CHILDREN’S PERCEPTIONS OF THEIR OWN NATIONAL IDENTITY AND WHAT IT MEANS TO BE WELSH

Alison Murphy

A thesis submitted to Cardiff Metropolitan University in partial fulfilment for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Cardiff School of Education

Cardiff Metropolitan University
DECLARATION

This work has not previously been accepted in substance for any degree and is not being concurrently submitted in candidature for any degree.

Signed ...................................................................... (candidate)

Date ..........................................................................

STATEMENT 1

This thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. Where correction services have been used, the extent and nature of the correction is clearly marked in a footnote(s).

Other sources are acknowledged by footnotes giving explicit references. A bibliography is appended.

Signed ..................................................................... (candidate)

Date .........................................................................

STATEMENT 2

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and summary to be made available to outside organisations.

Signed ..................................................................... (candidate)

Date ..........................................................................
ABSTRACT

The thesis examines primary school children’s understanding of their own national identity and their perceptions about what it means to be Welsh. Both topics are investigated from a qualitative standpoint and contribute to the mainly statistical material in the field.

The data were collected with children aged nine to ten years in three schools (two English-medium schools and one Welsh-medium school) in an urban area of south-east Wales. The study used multimodal methods, incorporating writing, drawings and interviews to capture the children’s insights.

Findings demonstrated that children aged nine to ten are able to define their national identities in clear and discerning ways. Welsh was the most cited national identity, both in singular and multiple definitions of their national identity. Family, birthplace and residency were identified as factors in shaping their sense of their own national identity. Language did not feature strongly in the children’s responses about their own national identity.

When reflecting on being Welsh and Welshness, the children’s drawings and annotations indicated common and often stereotypical views. These responses mainly occurred when the children discussed skin colour, religion and leisure activities. In this part of the investigation, the school, sport and the media were influential in shaping the children’s perceptions of a Welsh person. By contrast, while language was not highlighted by the children as a significant feature when considering their own national identity, the children’s perceptions of a Welsh person placed an emphasis on the Welsh language in this association.

Debates regarding national identity in the UK and Welsh contexts have recently been central to the public discourse. In Wales this has been particularly evident since devolution in 1999. This qualitative study not only contributes to the existing body of research regarding children’s ability to define their own national identity, but also to how this manifests itself in the devolved context of Wales.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my thanks to Professor Janet Laugharne whose unwavering support has kept me focussed and motivated to complete this thesis. Additional thanks are extended to Dr. Sian R. Williams who has also provided help and encouragement in the latter years and Dr. Alan Sandry who has also supported me along the way.

My thanks are also extended to the schools in which I collected my data and the teachers and children alike.
DEDICATIONS

This thesis is dedicated to my parents Harold and Joan Bishop, who would have been very proud of their daughter’s achievement had they been here to witness it.

Also to my husband Kevin and my children Emily and Joseph; they have all provided me with love and support throughout the process of completing this doctoral thesis. Their encouragement has helped me persevere to the end of the research and writing process and without them, the submission of this thesis would not have happened.
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

TABLES

Table 1: Data accumulated from ESTYN documentation (2009, 2006, 2010) and Cardiff County Council (2011, 2012).

Table 2: Information on initial data sample

Table 3: Data collection process

Table 4: School A - Self-categorisation of national identity

Table 5: School B - Self-categorisation of national identity

Table 6: School C - Self-categorisation of national identity

Table 7: Interviews: Rationale for Self Categorisation of National Identity

Table 8: Emergent Themes from Rationale for Self Categorisation of National Identity

Table 9: Questions to consider when drawing a Welsh person

Table 10: School A Image Content (Welsh Person)

Table 11: School B Image Content (Welsh Person)

Table 12: School C Image Content (Welsh Person)

Table 13: Emergent Themes from Image Content (Schools A, B and C - Welsh Person)

FIGURES

Figure 1. Methodological framework for the study

Figure 2. Initial framework

Figure 3. Process of consent

Figure 4. The research dynamic

Figure 5: School A Image 1

Figure 6: School A Image 2

Figure 7: School B Image 1

Figure 8: School B Image 2

Figure 9: School C Image 1

Figure 10: School C Image 2

Figure 11: School A Image 3

Figure 12: School B Image 3

Figure 13: School B Image 4
Figure 14: School C Image 3
Figure 15: School A Image 4
Figure 16: School B Image 5
Figure 17: School A Image 5
Figure 18: School A Image 6
Figure 19: School A Image 7
Figure 20: School A Image 8
Figure 21: School B Image 6
Figure 22: School B Image 7
Figure 23: School B Image 8
Figure 24: School B, Image 9
Figure 25: School B, Image 10
Figure 26: School C Image 4
Figure 27: School C Image 5
Figure 28: School C Image 6
Figure 29: Theoretical Framework resulting from the study
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration i
Abstract ii
Acknowledgments iii
Dedications iv
List of tables and figures v

Chapter 1: Introduction 1
1.1 Context and relevance of study 1
1.2 Methodological context 6
1.3 Theoretical context 7
1.4 Personal context 9
1.5 Thesis structure 12

Chapter 2: Literature Review 14
2.1 Defining national identity 14
2.2 National identity within the Welsh context 22
2.3 Children’s acquisition of national identity perspectives 29
2.4 Children and national identity in the UK and Ireland 35
2.5 Children and national identity in Wales 38
2.6 National identity and policy in Wales 40
2.7 Summary of literature review 44

Chapter 3: Methodology 45
3.1 The research paradigm 47
3.2 Ethical considerations 48
3.3 Methods 52
3.3.1 Visual methods of data collection 54
3.3.2 Children’s drawings 55
3.3.3 Semi-structured interviews 58
3.4 The pilot project 61
3.5 Sampling: School, Class, Interviews 66
  3.5.1 Sample – School selection 67
  3.5.2 School A 68
  3.5.3 School B 68
  3.5.4 School C 69
  3.5.5 Sample – Class selection 69
  3.5.6 Sample – Interview participant selection 71
3.6 Procedure for carrying out the study 72
3.7 Data Analysis 74
  3.7.1 Analysis of the children’s drawings 75
  3.7.2 Analysis of annotations and interview data 77
3.8 Evaluation of methodology 80

Chapter 4 Children’s perceptions of their own national identity 88
4.1 Analysis of children’s self-portraits - Image content 92
  4.1.1 School A self-portrait - Image content 92
  4.1.2 School B self-portrait - Image content 93
  4.1.3 School C self-portrait - Image content 95
  4.1.4 Overview of findings – Children’s self-portraits – Image content 97
4.2. Analysis of children’s self-portraits - Use of colour 98
4.3 Analysis of children’s self-portraits - Position and size of images 101
4.4 Discussion - Self-portraits and national identity 103
4.5 Analysis of written categorisations of national identity 105
4.5.1 School A 105
4.5.2 School B 107
4.5.3 School C 109

4.6 Analysis of interviews – Children’s justification of self-categorisation of national identity 110

4.7 Discussion of self-categorisation data 115

4.7.1 National identity categories 115

4.7.2 Children’s ability to define their national identity and justify their choices 120

4.8 Summary 124

Chapter 5 Children’s perceptions of Welsh national identity 126

5.1 Analysis of drawings of a Welsh person 126

5.1.1 School A - Image content 127
5.1.2 School B - Image content 132
5.1.3 School C - Image content 136

5.2 Discussion of drawing content - Welsh person 140

5.3 Analysis of annotations (Welsh person) 140

5.3.1. School A 145
5.3.2. School B 147
5.3.3. School C 149

5.4 Discussions of annotations - Welsh person 151

5.4.1 Physical appearance 151
5.4.2 Language 153
5.4.3 Religion 154
5.4.4 Hobbies 155
5.4.5 Things which are important to a Welsh person 156
5.4.6 Characteristics which tell us that a person is Welsh 157
Appendix 8: Examples of data analysis/drawings and annotations 206
Appendix 9: Example of data analysis/interviews 208
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Context and relevance of study

This study seeks to explore:

- Children’s perceptions of their own national identity
- Children’s ideas about Welsh national identity

National identity has been a significant topic in the United Kingdom in recent years for many reasons. In 1997, the Labour government implemented a programme of devolution which gave different levels of autonomy to Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland. Guibernau (2010:1) noted that this was in response to the ‘different demands for devolution based upon particular national identities existing within Britain.’ The result of devolution reforms was the creation of diverse systems for education, health and other key services in the devolved nations and also an increased affiliation by its citizens to the separate countries within the UK. Concerns have been voiced about the fragmentation of the Union following the devolution of certain powers and responsibilities to the nations within the UK. Owen (2013:3) reported ‘identification with Britain has been declining in recent decades as identification with individual UK countries has become stronger.’ He concluded that there has been a decline in people defining themselves as British and that White people in the UK are more likely to identify with one of the four nations. This acknowledges the changing landscape of national identity in the UK and the currency of the issues examined in this thesis.

Coupled with the devolution agenda, the UK has also become more diverse in terms of the ethnic composition of its citizens, as evidenced in the Census of 2011 (ONS, 2011) and the Labour Force Surveys of recent years. In turn, this increased ethnic diversity has had an impact on the national identity debate, as well as fuelling deliberations around migration and citizenship. Owen (2013:22) found ‘People from ethnic minorities clearly retain identification with their ultimate country of origin, but are more likely than White people to identify with Britain, and are much less likely to identify solely with one of the four nations within the UK.’ This reflects the findings of a study from thirteen years earlier. Alibhai-Brown (2000) reported that ethnic minority groups in devolved regions find identities such as Welsh and Scottish challenging. In summary, the notion of Britishness in the post-devolution era is complex, with some White people in Britain developing greater association to the individual countries within the UK, whilst some minority ethnic groups
identify more readily with Britain and Britishness. Devolution and ethnic diversity has, therefore, increased the discourse around national identity, nationality and national pride.

The present study further augments the varied and growing dialogue on national identity in the devolved and increasingly diverse British context and particularly focusses on how children in Wales view the concept of national identity. However, unlike Waldron and Pike’s (2006) investigation into Irish national identity and how this links to citizenship in education, it does not seek to scrutinise children’s role as citizens of a devolved nation or explore how educational approaches to citizenship in Wales have impacted upon the children. Citizenship is multidimensional and difficult to define, it can mean different things to different people as is the case with national identity. Helve and Wallace (2001) consider that citizenship is increasingly viewed as membership of a nation state and so therefore is linked to the concept of national identity. Citizenship is described by Leonard (2007) as having both an individual and collective element and according to Hoskins (2006), being an active citizen is about participation in civil society, the community and the politics. While national identity is an aspect of citizenship and recognising that there are parallels which can be drawn between the two concepts, national identity is the main focus of this project. The present study considers children’s understanding of their own national identity and Welsh national identity from an individual standpoint and how the children formulate these ideas; it does not examine this from the perspective of being a citizen of Wales. The thesis is concerned primarily with the views of children living in a devolved Welsh context.

Affiliation with nation has long been established as beginning in childhood. However, there is very little research which examines how younger children relate to the idea of nation and national identity and the influences which impact on this relationship. Children’s perspectives on national identity have been frequently been defined through age-related perspectives and many of these emerging developmental theories have been grounded in psychology. Sharma (2014:10) asserts that developmental psychology is dominant in much of the literature around early and middle childhood, and that this has faced criticism from sociologists for ‘universalizing of childhood’. Exploring childhood is complicated due to the varied nature of experiences, outlooks and cultural norms. The ‘one size fits all’ aspect of some of these developmental psychological concepts fails to account for the subjective nature of childhood and the different influences that interplay in a child’s life. Developmental psychology perspectives have tended to focus on a sequential notion of national identity development and how this links to children’s cognitive understanding.
at certain times within the span of childhood. As Sharma (2014) states, many of the psychological studies in the past have focussed on the ‘what’ but not the ‘how’. The current exploration examined children’s ideas about national identity and Welsh national identity (the ‘what’); and also what aspects impact on these notions (the ‘how’).

Many of the developmental studies have also sought to look at how children perceive others in society as well as the age related progression of children’s concepts around national identity. For example, Piaget and Weil’s (1951) influential study in Switzerland about the cognitive development and the evolution of national identity concepts, looked not just at how children felt about their own nation but also their beliefs about other countries and the people who live in them. The ‘us’ and ‘them’ aspect of national identity also appears in other studies by cognitive developmental theorists like Aboud and Amato (2001) and social identity theorists from Tajfel (1978) to Nesdale (2004). Although the current investigation does not identify how children feel about children from other countries, the notion of ‘other’ does occur when exploring Welsh national identity. For some of the children in the study, Welsh national identity was not concurrent with their own personal national identity and therefore this is where the ‘us’ and ‘them’ aspect occurs.

In contrast to the cognitive developmental perspectives of national identity as seen in the psychology models, some theorists have sought to incorporate social dimensions into their theories of national identity development. Social identity theory (Tajfel, 1978), social identity development theory (Nesdale, 2004) and self-categorisation theory (Oakes, Haslam and Turner, 1994) reflect the influence of the social environment. Again these theoretical models rely on age-bound notions of national identity development. Similarly, and also in common with the developmental psychology models, they focus on in-group and out-group biases and the evolution of prejudiced attitudes. However this thesis explored the child’s views on national identity and what influences their thoughts and ideas about this topic rather than solely concentrating on defined age categories or biases. Placing the child centrally in this research project and garnering the opinions of the child on the topic area was imperative to recognising the agency of the child in their ability to articulate their own experiences (James and Prout, 1997), rather than looking at what a child does or doesn’t know at a particular age.

As well as exploring children’s perceptions of their own personal national identity, the thesis examined how children perceive Welsh national identity. Some of the existing studies have mainly focussed on adults’ views of what it means to be Welsh. The particular
nature of this investigation is that it provided the opportunity to explore national identity from the child’s viewpoint, offering both a personal perspective of national identity as well as looking collectively at ideas of Welshness. This dichotomy is not evident in comparative work which is often centred on notions of personal national identity.

As identified earlier, there have been a limited number of investigations into children’s perceptions of national identity and this is particularly evident in the Welsh context. School based studies have taken place in other areas of the UK; Carrington and Short’s (1996; 1999) research in Scotland was carried out in an Edinburgh school with 9 to 11 year olds and exposed a distinction between British and Scottish identities. Similarly, Barrett (2002) examined national identity in England as part of the Centenary project and found higher levels of identification with Britishness in London. In Wales, Scourfield et al. (2006a) worked with children aged 8-11 years (105 children in total) in six primary schools across Wales. Their study revealed children’s attitudes to their own national identity as well as local and global identities and the authors also established markers that children used when defining their national identity. In contrast to the Scourfield study, which used card sorting exercises and interviews, the present study used multimodal methods of collecting data to enable the children to express themselves a variety of ways, acknowledging children’s potential to actively engage with the research process. Multimodality as an approach recognises that communication and representation is about more than just spoken or written language (Kress and van Leeuwen, 2001). The use of drawings, writing and interview supported engagement with the topic through three different modes and this in turn allowed the voice of the child to emerge from the data in a number of ways, strengthening the validity of the study.

Since Scourfield et al.’s findings were presented in 2006, there have been two particular changes since that time: the devolved education system in Wales has been established and the population of Welsh schools has become more ethnically diverse. These points highlight the timeliness of the research. Minority Ethnic Groups made up 4 per cent of the population of Wales in 2011 compared to 2 per cent in 2001 (ONS, 2011). This diversity was evident in the sample of children who participated in this research project and led to some rich and unique data.

The National Curriculum in Wales has been distinct from the National Curriculum in England since 1988 with distinctive subject orders for particular aspects of the curriculum such as history and geography. The introduction of the Curriculum Cymreig in 1993 was designed to ‘reflect the distinctive language, culture and heritage of Wales’ (Jones and
Roderick 2003:211) and represented a desire to promote Welshness across all subject areas. The Curriculum Cymreig has since been reviewed in 2003 and more recently in 2013 which firmly established the Welsh Government’s ongoing commitment to developing the Welsh dimension of the curriculum.

Coupled with the Curriculum Cymreig, the Welsh Government is also committed to the development of a bilingual nation. This is enshrined in both curricula documentation and the Welsh Language Strategy, *Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw* / A Living Language: A Language for Living (Welsh Government, 2012a). The relationship between language and national identity has been often discussed, for example by theorists such as Herder (1969) and Poole (1999), who assert that language was a dominant factor in defining national identity. Scourfield *et al.* (2006a) found that language was a determinant in their study with Welsh school pupils. The Welsh language has been seen, at times, as divisive in terms of the national identity agenda in Wales: the divide between those who can speak Welsh and those who can’t. In 2012, the Welsh Language Strategy reiterated the Welsh Government’s commitment to the promotion of the use of the Welsh language as a living and thriving language. This includes strengthening ‘the use of the Welsh language in everyday life’ (Welsh Government, 2012a:14). Children in Wales attend English or Welsh-medium schools and there are also some bilingual schools. In the present study three schools were involved, two English-medium schools and one Welsh-medium. This sample design reflected the need to consider the bilingual agenda in Wales and its manifestation in the school system via curricula and pedagogies which support the promotion of the Welsh language.

In summary, this thesis which uses multimodal methods to ascertain children’s understanding of national identity and Welsh national identity, adds to the contemporary debates regarding the developmental aspect of nationality and identity viewpoints, that is, what the children know about these topics at this particular juncture in their developmental journey. As well as adding to the debate on age related development of concepts of national identity, the findings contribute to current concern with national identity seen in educational and political agendas both in terms of how the children in the study viewed their own national identity and how they perceived Welshness. Therefore this study also has significance for the policy makers of Wales, particularly with regard to the policies and practices which aim to support children’s engagement with the nation such as the Curriculum Cymreig and the Welsh Language Strategy.
1.2 Methodological context

Fundamental to achieving the objectives of this study was the inclusion of the child’s voice. Seventy nine (40 boys and 39 girls) children took part in the investigation from three different schools (two English-medium schools and one Welsh-medium) in an urban area of South Wales. Placing the child’s voice at the centre of the project was reflected in the methods used to collect the data. A multimodal process was adopted accumulating visual, written and oral data. Kress and Van Leeuwen (2001) discuss ‘modes’ as the abstract, non-material sources of ‘meaning-making’ and ‘media’ as being the forms in which the modes present themselves. The research in this instance was multimodal as interviews, drawings and writing were all used to facilitate meaningful dialogues with the children which allowed them to express themselves through a variety of different media. Multimodality as an approach also offered the potential of exploring signs and symbols, of particular relevance in a present study examining complex concepts such as those of national identity.

Figure 1 illustrates the methodological framework for the study which starts by exploring national identity through the domain of the child. As a former primary school teacher, I was aware of the work of educationalists such as Malaguzzi and of the Reggio Emilia approach. Malaguzzi (1998) discusses the concept of the hundred languages of children which identifies the many different ways children think and learn. The Reggio Emilia approach acknowledges the numerous ways that children are able to communicate their ideas and that they are active participants in their own learning. Whilst this study does not attempt to use a hundred ways of exploring children’s thoughts and ideas, it recognises that children can express themselves in many and diverse ways. The children’s perceptions were gathered using pictorial, written and oral media, based around the premise that the voice of the child could emerge from the data in more than one way.
1.3 Theoretical context

This study is focussed around two key concepts: children’s perceptions of their own national identity and of Welsh national identity. The literature chapter discusses the definitions of nation and national identity and here the work of Smith (1991) is particularly significant. He states that ‘national identity and nation are complex constructs composed of a number of interrelated components – ethnic, cultural, territorial, economic and legal political.’ (1991:15). The multifaceted nature and complexity of national identity indicates that national identity can represent different things for different people; a premise which is recognised in this investigation of children’s national identity.

In terms of focussing on children’s acquisition of national identity, Barrett’s (2007) social-cognitive-motivational theory is an amalgamation of previous models which broadly focus on either cognitive development or socialisation as the key factors in the development of children’s national identity. He acknowledges the multiplicity of factors which interact with national identity such as motivation, as well as the effect of parents, education and the mass media. National identity in this study is viewed as multifaceted and subject to influences from a number of factors including family, education, and media and the concept of Welsh national identity is examined by drawing on these theories as a starting point into the research.
It is recognised that being Welsh, and the notion of Welshness, is subjective and dependent on many different elements. Wales has had a devolved government since the Government of Wales Act 1998. In the 2011 census, a question on national identity was introduced for the first time. Sixty six per cent of respondents in Wales identified themselves as Welsh (ONS, 2011). However, participants were not asked what it means to be Welsh and in studies about Welsh national identity, such as the work of Davies, Charles and Harris (2006), this question did not elicit a significantly uniform response. The issue of language, in particular, has been seen as contentious when considering Welsh national identity. The ability to speak Welsh can sometimes be viewed as exclusive, allowing Welsh speakers to have more of an authentic claim on being Welsh (Williams, 1999). Bryant (2006) asserts that the issue of language has been, and continues to be, divisive when considering Welsh national identity and that this particularly became apparent around devolution in 1998 and the ensuing debates. In order to acknowledge and consider the influence of language, children in a Welsh-medium school participated in the project alongside pupils in English-medium establishments.

The initial framework for this study, shown in Figure 2, built on the literature to examine ways in which the children might perceive national identity and Welsh national identity. Like Ireland, evident in the work of Waldron and Pike (2006), Wales has a strong sense of cultural identity. Waldron and Pike identified the ethos of the school and the influence of the media on the children’s views of what it means to be Irish. In an adult study by Davies, Charles and Harris (2006) of what it means to be Welsh, language and sport were prevalent factors. Thus, the diagram below shows a framework which seeks to understand the multiple influences which may shape how the children perceived national identity and Welsh national identity.
In short, a starting point for this study was that children have complex ideas about national identity and Welsh national identity. These perceptions are influenced by a number of factors, including the contextual effect of the school, family, media, language and culture. The resultant findings supported some of these initial assumptions particularly in relation to the complexity of their responses regarding their own national identity and this is reflected in the concluding chapter of the thesis.

1.4 Personal context

My interest in the question of national identity stems originally from my own experiences of the education system in Wales as a pupil and then later as a primary school teacher. This was further developed whilst studying for my undergraduate and postgraduate degrees and working as a teacher outside of the Welsh context. White, Welsh and working class; these are probably the categories that I would tick on the census form when attempting to categorise my own identity. Although the working class tag perhaps does not quite apply to my current status, my cultural heritage and personal values definitely stem from this background. Brought up in a primarily English-speaking village in the South Wales valleys, both my parents worked, in what would be categorised as working class jobs, a shop assistant and a surface worker for the now obsolete National Coal Board. Both my parents left school at 15, to go into the world of work, as this was the expectation. I was the
first member of my family to attend a grammar school and subsequently go on to higher education.

It was whilst attending the local grammar school, that I first observed social or class differences. Primarily this contradiction revolved around my own personal identity and the culture of the grammar school. The curriculum being delivered at that time in the late 1970s was not especially geared to the needs of the individual and paid little attention to local or regional variations. The subject matter was firmly anglicised and very much aimed at the middle classes. Teachers expected grammar school pupils to have knowledge of books and art gleaned from the family home and travel experiences. In reality my own knowledge of books and art revolved around the newspaper, the Daily Mirror and a print of Constable’s Hay Wain on the living room wall. This was in sharp contrast to teacher or curricula expectations. My valleys culture did not seem to be represented in the curriculum or in the way in which we were taught. Learning, therefore, was perplexing at times, as school life bore no comparison to the culture of the home or village I came from.

On completion of my secondary education, I moved on to higher education in Portsmouth to study for a Bachelor of Education. It was there that my interest in national identity was awakened. If I thought that adjusting to an anglicised grammar school curriculum and middle class ethos was disquieting, then actually moving to a different country was also a challenging experience and culture shock. Yes, Welsh people do consider England to be a separate country and very different from Welsh culture in many ways, not just in terms of language!

Although I was English speaking, my accent and use of colloquial expressions were not just difficult to understand for some of my peers and lecturers, my use of language was also a great source of amusement. The Welsh habit of adding ‘is it’ or ‘mun’ to the end of every sentence and to almost rearrange the grammar of sentences (similar to the configuration of sentences in Welsh) became a source of bewilderment and mirth. Although the student community was all encompassing, there was definitely a class divide as well as a cultural divide, in some instances. On reflection when I look at my friendship choices, most of my relationships were with people from similar working class backgrounds where perhaps I could find that common ground.

After graduating in 1989, I became a primary school teacher in Solihull in the West Midlands. The issue of national identity continued to interest me throughout my teaching career. Having taught in Wales and England since the introduction of the National Curriculum in 1989, I observed marked differences in children’s perceptions of national
identity and the strength of these feelings of belonging and affiliation. In England, during the early 1990s there was very little emphasis on nationality and national pride in the predominantly white working class area of the West Midlands where I taught. At this time, the curriculum in the primary age range explored the issue of national identity and cultural experiences through a ‘festival’ approach which reflected a broad multicultural emphasis. The approach to the curriculum is described by Troyna (1992) as ‘the three S period’, i.e. somas, saris and steel bands. However, on returning to Wales in the mid-1990s, I was struck by the marked emphasis on Welsh national identity which was asserted through cultural events such as Eisteddfodau and the curriculum. As discussed previously, at this time the National Curriculum in Wales as distinct from its English counterpart and the Curriculum Cymreig was introduced in 1993 to promote the linguistic, cultural, social, historical and geographical contexts in Wales. The resurgence of the Welsh language cemented in the Welsh Language Act 1993 was also occurring at this time, fostering what appeared to be a fervent sense of Welshness and Welsh national identity. From these teaching experiences in a variety of educational contexts, a profound interest in national identity and particularly Welsh national identity in the world of the young child was established.

Alongside the promotion of Welsh culture and national identity through the curriculum, other broad social factors have impacted on my perceptions of national identity and the influences on this. I found that national identity often comes to the forefront at particular sporting events. The Welsh fervour for rugby that is indoctrinated into many of us from birth was often a catalyst for nationalistic zeal. This was especially noticeable when Wales played England. The rugby field could be seen as an opportunity to revisit the perceived historical wrong doings and the anglicising of Wales. My own passion for the sport has further fuelled this interest in national identity and how these allegiances to a particular nation or country come to the forefront in sporting or cultural occasions.

My personal family history consists of grandparents and great grandparents who came from England and Ireland, but this mixed heritage has not impacted on my own sense of Welshness. I was born in Wales and now, after a short excursion across the border, live in Wales. My sense of Welshness is not about being separate or elitist, but about belonging to a set of people who have pride in being Welsh and want to maintain that connection with the nation. From a personal perspective, national identity is the affiliation that we feel to a place. It is about a sense of belonging, a feeling of being part of something, a sharing of commonalities with other members of the group.
The Welsh sometimes use the word ‘hiraeth’, which has no direct English translation but links to longing for the homeland, the bond that a person can have with a country, particularly when away from the place. A connection can be based on many things including shared history, culture, and language as discussed in the definitions of national identity by Guibernau (2007). Some people may feel a greater association with a region or local community, echoing Rogoff’s (2003) socio-cultural perspectives of identity development. However, this investigation sought to focus on the national context. Welsh national identity is explored here by considering what being Welsh means to an individual, in particular to a child, recognising that this is complex and can be interpreted in various ways, dependent as it is on the sorts of variables mentioned above, including language.

