palmer (1991, p. 59) who describes the following practices:

- Developing cross-curriculum sub-objectives within a given curriculum guide.
- Developing model lessons that include cross-curricular activities and assessments.
- Developing enrichment or enhancement activities with a cross-curricular focus including suggestions for cross-curricular ‘contacts’ following each objective.
- Developing assessment activities that are cross-curricular in nature.
- Including sample planning wheels or strategies in all curriculum guides.

Palmer’s suggestions might look like referring to the integration of all the subjects taught in a school but if adapted and adopted could help the arts teachers successfully teach the arts as a unity where possible. It encourages the use of new teaching methods that stimulate more learner participation by relating the subject content to real life situation or concerns. The teacher could engage pupils in a puppet theatre project which involves various processes or procedures. Pupils would identify a theme with their teacher which addresses an emerging issue in the village or town. They should think of what they want to tell the audience. Pupils can then discuss the stories in groups and as they discuss the stories they should carefully think about each character. Then they can later create puppets and costumes for their characters. Here is an example of children dancing in their masks and costumes at a movement drama workshop:
This involves different examples and aspects of creativity as pupils will be involved in creative thinking of what the puppet should look like, its size, what type of costume or masks and what materials to use for puppets and costume, the mood or expression as they act the story, the site or place of the show and the stage (Mannathoko, 2003). As they act they will sing and dance to songs relating to the play during intervals. This project integrates many subjects: the language used to write and dramatise the story, creation and decoration of puppets through art and craft, creating costumes through art and home economics, creating stage through design and technology, exercises done during drama practices through physical education and music for songs sung during intervals.

However, teachers need to be careful not to let some subjects overwhelm others. Concepts and skills for each discipline should be observed and emphasised or taught separately for
each subject. The process of how to best approach each module or subject discipline should be considered for example, masks, costumes and sculptures might be created in art and craft classes, and music and dance in music lessons. Sculpture could also be constructed in design and technology lessons under the topic construction. These practical projects would apply the concepts, skills and knowledge pupils gained during individual subject instruction. Integration will be effected through pupils demonstrating the varied processes and discoveries learnt in each subject through theatre performance. This would be both possible and manageable if topics from the CAPA programme could be approached in an integrated thematic problem-based manner such as that recommended for the teaching of the arts by Hookey (1997) among other arts educationists relating arts-curricular activities. It would have been helpful for teachers if examples of integration were included in the Botswana lower primary CAPA programme or teachers’ guides where themes might have been illuminated to encourage integration rather than completely separating the arts. Examples would assist teachers especially those who have limited knowledge in all these four subjects.

(Glatthorn, 1994, p. 92) identifies the following advantages and disadvantages of integration; the advantages are that:

- the real world is integrated.....the problems that adults face.....require the skills and knowledge of several subjects;
- integrated curricula facilitate the introduction of student-related issues and;
- integrated curricula can save some time in the school day.

The disadvantages of integration are:

- critical thinking and problem solving require in-depth knowledge of the subjects. Too much integration might short-change this important content knowledge;
each subject or discipline has its own way of knowing and inquiring, and these are critically important in understanding the world around us and;

many integrated units that are poorly designed will be unlikely to achieve their intended outcomes.

There will be obviously some challenges in developing and implementing an arts-based curriculum. The major areas of concern involve an integration of the arts in teaching, staffing and developing common learning outcomes. The approach calls for hard work, dedication and high levels of co-operation among teachers. Such co-operation and preparation can only be achieved if teachers understand all the CAPA subjects well enough and the integrative approach itself. This calls for appraising the teachers of the relevant facts, teaching methodologies and appropriate approaches to teaching the arts subjects. The solution to the problem of staffing will not be an easy one until the Botswana Ministry of Education considers recommending more teachers for in-service training in these areas and encourage them to specialise in CAPA subjects. It has been a constant requirement in the Botswana National Development Plan 8 that “there is a need for more facilities and training opportunities for the performing arts to be developed into an earning occupation” (p. 443). According to Stephens (1997) the success of teaching the arts in an integrated manner requires a creative perspective from the teacher.

Although lower primary CAPA programme did not emphasise that the four subjects should be taught in an integrated approach, there are certain skills and attitudes the document notes that can be developed through an integrated approach of teaching. This includes: creative skills through composing, performing and designing products, thematic approach skills of problem-solving, interpersonal skills through participation in team-work and awareness and
appreciation of the value of culture and tradition. The programme mentions that all primary school teachers should use the CAPA programme to guide their overall teaching of standard one to four. It further states that although the CAPA subject disciplines were put together in a modular approach, it has a lot of flexibility to facilitate project teaching and integration (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2002). One would assume that the document refers to integration across the curriculum and not specifically for the arts.

7.2.3 To what extent do teachers evaluate pupils’ performance in art and craft through formative and summative assessment emphasised by the CAPA programme?

With limited knowledge and resources in art and craft, Botswana primary school case study teachers desperately seek effective training to make assessment part of an on-going artistic process because this subject’s assessment issue is significantly different from other disciplines.

Unlike in other subject areas, assessment in art focuses on performance assessment, which dictates products as an end result of problem-solving activity. This process is also referred to as authentic assessment that uses realistic, meaningful, open-ended problems as a means of evaluating student learning. Authentic process is used by artists involved in the creative process” (Bensur, 2002).

Teachers could model reflective critical thinking for their pupils by providing tools for pupils to assess their own work. This system could provide pupils with the ability to self-assess while in progress and at the end of the project and hence they might recognise their personal levels of achievement. In addition, preparing pupils to assess their work independently may improve their self-esteem and confidence which could encourage the teacher to concentrate on the process of making art and craft rather than assessing the end product (Stiggins, 2001).
This would help pupils to take into account their hard work and diligence when working on a project rather than the common notion of viewing themselves as either talented or not talented and perceiving their assessment based on those two notions. A major component in any end product in art and craft is creativity, as it involves critical thinking to come up with a personal response. (Bensur, 2002) believes that “accountability begins with effective assessment instruments grounded on basic fairness principles that dictate that students should have access to evaluation criteria” (p. 21). He refers to this as ‘making thinking visible’ and ‘making excellence attainable’. It is important for pupils to know the criteria by which their work will be evaluated. We can not expect excellence from our pupils if we do not always provide them with clear, understandable guidelines by which to succeed and this can only be possible if teachers have the necessary skills of art and craft criticism. Stears (2008) advises that learners should be told comprehensively what they are going to be assessed on, why, how and when that assessment is going to be conducted.

I believe that an assessment of pupils’ art and craft work should be linked directly to what is taught. It is therefore the responsibility of the teacher to ensure that the instruction offered is consistent with the goals the teacher seeks and that the results clearly reflect those goals. To do this in art and craft requires that pupil learning in art and craft production, art and craft history, and art and craft criticism be evident in the written, spoken and visual products of instruction in both the expressive and cognitive domains. For effective results, teachers should make their assessment authentic.

An assessment is authentic when it involves students in tasks that are worthwhile, significant, and meaningful. Such assessments appear as learning activities, involve conceptual and higher-order thinking skills, and interrelate several different forms of knowledge. They make explicit what the student is judged on, and, in fact, are standard-setting rather than standard-testing in their character. Thus, authentic assessment makes the development of students’
content and achievement standards the ultimate goal to be reached in the instructional programme (Dorn, 2002, p. 42).

One of the CAPA requirements is for teachers to assess pupils’ performance formatively and summatively. However, it does not advise teachers to involve pupils in the assessment of their work. Lack of fundamental art and craft subject matter by most of the case study teachers resulted in them not being an evident need for assessment procedures. Most of the participants alluded to the fact that they found it difficult to assess pupils’ performance in art and craft and could not get any assistance from their administrators who also lacked skills in the subject. None of them understood the terms formative and summative assessment and were not aware that these concepts were included in the CAPA requirements. In addition, most of the case study teachers who were observed during teaching sessions seemed not to be familiar with questioning strategies used to involve pupils with looking at art and craft.

Case study teachers who claimed to be assessing pupils’ art and craft work mentioned that they attached scores either in figures or percentages for both theory and practical work and indicated that they assessed finished products and not the process. These teachers however, could not explain their assessment criteria except that they awarded grades or provided comments as ‘good’, ‘fair’ and ‘excellent’. Respondents who said they kept records of their pupils mentioned that those scores were either recorded at the back of the preparation book or designed school assessment forms which few claimed to be passing on to the next teachers at the end of the year. One would ask what message those teachers got from the figures without statements on pupils’ progress. Hopkin (2002) indicates that the Botswana Ministry of Education directs classroom teachers to keep pupils’ profiles. He stipulates that when teachers keep and write these profiles they are expected to provide an in-depth assessment of
the pupil so that one could get to know the child well enough to cater for their individual needs.

According to Dorn (2002) the development of scoring procedures that focus on defining tasks and provide a range of points for scoring each task is new. If what teachers teach in art and craft is mostly centred on pupils’ art and craft performance, then it makes sense to focus most of the assessment effort on the pupils’ art and craft performance. Dorn (2002) further notes that performance assessment in art and craft involves assessing what we generally do in the process of teaching art and craft in schools, which is to make things and evaluate them in the process. There was not sufficient evidence of involving pupils in critical thinking or evaluation of their art and craft work during lesson observation in case study classes and during interview sessions, although this might have helped teachers assess their pupils formatively. Where pupils were engaged in sharing their work with colleagues, they were required to list materials they used and products they created. Teachers put more emphasis on end-products than handling media and materials as process. As shown in lesson observation data (chapter 5), mostly pupils were asked to list materials they had used and refer to what they had created after they had completed their activities. The questions did not involve pupils in critical thinking.

In some of the case study classes the processes pupils learnt and applied when working through their activities were not regarded as a serious issue and yet that is precisely where creativity could be developed. Most thinking is involved before producing the outcome. That is when the art language (elements of art and principles of design) and other art and craft concepts could be included or emphasised when pupils describe the processes they followed and their choice for specific procedures. During our conversations, none of the respondents
seemed to be aware that pupils could be assessed formatively during the process of their projects by creating time to discuss their work in progress and then again after completion. Most of them talked of giving pupils tests which were mostly assessing their knowledge and understanding of the concepts.

Stears (2008) in his paper entitled: ‘Assessment for Learning: How do the ten Principles Mesh with Art and Design?’ maintains that “we need to identify how learners can assess their art and design work, what kind of feedback is appropriate in an art and design context, on what kind of scale, and with what frequency? What kind of guidance on making progress is appropriate?” (p. 2). These questions had not occurred to the case study teachers who involved pupils solely in presenting their finished activities. Teachers and classmates listened to what pupils reported on what they did but did not challenge their work or give advice in the form of feedback or require classmates to comment on the work presented and hence pupils were probably denied the opportunity to identify their strengths and weaknesses for improvement which could develop confidence in their art and craft creation. Black and William (1998) note that “the ways in which assessment can affect the motivation and self-esteem of pupils, and the benefits of engaging pupils in self-assessment, both deserve careful attention” (p. 5). With limited knowledge and resources in art and craft, Botswana primary school case study teachers desperately seek effective training to make assessment part of an on-going artistic process because this subject’s assessment issue is significantly different from other disciplines.

The model of critical thinking recommended by Feldman (1994) and Ragans (2000) enables pupils to understand the work of art and craft and helps the teachers evaluate and assess the pupil’s achievement in both knowledge and understanding of the art and craft concepts and
the practice aspect as the child will be involved in discussing the process and the outcomes of their own work and that of others. This model focuses on four stages which determine the quality and value of the art and craft work. These are: ‘description’, ‘formal analysis’, ‘interpretation’ and ‘judgement’. In ‘description’ pupils will describe the work by listing the visual facts. In the second step; ‘analysis’ will look at how the work is organised in terms of elements and principles of design and in ‘interpretation’ pupils will show the understanding and meaning of the artist, craftsperson or designer’s work, what the artist is saying to the viewer.

In the last step judgement, pupils will determine the degree of artistic or craft-ship merit. Is it a successful work of art and craft or not? They will give their own opinions and reasons for their opinions on others’ work. No one can ever tell someone what to like and dislike therefore pupils need to be encouraged to trust their instincts and be honest with themselves (Nthoi, 2003). They should not try to please anyone as this could interfere with their judgement. They should trust their feelings and know why they feel the way they do. For example, an artist may paint an elephant because he or she likes elephants but the child might dislike elephants and this is likely to affect his or her reaction to the work they are judging. Art and craft teachers should not only study the way children approach art and craft making, but also their appreciation for beautiful forms in their environment (Szekely, 2005). Most art and craft educationists believe that when pupils are prepared they can progressively enjoy the learning process that takes place during their aesthetic journey through an art and craft centre such as a museum. Most importantly, when they become familiar with critical thinking aspect, aesthetic studies and reflective writing process in the classroom setting, they find the art and craft centres or museum environment inspiring and thought-provoking.
“Current recommendations for teaching increasingly call for meaning-making and discussion” (Walker 1996, in Zander, 2004). Teachers are advised to create an environment that nurtures or encourages dialogue or discussion that is not teacher-centred. Teachers could bring images and artifacts to classes for pupils to critique using the four types of art criticism suggested by Ragans (2000) and colleagues. Most teachers are familiar with questioning strategies used to involve pupils with looking at images and artifacts. But while art and craft educators are concerned with questioning and getting pupils to think for themselves, studies show that despite the fact that many primary school teachers believe students should have opportunities for open-ended discussion, in practice, this is observed by researchers less often than teacher self-reports would indicate. Historically, teachers consistently dominate the talk that takes place in the classroom. Flanders (1970) cited in Milbrandt (2002) claims that two thirds of classroom talk is by the teacher. He explains further that two thirds of that talk is direct instruction and two thirds of the direct instruction takes the form of the questions that require a predictable response. In this case the teacher initiates a question, the student responds and the teacher either evaluates, gives feedback, or extends the answer by directing attention to related topics or opinions as observed in case study classes. Very little of what I observed in classroom lessons could be identified as dialogue; the reason being that many teachers were untrained in its use. “Dialogue is not just a matter of asking the right questions or understanding a teaching strategy but a matter of creating an environment in which the teaching relationship becomes one of open-ended discovery” (Milbrandt, 2002, p. 49). Our intention is to help pupils to critically examine the artist’ or craft-person’s work and to make informed choices and decisions when viewing these works.

Mitchell (2005, p. 2) cited by Dash (2005) says that “Art Education … must give children the opportunity to make work using themselves as their starting point and their life as their
inspiration”. Pupils like to view other children’s work and give comments on what excites them; sometimes comparing the work with theirs or other works they experienced and suggesting improvements. This was not experienced in one of the case study classes. (See S2 class observation notes in table 12).

7.2.4 Is the time allocated to art and craft discipline adequate to cover all topics at the end of the year?

Both the observation and interview schedules included the aspect of the time factor to find out whether pupils would complete their activities within the planned time and complete all the topics by the end of the year. Most of the pupils completed their tasks within the stipulated time and some even finished their activities before one hour elapsed. This could be because in most cases pupils were not given sufficient guidelines to clarify what they were supposed to be doing, or there may have been a lack of variety of materials to explore. However, all teachers raised a concern on time allocated to art and craft in their schools. This concurs with Phibon’s (2006) research findings who observed that teachers were concerned that the combination of the CAPA subjects reduced the time allocated to all the practical subjects as compared to the past. They commented that it did not allow them to complete all topics in the CAPA programme by the end of the year. This is when they were asked to share how they distributed time suggested by the CAPA programme or their schools during the interview sessions. Although it was difficult for the respondents, including administrators, to explain how they distributed time to the CAPA subjects per a week, some found time limited to the extent that it inhibited them from integrating and assessing the subjects effectively. Taylor and Andrew (1993) contend that problems that are encountered in the area of teaching art and craft include time allocation, which may be insufficient because the subject involves
each pupil spending most of his or her time confronting a series of problems on their way to a general solution.

The lesson plan notes, verbal and body expressions or signs respondents showed convinced me that they were not aware or did not understand some of the issues of the lower primary CAPA programme such as time suggested by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department. One administrator observed that the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department contradicted themselves by suggesting five hours to CAPA disciplines, which made the total hours exceed the hours required for pupils for lower primary to be in school. Like Stiggins (2001), I am concerned that although teachers could cope with the challenge of assessment in art and craft there is not enough time to pursue it effectively as lack of adequate time is a common complaint registered by teachers. Respondents reported that time was not adequate to teach and assess art and craft effectively considering the following factors:

- large numbers of pupils assigned to them to teach and assess too frequently;
- keeping records which include pupils’ social behaviour in class and assessment of subjects performance;
- preparation involved in teaching all the subjects in the lower primary syllabus;
- preparation of materials for all the subjects and;
- time needed to adapt to special needs pupils.

There was no uniformity on how teachers distributed time to the four CAPA subjects and they therefore encountered difficulty in explaining how they did it. There were many inconsistencies on how time was distributed as reported by teachers from the same streams in the same schools and as reported by their administrators, which points to little
communication among teachers and hence a lack of awareness on how integration might help them address issues of time. Although they were few respondents who claimed to have adopted the five hours minimum suggested for CAPA by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, I observed that their timetable differed as they offered the subjects for less than five hours which indicated that teachers were not always sure of how the CAPA should be handled both in teaching approaches and time allocation.

7.2.5 Do schools have adequate facilities for art and craft education?

The art and craft instructional materials supplied in primary schools included: core textbooks, teachers’ guides, plain papers, pencils, crayons, paint and glue. Textbooks and teachers’ guides were supplied in these schools in phases and during the study some units of textbooks had reached few levels of learning while most classes had not received anything since the introduction of the curriculum in 2002. The most used reference in the teaching of art and craft discipline was pupils’ textbooks and teachers’ guides although limited in most schools. I have observed from the results that there were inconsistencies in providing teachers’ guides and textbooks that are important in the implementation of the art and craft curriculum. In some schools they had a copy of the lower primary syllabus but not a copy of either a textbook or a teacher’s guide while in other schools they had copies of all the texts. Some of teachers complained strongly that the subject was supposed to be practical but because they had limited skills in art and craft they taught it theoretically as it was not backed up by pupils’ text-books and yet the teachers’ guides made reference to them.

In addition, there was a concern that there were too little resources and facilities for art and craft, which resulted in the practical activities not being taught as effectively as other
subjects. Art and craft was taught in ordinary classrooms while the subject often needs more space and purpose-built studios to allow pupils to work on their activities during and after normal classes. The problem of purpose-built classrooms is a concern of all the primary school education units in the country. Art and craft moderators and Colleges of Education instructors have long raised the concern and suggested sufficient structures for better teaching and learning of the subject in Colleges of Education but to date there has been no improvement. This resulted in moderators saying the moderation exercise had lost value since year-to-year reports have repeatedly highlighted this and no action has been effected by the Ministry of Education. Following these concerns and having been involved in this exercise for a period of two years, I believe there is still a long way to go to achieve the goals of high quality basic education in art and craft as a discipline in Botswana.

Many teachers emphasised that lack of materials hindered the teaching and learning of art and craft as a discipline, including its assessment, in the case study schools. There are instances in which lesson materials were inadequate for pupils, for example, where the teacher was teaching ‘collage’ in one of the remote areas. Pupils were asked to go outside during the lesson to collect materials for their activity. Pupils still could not collect various and enough materials as they were confined to the front of their classroom only. This limitation could have affected their creativity. As stated in chapter 1, schools in remote areas were in less developed settlements of the country and some of the school administrators were concerned that teachers and pupils had difficulties in finding found objects or recycled materials because they were no factories or shops to collect from. They even lacked simple materials, such as old newspapers to use in topics like ‘collage’ and ‘mosaic’. The teacher had to cut small pieces of white and pink manila paper to add to what pupils collected to assist them when creating their ‘collage’ design as seen in figure 39. Few teaching aids displayed on the
classroom walls also makes one assume that it was because of lack of materials or the subject not being regularly taught. Additional concerns about teaching reference materials can be viewed from the interview responses (appendix 5, item 10). Materials, physical and human resources were among the teaching of CAPA constraints mentioned by Phibion (2006) and Moalosi and Molwane (2008) in their CAPA research study.

However, with regard to other materials apart from teaching references, teachers need to be encouraged to improvise where necessary and use locally available resources such as clay, reeds, wires, fibres and sticks to create art and craft work. In topics such as ‘Collage’, ‘Mosaic’ and ‘Printmaking’, pupils are required to create their designs using waste materials. (See Module 2: standard 1, 2 and 3, objective 2.3.1.2 and standard 4, objective 2.9.1.2. Botswana has an Environmental Education strategy and guidelines that can serve as a take-off point for designing art and craft products using found objects (waste materials). According to NDP 9, 2003/04 – 2008/09, one of the areas of focus by the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation of the Botswana Ministry of Education during National Development Plan 8, was to use the infusion and integration approach to accommodate emerging issues such as Environmental Education as one of its major mandates to meet the objectives on promoting environmental education (Silo, 2006). It has to be noted that the CAPA programme and other educational documents encourages some self-reliance and resourcefulness to make the teaching and learning process fruitful, even in the face of scanty resources. Adequate materials help teachers create an environment that can promote greater pupils’ input into learning and choices of projects. In such an environment pupils are likely to become energetic and enthusiastic.
7.3 Conclusions

In view of the foregoing discussion, the conclusion reached is that the case study teachers, including school administrators, lacked sufficient knowledge and skills in art and craft as a discipline to enable them to handle the CAPA programme which contains four disciplines. Individuals approached the programme the way they felt appropriate, adapting to their personal preferences. The exclusion of administrators in the development and launching of the CAPA programme contributed to a lack of supervision and assistance of teachers. In addition, the exclusion of techniques and processes on how to go about art and craft activities and emphasising materials to use in most of the topics or objectives by the curriculum developers contributed to the comparatively ineffective teaching and learning of the subject. Pupils were denied the opportunity to benefit from the vital art and craft skills. Robinson (1998) and Barrow et al (2005) cited by Dash (2007) indicate that new teachers should show the determination to engage in new pedagogies relevant to pupils’ lives in recent learning environments, so that they do not miss an important opportunity to integrate values and precepts that could influence their life opportunities. Thus, Dash (2007) encourages teachers to employ strategies for teaching which build on a spirit of inquiry by adopting a more integrated approach to teaching and learning. This is in the spirit of the lower primary CAPA programme which advocates for the development of creative skills through composing, performing and designing products and thematic approach skills of problem-solving. However, the programme does not emphasise or adequately explain integration except mentioning that subjects were put together to facilitate the approach.

Teachers focused mainly on materials omitting the application of relevant art and craft concepts to their practical work. As a result, the teaching of art and craft was less effective than it should have been, considering the content taught to pupils, the strategies applied in
teaching and the problems and difficulties revealed by the results. There is little evidence displayed to indicate that pupils might develop skills stipulated in the lower primary CAPA programme which were derived from the education policies and other government policies such as: the National Principles, Vision 2016, RNPE 1994, the Aims of 10-year Basic Education Programme and the Aims of 7-year Education Programme. This includes attitudes and skills such as:

- knowledge and understanding of basic principles and concepts applied to CAPA
- skills in a range of practical processes to produce useful products
- creative skills through composing, performing and designing products,
- thematic approach skills of problem-solving
- positive attitudes towards practical activities
- a spirit of self-reliance
- interpersonal skills through participation in team-work
- awareness and appreciation of the value of culture and tradition.