Indeed language, which according to Joseph (2004), cannot be separated from identity, has been seen by many as a divisive element in Wales as stated previously (Bryant, 2006). The ability to communicate in Welsh, for some people, underpins their Welshness. As a person who was brought up in English-speaking community, the inability to use the language of the nation has never undermined my affiliation with Wales.

As outlined at the start of this section, my life experiences in teaching and in my personal life have stimulated my interest in this topic. As a former primary school teacher with experience of teaching a variety of age ranges, I wanted to know more about how and when children develop their ideas about national identity and Welsh identity in particular. In addition to this I was also keen to discover the primary influences on children’s ideas about these topics. Therefore, the research aims for this thesis evolved.

1.5 Thesis structure

The structure of this thesis follows the pattern described by Silverman (2000), when discussing the structuring of qualitative theses. The introductory chapter of this thesis outlines the rationale for the study and its contemporary relevance. It signposts the research aims and the subsequent chapters then summarise the research journey: the review of literature, methodology and outcomes of the study, with a final concluding chapter.

Chapter 2 explores the relevant literature where definitions of national identity are explored in general, as well as national identity in the Welsh context. The multifaceted nature of national identity is evident in this analysis. Several models which consider how children develop concepts of national identity are evaluated. These theories recognise the range of influences that can impact on children’s perceptions. Alongside this, the review discussed specific studies which have investigated children’s ideas about their own
national identity in the UK and Ireland context. These include Scourfield et al. (2006a), which examined Welsh national identity, and Irish national identity, as in the case of Waldron and Pike (2006).

Chapter 3 discusses the underpinning methodology for the project. Establishing the voice of the child was paramount as discussed above and identifying ways of representing this through different modes was essential in all aspects of the research. This section provides a rationale for the interpretivist standpoint adopted, as well as the reasoning behind the multimodal approach to data collection (drawing, writing and interviews). The chapter provides justifications of the sample and explains the sampling techniques followed by a discussion of the analysis process. The latter fundamentally adopted the constant comparative method first emerged from the work of Glaser and Strauss in 1967 in their grounded theory approach and was further supported by Thomas (2009). The sets of data from the three schools were analysed to establish trends and key themes emerging from the visual, oral and written data. The chapter details how the data was compared on an individual level, school level and then the accumulated information from all three schools was examined.

Chapter 4 presents the results of the study in relation to children’s perceptions of their own national identity, which is the first research aim of the study. The three modes of multimodal data are discussed and compared. How these children viewed and categorised their own national identity is discussed and also the potential influences that shaped these ideas.

The second research aim is addressed in Chapter 5 and focusses on children’s views about Welsh national identity in particular. As in Chapter 4, the interpretations arising from the visual, written and oral data are scrutinised and conclusions are drawn about how children view Welsh national identity and Welshness. Alongside this, the identifiable themes emerging from the data are addressed.

Chapter 6 is a summative discussion of the study in relation to the research aims. The conclusions are evaluated in relation to related theory and research. Alongside the conclusions drawn from findings of the research project, the design and methodological framework is evaluated. Shortcomings of the study are identified along with proposals to extend and develop this research.
Chapter 2: Review of Literature

This chapter seeks to explore the existing body of relevant literature related to the theme of national identity, as well as Welsh national identity. Identity and its importance in the world of the child is a frequently debated topic and the recognition of the importance of identity is enshrined in legislation, policy and practice in the UK. The child’s right to a legal identity is protected in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). Subsequent legislation in the UK such as the Children Act (1989) and Children Act (2004) reflect this ethos of respect for the child and his or her own personal and distinct identity. The ground-breaking Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure (2011), reflected the Welsh Government’s commitments to supporting children’s rights through legislation and policy in Wales. Curricula throughout the UK also reflect the need to nurture and support children’s identities, for example the Curriculum for Excellence in Scotland (2011) which encourages learners to be confident in their own identity. In the Welsh context this is evidenced in the Foundation Phase (2015) and in the Curriculum Cymreig (2003). The recent curriculum and assessment review in Wales carried out by Donaldson (2015:28) also supports this, ‘Our children and young people need to be rooted in their own cultures and to have a strong sense of identity as citizens of Wales, the United Kingdom, Europe and the wider world.’

Identity is described by Brooker and Woodhead (2008) as being multidimensional and establishing a child’s legal identity is just the first step in the complex and multi-layered process of identity development which takes place throughout life. Brooker (2008: 10) discusses the plural aspect of identities and the notion of viewing ‘identity as a multiple construct or to describe individuals as acquiring multiple identities.’ The primary focus of this investigation is national identity, which is viewed as one of the many aspects of a child’s identity. The term national identity is closely linked to ethnic and cultural identity, as well as other facets of identity. Whilst the interconnectivity between these terms is recognised in this study, the literature review is primarily concerned with children’s national identifications rather than ethnicity or culture. The examination of the literature will initially look at the concept of national identity per se and then specifically consider children’s national identity as well as then exploring national identity in the UK and Welsh context, in line with the second research aim of the study.

2.1 Defining national identity
Various disciplines such as psychology, sociology and education have sought to define national identity. In this initial section of the literature review, the aim is to examine the term national identity by exploring the differing perspectives from a range of disciplines, including the views of geographers, historians, psychologists and socio-culturists. Defining the term national identity is often described as being difficult and problematic (Sulieman, 2003). The complexity and the associated demanding nature of finding a conclusive explanation has been recognised by a number of key theorists such as the historians Hobsbawn and Ranger (1983), Anderson (1983) and later by Smith (1991) in their respective studies on nationality and nationalism. The term national identity is intertwined with other terms such as nationality, nationalism and ethnicity. Sulieman (2003: 18) states ‘it is not always easy to tell where ethnicity ends and nationality begins.’ In this thesis the issue of ethnicity will not be explicated in detail, as the children were not asked to identify their ethnic group in the data collection process, although it is acknowledged that this is very closely associated with national identity.

The view of national identity as a unifying and cohesive notion has been expressed by a number of theorists. The social anthropologist, Gellner, (1983, 2006) pursued the theme of unification in his definition of national identity. He also perceived national identity as being natural and unavoidable. As Bechhofer and McCrone (2009: 3) stated, Gellner’s view reveals a ‘taken-for-granted ideology which binds us to the state, or …the nation’. The terms nation and state are used interchangeably here, with no significant difference identified between national affiliation with the state or the nation but for some theorists such as Guibernau (2007), these terms themselves have very different connotations particularly in contemporary contexts such as Wales and Catalonia. The view of national identity considered as an objective reality, while at the same time being invisible and rarely challenged, is proposed by several writers (for example, Thompson, 2001; Barrett, 2005). Thompson (2001) suggested that individuals do not actively and explicitly explore terms such as nation and nationality. He acknowledged the role of socialisation in the replication of national identity, but sees nation and nationality as ‘common sense’ unquestioned categories. Barrett (2005) concurred with Thompson and stated that national identity is viewed as an objective reality, which individuals attain as a matter of course. National identity is seen here as an uncontested notion.

Gellner (1983) went on to conclude that nations are modern phenomena that have only recently appeared in world history. He identified the nation as a sociological product which was triggered by the industrial revolution which required a more mobile, literate
workforce. Smith (1991), a former student of Gellner, questioned Gellner’s approach reflecting on the role of the nation and national identity in non-industrial societies and the generation of ideas relating to national identity in these situations. This is reflected in Smith’s own theoretical studies of national identity, which explored the concept through a global lens, is discussed later in the chapter. In Gellner’s opinion, education was needed to train and educate the masses and therefore became a tool in transmitting ideas about nation and national identity. Gellner saw schools and curricula as having an influential role in shaping ideas about national identity, although, as he observed, the ideology of the state might not necessarily match the mind-sets of the individuals within that state.

Contemporary studies into national identity by Waldron and Pike (2006) and Barrett (2007) have acknowledged the role of schools and curricula in shaping children’s views on national identity. Current educational policy in Wales and Scotland reflect an emphasis on shaping children’s views about the nation; for example, in Wales, the Curriculum Cymreig seeks explicitly to promote the history, geography and culture of the Welsh nation and the Curriculum for Excellence in Scotland, which aims to nurture pupils' understanding of the history, heritage and culture of Scotland.

Echoing this theme of unification, seen in Gellner’s view of national identity as a sociological concept which fuses the nation together, Smith and Jarkko (1998) argued that shared national identity provides the social glue that holds a nation together. This tendency to view national identity in terms of a homogenous cultural group located within a single bounded territory is common (Gilroy, 1993). It identifies national identity as something which all people within a national boundary share and subscribe to on an equal basis. However, this does not take account of the nationalistic fervour adopted by some members of a nation and the apathy for national matters shown by others. It does not recognise the way that other issues such as social class, education and language influence the national identity agenda. Hobsbawn (1990) commented on these differences, not just between individuals’ adoption of the concept of national identity, but the often the contrasting nature of the state’s view at different points in time. This perspective recognised the possibility of conflicting opinions about national identity amongst the members of the nation state, some of which may subscribe to the state’s ideology and some may have opinions which may contrast with this.

Callhoun (2007:84) stated that ‘national identity is something that shapes individuals.’ He describes how the individual is influenced by a range of values, cultural norms and social structures which affect the construction of this identity and therefore it is not simply a
matter of being inexorable as advocated by Gellner (2006). National identity, according to Calhoun, is not just about being a member of a nation but also relates to what it means to be a member of that nation, ‘how it is to be understood and how it relates to the other identities its members may also claim or be ascribed to’(2007:85). Within a historical context, he maintained that national identity has been shown to be constructed rather than a primitive concept which an individual may have inherited as a matter of course, as advocated by Gellner. Hobsbawn and Ranger (1983) claimed that the cultural markers of national identity can be linked to political events or campaigns or even marketing projects rather than ethnicity, thus reflecting the sociological nature of the construction of national identity expressed by Gellner (2006).

Moving away from the theory of national identity as a single amalgamated concept, further research by Smith (1991) and Dixon and Durrheim (2000) into national identity, suggested that it is not a single concept but that it has several aspects. They proposed that an individual can have multiple components of national identity, which can be affected by, amongst other things, history and geographical location. The multiplicity in the concept of national identity is explicated further in Smith’s (1991) definition. He suggested that national identity is complex, abstract and multi-dimensional. Smith recognised the convolution of terms such national identity and nation. He also acknowledged that national identity was composed of a number of interrelated constituents including ethnic, cultural, territorial, economic and legal political components. National identity is not a fixed concept but is subject to change according to the forces that impact upon it, making it a fluid notion. The multiplicity in the nature of Smith’s definition was implicit in this investigation, incorporating the idea that national identity may represent different things to different people, which may be dependent on a number of factors including place, time and social context.

According to Smith, nation is ‘a named human population sharing a historic territory, common myths and historical memories, a mass public culture, a common economy and common legal rights and duties for all members’ (1991:14). This view of the conceptualisation of identity, that is, national or ethnic identity, proposes that it is fluid and changing according to who we are with and where we are. Many authors have recognised that the label, ‘nation’ is interpreted in a number of ways and is influenced constantly by social and political flux in the modern world. Smith (1991) compares the Western concept of nation to the non-Western model identifying the differences and similarities in these. The former is based on territory and land, whereas the latter perspective is more related to
culture, language, community of birth and family. Smith’s perspective raises the importance of considering national identity in relation to a pluralist society, where national identity may vary according to the perceptions of the individual and his or her inherited ideas. In his definition of models of nations, Smith acknowledges that there are elements, which are common to both the western and non-western concepts of national identity. Those common elements are units of population, homeland, mass public culture, legal rights and duties and a common economy with territorial mobility. This common ground may enable those with multiple national identities to bond with other members of the population. However, in his later work, Smith (2002) has refined his definition of national identity and removed references to the mass character of public culture and common economy (Guibernau, 2004). Guibernau persists that these changes reflected the ongoing and developing debates around national identity particularly in light of Connor’s (1978, 1993) work which asserted that homogenous elements such as geographical location and religion are only important when considering the degree to which they reinforce national identity. Connor (1993) stated such features can change without a nation losing its uniqueness. He asserted that the common belief held by members of the nation is that they are bound together by ethnicity.

Dixon and Durrheim’s (2000) geographical exploration of place and identity again suggested that this depends on where we are now and where we have been. Akin to Smith’s perception of the western model of nation, they emphasised the role of the geographical surroundings in the generation of perceptions of identity. Dixon and Durrheim maintained that geographical dimensions may form physical barriers in areas defining ‘the division between the established (those who belong) and the foreign (those who do not belong) may become embodied in the material organization of places’ (2000:42). Therefore an individual’s sense of national identity may not necessarily be a national affiliation but may have a more local geographical attachment.

This idea of regional identity conflicting with a more homogenous national identity is discussed by Paasi (2009) although he stressed that there is limited research into how this manifests itself in social and political terms. Paasi (2009:2) asserted that there has been a resurgence in regional identities in Europe since the formation of the EU ‘where both the making of the Union itself and the ‘Europe of regions’ are concrete manifestations of the re-scaling of state spaces and the assignment of new meanings to territory.’ As a geographer, he cited examples in Europe but acknowledged that the regions which may be defined by political boundaries may not be the same regions that exist in terms of social
and linguistics practices. In the Welsh context, which will be further explored in subsequent chapters, the geographical landscape as well as the political and linguistic agendas in Wales have been examined by Balsom (1985) and Bryant (2006). Both authors established that there may be distinct regional variations in perceptions of national identity in Wales, particularly emphasizing the divide between North and South Wales. This idea of local and regional alliances will be explored further when examining national identity in a UK context.

The transient nature of national identity is expounded by Guibernau (2007). She recognised the shared nature of the term in that ‘National identity is a collective sentiment based upon the belief of belonging to the same nation and sharing most of the attributes that make it distinct from other nations.’ (2007:11). Further, in concurrence with Smith (1991), she maintained that this is not a static phenomenon but is subject to flux and change. This feeling of national belonging can vary from person to person. Distinct national identities might also exist in what she termed as ‘nations without states’ (2007:11) such as Quebec, Catalonia and Wales. In these devolved nations, she described how devolution could be seen as threatening the national identity supported by the state. Guibernau designated nations without states as being nations which have their territories included within the boundaries of one or more states but maintain a separate sense of national identity. This is usually focused upon a common culture, history, attachment to a particular territory and the explicit wish to rule themselves (Guibernau, 1999). The issue of national identity in Wales will be considered further on within this chapter. However Guibernau (1999, 2007) cited examples from the United Kingdom, including Scotland and Wales, to illustrate her theory regarding the influence of devolution on the formation of multiple identities within a single state. In this instance the single state being the United Kingdom and the devolved nation of Wales where census data (2011) has shown greater levels of affiliation to the Welsh nation rather than the British state. She then goes on to identify five specific dimensions of national identity namely psychological, cultural (which includes language), territorial, historical and political.

In her exploration of the psychological dimension of national identity, Guibernau considered the internalisation of national identity and its ability to generate emotive feeling amongst fellow nationals. Regarding the cultural aspect of identity ‘values, beliefs, customs, conventions, habits, languages and practices are transmitted to the new members who receive the culture of a particular nation’ (Guibernau 2007:13). Guibernau asserted that a shared culture enables a sense of solidarity and uniqueness, allowing nation members
to see themselves as having commonality as well as being distinct from others. Guibernau argued that in contemporary society, media influences and education have a pronounced role in shaping ideas about the territorial nature of national identity. It is through these means that people are allowed to imagine ‘their nations as territorially bounded, distinct and sovereign’ (2007: 21). History and its significance and value vary from nation to nation. Some nations can evoke a long history dating back to medieval times, whereas according to Guibernau, more contemporary nations such as Palestine may have limited historical currency. This example could be viewed as problematic as Palestine is still not recognised as a state by some nations. Guibernau maintained that consequently ‘nations have attributed variable significance and value to history,’ (2007:21). Finally, the political dimension of national identity according to Guibernau, ‘derives from its relation with the modern nation-state’ (2007:23). Like Gellner (1983, 2006), she identified the political role of the national education system as well as the media in the ‘dissemination of a distinct national identity among its citizens’ (2007:24). Wales is devolved from the UK government in terms of education and the Welsh education system including the national curriculum is distinctive from England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. The role of the curriculum in shaping or influencing national identity has been acknowledged in recent studies as stated above and will be considered further in the section which evaluates the existing literature concerning children and their perceptions of national identity.

Deutsch (1966), who recognised the role of culture in the formation of national identity, defines nations as cultural bodies and acknowledges the role of communication as essential in establishing societies and cultures. This resonated in Guibernau’s discussion around the cultural aspect of national identity formation which incorporates language, beliefs, customs etc. and creates distinctiveness. Deutsch (1966:98) claimed that people within the nation are held together via this ‘communicative efficacy’ which allows them to communicate better with those within the nation rather than those outside. The development of in-group and out-group bias has been examined by social identity theorists when looking at the way in which concepts of national identity are formed and is discussed later in this chapter.

Socio-cultural perspectives, such as those put forward by Rogoff (2003), disputed the idea of identity categories such as national identity, although these viewpoints recognise the changing nature of identity in relation to the social and cultural situation of the individual. Rogoff stated that ‘Identity categories often focus on one’s ancestral nation (or continent) overlooking important variations within nations’ (2003:78). Her premise is centred on the idea that people may belong to, and identify with, many communities including national,
local and generational communities and that therefore identity is related more to culture than nation. Individuals ‘often identify their cultural heritage differently depending on the situation and audience’ (Rogoff, 2003:82). Rogoff’s view reflected Smith’s (1991) idea of the flexible nature of identity and how it adapts according to the circumstances and communities surrounding the individual. The concept of identity being more local rather that national is similar to Paasi’s (2009) investigations into regional identities. In Rogoff’s research however, community is the intersection of categories such as race, class and nationality. This fluid description of identity allows for analysis of each category in the context of another. Participation in community rather than membership of a community is the focal point of Rogoff’s ideas.

Language, as well as culture and socialisation, is also seen as primary factor in the definition of national identity (Herder, 1969: Poole, 1999). Herder (1969) considered language to be the critical factor in national identity and emphasised the fact that a nation is constituted through its language and culture. He goes on to discuss language as the most important component of culture and thus integral to national identity. Poole (1999:68) asserted that ‘our national identity is the primary form of identity available to us, that it informs all our other identities and in the case of conflict it should take priority over them’. Like Gellner (1983), he viewed national identity as unavoidable. Poole claimed that nation is appropriated through language and culture and that language supports the foundation for a shared sense of belonging. Likewise, Joseph (2004) argued that language and identity are inseparable and that the primary function of linguistics is interpretation. Interpretation includes the categorisation of people, a process of ‘identity ascription’ (2004:40). Barrett (2005) claimed that national identity asserts itself not just through language but also through culture and the media and other aspects of everyday living. This perspective recognised the prominent role of language and culture as discussed by Herder and Poole, but also highlights the role of the media in transmitting ideas about national identity.

Studies in Catalonia and the Basque country have established that the use of language is related to national and state identifications (Valencia et al., 2003). Those adults who regularly used Catalan or Basque in everyday speech had higher levels of identification with being Basque or Catalan, as opposed to being Spanish. The Welsh context has similarities to the Catalan and Basque position particularly in terms of the relationship between language and national identity. Specific studies, for example, Davies, Charles and Harris (2006), consider the situation in Wales and have identified language as a significant factor in identification with the Welsh nation.
Several key themes emerge from the theories and definitions discussed. In the initial explanations, national identity is seen as a unifying concept which binds the nation together. However many theorists support that national identity is a fluid and flexible notion, which can be affected by many factors including geographical contexts, language, ethnicity, and political, social and cultural components. Thompson (2001) and Barrett (2005) regard national identity as a concept that an individual obtains as a matter of course through everyday aspects of life. Other theorists (Calhoun, 2007) perceive the formulation of national identity to be influenced by the ethos of the nation and so not always a matter of free choice. This adoption of national identity may depend on the character of the nation itself, as well as numerous other influences including familial, social political and cultural perspectives. This study is set in Wales and therefore it is important to consider national identity specifically in the Welsh context.

2.2 National identity within the Welsh context

What does it mean to be Welsh? This question is fundamental to the research aims of the thesis which sought to explore children’s views about being Welsh and Welsh national identity. It can mean a number of things to different people. In Wales, as well as other nations within the United Kingdom, there is a tension between identifying with the nation, Wales, or the state, the United Kingdom. Devolution in Wales and Scotland has drawn attention to this distinction. Wales, Northern Ireland and Scotland were part of the devolution programme instigated by the Labour government in 1997. The subsequent Government of Wales Act in 1998, established the National Assembly for Wales. The National Assembly for Wales became the Welsh Assembly Government in 2002. The resultant reforms have created diverse systems within the UK, particularly with regard to health, education and other fundamental services.

The spotlight was focussed even more brightly on the issues surrounding devolution during the Scottish independence vote in September 2014. Although Scotland voted against independence, the topic of national identity was highlighted, not just within the Scottish context, but throughout the whole of the United Kingdom. The independence vote stimulated a number of debates about national identity and nationalism in Northern Ireland, Wales and England. Questions were raised about the seemingly less differentiated notion of English national identity as opposed to British national identity which had previously been explored by Kiely et al. (2001) and Kumar (2010). Kumar (2010) commented on the elusive nature of English national identity in comparison to Welsh or Scottish national identity, a theme which emerged before and subsequently since the vote for Scottish
independence. The Scottish vote also heightened the discourse around Welsh national identity and its connection with Britishness. Scotland has traditionally been seen as having a more voracious appetite for independence than its Welsh counterpart. In the context of such debate, the present study and its exploration of children’s views on national identity within the Welsh context, examined a particularly topical and current subject.

Barrett (2007) described Wales as part of a multination state, that is, the United Kingdom, which is ‘politically and culturally dominated by one of their constituent nations’ (2007:7). Thus Wales can be termed as a nation-state, a nation within a state. In Guibernau’s discussion of the identity of nations, she concurred that the political dimension of national identity is closely linked to ‘the modern nation-state’ (2007:23). According to Kumar (2003), the dominant nation, that is, England, in the UK context, has provided most of the institutions, symbols, traditions, historical events and figures synonymous with the British state. Parallels can be drawn with the Spanish situation with devolved nations which encompass Catalonia and the Basque regions. According to Barrett (2007:8) ‘in nation-states, because the nation and the state are coterminous, the conceptual distinction between the nation and the state is often blurred for those who live within these countries.’ Both adults and children within nation-states do not usually consider terms such as nation, state and country as part of everyday discourse. Even when actively considering these concepts, Barrett claims that these constructs may be unclear to them as nation-state citizens. This concurs with Barrett’s theory of national identity as an uncontested objective reality as discussed previously.

However, other theorists do not agree with the passive nature of this philosophy and uphold that people are active participants in fabricating their own ideas about national identity, which is formulated by the experiences they encounter in their lives. Contrary to Barrett’s unchallenged perspective, Thompson and Day (1999:45) advocated the view that ‘Welsh national identity is not pre-given, but is very largely constructed and produced by people as they develop and express their understanding of situations, events and other people as they arise.’ This sees national identity as moving away from being a uniform, established phenomenon which has rigid boundaries such as territory and birth. Thompson and Day (1999) carried out a study of Welsh national identity with adults in Bangor, North Wales. Their interviews portrayed Welsh national identity as ‘continually shifting, developing and adjusting according to context’ (1999:46), which can be attributed to local experiences and social relationships. Thompson and Day felt that it is this local context which actually shapes perceptions of national identity and belonging. This is akin to the
ideas described by Paasi (2009) in relation to regional identities and the elements of this affiliation with the local rather than national agendas and the perception. The multidimensional nature and intricacy of national identity indicated here demonstrates that it can represent different things for different people and that it is affected by differing contexts; a premise which is recognised in this investigation of children’s national identity.

As discussed in the introduction to this section, at the end of the last century, the issue of national identity became a high profile issue in Wales, in conjunction with the debate concerning devolution and the election of a national assembly. Guibernau (2007) claimed that devolution strengthens pre-existing regional identities; and ‘promotes the development of dual identities – regional and national – invoked at different times,’ (2007:53). In 1997, 50.3 per cent voted for the establishment of a Welsh Assembly Government although the actual turnout was low at 51.3 per cent. This contrasted strongly with the Scottish referendum, where there was a greater turnout (60.1 per cent) as well as a larger majority (74.3 per cent) in support of the establishment of the Scottish Parliament. Initially, the political parties that elicited the most support in the construction of the Welsh Assembly were those who advocated greater autonomy rather than complete independence.

This lack of enthusiasm for dislocation demonstrated through the 1997 referendum on devolution for Wales raises a number of questions in terms of Welsh national identity. Andersen’s (2001) study of national identity and independence attitudes in Wales and Scotland revealed that Scottish identity is more pronounced than Welsh identity. He used data collected as part of the Welsh Assembly Election Study (1999) conducted by Wyn Jones et al. and the Scottish Election Parliamentary Study undertaken in 1999 by McCrone et al. and published in 2001. These were post-election studies of political behaviour and attitudes following the first election to the Welsh National Assembly and the Scottish Parliament. Andersen established that 70 per cent of respondents interviewed in Scotland considered themselves to be more Scottish than British, whilst the figure in Wales was 40 per cent. This contrasted with the data accumulated around this time, as part of the Labour Force Survey of 2001 (ONS, 2002), which included a national identity question. Respondents were asked to state whether they thought that their national identity was Welsh, English, Irish, British or another. In Wales, 87 per cent of people born in Wales identified themselves as being Welsh, as opposed to British, whereas in England, only 15 per cent of those born in England, identified themselves as English (ONS, 2002). Those living in South Wales most commonly articulated this expression of Welsh identity. The sample for the current investigation was located in an urban area in south east Wales.
Andersen’s study also concluded that national identity in Wales was related to social class and that those in the working classes are more likely to associate with the minority nation with more affluent members of society having closer affiliation to being British. He provided an explanation for this difference in allegiance. He affirmed that is because higher class Welsh are ‘less likely to feel disadvantaged by the system and more likely to be integrated into British institutions,’ (2001: 16). The assumption being made here equates social class to economic parameters. However, it could be argued that class is not just merely related to wealth or job role as decreed in some measures, for example, National Statistics Socio-economic Classification (NSSeC). Other sociological aspects, such as culture and family background, may be linked to social class and subsequently national identity; although this is not fully debated in Andersen’s study.

Kiely et al. (2001) in their study of Scottish national identity, acknowledged that English people might struggle to differentiate between being English and being British. Other authors such as Heath, Martin and Elgenius (2007) insist that Englishness and Britishness are not seen as rival identities, in contrast to the Welsh and Scottish perspective. In their study of the erosion of British pride, Tilley and Heath (2007) maintain that the increase in nationalism in Scotland and Wales has affected the decline of Britishness. The conclusions generated from this study revealed that over a period of twenty three years from 1980 to 2003, there has been a decline in British pride which the authors attribute to ‘a generational shift in sentiments,’ (2007:13). Tilley and Heath asserted that ‘younger people have grown up in a world of more complex, nuanced identities, in which Britain is less prominent internationally and British identity in a multicultural, multinational state is less distinct’ (2007:13). They go on to state that Welsh nationalist movement challenges British identity and England has not yet witnessed a similar movement. However, in contrast to this, more recent research (Jones et al., 2013; Kenny, 2014) exploring English national identity supports the notion that people in England are identifying themselves more strongly as English rather than British. This rise in a raised awareness of Englishness in conjunction with the Welsh and Scottish landscapes may further erode Britishness and effect further policies around the devolution of powers to all nations within the United Kingdom.

The 2011 Census introduced a question on national identity for the first time and according to the Office for National Statistics (2012:10), this ‘was due to an increased interest in 'national’ consciousness and demand from people to acknowledge their national identity.’ Respondents were allowed to tick more than one category in order to recognise the multi-dimensional nature of national identity. Nearly two thirds (66 per cent, 2.0 million) of the
residents of Wales expressed their national identity as Welsh in 2011. Of these 218,000 (11 per cent) also reported that they considered themselves to be British (ONS, 2011). As this was the first time that this question was asked during a national census, it is difficult to compare with the other studies discussed above which were on a smaller scale but the census data does seem to confirm that Welsh national identity is seen as a separate and distinctive concept by the majority of the people who identified themselves as Welsh via the 2011 census.

Smith (1984:1) considers that when the Welsh think about Wales, there is more than one alternative to consider, ‘Wales is a singular noun but a plural experience.’ This suggested that there are a number of Welsh identities that people in Wales ascribe to, rather than one all-encompassing picture of Welsh national identity akin with the transient picture of national identity observed by Thompson and Day (1999). As well as social class, which was identified as a factor by Andersen (2001), language is similarly identified as a primary factor in Welsh national affiliation. Williams (1999) supported this notion, saying that often language is ‘associated with exclusive and authentic claims to Welsh identity’ (1999:86). Exclusivity is the key term here, invoking the idea that Welsh language speakers have an undivided claim to Welsh national identity with non-Welsh speakers being part of an ‘out-group’. In-group and out-group attitudes are a particular focus of studies examining children’s attitudes to national identity, for example, Oppenheimer and Barrett (2011). These theories will be examined when discussing children and national identity. Williams goes further and stated that even issues such as race are much less of an issue in Wales, due to the fact that Welsh identity is so contested. According to Bryant (2006), the Welsh language issue separated the Welsh during the process of devolution and he views the language issue as a divisive influence on a homogenous Welsh national identity. The link between national identity and language was also supported in the qualitative data collected as part of the Beaufort Research project in 2013, reflecting on Welsh language use in daily life. When discussing what the language meant to them, the themes of identity, encompassing personal, family, community and national identity were common responses.

Coupled with this tension between state and nation, Wales also has the dichotomy of the North and the South divide. Writers such as Balsom (1985) and later Bryant (2006) have sought to categorise different constructions of Wales. In Balsom’s case he uses defining factors such as the ability to speak Welsh and self-declared national identity (taken from the 1979 Welsh Election Survey) in order to classify areas of Wales. From this data he
forged the constructs of distinct geographical areas, Y Fro Gymraeg (Welsh speaking Wales), i.e. north west and west Wales, Welsh Wales, that is, Llanelli, Gower, Swansea and the Valleys, and British Wales, centring around east Wales and the far south of Wales and parts of Pembrokeshire. A further alternative is proposed by Bryant (2006) who builds on from this in establishing ‘five contemporary constructions’ (2006: 119). These include Y Fro Gymraeg with the emphasis on Welsh language, culture and rural life, Labour Wales, centring on working class solidarity, Anglo-British Wales which recognises that Wales has been influenced by England, Britain and the Empire, Cymru-Wales which is focussed on bilingualism and Modern Wales which sees Wales as a cosmopolitan and plural society. As seen in Bryant’s constructs of Wales, national identity is shaped by a number of factors not just language. These factors include historical relationship between Wales and Britain whereby the ‘Anglicization of Wales has undermined the Welsh language and eroded traditional culture’ (Bryant, 2008:119), as well as political and sociological influences. This study was located in south east Wales, defined by Balsom (1985) as British Wales, however Bryant recognised this area being diverse and multicultural. The latter was definitely evident in the children’s responses regarding their own personal national identity, which were often multifaceted and complex.

Davies, Charles and Harris carried out an ethnographic study in Swansea in 2002-3, replicating a similar study conducted by Rosser and Harris in 1960. Their research identified key themes in relation to the meanings that people attached to Welsh national identity. The three most prominent topics which arose from the data included the importance of the Welsh language, support for national teams especially the national rugby team and opposition to English and in some cases British identity. The ability to speak Welsh was identified as a positive attribute, although this was not seen as a factor which disqualified a person from claiming to be Welsh. This is contrary to the notion of exclusivity expressed by Williams (1999). Davies, Charles and Harris (2006) noted a marked increase in Welsh speakers among younger age groups. They maintain that this finding supported the success of the Welsh language policy which seeks to ensure that ‘the decline in the number of communities where Welsh is spoken by over 70 per cent of the population is arrested’ (Welsh Assembly Government, 2003:11). They concluded that there was ‘generally positive and unselfconscious assumption of Welsh identity’ (2006:51) when participants were asked to categorise themselves.

However, Davies, Charles and Harris (2006) noted most ethnic minority participants did not see themselves as Welsh. According to the researchers, this may be linked to the
approach of the British state which ‘allows for cultural difference within a common concept of British citizenship’ (2006:51). This endorsed previous findings identified by Alibhai-Brown (2000). She reported that ethnic minority groups in devolved regions find identities such as Welsh and Scottish problematic. Jackson and Jones’ (2014:98) qualitative study of migrants in Wales evidenced that, in interviews, the migrants displayed a ‘sense of detachment from Welshness.’ This study also revealed that many of the participants thought that being Welsh was unobtainable, despite living in Wales for long periods of time. When exploring the tolerance of the Welsh nation, Williams (2015) concluded that Wales was both divided and diverse and that these are not synonymous. She emphasised the plurality which is evident in Wales’ black and ethnic minority population and the complex patterns apparent in their identifications with ‘country of origin, country of settlement, country of onward settlement as well as cultural distinctiveness,’ (Williams 2015:344). Further research in this particular area is needed, as empirical evidence of the ways in which ethnic minorities negotiate national identity in devolved nations such as Wales and Scotland is generally limited. However, the views of the diverse sample of children in this study, have contributed to the developing dialogue around the way in which children in Wales from multicultural background perceive their own national identity as well as Welsh national identity.

The geographical notion of national identity being bounded by national borders has been explored by geographers such as Dixon and Durrheim (2000). Segrott (2006) conducted his research with parents and children at Ysgol Gymraeg Llundain, (The Welsh School, London). He surveyed opinions of the concept of national identity with those families living outside the geographical confines of Wales. His findings suggested that ‘migration and the move away from Wales can act to strengthen feelings of identity’ (2006:136). Both the parents and children at this London school, valued the importance of being Welsh and speaking Welsh. Although the children in this thesis were resident in Wales, the affiliation with other countries was evident in the findings, confirming that residency itself is not necessarily the predominant factor that influences national identity. This challenges the overriding notion that national identity and culture are positioned within a single bounded space and offers a more expansive view of Welsh national identity, which can be located beyond national borders. It may also suggest that living outside of the national boundary may in fact reinforce ideas of national identity.

The issue of national identity in Wales has received attention over recent years, particularly with the onset of devolution and the evolution of distinctive structures which can impact on
this, for example, political and educational systems. Complications of definition can occur when looking at the topic due to the diversity of regions within Wales, coupled with the language issue and ethnic diversity. This study seeks to explore national identity within Wales, although the scope of the data collection is limited to an urban area in South Wales consequently constraining the findings with regard to drawing conclusions about Wales as a whole. In line with the research aims, the research focussed on seeking out the children’s interpretations of their own national identity and Welsh national identity. The next section of the chapter will consider theoretical perspectives about how children develop concepts of national identity, both in general and then explicitly in the Welsh situation.

2.3 Children’s acquisition of national identity perspectives

There are many theories which explore how children develop their individual or personal identities and group or social identities. Erikson’s (1968) theory of identity development rooted in the domain of developmental psychology supports the concept that identity development occurs in stages and that this process of development is significantly influenced by the environment around the child. Erikson’s model of eight stages of identity development cites the influence of factors such as history, culture and traditions. He also distinguishes between the development of the child’s personal identity, that is, how they feel about themselves, as well as their social identity, which can be described as how they feel about others. This is defined by Shaffaer (1996) as the child’s need to belong and the need to be unique. This need to belong to a group and in-group and out-group biases has been outlined by theorists such as Tajfel and Turner (1979) and will be discussed in more detail later in this section.

Katz (2008:43) states that ‘identity formation involves the establishment and the elaboration of internal structures which enable the infant to develop an increasingly complex ability to make meaningful the internal and external world.’ These internal structures are formulated ‘within the context of social relationships,’ (McLean and Syed, 2015:437). The social, political and cultural context around the child is significant in formulating personal and group identities. As described in the introduction to this chapter, identity is a multiple construct with individuals attaining multiple identities (Brooker and Woodhead, 2008). Morrow and Connolly (2006) recognise the importance of gender, ethnic and religious identity. However there are many other aspects of identity which researchers have found to be significant, including national, cultural, language and faith identities. According to Brooker (2008:10), in modern societies, children are assimilating ‘a complex bundle of mixed and sometimes competing identities.’
The focus of this research study is national identity. In line with Brooker’s assumptions, this form of identity could be viewed as competing with other types of identity, such as racial, ethnic or cultural identities. However, the children in the study were not asked to express their ideas about a range of identity concepts but to focus on national identity. The project considered the assimilation of national identity concepts and ideas and how they begin to be formed within individuals. The children were also asked to reflect on Welsh national identity in general. The latter concept may directly relate to the child’s own personal national identity, that is, he or she may consider themselves as Welsh. Alternatively, when considering Welsh national identity, this may be perceived by the child as the national identity of others, if they do not consider themselves to be Welsh. Therefore Welsh national identity was a personal concept for some of the children in the study, but not for others.

Since the 1950s academics have presented theoretical perspectives which have tried to explain the development of the concept of national identity in children. Many of these theories have been located in the field of psychology, including studies by Piaget and Weil (1951), Tajfel (1978), Oakes, Haslam and Turner (1994), and Nesdale (2004). The cognitive developmental theory (Piaget and Weil, 1951; Aboud and Amato, 2001), focused on the child’s ability to be able to define their national identity as an age-related process linked to the development of cognitive skills. Piaget and Weil’s theory links the acquisition of geographical knowledge to the child’s ability to define their national identity. Alternatively, social identity theory (Tajfel, 1978), social identity development theory (Nesdale, 2004) and self-categorisation theory (Oakes, Haslam and Turner, 1994) relate the acquisition of national identity to the child’s interactions in social situations and social groupings. Other researchers have also looked at influences such as geographical location and the child’s place of residence as a factor. Howard and Gill’s (2005) investigations of Australian national identity with 11-12 year olds revealed stereotypical views about what it means to be Australian. The data were gathered from interviews and the children cited key images such as kangaroos and flags, images that were synonymous with cultural representations of Australia in books, films and advertisements. The use of symbolic images was also common in the work of the educationalists, Waldron and Pike (2006) in Ireland. They found that children’s perceptions of national identity are influenced by factors such as media images and the ethos of the school. The influence of the media and the role of education were also identified in large scale research projects such as those by Barrett (2002, 2007). In this thesis, the children were asked to rationalise their choice of
national identity category and to explain their ideas about Welsh national identity during the interview process. These findings are presented in detail in Chapters Four and Five.

In his seminal work with Weil (1951), Piaget maintained that children’s understanding of national identity is dependent on their cognitive capacity. Piaget’s (1951) concept viewed identity and self-knowledge as a construct, which would be developed over time as the person passed through a number of ages and stages, each stage being hierarchical and building on the previous one. His work with Weil in 1951, looked at the development of children’s ideas of the homeland and of the relations with other countries. The younger children in the study did not understand that a person could be Swiss and Genovese at the same time. According to Piaget and Weil (1951), this perception was only understood once the children reached the ages of 11 to 12 years. The seven to eight year olds in Piaget and Weil’s research displayed limited knowledge of other cultures, with predominantly egocentric opinions. The main assumption made by the research was that children’s construction of national identity depended on age and stage of cognitive development. The study did not explore fully whether attachment with their immediate locality was stronger than their national affiliation. Adult studies, such as those conducted by Dixon and Durrheim (2000) and Paasi (2009), found that there may be an affiliation with a particular region or locality which may be of greater importance than national identity. This corresponds with Rogoff’s (2003) socio-cultural theory, where national identity categories are seen as being less important, with more direct influences on identity, such as the immediate community, taking priority.

Lambert and Klineberg (1967) obtained comparable results to Piaget and Weil (1951) from their study with six year old children. In this instance, the children were unable to identify their own national group. Similar studies (Barrett, 1996; Barrett and Farroni, 1996; Axia, Bremner, Deluca and Andreasen, 1998) have also confirmed Piaget and Weil’s findings and state that children’s geographical knowledge can be confused until they reach early adolescence; although it is important to question how geographical knowledge translates into feelings of national identity affiliation. More recently, Piaget and Weil’s view has been supported by Aboud and Amato (2001), who maintained that identification and affiliation with national groups in children is associated with their underlying stages of cognitive development. Aboud and Amato’s research identified that at the age of six, children attributed positive characteristics to members of their own in-group and negative attributes to the out-group. After the age of six, out-group prejudice decreases. This corresponded with the Piagetian theory of cognitive development which maintains that
before the age of six, children are in the pre-operational stage of cognitive development and are egocentric in their ideas and thinking and therefore these egocentric responses govern their attitudes to nation and national groups. Barrett (2007:68) critiqued this particular approach in that it does not account for the ‘diversity of developmental patterns that are actually exhibited in children.’

As stated above, geographical knowledge may not necessarily an indicator of national identity. Barrett and Whinell (1998) found that boys had more knowledge of their own and other countries. In their investigation of geographical knowledge and national identity, they concluded that there was a gender difference in terms of the acquisition of geographical knowledge and that this knowledge increased with age. Similarly Barrett’s work with Riazanova and Volovikova in 2001, recognised that that children from the ages of five or six are able to identify with a national group and the ability to do so increases in importance as the child progresses into middle childhood. A gender and class bias has also been identified in the acquisition of this knowledge in the work of Bourchier, Barrett and Lyons (2002). They found that middle class children had better geographical knowledge of other countries than those from the working classes. Although many of these studies have established that there may be a link between geographical knowledge and notions of identity, this is not the only defining factor in children’s assimilation of ideas relating to their national identity. However, the identification of the role of social class and gender is noteworthy and this is reflected further in social identity perspectives which recognise the position of a number of social stratifications interacting with national identity.

Other parameters, such as the ability of the child to recognise national emblems and flags, have been examined to explore children’s national and cultural affiliations; although definite connections between the aptitude to identify these symbols and the child’s perceptions of national identity have not been clearly identified. According to Ding and Littleton (2005), children’s knowledge of national emblems is an under researched area. Moore and Kramer-Moore (2004) described national symbols as calling cards that act as visible identifier to those inside and outside the country. In the pilot study for this project, a number of symbolic images, including flags, were shown to the children. The children were asked to identify these images and discuss whether they had any importance for them. This approach was not used in the main study as the children did not identify many of the symbols used. Previous developmental studies have been carried out (Jahoda, 1963; Weinstein, 1957) that supported the hypothesis that children’s knowledge of emblems increases with age. This links to previous studies considered that reveal the connection.
between geographical knowledge and age. Barrett (1995) found that children gained knowledge about their own national symbols quickly, whereas knowledge of other countries’ badges and symbols appeared to be acquired more slowly. This was not reflected in the results of the pilot study for this investigation.

In general, the cognitive development theories (CDT) of national identity formation in children which have been debated in this chapter, concluded that the importance of national identity increases between five and six and again at 11 and 12. As discussed earlier, knowledge of geography, as well as views about people from other countries, have been paramount in the construction of cognitive-developmental perspectives on national identity in children. Critics of this approach have identified the age-bound nature of such theories as problematic. Sociologists such as Jenks (2005) have also identified that such ideas do not reflect cultural diversity, or the influences of social situations, as well as not recognising the agency of the child. Scourfield et al. (2006a:44) present a pragmatic approach to this, recognising that stages of development are fundamentally important in shaping identities but the child’s social experiences also need to be taken into account, including ‘the complex social nature of the interactional settings and situations of children’s experiential worlds.’

The acknowledgement of the child’s social interactions are evident in social identity theories (SIT) (Tajfel, 1978, Tajfel and Turner, 1986). These perspectives on the formation of national identity in children developed the idea that people belong to a variety of social groups and that this idea of belonging can become part of one’s self-concept. This may then subsequently impact on personal perceptions of national identity. The social groups in this context include gender, ethnicity, national, state and social class. Social identity theory recognises the role of self-esteem in motivating the need to affiliate with certain social groupings. These theories did not propose any developmental predictions with regard to children’s acquisition of ideas around national identity. It does however discuss in-group and out-group biases and how this can impact on the way children relate to those they perceive to be part of their group, which may then be associated with ideas about national identity.

Building on from this, Nesdale’s research (2004) took the social identity theory proposed by Tajfel (1978) and added a developmental slant. In his social identity development theory (SIDT), he identified four phases of the development of national and ethnic identities: undifferentiated, ethnic awareness, ethnic preference and ethnic prejudice. These phases begin when children are two to three years old and at this point Nesdale stated that
identities lack importance. The second phase which occurs around the age of three is where children develop an awareness of the groups which have social importance in their own world. Following on from this phase, the third phase occurs at around the age of four years when a predilection for the in-group occurs. It is only when children reach seven years, Nesdale claimed, that prejudice to out-groups, that is, the groups which they do not identify with, can emerge. According to social identity development theory (SIDT), ‘ethnic or racial prejudice would be unlikely to occur in children younger than 6 to 7 because their social motives and knowledge would not have reached the requisite level of development’ (Nesdale et al., 2005:653). This theory contrasts sharply with the cognitive development stages defined by Aboud and Amato (2001), who claimed that the peak age for out-group prejudice was six years and then this subsequently decreases. In relation to the development of national identity, their affiliation with a particular nation or state will only become apparent when children develop an awareness of their own in-group. This concurs with some of the findings of Barrett’s Centenary Project (2002) discussed below.

Self-categorisation theory (SCT) put forward by Oakes, Haslam and Turner (1994) was also a development of the social identity theory. This particular idea claimed that individuals have multiple identities that have personal and social significance. These identities are arranged in a hierarchy and this structured order depends on the social context that one find oneself in. In the case of national identity, Barrett, Wilson and Lyons (1999:2) described the premise of SCT as being ‘when the context contains a comparable national out-group, the salience of the national in-group increases; when the context contains the national in-group alone, the salience of that in-group decreases.’ The theory also asserted that when a social identity becomes important to an individual then self-stereotyping occurs and everyone within the in-group is seen as homogeneous. Therefore, according to the social situation a child may change the way in which they categorise themselves in terms of national identity. For example, this stereotyping may be different in the school and the home environment because of the personal and social influences that affect the child.

Barrett (2007) introduced a further theoretical perspective called societal-social-cognitive-motivational theory, which is an amalgamation of the models previously discussed. He maintains that ‘children’s development is always embedded within a particular societal and social context’ (2007:290). This theory recognised the key role that parents play in what he terms as the ‘natural enculturation’ (2007:292) of their children and that levels of cognitive and motivational development will also act on children’s identification with nations and
states. Parental influence is seen as paramount in this model in providing the child with experiences to encounter ‘direct personal contact with foreigners and foreign places’ (2007:296). The role of education is also accepted within this model both in terms of curriculum and teachers and pedagogy. Barrett similarly identified the mass media including the Internet and a range of other visual and literary sources as influencing children’s knowledge of countries, nations and states.

Within this section, a variety of concepts have been examined with regard to children’s acquisition of ideas about national identity. The perspectives considered in the main were: cognitive developmental theory (CDT), social identity theory (SIT), social identity development theory (SIDT), self- categorisation theory (SCT) and finally Barrett’s (2007) societal-social-cognitive-motivational theory. Each viewpoint has provided a rationale for how children assimilate their perceptions of national identity and in some instances the factors that can influence this. Many of these studies explore in-group and out-group biases with children. Although the current investigation does not identify how children feel about children from other countries, the notion of ‘other’ does occur when exploring Welsh national identity. The children in the study were asked to consider their own national identity and Welsh national identity; for some children who participated in the data collection processes, Welsh national identity may not necessarily be concurrent with their own personal national identity and therefore this is where the ‘us’ and ‘them’ aspect comes into play. Welsh national identity may have been an abstract concept for those children and not particularly related to their own perception of national identity.

The next element of the review focussed specifically on studies which have been carried out with children in the United Kingdom and Ireland.

2.4 Children and national identity in the UK and Ireland

In terms of exploring children’s concepts of national identity in the United Kingdom context, Carrington and Short’s (1996, 1999) research revealed birth and residence to be key factors in the determination of children’s sense of national identity. The 1996 research project was conducted with 9 to 11 year olds in an Edinburgh school and revealed pupils’ need to distinguish between being Scottish and British. Many of the children interviewed emphasised their Scottish identity. This reflected the enquiries carried out with adults, including the Labour Force Survey of 2001 in the United Kingdom and in the 2011 census. In the 2011 census (ONS, 2011) 71 per cent of 10 to 14 year olds identified themselves as Scottish, although this number decreased with 57 per cent for 30 to 34 year olds responding in the same way. The strength of affiliation to Scotland as opposed to the
United Kingdom or Britain is significantly higher in the younger age group, reminiscent of the results achieved in Carrington and Short’s work.

Similarly, a more recent comparative study was undertaken between Scotland and Malta by Fyfe (2013). The purpose of this study was to establish children’s attitudes to national identity and evaluate these outlooks alongside developmental perspectives. This contemporary study used qualitative and quantitative approaches. 112 Scottish children aged five to 16 took part in this research project and all the Scottish children self-categorised themselves as Scottish. When the children were asked why they had categorised themselves as Scottish, responses centered on birthplace, residency in Scotland, parentage and language. A similar picture emerged from the data with regard to the Maltese children. Although Fyfe’s conclusions and discussions revolved around how her findings relate to key theories about the development of national identity in childhood and in-group out-group prejudices, including cognitive developmental theory (Piaget and Weil, 1951; Aboud and Amato, 2001) and social identity development theory (Nesdale, 2004), her results indicated that the Scottish children displayed a strong sense in-group preference and could clearly articulate the rationale for being Scottish. Again this parallels the strong sense of Scottish identity demonstrated in Carrington and Short’s 2006 study.

Connolly, Smith and Kelly’s (2002) investigation was designed to give an insight into children’s cultural and political awareness and so not solely concerned with national identity. In their work in Northern Ireland, they used a range of cultural and political symbols (including flags and football jerseys) with 352 children aged three to six years in order to establish whether the children had an awareness of particular symbols. According to Connolly, Smith and Kelly, this awareness developed with age: ‘51% of all three year olds were able to demonstrate some awareness of the cultural/political significance of at least one event or symbol,’ (2002:5). The figure increased to 90 per cent with six year olds. They also focussed on the children’s ability to align themselves to a particular community, in this case either the Catholic or Protestant community. Identification with community increased as the children became older, with 34 per cent of six year olds seeing themselves as a member of a specific community. This again illustrated how other allegiances interact with national identity, in this case, religious denomination and is resonant with Rogoff’s socio-cultural theory where there may be more direct influences on identity such as the immediate community taking priority over national identity. Although the children in this study were not asked to cite their own religious denomination, they were prompted to consider the religion of Welsh people. The results of this are analysed in Chapter 5.
Exploring further this idea of regional variations in levels of affiliation, research by Barrett (2002) as part of the Centenary Project concluded that children living in London had higher levels of national identification with British national identity than those living outside London. The project also found that children from ethnic minority groups were less likely to consider themselves as English or British than white English children. This is comparable to studies previously mentioned, (Alibhai-Brown, 2000, Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006, Jackson and Jones, 2014) conducted with adults in Wales, whereby people from ethnic minorities were less likely to see themselves as Welsh or they found the notion of Welshness problematic. Barrett’s (2002) conclusions exemplify the role of geography and ethnic group memberships as factors in children’s sense of national identification. From a developmental perspective, Barrett found that ‘the attribution of characteristics to the national in-group does indeed seem to become less positive through the middle childhood years’ (Barrett 2002:13). Like Piaget and Weil (1951), Barrett sought to explore whether children’s concept of national identity changed throughout their development. The results generated were not wholly conclusive. Barrett found evidence to support both the cognitive developmental theory and social identity theory, which focuses on the effect of social processes and factors, and the influence this has on children’s identity formation. Therefore, there is a need to look at national identity from a number of viewpoints and stances, rather than relying on the maturational approach seen in earlier studies on children’s sense of national identity. This wider view of how children acquire notions of national identity, as adopted in this study, allowed me to explore the children’s perspectives emerging from the study and how they reflect on current theoretical ideas. This interpretivist stance is explored further in Chapter 3.

Krzywosz-Rynkiewicz et al. (2002) conducted an investigation into children’s national identity across Europe involving eight European countries including the United Kingdom. As well as exploring national identity the study also looked at European identity, citizenship, tolerance and difference. Around two hundred eight to eleven year olds participated in the project. In the United Kingdom, the white children considered themselves to be British whereas children from ethnic minority groups were unsure. This is consistent with Barrett’s findings (2002) and parallels other studies with adults, for example, Alibhai-Brown (2000). Krzywosz-Rynkiewicz et al. (2002) found other determinants to be important when discussing national identity particularly language but also other things such as music, sport, clothes and games. When exploring difference and tolerance with the children, skin colour and language were seen as defining features. Conclusions from the research project as a whole revealed that most of the children had a
strong sense of national identity with the exceptions of children from ethnic minority groups in the United Kingdom and Greece. Language and skin colour were viewed as important elements of national identity across all the countries, alongside customs and clothes. These factors were particularly apparent in the children’s ideas about Welsh national identity in this thesis.

The work of Waldron and Pike (2006) was carried out in the Republic of Ireland and focussed on children’s construction of national identity, that is, what it means to be Irish. Researchers used participatory group activities with 119 children (aged 10-11 years) producing individual drawings and writing, as well as conducting semi-structured interviews. Conclusions drawn from the study indicated that ‘media conceptions of Irish identity are particularly influential’ (2006:246), with the children’s drawings of Irish persons reflecting product symbols and slogans. In contrast to the findings of Connolly, Smith and Kelly (2002) there was limited mention of religion, which may be indicative of the nature of the societal differences between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. Waldron and Pike express concern over the notion that ‘definitions of Irish identity…were overwhelmingly cultural’ (2006:247). However, there was a lack of cultural and ethnic diversity evident in the children’s drawings. The descriptions of the national character offered by the children were stereotypical and the children were able to define ‘distinctive cultural markers and suggest the existence of a dominant authentic and unique cultural identity that they see themselves as sharing’ (2006:248). The study also concluded that the ethos of the school impacted upon the children’s sense of national identity. This was shown through children’s views of environment, rights and diversity. The authors express support for the exploration of identity as an integral part of the citizenship curriculum, especially in relation to the study of history. Waldron and Pike’s study was influential in shaping the methodological considerations for this study. The participatory methods they employed are reflected in the multimodal aspects of the current investigation. The children had the opportunity to express their ideas about national identity and Welsh identity through drawing, writing and speaking, allowing the child’s voice to emerge from the data in a number of ways.