Had consideration been given to teaching strategies which include critical thinking when developing the art and craft curriculum, teachers might have employed approaches which promoted some of this raft of knowledge, understanding and skills. Nevertheless, the teachers’ guides, which few teachers had a copy of, suggests activities which could engage pupils in such attitudes and skills although some teachers felt they were difficult and had been supplied with inadequate information. They were concerned that some of the concepts and the process of how to go about activities were not fully explained as seen in appendix 5 item 10.
More confusion was introduced by the combination of art and craft with the three disciplines, music, physical education and design and technology to be one subject. Art and craft had compressed specific objectives, which were not covered by the end of the year because of the few hours the subject was allocated per a week. None of the arts disciplines seem to have been sufficiently taught taking into account the staff available and their responses and yet “the government stated as part of the philosophy for basic education that high quality basic education is a fundamental human right that promote the all-round development of the individual; as well as foster intellectual growth and creativity” (Matsoga, 2006, p. 3). Providing teachers with an enriched education would enable them to contribute professionally to a desired basic education that would prepare learners for life in the 21st Century.

A further conclusion reached is that an integrated teaching of content in the Creative and Performing Arts programme was not taking place effectively. The teaching of content in the programme was largely fragmented, meaning that the various subject areas from which content was drawn were treated independently and taught as such. The teaching and learning were not as effective as they might have been; pupils did not get the full benefit of the integrated arts programme, since some topics were either omitted or insufficiently fulfilled. The issue of integration of the arts has since been debated by art and craft educationists in the Assessment of Performance Unit (APU) (1983), engaging art and design writers such as Best (1983), who were against integration of the arts subject disciplines. Best argued that the different arts subject disciplines serve different purposes in the society. As indicated in chapter 3, some of the post colonial countries which include Namibia and South Africa, have closely similar curricular structures to Botswana’s CAPA programme consisting of dance, drama, music and visual arts. Unlike in Botswana the arts education structures for these
countries are clearly defined for integration purposes. Senegal (according to Bamford’s 2006, research findings) is among the countries in Africa which are advanced in art and craft education as the subject has long existed. Any policy aiming at promoting art and craft education in this country is influenced by this well protected heritage as Education department representatives are knowledgeable of the subject.

Due to teachers’ lack of knowledge, understanding and skills in art and craft, they did not sufficiently assess art and craft as a discipline as required by the CAPA programme and the student-teacher handbook for assessment provided for distance learners. Teachers should have art and craft knowledge, understanding and skills to plan for assessment, observe learning, analyse and interpret evidence of learning, give feedback and support learners in self-assessment (Stears, 2009). These observations call for the education institutions to instill these pedagogical skills in teachers in conjunction with art and craft specific strengths. Teachers with such skills will understand that assessment that encourages learning fosters motivation by emphasising progress and achievement rather than failure and as such they will focus on positive achievement by all learners. One of the case study teachers mentioned that, when engaged in evaluation sessions, she required pupils to identify good and bad art and craft work from their products, although she could not clearly define what was identified as a good or bad piece. Clearly this teacher had limited skills in critical issues in art and craft and evaluation and assessment procedures which led her to employing techniques which might discourage pupils from developing in art and craft.

Finally, the lack of resources including purpose-built art and craft studios has not encouraged sufficiently high quality of practical making. Many teachers were not confident in their teaching as they felt inadequate in view of what the discipline demanded of them. Some gave
reasons of not assessing pupils’ work and keeping their profiles due to lack of resources. In conclusion, the results confirm the problems I assumed teachers could be encountering in teaching art and craft when I initially analysed the CAPA programme especially the art and craft curriculum. This means that the results support the hypothesis of the study stipulated in chapter 2 which were developed from the status core of the study indicated at the beginning of this chapter. However, although the study was not meant to compare respondents, there were some surprises from the classroom observation fieldwork results as some of the teachers who were not trained in art and craft showed more knowledge, understanding and skills in art and craft comparatively to those who did it as generalists in the diploma education in Colleges of Education. Furthermore, teachers in remote area schools were expected to have more difficulties in teaching art and craft topics, considering that they were far from the educational departments and art and craft centres therefore, could have been missing the opportunities of benefiting from the art and craft materials in centres and high schools. They could also have been missing the opportunities of benefiting from the workshops and exhibitions organised by experts in museums and other centres. This was not the case as some seemed to perform better than their counter-parts. “Experts like Meager (1995) have been stressing that teachers do not need to be specialists in art for them to teach it” Nthoi (2000, p. 74).

7.4 Summary

This section summarises the key issues of this chapter.

- The results revealed that most teachers had limited knowledge in art and craft as none of the twenty-four participants had specialised in the subject.
- School administrators were concerned that no useful guidance has been given to them by the Ministry of Education as they had been excluded from the development and launching
of the CAPA Programme and had been expected to supervise teachers in the area without adequate professional preparation.

- Teachers had been trained in basic pedagogy on the general methods of teaching in primary schools but lacked knowledge and understanding of art and craft which resulted in them not encouraging pupils to apply what they had learnt when engaged in practical processes.

- Lack of knowledge and skills in art and craft resulted in some of the case study class-teachers presenting irrelevant content to their pupils and not providing sufficient feedback so some of the curriculum objectives were incompletely addressed or not addressed at all.

- Questions teachers employed during teaching and assessment did not often engage pupils sufficiently in a critical thinking approach.

- The study had suggested that art and craft teachers should develop a flexible climate that encourages pupil inquiry and discussion. Teachers’ questioning skills are a central facilitating strategy to support pupil problem-solving. Thus, the teacher should present numerous opportunities throughout the lesson for pupils to make individual choices about their art and craft work.

- The child-centred method embodies the four Botswana national principles of democracy, unity, self-reliance and development. When using this method pupils work independently as individuals or in groups sharing ideas. They do not depend entirely on their teacher but they are encouraged to find solutions for themselves. This could help art and craft to achieve its aim of providing pupils with practical skills that would enable them to be independent, as well as helping their families when completing school.

- The classroom lessons observed and interview responses indicate that most lessons were conducted within the confines of the school and its grounds. This could have contributed
to the difficulties in richness of content and approaches teachers and pupils had, considering that none of the respondents were art and craft specialists.

- Regular and periodic outdoor work should be an essential aspect of art and craft. Visiting art and craft centres to view and learn more processes and techniques can motivate pupils and hence develop artistic and craft skills.

- Some teachers pointed out that integration as an approach to teaching was generally difficult but they introduced it where possible and yet expressed some uncertainty about what they were doing.

- The study had suggested that teachers should encourage pupils to construct a cross-disciplinary connections and personal meaning in their work. Whether to integrate the arts or not and how to do it will remain a problem for primary school teachers until solved by the art and craft panel which includes the Ministry of Education members, College art and craft lecturers, University of Botswana art and craft lecturers and primary school representatives because members seem not to agreeing on the approach.

- All teachers raised a concern that time allocated to art and craft in their schools was insufficient to complete all the topics in the CAPA programme at the end of the year although they had difficulties in explaining how they shared the time allocated to CAPA to the four subjects included in that programme.

- The insufficient time for these subjects was also believed to be one of the inhibiting factors for integrating and assessing the subjects effectively.

- The problem of lack of time for art and craft appears in most of the art and craft education literature which indicates that it is a global concern.

- Since art and craft resources are bound to be different from that of other subjects, teachers were concerned that they were difficult to locate and obtain and were very expensive. This contributed to the problem of the subject being taught insufficiently in primary
schools. Many art and craft educationists believe that exposing pupils to a variety of materials will help them promote their critical thinking and hence develop their creativity skills. Remote areas had more serious cases of shortage of materials, including found objects, than other areas in the study because of less development involving recycling.

- Respondents further showed a concern that they were having difficulties in assessing pupils both formatively and summatively as required by the CAPA Programme. None of the respondents, including administrators seemed to be aware that pupils could be assessed formatively during the process of their projects by creating time to discuss their work in progress and after completion so as to inform the summative assessment.

- Teachers are key to any educational system; therefore to improve the quality of primary education means putting in place well-trained and well-remunerated teachers. Instances where greater emphasis is laid on the need to provide good quality basic education art and craft teacher education programmes in place must be of a high standard.

- Literature consistently reveals that relevant skills and sufficient teaching strategies displayed by art and craft classroom teachers is determined by the nature or structure of training they get from training institutions.

- It is therefore recommended that non-art and craft major teacher trainees should also be sensitised to critical thinking education to prepare them to engage their pupils in critical and creative thinking activities which include self-evaluation of their work or art and craft criticism of other artists and crafts-people’s work.

- Art and craft essentially focuses on moral and human qualities therefore, if effectively practised in primary schools, could promote the principles of tolerance and honesty advocated by the Botswana government and development of other pro-social behaviours which are essential for the integrity of a great nation.
The next chapter is the last chapter and it gives the summary and recommendations of the study.
CHAPTER 8
SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a summary of the research study and the recommendations arising from it. Observations are based on analysing the teachers’ views and experiences of the recently introduced lower primary art and craft curriculum in Botswana which is an aspect of the CAPA programme. The study was designed to observe the application of the Creative and Performing Arts programme as it impinged on the teaching of art and craft, by observing lessons and questioning teachers and school administrators in a representative cross-section of Botswana primary schools. These findings were then developed into recommended procedures for the future. Both the summary and recommendations sections are presented in sub-headings that refer to specific aspects of the research.

8.2 Summary

The summary of the research is presented under sub-headings that identify the opportunities introduced by the innovatory CAPA programme specifically for teachers responsible for the art and craft curriculum, such as those strategies teachers commonly used in the teaching of art and craft, the time allocation to art and craft as a CAPA subject, evaluation and assessment of pupils’ performance, resources and teachers’ preparedness to teach the art and craft curriculum.
8.2.1 Changes brought by the introduction of the art and craft curriculum

Most of the respondents (83%) indicated that the curriculum has made changes to the traditional way of approaching art and craft lessons by reducing the confusion teachers had felt before its introduction. Respondents believed that the changes to the curriculum had substantially improved their ways of approaching teaching art and craft. The key issues include the presence of a curriculum as a professional guideline on what to teach; teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks to refer to; the curriculum advocating that learners should be allowed to explore art and craft media and techniques thereby developing their manipulative and other art and craft skills (in contrast to the traditional way of presenting theory work to pupils and directing them on what to do); giving opportunities to those pupils below average in academic work that enables them to pursue further studies specialising in art and craft rather than be seen to be failures in life; teachers and pupils gaining knowledge and understanding of the subject including assessment strategies; teachers gaining knowledge of the value of art and craft in people’s lives and the subject being formally taught in classrooms and allocated more timetabled time (unlike in the past when it was taught intermittently and occasionally). Those who were new to the teaching profession shared their experiences of the time when they had studied in primary schools that there had been no curriculum in art and craft.

However, one administrator was of the view that the curriculum has only partly changed art and craft education in the primary school. Her argument was that whilst the curriculum has improved the education system in the sense that she was now able to identify many aspects of art and craft which she had not been aware of before, she felt the way the curriculum was designed had introduced a lot of additional challenges to teaching that now needed experts in the area. There were those respondents who mentioned that they had difficulties in comparing
the past with the present since they had never taught before the introduction of the curriculum. In addition, one of the administrators felt there were no improvements at all since they lacked sufficient materials to teach the subject.

8.2.2 Strategies or approaches teachers commonly used in the teaching of art and craft discipline

8.2.2.1 Integration

One key observation in the findings is that although some of the case study class-teachers have received training in some of the subject disciplines covered by the different modules of CAPA in art and craft, music, and physical education, they were unable to integrate concepts they learnt in their classroom practice when teaching CAPA. Teachers demonstrated little understanding of art and craft and CAPA as a composite programme combining different content areas and concepts from different modules. Yet the newly introduced lower primary syllabus states that one of the reasons for putting together the subjects was to facilitate integration. None of the teachers who were observed teaching art and craft had integrated the CAPA subjects in their instruction. They taught art and craft as a subject independently. However, during the interview sessions some (21%) mentioned that they sometimes integrate the arts in their CAPA lessons after identifying the relationships of the specific objectives from the four disciplines.

A concern expressed is that it is not sufficiently clearly introduced or explained in the CAPA programme how teachers could approach these arts disciplines from an integrated approach. This problem is also revealed by Phuthego’s (2007) findings on the CAPA research that teachers did not demonstrate or express a convincing understanding of specific approaches to integration. In this respect, it should be noted that there is some disagreement amongst the
members of the art and craft panel on how to approach the CAPA programme. The Ministry of Education representative emphasised that teachers were expected to teach in an integrated approach whereas lecturers from primary school teacher training institutions argued against such an approach indicating that the CAPA disciplines have different purposes and expectations which require different approaches. This may have confused those primary school teachers who tend to rely on these members by virtue of their profession as curriculum developers and teacher trainers. This challenge confronted school administrators who complained that the concept of curricular integration had never been demonstrated to them although they were expected to assess and assist teachers.

I believe that integrating the arts would address the concern from some of the Botswana CAPA researchers that Botswana curriculum designers have not yet been able to encode cultural phenomena in some of the CAPA subjects, such as in the art and craft curriculum. Pupils could stage a drama event integrating artworks such as masks and puppets with music, using a stage created through design and technology processes under a theme such as ‘culture.’ The CAPA programme emphasises ‘culture’ responding to the RNPE (1994), the national principles and the Vision 2016 pillars, which recommend that the education system must develop moral and social values, cultural identity and self – esteem, good citizenship and desirable work ethics. The influence of culture on art and craft education in a country like Botswana is profound and complex, as the country has various ethnic groups of different languages, cultures and traditions.

8.2.2.2 Teaching and learning environment

Teachers who were observed teaching art and craft attempted addressing the objectives mostly through a question and answer method. Some of the teachers were flexible and
considered other aspects which were relevant to what they taught which were not prescribed by the specific objectives. Pupils were not encouraged to apply what they had learnt theoretically to their mainly practical activities. Some teachers discussed the art and craft concepts but did not encourage their pupils to apply them when creating their products. This may have caused them to pay less thorough attention to their activities as there were few educational guidelines to observe.

Most teachers including school administrators were not fully aware of the role of art and craft centres to education and the benefits they could get from local art and craft practitioners. Pupils were mostly confined to their school environment and not exposed to art and craft work elsewhere such as museums or local artists’ and crafts-people’s studios. Some of the teachers took their pupils outside the classroom in the school grounds to collect materials for the lessons during their teaching but not to other locations. As has been shown in the literature most researchers maintain that involvement of local artists, craft-persons or designers in schools can promote effective awareness and extension of culture in art and craft lessons. At the same time, it is often advantageous to maintain close contact with artistic contexts like museum or galleries to help teachers and pupils gain knowledge and skills in art and craft. Such approaches are also viewed by most art and craft education researchers as helpful in promoting child-centred and enquiry methods which develop critical thinking and creativity skills in pupils. As shown in the literature, art and craft researchers emphasise that critical thinking is enhanced by independent enquiry, problem-solving, interactive discussion and analysis. As pupils investigate artifacts, artwork and craftwork of other cultures, they engage in a complex enquiry that requires an examination of processes and products from a variety of perspectives, among which include practical, aesthetic, historical, economic and social dimensions (Borg, 2007).
8.2.3 Time allocation to CAPA subjects

Most of the respondents including administrators expressed concern about distributing five hours recommended by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department to be the minimum allocation to the CAPA curriculum. They were concerned that five hours was not enough to cover all the topics in the CAPA programme due to the congestion of specific objectives. Respondents reported that assessing and maintaining records for all their pupils was too demanding and difficult since they were involved in preparing and teaching all the subjects in the lower primary syllabus. They were also concerned that they needed time to prepare materials and cater for remedial lessons for the special needs pupils. There was no uniformity on how teachers distributed time to the four CAPA subjects. There were many inconsistencies between the accounts of teachers and their administrators on how time was distributed.

Although they were some respondents who claimed to have adopted the five hours minimum recommended for the CAPA programme by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, their timetables contradicted this claim which indicates that they offered the subjects for less than five hours. Despite that teachers were concerned about the limitation of time for art and craft lessons, most of the pupils in the case study classrooms completed their tasks within the stipulated time and some finished their activities inside the one hour period.

8.2.4 Evaluation and assessment of pupils’ progress

Various art and craft researchers have shared ideas on the values of various forms of evaluation of pupils’ art and craft work. Various art and craft educationists conclude that evaluation is an effective means of assessing pupils’ art and craft performance in which the
criteria for evaluation has been developed by both the teacher and the pupils; and where self-evaluation is understood to be an essential educational assessment tool. It is insufficient simply just to accept or dismiss the child’s work. There has to be correspondence of some kind between the child, their work and the teacher; the qualities apparent in the work; what the child says about it and the observation and understanding of the teacher. As shown in chapter 3, research has indicated that assessment is the vehicle for encouraging the formative and cyclical process of learners’ creation. Teachers therefore should help pupils to understand the evaluative criteria to be used to assess them and support their involvement in its creation. Pupils need to understand what it is they are trying to achieve and they need to be involved in wanting to achieve it. When the teacher manages to bring these aspects into relationship then positive learning takes place. Assessment was one of the most significant aspects the case study teachers raised a concern about as most of them stressed that they lacked knowledge in assessing practical activities which resulted in them either not assessing, grading with figures or numbers they could not clearly account for or putting a tick with comments such as ‘good’ ‘fair’ or ‘excellent’. Teachers and pupils’ knowledge of the basic guidelines for viewing works of art and craft through an art and craft critiquing model might help them to find meaning in what they see when looking at art and craft works and hence enable them to more comprehensively evaluate art and craft activities or projects.

One of the CAPA programme requirements is for teachers to assess pupils’ performance formatively and summatively. However, it does not advise teachers to involve pupils in the assessment of their work. None of the respondents understood the terms ‘Formative and Summative Assessment’ and were not aware that these concepts were included in the CAPA requirements. In addition, most of the case study class-teachers observed teaching were not familiar with questioning strategies used to involve pupils with looking at art and craft work.
There was no evidence of involving pupils in critical studies or evaluation of art and craft work during lesson observation in case study classes and during interview sessions. Very little of what I observed in classroom lessons could be identified as dialogue. Pupils were mostly asked to list materials they used and products they created. Pupils should be educated to become analytical and critical thinkers who are capable of examining their life circumstances. If criteria for involving pupils in the evaluation of their own performances through all the processes were clearly defined in the curriculum, this information could help teachers in the assessment of their pupils’ performance to fulfil the CAPA requirement.

8.2.5 Resources for teaching and learning art and craft

Teachers listed problems of lack of art and craft resources which included reference books, plain paper, paints, glue and physical facilities. They mentioned that the council for each region was required by the government to supply art and craft instructional materials such as core textbooks, teachers’ guides, plain papers, pencils, crayons, paint and glue. The concern was that these materials especially textbooks and teachers’ guides were supplied in most schools in phases and some indicating that they had not received them since the introduction of the curriculum in 2002. Most schools which had these resources were concerned that they were limited. Teachers strongly complained that teachers’ guides made reference to the pupils’ textbooks which schools did not have which made their teaching particularly difficult. In addition, there was a concern that art and craft was taught in ordinary classrooms which were inappropriate for the subject which resulted in the practical activities not being taught as effectively as other subjects. Respondents advocated for purpose-built classrooms in primary schools.
All respondents emphasised that lack of materials hindered the teaching and learning of art and craft as a discipline including its assessment. The problem of material was also evidenced during the classroom observation lessons whereby pupils struggled with activities due to lack of and limited materials. Where possible, teachers need to be encouraged to consider using available materials in the locality. Improvisation in education is emphasised by the Botswana National Development Plan 9, 2003/04 – 2008/09 to accommodate emerging issues such as Environmental Education as one of its major mandates to meet the objectives on promoting environmental education. The CAPA programme and other educational documents encourage some self-reliance and resourcefulness to make the teaching and learning process fruitful even in the face of scanty resources. Studies have advocated for adequate materials in art and craft classrooms arguing that these help teachers to create environments that can promote greater pupils’ input into learning and choices of projects. When pupils are exposed to a variety of materials to explore, they become more innovative and develop creative skills. Teachers in remote areas had more problems as they could not find sufficient found objects (waste materials) because there were no shops, factories or offices where they could collect recycled materials.

8.2.6 Teachers’ preparedness to teach the art and craft curriculum

Both the classroom observation and the interview results revealed that most teachers had limited knowledge, understanding and skills in art and craft education as none of the twenty-four participants had specialised in the discipline. 42% of the respondents were trained as generalists in the art and craft area. Teachers complained that they did not get sufficient orientation from the Ministry of Education on how to approach the CAPA programme and that there was no follow-up assessing whether or not they had coped with the introduced programme. Teachers listed some of the constraints that contributed to some of the issues
preventing full implementation of the programme through to reflective and evaluative final assessment that included: difficult terminologies and content in the curriculum and available references, lack of relevant resources, congested objectives with limited content, lack of in-service training and supervision in the subject.

The art and craft generalists teachers also indicated difficulties in approaching the art and craft curriculum. In addition, the newly qualified teachers expressed the fact that they were facing significant professional challenge in teaching the CAPA programme including art and craft. The problem could be the structure of the college curriculum as the art and craft panel minutes dated 14\textsuperscript{th} – 15\textsuperscript{th} May, 2007 shows that there was no agreement on how teachers could approach the CAPA programme. One of the researchers observed that lecturers offering different subjects in the Colleges of Education in Botswana concentrate on the general pedagogy of teaching in primary schools and provide student-teachers with comparatively insufficient professional training on their respective disciplines.

Lack of knowledge and skills in art and craft resulted in some of the case study class-teachers presenting less than relevant content to pupils. The case study classroom teachers who were observed teaching art and craft lessons mostly emphasised materials rather than techniques and methods of creating art and craft work. This could be due to the fact that the art and craft curriculum objectives mostly emphasise materials to be used to create items without paying attention to appropriate techniques and processes which could have influenced teachers to do likewise in their teaching as they lacked sufficient knowledge and skills in the subject. Even those who mentioned that they had CAPA teachers’ guides had difficulties in their delivery although the references suggested relevant content, techniques, processes, activities, and assessment for each topic. Teachers complained that these were too congested like the
curriculum and too demanding for them and the appropriate primary level. This could have led to the problem of omitting important aspects suggested in the teachers’ guides. Interestingly, one of the teachers who did not train in art and craft appeared to be more knowledgeable in the subject than those who studied the discipline as generalists. She was organised and delivered relevant content sequentially and confidently except that she could not encourage pupils to apply the theory they learnt relating to practice. Most school administrators indicated that they did not have sufficient knowledge and skills to assess and assist teachers in art and craft lessons.

However, both case study teachers and school administrators were optimistic that positive intervention by the authorities could change the situation for the better. The recognition by these teachers that art and craft is important to pupils for developing practical skills and self-reliance is both welcome and positive and shows that there is a high likelihood of them applying themselves professionally more than they have hitherto. Such application will make the implementation of the CAPA programme more effective and ensures that the aims of the primary school syllabus in general, and the aims of the art and craft in particular, are addressed. Teachers suggested some of the solutions to the concerns they identified which they emphasised if adhered to, could improve the implementation of the art and craft education at lower primary. These suggestions were taken into consideration when making recommendations for future development of the art and craft curriculum.