The above studies have focussed on devolved region of the UK, namely Scotland and Northern Ireland as well as research carried out in England and the Republic of Ireland. All of the investigations revealed factors which may affect children’s perceptions of national identity including religion, ethnicity, media and the school. The penultimate section explores specific studies undertaken with children in Wales.
2.5 Children and national identity in Wales.

There have been a limited number of studies which have examined children’s perspectives of national identity in Wales particularly with younger children. In 2005, Scourfield and Davies worked with a group of 8-11 year olds across six primary schools in Wales. The schools were chosen to represent a diverse cross section of Wales taking into account language, ethnicity and social class. The focus of the study was to explore national and ethnic identities with children in Wales. Their findings generally supported the notion of agency in the children’s construction of their own national identity, a perspective which is reflected in the methodological underpinnings of this study. Other conclusions drawn from the study relate to children’s views of Wales as a predominantly white nation, although some of the children did express more inclusive opinions of what it means to be Welsh. Further significant investigations were carried out by Scourfield, Dicks, Drakeford and Davies (2006a). Their study was an exploration of children’s national identity in Wales with a specific emphasis on the children’s understanding of place and nation. The project looked at middle school pupils aged 8 – 11 (n=105) and the primary schools participating in the project represented a diverse cross section of the Welsh population, that is, the study chose Welsh-medium and English-medium schools in both rural and urban locations. Research methods were qualitative and included 18 focus groups and 54 semi-structured interviews, as well as use of a card-based exercise, whereby children chose identity labels.

The results revealed that many children showed ‘an inclusive notion of what it is to be Welsh’ (Scourfield et al. 2006a:152) and the children linked this to Welsh sounding names or the ability to speak Welsh. Although the sample only included a small number of pupils from ethnic minorities, none of these children chose the term Welsh as their primary national identity. This supported the findings established by adult studies carried out in Wales (Alibhai-Brown, 2000, Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006, Jackson and Jones, 2014). In the areas which were populated mainly by Welsh speakers, they were ‘more aware of their difference within Britain than were children in other schools’ (Scourfield et al. 2006a:153). Therefore, language was recognised as a feature, which was similar to the adult study of Welsh national identity carried out by Davies, Charles and Harris in 2006. The results of Scourfield et al. implied that both ethnicity and language are key aspects of the way in which children perceive their national identity.

Scourfield et al. (2006b), elaborated on the key findings of the qualitative research with the older primary school children in the study in a further research article. They looked at the children’s attachments to places and cultures. 54 children were interviewed and undertook
card sorting exercises children to establish their affinity to place and spaces. They found that dominant markers used to distinguish nationality were place of birth, either the child’s own place of birth or their parents. Rugby was also seen as a signifier of Welshness. This again can be compared to the results of Davies, Charles and Harris’ (2006) ethnographic research with adults in Swansea in which support for the national rugby team was also ascribed to national identity. In Scourfield et al.’s study (2006b) family and friends were recognised as primary influences and national identity was characterised by how people speak, rather than occupation or appearance. The authors maintained that ‘the nation does not appear as a significant boundary in children’s talk; it is largely a one-dimensional category, confined to linguistic and sporting markers,’ (2006b:592). One of the main reasons cited for this view is that children aged between eight and eleven have not had time to absorb ‘a language of identity’ (Scourfield et al., 2006b: 592), which is made up of visual images, literature, music and cultural stereotypes.

In a study with older children, Coupland, Bishop, Williams, Evans and Garrett (2005) undertook a survey of approximately 2000 participants. They looked at the attitudes of sixteen year olds in Wales to Welsh and Welshness. The aim of the survey was to establish whether there were clear links between the ability to speak and interact in Welsh and affiliation to the Welsh nation. Their study revealed, ‘Quite high affiliative identity to Wales exists across the sample in most subgroups (including some with low competence in Welsh),’ (Coupland et al. 2005:18). The researchers asserted that the idea that the Welsh language is valued as a tool to display a group’s distinctiveness or in group affiliation applies ‘only in a very muted way’ (Coupland et al., 2005:17). This challenges the work of Herder (1969) and Poole (1999) discussed earlier, as well as Scourfield et al. (2006a, 2006b) which identified language as a key issue in children’s perception of national identity and studies carried out with adults in Wales as detailed above, for example the Beaufort project in 2013. The issue of language was examined from a personal identity perspective and from a Welsh national identity perspective in this thesis. A stronger emphasis on language was seen when considering Welsh national identity which may be linked to the policy context in Wales around the Welsh language and the promotion of Welsh identity which was analysed in the final part of the review.

2.6 National identity and policy in Wales

The final section of this review explores relevant policy (mainly educational) and practice in Wales. It reflects specifically on Welsh language policies and initiatives as well as more
generic policies which support the promotion of Welsh language and culture, such as the Curriculum Cymreig.

Language and the promotion of the bilingual agenda in Wales has been a significant topic for some time. The Welsh Assembly Government (2003:3) affirmed the Welsh language as ‘an integral part of our national identity…and an essential and enduring component in the history, culture and social fabric of our nation. We must respect that inheritance and work to ensure that it is not lost for future generations.’ The Welsh language, according to data collected in the 2001 census, has witnessed resurgence in the numbers of Welsh speakers. The census reported an increase from 18.5 per cent in 1991 to 20 per cent in 2001. However in the 2011 census (ONS 2011), the number of Welsh speakers showed a slight drop of two percentage points. Aitchison and Carter (2004) attribute the initial increase of Welsh speakers described in the 2001 census, to numbers of school age pupils now identified as competent Welsh speakers. This was still evident in the 2011 census despite the small decline recorded. Thus educational policy has had and continues to have a key role in the revival of the Welsh language.

_Iaith Pawb/Everyone’s Language_ (Welsh Assembly Government, 2003) described the strategic plan for the development of bilingualism in post-devolution Wales. One of the main goals of this policy revolved around increasing numbers of Welsh speakers by 5 per cent from the numbers documented in the 2001 census. This did not come to fruition in the 2011 census, where a slight drop in the numbers of those people speaking Welsh was recorded.

The Welsh-medium Education Strategy/Strategaeth Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg (2010) built on the vision to create a bilingual Wales outlined in _Iaith Pawb/Everyone’s Language_ (Welsh Assembly Government, 2003). This policy confirmed the Welsh Assembly Government’s commitment to the growth of Welsh-medium education and training across all phases, from the early years to higher education and beyond. There was also an emphasis on improving planning and infrastructure for Welsh-medium education with targets set at five and ten year intervals. An evaluation of this strategy began in 2012 and lasted until 2015, the final report was produced in 2016 (Welsh Government, 2016). The resultant appraisal of the strategy examined its effectiveness and impact as well as whether it met its aims and objectives. Findings revealed general support and commitment towards the strategy from officers, stakeholders and practitioners involved in the delivery of Welsh-medium provision and some positive outcomes for schools and learners. However concerns were expressed regarding the consistency of delivery across educational contexts.
Subsequently many of the targets set in 2010 have not been met such as increasing the numbers of practitioners in the Welsh-medium educational workforce.

In 2012, the Welsh Government produced its latest strategy for the promotion of the Welsh language, *Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw/ A Living Language: A Language for Living*. This document discussed the continuing acquisition of the Welsh language in the school context and also in the use of Welsh in the wider community. A change in rhetoric is identified by Williams (2013), who noted the deviation from the promotion of bilingualism towards increasing the number of people who speak and use Welsh. Selleck (2015:2) also reflected on the policy shift which she claimed was evident in this document, whereby ‘recreational spaces are subject to language ideological influence,’ as well as within educational domains. Selleck commented on the contrast between this current policy and *Iaith Pawb/Everyone’s Language* (Welsh Assembly Government, 2003). The former document suggested a sense of choice in access to languages and championed bilingualism as opposed to the 2012 policy which Selleck (2015:2) claimed was ‘based on coercion, pressure and influence.’

Selleck (2013:20) explored ‘the dichotomy between the inclusive nature of Welsh language policy and the ‘reality’ on the ground.’ Her study focused on the experiences of pupils in two schools (a bilingual school (Welsh and English) and an English-medium school) in west Wales. The findings reflected a contrast between the notion of choice seen in policy documents such as *Iaith Pawb* (2003) and the actual experience of learners in the community. The two schools showed strategic differences in their management of bilingualism and the choice of school was largely governed by the parents. Interestingly, with regard to the present thesis, ‘it appears to take on a nationally identifying element - go to the Welsh school and become Welsh, and go to the ‘English school’ and become English,’ (Selleck, 2013:36). This acknowledges the role of language in national identity formation as seen by the secondary school pupils in this study. Selleck’s subsequent ethnographic study in 2015, examined the use of the Welsh language in the home and in the school. She collected data across two secondary schools (one bilingual, although Selleck describes this school as mainly functioning in Welsh and one English-medium) and a Youth Club (which accommodated children from both schools). Selleck notes a gulf between the numbers of children being educated via the medium of Welsh and the usage of Welsh outside of the school gates. She goes on to question whether the current policy in Wales, *Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw/ A Living Language: A Language for Living* (Welsh
Government, 2012a) will have a significant impact in increasing the usage of Welsh outside educational institutions.

Alongside language policy in Wales, other educational strategies such as the Curriculum Cymreig (1993) have been introduced to develop the Welsh dimension of the curriculum throughout all stages of the education system. The national curriculum in Wales was introduced as part of the Education Reform Act in 1988. Within the national curriculum orders produced at this time there were distinctive Welsh dimensions in subjects such as geography and history. In 1993, following pressure from activists to create a curriculum which reflected the distinctiveness of Wales and Welsh culture, Awdurdod Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (ACCAC: the Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales), produced a document entitled ‘Developing a Curriculum Cymreig.’ The goal was to create a distinctive curriculum in order to reflect the various linguistic, cultural, social, historical and geographical contexts in Wales. Since 1993, the Curriculum Cymreig has undergone various revisions and updates. The Welsh Assembly Government via ACCAC, introduced updated guidance in 2003, to identify ways in which schools could promote the Welsh element throughout all subject areas and ‘develop whole school approaches so that the Curriculum Cymreig is an essential part of the school’s ethos’ (ACCAC, 2003:3).

Following on from this ESTYN (Her Majesty's Inspectorate for Education and Training in Wales) (2005) produced an evaluation of the progress made by schools in implementing the ACCAC guidance on Y Curriculum Cymreig from the early years to Key Stage 3. This report states that ‘Pupils are developing a good knowledge, skill and understanding of the way in which historical events, people and landscapes have influenced artists, poets and authors in various parts of Wales’ (ESTYN, 2005:5).

In 2012, a review was commissioned to look at the teaching of Welsh history, the story of Wales and Curriculum Cymreig. The purpose of this appraisal was to evaluate current policy and practice in light of the significant curricula developments that have occurred since the instigation of the updated Curriculum Cymreig in 2003. The brief of the review was to establish whether the Curriculum Cymreig should be taught predominantly through the history or across the curriculum. Recommendations produced in 2013, included the continuation of the cross-curricula nature of Curriculum Cymreig, redefining the Curriculum Cymreig and making it central to any future curriculum (Learning Wales, 2013). The final report confirmed the continuing commitment of the Welsh Government to support the education of children in Wales with a curriculum that helps children ‘to identify their own sense of ‘Welshness’ and to feel a heightened sense of belonging to their
local community and country’ (Welsh Government, 2013:2). As seen earlier in the work of Waldron and Pike (2006) in the Republic of Ireland, school ethos can influence children’s sense of national identity and this school ethos may be influenced by various driver including the curriculum. The Curriculum Cymreig continues to aim to foster a sense of belonging, place and heritage in pupils being educated in Wales and therefore may be a contributory factor in the development of their national identity.

Bilingualism and the promotion of the Welsh language continues to be a primary objective of the Welsh Government, coupled with the development of a sense of belonging and heritage through Curriculum Cymreig. The impact of the policy for development of the Welsh language in Wales has been considered here, as well as the role of the Curriculum Cymreig in shaping children’s ideas about language and culture in Wales. The Welsh language and its resonance with perceptions of national identity has been identified in the previous sections of this literature evaluation in studies with both adults and children. Therefore, the current strategy for Welsh language development, *Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw/ A Living Language: A Language for Living* (Welsh Government, 2012a) and the reviewed Curriculum Cymreig could be seen as having an influence on children’s ideas of national identity and Welshness.

2.7 Summary of literature review

To conclude, the literature review has considered a range of interpretations of national identity from a variety of disciplines, including psychological, sociological, historical and educational perspectives. National identity has been explored in a general context as well as from a United Kingdom and Welsh standpoint. A number of theories have been examined which have sought to provide explanations for the way in which children formulate their ideas about national identity and the influences that can contribute to these conceptual constructions. Alongside this, the evaluation has reflected on studies on children in the United Kingdom and Ireland as well as the Welsh context in line with this current study. Current influential educational policies have also been analysed in light of their potential impact on children’s national identity and the views on Welsh national identity.

This research project investigated children’s perceptions of their own national identity and Welsh national identity. The voice of the child is paramount in this project and the
methodology which is qualitative has been designed with the goal of engaging children in the research process and trying to elicit meaningful responses through a multimodal approach. Methodological issues and the research framework will be discussed in the next chapter.

Chapter 3: Methodology

This chapter presents the research paradigm used to frame this study as well as the methods and sampling frameworks utilised, ethical considerations and data analysis methods. An overall evaluation of the methodology is included in the latter part of the chapter.

Research involving children is a particularly problematic and contentious area for a number of reasons. Ethics is usually cited as the primary obstacle when researching with children. Bronfenbrenner (1952), a leading theorist in child development, stated that to refrain from social research with children was really the only way to fully respect professional ethical principles. Although procedures and practices have been developed since that time, this statement still summarises the difficult dilemma for those involved in the process of research with children. This becomes even more challenging when researching with young children, as informed consent in the research process can be demanding to negotiate in respect of the child and other ‘gatekeepers.’ Further consideration of ethical issues will be discussed later in this chapter.

I sought to represent the child as an active participant in the research process and this view of the child has informed every aspect of the research, from the research paradigm to the methods and subsequent analysis of collected data. However, it is recognised also that the research was carried out in schools where the relationship between the adult and the child is characterised by specific behaviours, with the power being in the domain of the adult. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1989, which was ratified by the British government and enshrined in subsequent legislation such as the Children Act of 1989 and 2004, which supported the view that children to be involved in decisions which affect them individually and collectively. In Wales, the Rights of Children and Young
Persons (Wales) Measure (2011), further reinforced the rights of the child to be an active participant in decision making processes. Therefore researchers have a moral duty to respect the view of the child in all aspects of the research process.

Qvortup et al. (1994:2) described children as ‘beings not becoming’ who have the ability and competency to express their own views on their own lives. As Tisdall, Davis and Gallagher (2009:3) affirmed children are ‘experts in their own lives.’ Approaches to teaching and learning in the early years used in Reggio Emilia in Italy and in the work of Malaguzzi, (1998), reflect this perspective of listening and respecting the views of the child (Roberts-Holmes, 2005). The Reggio Emilia approach seeks to promote children’s education through the development of all their languages: expressive, communicative, symbolic, cognitive, ethical, metaphorical, logical, imaginative and relational. Thus, using a range of these languages in the research process is essential to allow children to express themselves fully. In this study children have used drawing, writing and oral means to communicate their ideas.

According to Tisdall, Davis and Gallagher (2009) in the past, children were often seen as objects of research, whereas now children have become the subjects of the research process. Barker and Weller (2003) stated that previous, mainly positivist approaches which featured large-scale observations, measurement and assessment, represented children as objects of research and these studies were considered as research on, rather than with, children. The notion of research with children, rather than on them, is discussed by Christensen and James (2008). Their view is that children should be positioned as ‘social actors who are subjects rather than objects of enquiry,’ (Christensen and James 2008:1). However, further development of this is actively involving children in the process of research and viewing the child as a participator. There may be a limit to the extent of the child’s participation in the research process, as the initial instigator of the investigation it is generally the adult who is the project manager. Therefore the collaboration process may be framed by the views of the adult and his or her perceptions of childhood and ideas about the agency of the child.

Mandell (1991) explored the role of the adult in the research process and recommends the suspension of all adult characteristics except for size (in this instance the author is referring to body size). However the adoption of this may be considered unfeasible for some adults or for some methods of research. Christensen (2004) described an alternative suggestion where the researcher adopts the role of the unusual adult. In this present study, there are
further complications in clarifying the adult role, as the data collection took place within a number of primary school environments. Within such situations, the adult is seen in a specific way and children are expected to perform in a particular manner, the power lying very much in the domain of the adult. Morrow (2007) saw the power relationships between adults and children as providing a major challenge for researchers in the field. However, she suggests that the way to overcome the impact of these power relationships lies with the researcher and through the design, implementation and analysis of the research. The researcher’s view of the child should be evident at all points in the research from the conception of the project to its conclusion. In this study, the child was seen as an active participant and partner in the research process. The methods used reflected the need to represent the child’s voice as central to the project and this was evidenced in the subsequent analysis of the data. The ethical considerations for the study incorporated the consent of the child as fundamental to the procedure.

3.1 The research paradigm

Mukherji and Albon (2010) described a paradigm as an exemplar or a mode whereas Hughes (2010:31) explained that it is ‘a way to see the world and organise it into a coherent whole.’ Both texts cited the work of Kuhn (1970) and his work on the role of paradigms in relation to the research process. Hughes (2010) also used the analogy of the paradigm as a picture frame which defines the way in which we see and interpret the research within it. Kumar (2005) identified the two main paradigms used in researching the social sciences, positivist and naturalistic (interpretivist). The former is located in the notion that the world is governed by unchanging universal laws despite the ever-changing sequence of superficial events (Hughes 2010). Positivism has its foundations in science where the traditional belief is that scientific knowledge can be proven by the accumulation of facts and data from observing or experimenting.

Alternatively, interpretivists and interpretivist research methods, recognise that there may be many different perspectives and explanations for actions and thoughts. Within this research paradigm ‘there is an acknowledgement of diversity of viewpoints’ (Mukherji and Albon, 2010:25) Interpretivists seek to explain how people make sense of their circumstances in both a social and material context. Qualitative research which is defined by Corbetta (2003) as being open and interactive whereby observation comes before theory and therefore tends to be located primarily within the interpretivist paradigm, and, as Hughes (2010) stated, validity is gained through triangulation of methods in order to secure a consistency of responses. Unlike positivism the research process does not seek to prove
or disprove a theory or phenomenon, but rather moves to identify a range of miscellaneous interpretations of a particular theme or subject. Hughes (2010) identified this knowledge as being local and specific to that project.

Poststructuralists such as Derrida (1978) and later, Foucault (2002), sought to deconstruct established discourses. Discourses in this instance refers to the ways of thinking, speaking and writing ‘which have been established to control ways of thinking’ (Atkins and Wallace, 2012:8). In poststructuralism, there is a belief that everyone and everything in the world is constantly in flux and that ‘a subject’s understandings of the world are associated with their particular experiences of the world’ (Hughes 2010:47). Each subject’s understanding links to their social and material circumstances including race, gender and social class. Like interpretivists, ‘poststructuralists judge the validity of knowledge according to the authenticity of the research participants’ voice,’ (Hughes 2010:48).

The aim of this study was definitely to acknowledge that discourses around national identity may not always be the same and are dependent on a number of factors and therefore could be construed as being in flux akin to the poststructuralist viewpoint. However the subjects’ social and material circumstances were not explored fully and consequently this research cannot be perceived as poststructuralist in essence.

This study was positioned within the interpretivist or naturalistic paradigm, as it aimed to identify children’s perspectives on their national identity and how they generate these ideas and interpretations. The research data were collected within one particular type of setting, that is, within schools at certain points in time. Therefore the voices of the participants may not be the same at a different time or in an alternative social context, that is, the home or the playground. I was mindful that this approach is aligned with the poststructuralist idea that these children’s ideas of national identity maybe in a state of flux according to the social circumstances that they placed it. The view of the child was also significant in identifying the research paradigm and here the child was seen as actively and capably interpreting his or her own national identity and how this is influenced by the world around them. Thus, the children’s own understanding of their own national identity and Welsh national identity at a certain time in a particular context was at the core of this project.

### 3.2 Ethical considerations

Ethics in research with children is a highly contested issue and in some ways ‘ethics can dominate debates about methodological concerns’ (Punch 2002:323). According to Gallagher (2008), ethical codes in the social sciences have paralleled the development of these practices in medical research. Wiles et al. (2007) cited this as problematic in the
field of social science, as it may be difficult to ascertain what causes someone harm or provides a benefit. Assessment of detriment or gain in medical research may be easier to determine. Medical codes have been adopted since the Nuremberg Trials in 1949, where certain moral, ethical and legal principles relating to research involving human subjects, were laid out and this impacted initially on medical research but then also became customary to acquire voluntary participation and informed consent in all research scenarios (MacNaughton, Rolfe and Siraj-Blatchford, 2001). The subsequent Declaration of Helsinki which was originally created in 1964, took these proposals further and decided that adequate information must be provided to the research participants (World Health Organisation, 2001). Also the Declaration stated participation in the research must be freely volunteered, with the understanding that the research subject can withdraw at any time and informed consent should be obtained, preferably in writing. However, the latter may not be appropriate when working with younger children as they may not have the relevant literacy skills.

When planning and implementing any research project, there are three primary ethical considerations; informed consent, anonymity and confidentiality. Gallagher (2007) stated that consent involves some kind of explicit act, such as a written or verbal agreement. Throughout this research project, consent was gained via written means from adults and a verbal agreement with the children. Informed consent involves providing participants with relevant information so that they fully understand the process and consequences of the research. Informed consent is more contentious in the context of working with children. A leaflet was prepared for the children and a letter for the parents and teachers (Please see Appendices 1-3). These documents outlined the purpose of the research, the research process and the subsequent use of the data and was in line with University processes and procedures and the BERA (British Education Research Association) guidelines issued in 2011.

As this research was set within the context of the school, the consent of the head teachers and teachers, the so called ‘gatekeepers’, was the first requirement, followed by permission from parents and then, the child. The subjects of the research formulated the final link in the consensual process. Alderson (2005) questioned whether we require consent from all these parties when negotiating research with children. Permission from the head teachers was gained initially via written communication with a follow up telephone communication and meeting. The head teachers then identified which teachers would be willing to participate in the research process. After consultation with the teachers involved, a parental
letter was sent out asking the parents to provide permission for their children to take part in the project. Finally, children were consulted regarding their willingness to participate in the study. The consensual process is illustrated below in Figure 3.

**Figure 3. Process of consent**

The competency of the child to give consent is a much debated issue. Alderson (2005:34) stated that this depends on ‘each child’s own relevant experience, confidence, the type of research, and the researcher’s skill.’ She went on to identify that the subject of competency was affected by the Gillick ruling in 1995, which declared that by law, competent children under the age of 16 can give valid consent. Children who participate in research within the school environment are often described as a ‘captive sample’ (Morrow, 2007:158). Morrow commented further, stating that therefore, the concept of voluntary consent from the pupils within the school setting may be doubted, as children feel compelled in this scenario to comply with the wishes of the adult. In the current investigation and many other studies, as part of the process of gaining consent, the child is consulted only after negotiation with adults, which still raises issues regarding society’s view of competency in the decision making process. Langstone *et al.* (2004, cited in Mukherji and Albon, 2010) identified that even after giving consent initially, children may also withdraw their consent via methods such as refusing to engage with the researcher or research material or becoming uncharacteristically quiet.

The children were initially asked whether they wanted to take part in the project and given the opportunity to ask questions about the project. This process was repeated throughout
each stage of the data collection process. According to Dockett and Perry (2011) this is the process of assent rather than consent, whereby the researcher seeks to ascertain the child’s willingness to participate in the project in order to develop a respectful partnership. Kellet (2010:26) defined assent as being when the ‘child acquiesces without knowledge or understanding.’ This is contrary to the definition of assent seen in the work of Dockett and Perry (2011) and Phelan and Kinsella (2013). In the latter study, assent is seen as willingness to take part and can be gained by verbal or written means. Phelan and Kinsella (2013) also reflected on the need for reflexivity in the research process in matters of assent. As the researcher in this process, I needed to be vigilant in the observation of the children’s verbal and non-verbal responses, in order to ensure that the child was comfortable with the procedures involved in the study.

Assessment of competency to consent or assent to the research process and the power relationships involved are correspondingly linked. Punch (2002:323) stated ‘Children are marginalized in adult-centred society,’ and there are unequal power relationships between adults and children which result in children having much of their lives controlled by the adults around them. According to Gallagher (2009:24) ‘childhood researchers have tended to see power as something that adults have more of than children.’ However researchers using more participatory methods for data collection may be able to redress this balance of power. Matthews (2001, cited in Gallagher, 2009) stressed that attempting to equalise these power relationships is an important challenge for research ethics. Children should not feel coerced into taking part in a research project or participate in order to please the adults around them for example, parents or teachers (Phelan and Kinsella, 2013).

Mayall (2000) asserted that adult researchers need to address generational issues when working with children. The children’s participation in this particular project was associated with the data collection stage, which in some instances would be regarded as minimal involvement and not essentially adopting a participatory approach. French and Swain (1997) compared what they termed as ‘emancipatory’ research, in which participants are involved throughout the research process, from the evolution of research questions to the evaluation of the accumulated data, and ‘participatory’ research, in which they are actively involved in data collection, as in this study. Also, the context in which the data gathering took place, within school settings, could be construed as an example, where adult power over children is particularly prevalent and that in this context children are not familiar with expressing their views freely. Davis (2009) discusses how children can become involved in all aspects of the study, from what he defined as the ‘pre-data collection stage’ (2009:157),
to the reporting stage. The way in which children were encouraged to contribute in the research process will be discussed later, as well as the strategies employed to empower the children to give their responses to the research questions.

Protecting the anonymity and ensuring confidentiality for all participants involved is seen as a key feature of ethical research. This involves ensuring that the participants or the establishments are not named within the data and subsequent presentation of the study via articles, papers and theses. Anonymity and confidentiality are enshrined in the sentiments of the Data Protection Act (1998) which legislated for the fact that researchers must securely store any accumulated data and inform the research participants about how the data will be used. The participants’ entitlement privacy is essential unless they or their guardians waive that right (BERA, 2011). The researcher may override confidentiality if he or she is party to some kind of a disclosure which may constitute illegal behaviour that might be harmful to the participants or others (BERA, 2011). Child protection issues would be an example of this within a school setting. Schools in Wales are guided by the All Wales Child Protection Procedures (2008) and as such have policies and practices in place to deal with such situations. Fortunately there were no instances of disclosure encountered as part of the data collection process.

In order to maintain anonymity, in some studies children are given pseudonyms or choose their own fictitious names (Gallagher, 2009). This can be problematic in analysis of data when children do not use gender specific names particularly if the research is focussed around cross-cutting themes such as gender. In this study each child’s drawing, writing and transcribed interview were given a unique code ascribed by the researcher according to their gender and school, in order to compare all responses for analysis. The data was stored in a secure, electronic location and drawings and annotations were located in a locked filing cabinet. Access to the data was limited to those directly involved in the project, that is, the researcher and the research project supervisors. During the initial collection of data which involved a whole class activity, whereby the children produced drawings and annotations, the class teachers were present in all three schools. In terms of sharing the information gathered, the data was seen by the class teacher and therefore perhaps this does challenge whether confidentiality was observed throughout the study. However, as explained in the subsequent sections of this chapter, the input of the class teacher was required in establishing the interview sample as he or she had substantially greater knowledge of the pupils in his or her class than the researcher.

3.3 Methods
As stated previously, the study has adopted an interpretivist paradigm which draws predominantly on a qualitative approach for the collection of data (Aubrey et al., 2000). Qualitative research can be defined simply as research that is ‘concerned with the quality of the data it produces, rather than the quantity’ (Hughes, 2010:53). Methodologies which support the collection of qualitative data are associated with establishing meaning and significance. This is a direct contrast to quantitative research which as the term implies and as stated by Mukherji and Albon (2010: 14) seeks to ‘measure, quantify or find the extent of a phenomenon.’ In establishing children’s views about their own national identity and Welsh national identity, this study sought to determine children’s ideas around national identity and its significance in the world of the young child. Therefore qualitative approaches were preferred to the more positivist methods adopted in quantitative research.

According to Punch (2002) one way to investigate the diversity of childhood and experiences is to use a range of different methods in the research process. Adult perceptions of the child can also affect the choice of methods. Currently there are three main stances adopted by researchers; seeing children as essentially being the same as adults, viewing the child as different to adults or recognising the child as being similar to the adult but possessing differing competencies (Punch, 2002). Concurrent with the active participant ethos described earlier, the latter presumption was adopted and the choice of methods acknowledged the competencies of the children participating in the research process.

Previous personal and professional experience as a primary school teacher made me conscious of the different ways in which children are able to express themselves both orally and through more creative means. Therefore, a range of approaches were used including drawing, writing and semi-structured interviews. The methods built on the work of Waldron and Pike (2006), which was discussed in the literature chapter. Waldron and Pike (2006) asked children to illustrate what it means to be Irish in both writing and drawing, followed by semi-structured interviews. Their research reflected a participatory approach and attempted to encourage children to engage critically with their own ideas, a method also adopted in the present study. However, both projects may be viewed as not wholly facilitating participation since although the methods used sought to elicit responses through different modes, the children did not choose the mode of expression. In future research, this could be overcome by asking children to select how they could best offer their ideas about the subject area, however based on my own experience as a primary school teacher, some children might find the element of choice difficult. In the school
context, children would not always be familiar with having to choose a particular way of voicing their opinions. Also, in this study as in that of Waldron and Pike (2006), the children were seen as active participants in the data gathering process but were not involved in the planning, implementation or evaluation strategies.

The methods used to collect the data in this study were an initial event to gather the children’s drawings (the children also annotated their drawings) and this was followed by a return to the schools to conduct semi-structured interviews. Having a multi-method or multimodal approach supported the triangulation of the data and increased the credibility of the findings. This approach also sought to allow the children to communicate their ideas in more than one way. Barker and Weller (2003) believe that traditional approaches, such as using questionnaires to gather data, can be intimidating for young children and that drawings can be more inclusive and help to build rapport and trust. Despite Barker and Weller’s (2003) assertions regarding the inclusiveness of using drawings, this may not be the view of the child. Punch (2002) concurs with this; she also discusses the notion that adults assume that children will prefer more ‘fun’ methods such as drawing and this will enable them to be more competent in the research process. Again this is linked to adult interpretations of child competency and Punch (2002) stresses that this competency in drawing and writing may be different for each participant.

3.3.1 Visual methods of data collection

The term ‘visual data’ is ambiguous in that it encompasses many forms, including photographs, maps, advertisements and drawings. Pink (2006:17) stated that ‘Images are “everywhere”. They permeate our academic work, everyday lives, conversations and dreams.’ In recent years, there has been an increase in the use of visual methods ‘to develop new ways of understanding individuals and social relationships, and social science knowledge’ (Emmel and Clark, 2011:1). Previous studies show that photography and film have been popular within visual sociology and anthropology research (Mitchell, 2011). However, other disciplines are seeking to use images to create research methodologies. Pain (2012) looked at the reasons cited for using different types of visual methods in order to collect data. She concluded that primarily the explanations cited for using such methods relate to the enhancement of the data collection process or the interactions between the researchers and participants. Liebenberg (2009:444) claimed that the use of visual images, in this instance, photographs, increases the validity of the data allowing the researcher an opportunity to ‘literally see what participants are talking about.’
There are also limitations identified when using visual methods, in particular the relationship between the researcher and the participant, and the effect that this has on the data. Emmison and Smith (2000) point out that the researcher can exert a marked effect on the outcomes of the research if he or she has guided the participants specifically regarding the choice of images used as part of the research process. The authors here are referring to the power relationships in the research process which have already been debated with regard to this study, and the power dynamics of the classroom and the school setting. Initially, the children were given guidance regarding the subject of their drawing and a template, which restricted the size of the image. This may have impacted on their responses in terms of what they produced and the positioning and size of the drawing.

Other issues around the limitations of visual methods are largely focussed on ways such data may be analysed (Pink, 2006 and Emmison and Smith, 2000). There have been a range of approaches adopted to analyse visual images, including discourse analysis (Rodgers, 2011) and content analysis (Edwards, 2010). The latter approach was used to analyse the data collected as part of this study and is described in 3.7. Whilst the above recognises the debates around the potential restrictions on analysis of visual methods, the methodology of this research is not solely visual. The images were used as a tool or prompt to stimulate the children’s discussions and annotations and analysis was conducted across the different modes. The limitations of the methods have been evaluated holistically in section 3.8.

3.3.2 Children’s drawings

During the data collection process, the children were asked to draw two pictures, a self-portrait and a drawing of a Welsh person. The use of children’s artwork as a means of establishing children’s ideas and thoughts about a particular subject area, has been a recognised research method for many years. Pauwels (2011) established that this would be categorised as respondent-generated images offering a ‘unique (insider) perspective’ but this is not the end product. Analysis would then need to take place to make sense of the image and how it is framed within the research. This method has become more widespread as participatory techniques for research have been encouraged which allow children to contribute more actively in the research process. As Kellet (2010:73) affirmed ‘children’s drawings are increasingly being used as a creative method to research children’s experiences and generate particularly rich data when children are invited to talk about their drawings.’ A sample of children in each school were chosen to talk about their drawings.
Leitch (2008, cited in Thomson, 2008) discussed image making as a tool for exploring children’s narratives. A study on children’s rights in Northern Ireland carried out in 2005 by Kilkenny et al. demonstrated how children’s drawings and stories can illustrate key issues that are important in the lives of young children. Subsequently the data gathered by Kilkenny et al was interpreted and the children’s views were presented to policy makers in a formal report context but also using children’s visual images to complement the major themes emerging from the data. Drawings coupled with written and oral narratives in this project, present an opportunity for the voice of the child to emerge from the data in more than one way. Similarly, research carried out by Linesch in 2002, after the atrocities of September 11th, revealed children’s knowledge of the events and their understanding of the political climate.

Kramer (1958) described artwork as representing a vessel of emotions. According to Pahl (1999) children’s drawings help them to externalise their thoughts and this is echoed throughout the work of Coates (2004) who characterised drawings as a dialogue which helps us understand how children perceive the world. Punch (2002:331) stated:

> The advantage of using drawing with children is that it can be creative, fun and can encourage children to be more actively involved in the research. The use of drawing gives children time to think about what they wish to portray.

She goes on to identify that task-based methods such as drawing can help children to feel more at ease with an adult researcher. Often children are able to depict their ideas in their drawings in a far more in depth way than if they were using verbal means. This is supported by Roberts-Holmes (2005) who concurred that drawings can be used by children to show their feelings about a particular subject. He also identified the use of drawings as a participatory tool which builds on children’s enjoyment of painting and drawing, although it is also recognised that this could be an adult perception of the art process.

The use of drawings in research with children was used as far back as 1926 with Goodenough’s ‘Draw a Man’ test as a tool for the measurement of cognitive ability. Subsequently, children’s drawings have been employed as a research tool for exploring children’s emotions and also as a therapeutic intervention. Traditionally, both in psychology and psychotherapy, the images generated by children have been used for clinical and diagnostic research. Criticisms of this approach include the recognition that children need to be accustomed to using drawing as a tool for expression (Veale 2005, cited in Mukherji and Albon, 2010). If children are unfamiliar with representing the ideas and thoughts through the medium of drawing, this will limit the research process and subsequent richness of data. In this project, the children in all three schools were
accustomed to using drawings as a means of self-expression. This was confirmed by the classroom wall displays in all three schools which depicted examples of the children’s drawings and paintings. Older children may be sensitive about their competency in art and this may be linked to their exposure to drawing practice (Punch, 2002). This could inhibit their drawings and affect their enjoyment of the task. Again during the drawing activity all children appeared to be engaged with the process and did not display any behaviour to indicate that they were not enjoying the task. However their enjoyment was not the focus of the subsequent interview and therefore it is difficult to firmly ascertain whether the experience had been pleasurable and thus uninhibited.

Another concern regarding drawings, is the replication of stereotypical images which may be directly linked to the child’s experiences of drawing and as well as the visual and media images they encounter in the classroom and elsewhere. Freeman (1980) discussed the stereotypical images produced by children. This theme was a feature of the initial pilot study which is discussed later in this chapter, whereby many of the children produced similar images which could be interpreted as stereotypical representations of Welsh identity, for example, producing drawings showing traditional Welsh costumes and rugby kit. Hart (1997:62) proposed that ‘stereotyped images that relate to what they have learned to draw, which in turn is often an expression of a limited range of objects emphasized by the particular culture.’ Punch (2002) also draws attention to the fact that children may copy from each other and that this needs to be taken into account when analysing the drawings, especially if there is a series of recurring images. Again in the pilot study this was also the case, with a number of recurrent themes being present in the children’s depictions, which could indicate that the children may have duplicated images drawn by their peers.

Silver (1997) explored the role of gender in children’s artwork. The ‘Draw a Story’ test was designed by Silver to assess cognitive, developmental, and emotional functioning. The use of drawings with children would allow them to express themselves through visual rather than oral means. She used the ‘Draw a Story’ test in order to explore the content and style of the images drawn by children. Silver analysed the subject content of children’s drawings to identify whether boys and girls depict subjects of the same gender in their pictures. She wanted to establish whether boys drew boys and similarly, if girls drew girls. Her study which focussed on a range of children from different age groups, concluded that most children draw subjects which are consistent with their own gender. Silver also explored the drawings of children who did not draw subjects who were consistent with their own gender and found that often these children created images which presented these
subjects in a negative way. Malchiodi (1998) stated that gender and children’s drawings is still an under-researched area. Her own 1990 study cited in Malchiodi (1998), was carried out in high school in the USA with 50 adolescents (25 girls and 25 boys) involved analysing the children’s self-portraits. Results showed that boys drew themselves in active roles engaged in sport and other activities, whereas, girls usually drew either a head and shoulders or full figure image but without any movement or activity. Malchiodi linked this to the children’s beliefs about gender roles in this particular region of America. She concluded that children’s drawings can provide a valuable tool for examining their self-perceptions as well as their understanding of those people around them.

Researchers such as Machiodi (1998) also suggested that adults view children’s drawing through adult eyes. Kellog (1969, cited in Coates, 2004) also discussed the adult role in the interpretation of children’s drawings and expressed the view that the adult interpretation of the drawing is often accepted by the child, although it may not be a true reflection of what they have actually drawn. Kress (1997, cited in Coates and Coates, 2006), stated that it is mainly the end product that is used in analysis and the talk created during the process is ignored. He maintained that this discussion around the drawing process can facilitate a greater understanding of the child’s intentions. Leitch (2008) emphasised that children need to be given the opportunity to discuss their visual responses in some sort of follow-up occasion. Reflection on their images provided allowed further opportunities to discuss the child’s interpretation of the image rather than imposing my own explanation on the drawing. Although the children’s conversations were not closely monitored as they undertook the drawing activity as part of this study, the semi-structured interviews which took place after the completion of the drawings were aimed at developing a greater depth of understanding of the pictorial representations produced. In addition to this, any annotations on the drawings were also used to support the analysis. Interviews were completed with a small sample (chosen with the class teacher and discussed in 3.5) from each school using the drawing as a starting point for the discussion.

Leitch (2008) described the visual image in the drawing as the third party in the research process, accompanying the child and the researcher in a triangular configuration. She goes on to discuss the influence that this image has over the researcher, the participants and the research process, ‘allowing layers of meaning and significance to emerge’ (Leitch, 2008: 54). This is the analytical model that was adopted in this study as a sample of the children were asked to discuss their drawings and therefore the drawing became a significant feature of the relationship between researcher and participant.
3.3.3 Semi-structured interviews

Semi-structured interviews were carried out with a sample of children (six children in School A, five children in School B and five children in School C) from the selected class in each school (See Appendix 7 for interview questions). Children were interviewed outside of their normal classrooms (in a small classroom in schools A and B, with only the researcher and interviewee present and in the library in School C, where other staff and pupils were accessing resources). The interviews were recorded and then later transcribed. The method of semi-structured interviews is associated with qualitative research which seeks to generate a body of rich data from the participants’ responses to a range of questions. An interview can be termed as a ‘method where one person asks questions of an individual’ (Mukherji and Albon, 2010:118) but of course the process is not as simplistic as this, as there are many factors which can influence this process such as the power relationships which were discussed earlier. Throughout the interview process the interviewee is expected to respond to particular questions posed by the interviewer.

Furthermore, semi-structured interviews can be considered as ‘structured conversations’ (Cannold, 2001:179). They are used frequently when collecting data with children, in fact Kellett (2010) stated that they are the most common and popular method used with children. She characterised semi-structured interviews as encompassing a core of pre-determined questions which allow for flexibility in terms of responses and the direction of the questioning, ‘the most important characteristic of a semi-structured interview is flexibility,’ (Kellett, 2010:72). In contrast to the structured interview, this allows the interviewer to seek further clarification about a particular topic and also enables the question to be adapted to the needs of the interviewee and their understanding (Mukherji and Albon 2010). Mukherji and Albon (2010) go on to claim that unstructured interviews are most appropriate when interviewing children as this allows the child to set the pace and direction of the interview. This relates back to the power and participatory dilemmas deliberated earlier in the chapter. The child fully engaging in the unstructured interview and dominating the course of the interaction can be viewed as incorporating a participatory agenda which allow the child to direct the process, that is, the control is not permanently with the interviewer (Fontana and Frey, 2000). One concern is that the responses given in unstructured interviews may be difficult to compare (Mukherji and Albon, 2010). As a result the body of data may not fundamentally answer the research questions. In order to achieve a more focussed result, the semi-structured approach was used in this instance to ensure that the dialogue was contributing to the aims of the research and to enable
comparisons of individual responses to the research questions. The outline of the questions can be seen in Appendix 7, however this was a starting point for the subsequent dialogue with the child which allowed a more flexible approach.

The focus group method was considered as an alternative to semi-structured interviews. According to Lancaster and Broadbent (2003), this method encourages interaction, empowerment and shared understanding, with the children being viewed as the experts. Children, especially in the early years environment, are familiar with this type of approach in activities such as ‘circle time’ or ‘shared discussions’, which usually embrace a particular theme. Disadvantages of the method identified by Mukherji and Albon (2010) include the lack of identifiable individual perspectives and the probability that some children may dominate the discussion. Therefore semi-structured interviews were chosen to establish the children’s individual perspectives on national identity and Welsh national identity rather than group viewpoints.

Scott (2008) recognised that there are practical and methodological problems associated with interviewing children. The most debated issue is that of ethics, which has tended to dominate many of the debates around research methods and children, as previously stated. Brooker (2010) considers interviews as a more intrusive method of data collection, as opposed to more passive research methods such as observations, and, as such, researchers may become party to sensitive information. Researchers need to be responsive to children’s emotional well-being during any interview situation and consider terminating the process should the child become distressed. No interviews were prematurely terminated in this study.

Data quality is an additional concern when interviewing children and Scott (2008:89) questions whether the ‘adult interviewer can obtain reliable and valid accounts from children’. As adults, it is difficult to return to the mind-set of the child and to recall that younger children tend to respond well to adult questioning (Scott, 2008). This is because within many of their daily situations both in the school and the home environment, adults question, and children are expected to reply. If children do not answer appropriately, then this is often interpreted by adults as cheeky or defiant. This then raises questions about the impartiality of the data and whether this is a valid response. Scott (2008) advises making sure that the questions are pertinent and linked to the child’s knowledge and experience, in order to make the data more meaningful. Using the drawings as prompts in this instance, enabled the questions to be focussed around what the children had produced and provided a springboard for further questioning promoting the cogency of the responses.
Peer influence is also a consideration when conducting semi-structured interviews. Scott (2008) claimed that the proximity of classmates can influence the child’s responses. Therefore the context of the interview situation is very important. Interviews were carried out in the school context and, as stated earlier, the educational environment and the behavioural norms exhibited in the classroom might have affected the children’s responses. ‘The expression of the child’s personality, in terms of behaviour and attitudinal preferences is often so context dependent,’ (Scott, 2008:92) In order to overcome peer influence and increase the reliability of the data, the children were taken to a quieter area. As well as enabling the children to voice their opinions independently, this also facilitated the recording of the interviews which would have proved difficult in the main body of the classrooms.

Other concerns in the compilation of data gathered from interviews include acquiescence, bias and social desirability (Scott, 2008). The latter, she described as being ‘heavily context dependent’ (2008:96). Removing the child from the classroom and away from their peers, may therefore reduce this social desirability bias, as the child may not feel the need to respond in the way his or her peers would expect. However, the child will still be constrained by the parameters of the setting. Scott claimed that in terms of the acquiescence bias, this can be influenced by a disapproving response from the interviewer. It is therefore essential that whilst trying to create a rapport between interviewer and interviewee, the interviewer needs to ensure that responses are objective and relevant. The effect of the researcher will be incorporated into the data analysis as this forms a fundamental part of interpretivist research. As Fielding and Thomas (2008, cited in Mukherji and Albon 2010:119) assert, interpretivist researchers ‘tend to value and analyse the effect of the researcher on the interviewee’s response’.

The interviews were recorded and then transcribed. Heritage (1984) contends that recording and transcribing interviews is advantageous for a number of reasons including allowing thorough and repeated examinations of the participants’ responses and to counter bias during the analysis process. During the interview process, the children were informed of the recording taking place and shown the Dictaphone being used. According to Walsh (2001), recording interviews may inhibit the person’s responses. There was no microphone used and the recording device was unobtrusive, but the very fact that the machine recorded the children’s responses, may have been off-putting for some participants.

3.4 The pilot project
A pilot project, or feasibility study as it is sometimes called, is described by Polit, Beck and Hungler (2001:467) ‘small scale version(s), or trial run(s), done in preparation for the major study.’ Baker (1994:182) described the piloting process as an opportunity for ‘trying out’ a particular research instrument. The aims of this pilot study were to provide an initial insight into children’s perceptions of national identity at certain ages and to establish the methodology for the main study.

Drawing on cognitive developmental findings (Axia, Bremner, Deluca and Andreasen, 1998; Barrett, 1996; Barrett and Farroni, 1996; Piaget and Weil, 1951) that suggested children do not develop concepts of national identity until the ages of 11-12 years, one class of children aged ten to eleven years was chosen and another class of children aged seven to eight years.

Being conscious of the different ways children are able to express themselves both orally and through more creative means, a range of approaches were used including drawing, writing and semi-structured interviews in the pilot study. The methods drew particularly on the work of Connolly (2006) and Pike and Waldron (2006). Connolly’s study used pictures of flags and emblems as a prompt to initiate discussions related to national or community identity; this was used with the younger pupils in this study. These national symbols are described by Moore and Kramer Moore (2004) as visible identifier to those inside and outside the country. Developmental studies have been carried out (Jahoda 1963; Weinstein 1957) which support the hypothesis that children’s knowledge of emblems increases with age, which links to views of the cognitive development theorists described above. Waldron and Pike (2006) asked children to illustrate what it means to be Irish in both writing and drawing, followed by semi-structured interviews. Therefore a multimodal approach was chosen in the pilot phase to attempt to establish how children represented their ideas through drawing and writing and how their own images could be used to prompt meaningful discussions.

A primary school situated in the South Wales Valleys was chosen as the location for the pilot study. This school is a voluntary aided Church in Wales school. The governors employ the staff, are responsible for the admissions to the school and determine the content of the religious education syllabus. A strong Anglican ethos with daily worship are key features of the school. The school was chosen primarily because I had an existing relationship with the school as a parent (my own children were not involved in the pilot study). There were no children from ethnic minority groups present in either of the classes sampled. Consent to carry out the study was sought initially from the head teacher and this
was followed by parental permission letter being sent to the relevant pupils in each class. The purpose of the research and their participation in the study was also discussed with the children during the whole class activities and then individually during the interview process.

Initially, with both classes of children, I introduced the topic via a presentation with class discussion and this was supplemented with a picture quiz (See Appendix 4) designed to initiate a relationship between researcher and participants in a relatively relaxed manner. During this activity, the children were split into groups and asked to name Welsh celebrities and figures from the world of media, politics and because of the nature of the school, religion. I decided that this was an informal way to introduce myself to the class but also to focus the children’s ideas on Welsh people in the media and even the notion of Welshness. I recognised that this may also have influenced the children’s views in terms of their responses, particularly to the drawing task, which followed on straight after the quiz.

In the class of seven to eight year olds, the children were asked to draw what they thought a Welsh person looked like and what they thought people from other countries thought a Welsh person looked like. This was followed up with semi-structured interviews, where they were asked about their own national identity and invited to discuss their drawings, in order to establish the reasoning behind their choice of images. After this, the children were shown flags and cultural symbols or emblems and asked to name them and discuss whether they had any importance for them.

In the first drawing task (What do you think a Welsh person looks like?), the children in this class tended to draw stereotypical images of Welsh people. Many of the drawings reflected characters wearing Welsh rugby jerseys or Welsh traditional costumes. Others depicted people in what they called ‘ordinary clothes’. In the subsequent interviews the children described what they had drawn but usually could not give an explanation for the reasoning behind their choices. The boys all represented their Welsh person as male and, similarly, the girls all drew female figures. This was common in both drawing tasks.

Responses to drawing task 2 (What do you think people from other countries think a Welsh person looks like?) were more varied. Some children drew characters in stereotypical clothing representative of other countries. Examples included girls dressed in saris, a boy in a kilt and a man in shorts and t-shirt wearing a hat with corks around the edge of it. When asked to explain their drawings during interviews the responses tended to reflect the idea that people from other countries would think “we might wear the same as them”
(Child 1a). Other children drew people in Welsh rugby outfits because “they think we are good at rugby” (Child 8a) and other children drew pictures of children in ordinary clothing.

All the children were able to clearly categorise themselves in terms of their nationality. The reasons used to justify these categories ranged from place of birth, nationality of parents and grandparents, parental place of birth, current or previous places of residence and where their family were located. Many of the children indicated multiple identities, for example, one child described herself as “a quarter English and the rest Welsh.” (Child 4a) Half English and half Welsh was a common category, with other describing partial English, Scottish and Irish heritages.

All the children recognised the Welsh flag. Most of the class group identified the British flag (The Union Jack) and about half of the children were able to point out the English flag. Other flags that were recognised by some of the children include the Indian flag and it transpired that this had been a class topic during the previous year, and the Scottish flag. When asked to identify their favourite flag, about a third of the class chose the Welsh flag and another third chose the Union Jack. The remaining third made miscellaneous choices with two children choosing the English flag. Both these children had either one or both parents who were English and had been born in England.

The dragon was highlighted as an important symbol by half of the class. The reasons given for this were mainly related to its inclusion on the Welsh flag and identification of the dragon as “it represents our country” (Child 11a). Other symbols that the children felt were important were the rugby ball (“I like playing rugby”- Child 25a) and the daffodil (“It reminds us of St. David” – Child 4a)

With the older age range the activity was modified based on the outcomes of the research with the seven to eight year olds. The 10-11 year olds were asked to draw a self-portrait and annotate this with their own national identity and to draw what they thought a Welsh person looked like. As with the first class, they were all then interviewed about their drawings and annotations.

The children responded well to the drawing task and completed their self-portraits enthusiastically. Some children drew themselves in school uniform, others in ordinary clothing or sporting kit. Each child defined their national identity and most of the children reflected on the reasons for their choices which were often detailed and complex. In the second drawing activity, (drawing of a Welsh person), images tended to elicit some stereotypical responses including traditional Welsh dresses and Welsh sporting jerseys as
considered earlier in this chapter and in common with the work of Hart (1997). The children were keen to annotate their drawings in response to the prompt questions provided and the majority of the children readily discussed their ideas during the interview process.

Reflecting on the research process and research instruments, the initial quiz (See example in Appendix 4) used to introduce the topic to the children and ‘break the ice’ was successful in both age ranges. Although the children in the older class (10-11 year olds) identified a greater number of the famous people depicted in the PowerPoint. The images from the quiz did not seem to affect the children’s responses in terms of the images produced in the drawing activity. Due to the success of the quiz, it was therefore decided that this introductory activity would be utilised in future.

The findings from this initial process conducted with seven to eight year olds, were published in the journal, *Education 3-13* (Murphy and Laugharne, 2011). During the data collection procedures with this group, all the children responded appropriately to the first drawing task, drawing a Welsh person. However the children’s pictures were very diverse in the second drawing task. During the interview process, some of these children found difficulty explaining what they had drawn and their rationale for this. The terminology used regarding how people from other countries viewed Welsh people, proved to be confusing for them. When many of the children were interviewed they found difficulty explaining their images and responding to questions about their own national identity. Many of the flags and cultural symbols were not recognised by the children and this led to deliberation about whether this was a beneficial exercise and if this provided any further information about the children’s perception of their own identity or Welsh national identity.

Therefore the methods were amended prior to data collection with the older children in the pilot study as described above. In the class of 10-11 year olds, they produced a self-portrait with a statement of their own national identity. All of the children in this class drew pictures of themselves and clearly ascribe to a particular national identity which they could rationalise during the interview process. The children clearly understood the task of drawing a Welsh person and, in most instances, added some annotations to their work based on a number of prompt questions. These questions asked the children to consider the physical attributes of the Welsh person that they had drawn as well as other elements, such as what language they spoke and what religion they practised. Again during the interviews, they discussed the images and the notes that they had made and the reasoning behind their pictorial and written responses. As a result of the more detailed drawings, writing and oral
contributions, the main study focussed on the older age range, although the children in the final project were in year five (nine to ten years) and the rationale for this is detailed below.