These challenges pose a formidable to the Department of Primary Education as the findings of this study correlate directly with research by other University of Botswana CAPA lecturers, Phibion (2006), Phuthego (2007), Moalosi and Molwane (2008), Phuthego (2008).
and Gaotlhobogwe and Mannathoko (2008). Schools need help facing identifiable educational problems arising from teaching art and craft through the CAPA programme.

8.3 Recommendations

In the light of the observations made with regard to the findings in this research and the conclusions drawn, the recommendations are advanced under the following sub-headings: the CAPA programme and art and craft curriculum review, programme monitoring, in-service training, Creative and Performing Arts panels, utilisation of local human resource and community participation, procurement of books and equipment and suggestions for further research.

8.3.1 The CAPA programme and art and craft curriculum review

The programme should be reviewed with a view to achieving the following:

a) The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department should convene an immediate workshop with the stake-holders specifically the CAPA teacher training lecturers to review the programme and to find means of redesigning a primary school programme more closely aligned to the teacher training courses.

b) Topics which relate should be identified and common themes identified and given prominence throughout the programme so as to achieve maximum integration of subject matter across the different arts modules in the CAPA programme.

c) Over-prescribed specific objectives which appear to dictate those lesson activities teachers should provide to pupils should be reviewed to allow more flexibility in
teachers’ instruction and reduce load to make completion of the programme by the end of the year.

d) Art and craft curriculum designers should consider including a recognised cultural dimension in the curriculum as it is an emerging issue in Botswana and globally.

e) The art and craft curriculum designers should consider introducing and explaining skills, techniques and methods within the objectives in all the topics to make more effective teaching in specific art and craft content.

f) The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department should review the time allocation for CAPA subjects in relation to the subject areas or modules as it was identified as one of the obstacles in the effective teaching and assessing of art and craft as a discipline.

8.3.2 Programme monitoring

The three departments, the primary section, the Teacher Training and Development (TT&D) and the Curriculum Development and Evaluation should work together and undertake regular visits or inspections of the primary schools in all the regions to observe first-hand the situation on the ground regarding the implementation of the Creative and Performing Arts programme. Regular visits would help with monitoring and managing the implementation of the programme. Follow-up of the evaluation should be based on carefully selected evaluation approaches to enable the development of further guidance. This should be done in consultation with stake-holders such as the teacher training college lecturers. Furthermore, suitable individuals should be appointed as Education Officers for practical subjects in appropriate departments such as Primary Education and Teacher Training and Development. Such officers would be able to assist when schools appeal to them for support.
8.3.3 In-service training

In view of the high number of teachers who confirmed that they lack sufficient knowledge and skills in the subject of art and craft and also that CAPA is a new programme in the primary school curriculum, there is a need to conduct needs assessment for in-service-training programme so that such training is oriented towards meeting the teachers’ needs. The evaluation team from the Ministry of Education Department should work closely with the teacher training institutions and primary school teachers who attended the orientation when CAPA was launched so as to monitor their progress and motivate them to mount workshops for their colleagues at both school and regional level.

8.3.4 Creative and Performing Arts panels

a) Panels from the four disciplines which form CAPA should meet to address the common problems of teaching through the arts rather than tackling them separately so as to consolidate a convincing report to advocate for the subject to the Ministry of Education.

b) The art and craft panel should consider mounting workshops and organise artists and craft workers-in-residence schemes in primary schools frequently to work with teachers and pupils. This should involve stake-holders such as artists and craft-workers and museum staff who could also play a role in promoting the subject by engaging in activities with schools.
8.3.5 Utilisation of local human resource and community participation

Primary schools should be encouraged to approach and request the services of experts in different aspects of art and craft such as painters, sculptors or designers from the local community.

8.3.6 Procurement of books and equipment

Communication of who is responsible for issuing equipment and prescribed CAPA books should be made clear to the teachers and the process be expedited so that books and equipment reach schools urgently. In some cases pupils proceed to the next level before books are made available. Since many of the school administrators and teachers have limited knowledge in art and craft it would be helpful to assist them with possible lists of materials suitable for various topics in art and craft so that they could make requisition to their council offices before schools resume. The potential of improvisation should also be encouraged in schools as with view to sound ecological practice.

8.3.7 Further research

Further research in the area of art and craft curriculum as one of the new CAPA programme disciplines in Botswana primary schools is certainly needed that focuses on specific aspects of the syllabus at various levels of learning. Possible aspects for further research include the following:
Table 22: Possible aspects for further research in art and craft education in Botswana

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Topic</th>
<th>Modes</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investigation into approaches to the integrated teaching of the Creating and Performing Arts programme.</td>
<td>National report</td>
<td>➢ Help teachers integrate the CAPA disciplines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigating the extent to which the community could participate in the implementation of an integrated indigenous arts programme.</td>
<td>National Report. Thesis/Dissertation.</td>
<td>➢ Teachers to benefit from art and craft in different cultures and develop practical skills. ➢ Sensitise stakeholders to get involved in school activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of time allocation to the Creative and Performing Arts disciplines.</td>
<td>National Report. Thesis/Dissertation.</td>
<td>➢ Teachers &amp; pupils to have adequate time for the CAPA programme and evaluation/assessment of practical projects. ➢ To complete the CAPA programme at the end of the year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigation of how art and craft specialists in primary schools interpret the Creative and Performing Arts programme as the case study schools for this research did not have any specialist teacher in art and craft therefore focused on non-specialists.</td>
<td>Thesis/Dissertation.</td>
<td>➢ Get feedback for improvement of teacher-training programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examining the contributions made by art and craft centres to the teaching and learning of CAPA in primary schools.</td>
<td>National Report. Thesis/Dissertation</td>
<td>➢ To sensitise stakeholders to get involved in school activities. ➢ To help teachers and pupils gain knowledge and skills from the art and craft experts in the country and increase their critical and creative skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


Clement, R. (1992) *The Readiness of Primary Schools to Teach the National Curriculum in Art*. Plymouth: The Centre for the Study of the Arts in Primary Education,


367


371


Jones, D.J. (2000) *Adults, aesthetics and Lifelong Learning in the Adult Curriculum*. Nottingham: Continuing Education Express, School of Continuing Education, University of Nottingham.


Mallen, ND Art and design in the primary school. Sussex: East Sussex County Council


Schools and Teacher Education and Callaway International Resource Centre for Music Education (CIRCME).


Ndaba, N.N. (2008) *The Effects of the Shift from Traditional Craft Subjects to Design and Technology: The Botswana Experience*. Retrieved from [http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/) 12/03/09.


APPENDICES

Appendix 1  Classroom Observation Schedule for Art and Craft Lessons

Section A:

Personal details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Place of Birth</th>
<th>Years of teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Professional Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td>PTC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JC</td>
<td>Bed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGCSE</td>
<td>Med</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER</td>
<td>PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post in School:

Head-teacher

Deputy Head-teacher

Head of Department (Lower, Middle, Upper) Classes

Senior Teacher (Please Specify)______________________________

Class-teacher

Other: (Please Specify)______________________________

...Current Class

Standard 1

Standard 2

Standard 3

Standard 4

No of Pupils in class:______________________________
SECTION B: Information about the lesson observed

Topic: ________________________________________________________________

General Objectives: ________________________________________________

Specific Objectives: ________________________________________________

Relevancy of the teacher’s preparation notes: _________________________

Organisation of Class: ______________________________________________

Date: __________________________________________________________________

Time: __________________________________________________________________

SECTION C: Lesson Presentation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Teaching strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Approaches Used?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indoor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. Methods Used?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child-Centred</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-Centred</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. To what extent did the teacher master the content?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Pupils’ tasks/activities</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Type of tasks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. Did pupils cope with the tasks?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Adequacy of materials or tools &amp; equipment?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. How are pupils involved in the evaluation of their work?

6. Time factor
   i. Were pupils able to complete their tasks within the planned time?
   ii. Was the teacher able to cover all her tasks within the planned time?

SECTION D: Pupils’ conversation about their work

1. What have you created?
2. What materials have you used?
3. Why did you choose to create this object/product/image?
4. What processes did you follow to create your product?
5. What did you enjoy about the activity?
6. What problems did you encounter when creating your product?
7. What would you do differently if given chance to work on your activity again?
Appendix 2  Unstructured Interview for Case Study Schools and other Stake Holders

Name of School/Department:___________________________________

What is your view about art and craft curriculum for lower primary?
Appendix 3  Interview Schedule for Teachers

Section A:

Fill in the blanks or tick where applicable

Personal details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Place of Birth</th>
<th>Years of teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Professional</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td></td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JC</td>
<td></td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGCSE</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td>Med</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post held  (tick as appropriate)

- Class-teacher
- Head of department
- Senior-teacher
- Deputy school head
- School head
- Other

Current Class  (tick as appropriate)

- Standard 1
- Standard 2
- Standard 3
- Standard 4
Section B: Teachers’ views on art and craft in general

Item 1: What do you understand the terms art and craft terms to mean?

Item 2: How does art and craft contribute to society?

Item 3: What is the value of art and craft education to the primary school child?

Item 4: How well do you think Botswana Vision 2016 pillars are represented in the Art and Craft Curriculum for Lower Primary?

SECTION C: Teachers’ Views on the implementation of the Curriculum

Item 5: How did the introduction of the art and craft curriculum improve your teaching?

Item 6: What approaches do you commonly use in the teaching of art and craft?

Item 7: Do you integrate the CAPA subjects when teaching or you teach them separately?

Item 8: How do you distribute 5 hours suggested to 4 CAPA subjects as minimum duration per a week?

Item 9: Will you please share with me how you use formative and summative assessment techniques emphasised by the CAPA programme to assess learners’ performance in art and craft.

SECTION D: Teachers’ preparedness to teach art and craft curriculum at lower primary

Item 10: What problems do you encounter when teaching the newly introduced art and craft curriculum?

SECTION E: General comments about art and craft Curriculum

Item 11: Do you have any suggestions you feel could help improve the art and craft curriculum at lower primary?

THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS RESEARCH. YOU CAN BE ASSURED OF CONFIDENTIALITY AND ANONYMITY AND FULL ATTENTION TO ETHICAL PROCEDURES
Appendix 4  Interview for the School Administrators for Lower Primary

Section A:

Fill in the blanks or tick where applicable

Personal details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Place of Birth</th>
<th>Years of teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Professional</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PSLE</td>
<td></td>
<td>PTC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JC</td>
<td></td>
<td>DPE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGCSE</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td>Med</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post Held:  (tick as appropriate)

School head
Deputy school head
Senior teacher
Head of department
Other

Current Class  (tick as appropriate if applicable)

Standard 1
Standard 2
Standard 3
Standard 4
Standard 5
SECTION B: School administrators’ views on art and craft in general

Item 1: What do you understand the terms art and craft terms to mean?

Item 2: How does art and craft contribute to society?

Item 3: What is the value of art and craft education to the primary school child?

Item 4: How well do you think Botswana Vision 2016 pillars are represented in the art and craft Curriculum for Lower Primary?

SECTION C: School administrators’ views on the implementation of the art and craft curriculum

Item 5: How did the introduction of the curriculum improve teachers’ teaching of art and craft?

Item 6: What approaches do teachers commonly use in the teaching of art and craft?

Item 7: Do teachers integrate the CAPA subjects when teaching or you teach them separately?

Item 8: How do teachers distribute 5 hours suggested to 4 CAPA subjects as minimum duration per a week?

Item 9: Will you please share with me how teachers use formative and summative assessment techniques emphasised by the CAPA programme to assess learners’ performance in art and craft.

SECTION D: Teachers’ preparedness to teach art and craft curriculum at lower primary

Item 10: What problems your teachers/you encounter when teaching and assessing teachers on the newly introduced art and craft curriculum?

SECTION E: General comments about art and craft Curriculum
Item 11: Do you have any suggestions you feel could help improve the art and craft Curriculum at Lower Primary?

THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS RESEARCH. YOU CAN BE ASSURED OF CONFIDENTIALITY AND ANONYMITY AND FULL ATTENTION TO ETHICAL PROCEDURES.
Appendix 5 Interview Fieldnotes

6.3.1: Teachers’ views on art and craft in general

Item 1: What do you understand terms art and craft terms to mean?

Loso

L1: ‘Art is to express what you think. That is expressing yourself through drawings and craft is how you use your hands.’

L2: ‘Art is any work done by hands. It can be drawing and singing. Craft deals with work done by hands creating traditional objects’

L3: ‘Art is a practical subject. Craft and art are the same thing, I do not know how to differentiate them.’

L4: ‘Art is a subject that is creative. Pupils can create something and make a living from those things that they have created. Craft refers to using pieces of scrap to make something of a better value.’

L5: ‘Art is simply drawing, moulding, painting and even dancing. Craft is putting things together to come up with a concrete thing.’

LH: ‘Art is something that you do practically that can be seen. Craft is what you make with your own hands.’

Selepe

S1: ‘Art is anything that you can create either by drawing or singing. Craft is all about using your hands to create something. It might be carving or knitting’.

S2: ‘Art deals with things of nature. Craft means doing with your hands’.

S3: ‘Simply, art is a state where somebody uses a pen, crayon or something to draw a picture. Craft is to mould for example, moulding sculptures’.

S4: ‘Art is something which decorates, which suits your emotions. Craft is concerned with sculptures, using hands to produce products’.

SS: ‘Art means to be creative in drawing, painting, singing and using papers to make a mosaic. I also view it as performing arts. Craft is the ability to do sculptures, weaving and carving’.

SH: ‘Art refers to things that are done by our hands. Craft is the same as art but slightly different. Art can be done by hands and vocal whereas craft is based on hands only’.

Budzi


B2: ‘Art is something that deals with painting. Craft deals with carved things’.

B3: ‘Art is basically expressing yourself through drawing and painting. Craft is something to do with creating something for example, moulding’.
B4: ‘Art is what we do in real life. Craft is what we make and some people even earn a living through craft’.

BS: ‘Art is a talent where you express yourself through drawing and writing. Craft is where you use hands for instance carving’.

BH: ‘Art deals with drawing all those things that you can do. Craft is more of practical and deals with sewing, weaving, and all those things that we can do’.

Xai

X1: ‘Art is whereby you express your feelings or views through pictures, music, drama or anything else. Craft is an end product. Using something to come up with an end product for example using reeds to create an object’

X2: ‘Art is what is done by hands; for example, drawing and painting. Craft deals with designing and carving’.

X3: ‘Art is a subject that is there to enable learners to express their feelings and thoughts. Craft is a way in which learners put what they have learnt into practice; for example, designing what they feel like’.

X4: Art is one way of trying to express yourself. You can express yourself by drawing, modelling and painting. I do not know much about craft’.

XS: ‘Art is everything you can design, anything you can come up with. For example if you want to draw a tree, you can scratch first and that scratch can become a tree. Craft deals with weaving using traditional reeds’.

XH: ‘Art is presenting something to express your views just like experiencing your views with dance and stimuli. Craft is something done by hands’.

Item 2. How does art and craft contribute to society?

Loso

L1: ‘It contributes to the society because children should learn to use and express their feelings to show other people how they feel about the environment they live in.’

L2: ‘When children complete primary school they can earn a living through art and craft if they do not get the opportunity to progress to higher institutions. They can create objects such as pictures, paintings and baskets to sell.’

L3: ‘It improves the creativity skills of the children. The society can benefit from it for example drawing pictures to sell and earn a living.’

L4: ‘People can make a living out of art and craft’.

LS: ‘Some people survive on art and craft. They make products and sell to make a living.’

LH: ‘It is important because even from the olden days there was art and craft. With art you can do so many things. As you go around you can see boards portraying art and craft for example, paintings. There are so many things that one can do to earn a living from art and craft for example, paintings and the writings.’

Selepe

S1: ‘It is important in a way that it can create employment. When I look at art if you know how to draw, paint or make sculptures you can get employment’.
S2: ‘It helps communicate the past to the new generation’.

S3: (No response given. The question seemed to be very difficult to the interviewee despite several probing).

S4: ‘Art and craft can be used to earn a living. For example, draw in shops to earn a living’.

S5: ‘When children do art and craft in primary school, they will grow up being more creative in activities such as weaving, carving and sculptures. They can benefit from art and craft for their living’.

SH: ‘It contributes a lot in peoples’ lives because it is a form of making a living, for example, weaving and basketry. That is why it has to start at an early stage so that pupils grow having the skills they can use in future’.

Budzi

B1: ‘Some people are gifted in art and craft therefore could earn a living through art and craft’.

B2: ‘Some people earn a living from it. Those who did not go further in school can create things like pots to earn a living from it’.

B3: ‘People can make a living out of art and craft for example, making things to sell to get money. It can benefit people economically’.

B4: ‘When entering some peoples’ houses you can find designs and that is art. Art is everywhere’.

BS: ‘When you look at the general life of the community, they apply art and craft everyday. Everything they are using at home is art’.

BH: ‘Some people can use things that they get from art. They can use it in their lives. Some people make paintings and sell for their living; for example, carving’.

Xai

X1: ‘Some people express their feelings through art and craft. They can model something to express something to people. For example, communicating their culture to people through art and craft work’.

X2: ‘It creates jobs for example, one can carve chairs. It also helps maintain or retain our culture. There are paintings or things that happened in the past that involves culture that can be seen by other generations to come’.

X3: ‘It creates jobs for the society that we are talking about because after gaining this knowledge one would put it into practice for example, drawing and so on and sell to the community or carving wooden chairs to earn a living’.

X4: ‘One can take art as a profession and eventually become a teacher. It also sends a lot of message for example, billboards which send HIV/AIDS messages to people out there’.

XS: ‘In a society art is everywhere for example in a gathering you find artwork displayed in a certain design. Even the way we dress there is art. When we choose dresses looking at the colours and design; that is art. Therefore when the society choose to buy things they are influenced by art’.

XH: ‘The community can make things for themselves and sell to earn a living’.
Item 3: What is the value of art and craft education to the primary school child?

Loso

L1: ‘It shows the child’s creativity or increases it. For example when a child knows something, the teacher shows him or her more of how to do it.’

L2: ‘Sometimes you find some of the children with difficulties in other subjects but when giving them art and craft activities, they show that they are part and parcel of the class, doing well in it than in other subjects. This then means that when they go to a higher level like secondary school, they will be able to make good choices of subjects according to their interest and abilities.’

L3: ‘It develops pupils’ creativity skills and hence they love the subject.’

L4: ‘Art and craft is very important to pupils especially those who are gifted because they can create products to sell to make a living.’

L5: ‘If it was taught the way it is planned it will be of importance to the children but because of lack of materials and time pupils do not benefit from it, not at all. If there were materials they would work on it and acquire a lot of skills which can later help them in future for further studies or even earning their own living.’

LH: ‘When one is educated in art and craft he or she can end up making a living through it by making paintings and other products to sell.’

Selepe

S1: ‘Pupils might be having that talent of painting and drawing and in this subject they could be able to show that talent and they can go on improving it as they grow up’.

S2: ‘It contributes a lot. For example, a child could learn colours and shapes which they can later relate to their day to day lives. For example, children can mix colour to create the real colour of a donkey when painting its picture’.

S3: ‘Not all students are able to perform well in theoretical subjects therefore, the art and craft basics given to primary school pupils will help the talented ones in future’.

S4: ‘Some pupils are not good achievers or intelligent in theoretical subjects and when taught art and craft they feel confident because the subject is practical’ If young children can be taught art and craft at a young age, when they grow up they can use it to earn a living’.

SS: ‘When children finish school they can engage in projects and produce products to earn a living’.

SH: ‘Since they will be exposed to foundation skills which they can use in future, they will modify these skills as they grow and become competent’.

Budzi

B1: ‘It is very important to pupils for example, “lets take people in our village here, our pupils are not interested in learning so if they know anything art and craft they can survive upon that’.
B2: ‘There are some who do not do well in Maths and Science but do well in art and craft for example, if I can set an example of our kids here, most of them do not go for further education; we see them around the village creating clay pots using the village clay and basketry using Mokolwane (bank river reeds) plant and sell’.

B3: ‘If they learn art and craft at a younger age they will know about it at an early age and hence pursue their interests later on’.

B4: ‘It is a subject which arouses children’s interest. If you engage children in art and craft activities they become interested and even slow learners are involved. For example, a lesson I was teaching on letter design, everyone was involved and slow learners were more active than others’.

BS: ‘It develops the kids. They grow up with skills like manipulating, making things for themselves’.

BH: ‘It prepares them for their lives when they go to junior secondary and senior secondary schools because when they get there they choose subjects of their choice and they also will be able to compete with other children in art competitions such as “Moso” and show their ability. Even in art and craft fares where they compete with other schools. This is what happens in primary schools as our pupils sometimes join fares to compete with other schools. We once competed in Serowe displaying patchwork and drawing and our pupils took position 1, 2 and 3’.

Xai

X1: ‘You find that some children are not capable in theoretical subjects but are able in practical subjects such as art and craft work and hence end up earning a living through art and craft’.

X2: ‘It helps the child to be a critical thinker for example, if you want children to do something like the collage that we made (Referring to the collage lesson I observed), they have to think of what to make. And when they make art work they have to relate it to the real world like the children who made trees with green leaves and the soil with soil (referring to the collage lesson I observed).

X3: ‘Pupils grow up with the knowledge they have gained while still young then they will develop the art and craft skills’.

X4: ‘Pupils develop the ability to express themselves through drawing and painting, to take it from there and may be end up at the university or wherever’.

XS: ‘The kids grow up with drawing skills. The child ends up earning a living through art and craft work’.

XH: ‘It helps mostly those pupils who are below average in academic work so that even when they fail they can earn a living through art and craft products they create’.

Item 4: How well do you think Botswana Vision 2016 pillars are represented in the Art and Craft Curriculum for Lower Primary?

Loso

L1: ‘There are children who have already shown their ability through the assistance of teachers by winning the prizes in art and craft competitions which they compete with other primary schools which starts from branches/clusters then Districts/Region and lastly up to the national level which is done at the Botswana trade fare. (Although I tried to explain Vision 2016 to the teacher as she seemed not to be familiar with it, she still
could not respond to my question instead repeatedly explaining to me how pupils in her school succeed in art and craft competitions).

L2: ‘The curriculum would be fine but teachers do it when they feel like. Sometimes when it is time for art and craft as scheduled in the timetable and I do not have adequate materials for the topic, I switch to a different subject like cultural studies where I know I will get something from it. (She stressed. She emphasised that if there were adequate materials they would teach it effectively). ‘Jaanong ga re e rute, mo gongwe beke e kgona go feta re sa e rute’ as you have seen in my scheme book that art and craft does not appear frequently, it is music in my scheme of work because I love music as it does not give me any problems”. Meaning that ‘we do not teach the subject frequently as sometimes a week can pass without art and craft been taught as it appears in her scheme of work’ (Just like for L1, I tried to probe but she could not get to the point of answering my question except emphasising that it is difficult to teach the subject.)

L3: ‘I think there is a relationship between the curriculum and Vision 2016 because if the subject can be effectively taught pupils can use their creative skills to create something they can benefit from and this addresses the self-reliant pillar.’

L4: ‘The document addresses the pillars but unless the government takes note of the unavailability of resources such as materials the pillars cannot be addressed.’

L5: ‘The curriculum developers have considered the pillars because when one looks at the objectives one by one and assume that pupils are doing that, one will think that children benefit a lot and that the education they gain is relevant to 2016 pillars. For example, if they gain the art and craft skills they will be educated and self-reliant.’