Decisions made regarding the sample schools are discussed in the next section but primarily this was influenced by the need to explore a range of multilingual and ethnically diverse settings. In both classes in the pilot study, all the children were interviewed about their drawings. This proved very time consuming and did not always elicit communicative responses from the children. In the main study a selection of children were chosen in discussion with the class teacher. This process is considered in the subsequent part of this chapter.

3.5 Sampling: School, Class, Interviews

One of the most problematic areas of a research project involves choosing the participants to take part in a research project. This is due to a number of issues including gaining access to the sample and ethical concerns which may arise during the process of establishing a viable cohort for the study. When working with children, researchers are faced primarily with the problems of gaining access to children. Depending on the chosen setting this may involve negotiation with parents, teachers and other gatekeepers before reaching the intended sample as discussed earlier. In the early planning stages of the study, it was decided that the data would be collected in a number of schools in an urban area of South Wales. The choice of location was linked to convenience and current and prior employment experience. As a former primary school teacher, I was familiar and comfortable with this type of setting, that is, the primary school and felt able to approach and work with schools and teachers. My workplace during the time of data collection, had a network of school contacts in the urban area being studied which would facilitate ease of access.

The pilot study in a school in the South Wales Valleys influenced the sampling frame for data collection. In the pilot classes there were no children from ethnic minority groups present; in the 2011 census the area concerned had 97.4 per cent of people of White ethnic origin (ONS, 2011) which was reflected in the ethnicity of the children in the school. Therefore in order to facilitate a more diverse ethnic sample for the study, one school (School A) was chosen in order to reflect a more diverse ethnic mix. This was considered to be appropriate in terms of enhancing the data collected and reflecting the multi-ethnic nature of Welsh society today.
In the 2011 census, Wales had the largest percentage of people of White ethnic group in 2011, 96 per cent (2.9 million). However, in the area where the study was carried out there was a more diverse demographic with 15 per cent of residents coming from ethnic minority groups (ONS, 2011).

Another factor identified in the pilot study was language. Wales is identified as a bilingual or even multilingual nation in government documentation and this was also evident in the results of the pilot project. The Welsh Assembly Government (2003:3) affirms the Welsh language as ‘an integral part of our national identity…and an essential and enduring component in the history, culture and social fabric of our nation. We must respect that inheritance and work to ensure that it is not lost for future generations.’ In Wales, children are taught either primarily through the medium of English with Welsh taught as a second language or through the medium of Welsh with English as a second language. The Welsh language, according to data collected in the 2001 Census, is witnessing resurgence in the numbers of Welsh speakers. The Census reported an increase from 18.5 per cent in 1991 to 21 per cent in 2001. Aitchison and Carter (2004) noted that the increase of Welsh speakers was linked to the numbers of school age pupils now identified as competent Welsh speakers. In the 2011 census, (ONS, 2011) there was a two per cent decrease in Welsh speakers, although in the area where the study was conducted there was a percentage increase, despite being viewed as a less traditional Welsh speaking region. This was attributed to the increasing numbers of younger children speaking Welsh in line with the Welsh Government’s language strategy of promoting bilingualism. In addition to this, most children in the pilot study concluded that the Welsh person they had drawn would be bilingual, speaking both English and Welsh. Thus, language was a factor when choosing the sample and a Welsh medium school (School C) was chosen as part of the sample to reflect this bilingualism. Finally, the third school (School B) mirrored the pilot school in terms of having fewer children from ethnic minority groups, although five per cent of pupils in this school were recorded as having English as an additional language (ESTYN, 2006).

3.5.1 Sample – School selection

A convenience sampling method was used as a rationale for the choice of schools. This is described by Patton (2002) as being a sampling technique which affords the researcher easy access to the participants. The schools chosen were within five miles of each other in an urban conurbation in South Wales. The majority of the children in each school came
from advantaged homes. This label of advantage was linked to the ratio of pupils accessing free school meals and was reflected in recent ESTYN (Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales) documentation as detailed below.
Table 1: Data accumulated from ESTYN documentation (2009, 2006, 2010) and Cardiff County Council (2011, 2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Number on roll</th>
<th>FSM (Free School Meal) percentage</th>
<th>English as an additional language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School A</td>
<td>478</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>37% (43% from ethnic minority background)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School B</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School C</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>4.7% (9% from homes where Welsh is the first language)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.5.2. School A

School A is located in a residential area the north-eastern section of the city. Currently there are 478 children on roll, 60 of these children from the nursery section of the school with the remaining 418 children in the primary school (Cardiff County Council, 2011). There are 14 primary classes in the school. According to the most recent inspection report, the catchment area is comprised of ‘socially and economically advantaged homes, many of them from professional families,’ (ESTYN, 2009:6) with only four per cent of pupils deemed eligible for free school meals which is below the average in Wales of 14.5 per cent (Office for National Statistics, 2011). Forty three per cent of these pupils are from an ethnic minority background (ESTYN, 2009). This report also states that ‘Thirty seven per cent of the total number of pupils speaks a language other than English at home. Eighty eight per cent of these pupils receive support in learning English. Twenty six different languages are spoken among the school population. No pupils speak Welsh as a first language.’ (ESTYN, 2009:6). Therefore the overall picture of the school depicts an affluent urban school with a diverse ethnic mix and a high proportion of bilingual or multilingual pupils.

3.5.3 School B

School B is located closer to the city centre and could be described as an inner city school. In this school there are currently 304 pupils on roll in 12 classes. The school does not have a nursery and in recent years the number of children at the school has fallen (Cardiff
County Council, 2011). The school was last inspected in 2006 and at this time there were around six per cent of pupils accessing free school meals, although the majority of children were from ‘advantaged home circumstances’ (ESTYN, 2006:6). The report also noted that around five percent of pupils speak English as a second language and these languages include ‘Bengali, Punjabi and Arabic’ (ESTYN, 2006:6). This school is not as ethnically diverse as School A, but has a slightly greater number of pupils from lower socio-economic groups claiming free school meals.

3.5.4 School C

School C is a Welsh-medium primary school located in the urban conurbation last inspected in 2010. There are currently 248 children on roll with 7 primary classes and a nursery accommodating 44 children (Cardiff County Council, 2011). According to ESTYN (2010), 50 per cent of the children who live in the catchment zones surrounding the school come from areas ‘described by the school as being neither prosperous nor economically disadvantaged’ (ESTYN, 2010:6). Fifty per cent of the pupils come from ‘an economically disadvantaged area’ (ESTYN, 2010:6). In total, 13.9 per cent of pupils access free school meals (ESTYN, 2010). The report also noted that 9.2 per cent of children come from homes where Welsh is the first language and 4.7 per cent of pupils come from an ethnic minority where first languages include Urdu and Farsi (ESTYN, 2010). This is comparable to the ethnic diversity found in School B, although in School C there are a larger number of pupils from lower socio-economic groups claiming free school meals.

3.5.5 Sample – Class selection

Following on from the pilot study described above, a sample from the age range of nine to ten years was established. The rationale for this choice centres on the existing theoretical ideas about children’s ability to engage with conversations about national identity and the experience of carrying out the pilot investigation. According to cognitive developmental theorists (Piaget and Weil, 1951; Aboud and Amato, 2001) the importance of national identity increases between five and six and 11 and 12 years. Therefore the selected age range for this study falls towards the latter part of this time frame. Similarly, social identity theorists such as Nesdale (2005), assert that children only become aware of national identity once they have assimilated views about their own group which occurs after the age of six. Thus embracing these theoretical perspectives, it can be noted that cognitive,
developmental and social identity research, affirms that by the age of ten years, children’s sense of national identity should be established.

In the pilot study, the data collection methods were conducted with two age groups, seven to eight years and 10 to 11 years. The children aged 10 to 11 years were more able to express their views regarding national identity and clarify the reasons behind their self-categorisation. The younger age range were able to assert their national identity but in some instances were unable to state the reasoning behind these choices. As a result of this piloting activity, the age range of nine to ten was chosen so that the children would be able to categorise this affiliation process and also discuss what might influence these decisions concerning national identity. After initial consultations with schools, it was affirmed that data collection within Year 6 of the primary school might be problematic in terms of interrupting the children’s studies in the penultimate year before transition to secondary education. Consequently, in response to the feedback from head teachers, the project focussed on children in Year 5.

The head teacher of each school was asked to select one class from this age range for participation in the study. Also, the teachers responsible for these classes were asked if they were happy to take part in the process of data collection. The number of pupils and gender mix varied in each class (See Table 2 below) but generally there were between twenty five to thirty participants. Females slightly outnumbered males in School A and School B. In School C there were more boys than girls in the chosen class.

In School A, there were 30 children in the class and 27 pupils (12 males and 15 females) took part in the initial data collection activity, which involved the quiz and the drawing activity. One child was absent and two children did not receive parental permission to participate in the project (this will be discussed further in the subsequent chapters). In School B, there were 25 children in the class. All children present contributed to the initial quiz and the drawing task. Twenty four children (11 males and 13 females) were present on the day of data collection. In School C, the class consisted of 30 children and all of the children participated. Twenty eight children (17 males and 11 females) were in attendance on the day that the data collection took place.
Table 2: Information on initial data sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Number of pupils in class</th>
<th>Number of males who took part in the study</th>
<th>Number of females who took part in the study</th>
<th>Total number of pupils who took part in the study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School A</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School B</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School C</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.5.6 Sample – Interview participant selection

Following on from the initial activity, a preliminary analysis of the drawing and writing took place and a sample was selected for interview in discussion with the class teacher. The class teacher was consulted as he or she had a detailed knowledge of each child in the class and therefore could advise on whether the children would be communicative in a one to one interview situation, thus facilitating the collection of spoken data. Each class teacher was asked to choose a mixed gender sample of five or six children based on the content of their drawings. This selection was also intended to reflect a varied picture in terms of the national identity of the children. The class teachers used the children’s writing and drawings to help with this selection process and in consultation with the researcher, an agreed sample was established. These children were then interviewed individually using their drawings as prompts as well as a set of questions (See Appendix 6) to support further discussion. These questions were centred on the research aims of the study and evolved from the pilot project. The children were asked to look at their drawings and annotations and discuss their national identity and the reasons why they had selected a particular category or categories. They were then requested to reflect on their image of a Welsh person and provide a rationale for the illustrations and any notes they had written.

Within qualitative research such as this, a representative sample i.e. choosing a sample that represents particular strata of the population, is not the goal. The goal of the project was to
understand the perspectives of these children in relation to national identity and Welshness rather than seeking to generalise. According to Goodwin and Goodwin (1996:115) researchers using this type of approach ‘select persons … that will yield important data on the topic of interest.’ This method of sampling could be defined as theoretical sampling (Mukherji and Albon 2010) which relies on identifying participants as the study evolves. Theoretical sampling originated from the work of Glaser and Strauss (1967) on grounded theory. For theoretical sampling to be implemented successfully, data collection and analysis need to be simultaneous. In this case the initial data collection process (the collection of drawings and annotations) informed the subsequent interview sample, thus collection and analysis were concurrent. The continuing analysis of the drawing and writing task informed the next data collection process.

Selecting specific children in order to elicit appropriate data could also be defined as purposive. Purposive sampling as described by Patton (2002:40) is linked to selecting ‘information-rich and illuminative’ cases for in-depth study. These cases are chosen because they support detailed exploration of the research questions. Coyne (1997) states that the terms ‘theoretical’ and ‘purposive’ are used synonymously and interchangeably in qualitative studies. From the definitions above, there are similarities between both approaches; however due to the nature of the data collection and analysis processes, the sampling is more aligned with the theoretical sampling framework.

3.6 Procedure for carrying out the study

The head teachers of the schools were contacted via telephone to introduce the project and discuss whether taking part was feasible. A meeting was then arranged so that I could visit the school to explain the study further. This was then followed up with a letter which contained detailed information about the research project (See Appendix 2). Also contained in this pack were examples of the leaflet for the children (See Appendix 1) and the resources that would be used during the project (See Appendices 5 and 6).

During this initial meeting with the head teachers, dates were organised to facilitate an introductory visit to meet the chosen class teachers and classes. Parental letters were distributed at this juncture. Following on from this, I spent half a day in each classroom familiarising myself with the children and teachers. This was to get to know the children and the teacher so that they would feel at ease during the data collection processes. Further dates were arranged to return to the schools in order to begin the data collection process.
I attended each school in order to carry out the first stage of the data collection process, which was a whole class quiz activity (See Appendix 4) designed to familiarise and focus the children’s ideas about national identity. This was then followed by the children undertaking drawings with any annotations they wished to include.

The drawings were then examined as a preliminary analysis in terms of their content and the accompanying notes made by the children. From this analysis, a sample of children for interview was selected. The decision regarding those children chosen for interview was made in conjunction with the class teacher from looking at their drawings and identifying whether these children would be communicative during the interview process. The drawings and writing was used to establish a varied sample. A date was then arranged for completion of the interviews. The final stage of the process involved the researcher returning to the schools to thank the relevant staff and children and to give some feedback on the initial results of the project. This procedure was then repeated in Schools B and C.

Table 3: Data collection process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Initial meeting with head teacher</th>
<th>Visit to class</th>
<th>Whole class data collection</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School A</td>
<td>8/9/11</td>
<td>28/9/11</td>
<td>14/10/11</td>
<td>19/10/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School C</td>
<td>6/2/13</td>
<td>7/3/13</td>
<td>14/3/13</td>
<td>21/3/13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen in the above table, the data collection process for schools A and B took place over a three month period from September 2011 to November 2011. During this time, I also sought to gain access into School C, a Welsh-medium primary school within the five mile radius established for the sample. Initial contact was made with a Welsh-medium school in July 2011, but it proved very difficult to follow this up, despite sending written details of the project and telephoning on several occasions. Therefore, the data collection began in schools A and B during the autumn term but not at School C. An alternative Welsh-medium primary school was found within a five mile radius of schools A and B, which was willing to grant access for data collection. Hence there was a substantial gap in the data collection cycle. An assessment of the possible impact of this delay is discussed in the evaluation of the methodology.
3.7 Data analysis

The analysis of the research data collected is the fundamental part of any study and determines the outcomes of the project. According to Edwards (2010), analysis of qualitative data usually involves content analysis. Edwards (2010:132) describes this as ‘a process of combing the evidence’ and reflects on whether this is of a fine or broad nature, depending on the purpose of the study. In this investigation into children’s perceptions of their own national identity and Welsh national identity, the data analysis was varied in nature, with a large amount of multimodal data. The accumulated responses from the children were represented in pictorial, written and oral formats and therefore interpretation of the data involved identifying a way to evaluate the content of each mode of representation separately but also to link these together to formulate generic themes emerging from the information.

In this instance, it was the children’s drawings which formed the link between the written and oral data, centring the visual representations at the core of the data collection process. The children annotated these drawings and then a sample of the children went on to discuss them. The child and the interviewer were linked in a ‘three-way dynamic engagement’ (Leitch 2008:54). Leitch goes on to describe the image as the ‘third party’ in the interview process and as such, this visual representation exerts influence over the researcher and the research participants. The figure below is adapted from Leitch (2008) and reflects the analytical processes involved in this study with the interview firmly located in the dynamic occurring between researcher, child and image. Leitch argues that the use of the visual image enhances the narrative processes enabling children to communicate their experiences to others.

![Figure 4. The research dynamic](image-url)
3.7.1 Analysis of children’s drawings

The examination of visual data is complex and the use of pictures and drawings can be problematic in terms of the process of analysis. Critics of visual methods cite the reflexive and interpretative nature of the analysis as problematic. Atkinson (2002) stated that criticisms often focus around the need for objectivity in the process of analysis and the need to produce reliable and generalised data. He also goes on to explore the method of analysis used in visual projects, with many researchers purporting the use of ‘grounded theory’ (Glaser and Strauss, 1967) as the primary interpretative tool. Atkinson (2002) questioned whether studies using visual methods just reaffirm existing theories, rather than challenging or changing these ideas. In previous studies that included visual data such as drawings or photographs, content analysis was used to draw conclusions from the images and was largely quantitative in nature. Bell (2001:34) discussed how content analysis can be used to ‘make quantitative generalizations about visual and other forms of representation.’ Silverman (2000) stated that the content analysis of visual data can generate both quantitative and qualitative elements. Merriman and Guerin (2006) debated two approaches to analysing children’s drawings, a projective approach which sees the drawings as data to be analysed by the researcher and an alternative approach which focuses on the content rather than the interpretation. In their study of street children in Kolkata, they asked the children to draw a picture of the sort of person they wanted to be when they grow up. They used the latter method to dissect the visual data collected and used content analysis to identifying recurrent themes, using the work of Stiles and Gibbons (2000) as model for this mode of analysis. As stated earlier the drawings collected in the present study were analysed primarily relating to the subject matter or content of the image that the child had drawn.

Burkitt et al. (2003) asserted that children’s drawings can reveal positive or negative feelings about the topic area. These feelings can be analysed in terms of the size of the objects drawn, their spatial disposition and the colours used. Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) sought to define a visual grammar in order to interpret meaning from the visual image and would term this type of analysis as the ideational meaning i.e. what the image says. Kress and Van Leeuwen also discussed interpersonal meaning in relation to how the image interacts with its intended audience as well as textual meaning. The latter term refers to how the elements of the drawing interact such as colour and size of objects.

when she referred to the images that the children produced as a reaction to the text. This is similar to Kress and van Leeuwen’s ideational meaning. Rabey then went on to reflect on the overall effect and internal structure of the drawings, again comparable to Kress and van Leeuwen’s ideational meaning and textual meaning.

In the present study, the focus of the analysis of the drawings was principally concerned with the actual content of the depiction, although colour and the sizing and positioning of the images were also taken into account. This approach was similar to Merriman and Guerin’s (2006) study and comparable to Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) ideational meaning. The numbers of drawings collected during the study (approximately 150 images), supported the necessity to focus on the image content, the drawings produced by the children (two drawings per child) were scrutinized in terms of what the image represented in relation to the two research aims of the project. Initially children were asked to draw themselves and these drawings were considered as a set of data and then, similarly they drew pictures of a Welsh person. Themes were identified in both sets of data via an initial sifting process to become familiar with the data (See Appendix 8). This was repeated until specific patterns emerged. The frequency of the occurrence of these themes was established. The form of analysis used for the drawings is akin to the constant comparative method (Thomas, 2009). This type of content analysis allows for qualitative enquiry into the subject matter of the drawings as well as the quantitative element of how many times specific themes occur. Merriman and Guerrin (2006) applied a similar approach when interpreting their data, establishing the occupations featured in the children’s drawings and the number of times they occurred. This can add depth to the study as the quantitative element of the data analysis supports the thematic nature of the overall qualitative examination.

A further consideration in the analysis of the children’s drawings of a Welsh person, was the annotations which some children made on the drawings. The children were given a number of questions (See Appendix 6) to consider when they were undertaking the task. They were given the option to annotate their drawing and many of the children wrote around their drawings creating multimodal responses (See Appendix 8). This written data was analysed separately, as described below.

In addition to this, the internal structure Rabey (2003), of the children’s work was considered. This concept is akin to Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) idea of textual meaning, which focuses on the colour, size and positioning of the image. Both sets of data were examined to establish whether the use of colour was specific to each individual
drawing, or if there were significant recurrent trends in each school or indeed throughout all three settings. When reflecting on the use of colour, the timescale allowed for the activity was curtailed in some schools which sometimes impacted on the children’s ability to use colour. Similarly, the sizing and positioning of the images was considered in order to establish any noteworthy patterns. Although the use of colour, the sizing and positioning of the image were considered, these factors were not analysed in as much detail as the content of the image. The main analysis aim was to examine the content of the images.

Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) discussed interpersonal meaning in examining images. This was not considered as part of the analytical process, since the children were not asked to produce a drawing for a particular audience. In this instance, the drawings were used as a tool for expressing the children’s ideas about national identity. Nevertheless, it could be argued that as the researcher, I was the audience for this particular pictorial representation. Cochran-Smith and Lytle (1993:58) maintain that teacher researchers interpret images from an ‘insider’ perspective. Their assessment of teacher research maintains that ‘when teacher researchers turn their attention to something like children’s drawings, they bring a historical framework based on a thousand other drawings and what these drawings meant for particular children in real school time’ (Cochran-Smith and Lytle, 1993:58). As a former primary school teacher, I am aware that the images presented may be interpreted through an interpretive viewpoint based on my own experiences in teaching. This will be explored further in the evaluation of the methodology.

The drawings were used as a tool to understand more about of the child’s perceptions of their own national identity and Welsh national identity. The drawings provided the connection between the visual and the oral data collected. The form of analysis used for the drawings complements the constant comparative method (Thomas, 2009) which was the primary method used in the analysis of the interview transcripts and the annotations. Comparing the visual data and establishing key themes in terms of content enabled a cohesive response to both visual and oral data. Themes emerging from the annotations, transcribed interview data and the visual data combined to create a thematic map of the accumulated data as evidenced in Chapters 4 and 5.

3.7.2 Analysis of annotations and interview data

Following the interpretivist approach the analysis of the annotations and interview data was conducted using the constant comparative method defined by Glaser and Strauss in 1967 in their grounded theory approach and later by Thomas (2009). According to
Thornberg (2012) the grounded theorist seeks to code the data by scrutinising every word or line. He went on to say that these codes are provisional and can be refined or changed throughout the continuing process of data analysis. This primary stage is termed as open coding (Glaser, 1978; Strauss and Corbin, 1990). Using the constant comparative method data is measured against data and code against code to establish connections and inconsistencies. ‘Comparisons that are highly regarded increase the internal validity of the findings,’ (Boeije, 2002:393).

The next stage of the analysis was termed by Glaser (1978) as ‘focused coding’ where one category or code supports the next stage of data gathering and coding. Charmaz (2000) described focused coding as where the most noteworthy or frequent codes are established to enable the researcher to sift through the data rather than only one code. The third phase of coding in grounded theory is termed theoretical coding. Thornberg (2012) explained how in this process the researcher analyses how the codes generated from the data link to existing theories or theoretical models. According to Glaser (1978), these theories may be drawn from different disciplines to support the coherence of the study.

According to Boeije (2002:393), the constant comparative method goes hand in hand with theoretical sampling, whereby ‘the researcher decides what data will be gathered next and where to find them on the basis of revisionary theoretical ideas.’ Although the sample for the main study was based on a convenience rather than a theoretical basis, the rationale for choosing the types of schools was constructed around the limited diversity seen in the pilot setting. The pilot project was carried out in a monolingual school, where there was no children from ethnic minority backgrounds. The main body of data was collected in suitable locations within a five mile radius of my workplace and the settings were multi-ethnic and multilingual in composition. Where the analysis for this study differs essentially from the constant comparative method, is that the examination of the data was not used as a tool to go forward and seek out further data. However, a constant comparative approach of analysis was used to scrutinise the data.

In this study, in order to investigate the data generated by the children in the form of annotations, a three stage process of analysis was established. This was similar to the five stage process described by Boeije (1999:395), in his work which was undertaken with couples dealing with Multiple Sclerosis. Boeije used a five stage method to compare the interview data collected as part of his study and shown below:
1. Comparison within a single interview.
2. Comparison between interviews within the same group.
3. Comparison of interviews from different groups.
4. Comparison in pairs at the level of the couple.
5. Comparing couples.

A staged approach was applied to each mode of data in the current project. The stages of data analysis are detailed below:

1. Examination of data on the child’s view of national identity in their drawing
2. Comparison of data on national identity in each class
3. Comparison of data on national identity in all three schools

The data was firstly analysed by investigating the children’s identification of their own national identity (See Appendix 8), including the order in which the children recorded their identity categories. Then I compared the written data in each school setting identifying how many times specific identities were recorded. Following on from this, the data sets gathered in all three schools were evaluated and assessed against each other.

The annotations on the drawings in relation to their drawings of a Welsh person were scrutinised in a similar way. The children were given questions as prompts to support their ideas when creating their pictures. Most of the children based their annotations around these questions. The questions are listed in Appendix 6.

The analysis concentrated on each individual child’s written comments and then focusing on the data accumulated in each school to identify any common responses and the frequency of these responses. Finally, the annotated data sets on Welsh national identity generated in all three schools were evaluated and assessed against each other. The stages were as follows:

1. Examination of data on Welsh national identity in general documented in each drawing
2. Comparison of data on Welsh national identity in each class
3. Comparison of data on Welsh national identity between all three schools

Interpretation of the interviews was more complicated and therefore required a six stage approach. The interviews were carried out with a small sample (five or six children) from
each school, chosen in conjunction with the class teachers. The children were interviewed using their drawings and their annotations as a tool to support the discussion. During the course of the interview, the children were asked to consider their national identity and why they had categorised themselves in that way, focusing on their drawing of themselves (See Appendix 9). Secondly, using the drawing of a Welsh person, they were asked about the characteristics of the person they had drawn (initial analysis of this can be seen in Appendix 8). Again the data was analysed in a sequential manner as detailed below:

1. Examination of spoken data on national identity discussed in each interview
2. Comparison of spoken data on national identity within each class
3. Comparison of spoken data on national identity within all three schools
4. Examination of spoken data on Welsh national identity within each interview
5. Comparison of spoken data on Welsh national identity within each class
6. Comparison of spoken data on Welsh national identity within all three schools

Therefore, the resultant data analysis processes allowed rigorous examination of the data gained from each participant and comparisons between children, classes and schools. I was able to establish specific themes emerging from the data collection process and to cross reference the themes to the aims of the study.

3.8 Evaluation of methodology

When conducting a research project, it is essential to assess the processes and methods used to generate the main body of data. This evaluation includes looking at the suitability of the research design, as well as, establishing the effectiveness of the data collection processes and the sampling procedures. The main problem regarding the ethics of this project was around the issue of gaining permission to carry out the research project in a selection of schools. This was not problematic initially as the two English-medium schools readily agreed to grant access to the setting in order to facilitate the data gathering exercises. Hence the data collection process in Schools A and B took place during the Autumn term of 2011. However, securing entry to the Welsh-medium school proved more difficult. One Welsh-medium school was approached and initially I was asked to wait a few months for various events in the school to take place and then make contact again. After many attempts to engage in dialogue about the project, there was very little progress in acquiring permission to carry out the study in this school. Therefore, another Welsh-medium school was contacted and this time the school was willing to allow me to engage with the children at that school. Data collection took place in this school during Spring.
Term 2013. This was over a year after the other sets of data were collected. It could be argued that the gap in the data collection process could have some impact on the results, as the data was collected with a different cohort of children, that is, the children in Schools A and B were in year five during 2011-12 whereas the children in School C were in year five during the academic year 2012-2013. In summary, the children examined in the English-medium schools were in the same school year which was different to the children in the Welsh-medium school. In terms of reliability, this could be deemed as problematic as their school experiences and possibly their cultural involvements, in terms of engaging with significant national events, may have been dissimilar. However, the data did not reveal significantly different responses in the Welsh-medium school which could be attributed to this delay in collecting the children’s responses.