LH: ‘By the year 2016 each child will be educated in CAPA and will stand for themselves for example one could make a workshop doing things that he or she can sell for a living.’

Selepe

S1: ‘It might be covered by the ‘educated nation’ and ‘self-reliant nation’ pillars as pupils will get educated in art and can make their artwork in future to sell and be self-reliant’.

S2: ‘Pillars are well represented for example, students can create products to sell and earn a living using the knowledge and skills gained in art and craft at primary school.

S3: ‘Art and craft being taught in primary schools educates pupils and also promote self-reliance which is one of the vision 2016 pillars because learners will make use of art and craft to earn a living and also reduce dependency of artefacts from other counties’.  

S4: ‘I am not very clear about it but if I am to recall the pillars well, there is one which talks about the educated nation but because we are teaching art and craft in primary schools I think it is incorporated’.  

S5: ‘I think so. There is a shortage of CAPA syllabus. We are using one lower primary syllabus for the whole school.(She could not respond to the question despite probes’. (The expression and excuses she gave made me assume that she was not familiar with the curriculum).

SH: ‘They are well represented for example, the one which requires a “prosperous and educated nation”, as children refine the skills they gained in primary schools they will not only rely on white collar jobs when they grow up but will join the market of blue collar jobs’.
Budzi


B2: ‘I think the curriculum has addressed the pillars. Unlike with other subjects, when one fails art and craft he or she can still join the community groups like the one which is in this village which deals with culture and create art and craft products from natural objects to sell and earn a living’. Why do you think the objectives address the pillars? ‘If pupils could be given the right information by the year 2016 they will have gained knowledge in art and craft; for example, the topic I was teaching “Pattern” if they have gained the printing skills from pattern making they will later create print objects and sell for living’.

B3: ‘I really do not know.’ Do you remember any pillars? ‘No’.

B4: ‘The curriculum addresses the pillars “Educated” and “Self-Reliant” nation as they will gain knowledge and skills in art and craft that they will rely on in future by creating products and sell for living’.

BS: ‘Some pillars like that of the “educated and informed nation”, “to be innovative”, I think most the people who did art, start things for themselves, they are innovative’.

BH: ‘I think they have because this syllabus contains a lot of things and it is divided into many modules and pupils can be better citizens if they can use the skills they have learnt in future to earn a living. For example, if they are interested in drawing and painting they can create them in future and sell for their living because art is practical; most of the time pupils do practical work. They can even create jobs for other people’.

Xai

X1: ‘As art and craft requires pupils to work with their hands therefore at the end of the day they will be able to do for themselves what they have learnt and may be even more than that and hence be an educated nation and self-reliant as advocated by the pillars’.

X2: ‘In a way, for example, children learn about other cultures. It also teaches children to be self-reliant; they can earn a living through carving, drawing and others’.

X3: ‘Theoretical yes, because the curriculum itself addresses the pillars, but because of lack of materials it is not practical’. Will you please give an example? ‘Educated and self-reliant nation’. They will gain art and craft knowledge and skills and apply them in future for living’.

X4: ‘Partially yes because some of the objectives like modelling and painting, if you have been good in art and craft at school and have dropped out you could earn a living by painting on walls for people and even advertising work and this addresses the pillar of a “self-reliant nation”.

XS: ‘There is a relationship between the curriculum and the pillars for example, pupils will develop skills they will use to create products such as drawings and painting which they can put on market to sell for their living and that addresses the pillar of the “self-reliant nation”.

XH: ‘The art and craft curriculum address the “self-reliant” pillar because as the children learn by doing they will be able to create their own work to earn a living. When they grow up they will be independent and not relying on other people financially. The school also equips them with the art and craft knowledge which they will later apply in life and that addresses the pillar “an educated and informed nation”.

402
6.3.2 Teachers’ Views on the implementation of the Curriculum

Item 5: How did the introduction of the curriculum improve your teaching of A&C?

Loso

L1: ‘In the past we were just integrating art and craft in social studies and science because there was no syllabus to follow. After teaching the lesson from these two subjects, teachers could ask pupils to draw, model or paint pictures of certain apparatus. At least we had topics that guided us or shed light on what to do.’

L2: ‘In the past teachers taught anything that they thought was art and craft. You could just recall what you were previously taught in primary school and at the teacher training college and use that experience to teach the subject. We used to anticipate art and craft as painting with paint and brush and making pictures with pencils and crayons. Now we know where to go and what to do although though we lack materials. One has an idea of what to teach.

L3: ‘I did not teach before the introduction of the curriculum but when I was studying in primary schools I was just taught drawing. Teachers used to introduce the topic and gave us papers to Unlike in the past, now there is a curriculum with objectives to follow, teacher’s guides and all the necessary materials’.

L4: ‘In the past we had a period called art and craft and we used to only give pupils papers, pencils and crayons and asked them to draw whatever they wanted to draw. After drawing, the work was pasted on the classroom and nothing was done to it. But now that the curriculum is there one looks at the objectives and presents what he or she wants to present for example if it is painting one asks pupils to mix secondary and tertiary colours and paint’.

L5: ‘In the past teachers visited Private (English medium) primary schools to get ideas and use them in their teaching of art and craft and there was no uniformity as you could find one doing painting, one pencil work, the other one moulding and so on. Presently the objectives are centralised and classes of the same level are expected to be taught the same content following those objectives. Although we can use different approaches but we follow the same objectives. There is a guideline of what to do.’

LH: ‘In the past teachers undermined art and craft and did not teach it seriously. It involved only art and craft therefore was not challenging. I am not sure how other teachers handled it as I have not assessed them in art and craft then. The subject now involves so many subjects and it calls for my attention as it is challenging. Teachers teach art and craft better than before.’

Selepe

S1: ‘I never taught before the introduction of the curriculum’.

S2: ‘Now children are taught variety of things not like when art was thought to be drawing only. The other thing is that teachers now move around when pupils work on their activities to guide where necessary. There was also no timetable and the subject was treated as free time not taken seriously’.

S3: ‘Previously, it was done sometimes, once termly to decorate classrooms. Teaching has since improved after the introduction of the curriculum because there are topics in the syllabus to guide what to teach’.

S4: ‘It improved a lot because previously if you got in someone’s class you could find nothing in art and craft and when you asked the teacher why he or she was not teaching the subject he or she would say “where can I get
it, there is no syllabus for art and craft so why should I worry, but nowadays it is better because we refer to the syllabus and the teachers’ guides for art and craft’.

SS: ‘There is no improvement because there are no materials. Schools are not supplied with materials therefore we still improvise. If there were materials that is when I could say there is improvement or no improvement’.

SH: ‘It has improved the teaching a bit because we used to have less meetings to talk about topics which we were not able to handle but as for now we have frequent meetings with teachers to talk about areas they are not competent on. We also share ideas on teaching some of the topics. The teachers’ performance now compared to their performance in the past has improved. Art and craft has been handled as a classroom subject not allowing children hands on experiences. It was never taught successfully’. Why could you not meet in the past to share ideas on what to teach in art and craft? ‘It is because now we are making some observations as we are provoked by the country’s requirements such as the Vision 2016 pillars advocating for the educated and informed nation. We are trying to improve our methods and approaches’.

Budzi

B1: ‘Some years back before the introduction of the CAPA syllabus art and craft was not important. We were allowed to do art and craft may be once or twice a week and it was not valued. We were distributed with materials to sew and weave in groups without effective supervision but now pupils learn more and even us teachers we get light on where we are going and where we come from because most of the things pupils do by themselves, they are manipulating as they are small children, they learn by doing. Previously it was not formally done in class. The teacher would just say “go and sew like this. It was also never marked. Some of the products we created were sold. It was just like fundraising for the school’.

B2: ‘There is improvement compared to the past. We used to be told to draw butterflies not knowing whether the teacher was lazy or not. Teachers were not researching in art and craft, one could just dream of what to teach the following day. Now that we have the teacher’s guides and the pupil’s textbook I see them rich with information. This has improved the teaching of the subject because in the past there were no reference books to refer to’.

B3: ‘I am new to the profession as I have started teaching in 2006 but I will share with you my experience when I was attending school in a primary. In the past art and craft was not taken to be a subject, it was just about drawing. It wasn’t really taught unlike today. The new curriculum which is present covers a lot of things that we never thought were related to art therefore the development of the curriculum brought an improvement to the subject. The subject was taught once in a while, once a week or once a term and pupils were just given papers to draw anything of their choice. Now it is timetabled and allocated at least four hours a week. Because now there is a guideline (curriculum) for the subject, the approaches to art and craft have improved as teachers follow the guideline and the timetable’.

B4: ‘Before the introduction of the curriculum, art was just thought to be drawing or pupils would just be told to go for sewing at 1’clock but since the introduction of this curriculum, art involves many things. It is easily interacted with other subjects such as English because pupils can draw and write like in the activities they have just done whereby they were using letters to design. Figure drawing for example, pupils just made a circle to represent the head and dots for eyes while now because of the guidelines they show detailed’ drawing. I used to say I am not able to teach art and craft because I did not know how to draw. I also used to make discouraging comments to pupils’ art and craft work such as, “this one has drawn a nice picture” and this one does not know how to draw therefore he or she is not an artist’.

BS: ‘When I was attending school in primary art and craft was painting and drawing only compared to the recent curriculum whereby there are lot of things involved. It is broad now. The teaching part of it is a problem
because looking at the syllabus, how it has been designed, it needs some specialisation, if you have been trained for those areas that is when you teach it properly therefore the implementation itself is just like before, there is no change'.

BH: ‘In the past, we didn’t have a syllabus in art and craft and we were just preparing and teaching anything we thought was art and craft but now that we have something that we can refer to; we have pupils’ books and teachers’ guides. The only problem that we have is material. Otherwise the new syllabus is good. How did you teach it before the introduction of the curriculum? ‘We were just picking activities from books. Did you assess it?’ ‘I didn’t assess it. We used to select topics that we felt we have materials to use in the locality but now the syllabus covers a lot of topics and even when we don’t have materials but we have pupils’ books to refer to. There is something to refer to. “Kana bogologolo re ne re ruta fela go sena fa re e tsayang teng” meaning that “In the past we used to teach art without any syllabus or guideline”.

Xai

X1: ‘The curriculum has changed a lot because in the past art and craft was not taught but now pupils are getting educated as those who are not capable in theoretical subjects are excelling in art and craft and will end up somewhere’.

X2: ‘I have not taught before the introduction of the curriculum. What about your experience while going to primary school? ‘I find it difficult to compare with the time I was at primary school as I can not remember what I did in art and craft that time’ What about the time you were doing teaching practice in primary schools while you were at the college of education? ‘I do not see any difference with the time I was doing my teaching practice while at the college of education’.

X3: ‘I am new to the profession and never taught before the introduction of the curriculum’. What about compare with your experience when you were a primary school child? ‘I was never taught art and craft in primary school. The curriculum could be helping teachers teach the subject effectively if there were no inhibiting aspects such as materials which make teachers to only teach the subject theoretically. Small kids like standard threes I am teaching learn better by doing and seeing things and the pictures in books alone are not enough’.

X4: ‘I am new to the profession and never taught before the introduction of this curriculum’. What about your experience studying at primary school? ‘When using my experience when studying at primary school I do not see much of a difference. However, in the past, much of the time was spent on other subjects like science related subjects and languages and there was little time for art and craft. The topics covered were mostly, drawing, painting and modelling. We used some clay. The activities were not marked but only displayed on the classroom wall’.

XS: ‘There is a lot of improvement even though we are having a problem of materials for example; you find that we lack paints. In the past art was not effectively taught, pupils were not doing it practical but for the child easily grasps information by doing. In the past when we taught about topics like colour pupils could not see or manipulate it, it was just lectured to them for example they were told that red plus yellow equals this colour unlike today where they really mix colours to see the results or effects. They are not told by teachers what will happen when they mix colours. Even when they are taught topics like mosaic and collage, they do them rather than being told by their teachers. In the past teachers had a tendency of telling pupils not allowing them to explore but nowadays because there is a guideline, the objectives requires the children to do’.

XH: ‘Unlike in the past where we visited libraries to research from big books on what to teach now we have something to refer to as we have the syllabus and the teachers’ guides. But now you only research for the difficult topics, otherwise you just use the teachers’ guides and the syllabus and teach; so there is a big progress.”
I used to use what I got from the teacher training college and from the senior secondary school to teach which could have been sometimes above the pupils level but now I give them the relevant information’.

Item 6: What approaches do you/teachers commonly use in the teaching of Art and Craft?

Loso

L1: ‘I use the classroom and never take pupils out because of limited time. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I know some artists and craft-workers in my locality but do not have an idea on how to have access to them to get help for example; one could visit the museum to get information on certain topics. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? We never involve any artists or craft-workers in our school activities. However, I once visited the museum and discussed some of the art and craft work displayed with the staff to find out how the products were created.’

L2: ‘I usually teach in the classroom because taking children to other places would require transport which takes a long process. We are also avoiding harsh weather conditions outside the classroom, like wind. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I never take them anywhere’. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I have never involved anyone except that there was once a student teacher who specialised in art and craft who was attached in our school from the college of education who helped us in art and craft topics, as this teacher was not only concentrating on the class he was attached to but also moved around to other classes to check if teachers needed any help. He even left paintings he did in our school. Apart from colleagues in school, I work alone. When faced with teaching problems, I consult colleagues for assistance.’

L3: ‘I first introduce the topic inside the classroom and if it is painting I take pupils outside for the practical work. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘We never take pupils outside the school locality.’ Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘We never involve the community; we just sit down as teachers and help each other.’ Any reason for that? ‘No, we just never thought of that.’

L4: ‘I use the classroom and never take pupils outside because of limited time. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘No, I just work with colleagues in school. We sit together and discuss as a staff otherwise, I approach teachers from other schools for help.’

L5: ‘Teachers sometimes teach indoors. Since the curriculum is new we have not yet taken the students to any of the art and craft centres but hope to do so in future. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I know a fine artist who paints and moulds but teachers never involved him or any other outsider in their teaching of art and craft. Teachers also never invite the community or art and craft workers to their classes.’

LH: ‘I sometimes see pupils outside doing practical work for example, observing objects such as goats. Do teachers sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘Teachers never take pupils to any art and craft centres such as museum. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons?’ Although I know a certain man I saw from the Botswana television doing art and craft work and one boy who completed in a secondary school who once made a big painting for our library when I was teaching in a different school, we never involve them in our teaching of art and craft. Infact, all the teachers in lower primary never involve art and craft workers to their classes.'
Selepe

S1: ‘It depends on the topic but I mostly use indoor. I have never came across any topic that need to take pupils elsewhere apart from school locality’.

S2: ‘Most of the time I teach outside the classroom but in the school locality or nearby places because of time limitation. For example, I intend taking pupils to the nearby stream to do modelling’.

S3: ‘It depends on the topic. For example, sometimes pupils go out to observe texture on different objects. However, I have never taken pupils to any art and craft centre. I only take them in the outside school locality’.

S4: ‘Usually I teach in class because the materials I use are local. If I teach topics like prints I usually take pupils outside the classroom but not as far as the cattle-post’.

SS: ‘Most of the time it is done indoor. They never take pupils to any place’.

SH: ‘I have not seen anyone taking trips with pupils’. Why do teachers never take trips with their pupils? ‘The problem is the locality they are in because the field trips are costly as taking pupils to trips requires a lot of money which we cannot afford. However, I am aware that the field trips contribute a lot as learners become interested and encouraged to learn’.

Budzi

B1: ‘It depends on the topic. Sometimes we go out to collect materials to use and come back in classroom to use the material’. Do you sometimes take pupils outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I have never done it. Any reason for that? ‘It is very difficult to take children to far art and craft centres because the arrangement is complicated. It is not like before when we were schooling as we used to go for tours, these days it is difficult. The problem is that our children are under the council therefore they need to be consulted in everything the school does to get permission. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons?’ ‘I had never done it because whatever is covered by our lower primary syllabus we do not find anything difficult which can prompt us to seek help from the public. Most of the time I share with my colleagues in school but when time comes I will seek for help from the community. This year I have not yet reached such topics which need the help of the community’.

B2: ‘I use both indoor and outdoor depending on the topic like last time when I was teaching texture rubbing, pupils went out to rub on car tyres, goats, leaves and other objects’. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I once took my standard four pupils in 2006 to a certain house in the village to see decorations and other designs to emphasis the value of art to the society giving them examples of roofing and decoration skills they could use to earn a living and that they could be hired to design and roof lodges with grass. What about this year? ‘I have never done it this year. I have never taken them far because of lack of funds for transport. When we talk to our seniors they say there are no funds therefore we can’t take the kids there’. Do you ever involve the community or art and craft workers in his locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I have never tried it in the school I am in now but once invited the education officer for Serowe Education Centre when teaching in that area’. Why are not doing it where you are now? ‘The problem is lack of finance’. I also do not know any artist and craft workers in this locality.

B3: ‘Mostly I do it in classroom but sometimes I take children outside. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere?’ ‘I never, because of the nature of the location of the village. There are not many things that are happening around the village to take pupils to. I had never thought of taking pupils away to centres like museum because the channels of communication are
broad and include supervisors, the school head, and so on. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I have never done it although I know some for example, a man who creates leather products’.

B4: ‘It depends on the topic and activity. Some are done indoor and some outdoor. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘Because of limited allocated time to CAPA it is difficult. Even the process of requesting for permission is stressful therefore hinders that. Do you think there is a possibility that you can be denied permission? ‘No’, but I know that it won’t be successful because of transport as most of the kids in this school depends on the council benefits even the sports fee. That is about three quarters. Why about requesting the council for help? ‘The council will say the arrangement can take long therefore they can not manage’. What about if you can try to arrange in time then go during the holidays. We once requested to take tours and the council department said there was know money therefore could not help’. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? I invited two locals this year to work with pupils when dealing with the topic “Construction” where they were to work with wire but because of lack of materials they could not help. Where does the problem of materials come from, is it the school not purchasing them? We make requisition to the council but they do not deliver them. We have also met officers from the ministry who visited our school this year about the problem who confirmed that the problem of material is a national issue.

BS: ‘Teachers use both indoors and outdoors. Some times they do it outside more so that we don’t have labs; where they have to make some experiments and practical work, they have to go outside’. How do you/teachers involve the community or art and craft-workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft? ‘Some teachers do as they sometimes take pupils to people working with leather. But they have never invited parents to come to school and teach or work with pupils. ‘It would be a good idea as parents are more skilled in craft work than teachers are’.

BH: ‘Most of the time they teach inside the classrooms but if there are those areas which require them to go outside they do that. How do you/teachers involve the community or art and craft-workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft? ‘I have never seen any class taken to the community or far places like Serowe and Francistown museum and I think teachers never take pupils to the community to learn from them. Any reason for not taking them out? ‘There is no barrier; it is just that we have never thought about it.

Xai

X1: ‘Mostly I do it indoors because they are no materials. If we had materials we could do it outdoors. You find that in primary schools there are no resources and instead of teaching art and craft practically we just lecture. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘We sometimes do it for example modelling, because we do not have artificial clay we use the traditional ones. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I work with colleagues in school to plan for lessons. However, we sometimes invite the elderly women from the community to come and demonstrate to us on how to model traditional pots using their clay. I have not done it this year but I did it last year’. Do other teachers at lower primary do the same? ‘Yes, other teachers in school do it as they are encouraged by the administrators to identify people in their locality who are experts in certain areas to help them where they have difficulties’. What about taking them to art and craft centres? ‘I have never tried to take pupils to art and craft centres such as museums’. (She reluctantly said,) ‘May be it is because of lack of funds’.

X2: ‘It depends on the topic and activity. Some are done indoors and some outdoors; for example, the lesson you observed; because we needed a flat surface we had to do the activity indoor. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I never because taking children on a filed trip involves the seniors but we usually take the mature children away for trips. That is upper
classes. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I had never tried’.

X3: ‘Sometimes I teach indoors and sometimes outdoors. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I had never taken them to the community because I do not have any topic which requires such approach. What about art and craft centres? ‘I also never take them to any art and craft centre outside their locality because of limited time I have for the subject. I could have taken them outside the school locality when teaching about modelling but because it was a 30 minutes period I could not afford to do so. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘We have artists and craft workers in the locality but I have never involved them because it has never crossed my mind’. (She was laughing when responding to this question).

X4: ‘We usually take them out in topics like collage to collect materials around’. Do you sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘I had never taken them to the community’. Do you sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in your locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘I had never involved them’.

XS: ‘Some objectives lead teachers to take their pupils outside to observe and do activities practically whereas others require them to gather pupils in the classrooms and teach indoors. Do teachers sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘Last year one teacher took pupils to the community to observe how tie and dye is done but this year I have not seen anyone taking pupils to the community. Do they sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in the locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft? ‘They do invite parents to help; for example, we once invited parents to come and demonstrate to pupils how to carve. Because in school there are no carving tools we asked a certain man to come and demonstrate to pupils using his own tools this year but this was for the standard fives. We have not done it to the lower primary this year. Do teachers sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in the locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft? ‘They never involve parents in their planning or share with them the curriculum; they ask those teachers with expertise to volunteer to help them in certain areas’.

XH: ‘They sometimes teach indoors and sometimes outdoors. They are sometimes reluctant to take pupils outside because they teach the subject theoretical whereby pupils end up not understanding. Pupils understand more when they do. Sometimes time is also a barrier as it is not enough to take pupils outside. Is it not because of the attitude? (She laughed and said.) ‘It is because teachers will be rushing as the time allocated for art and craft periods is not enough. The time allocated for art and craft is not enough; (She still emphasised) therefore taking them to the community will overlap and consume time for other subjects’. Do teachers sometimes take them outside school locality like in the community or any art and craft centres elsewhere? ‘It is rarely done may be when a teacher has a one hour period’. Do they sometimes involve the community or art and craft workers in their locality in the planning and teaching of art and craft lessons? ‘We have never taken any of the standards one to four classes this year. However, it is something the school sometimes do’.

Item 7: Do you/teachers integrate the CAPA subjects when teaching or you/they teach them separately?

Loso

L1: ‘We teach them separately looking at the topics because when you look at music pupils sing and play games whereas in art they draw therefore they can not be integrated because they do not relate.’
L2: ‘We sometimes try to integrate for example, when teaching music one can later ask pupils to draw the instruments. We do it when there is a need. We follow objectives of all the CAPA subjects when integrating’. Why do you integrate them? ‘For pupils to recall what they learnt easily; to arouse pupils’ interest so as to listen attentively and also because in standard two most of their notes are pictures because standard two pupils can not read. (But the examples this teacher kept on giving could make someone believe that she talks of integration which naturally comes when teaching for example, when teaching a topic or giving notes and trying to clarify or simplify it with illustrations).

L3: ‘We integrate them’ Why do you integrate them? ‘Just.’ (Could not give any reason despite several probes).

L4: ‘I teach them separately in order to concentrate on the one to teach for the day as the modules separate them. I pick two topics from a module and teach them and do the same to all other modules until I complete the CAPA topics. Is it uniform in your school? (It is uniform as all standard 3 teachers teach the modules separately).

L5: ‘Teachers do not integrate but teach them as they are in the curriculum. They pick one topic from one module and complete it and go to the other module and do the same and so on. But not even a single teacher is going to cover all the objectives. Why do they separate them while they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘Because we are not sure of what to teach and how to teach. It as a very big challenge for teachers.’

LH: ‘Teachers do not integrate but teach them as they are in the curriculum. They teach one topic in a module per a day. Why do they separate them while they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘There is no reason, it is only that we are not aware of integration’.

Selepe

S1: ‘I teach them separately’. Why? ‘I do not mix them because there will be a mix up and pupils will not grasp information taught’.

S2: ‘We teach them separately. We teach according to the objectives. I pick a topic from one subject and teach it for a week covering all its objectives then picks one from the other and does the same thing. That is one topic each week’. Why? ‘I use that system to avoid confusion so that pupils master objectives for each topic before proceeding to the other’.

S3: ‘I teach them separately. That is one subject each week’. Is there any uniformity on how to teach art and craft in your school? ‘We have agreed as a stream to follow this style of teaching’.

S4: ‘I do not integrate them when teaching because I do not think that I can teach all the things as the children can not master anything’.

SS: ‘They teach it separately except modules like health and safety which they infuse in every topic they teach as they can not be taught separately. Pupils should be cautious in everything they do to avoid accidents therefore this module is infused’. Why do they teach them separately while they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘Because these subjects are different and can not relate well when integrated’.

S1H: ‘Integration is done on topics that are related’. Why do you integrate them? ‘Because if you teach them separately, you would not cover all the topics in the syllabus, that is why those objectives which are related should be integrated’. Is it the school arrangement? ‘Yes, Integration in the learning situation is of benefit to the learners and has been done in most subjects a long time ago’. How teachers integrate them? ‘I really don’t know but I know they do it’.
Budzi

B1: ‘They go hand in hand, there is no difference’. How do you teach them as they go hand in hand? ‘It depends on the topic that I have planned for that day. I sometimes integrate where objectives from different CAPA disciplines relate and sometimes teach them separately’. Is this uniform in your school? We schemed together as standard ones and agreed that they should integrate related objectives and teach others separately. Did you sit down as a stream to identify related objectives which can be integrated or you do it individually? We worked together to identify those which integrate’.

B2: ‘We teach them separately’. Is it uniform in your school? ‘Yes it is’. Any reason for separating them while they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘It is difficult to answer the question; we just agreed to do it in our school without any reason’.

B3: ‘Usually, I teach them separately. Why? ‘I think that it makes everything easier for the teacher and the learners to understand rather than when combining them as this could cause problems for both of us. What problems do you think one can encounter when combining them? ‘I am of the view that the objectives for these different disciplines do not relate therefore could not be combined for example, in Physical Education, gymnastic objectives and some objectives in music do not relate therefore can not be combined. Is this something you agreed upon in your school? ‘It is not uniform for the whole school but we agreed upon it as standard threes not to integrate them. How have you divided your periods? ‘It is on weekly basis for example, if I take music, I have to cover the objectives may be for a week thereafter goes to the other subject and do the same thing’. How do you integrate them? ‘I never integrate them’.

B4: I teach them separately. I just pick a topic from different modules. In order to push I take two topics from each module and teach, then two from another and so on unless if I have problems with materials that is when I leave the topic to teach the other one. However, sometimes when I teach I discover that I have integrated some of the objectives. Is there any reason for separating the modules while they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘I do not have any reason; I just decided to do that’. Is it uniform in your school? ‘Each individual teaches the way he or she feels better for him or her. However, teachers have problems in teaching CAPA subjects and always say they teach the ones they are comfortable with and leave the ones they are not comfortable with. All the CAPA subjects are not taken serious but teachers are attempting to teach them because now the school requires them to test it monthly and termly. Is it examined in standard four national attainment tests? ‘No, it is not included in the standard four national tests written at the end of the year to determine whether you can progress to standard five or repeat.

BS: ‘They are teaching them separately. We have never experienced a case where teachers integrate them. Is it something agreed and applied by the whole staff in your school? ‘It is not uniform but it is up to an individual to see how he or she can apply it to suit the young ones. Why do teachers not integrate them because they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘There is no reason. It might be because we lack skills on how to address the CAPA syllabus’.

BH: ‘In the scheme of work that is where they arrange these things. I think they just do it according to topics. They pick one topic from each module and deal with them one by one not integrating them’. Is it something agreed and applied by the whole staff in your school? ‘No, it is up to the individuals’.

Xai

X1: I teach them separately. Why do you not integrate them because they are combined in the CAPA programme? ‘There is no reason for that. We just do it’. How have you divided your periods? ‘In the time table it is CAPA, but teachers in our stream schedule them differently on different days for example, Monday for
Physical Education, the other day Music and so on’. *Does the whole school do the same thing?* ‘I am not sure whether the other teachers do the same thing.’

X2: ‘I teach them separately. *Any reason for separating them while they are combined in the CAPA programme?* ‘I do that because I take them as individual subjects even though they are combined in the CAPA syllabus. (She repeatedly, said,) ‘they are different unless if there is a topic I once taught in one of those subjects that I can relate this other new topic to; for example, the topic dancing in music and drawing in art and craft; they are two different things. This also makes it easy for them as teachers to get help from those who specialised in individual subjects and also to help others with the subjects they are competent in so as to teach them competently. For example, I only specialised in music among the CAPA subjects therefore help those who have problems in that area in my stream. *Will you please give me an example of the topics which relate if you can remember any?* ‘I can not remember any at the moment’. *Does everyone not integrate in lower primary in your school?* ‘In our stream’.

X3: ‘I teach them separately because the objectives are separated, “if for instance I am teaching music, it has to be music then the next may be design and making. Actually, when I joined the school I found it like that and never questioned, I just followed suit. *How do you feel about it because the CAPA programme has combined them although not integrated them?* ‘I do not have any problem in teaching them separately’. *Is it agreement in school?* ‘Yes, we agreed as a stream to scheme it subject by subject and objective by objective but if the teacher feels otherwise when teaching she can do as she wishes’.

X4: ‘I teach them separately. *Does the whole school do the same thing?* ‘Yes, everyone does it like that’. *Any reason for separating them?* ‘I feel that they will understand better that way because this syllabus is a problem to these kids; it is very difficult for them to comprehend and if you can mix or jumble the content, you can have problems. It was for each individual to see how he or she can tackle the syllabus’.

XS: ‘They do not integrate them. They teach them separately’. *Any reason for separating them?* ‘May be I say teachers do not do it while they do; according to my observation they do teach them separately’. (She seemed not show of what teachers really do and she could not give any reason for separating them although she emphasised that each module is addressed individually).

XH: ‘They combine some of the objectives but some of the objectives do not accommodate to be combined because they need more time to do something specifically for that lesson. *Is it agreement in school?* ‘Yes, all teachers practice that’. *Any reason for combining and separating them?* ‘You find that some of the objectives are similar although from different themes in CAPA and when combined, you find that you have killed two birds with one stone. When you take them one by one, the year ends before finishing the CAPA topics’.

XH: ‘Teachers tell pupils to discuss their work. After completing their practical work in class they can stand in front of the class and explain how they came up with the product’.

**Item 8: How do you/teachers distribute 5 hours suggested to 4 CAPA subjects as minimum duration per a week?**

Loso

L1: ‘There is no order as we sometimes give one hour to one subject, the other 30 minutes and visa-versa.’ *Does this time allow you to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft?* ‘Time is not enough to cover all the topics at the end of the year.’ *What do you with the other topics?* ‘We talk to the one taking pupils to continue.’ *What happens then to the topics for the level pupils are in?* ‘The topics are the same.’ (Laughing loudly).

L2: ‘You find that one concentrates on one subject which he or she is competent and confident in
while other subjects suffer then allocate it 5 hours.’ But is it enough the time enough to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus? ‘The time is not enough to cover all the topics at the end of the year so we concentrate on the ones that we are competent in.’

L3: ‘CAPA is awarded 30 minutes a day which is two and half hours a week. (It was difficult for her to explain how she distributes this time to four CAPA modules). Is the time allocated to CAPA enough to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus? ‘It is not enough.’

L4: ‘When I pick a topic from a module to teach in a week I allocate it five hours. Are you able to complete all the CAPA topics at the end of the year? ‘I do not because CAPA is too congested.

LS: ‘CAPA is allocated the last hour every day for the five school days and each module is given a day and the last hour of the last day of the week is used to cover the objectives from any module which lagged behind.’ Why it is allocated the last hour? ‘I just found it like that in the school timetable, may be people still have that old concept that maths and English are of value therefore should come first. I think people might be assuming that CAPA is easy or they do not give it priority because it is just timetabled but not examined in PSLE.’ Does the time allocated to CAPA subjects allow teachers to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus? ‘The time allocated is not enough to complete the topics at the end of the year.’

LH: ‘As a CAPA subject teacher, he knows how to allocate it (Referring to L4 who was on specialists subject piloting project). I have never discussed anything of that sort with the CAPA teacher and the head-teacher as she is the one who prepared the school master timetable. Does the time allocated to CAPA subjects allow teachers to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus? I do not know the difference between art and craft and CAPA. However, when looking at the topics I do not believe that they will be completed at the end of the year because the curriculum is so congested.’

Selepe

S1: ‘Normally we do not teach all these subjects in one week. You find that we teach music and art and craft in a week and others the other week’. Does it allow you to cover all topics in the A&C Curriculum by the end of the year? ‘No, but we try to cover a lot of them’. What happens to the ones left out? ‘We do not do anything because there is no time’.

S2: ‘In the timetable it just shows CAPA not individual subjects therefore, I allocate 5 hours to the topic taught in each week’. Does it allow you to cover all topics in the A&C Curriculum by the end of the year? ‘I cover all the topics at the end of the year’.

S3: ‘I allocate five hours to one subject that I teach every week because I teach one CAPA subject weekly’. Does it allow you to cover all topics in the A&C Curriculum by the end of the year? ‘The time is not enough because the content is very, very, very broad to the extent that we end up giving students notes to read on their own. (He repeatedly stated that “CAPA e ntse thata” meaning “CAPA is so congested”). What do you do with the remaining topics? ‘Pupils just proceed to the new standard’.

S4: ‘I make sure I teach all the CAPA subjects per week. There is no uniformity on how the five hours should be distributed in school. It is a free style’. (The teacher could not clearly explain how she does it despite probing). Does the time allocated to art and craft subject in your school allow you to cover all topics in the A&C Curriculum by the end of the year? ‘The time allocated does not allow all art and craft topics to be covered looking at the painting objectives. The syllabus is packed as the objectives are so many’. What do you do if the pupils do not cover some of the topics? ‘I request them to come in the afternoon to finish up’.

SS: They teach one module for example, art and craft weekly and allocate it five hours.
SH: ‘The CAPA syllabus suggests 10 periods which is 5 hours per week but we have cut it to 4 hours to suit our working hours so as not to overlap to 2 o’clock. Is this a school arrangement? There is no uniformity in school. There is flexibility. Every teacher divides the hours according to his or her needs as long as the four hour is allocated to the four CAPA subjects per week’.

Budzi

B1: ‘Timetables differ according to each stream. In standard one CAPA is two and a half hours. Sometimes I pick a topic and teach it for a week and award it two and half hours. Do all the standard teachers do the same thing? ’Yes, we all do it. We pick topics from each discipline and scheme for a term so as to balance them for example, from Communication, Design and making and others’. Is two and half hour period a week allowing you to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft? ‘I am not sure but because we sacrifice to teach in the afternoons I believe we will finish them. Have you been finishing them in previous years like last year?’ ‘No’. What happens to the topics left out? ‘They are just left without attended to’.

B2: ‘As a stream we have awarded two and half hours to CAPA subject per a week for standard twos as per CAPA suggestion. (She first claimed that the two and half hours they offer was also suggested by the CAPA programme but when probed further she said she was not sure. She has a difficulty in explaining how she distributes time to the four CAPA subjects. However, she later said,) I pick a topic in one discipline and allocate it two and half hours per week. What about if you do not finish it in that week? ‘I continue with it the other week until I finish with it but awarding the agreed time per week. Does the two and half hour period a week allow you to complete all the topics in the CAPA programme including art and craft?’ ‘We never cover all the topics’. What happens to topics left out? ‘Usually in a stream we look at the ones we feel we can just talk to the pupils about without doing and rush over them in the afternoons but we still do not finish’. What happens to them? ‘Nothing’.

B3: ‘I award three hours to every subject per a week because in our school CAPA is awarded three hours only. Do all the standard three classes do the same? ‘In the school timetable, the standard threes are awarded three hours for CAPA and it is just the administration’s decision. Does 3 hours period a week allow you to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft? ‘Usually we have afternoon studies in which we try to catch up where we are left behind but we still do not complete the topics because the study time is only one hour which makes four hours and four hours to me is still not enough for all the CAPA subjects. But, in our case, I think that it is enough because some of the topics we don’t really have materials to use, topics like gymnastics, we don’t jump, roll so I think time is enough but if we had the whole equipment time would not be enough. Do you have an idea which topics you do not teach in art and craft due of lack of materials? There are few topics in art and craft which do not have materials unlike in Physical Education as we sometimes lack paint but it does not happen often. Is there nothing you could improvise with to teach those topics? ‘We do not improvise with anything. There is nothing really’. What happens to topics left out? ‘Children just proceed to the next level without having attempted them’.

B4: ‘The school administration has only awarded three hours to CAPA subjects per a week for standard fours. I have talked to them about the CAPA syllabus requirement that it says 5 hours and they said there is no time to award such hours to CAPA. Only English and Setswana are awarded 5 hours per week to standard fours, maths is 4 hours and the rest of the subjects are two and a half hours per week. There is a school master timetable which shows time for each subject for each stream and this is just the administration’s decision. Only standard ones and two timetables are flexible and determined by the class teachers. I pick two topics from one module and teach them weekly and award them three hour’. Do have an idea why the time was reduced? ‘The administrators said there is no time’. How long do the two topics you said you pick from each module usually take you to finish them? ‘It depends on the objectives. Does the 3 hour period a week allows you to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft? I can not complete them; the time scheduled is too short. What happens to the topics left out? As I have proceeded with the same pupils from standard three, I find
extra time like in the afternoons to work on these topics with pupils. **What happened to those who do not proceed with their pupils?** ‘They leave them out without being tackled’.

**BS:** (When I asked the question she quickly corrected me to say it is two and half hours which is 5 periods not 5 hours). **Was the two and half hours suggested by the school or the CAPA syllabus developers?** ‘The syllabus has suggested 5 periods which is two and half hours per week. For standard one we make our own timetable therefore it is double, double, then single period because it is practical’. **How do other teachers distribute the time?** ‘Some of them double, and then they make one, one, one because according to the syllabus issued it should be taught every day but if we don’t double the periods we don’t finish the activities. If the teacher teaches a module in a certain week he or she allocates it two and half hours and do the same to all the modules in the CAPA syllabus. **Is it uniform?** ‘It depends on individual teachers on which module to teach and when. **Does the time allocated allow teachers to complete all the topics in the CAPA programme including art and craft?** ‘This time is not enough to cover all the topics at the end of the year. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘They are just left like that’.

**BH:** ‘CAPA is given 5 hours per week in our school and we were once called to the office by the school head to work on that and allocated CAPA subjects the time suggested by the syllabus. All the subjects are allocated time according to the time suggested by the syllabuses. **How do teachers distribute these 5 hours in their streams?** ‘They just select a topic from one module and allocate it 5 hours because usually one topic lasts for a week; for example, painting, if they pick it they teach it for the whole week and allocates it 5 hours as they can not go to the next topic before they complete it. **Is it uniform?** ‘This is done by all teachers in our stream. **How do other teachers distribute the time?** ‘I have no idea. **Do you think the five hours is enough to complete all the topics at the end of the year?** ‘I do not think so because the syllabus is congested and art and craft is practical whereby pupils have to do things practical in class and outside. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘They are just left like that because pupils might not be taught by the same teacher in the next level’. **What would happen if they were taught by the same teacher?** ‘They were still going to be left out because the material for the level children were doing would also suffer if the teacher is to cover that other one first.

**Xai**

**X1:** ‘We have allocated 30 minutes everyday for five days which is two and half hours per week. We give each subject a day in a week amounting to 30 minutes. **How do you do it as there are four subjects and five school days per week?** (She could not respond to the question as expected despite probes; instead she said,) ‘I am not aware that CAPA is allocated 5 hours in the CAPA syllabus’. **Does the two and half hour period a week allow you to complete all the topics in the CAPA programme including art and craft?** ‘This time is not enough to complete all the topics at the end of the year. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘Children just proceed to the next level of without having attempted them’.

**X2:** ‘CAPA subject is allocated two and half hours in our stream. **Who decided the time?** ‘I found it like that and I am not even aware that the CAPA syllabus have suggested 5 hours’. **How do you distribute the two and half hours to four subjects?** ‘I allocate the whole two and half hours to one of the subjects per a week. What about if you do not finish the topic in that week? ‘I carry on to the next week’. **Is it uniform?** ‘It is done by all the standard two teachers as we work together as a stream. **Do you complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft at the end of the year with this two and half hour period a week?** ‘The time is not enough because a practical subject needs more time than other subjects especially for the standard two who are too slow and it takes time for them to understand some of the concepts. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘I do not know but I believe they are left out and hence children denied some of the foundation skills in some of the topics that are to be taught at the next level and will have problems with those topics.'
X3: ‘The school administration has only awarded three hours to CAPA subject per a week for standard threes in the master timetable. I am not aware of what happens in other streams. **How do you distribute the three hours to four subjects?** ‘I am teaching one subject for a week and then proceed to the other awarding the subject 3 hours per a week. **What happens if you do not complete a topic within a week?** ‘I proceed with the topic I am teaching to the next week if I do not complete it within a week. **Are you aware that the curriculum suggests at least five hours for the CAPA subjects per week?** ‘I am not aware’ (She responded with a loud voice and surprised face). ‘May be this is why we are failing to cover some of the objectives when it comes to CAPA because really, the time is not enough’. **Do you complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft at the end of the year with this three hour period a week?** ‘I do not complete them’. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘It is a problem because pupils go to the next level while they are still behind and I believe they will do the topics for that level which are extensions for standard three objectives they have not covered’.

X4: ‘The time allocated is too little’ (He repeatedly said that). **How much time is allocated to CAPA per a week for standard three classes?** ‘I am not sure of the time allocated. The curriculum is so difficult that teachers do not teach the subject most of the time but they teach it sometimes. **Is it because of the attitude towards art and craft?** ‘I am not sure. I can not say so much time is allocated to art and craft because teachers teach it when they feel like. **Do you complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft at the end of the year?** ‘Through rushing they do especially when the exams are close-by’.

XS: ‘CAPA subject is allocated to three and a half hours per a week’. **How do teachers distribute the three hours to four subjects?** ‘They pick a topic for one module and teach for a week and after covering its objective they go to the other module and do the same but allocating the subject its three and half hours per week’. **Is there any reason why you decided to allocate CAPA three and half hours while the curriculum suggests that it should be allocated at least five hours?** ‘I am not aware of that and we did not consider it. **Does this apply to all the lower primary classes?** ‘Standard one and two timetable is flexible and the three and a half is for standard threes and fours’. **Do teachers complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft at the end of the year with this three and half hour period per a week?** ‘The time allocated is too little because CAPA syllabus is packed. It has a lot of objectives’. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘We just leave them out’. (She laughed as responded)

XH: ‘Two and a half hours is allocated to CAPA subject per a week for standard one to three. **How do teachers distribute the two and a half hours?** ‘They allocate the time looking at the gravity of the content. In the beginning we used to attach or allocate each theme to a day but later discovered that some objectives suffered because we were forced to leave them hanging to teach a different theme attached for that day. We therefore teach according to objectives. We pick objectives from each theme and address them one by one. **Are teachers aware that the curriculum suggests at least five hours for the CAPA subjects per week?** ‘They are aware of that and I blame the curriculum developers who suggested that, they are confused because this are the same people who brought the time analysis that suggests that two and a half hours should be allocated to these pupils. When we add these five hours and other subjects’ allocated times they do not match the time analysis still suggested by the curriculum people as they say for example, standard one pupils should be in school for 22 hours 20 minutes per week. We have altered looking at the time analysis but still we have just compromised as the time does not allow us to come up with what we have. **Does the two and a half hour period a week allow teachers to complete all the topics in the CAPA syllabus including art and craft?** ‘If one covers them it will just be rushing because time allocated is not enough’. **What happens to the topics not covered when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘They will cover them in standard two’. **What will happen to the standard two topics?** ‘They will also suffer. But if you are the same teacher, it will be better because you already know what you taught for example, Safety and Precautions; if you find the same topic in standard two you will just pick up the standard and not spend time on it. I believe with the new teacher it will be very difficult because he or she will not have been orientated on what pupils covered and did not in standard one.'
Item 9: Will you please share with me how you use formative and summative assessment techniques emphasised by the CAPA programme to assess learners’ performance in Art and Craft.

Loso

L1: ‘We give pupils theory tests at the end of the term and year and practical during the term in the form of quizzes.’ How do you grade practical work? ‘We do not grade practical work, we only grade theory work.’ Why are you not grading practical work? ‘We lack materials to use for the practical work projects. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?’ ‘If one pupil has created a picture of his or her family, she shows it to the rest of the class and there is an open discussion about the picture although I guide them on what to focus on for example, asking classmates what a colleague has created and why they think he or she did it. I sometimes display their work and allow them to talk about it then later they take their work with them home because it is theirs. Do you ever allow an individual to talk about his or her own work? ‘Yes.’ How do you do it? ‘I do it by asking an individual child to share with others the materials she used to create his or her product and the process he or she followed to create that product’. How do you keep records of pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I do not keep records because we do not have materials to make pupils’ progress files’.

L2: ‘When teaching we try and rush to the testable objectives which we believe when testing pupils they can understand the questions. Which ones do you see testable? (She attempted to give an example on how one can test pupils on painting but it was very difficult for her to do it and ended up saying,) ‘We follow Criterion Reference Testing (CRT) method to test pupils. (The problem of failing to respond to this question made her emotionally, and made me ending up not making any follow up to it. However she said, ‘One should be able to identify the correct answer among others if the child gives more than one answer’. Do you grade pupils’ work? ‘Yes we assess and grade art and craft. What criteria do you use for marking practical work?’ ‘I look at the pictures because each child’s picture is important to him or her; for example, the lesson the lesson I have just taught whereby one boy made a mixed up picture which when asked he told me that “it is a woman putting on make up and lip stick.” ‘There is no ugly thing in art.’ (She emphasised). (But she still could not explain the criteria she used to assess practical art and craftwork despite several probing except that she put marks). What about summative? ‘We use the same system to assess pupils for summative at the end of the term. How do you grade practical work? ‘We put marks.’ Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I never throw away pupils’ work; I display it on the classroom wall although I do not do anything about it’. How do you keep records of pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘We keep record of pupils’ progress in figures after giving them a test. (However, she was concerned that some teachers did not keep records to the extent that they cheat giving wrong information about the child when they are under pressure, the school administration requesting for the child’s progress file when she is taking a transfer to a different school). ‘It goes to the extent of the teacher requesting for a progress file from a different school to claim that it is for the child who is going for a transfer.’ She explained with a concern’. How do you use the records when pupils move to the next class at the end of the year? ‘They should be going with them even when pupils go for transfers but other teachers do not do it because of laziness. Some teachers do not see them of use to them. When they are handed with pupils’ profiles, they do not use them.’ (She emphasised that it was expected that pupils should proceed with their files wherever they go, that is from one level to another or from one school to another). Is there any proper handover of files from one teacher to another? ‘In our school there is no proper handover of pupils’ progress’.