Once the sample of schools had been established, the next consideration was how to choose the participants. The year five group had been established after the pilot study. The head teacher in each school recommended which classes would be used. In schools B and C, there was only one year five class, but in school A there were two year 5 classes. The head teacher choose a specific class in School A based on the timetabling of the data collection and the willingness of the class teacher to participate. When selecting children for the follow up interviews, I worked in conjunction with the class teacher to establish which children would be likely to be communicative during one to one interviews. The images and annotations also guided the selection as well as a need to reflect a balanced view in terms of gender and different national identities. Therefore, staff at the schools had a significant impact on shaping the project via the choice of participants. This could be viewed positively, as the teachers had detailed knowledge of the pupils in the class and therefore could advise the researcher accordingly with regard to the suitability of the chosen participants. However, it is the case that the method of selection relied in part on the judgement of a different person in each school. Also, this could be construed as having an ethical impact, as the data in each school was shared with the class teacher and therefore the action could be seen as breaching confidentiality.

Another ethical concern was the method used to gain parental permission. In consultation with the respective head teachers and class teachers in each school, an opt-out format was used in the parental permission letter (See Appendix 3). Parents were required to return the completed proforma if they did not want their child to participate in the research process. This opting out process can be described as passive consent whereby parents are required to retract their consent by, in this case, signing the required slip and returning this to the
school, thus not allowing their children to participate. Critics of this approach of comment that when researchers use passive approaches, parents may not engage with the information provided or in other scenarios they may not have received the information (Unger et al., 2004). However, Kirk (2007) argues that when the research is low risk and this study would be deemed as such according to the BERA (2011) guidelines, then this passive consent is less of a problem. This is challenged by Punch (2002) who supports the needs for fully informed active rather than passive parental consent.

The central rationale for using passive consent in this instance was to recruit an appropriate number of participants to the study. In schools B and C, all of the children in each of the classes chosen were given parental permission to participate. Two children in school A were not given permission by their parents to take part. Here the class teacher thought that the children in question might have decided that they did not want to take part in the research activities, although there was no documented evidence to support this as the parents were not asked to provide a reason for non-participation on the consent form. A recent investigation (Spence, Adamson, White and Matthews, 2014) into participation rates, found that passive parental consent led to higher participation rates and a more representative sample. The investigation with 11-12 years old children who were involved in a dietary study also advocated that passive consent can support equality of opportunity as more children have the chance to take part in the research process. The number of children taking part in this project supports the premise that passive consent does result in higher participation rates. In this study, there were several processes employed to safeguard the participants including seeking consent from school staff and giving the opportunity for parents and children to opt out if they wished. Therefore as the safeguarding procedures were robust, this reduced the ethical implications to a minimum.

Permission was gained informally from the children at all stages via discussions at each stage of the data collection process. The notions of children giving permission in this type of context, that is the school setting, is debated in the ethical considerations section 3.2. All of the pupils appeared content to participate in the data collection processes.

The children were given a template which restricted the size of the image as seen in Appendix 5. This was researcher led and designed to provide a consistent approach across the settings and improve the reliability of the data in that the images could be compared more easily. Again this approach linked to my own experiences as a primary school teacher in trying to support and scaffold the children’s responses. All of the children were
able to create an image for each of the two drawing tasks. The children were given guidance regarding the subject of their drawing and therefore, using this technique cannot be described as wholly participatory, as the researcher governed the remit for the theme of these depictions. The use of guidance and a specified template may have impacted on the spontaneity and creativity of some children. On a positive note, this more prescriptive approach added to the quality and volume of data generated by the study.

Alongside the template for their drawings the children were also given prompt questions to support their drawings and annotations of a Welsh person. As considered above, my rationale for using both the drawing template and the prompt questions was to help scaffold the development of the children’s ideas, represented in their drawings and writing. According to Hudson, Lane and Mercer (2005:474) ‘teachers often use prompts to produce a facilitative priming effect on children’s writing.’ Although the template could have restricted the size of the images drawn, the prompt questions regarding their views of a Welsh person appeared to have a greater impact on their images and writing. Hudson, Lane and Mercer’s investigation suggested that prompts were used meaningfully by the children if the topic they were writing about was appealing. In general, their annotations around the Welsh person drawings were mainly focussed around answering the prompt questions. The impact of the prompt questions could also be seen in the drawings, for example, some children drew images that they thought were important to Welsh people in their pictures. When evaluating the prompt questions, some of these proved challenging for some of the children particularly when asked to consider physical characteristics of a Welsh person. On reflection, physical characteristics could have been assessed through the visual representations and the use of follow-up questions during the interview process. The impact of the prompt questions will be analysed further in Chapter 6 and in the conclusion of the thesis.

When the drawing activities were implemented in each school, the class teacher and the school timetable governed when the events could take place. In school A and school C, the children had less time (about 15 minutes less in both cases) to complete the drawing and annotation tasks, as there were other curricular inputs happening which required the children to leave the classroom. This affected their drawings, as many were unable to use colour in their drawing due to time restrictions.

The literacy skills of some of the children varied and this was reflected in their ability to annotate their pictures, both in terms of the quality of the writing but perhaps more
noticeably, in the quantity of the writing used to accompany the images. However the amount of writing may also have been affected by the timing issues described in the previous paragraph. According to Clarke (2012) evidence proposes that only half of pupils surveyed on behalf of the Literacy Trust in 2011, think they are average at writing and therefore, may not have the confidence to express their ideas successfully. Lack of confidence in their ability to write may have had some impact, however a strength of the study is the use of a range of methods to explore the children’s perceptions and taking account of their drawings and verbal feedback alongside their written responses.

Environmental issues can influence the responses given in the settings. In school A, the topic for the term was World War 2 and this was characterised by Union Jack bunting displayed around the classroom. The data in school A was collected on the day before the Welsh rugby team were due to play an important match in the semi-finals of the Rugby World Cup of 2011 in New Zealand. But this was not especially evident in the data for that school. However, the children had participated in an assembly that morning and one child drew an image of a farmer when drawing a Welsh person which seemed to be consistent with the theme of the assembly. This child played the farmer in the presentation. In school B, the classroom had many images of the sporting achievements attained by the school. In tandem with this, the class teacher had an additional responsibility for coordinating physical education and team sports throughout the school. The Welsh football player Gareth Bale, had a connection with the school and these sporting references could clearly be seen in the images of a Welsh person drawn by the children in school B.

One to one semi-structured interviews were adopted to establish individual perspectives of national identity and Welsh national identity. During the interview process, the children displayed generally positive emotions and no interviews were terminated prematurely. Drawbacks to this approach include withdrawing the child from their usual environment which may have made the child less comfortable. Generally the children were taken to rooms that they were familiar with as part of their normal school routine. In Schools A and B, the children were taken to a small room away from their normal classroom and in both instances, it was just the researcher and the child present. Thus the conversations between the child and the researcher were completely confidential and the children could express themselves freely without interruption. In School C, the interviews were carried out in a busy library where there were other teachers and pupils nearby. Consequently, the children did not exhibit detailed and uninhibited responses in comparison to the children interviewed in the other two schools. I also found it difficult to maintain the attention of
the children and needed to encourage them to focus on the image and the interview questions in such a hectic location. In attempting to record interviews in the busy school library, the quality of the sound recording was also compromised at times when there was significant background noise.

The other perhaps most significant feature to consider in School C, was the language of the school in contrast to the language of the researcher. School C was the Welsh-medium school and I am unable to speak Welsh fluently. However all children in this class were proficient in English and for many this was their first language. As a result of this, I led the quiz and the drawing task with support from the teacher. She translated some of the instructions to the task into Welsh and intervened where necessary. Interviews were conducted in English. The results of the drawing task was comparable to the other two schools. However, the responses in the interviews were not as extended as in the other two schools. This may have been associated with the language used in the interview process, English, which was in contrast to the school language, Welsh. However, the environmental influences may have had more of an impact as discussed above, as the interviews were not carried out in a confidential space.

Reflecting on the interview process further, Jones and Tannock (2000) comment on the relationship between the teacher-researcher and children being interviewed. The researcher who was formally a primary school teacher, spent two afternoons in each setting, initially collecting the visual and written data and the returning the following week to collect the interview data. Walford (1991 cited in Jones and Tannock, 2000) contends that long term involvement can be beneficial for the quality of the data as well as the reliability and validity. My own job commitments did not allow for prolonged interventions in all three schools. Yin, (1994, cited in Jones and Tannock, 2000) on the other hand considers the aspect of over familiarity with the students as raising the potential for bias. In the present study, the limited time spent in the school did not allow for any biases towards particular children and, as the researcher was independent to the school, their responses were not compromised through familiarity with that person. As discussed earlier in this chapter, the class teacher was instrumental in choosing the children for interview which may have, to an extent, compromised impartiality in the sampling process.

This chapter has considered all aspects of the research process, including the ethics, sampling, methods of data collection and analyses. The evaluation of the methodology has reflected upon a number of issues around the sample, including acquiring access to the schools and the range of participants with diverse literacy and creative abilities. There were
also environmental considerations which may have impacted on the results. The data were collected across three different schools, therefore each setting was individual in terms of ethos and environment despite having shared curricula goals. The effect of the researcher on the study has also been explored and of the other adults participating in the sampling procedures. In the subsequent chapter, the results are analysed and presented in line with the two research aims: that is, children’s perceptions of their own national identity and their ideas about Welsh national identity.
Chapter 4: Children’s perceptions of their own national identity

The data sources have been analysed in accordance with the research questions which focus on children’s perceptions of their own national identity, as well as their observations of Welsh national identity. The analysis in this chapter specifically scrutinised children’s perceptions of their individual national identity. Initially, the evaluations were based on their annotations and drawings. This is followed by an exploration of their justifications for their choices using the material gathered in the interviews. Children’s perceptions of Welshness and Welsh national identity will be discussed in the next chapter, also using their drawings, annotations and the interview transcripts.

A quiz activity (See example in Appendix 4) was conducted in each of the three schools in the study and after this, the children were asked to complete a self-portrait and categorise themselves in terms of their own national identity as described in Chapter 3. They were asked to draw themselves on the left of the template (See Appendix 5) that was provided and then complete the sentence ‘I am …’ with their ideas about their own national identity. A total of 79 children participated in the study (27 in School A, 24 in School B and 28 in School C). An initial analysis of the drawing and writing produced in the class activities was conducted. After this a sample of children from each school was selected for interview. Six children were interviewed in School A, five children in schools B and C.

During the interview process the children were asked to discuss the reasoning behind their self-categorisations of national identity displayed in the annotations of their drawings. The children’s drawings formed the link between the written and oral data, centring the visual representations at the core of the data collection process. The child, his or her drawing and the interviewer were linked in a ‘three-way dynamic engagement’ (Leitch, 2008:54) as described and illustrated by Figure 4 in Chapter 3.

In School A, 27 children participated in the group quiz about famous Welsh people and the initial individual drawing and writing activity. Two children were not allowed to take part in the activity, as parental permission was not granted. When the class teacher was asked to consider why these children were not taking part, she felt it may have been related to the children selecting to opt out of the activity rather than parents objecting to them taking part. According to the class teacher, both the children could be considered as Welsh in terms of their national identity and they were not from an ethnic minority group. In
general, the children who participated appeared enthusiastic to take part in the quiz which was designed as an introductory activity to enable the children to begin to think about national identity and what it means to be Welsh. During this, and also throughout the drawing activity, the children worked in their usual classroom groups and sat in their own allocated seats. The activity took place on the eve of the Rugby World Cup semi-final in New Zealand. The Welsh Rugby team were playing France in this important match; this was challenging for me initially, as there was concern regarding the possible effect of an escalation of nationalistic fervour linked to this sporting event. However, from their responses in the quiz, this match did not seem to have any effect on the class in terms of an increased interest in rugby or general positive interest in Wales. In fact, although there were several high profile Welsh international rugby players depicted in the quiz, the children were not able to identify these sportsmen. Largely, it was observed that during the quiz, many of the children did not seem aware of Welsh celebrities or sporting and cultural personalities. Following on from the quiz the children completed the drawing activity and again they were keen to participate. The children were given the option to annotate their work if they wished to.

On returning to the school the next week, six children were interviewed using their drawings and annotations as prompts. Interviews took place in an activity room, located away from the main classroom, which was quiet and allowed the children opportunities to respond in a relatively private environment. The children proved to be responsive when asked a series of questions using their drawings and annotations. Most of the participants gave detailed answers regarding the rationale for their drawings and the comments they had written.

In School B, 24 children participated in the quiz and initial drawing and writing activity. All children present on the day were able to participate as parental permission was gained from the whole class. There was one child absent on the day that the data was collected. The children who participated appeared very enthusiastic to take part in the quiz (more so than the children in School A) and they appeared to enjoy the element of competition in the activity. Throughout the quiz and also during the course of the drawing activity, the children worked in their usual classroom groups at their normal activity tables. The results of the initial quiz revealed that the children in this class were very aware of Welsh celebrities, cultural and sporting figures, with most of the groups recognising the famous people shown to them. They were particularly knowledgeable about Welsh sportsmen and women. This emphasis on sports may be related to the learning environment which had
displays relating to school sporting achievements and the class teacher was also the sports coach in the school. This sporting ethos was also evident in the competitive nature of the class during the quiz activity. The quiz was followed by the drawing/writing activity and the children appeared to be very engaged in the task.

In this school, five children took part in the interview process approximately seven days later. Interviews were conducted in a quiet room near to the school library. The children were eager to talk about the pictures and the writing that they had produced. There were no interruptions to the interview process.

In School C (the Welsh-medium school), 28 children participated in the quiz and initial drawing and writing activity. All children present on the day were able to participate as parental permission was gained from the whole class. There were two children absent on the day that the data was collected. In general, the children who participated appeared very willing to take part in the quiz and there appeared to be friendly rivalry amongst the groups in the class. The usual classroom layout consisted of tables set out in rows with two children sitting together. During the quiz, the children were grouped in fours and then they returned to their normal seats (in pairs) to complete the drawing activity. The results of the initial quiz revealed that the children in this school had very little knowledge of the Welsh celebrities or the cultural and sporting figures shown in the PowerPoint presentation described in the methodology section. One group seemed to be more knowledgeable than the rest of the class. The children sat in twos for the drawing and writing activity and were engaged in the task.

In School C the interviews were conducted in a busy school library, where there were other children and staff present during the interview process. This was distracting for the children participating in the interviews and also for me, as it was sometimes difficult to hear the children’s responses. Subsequently it was also difficult to record their answers due to the level of background noise. Although the children in the school are taught through the medium of Welsh, only 9.2 per cent of the children in the school are from homes where Welsh is the first language (ESTYN, 2010). Interviews were conducted in English and all the children seemed able to converse well and understand the questions. In one instance a member of staff who was in the library and had been present in the classroom during the initial quiz activity, prompted one of the interviewees by giving them the Welsh equivalent for a word. The children being interviewed were definitely aware that other parties were listening to their responses, that is, the teachers and fellow pupils using the library and this
may have had some possible adverse effect on their responses. Subsequently their responses and interview transcripts in School C were shorter than in the other two schools.
4.1 Analysis of children’s self-portraits - Image content

As discussed earlier, children were asked to create a self-portrait to accompany their written statement regarding their own national identity. The sections below discuss the analysis of the images produced. When examining the pictures produced by the children, image content was the main consideration, together, to a lesser extent, with use of colour and the sizing and positioning of the image. A content analysis approach, as described in the previous chapter, was used which links to similar methods seen in the work of Merriman and Guerrin (2006) and Stiles and Gibbons (2000). Emerging themes were identified in terms of image content. Then the frequency of their occurrence was determined. This was in line with constant comparative method described by Thomas (2009) and others as described in Chapter 3.7.1. Use of colour and the sizing and positioning of the image was evaluated in order to establish whether these were specific to individual drawings or if there were significant trends in each school, or indeed throughout all three settings. However, the primary focus for the analysis revolved around the image content.

4.1.1 School A self-portrait - Image content

In school A, 23 of the children (27 in total) represented themselves in everyday clothing. Three boys and one girl depicted themselves in school clothing. One girl drew herself wearing the hijab. Twenty out of the twenty seven children taking part drew just head and shoulders in the drawing space, whereas seven pupils depicted the whole or majority of their head and body in the drawing (the children were not given any guidance regarding whether they should draw a fully body image or just head and shoulders). In this school, the children did not add any other objects within the drawing of themselves. However, a few of the children did include some writing on their clothing. One girl wrote ‘I am me’ (Figure 5 below) and four boys who had drawn themselves in school uniform wrote the name of the school or the school logo. One of these children also wrote Cardiff City (located on the boy’s jumper) in their drawing. Another pupil wrote the name Jim (this was not his actual name) on his jumper and six stars, see Figure 6 below.
The drawing seen in Figure 5 gives an indication of how this girl feels about herself, as well as writing ‘I am me’ on her t-shirt, she also wrote ‘I am Welsh’ above the drawing. This may signpost that she had a definite notion about her own national identity, Welsh, and a strong view of how she saw herself in general which is conveyed via the ‘I am me’ comment. Image 2 (Figure 6) is not straight forward to interpret, as essentially the boy has given himself an alternative name. The stars maybe an indication of the reward system used in the school, or just a decoration. Neither child participated in the interview process, therefore it is difficult to establish concrete conclusions from their drawings.

4.1.2 School B self-portrait - Image content

In School B, 23 children took part in the drawing activity and in this school. There was more time allocated to the drawing activity due to the way that the timetable was constructed in this school. Nineteen children represented themselves in everyday clothing. One child drew herself performing a violin piece. In her annotation she describes herself as wearing an ‘uncomfortable dress for a concert’ (See Figure 7 below). Three boys drew themselves in football kit or sports clothing and one girl drew herself wearing a football shirt. Only one child chose to draw just their head and shoulders, all the other children drew full body images. In many of these drawings the children drew lots of objects which linked to their hobbies and interests. Sporting apparatus, that is, footballs, tennis rackets and cricket bats featured in seven drawings. Musical instruments or equipment were depicted in four drawings. Animals including cats, a horse (plus riding gear), a giraffe and a lion occurred in four drawings. As stated previously, the learning environment, particularly the displays and photographs in the room, had a sporting emphasis and the class teacher was the coach of the football team. This may have impacted on children’s
choices when drawing themselves and their interests. The additional time allowed for the activity in this school may also correspond with the level of detail in their drawings.

Figure 7: School B Image 1

The girl in the image above (Figure 7) has drawn herself in a dress which she wears when performing at violin concerts. She has also depicted her violin, her bow and her music stand with her Grade exam pieces. Including this instrument and the music reflects the child’s perception of what is important to her in terms of her identity. She discussed her violin playing in the subsequent interview and commented that she was practising hard in order to progress and thus this clearly influenced the way in which she saw herself.

‘Well, I learn violin in Cyncoed, I used to learn violin in school then I didn’t level up that much so my mum said if you want to level up more, get better, maybe I can go to a private school. Then I agreed and I just levelled up really quickly.’ (School B, interview 3)

This girl, who identified herself as Japanese, was interviewed as part of the data collection process. When asked about her reasoning behind her choice of national identity, she said this was because both her parents were Japanese and she herself had been born in Japan and that she hadn’t been in Wales for very long.
Figure 8 indicates this boy’s interest in sport with a tennis racket and football in the drawing. As stated above, sport and sporting achievements were something that was celebrated in this classroom with many images of sports teams, trophies and other memorabilia displayed around the room which may have impacted on his picture. His national identity was defined as Welsh/English and American. This child was not interviewed after the drawing and writing activity.

4.1.3 School C Self-portrait - Image content

In School C, 28 children took part in the drawing activity. Nine children represented themselves in everyday clothing and 13 children drew themselves in school uniform. Four male children were depicted wearing sporting kit (three of these were wearing football shorts and shirts). One child drew themselves as a knight in armour (See Figure 9) and one child drew themselves wearing a red outfit. Only one child chose to draw just their head and shoulders, all the other children drew full body images. A football appeared alongside the child in a football kit in one of the drawings. A dog featured in two drawings, alongside the knight in one instance. One drawing was particularly interesting, where a girl had drawn herself surrounded by writing (See Figure 10). The writing is very much focussed around her justification for national identity. When categorising herself, the girl wrote that
she was Welsh but a little bit English and then wrote the following around the image she had drawn: ‘I am Welsh but I grew up talking English. I am only Welsh because I am in Wales and because I go to a Welsh school. I am glad’. This child was not interviewed as part of the process as the participants were chosen in collaboration with the class teacher as described in the methodology chapter. However, she clearly had strong feeling regarding her national identity and the reasoning behind this, which is linked to birthplace and the school she attended which was a Welsh-medium school. No other children annotated their self-portraits, as this was not directly suggested to the children in the introduction to the activity.

Figure 9: School C Image 1
Figure 10: School C Image 2

4.1.4 Overview of findings: self-portraits – Image content

The results of the self-portrait activity show similarities and differences in terms of the way in which the children drew themselves. There were several recurrent themes including everyday clothing, school uniform and sporting kit. In schools A and B, the most common representation was everyday clothing whereas in school C, a high percentage of pupils drew themselves in school uniform. The latter may be an indicator of a strong allegiance to the school or purely that the children were drawing themselves in the clothes that they were wearing on the day of the activity, although this was not replicated in the other schools. Sporting kit and apparatus were frequently seen in the drawings of the children in schools B and C. In School B the emphasis on sporting activities was particularly evident in the classroom, which may have had a bearing on some of the drawings. The timetable allowed the drawing activity to be conducted over a slightly longer period of time in School B and this may have contributed to the amount of detail in the drawings. Other themes which appeared in schools B and C included pets and objects used in pastimes and hobbies. In school A, most children drew a head and shoulders self-portrait which took up most of the drawing space and therefore did not depict other objects. The reason for this is
not known but one reason might have been if the children had recently explored portraiture in the art curriculum which may have affected their depictions. At this age (nine to ten years), the children were able to represent themselves and express their ideas through their artwork and this is comparative with other studies including Merriman and Guerrin (2006) and Stiles and Gibbons (2000; 2004).

4.2. Analysis of children’s self-portraits - use of colour

In all three schools there was a restricted timescale for the completion of the activity and as a result of differing timescales, some children coloured in their drawings and others did not. In schools A and C the children had approximately 15 minutes less than the children in school B. The impact of this inequality in terms of allocated time was discussed in the evaluation of the methodology in Chapter 3. As a result, many of the children were unable to use colour in their drawing due to time restrictions. In School A, only two children had begun to colour their drawings in. The girl who drew herself wearing a hijab depicted below in Figure 11, coloured the hijab in blue but had not coloured in any other aspect of the drawing and another girl had coloured her hair brown but no other part of the drawing.

The girl represented in Figure 11 was interviewed as part of the data collection process. In the interview she referred to the hijab when asked to describe her drawing. She said ‘Well, that’s my scarf and umm…’ (School A, Interview 4) which indicated that wearing this was important to her. She described her national identity as Pakistani and British ‘Yes, half and half,’ (School A, Interview 4). Her reasons for this choice were connected to her and her family’s birthplaces and current residencies. ‘Cos like my dad was born in Pakistan and I normally go there to live there and all of my aunties and uncles live there as well. And then British because I was born in Britain, um, Wales and because I live here now,’ (School A, interview 4). In school A, the term Pakistan and Pakistani occurred in six responses. Pakistan or Pakistani was not evident in the data from school B and C.
In School B, more children coloured in their drawings (11 children in total). The primary colours were generally used but some children were very specific in illustrating their skin colour and attempted to create the right shade for this purpose. This can be seen in six of the images. Two examples are illustrated below in Figure 12 and Figure 13.
Figure 12 shows a boy and he has attempted to replicate his skin colour in the drawing. This boy wrote that his national identity was Indian. He was interviewed as part of the data collection process and said he was Indian because all the family members that were known to him were Indian. Figure 13 shows a girl dressed in a football shirt and jeans, with a football to her left. She has coloured her skin in a pink/beige colour and has also taken the time to represent her cheeks in a darker tone. This shows attention to detail when attempting to reproduce the colour of her skin. She decorated the football shirt in black and white stripes which may illustrate an affiliation with a specific football team. Again this may be an indicator of how her identity is linked to a sporting team, however this study is specifically exploring national identity rather than identity per se. The girl recorded her national identity as Welsh and did not take part in the interviews.

In school C, six children had begun to use colour in their drawings. An illustration of this can be seen in Figure 10. This is the same child who annotated her self-portrait but was not interviewed as part of the data collection process. Another child coloured in her skin colour on her face and arms but did not colour any other part of her drawing (This is depicted below in Figure 14). This may illustrate that the girl felt skin colour was important or that she did not have time to colour the rest of the drawing.
4.3 Analysis of children’s self-portraits - position and size of images

In School A, most of the images were of head and shoulders. As discussed earlier, this may have been linked to their interpretations of what constitutes a self-portrait based on previous lesson content on portraiture. As in all the schools, the children were given no guidance from the researcher regarding whether to draw a full body image or head and shoulders view. An example can be seen in Figure 15. These drawings mainly appeared centrally in the space allocated for the image and took up most of the box. The children who produced full body images tended to produce smaller drawings and these again were centrally located.
Figure 15: School A Image 4

In School B, the children had slightly longer to complete their drawings than in the other two schools and most of the images were of the whole body. However, one boy drew his head and shoulders and this fills the whole drawing space. It is difficult to establish whether the timescale affected the detail in the drawings or in this instance the way in which the image was positioned. Drawings in School B mainly appeared centrally in the space allocated for the image and varied in size. Where children chose to depict objects alongside the drawings of themselves, their self-portraits were smaller. This is particularly characterised by the girl who drew herself alongside a horse. The horse takes up most of the picture whereas the girl is drawn in the bottom left hand corner of the image as depicted in Figure 16.
In School C, the images were predominantly of the whole body and varied in size. The children who had drawn smaller images located their drawings either centrally or towards the top of the drawing space. The children who drew themselves alongside images did not make reduce the size of their self-images.

4.4 Discussion - Self-portraits and national identity

Although there was a significant amount of information gathered from the images, this was enhanced when the child was also a participant in the interview process as considered in some of the examples above. Most of the children, in all three schools, drew themselves in everyday clothing or school uniform. The children in Schools B and C tended to draw objects alongside their portraits. These objects mainly consisted of pets or equipment for sport or hobbies. Portraits provided information about identity in general, which was interesting but not was not a central focus of the study. If this study was focussed on other aspects of identity particularly gender, then the analysis of these accompanying images would be insightful. Malchiodi (1998) noted that in her study of the self-portraits of
adolescent boys and girls, boys drew themselves in active roles whereas girls did not. She attributed this to the children’s beliefs about gender in this particular area of the USA. In this present inquiry, more boys than girls drew themselves in sporting kit or with sporting equipment but the girls also depicted themselves involved in various activities such as horse riding, dancing and playing the violin. Although as mentioned previously national identity was the focus of the study rather than gender identity, it is noteworthy to consider the image content of the drawings in line with gender and previous research.