L3: ‘I sometimes give pupils quizzes after every topic to check pupils’ understanding.’ Theory or practical? ‘Both theoretical and practical quizzes’. How do you mark practical work ‘I question them about their pictures to see how they will respond and grade in figures (She was giggling when responding). Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I always ask pupils to let me know me when they do not understand and I help them when they have difficulties’. How do you keep records
of the pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I used to have one but now I do not record what I test.’ Any reason for that? ‘No’.

L4: ‘The past week I gave them theoretical quiz and graded in figures. What about practical? ‘I sometimes give them practical work and assess it.’ I am still going to give them more practical work. How will you grade it? ‘I will see’. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I have not started but I will have to do it’. (He spoke with a very low tone looking embarrassed as if he was not doing something right) Will you please share with me how you will do it? ‘Pupils will tell their colleagues how they did their work and where they went wrong’. How do you keep records of the pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I record in my scheme book’. How do you make use of the records when pupils move to the next class at the end of the year? ‘Class-teachers keep them.’ But I think it would be proper for pupils to go with them to the next level’.

LS: ‘Teachers do not assess it. ‘They never set any test for art and craft”. Pupils only get the opportunity when there is a competition like “Moso”, that is when they are given projects which are marked and graded’. Why? ‘Because of limited knowledge’. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Teachers never allow pupils to talk about their art and craft work or that of others’.

LH: ‘Teachers set short questions every month end. I think CAPA is also one of them and at the end of the term they are given an exam. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I am not sure whether teachers do it but I do not do it in my class’. How do teachers keep records of pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘The records are there for all the subjects and we call them continuous assessment. You find that all the subjects are there in the file, then if one wants to see how children do in art and craft he or she looks at the record with pupils’ names and their marks. ‘How do teachers use of the records when pupils move to the next class at the end of the year? ‘Teachers remain with the files so that if one wants to check the child’s progress he or she could request for information from them or the teacher may hand the files over to the next teacher to refer to when he or she wants to know something about the child. Is there any formal handover of pupils’ progress records? ‘Yes, there is a formal handover of pupils’ progress by teachers and the names of slow learners are submitted formal to the next teacher and that teacher is advised how each individual child could be remediated.

Selepe

S1: ‘We usually do not examine all CAPA subjects at the end of the term or year but give class tests’. Do you test theory or practical? ‘Theory where there is need but mostly practically’. Will you please explain what you mean by “when there is a need.” ‘I mean that since we do not examine it we do not take it serious therefore we do not put more effort when we teach it’. Do you grade pupils’ art and craft work? ‘We usually paste the best ones on the wall and put others somewhere. We do not grade’. How do you identify the best ones? ‘By just looking at them’. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Sometimes I tell them to draw whatever they like and thereafter talk about their pictures’. What do you usually ask them to talk about? ‘I just let them talk freely, saying whatever they like without any guideline’. How do you keep record of the pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I usually keep their art and craft work somewhere, piling them somewhere, paintings and drawings. I do not mark them’. What do you really test from pupils? ‘I really do not know. I just ask them to draw or paint. I do not mark’.

S2: ‘Sometimes I give them theory tests only and grade in figures’. Why do you not give them practical work? ‘Because of lack of material and I also do not have knowledge on how to assess practical work’. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I sometimes ask them questions like, what problems did you encounter when creating your product? Why have you chosen to create this product? I also encourage them to continue working on their art and craft work at home for example, to research from the community.’
How do you keep record of the pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I do not keep record of pupils’ progress’.

S3: ‘I sometimes give them tests consisting of theory and practical’. What do you give in theory and practically? In theory I give pupils questions to answer whereas in practical I give them work such as drawing and grade them using figures looking at what is “good”, “better” and “fair”. What criteria do you use to grade using the three afore mentioned concepts? ‘I look at how the child used space, neatness, and attractiveness’. Do you have any problem in assessing art and craft? ‘Not at all’. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Sometimes I display their work on the board and ask them which one is attractive or beautiful and sometimes ask them to exchange their work to assess each other and choose the best’. What do you refer to when you say attractiveness? ‘It depends on what pupils themselves define as attractiveness that time’.

How do you keep record of the pupils’ progress in Art and Craft? ‘I record marks to know pupils’ progress’. How do you make use of the records when they move to the next class at the end of the year? ‘I hand them over to the next teacher’. Why? ‘I feel that it would be of benefit to the next teacher if forwarded with pupils’ records to continue assessing their progress from where the other teacher stopped’.

S4: We never test or examine this subject as it is not basic. We see it as not of great importance and only test the five which are basic. Which are those? ‘Maths, English, Science, Setswana and Social studies’. What do you do with the pupils’ finished art and craft work? I sometimes mark their work not grading but putting a tick on every piece of work as every work to me is important to each individual child. The work the pupil creates is what he or she wants to draw or paint. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Pupils just criticise themselves in groups, comparing their work. Whether their art and craft work is nice or not, better or not and some boast saying, “mine is better than yours”’.

SS: ‘They give quizzes’. Theory or practically? ‘They do not assess practical work. There are also no exams for art and craft’. Will you please share with me the criteria they use to assess theory in art and craft work? ‘I am not sure whether teachers mark pupils’ work. What I know is that in art they can just make pictures and then the children mark’. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I am not sure as I have not visited them teaching’. What about in their lesson plans, is there any evidence of them using such approach in their classrooms? ‘I do not remember anyone mentioning it in his or her planning’. How do teachers keep records of pupils’ progress? ‘There is no record kept in art and craft’.

SH: ‘A few of us give learners tests and award marks for the projects created whereas some just award a tick to anything a child has done because that is how the child perceives, each child views the world differently. However, the method of assessment differs according to observers because there is a set target by each teacher. The agreement in Summative assessment in our school is that we should not award marks for children’s projects but only observe a child carrying out an activity’. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I am not sure’. How do teachers keep records of pupils’ progress? ‘Teachers do not keep any record in art and craft’.

Budzi

B1: ‘I give monthly quizzes and tests only. Does it include both theory and practical work? ‘I do not assess practical work for formative assessment and I have never graded practical work. Any reason why do you not assess and grade practical work? ‘There is no reason why I am not assessing it because I do not have any problem of doing it, the only problem according is lack of materials to do it. How would you assess it if there was material? ‘I have never tried it’. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Pupils discuss their work with classmates and I sometimes paste their work on the wall for them to see what they have done. What do you usually include in the discussion? ‘They just go around and give comments they like. It is a free style. There is no formal criterion’. Do you keep records of
pupils’ work in art and craft? ‘We test pupils on every topic we complete and keep records. How do you grade pupils’ art and craft class activities? ‘We grade art and craft in figures and give comments such as, keep it up, good work, excellent when someone has got them all. What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the next level? ‘They proceed with the records. I record the same information twice, in the school continuous assessment form and in my exercise book and submit the one in the form to the office and the one in an exercise book to the next teacher on her own will. Does everyone do that in their school? ‘Most of the teachers do it but also at their own will. It is not a requirement.

B2: ‘In our stream we give pupils tests after completing each topic and end of the term we pick some questions from those tests to set an end of term test’. Do you include both theory and practical work? ‘Yes we do’. How do you assess practical work? ‘If pupils have created items like pottery we just look at whether the child has completed the pot and included all the things needed. The problem is that we don’t have a format on how to grade it. This then makes it difficult for us to assess art and craft’. How do you grade it then without a criterion to follow? ‘I never award marks because every artwork is good therefore, I just write “good”. (She also voluntarily shared her experience on how pupils draw at different stages of art development. She said small kids draw differently at different stages and gave an example that you find their drawings of human figure shows the neck combined with the whole body and that is his or her stage. However, she contradicted herself saying she has 12 year olds in her class but when they draw, she just takes it that they are standard two kids and when they excel she just say they have done well). ‘In practical, we don’t grade, we grade theory’. Do you all do that in your stream or the whole school? Our stream. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I usually give them time to display their work and they talk about their work. What does the discussion usually involve?’ ‘I do not guide them so as to make them free. They look at each others’ work and say what ever they want to say freely’. Do you keep records of pupils’ work in art and craft? ‘Yes, I do keep record. Will you please share with me how you keep both theory and practical work? ‘I keep theory work through figures but I do not keep any record for practical work’. Any reason for not keeping practical work record? ‘I do not award it marks’. What happens to the theory record when pupils proceed to the other level? ‘I keep it’.

B3: ‘We give monthly tests? Theory or practical test? ‘We give theory only in our stream for formative assessment and grade in figures. For example, asking pupils questions on painting such as “How do you mix paint to get a certain colour?” “What colour do you get when you mix red and blue?” Why do you not test practical work? There is no reason, it is only that I found the school doing that practice and followed it. I also do not have experience in assessing practical work’. How do you mark art and craft practical class work? ‘I sometimes just put a tick and write “good” and sometimes in figures out of a ten and sometimes alphabets (A,B,...) How do you come up with a figure? ‘I look at the beauty of a picture, and whether it is communicating in a way’. What do you usually defines as beauty in drawing? ‘Something which is very attractive in terms of colour, line, tone, and so on. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I just collect the papers and say wow! this is good, we don’t really talk about their work’. Do you keep record of pupils’ art and craft work? ‘Yes, I do’. What do you do with it? ‘Nothing’.

B4: ‘I give them monthly theoretical tests and only give them activities in practical work for formative assessment. How do you assess or grade practical work? I have never graded practical word. Any reason for that? ‘Previously, I did not know how to do it but now I know because I got information from the art and craft distance education modules; because of lack of materials I do not neither assess the subject nor grade it. The school head wrote a letter to the officer in Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit in 2006 which I submitted myself requesting for a workshop to learn how to assess the subject but she never responded by writing instead, she responded verbally to say they will arrange for that workshop but up to now they have not come. (This is one of the teachers who attended a workshop organised by the curriculum department inn their region to sensitize them to the introduction of the new primary school syllabuses). Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I usually ask them to say what they think about their work’. What does the discussion usually involve? ‘They talk about what they have done and the problems they encountered and most of the time they complain that I do not give them enough time to
complete their work’. **Do you keep any record of your pupils’ art and craft work?** ‘There is standardised school marks schedule for continuous assessment to record marks and this is done in the form of figures supported by short comments. **Will you please share with me the type of comments you usually make to art and craft work?** ‘This one needs more help in this subject or this one well done’. **What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level?** ‘We keep it in the school head’s office and the continuous assessment is given to parents in the form of reports. **Do teachers not use them?** ‘They may request for them if they need them otherwise, there is no formal handover of the pupils’ profiles. Slow learners files showing the remedial assessment which were given to the pupils are the ones handed over to the next teacher and this are handed over to the senior teacher advisor learning difficulties and she is the one who hands them over to teachers’.

BS: ‘Teachers give pupils monthly tests and those are topic tests which cover formative assessment. End of the term we have tests again. **Do teachers at lower primary test both theory and practical work?** ‘They do not test practical work because they have difficulties in marking practical work as they do not have tools for marking them. They mark theory and grade it in figures. When marking teachers just look at the correct answer because their tests are objective tests which need a one word answer only. Pupils do not need to explain anything. **Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?** ‘I have experience in lower classes only where they do not do it unless if it is for the purpose of other subjects such as in English where they take a picture and talk about it which we call “Picture Talk”. Otherwise we do not give involve pupils in evaluating their art and craft work. **Is there any reason for not allowing pupils to evaluate their art and craft work?** ‘There is no reason for not doing it’. **How do teachers keep the record of the theory tests they give to pupils?** ‘They record the marks and the child gets 9 out of 10 they just record 9’. **What do teachers do with that record?** ‘We take them to the next teacher who will be receiving pupils at the higher level’. **Is it a school requirement?** ‘I think the school emphasises it so that the teacher who receives pupils should have access to pupils’ progress. We have just started that process in our school; we have not been doing it’.

BH: ‘Pupils are given monthly tests’. **Theory or practical?** ‘We only give theory tests, we don’t test practical work’. **Is there any reason for not testing practical work?** ‘There is no reason for not assessing practical because we don’t have any difficulty in assessing art and craft. **How could you assess drawing and painting if you were to do it?** ‘We have difficulties in assessing drawing as it is mentioned that there is no right or wrong in pupils’ drawings. **What could you look at when assessing other art and craft topics in pupils’ practical work?** ‘It is difficult and may be that is why other teachers are also not assessing it practically; it is difficult’. **How do they deal with Summative assessment?** ‘They test at the end of the term and year but still theory and grade in figures. **Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?** ‘I think they allow children to talk about their work because when pupils have done something or drawn they need to talk about their work’. **What does the discussion usually involve?** ‘Pupils say whatever they can say without any guideline because teachers do not have any idea on how pupils should talk about and what to look at when discussing art and craft work. For example, some teachers when pupils have drawn pictures like dogs drawn on bare space looking like flying, they say nothing to pupils and do not even see any problem with the picture unless if an outsider can see the drawing and give advice that a dog or cow can not just stand on air, they should be ground or grass on background. **How do you do it in your class?** ‘Because they are standard ones they just tell me that “this is a boy, he is at the cattle post, he is doing this and that and so on’.

**How do teachers keep the record of the theory tests they give to pupils?** ‘They do it like in other subjects where they record them in figures’. **What do teachers do with that record when pupils proceed to the next level?** ‘They take them to the next teacher who will be receiving pupils at the higher level’. **Is it a school requirement?** It is what is expected from them but I am not sure whether everyone does it’. **Is there a formal handover of records?** ‘It is not formally done; some do not do it.

Xai

X1: ‘We planned that at the end of each topic we give pupils some exercises to check whether they have obtained the objectives’. **Theory or practical?** Most of the time it is theory and there is no practical assessment.
**Why do you not assess practical work?** ‘There are no materials. But I am aware of the importance of assessing pupils’ progress in practical work as children need to be given a project and be assessed on the end-product.

**How would you assess practical work if you had materials?** ‘I would look at the process the child followed, how the child used the materials and tools and the end-product and grade according to the requirement of each stage’. **Do other teachers in your stream assess practical work?** ‘Other teachers do not assess it also because of lack of materials’. **How do you grade theory?** ‘In figures’. **Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?** ‘I do not’. *(But immediately said,)* ‘I know I should be doing it’ **Why?** ‘Because when the child has communicated his or her own feelings through art and craft it is important for the teacher to know the problems he or she encountered when creating that art and craft work’. **Do you keep any record of your pupils’ art and craft work?** ‘I do record theoretical work. **What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level?** ‘I handover pupils’ progress when they proceed to the other level of learning especially slow learners’ progress whereby teachers communicate their progress to the next teacher. **Is it a school requirement?** ‘Yes’ everyone does it’.

---

**X2:** ‘I give revision questions at the end of every topic to see whether they have understood what was taught in which I grade in figures and write comments such as good, well done, fairly done. We do not really evaluate to see what the child has not done well and why. **What about practical work?** There is no practical work assessment. All teachers assess art and craft theoretically because it is Botswana art and craft curriculum requirement. There is also no criterion or guideline to assess practical work. **Is there a guideline for marking practical work?** ‘Yes, there is a guideline on how to mark theoretical work in the teacher’s guide. *(Her explanation on how to evaluate pupils’ art and craft work which included the aspects of art criticism advocated by Ragans, 2000 showed knowledge on how to assess practical work and she mentioned that that they were given guidelines at the college of education).* What is the teachers’ attitude towards this subject according to your experience? ‘The issue is not the attitude as teachers try to teach it and approach us as the practical subjects’ panel where they have difficulties. What is the role of this panel? ‘The responsibility of the panel is to set tests in these practical subjects and ensure that pupils participate in subject fares. **Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?** ‘I sometimes do it especially when the CAPA lesson is the last lesson of the day as I will be having time but sometimes I do not because I will be moving on to the other subject. **Why do you give them chance to talk about their work? The importance of allowing pupils to talk about their work is that it helps them to easily recall the activities they were doing that day’. **Do you keep any record of your pupils’ art and craft work?** ‘I do at the end of the scheme book and the score book. The scheme books are collected by the administrators at the end of the term. **What do they do with them?** ‘They check whether we have been giving tests and recording’. **What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level?** ‘I do not know’.

---

**X3:** ‘I give quizzes after every topic. **Theory or practical?** ‘Theory’. **Why do you not assess practical work?** ‘They are no materials’. **How would you assess practical work if materials were available?** ‘I would look at whether there is creativity in the project, theme and the child’s feelings. *(She was laughing when responding).* **What would you describe as creativity?** ‘When I have given a child an activity, I will look at whether he or she will come up with a new idea’. *(She continued laughing, but loudly now).* **How do you grade pupils’ art and craft work?** ‘I grade theory in figures’. **How would you grade practical work?** ‘I would also do it in figures. I would lay down the things I would look at in a project’. **Things like?** ‘Like creativity, novelty and so on. *(She continued laughing loudly with enjoyment).* **Do other teachers assess art and craft in your school?** ‘To be fair and honest with you I don’t think teachers take CAPA seriously like other subjects as setswana, maths, English and others; so it is really hard to say they assess it’. **What about the attitude of administrators?** ‘Only when the results are bad, otherwise, they do not consider it. It is kind of looking at the whole performance of the children in the area’. **Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others?** ‘Pupils discuss their work when they finish’. **What does the discussion usually involve?** ‘Pupils are free to say what they want without my interference or guide’. **Do they sometimes talk about each other’s work?** ‘Pupils are also able to say many things about other pupil’s work’. **Do you keep any record of your pupils’ art and craft work?** ‘Yes, I do keep records’. *(She responded reluctantly).* **What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level?** ‘I do not know because I am new to the school but had never heard of any proper
handover of the records to the next teacher. I just hand them over to the administrators but I do not know what they do with them. I share my quizzes with my colleagues in the stream but they never share with me so I am not sure whether they even sometimes set quizzes for their classes’.

X4: ‘Normally, we set tests for classes we are not teaching and we do that on monthly basis and also at the end of the term’. Do you test theory or practical? ‘We basically test theory’. (He responded with a puzzled face). ‘practically work is not tested in our school because of lack of resources. Teachers do not have any problems assessing the subject. When did they last assessing the subject? Since I joined the field, I had never seen teachers assessing practical work. Will you please share with me how you encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘I usually advise them to talk about their work when I have time. Do other teachers in lower primary do it? ‘I am not sure whether my colleagues do like wise. Do you keep any record of your pupils’ art and craft work? ‘We sometimes record marks and evaluate them and find some way forward. That is after the evaluation if the marks are low we look for better approaches and ask teachers who are experienced in the subject to help those who are in-experienced’ (He responded reluctantly). How do you record marks? ‘We record theory in figures and write comments to indicate where the pupils went wrong and how the other teacher can help him or her’. What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level? ‘Pupils go with them to the next level’. Are the records formally handed to the next teachers? ‘This is formerly done in our school as we hand in assessment files to the administration for teachers taking pupils at the end of the year’.

XS: ‘They give quizzes and the practical subjects’ panel sets the questions for standard one up to six because standard seven does not have CAPA. CAPA was started by the pupils who are in standard six now. But I am concerned that most of the art and craft objectives are not testable as they require practical work and we end up having only few questions or short tests on theory’. Do you not assess practical work? ‘We do not assess practical work’. Any reason why teachers are not assessing practical work? ‘Because of lack of both knowledge and materials. The council supply us with white paint only and the school buys the primary colours. I also do not have experience in assessing pupils’ practical work. However, I hope I will improve because I am doing diploma through distance specialising in art and craft’. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘They give tests’. Do you test theory or practical? ‘Yes they do ask them questions about their pictures’. Do teachers keep any record of their pupils’ art and craft work? ‘Yes, they keep records for theoretical work’. What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level? ‘Pupils go with their records to the next level’. Are the records formally handed to the next teachers? ‘Yes, they are monitored and formerly done by all the teachers in the school’.

XII: ‘They give tests’. Do they test theory or practical? ‘They do not assess practical work. The objectives are just left out because they do not have time to observe pupils doing practical activities. Do pupils not do practical activities at all? ‘Pupils are given practical work activities in classes but not assessed’. Why do teachers not assess practical work? ‘May be it is because of the concept or old mentality towards art and craft subject whereby it was not tested. They also do not have knowledge in assessing practical work in art and craft. There is not enough time to test practical work so they just give multiple-choice questions and grade with figures. Will you please share with me how teachers encourage pupils to talk about their work and that of others? ‘Teachers ask pupils to discuss their work with classmates. What does the discussion usually involve? ‘They do talk about how they feel about their pictures especially when preparing for subject fares’. What about their class work? ‘They also do it with class work’. Is there a guideline on what they should talk about? Pupils freely talk about what they feel about the products without any guidance. Do teachers keep any record of their pupils’ art and craft work? ‘They keep records for theoretical work. What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level? ‘They keep them and submit marks schedules to the administration office’. What happens to the record when pupils proceed to the other level? ‘Pupils go with their records to the next level’. Are the records monitored and formally handed to the next teachers? ‘Yes they are monitored and done by all the teachers in school. We used to have one record book for the whole school but since last year each class has its own record book’.

423
6.3.3 Teachers’ preparedness to the teach art and craft curriculum

Item 10: What problems do you/teachers encounter when teaching the newly introduced art and craft curriculum?

Loso

L1:
- Materials are not enough and we only have paint. We have topics like modelling and we do not have clay to do it. Some of the paints do not mix well with water as the paint just floats and we have problems when they want to mix colours to create other colours of the spectrum.
- The way the pupil’s textbook is written is also confusing because the curriculum developers have not addressed the topics appropriately for example, you find that topics like texture lack some of the content and mislead pupils because it includes smooth objects only and exclude others. When the teacher introduces the qualities missing such as rough texture pupils get confused because they are not in their textbook. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and pupil’s text-book to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘No, we do not even have a teacher’s guide for art and craft or any other reference to supplement the textbooks.’
- Most seriously, we lack art and craft knowledge and we really do not know what to do. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the last 5 years? ‘I never had one.’

L2:
- Materials are not adequate and we do not even have plain papers. How do you teach then? ‘We look around and also meet with colleagues to discuss what could be used to teach topics we plan’.
- ‘Some of the recommended pupils’ textbooks in lower primary are either of high level to its consumers or below their level for example, the current standard two textbook we are using that is useless for pupils because it is beyond their understanding. I am the only one who can understand the content but not pupils. It makes it very difficult for us to simplify the content for pupils to understand. Sometimes the information in pupils’ textbooks are irrelevant to the topic addressed.’ (She was so emotional when blaming the department responsible for prescribing books but most interestingly, she seemed not to be knowing that books are prescribed by the curriculum department as she emotionally blamed the council for recommending books which did not match the levels of pupils they teach.)
- I do not have problems myself because I research before teaching and ask for help from core-workers.’ Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the last 5 years? I had never had one. The content is really too high to pupils and teachers struggle to simplify it to pupils (She emphasised).
- Sometimes the information in pupils’ textbooks is irrelevant to the topic addressed. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and pupil’s text-book to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘In standard 2 we use the pupil’s textbook only although they are not enough copies. There is no teacher’s guide for CAPA.’

L3:
- Materials are inadequate and we only have paint and coloured pencils.
- We do not have protective clothing to protect ourselves when we work with topics such as painting.
- Sometimes we come across the difficult topics and it seems like most of the teachers do not have much knowledge in the subject. The subject needs specialists. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘We do not have any references in our stream except few pupils’ textbooks. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the last 5 years? ‘I have never had one’.

L4:
- The materials are inadequate and we do not even have papers, we only have wax crayons.
- The topics in the curriculum are not addressed in the pupils’ books as I end up researching externally. You find that some of the topics which are in the pupil’s textbook are not in the curriculum and vice-versa.
- I teach all the standard 4 classes CAPA modules as our school is among the 98 in Botswana which the Ministry of Education selected to pilot subject specialisation. But I lack knowledge and skills in some of these

424
modules except Physical Education which I am currently specialising in, in my Diploma in Education which I do through distance learning mode. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and pupil’s text-book to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘We have the teacher’s guide which relates well with the curriculum’.

- In standard 4 we only have one pupil’s textbook which is the teacher’s copy and a teacher’s guide for CAPA. We have long ordered books but the council people have not supplied them yet. This is a problem because pupils will be writing their attainment tests on art and craft and will only depend on their class notes.’
- Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the last 5 years? I had never.

LS:

- Materials are inadequate and when we make requisition, the council department does not supply us. When we make a follow-up they always promise to supply. The school does not have adequate funds to buy materials.
- Teachers do not have skills in using materials because of lack of knowledge in art and craft.
- The content is very difficult for teachers. However, unlike in music where there are no experts in that area in junior secondary schools, in art and craft teachers seek for help in secondary schools. Do teachers have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘We have a teacher’s guide draft and pupil’s books otherwise, we research externally. (She doubtfully said,) ‘The lower primary school pupils have enough pupils’ book copies and the teachers’ guides are fine; the problem is with teachers as they do not have an idea of what they are really expected to teach.’ How do you help teachers who have problems in art and craft? ‘Teachers seek help from one of the teachers in the school who has background in art and craft.’ Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the last 5 years? ‘I had never had it except that I did a CAPA course in South Africa and completed in 2004. I was specialising in Music but we were required to integrate Music and Art’. (She claimed to have done a bit of art not in South Africa explaining that one can not go to the class and say he or she is teaching art and craft for the day). One has to integrate Art and Music always. But in Botswana it is not possible to do that because of lack of materials because preaching to teachers not showing them does not serve any purpose as they will not easily grasp the information. How much confidence do you have in assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘Before visiting the teachers I identify the topic and objectives to be taught and study them before visiting the teacher to assess and that builds my confidence’. How often have you assessed teachers this year? ‘I assessed teachers twice during the first term of the year, standard ones, twos and threes’. What were you looking at when assessing teachers in art and craft lessons? ‘Objectives whether they are achieved, even when the teacher is failing to integrate but able to deliver content for each module I get convinced that the lesson is okay’. Were you convinced that teachers’ presentation of art and craft lessons address the Attainment Targets and Objectives stipulated in the CAPA programme? ‘Teachers’ instruction addressed the Attainment Targets and objectives (although she was of the feeling that they could have cheated as they were the once choosing the objectives to teach therefore could have chosen the ones they felt competent with). Have you ever had internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in A&C? ‘The beginning of every term we sit down together and look at the objectives and come up with the solutions to the problematic objectives including the emerging issues and engage external people where there is need. It is unfortunate that this group (learners) is the first one to do the new syllabus because pupils will be writing their attainment tests on art and craft and will only depend on their class notes.’ Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘There are pupils’ textbooks and teachers’ guides only unless one researches for more information externally.’ Do teachers have problems when using those references? ‘Some of the topics and content relate well with the curriculum while some differ. I am not sure whether teachers encounter problems when using them because I am new to the school but I had never seen any art and craft work displayed on classroom walls’. I have also never heard any complaints from teachers about the art and craft curriculum. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in art and craft in the past 5 years? ‘I never attended any in-service training in art and craft’ How much confidence do you have in assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘I have never assessed art and craft’. Do you have any teacher under your
supervision in art and craft? I have one standard 4 teacher (standard 4) who is teaching all CAPA modules to all the standard 4 classes but I am only 1 month with him. Have you ever had any forums/meetings with teachers to discuss how they could incorporate emerging issues in art and craft? We never have forums in art and craft but have them in other subjects especially those examined at the end of the primary education. (This is the administrator who mentioned in item 11 that she was only a month transfer to Loso primary school).

Selepe

S1:
- Materials are not enough but I do not have problems with the ones available. The pupil’s book is well explained and easy to follow and I work with colleagues who are standard one teachers when planning and we discuss about how we are going to go about the lesson and materials we are going to use. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and pupil’s text-book to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘We do not have a teacher’s guide. We only refer to the pupil’s textbook’. Do they relate well with the curriculum? ‘The pupil’s textbook is very good and relates well with the curriculum’. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years? ‘No, I only did art and craft at school during training at a college as a minor subject’.

S2:
- We do not have materials not even plain papers.
- Objectives in pupil’s textbook are written on the top pages with pictures below but it is not clear whether they are for those pictures or not therefore confuses. Otherwise I am fine with fine with the syllabus. If I can be provided with adequate materials I could handle the curriculum with ease. The pupil’s textbook is clear. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and pupil’s text-book to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I use my knowledge from the college including pupil’s CAPA textbook. I do not have a teacher’s guide’. Do the textbook relate well with the curriculum? ‘Yes they relate well’.
- Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years? ‘No’.

S3:
- Inadequate materials.
- Unavailability of references. They are few sometimes one or two.
- Some of the objectives are very difficult to understand as I have limited knowledge in art and craft. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I use my college books and the CAPA pupil’s text-book. We do not have a teacher’s guide. There is only one copy of the pupil’s book that we share’. Does the textbook relate well with the curriculum? ‘Yes, they do relate well with the curriculum’.
- It seems teachers have negative attitudes towards art and craft as it is not taught nor tested in some of the streams at the end of the term.
- Time allocated to the four CAPA subjects is also not enough to cover all the topics. What do you do when encountering such problems? ‘I consult colleagues in my stream and friends outside school to help. Friends help by making teaching aids while teachers help with planning the lessons’. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years? ‘No’.

S4:
- Some of the words in the curriculum are very difficult but if I always seek help from other teachers.
- There are not enough materials for art and craft.
- Pupils’ art and craft textbook does not address some of the objectives in the curriculum and yet there are no other references to refer to such as the teacher’s guide. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and textbook to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I rely on the CAPA pupil’s textbook only. I have no teacher’s guide. Sometimes I use my art, craft and design module for primary teachers distance learners. Do you encounter any problems when using pupil’s A&C text book as a reference?’ Sometimes you find that one does not understand the objective in the curriculum and when trying to refer to the pupil’s book there is also no information and the subject becomes very difficult to teach. Does the textbook not cover all the objectives in the curriculum? ‘Yes it does not. Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years?’ ‘I never had one’.
SS:

In adequate materials. Who is responsible for this problem? ‘It is the council department. We make orders in school and submit to the council offices but they do not deliver the materials ordered. Every child should have his or her own brushes but they are not enough. Do teachers sometimes come forward with problems in art and craft?’ ‘Kana le nna I sometimes have problems, they come with problems that I also have’ meaning that “I also sometimes have problems and they bring problems that I also have’.

How do you help them?’ ‘We sit together as a practical subjects panel and address the problem but sometimes we fail to solve the problems’. What is the role of the panel? It is for setting tests and helping classes with extra lessons when they have difficulties for example of agriculture. In art and craft there is an art and craft club responsible for raising funds and coordinates art and craft activities for entering art and craft fares’. How much confidence do you have in assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘I have done a bit of art and craft in primary teacher training therefore have limited skills. I do not have much confidence because of limited knowledge and skills in the subject’. Have you had in-service training or workshop in A&C in the past 5 years? ‘I did three years back at the Serowe Education Centre where the concentration was on art and craft assessment instruments. What difference did it make in your assessment of teachers in A&C? ‘I got information that safety should be infused in all the CAPA subjects and topics should not be taught in isolation. I also learnt how to assess pupils’ art and craft work’. Did you share information from the workshop with other teachers? ‘Yes I did’. What feedback did you get from teachers as a follow-up of what you shared with them for example, teachers and child assessment tools where teachers and pupils could use to assess themselves? ‘Teachers have not adopted the style’. What difficulties do teachers have in using those tools or applying skills gained from your presentation to keep pupils’ profile? ‘It is because there is a lot to do as we have many children in classes and when I talk to teachers about it they say they have a lot to do therefore can not afford’. What do you look at when assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘I concentrate on how the teacher presents the lesson, how he or she demonstrates the activities to pupils. I also look at pupils’ work and how they participate’. What about content taught? ‘I look at it whether it relates to the objectives’. Are you confident in assessing content? ‘No, because some of the topics are difficult’. How many times did you assess teachers in A&C Lower Primary this year? ‘I had never assessed but I only check whether they have planned for the subject regularly’.

What are your findings? ‘Teachers plan it regularly therefore I am convinced that all the objectives are achieved.’ Do you see teachers’ preparation of A&C lessons addressing the Attainment Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA syllabus? (The teacher seemed not to be familiar with the term Attainment Targets as she wanted me to explain what I meant. Later she said she assumed they address objectives). Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘Pupil’s textbook. There are no teacher’s guides for art and craft. I think all primary schools in Botswana have no art and craft teacher’s guide’. Does the textbook relate well with the curriculum? ‘Yes, it relates well’. Have you ever had any forums/meetings with teachers to discuss how they could incorporate emerging issues in art and craft? ‘No.’

SH:

- We do no have adequate A&C materials You find that there are only two bottles of glue to be used by the whole school.
- Some of the illustrations in the textbooks are not well explained.

Although teachers have never approached me as their senior staff for help, I have observed that there are those who pull some of the teachers from their classes to help them in their own classes especially those who once attended in-service training for art and craft. (She pointed out some of the teachers she believed were very good in art and craft and helping others). Some of the objectives that are in the curriculum should have not been brought to us at our level because a practical subject needs a laboratory where equipment could be stored and with enough space for free movement and sometimes paint split on pupils’ exercise books and it requires the teacher to always control movements’. How do you help teachers you see having difficulties in art and craft?

I am competent in music and I help teachers in music and those who are competent in art and craft help teachers. How much confidence do you have in assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘I can’t say I am much confident in assessing them in art and craft because you assess teachers in order to help them’. Have you had in-service training or workshop in A&C in the past 5 years? ‘I attended a workshop on CAPA when it was introduced not art and craft alone. I was involved in the launching of the standard one to four CAPA syllabus. How was it
done? ‘Every year we were called by the curriculum developers, they selected few teachers from each district and would go over the syllabus with them for all the CAPA subjects identifying the topics we feel we can handle and the ones we see as problematic. We discussed them. As we represented the sub-disticts we called each stream (standard 1-4) yearly to workshop them. That is discussing standard one syllabus, then two and so on up to standard four’. What difference did it make in your assessment of teachers in A&C? ‘It built confidence in me in assessing art and craft. Moreover, it built teachers’ confidence and developed positive attitudes towards art and craft and they understood senior’s visit to be of helping them improve their teaching’.

What do you look at when assessing teachers in A&C lessons? ‘There are many types of assessment. I make sure that it is schemed and planned well, whether pupils are given enough work and attended to. I also visit classes to see what appears on the wall. However, I have never observed the teachers presenting art and craft lessons’. What would you look at if you were to observe the lessons? ‘I would look at the classroom arrangement, whether materials are enough and appropriate for the lesson presented, teaching approaches and how children learn, that is children involvement in the lesson’. Would you not look at the content? ‘When looking at the appropriate teaching methods and learning aids, I would also be matching it with content whether content has been derived well from the objectives. Do you think you would not have any difficulty in assessing art and craft? ‘I do not think so because before assessing I have pre conferences with teachers to find out what the teacher is going to teach about and the teacher explains to me how he or she is going to tackle the lesson and I offer advise where necessary’. Although you have never assessed your teachers in art and craft, according to your observation or experience, do you see teachers’ presentation of A&C lessons addressing the Attainment Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA syllabus? ‘No because there are not confident in some of the topics therefore could not be addressing them in topics that they are confident in’. Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘We use recommended pupils’ textbooks but there is only one copy for each standard or stream for teachers to share. Teachers also have the teacher’s guide for standard one to four’. Do they relate well with the curriculum? ‘Yes they do though the textbooks only include few activities and require the teacher to come up with more’. ‘Yes, because we sometimes come up with problematic objectives and look at them as a group to get their meanings and also consider emerging issues because there are topics such as environmental issues, HIV/AIDS, hygiene practices and safety to avoid injuries). That is when we bring in the emerging issues in place because learners have to realise how they have to help those who are hurt and why they have to protect themselves and that is when issues like HIV/AIDS transmission are addressed’. Have you ever had internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in A&C? ‘We have never’.

Budzi

B1:
- I do not have problems with the curriculum because the pupil’s book makes content easier. The only problem is lack of materials. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum and the pupil’s textbook to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I use pupil’s textbook. I do not have the teacher’s guide’. Does the textbook relate well with the curriculum? ‘Yes, it does’ because it covers all the topics and objectives in the curriculum. Have you had in-service training or workshop in A&C in the past 5 years? ‘I haven’t but I have done art and craft at the Teacher Training College’.

B2:
- I don’t have problems with the curriculum except that we don’t have enough art and craft materials. May be it is because I like art and craft but I don’t have much skills. As a senior teacher, do other teachers according to your observation have problems? ‘One teacher once approached me to present a lesson for her and I did but she later told me that she was now fine with other topics’. Apart from this teacher, noone in my stream has ever shown any difficulty in the subject. Have you ever observed any art and craft lesson this year? ‘I have observed one teacher teaching art and craft this year and the lesson was just fine. The lesson was painting secondary colours’. What do you look at when observing the art and craft lesson? ‘How the has prepared the lesson, if she is following the planned steps, if she delivers the lesson well to the pupils and whether pupils understands the content’. What do you really mean by delivering the content well? ‘I mean whether she is
confident in what she is teaching’. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I use pupil’s textbook and teacher’s guide. Do they relate well with the curriculum? I do not have any difficulties because in our stream we once looked at the standard one to three pupil’s textbooks and discovered that they carry the same content therefore everyone can not encounter any problems in teaching those levels. They relate well with the curriculum and covers all the objectives in the curriculum’. Have you had in-service training or workshop in A&C in the past 5 years? ‘I had never’.

B3:
- I have problems with other topics in art and craft especially the practical part therefore we need instructors with the knowledge to help. Do you have any other references apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I usually use pupil’s textbook and teacher’s guide. Do they relate well with the curriculum? ‘I am not sure. Do you have any problems when using them? ‘I do not have any problems in using them’.
- Materials are not a problem except that they are not enough especially brushes.
- There is not that much difficulty in art and craft; it’s only that I personally have a negative attitude in these practical subjects because I have never really liked art and craft in my life. But he I did it in junior secondary school and in a College of Education as a generalist at diploma level. Is there any reason for not liking it? ‘I failed it at a junior secondary school therefore started hating it’. Do you dislike all the subjects you failed at that level? ‘I had a problem with art and craft because I can not draw and I am not even an artist’. (He raised his voice with a very serious face). Do you also hate topics such as printing and collage making? ‘Those ones are interesting but because of drawing I do not like art and craft (He smiled calmly). Have you had in-service training or workshop in A&C since you joined teaching? ‘I had never attended any workshop in art and craft’.

B4:
Although the references I use relate well with the curriculum, they do not cover all the topics and objectives in the curriculum therefore you find that sometimes I do not have information for other topics’. Which references do you have to support the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I use pupil’s textbook, teacher’s guide and art and craft distance modules as I am doing diploma through distance learning and majoring in art and craft. I share my modules with my colleagues and have expressed interest in these modules as they see them valuable. Do these references relate well with the curriculum? ‘The available references relate well with the curriculum but they do not cover all the topics and objectives in the curriculum’.

- We lack exercise books to the extent that we borrow from neighbouring schools in the region. One of the excuses we get from the council is that the suppliers do not have enough materials for schools. Even money for petrol for the school head or his deputy to go and request materials from other schools is not there and the council does not provide. We end up using some of the money contributed by pupils in school as each pupil contributes P15 per a week for school development. Three quarters is paid for by the council as they are the RADS while one quarter gets money from their parents.
- Space is not enough for storing materials and even when pupils work in the classroom like when painting.
- No materials even newspapers to cover tables when working with paints as they are no shops in the area selling newspapers where we could request for old papers.
- We also have problems with some of the topics in art and craft in the curriculum and usually ask for help from colleagues in school. I do not have much problems in the subject except that I need someone experienced in art and craft to assess me and show me my weaknesses as I have never been assessed in this subject since the introduction of the curriculum. I was only assessed in English and Cultural Studies. Do administrators sometimes assess art and craft in your school? ‘Not at all, because they are not knowledgeable in this subject. Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum? ‘I had never; except the one that I attended in 2001 which was conducted by the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit to work with teachers to identify problematic objectives and discuss with colleagues in the workshop and it was for all the subjects in standard one syllabus. I have not gained much from the workshop as it was not addressing us on how we should teach the syllabuses but only to identify and discuss problematic objectives. The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department could not address some of the objectives as they were also difficult for them and promised to look for information and come back to which they never did up to now. Did the workshop make any difference in understanding the art and craft curriculum you are teaching at present? ‘Yes, through the discussion with colleagues it did as we helped each other to clarify some of the objectives’. Did you share the knowledge and skills you gained with colleagues in your school? ‘Yes, the administrators who attended the workshop mounted a workshop for the whole staff’.
BS:

- Because the material we have is only paint, no one has a problem in using it. The problem is that there is not enough material.

Teachers complain that they have problems with some of the objectives and ask for help from the junior community school in the locality. Teachers do not have any problems with approaches and methods of teaching the subject because teaching is just teaching as long as one understands what to teach and if the materials are available the how part of it is not a problem. **Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons?** ‘Teachers use teachers’ guides and pupils’ textbooks and art and craft books in our storeroom. Some teachers use art and craft modules for distance learners that they have’. **Where did you get the art and craft books that you have apart from pupils’ textbooks and teachers’ guides?** ‘From the council’. **Do teachers encounter any problems using those references?** ‘Sometimes teachers complain that they do not find information for some of the objectives from those references. **As their supervisor, do you sometimes help them with problems they have in art and craft?** ‘Even us supervisors you find that we have difficulties. **Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum?** ‘I never had any in-service training in art and craft except when the curriculum was introduced whereby we were identifying the problematic objectives and later try to explain some of them. We were never advised on how to teach the subjective but I am of the view that the integration should form individual teachers’ decision where they feel objectives from different disciplines are matching. But we were advised in that workshop to consider teaching all the disciplines picking objectives from each rather than teaching one subject and ignoring others’. **Did the workshop make any difference to you in the teaching and assessing the subject?** ‘Totally nothing and I think I have the same problems that I used to have. I do not have confidence in assessing teachers because if the teacher could ask for help I would have problems as I would not be able to help. **How many times have you assessed teachers in art and craft lower primary this year?** ‘I have never assessed any teacher this term as I assess one teacher in the subject every term. I assessed one last term but the teacher had no difficulty in her presentation. She was teaching painting. **What do you look at when assessing teachers in art and craft?** ‘When assessing teachers I first look at the objective and follow the teaching processes whether they address the objective and then view the pupils’ practical work. **Do you see teachers presentations addressing the Attainments Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA syllabus?** (She seemed not to be familiar with the term Attainment Targets but when explaining to her she said one can not be sure because when teachers are assessed sometimes they pick the objectives which they feel comfortable with and further said,). ‘But the lessons I observed, I was convinced that the objectives were achieved’. ‘I never have forums whereby we discuss emerging issues but we used to meet when there was a senior teacher practical subjects who has just been transferred because we experienced that some of the teachers were not taking the subject serious and hence not teaching it or teaching it in passing because it will be tested at the end of the year and sometimes teaching only the objectives which they feel they can be tested and leave some behind’. **Do you have an idea whether art and craft will be tested at the end of the year in standard four attainment test?** ‘Not at all because we received a letter that the CAPA subjects will be excluded. **Have you ever had any internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in art and craft?** ‘We have not yet, but we are intending to have one on how to assess and mark art and craft practical work but none has shown experience on that area from the staff to can workshop other teachers. **What about what you learnt from the workshop you once attended?** ‘At the workshop I attended there was a document called “Tool” but it was basically for marking practical work but although I was introduced to it I am still confused and can not use it’.

BH:

Not enough materials. We always say to each other that art and craft is not a difficult subject; the problem is material. Otherwise, teachers never raise any problem with the topics and objectives of the subject. One time pupils were failing CAPA and in our meeting it was asked why pupils always fail this subject and teachers did not give any reasons. I am the one who said that I have observed why pupils fail, some teachers do not take it serious and to tell the truth, they do not take it serious, they just teach it in order to have something to test at the end of the month as per school requirement because the school will require evidence that it is taught and tested, they then just rush through some of the topics. **Why do you think teachers do not take it serious?** ‘Teachers do
not take it serious because CAPA is not examined in the Attainment Tests and Primary School Leaving Examination. When they get to standard seven teachers focus more on the examined subjects and not CAPA. **Do you have an idea when it will be examined at lower primary attainment tests?** ‘There is no information on when the ministry of Education will start examining it’. **Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum?** ‘I never had any in-service training in art and craft. I am just acting on this post; it is only that I like art and craft. I did it in the senior secondary school. I also did it at certificate level at the Teacher Training College although it was not effectively taught. It is only that I have so much interest in it because when I got here they didn’t have any art club and I formed it and our pupils competed in fares. **What is the role of the art club?** ‘It is no more existing but I am thinking of forming it again, the senior teacher for practical subjects who has just been transferred had no interest in art and craft at all. I could see that she was not interested in the subject that is why I am planning to revive the art club’. **Do you have confidence in assessing the subject?** ‘I have confidence because I enjoy it. **What do you look at when assessing teachers in art and craft lessons?** ‘When assessing the teachers I could look at how the teacher interacts with the pupils, the materials used, whether pupils have interest in the subject. **Do you see teachers presentations addressing the Attainments Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA programme?** ‘I have not yet assessed teachers in art and craft’. **Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons?** ‘We use Teacher’s guides and pupils’ textbooks. **Do teachers encounter any problems using those references?** According to me the references relate well with the curriculum and cover all the topics in the curriculum. The only problem teachers complain about is that there are no materials for other topics’. **Have you ever had any internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in art and craft?** ‘We never had any internal conference or seminar for art and craft. It was once when those who attended the workshop at Serowe Education Centre concerning the entire newly introduced primary school syllabus were briefing the staff. **What were they briefed on?** ‘They were not concentrating on CAPA subjects but all the subjects and did not address how the CAPA subjects should be approached except just letting us know what subjects are included in which syllabuses. It was just like saying, here are the new syllabuses and there was no follow up on whether we are coping with the syllabuses. The workshop did not address teachers’ problems more so that some new members of staff have been joining the school but no workshop was mounted for them concerning these syllabuses’ **Have you ever had internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in A&C?** ‘We have never’. **Xai**

**X1:**

- Lack of materials. For example, there is an objective which requires pupils to mix primary colours to create secondary colours but we never do it because we lack paint; pupils learn better by doing. Even when you want them to create mosaic there is no glue. We really have interest and understand objectives very well but we lack materials. Otherwise with objectives if we have difficulties we consult colleagues’. ‘I use the pupil’s textbook. **Which references do you have to support the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons?** ‘I have never seen or heard of teacher’s guide since I joined the school in 2006’ I only use the pupil’s textbook’. **Do you have any problems when using the textbook?** ‘It is okay because it goes hand in hand with the curriculum and covers all the objectives’. **Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years?** ‘I had never since I joined teaching’.

**X2:**

- The pupils’ book is not detailed. Some of the objectives are not fully addressed as some of the concepts are not fully explained and the process of how to go about an activity. The teacher’s guide is much better than the pupil’s book but still not detailed as in topics like collage they have only listed materials and only explained what a collage is’. 
- It is difficult to explain some of the concepts to the standard two pupils. That is the level is too high for their age. It is very difficult to find suitable words to explain to them eg terms like Collage. **Which references do you have to support the curriculum apart from the pupil’s textbook to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons?** ‘There is only one pupils’ textbook copy which is shared by the entire standard two teachers (two teachers), nothing for pupils. There is also a teacher’s guide, notes from college of education and an art and craft
textbook which I borrowed from a colleague. The school administrators say there are no books because the suppliers are not supplying. Do you have any problems when using them? The pupils’ book is not detailed and if one has no knowledge about the topic he or she is to teach it means he or she will have problems in teaching it. Some of the objectives are not fully addressed as some of the concepts are not fully explained and the process of how to go about an activity. For example, how collage is done. The teacher’s guide is much better than the pupil’s book but still not detailed as in topics like collage they have only listed materials and only explained what a collage is.

- Lack of materials.
- Pupils and teachers should be provided with protective clothes such as aprons and gloves to protect their clothes. Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum? ‘I had never had one’.

X3:
- I have no problems with any objectives but I have realised that pupils do not do well in theoretically work as there is no practical work and also because of limited time you find teachers rushing through topics racing against time. Which references do you have to support the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years? ‘I had never except that I did it at college level as a generalist’.

X4:
- In exception of the resources books inclusive I do not have any problems in teaching art and craft. Whenever I have difficulties I approach colleagues for help as we have teachers who specialised in art and craft in this school. Otherwise, I do not have problems with any objective but I have realised that pupils do not do well in theoretically work as there is no practical work and also because of time limitation you find teachers rushing through topics racing against time. Which references do you have to support the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘I have pupil’s textbook only. I do not have a teacher’s guide. I have never seen any teacher’s guide for CAPA. We have two teachers’ copies for CAPA textbooks which they share in a stream’. Where did you get them from? ‘I am not sure where they came from. (I discovered that the copies he talked about were samples from the two publishing companies who were advertising themselves in schools by distributing those books for teachers to view. The teacher seemed not to have information on the process of book selection by schools as he denied viewing and selecting books for their school). Have you had any in-service training or workshop in A&C in the last 5 years? ‘I had never except that I did it at college level as a generalist’.

X5:
- Some of the teachers have problems in teaching art and craft because of lack of knowledge and skills in the area as they never did it in their schooling. However, we are lucky to have one of the teachers who has just joined us from his studies in Australia who specialised in art and craft. He usually helps teachers because I told them that who ever have problems should see me so that I arrange for him or her to get help from this specialist. But teachers do not often seek for help as they do not have many problems in art and craft. Teachers are just fine with topics, objectives and the available materials. They also get assistance from the local junior secondary school as we have an agreement with them that wherever we have difficulties we should make an arrangement to bring kids to the secondary school for help’. Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘There are few pupils’ textbooks which are samples brought to us by different publishing companies to advertise themselves’. Why is there shortage of books? ‘We have submitted the requisitions to the council but it has not supplied us with books. Do teachers have any problems when using the textbook? ‘Teachers never complain of anything’. Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum? ‘I had never except that I am doing art and craft through distance learning. Do you have confidence in assessing the subject? ‘I have confidence in assessing teachers in art and craft lessons. What do you look at when assessing teachers in art and craft lessons? ‘I usually do not go into classes to assess teachers but only collect scheme books to check the scheme of work and lesson plans and pupils’ textbooks to check whether what has been schemed and planned has been taught to pupils. Only the
heads of departments are allowed to go into classes to assess. However, we are not restricted much; we can observe lessons’. Do the Heads Of Departments sometimes assess teachers in art and craft at lower primary? ‘They do’. Have they assessed you this year? ‘I have not yet been assessed in it this year. Do the pupils’ art and craft exercise books you have looked at have evidence that the subject is effectively taught?’ ‘Yes, they do. There is no how teachers can relax on it because they know it is tested at the end of the term by the art and craft panel. How do pupils perform according to your experience?’ ‘Pupils do well in art and craft tests set by the panel’. Do you see teachers presentations addressing the Attainments Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA programme? (She was so surprised and lost as she gasped when hearing the term Attainment Target but after explaining to her she responded by saying.) ‘I am familiar with the objectives only and the pupils’ exercise books indicate that the objectives are effectively addressed’. When looking at pupils’ art and craft exercise books is there evidence that teachers are addressing the emerging issues? ‘Yes, they do’. Have you ever had internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in A&C? ‘No, I had never had any training’. Have you ever had any internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in art and craft? ‘We had it last year but not yet this year. We met as a staff and it was sort of a workshop and discussed art and craft issues’.

XI:
- Some of the objectives are difficult to address. We do not have information about them. Maybe it is because we lack the knowledge especially those who did PTC (Primary Teachers’ Course) including me. You find those teachers having difficulties in teaching this art and craft as they are not familiar with some of the objectives.
- The other problem is lack of materials. Who is responsible for making orders and supplying materials? We make requisition but the council does not supply. Where there are materials there is no appropriate place to use them for example a saw and planks I brought from my home, there is no suitable classroom to use them.
- There is also no school workshop to refer pupils to do practical work. However, we sometimes just improvise even though it is difficult to do it in some of the topics. How are teachers who have problems helped? ‘We sometimes identify the problematic objectives with teachers and come together as a staff and try to interpret them. After that teachers cope as they apply what they discussed in the meetings’. Which references do teachers use apart from the curriculum to plan and teach Art and Craft lessons? ‘They use pupil’s textbooks and teacher’s guides for standard threes; I am not sure of standard four. In standard one you may find only four copies for pupils and one copy for the teacher. Why is there shortage of books? ‘We have submitted the requisitions and in some classes they have supplied late and not yet with others’. Do teachers have problems when using those references? ‘The teachers’ guides have limited content. Sometimes only one example is given on how to do civilizations which means the teacher has to research. If you do not research you will end up denying pupils information giving that little information or example from the teachers’ guides reference’. Where do teachers research? ‘We have a mobile library in the village and the one in school which have art and craft books. This does not solve much of the problem because theoretically teachers can get information but they can not apply therefore they need workshops. Most of the schools need art and craft workshops where pupils could go there to use the materials in that workshop. Are the references teachers use relevant to the curriculum?’ ‘Yes, the references are relevant to the curriculum’. Have you ever had any in-service training in art and craft since the introduction of the curriculum? ‘No, I had never had any in-service training. How much confidence do you have when assessing the subject?’ ‘I have confidence in those topics that I am competent in. I am not able to assess topics that I am not knowledgeable in’. How many times have you assessed art and craft this year? ‘I have never assessed teachers in art and craft this year but I had in some of the subjects’. What do you look at when assessing teachers in art and craft lessons? ‘I look at whether pupils are doing or they are just taught theoretically, and whether pupils work is displayed after they have done something because they have to display so that those who have not done well could compare with those who have done well and see where they went wrong’. Do you see teachers presentations addressing the Attainments Targets and objectives stipulated in the CAPA syllabus? ‘Partially they do it because they lack knowledge in art and craft’. Have you ever had internal conferences/workshops for your teachers in A&C? ‘We had never organised any’.

433
6.3.4 General Comments about Art and Craft Curriculum

Item 11: Do you have any suggestions you feel could help improve the Art and Craft Curriculum at Lower Primary?

Loso

L1:
- Adequate materials for the subject should be supplied because there is no how pupils can learn without materials. If you get into craft work there are no materials to teach those topics. Only wool is provided. *(She emphasised with frustration).*
- Teachers should be given in-service training on the subject so as to cope with the curriculum.
- Some of the standard one content is very difficult for us therefore it should be simplified.
- Standard one topics should be reduced. This could be possible if each level could be attached to its own topics and these topics to be fully exploited at that time instead of the current situation whereby there is a topic of art in all the levels of learning for example if there is painting for standard one, it should not appear again in any other level.

L2:
- May be now that the Ministry of Education has introduced the specialisation and our school is also part of the piloting, the teaching of the subject will improve.
- Looking at the load I am carrying, teaching 11 subjects you find that in other subjects I do not teach effectively as in others. If everyone could be responsible for a certain subject then he or she will be accountable for its results at the end of the year
- If workshops could be mounted for teachers they could perform better in this subject because teachers have never been trained to teach this subject.
- Teachers should adhere to the requirement which seeks them to keep pupils’ progress files so that they can know their pupils better.

L3:
- The subject needs specialists to help other teachers in the teaching of the subject. *When asked whether they do not have specialists in school she said:*
- We have, but when one contacts them they also say they do not know because they also have difficulties with the CAPA syllabus.

L4:
- If I was the government I would make sure the curriculum is developed by primary school teachers. *(He claims that teachers are excluded in the panel which develop the curriculum).*
- The content is too high for the level of these kids therefore it should be simplified.
- More specialists teachers should be brought to cover the other three aspects of CAPA as I only specialises in physical education but expected to teach all of them.
- The curriculum developers should supply them with the criteria on how to assess art and craft.

L5:
- Adequate materials should be supplied to our school.
- Specialised teachers in CAPA should be considered because they are objectives which give teachers problems. I see specialisation as a disadvantage in our school as art and craft is taught by a teacher who was never trained for it in lower primary therefore I would suggest that art and craft should be taught by teachers who are specialists. In CAPA, there should be a teacher specifically for art and craft, music, just like that not to have a teacher without background in art and craft to come and teach children not having knowledge of the subject.
- The best thing is to include a lot of theory than drawing and at the end of the day assess the theory part. “Are they able to do this…. do they understand the lines they are using, why is the painting like this and that, how did they mix them to come up with this colour”. *Does the curriculum emphasise practical work?*
- Teachers are the ones who decide to concentrate on practical than theory. Even our best teachers they are too much into drawing and painting.
- Because the curriculum is new we do not have much information, if you could come the following year this time of the year you would get a lot.

LH:
- We are not trained; therefore more teachers should be trained for CAPA subjects as art and craft is not an easy subject.
- Adequate materials should be supplied because we do not have enough.
- Pupils should be given more practice in art and craft as according to my observation they are not given much work in art and craft.
- Pupils should not be given tests all the time but a lot of class activities.

Selepe

S1:
- As I am teaching right now there are no materials therefore we improvise even when unnecessary. Adequate materials should be provided for effective teaching.
- It could be improved if there could be specialists in all these subjects. That is someone who has really specialised in these subjects at college level because we are not specialists in this area. Do you see the subject taught effectively in your school? ‘Yes, I think so because when I move around I see art and craft work displayed on the classroom walls’.

- To be recognised as a subject it should be tested like other subjects so that it can be really done.

S2:
- The curriculum is fine. The problem is only lack of materials.
- A purpose built classroom should be built for art and craft with all the necessary materials, tools and equipment for the subject to be effectively taught. According to your observation, do other teachers cope with the curriculum like you? ‘I think so as they never ask for assistance from those who have done art in their training’. Have you ever been assessed in art and craft this year? ‘I have never been observed teaching any CAPA subject including art and craft except that the head of department for CAPA regularly checks our planning in all CAPA subjects’. Will you please share with me whether the comments made by the head of department for art and craft after looking at your plan help you improve? ‘They do not help for example; we are given comments such as: “Make sure art is practical or hands on not only theory”. (With those comments, she suspected that her head of department could be having limited knowledge in art and craft).

- Teachers should be equipped to be able to assess art and craft and promote it so that pupils also value it to be of importance to their lives.

S3:
- Some terminologies included in the curriculum are very difficult for us to understand. They need to be simplified.
- It could be improved if there could be specialists in all these subjects and also adequate materials. (He said he was so concerned that it is not effectively taught and wish that teachers could change their attitude towards the subject). What are the teachers’ attitudes in your school? ‘They have negative attitudes towards it’.
- Art and craft is like any other subject therefore, it should be assessed through formative and summative procedures as the curriculum requires so as to follow pupils’ progress. This can be effective if the curriculum developers could suggest the criteria to apply those strategies to help teachers who lack knowledge in the subject.

S4:
- There should be a specialist for CAPA subjects to teach them because other teachers do not have interest in these subjects. Why do you think they do not have interest in them? ‘Because when I say, let’s prepare CAPA they say, that is your subject, we do not like it then I will have to prepare it’. Sometimes teachers in this school including the administrative staff invite me to teach it for them. Teachers have a negative attitude towards art and craft. I have also observed that even the school administrators do not like the subject and I am suspicious that they do not teach it to their pupils’.
- Sufficient materials should be provided including references.

SS:
- In-service training should be given to teachers.
- Art and craft should be assessed through structured and multiple choice questions.

SH:
- I suggest that there be monitoring by those who are art and craft expert to see to it that art and craft is effectively taught in primary schools like the curriculum developers who represented different subjects who used to move around schools launching the curriculum. They should now make a follow-up to get feedback on teachers’ strengths and weaknesses in the implementation of the syllabus. They should get into classrooms to observe teachers teaching and get teachers’ views about the subject.
- The other thing is that children get motivated by seeing people benefiting from things made of art and craft. That is seeing art and craft being applied in real life not only as a school subject therefore pupils should be exposed to the art and craft outside the classroom. They should be able to use knowledge they acquired in schools in real life situation.
- Teachers should be provided with forms so that they know exactly what they should look for when testing a learner. Practical work cannot be assessed by pen and paper work. For most of the time they should a part whereby learners carry out an activity and be observed to see if they followed well during the lesson. There should also be a small part whereby children can write expressing their feelings.
- The way the subject is designed shows that it is a hand on discipline therefore teachers need to be equipped on how to assess it.

Budzi

B1: ‘Whatever is there, for me it is okay. As I am still experiencing the curriculum because it is new may be as time goes on that is when I would have identified something and then suggest’.

B2:
- Some of the teachers have never been trained for art and craft therefore should be taken for training. This is not the case with our school only but all Botswana primary schools.
- Because we never finish the objectives, time for the CAPA subjects should be increased.
- Because we don’t know how to assess art and craft we don’t know what we really should look at and where we are going therefore should be trained on this.
- Problem of shortage of materials should be attended to. Who is liable for this problem? ‘I am not sure whether it is the council or people up there because we have made requisitions and submitted to the council but nothing is forthcoming except that they keep on promising that things have been sent and are on the way. What is the attitude of teachers towards art and craft in your school? ‘They like it and when they create products for competitions they are willing to do the activities and cooperate as long as there are materials like papers and crayons. When I arrived here from another school I joined them and we worked together with our pupils and won the art and craft competitions up to the national level. (She emphasised that there should be in-service training for teachers).

B3:
- In art and craft we need to have a laboratory whereby when pupils get in could feel that there are in an art and craft lesson because the classrooms we have are not conducive for art and craft lessons.
- Teachers should be given in-service training or workshops on how to plan and teach art and craft.
- Teachers should also be given an outline on how to mark art and craft work.

B4:
- The council people should try and build bigger classrooms as the space is not enough and also more classrooms as there is a shortage. There is not enough space for displaying and to avoid sharing as some pupils in other classes could sometimes break the products for other classes.
- Materials should be supplied to schools.
- CAPA topics should be reduced as time is not enough to cover all of them in a year.
- The time for CAPA subjects should be increased as it is not enough.
- Some topics such as Construction should be simplified as they are very difficult to both teachers and pupils.
- There should be in-service training for teachers in art and craft because most of the teachers have never done it.
- Attention should be given to assessment by training teachers on how to assess art and craft.
- When dealing with materials the concerned ministry should consider remote areas first as those parents in towns and big villages could afford and have access to materials where they are. They seem to be giving more attention to big villages and towns.
BS:
- If teachers could be taken for in-service training.
- Objectives are also broad and need to be reduced.
- We need an art and craft lab.
- Since we have no materials it is not easy to identify problems but if materials were available we could identify problems and difficulties pupils have. It is not possible for us to diagnose difficulties because pupils have not explored some of the objectives and materials since they are not available.
- Since this subject is different from others there should be a format provided to teachers on how to assess art and craft. **Who responsible for providing material?** ‘We make requisition for materials and submit to the council office’. **Do you ever make follow-ups?** ‘We never make a follow-up. The council say they still have a problem of money to purchase material’.
- The subject should be taken serious just from the top people who are responsible for distributing materials to develop the necessary skills at a younger age because the subject moulds the kids and art and craft is easier than other subjects and pupils enjoy it’. **What attitude do teachers have in art and craft according to your experience?** ‘Most of them are still dragging their legs behind. They still value subjects like Maths and Science to be the only ones of value’.

BH:
- Teachers should be taken for in-service training to motivate them because some of them like art and craft although some do not.
- More internal workshops would also help teachers in the teaching of art and craft.
- Since this subject is different from others teachers should be trained on how to assess practical work and there should be a format provided to teachers on how to assess art and craft.
- School to be provided with enough materials because sometimes we fail to do activities because of lack of material. If they could just go through the syllabus to check what is needed and provide materials, teachers can not have problems in teaching art and craft. The only thing that makes teachers not to teach this subject is lack materials because in art and craft there is nothing you can do without materials.
- The subject should be examined because it is one of the things that make some of the teachers to ignore the it; they know that it is not examined. They say what is the use of teaching it and this deprives those children who like art and craft.

Xai

X1:
- Art and craft is a practical subject and the end-products need to be tested not only theory. Apart from materials teachers do not consider assessing the subject. Also primary schools should be treated as secondary schools as secondary schools are given appropriate materials and in primary schools we are expected to improvise all the time and how far will we go with improvisation? I did art and craft in teacher training college and it was effectively taught and this made me to love it although I chose to major in music and agriculture in my distance learning.

X2:
- If the schools could find a way of testing practical work.
- If appropriate reference books, enough pupils’ text books and adequate materials could be provided.
- The subject is not tested at standard 7 and suggest that it should be tested “What is the use of us teaching children, right now we are struggling for these children to understand and at a certain level the subject is dropped and all our work is gone to waste? When children go to junior secondary schools and to upper levels they are taught those subjects and why can they not be tested?” *(she exclaimed)*

X3:
- More emphasis should be put on the practical part of art and craft because young children recall or learn better when they see things and touch them; it remains in their heads but if you tell them they easily forget of which this is what we are doing, just telling them things they do not know and it is very easy for them to forget.
- We teachers also need to be shown the value of art and craft because we do not take it serious. We do not take it serious *(She repeatedly)*, we only focus on the five subjects which are examined, *(she emphasised)*. “Motho mo gongwe beke e kgona go feta a sa naga searts, ga go mo tshwenye ka sepe e se gore ga a na nako”
meaning, “sometimes one can go for a week without teaching art not because there is no time but just can not be bothered teaching it”. ‘Is the problem is the attitude or lack of knowledge? ‘Both’.

X4:
- Specialisation could help because if one does not have knowledge in art and craft he or she will have a negative attitude towards the subject and thus not teach it effectively and will end up affecting those pupils who have potential in art and craft.
- Secondly, schools should be provided with relevant reference books. **What is the attitude of teachers towards this subject? ‘I do not want to be rude but those who have gone as far as degree or diploma level have a better attitude towards art and craft as compared to those who have lower qualification. This is because the content of the curriculum is very difficult for those with Primary Teacher’s Course (PTC) qualification therefore resulting in them having the negative attitudes towards the subject as compared to those with higher qualification. For those with diploma and degrees if it is there it results from laziness’**. **What about the administrators’ attitudes? ‘The administrators, like the school head encourage us to teach it’. Have you ever been assessed in art and craft this year? ‘I have never been assessed in art and craft since I joined the field’.

XS:
- If practical work objectives could be reduced and the theoretical ones be increased it would help teachers when they set tests as they will have enough content to set from. **What is wrong with the practical work? ‘There is nothing wrong with it except that lack of materials influences us to avoid it.**
- Specialisation could help whereby a teacher could concentrate on one module instead of four as these could help teachers to teach the subject effectively.
- If there was a format on how practical work could be assessed.
- If there could be an art and craft workshop where one could find all the appropriate equipment, materials and tools not like now where you find teachers suffering and hence not teaching the subject effectively. “Art and craft is not difficult if the materials were there and teachers and pupils love it; if everything was there everything could be going smoothly”. (She emphasised with confidence). **What is the attitude of teachers towards art and craft according to your experience? ‘The attitude of teachers towards art and craft is positive’. (She responded with a smile in her face).**

XH:
- If there could be a school art and craft workshop or studio so that when lessons like how to store materials and how to handle them safely are taught; pupils could do it practically storing materials they have used in that workshop and this will help them to easily recall content they are taught in art and craft. Some of the materials and tools are just lectured to pupils and they do not know how they look like.
- I also suggest that there should be specialised teachers for art and craft so that children get enough and relevant information unlike us who omit some of the objectives and hence denying pupils the opportunity to gain much needed knowledge and the necessary skills in art and craft. **Do the attainment tests for standard fours cater for art and craft? ‘No, that is a school arrangement as we are the once who set for our pupils. ‘Only the languages and maths determines whether the child should proceed to standard five. **What is the attitude of teachers towards art and craft? ‘Those teachers who have knowledge and skills of the subject like it.**
Appendix 6  Permission Letter from the Ministry of Education

30 October 2006

To:  Ms Magdaline Chilalul Mannathoko
77 Coed Edeyn
Llanedeyn, Cardiff, Wales
United Kingdom

RE: PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

We acknowledge receipt of your application to conduct research that will:

➢ Investigate how the art, craft and design is taught at the lower primary level.
➢ Examine the links of the curriculum with African cultural heritage.
➢ Determine whether methods and approaches used in the teaching of the art, craft and design address the aims and objectives of the Creative and Performing Arts(CAPA) syllabus.
➢ Determine whether the activities given to children develop their knowledge and skills.

You are granted permission to conduct research data collection for your research entitled:

FROM DESIGN TO PRACTICE: EVALUATING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NEW ART, CRAFT AND DESIGN CURRICULUM IN SIX PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN BOTSWANA.

This permit is valid until OCTOBER 31 2007

You are reminded to submit a copy of your final report to the Ministry of Education, Botswana

Thank you,

[Signature]
For Permanent Secretary
Appendix 7  Permission Letter from the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit

Magdeline C. Mannathoko
77 Coed Elynn
Llanedeyrn
Cardiff
CF23 9JW
Wales
United Kingdom

Dear Madam,

Request to Conduct a Study on Art Craft and Design Education

Your letter requesting to interview officers responsible for Creative and Performing Arts Syllabus at Primary refers.

Permission is granted to collect data through interviewing officers for your research entitled: FROM DESIGN TO PRACTICE: EVALUATING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NEW ART, CRAFT AND DESIGN CURRICULUM IN SIX PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN BOTSWANA.

The officer to be interviewed can be identified later and all other logistical arrangements will be made at the appropriate time.

Thank you.

Yours faithfully,

D.M. Ratsatsi
Acting Director
CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT & EVALUATION