There were ‘national’ themes in the drawings which could be linked to national identity particularly where the self-portraits had been annotated. One child in School C annotated her self-portrait in detail (Figure 10: School C Image 2). She wrote about being Welsh but that she her first language was English, living in Wales and attending a Welsh-medium school. In her annotations, the justification for her national identity can be seen (she stated that she was Welsh). She used her place of residence and her school as determining factors in her national identity. The latter is particularly interesting as the influence of school on national identity did not appear in any of the interviews. It is the only example that directly reflected Waldron and Pike (2006) and Barrett (2007) findings on the influence of the school on children’s perceptions of national identity. Similarly, the curriculum of the school, which is acknowledged as being influential by Barrett (2007), and the fact that this was a Welsh-medium setting can be seen as significant in this instance. The child attended a school or ‘Welsh school’ as she described it whereby the curriculum was delivered through the medium of Welsh, an aspect that appeared to be important to this girl in describing her national identity. Language also featured in her response. This was the only reference to the Welsh language in the visual data. As a finding it is in contrast with similar studies in Wales on national identity such as Scourfield et al. (2006a), whose results found that language is a key feature in the way in which children perceive their national identity.

The position of the images and the use of colour were not insightful in determining the children’s perceptions of their own national identity. Not all children had the opportunity to colour in their work due to the limited timescales. The most interesting use of colour was in School A when one child chose only to colour in her hijab. Again this would be relevant if this study was exploring other aspects of identity, such as religious identity. In essence, no parallels can be drawn about this use of colour and the child’s national identity in this instance. Some children in schools B and C paid particular attention to representing their skin colour as seen in Figures 12, 13 and 14. The relationship between skin colour and national identity is documented in other studies relating to children and their...
perceptions of national identity. Krzywosz-Rynkiewicz et al. (2002) in their study of around two hundred eight to eleven year old children in eight European countries, including the United Kingdom, found that skin colour was a determinant of their nationality. Other determinants included clothes, games, music and sports. Although skin colour appeared to be important to some of the children who shaded their drawings, the relationship between skin colour and national identity was not explored as only one of these three children was interviewed and this child did not specifically discuss his skin colour during the interview process when referring to his own national identity.

4.5 Analysis of written categorisations of national identity

4.5.1 School A

The most popular category chosen by the children was Welsh (eight children, three boys and five girls, which represent approximately 30 per cent of the sample). Three children identified themselves as Welsh and British (one boy and two girls). Three children listed Pakistani as the primary category, with either Welsh or British; and one boy wrote ‘from Pakistan,’ (Boy 11). Only one child identified themselves as British.

The individual interpretations of their national identity are described below and the punctuation and terminology used reflect the exact wording and punctuation used by the children on their self-portraits (The children were given the words I am… and were asked to complete the sentence with their own national identity as can be seen in Appendix 5).

Table 4: School A - Self-categorisation of national identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-categorisation of national identity</th>
<th>No. of girls</th>
<th>No. of boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and British</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurdish Welsh</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistani/British</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Welsh and English</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian, quarter American</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irish, French and English</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to ESTYN (2009:1) 43 per cent of the pupils within the school are from an ‘ethnic minority background.’ This diverse ethnic mix is represented in the data and was evident in their self-categorisation. Out of 27 pupils only ten children assigned themselves as being one single nationality (eight Welsh, one British and one from Pakistan). All the other children reflected multiple categories of national identity, with 12 children describing themselves as being from two nations and five children choosing three or more categories. Welsh featured in 18 responses (66 per cent).

The order of their chosen categorisation is also interesting to consider and may indicate their primary allegiance to a particular nation. This was further explored during the interview process with several of the pupils who had indicated more than one national identity categories. Six out of the 17 children placed Welsh first when they displayed a plural national identity. A further six children included Pakistani or Pakistan in their responses, three children placing it as the first category in multiple definitions of national identity. This pattern was not observed in any of the other schools; in fact the term Pakistan or Pakistani was not cited in either school B or C. School A had a high percentage
of pupils from ethnic minority backgrounds and in this particular class there was a clear connection between the several of the children’s perceptions of their own national identity and affiliation with Pakistan. Welsh was the only other category which appeared as frequently in this school.

One girl listed Muslim first as her national identity with a number of other nationalities. It seems her idea of her national identity was related to her religious disposition, with this taking priority over other categories.

4.5.2 School B

The most popular category chosen by the children was Welsh (seven children, three boys and four girls, which represent approximately 30 per cent of the sample). Welsh/ English was the only other category which had more than one respondent. Eighteen pupils in total included the term Welsh within their self-categorisation. The category British was not used by anyone in the class.

The individual interpretations of their national identity are described below and the punctuation and terminology used reflect the exact wording and punctuation used by the children.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-categorisation of national identity</th>
<th>No. of girls</th>
<th>No. of boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and Iraq</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and half Greek</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh/ English</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh/ English and American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh/ British</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: School B - Self-categorisation of national identity
According to ESTYN (2006) five per cent of pupils in this school speak English as an additional language. This indicates a less diverse ethnic mix than in School A, where 43 per cent of pupils were from ethnic minority backgrounds (ESTYN, 2009). However, there was a more diverse ethnic mix represented in the specific class where the data were collected and this was evident in their self-categorisation. Out of 24 pupils, 12 children assigned themselves as being one singular nationality (seven Welsh, one Indian, one Japanese, one American, one Polish and one English). All the other children reflected more than one national identity category, with eight children describing themselves as being from two nations and four children choosing three or more categories. The majority of the children who defined themselves in terms of having multiple national identities were white and affiliated themselves mainly to countries with the UK and Europe. Welsh featured in 18 responses (75 per cent).

Ten children placed Welsh first when they displayed more than one national identity category and this represented the majority of the group that had chosen multiple national identity categories. This was higher than the figure recorded in School A (six children placed Welsh first in School A). The ordering of the chosen categorisation may be an

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-categorisation of national identity</th>
<th>No. of girls</th>
<th>No. of boys</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and a quarter Italian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and a quarter Italian and a quarter Irish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh/ English/Irish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half English and half Bengali</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Welsh and half Scottish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half English, quarter Welsh, little bit Irish and a little bit Tanzanian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals

Total number of girls: 13
Total number of boys: 11
Total number of pupils: 24

108
indicator their primary allegiance to a particular nation, with Welsh being a significant feature in these choices.

4.5.3 School C

The most popular category chosen by the children was Welsh (nine children). These were all boys and represent approximately 30 per cent of the total sample. Half Welsh and half English was the only other category which had more than one respondent (two children). Twenty seven pupils in total included the term Welsh within their self-categorisation (96 per cent of the sample). The category British was not used by any of the children in the class.

The individual interpretations of their national identity are described below and the punctuation and terminology used reflect the exact wording and punctuation used by the children.

Table 6 School C - Self-categorisation of national identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-categorisation of national identity</th>
<th>No. of Females</th>
<th>No. of Males</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welsh but a little bit English</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh only a little bit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and Iranian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter Portugal and Welsh</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh and a quarter Dutch</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Welsh, half English</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Welsh, half Cuban</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half Welsh, half New Zealand</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three quarters Welsh and one quarter New Zealander</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Irish and Welsh</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to ESTYN (2010:1), 4.7 per cent of the pupils within the school are from ‘minority ethnic background.’ The data however seems to represent a much more diverse ethnic mix through the pupils’ self-categorisation, although the data was collected approximately three years after the publication of this report. Out of 28 pupils only nine children assigned themselves as being one nationality, in this instance Welsh. All the other children reflected multiple national identities, with 10 children describing themselves as being from two nations and five children choosing three or more categories. One child used the category half English but did not give details of the other half of their national identity and another child stated that they were ‘Welsh only a little bit’. Welsh featured in 27 responses.

The order of their chosen categorisation as discussed previously may indicate the child's primary allegiance to a particular nation. This was further explored during the interview process with several of the pupils who indicated multiple national identity categories. Ten of the children placed Welsh first (the same as school B and a higher number than in school A) when they displayed more than one national identity classification. Five children listed English in their responses, although this was alongside other nations.

One boy listed Swansea as part of his national identity, coupled with a number of other nationalities, with Swansea listed first. His perception of his national identity appeared to be related to a more local perspective and affiliation with the city of Swansea.
Traditionally, in the area where the study was carried out, there is some rivalry between Cardiff and Swansea and their respective football teams.

4.6 Analysis of interviews – Children’s justification of self-categorisation of national identity

After completing the drawing and annotation exercise, a sample of children were chosen to be interviewed using their completed art work and written material as a basis for the discussion. As discussed in the methodology chapter, these children were selected in discussion with the class teachers. The children were asked to discuss the reasoning behind the self-categorisations of national identity, based on their drawings. Six children were interviewed in School A, five children in Schools B and C. Their responses were analysed using the constant comparative method (Thomas, 2009) as discussed in the previous chapter and the emerging themes were established as seen in the table below (Table 7). The children are identified in the data according to their school, the order of the interview schedule and their gender.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School, Child, Gender and Self Categorisation of National Identity</th>
<th>Justification for self-categorisation of national identity, emergent themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 1 (Girl) Welsh</td>
<td>Parental national identity/ family origins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 2 (Boy) Welsh</td>
<td>My birthplace/ Family birthplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 3 (Boy) Half Kurdish/ half Welsh</td>
<td>Family birthplace/ current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 4 (Girl) Pakistani and British</td>
<td>Family birthplace/ my birthplace/current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 5 (Boy) Welsh and British</td>
<td>Current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL A 6 ( Girl) African American</td>
<td>Parental national identity, my birthplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL B 1 (Boy) Half English quarter Welsh a little</td>
<td>Family birthplace/my birthplace/ grandparents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### School, Child, Gender and Self Categorisation of National Identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School, Child, Gender and Self Categorisation of National Identity</th>
<th>Justification for self-categorisation of national identity, emergent themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bit Irish and a little bit Tanzanian</td>
<td>national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL B 2 (Boy) Indian</td>
<td>Family national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL B 3 (Girl) Japanese</td>
<td>Birthplace/ parental national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL B 4 (Girl) half Welsh half Iraqi</td>
<td>Parental national identity/my birthplace/residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL B 5 (Boy) unsure whether British or American</td>
<td>Parental national identity/residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL C 1 (Girl) Half Welsh, half Irish and bit English</td>
<td>Parental national identity/ family national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL C 2 (Boy) Fully Welsh</td>
<td>My birthplace/ Parental national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL C 3 (Girl) quarter Jamaican, quarter English and half Welsh</td>
<td>Grandparents national identity, Parental national identity/ family origins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL C 4 (Boy) Welsh, half Nigerian and quarter Jamaican)</td>
<td>My birthplace, Parental national identity/ Grandparents national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL C 5 (Boy) Welsh</td>
<td>All family speak Welsh, residence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Four key themes emerged from the responses given by the children. These themes included the national identity of close family members, birthplace and residency. Two children also included language in their responses, although only one child stated this as a factor in his self-categorisation of national identity. Some children cited one of these elements as a determinant of their national identity. However, most children used a combination of the categories in their responses, as can be seen in Table 7. Table 8 displays the emergent
themes and the number of times these themes occurred in the interview data accumulated from all three schools.

**Table 8: Emergent Themes from Rationale for Self Categorisation of National Identity**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Familial national identity</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental national identity</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandparent national identity</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family national identity</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Birthplace</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family birthplace</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child’s birthplace</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Residence</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place of residence</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family residence</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The national identity of family members was significant to the children that were interviewed and, in particular, the national identity of their parents. Nine children cited this as their justification of their own national identity. Typical responses included:

SCHOOL C 4 ‘… also my mum’s Welsh but my dad’s Nigerian’

SCHOOL B 3 ‘Cos … my parents are Japanese…’

The national identity of grandparents was also considered to be important to three of the children when defining their own national identity.

SCHOOL B 1 ‘…my mum’s parents, both of them are Irish’

SCHOOL C 3 ‘…my grandparents came from Jamaica … my other grandma came from Cornwall.’

Other children cited the national identity of the family in general.

SCHOOL B 2 ‘… all my family that I know is Indian’
Birthplace was another common theme and this was characterised either in terms of where the children themselves were born, or where their family members were born. The examples below are from children who cited their own birthplace as a determinant either in a local or national context.

SCHOOL A 2: ‘I was born in Cardiff’
SCHOOL C 2: ‘… I was born here’

As stated above, children also reflected on the birthplace of their close family, as well as their own.

SCHOOL A 3: ‘Well my mum and dad were born in Kurdistan. My sister was born in Kurdistan but I was born in Wales …’

The current place of residence of child and their family was also frequently mentioned. Five children said their national identity was linked to where they currently lived and three children commented on the relationship between national identity and where their family resides or come from.

SCHOOL A 5: ‘I live in Britain’
SCHOOL A 1: ‘My mum is Welsh and my dad is Welsh and they don’t come, they haven’t lived or came from any other place.’

Two children discussed language during the interview. One child was studying in the Welsh-medium primary school and he clearly linked his national identity to the language spoken in his immediate family.

SCHOOL C 5: ‘Pretty much every person in my family tree like from me and my sister to about like my gran, no, my gran’s mum can all speak Welsh.’

Another child in School A stated that he spoke English when asked about defining his national identity, but did not attribute this as the reason for his selection of his specific national identity.

SCHOOL A5: ‘…and I speak English’

The emergent themes were evident across the three schools. However in school C, four out of the five children interviewed included parental national identity and this was also the most cited category across all schools. All the girls interviewed, apart from one child, cited parental national identity as a justification for the self-categorisation of national identity.
The boys did not display any particular preference towards a particular themes when citing their reasons for national identification.

4.7 Discussion of Self-Categorisation Data

Several significant issues have arisen from the data collection process centring on children’s ability to define their national identity and rationalise these choices, as well as the nature and diversity of some of the defined identities. The study identified clearly that children between the ages of nine and ten years can describe their national identity; and that this explanation is often complex, with the use of multiple national affiliations evident in many cases in the data. Welsh was the most named single category in all schools and was also used alongside other national identities. The term British only featured once as a single category, although British occurred five times as part of multiple definitions of national identity. Other nations cited include countries in the UK, Europe the Middle East, the Indian sub-continent, as well as Australasia and North America.

When the children were asked to provide a rationale for their choices in the interviews, they gave well defined answers with the national identity of close family members, birthplace and residency highlighted as reasons for the selections they had made. Language was cited by one child as a reason for the choice he had made regarding his own national identity.

4.7.1 National Identity Categories

Welsh was the most cited single category in all three schools regardless of the ethnic composition of the setting. Seven pupils in school A, eight in school B and nine in school C (the Welsh-medium setting) said that they were Welsh. According to ESTYN (2006), school A has the highest proportion of pupils from ethnic minority backgrounds (43 per cent), whereas the other schools had approximately five per cent of pupils. However, the differences in the numbers of pupils in each school indicating that they considered they were Welsh were very small. In school A, two children identified themselves as being affiliated to a single nation other than Wales. This number increased to five children in School B. No child in school C ascribed themselves to a singular nation other than Wales, although one child said they were half English, but did not clarify the other part of their national identity. The repeated occurrence of Welsh is comparable to the results found by Carrington and Short (1996) in Edinburgh, where the children displayed a strong sense of Scottish identity. In the present study, Welsh national identity was the most popular single
category recorded, indicating a strong sense of Welsh national identity in all three schools. This has parallels with the 2011 census (ONS, 2011), when in total 2.4 million (out of a population of 3.06 million) people who chose Welsh, either on its own or in combination with another identity, in defining their own national identity.

The attachment to Wales can be seen further where children were using more than one national identity category in their responses. Where children were displaying two or more national categories, there was a noticeable difference apparent in School C (the Welsh-medium setting). In this school 27 out of 28 children included the term Welsh in their self-categorisation of national identity (nine singularly and 18 as part of their answer, for example half Welsh, half English). In schools A and B, 18 children incorporated Welsh into their definitions of national identity. This would indicate that the children in School C had a greater affiliation to the Welsh nation. It is difficult to ascertain whether this sense of Welsh national identity can be attributed specifically to the language of the school (Welsh), which was distinctive from the other schools in the study. Other factors which may have influenced this may include the ethos of the school as seen in the Waldron and Pike (2006) study in Irish schools, or other influences, such as the family; which featured frequently in interview responses. By contrast, during the five interviews carried out at school C, the Welsh language was named by only one boy as the reason his national identity choice.

The school was not mentioned as an influence on choice of national identity by any of the interviewees in any of the three schools. Central to the curriculum in Wales (education was devolved to the Welsh Government since 1999) is Curriculum Cymreig, introduced initially in 1993 and recently reviewed in 2012. This initiative supports the promotion of Welsh culture and linguistic, cultural, social, historical and geographical contexts in schools. The 2012 review of this curriculum policy reiterated the Welsh Government’s commitment in encouraging children to develop a sense of ‘Welshness’ and belonging to their local community and country (Welsh Government, 2012b). The attachment and sense of belonging was certainly evident in the results of the study, suggesting that many of the children had firm association with Wales in terms of the categorisation of their national identity, although none explicitly mentioned school or the Curriculum Cymreig.

With regard to the influence of local community, one child in School C (Child 28) wrote ‘I am quarter Swansea, half Malta and all Welsh’. This suggested that this child had a connection with the city of Swansea, but as this child was not included in the interview schedule, the motive for the inclusion of Swansea was not explored. Locality is discussed
above when considering the reasons behind children’s categorisation of their own national identity when children stated their birthplace and place of residence as motives for their choices. Affiliation to a more local community was seen as influencing national identity by Thompson and Day (1999) in the context of North Wales and Connolly, Smith and Kelly’s (2002) study with children in Northern Ireland. This is also acknowledged in the work of Paasi (2009) when exploring European regional agendas.

Research by Smith (1991) and Dixon and Durrheim (2000) into national identity suggest individuals can have multiple national identities, with history and location impacting on these. Further, Smith (1991) proposes that national identity is complex, abstract and multi-dimensional. The multi-dimensional aspect of national identity was clear in many of the responses. In all three schools, a greater number of children chose multiple rather than single categories of national identity (single national identities chosen by 10 children in School A, 12 in School B and 9 in School C). Two categories were chosen by 30 children in total (12 children in School A, 8 children in School B and 10 children in School C). Three or more nations were chosen by a further 14 children in total (5 children in School A, 4 children in School B and 5 children in School C). As discussed previously, where children were displaying two or more national categories, there was a significant difference apparent in School C (the Welsh-medium setting). In this school 27 out of 28 children (schools A and B, 18 children) included the term Welsh in their self-categorisation of national identity, representing a strong allegiance with Welsh national identity in this setting.

This rise in the multiplicity of national identities indicated in the study corresponds with the increasingly plural nature of Wales as a whole. Census figures for 2011 in Wales (Welsh Government, 2013) show that ethnic minority groups in Wales have doubled from two per cent to four per cent since 2001. Studies of adults (for example Alibhai-Brown, 2000) have reported that ethnic minority groups in Wales and Scotland find identities such as Welsh and Scottish problematic. The area of Wales where the study was carried out, has the highest proportion of ethnic minority groups in Wales (15.2 per cent). School A, was the school with the largest proportion of pupils from ethnic minorities (43 per cent according to ESTYN, 2009). Pakistan or Pakistani featured in six responses in this school. Asian or Asian British was recorded as the largest ethnic group in Wales in 2011 and half of the 12,260 Pakistani populations living in Wales live in the urban area (Welsh Government, 2013) where the research was conducted. This was reflected in the data for
School A where a number of children expressing Pakistan or Pakistani as their national identity.

In schools B and C, the diversity displayed in the children’s affirmations of their own national identity did not correspond with the data cited by ESTYN in 2006 and 2010, where both schools were listed as having approximately five per cent of pupils from ethnic minorities. Children in school B, who recorded multiple national identities, made reference mainly to countries in the UK or Europe, reflecting perhaps the less geographically diverse ethnic mix within the school than school A. The data in School C revealed a wide variety of countries, including countries in the Middle East, the Caribbean, Africa, Australasia; as well as Europe and the UK. Welsh was included alongside the majority of these national identities. It is noteworthy as it displayed the diversity in the national identity of these children who were being educated via the medium of Welsh. In this particular class Welsh was a dominant identity category, but this was often placed alongside other identities from differing continents.

Barrett’s (2002) centenary project found that children from ethnic minority groups were less likely to consider themselves English or British than white English children. In the Welsh context, Scourfield et al.’s study of national identity (2006a), ascertained from the chosen sample, that none of the children from ethnic minorities chose Welsh as their primary national identity. In this investigation, Welsh was not chosen as a single category by children from ethnic minority groups, but was chosen frequently alongside another category. Examples of this include Kurdish Welsh, half Welsh and half Pakistani, and Welsh, half Nigerian and quarter Jamaican. This indicates that the ethnic minority children in this investigation showed an affiliation to Wales alongside other national identity classifications.

English was the second most popular term after Welsh used by the children in all three schools (14 occurrences). The term English was written twice in School A and six times in School C as part of multiple identity definitions. Two children cited New Zealand and 4 wrote Irish to accompany other nationalities. In School B, English was listed as a single category once and five times in conjunction with other nations. In School A, other recurrent national identities were the terms Pakistan or Pakistani, which featured either independently (once) or in conjunction with another national identity (5 instances). Also in School A, Irish, Arabic and Swedish each occurred twice alongside other national identities. In School B Irish was listed three times and Italian twice as part of multiple identities.
British, as a descriptor of national identity, was given as a singular response by a child in School A and appeared on four occasions alongside other national identity categories for example Pakistani/British. In School B, one child used the term British alongside Welsh. In School C, the Welsh-medium setting, British did not feature. The latter may perhaps be linked to the notion, discussed in the literature (Heath, Martin and Elgenius, 2007), of British and Welsh as distinctive and incompatible.

British occurred most in School A. This was the school where there were larger numbers of pupils from ethnic minorities (43 per cent) compared to the other two schools. As discussed previously, research (Alibhai-Brown, 2000) has indicated that ethnic minorities may find identities such as Welsh and Scottish problematic. This may account for the preference towards using the term British in School A. In School B, British was recorded once. Tilley and Heath’s (2007) research into British pride highlighted an increase in Scottish and Welsh nationalism, which has resulted in a decline in Britishness. In School C, the term Welsh was present in all but one of the responses but British was not evident. Similarly Heath, Martin and Elgenius (2007) stressed that in Wales, British and English are not seen as rival identities, whereas in Wales, British and Welsh are seen as being unique and potentially conflicting. In the present data British and Welsh did occur together: once in School A and once in School B.

When indicating their national identity preferences, it was important to explore the order that the children used when writing down their choices. In School A, 17 children chose multiple national identities and five children placed the term Welsh, or part Welsh, first. The number of children choosing Welsh first was higher in School B (nine out of 12 children) and School C (ten out of 15 children). School A had the highest population of ethnic minority pupils (46 per cent) and this was the school where the greatest number of children chose more than one category of national identity. If order of preference is regarded as a measure of affiliation with a particular nation, then the children in School A did not exhibit such a noticeable alignment with Welsh as a national identity label. This relates to the results of Scourfield et al.’s (2006a) investigation, where no children from ethnic minorities chose Welsh as their primary national identity.

Two other responses are interesting in terms of the order of their responses. One child in School A wrote ‘Muslim/Arabic/British/half Mexican/half Turkish/quarter Russian’ (School A, child 27) and another in school C who stated ‘Quarter Swansea, half Malta and all Welsh’ (School C, child 28). Both responses have been discussed in this chapter; and it could be concluded from these statements that these children did not fully understand the
concept of national identity. However, in terms of the order they have used, the child in School A appears to have a strong affiliation with her religion and as this is the first thing she has written down. The child in School C clearly identifies with a locality first, rather than a nation. In Northern Ireland, Connolly, Smith and Kelly (2002), found that loyalties to local communities and religious denominations interacted with national identity. This could be compared with the two children in this study, who were using religious markers and allegiance to a local area as indicators of their identity.

4.7.2 Children’s ability to define their national identity and justify their choices

The findings of the study demonstrated that children aged nine to ten years have the ability to engage with the topic of national identity and voice clear and insightful views. Most of the children who were involved in the drawing/writing activity or, later, in the interview procedure, were able to state their national identity and in conversation express ideas regarding the reasoning behind these choices. The reasons provided for the national identity choices were focussed around the national identity of close family members, birthplace and residency.

Research carried out by Piaget and Weill in 1951, which has been confirmed in comparable studies (Aboud and Amato, 2001; Axia, Bremner, Deluca and Andreasen, 1998; Barrett, 1996; Barrett and Farroni, 1996), asserted that children do not understand the concept of their national identity at the ages of years 10-11, as this knowledge is dependent on cognitive capacity. In the 1951 study by Piaget and Weill, which was a pivotal investigation into how children perceive national identity, the researchers concluded that children only fully understand the concept of nationality and can justify a preference for their home country from ten years onwards. However, in the present study the data have shown younger children, aged nine to ten years, were able to define their own national identity; and often these definitions were complex and thoughtful. The children described singular national identities such as Welsh and Polish, as well as, accurately defining fractional national identities, for example, ‘half English, quarter Irish and quarter Welsh’ and ‘half Pakistani and half Turkish’. Less defined measures of national identity were also used, including ‘half English, quarter Welsh, little bit Irish and a little bit Tanzanian’ and ‘Welsh but a little bit English’. Although most of the children were able to give credible and considered responses, one child stated that she was ‘Muslim/Arabic/British/half Mexican/half Turkish/quarter Russian’ which may indicate
that she did not fully comprehend the concept of national identity; or, alternatively, it may demonstrate that she primarily sees herself as a Muslim first, before considering other categories.

Sixteen children were interviewed about their annotations and drawings and all were able to give the reasoning behind their choices. The children’s valid and rationalised responses, evident in the data, does not tally with cognitive developmental theories of national identity discussed above and Piaget and Weill’s (1951) assertion about cognitive comprehension of national identity only being present in children from the age of 10 onwards. Critics of the developmental approach to the formulation of concepts of national identity (Jenks, 2005, Barrett, 2007) disagree with the age bound notions of these theories, as they do not account for the diversity in children’s developmental patterns and disregard social and cultural factors. Indeed, the variety of responses given in this project may indicate that some children may have a more defined sense of national identity than others.

On the other hand, the example cited above, where the child had included her religion in her response may be an indicator of a less sophisticated understanding of the concept of national identity. Alternatively, this affiliation with religion may be closely linked to national identity for this particular child. Connolly, Smith and Kelly’s (2002) study in Northern Ireland demonstrated how religious denomination interacted with national identity in children aged six years and therefore it is possible that religion and national identity were interlinked concepts for the child in this study. Similarly one child drew herself wearing the hijab (Figure 11) which could be described as a symbolic indicator of her religious identity and she also mentioned that she had drawn this in her interview. She clearly associated wearing the hijab with her own personal identity. However she did not in the interview discuss her religion in relation to her categorisation of national identity.

The social context is predominant in other theoretical perspectives which consider the way children develop their concept of national identity, namely the social identity theory (SIT) (Tajfel, 1978). Social factors are also considered as fundamental in the self-categorisation theory (SCT) of national identity proposed by Oakes, Haslam and Turner (1994) and, more recently, social identity development theory (SIDT) (Nesdale, 2004). In line with these theories, it is acknowledged that social groupings and the social context of the school environment impacts on the way that the children categorise themselves. The data was collected in three different classrooms and the plural nature of Wales was evident in all three schools, reflecting the changes in Welsh society as a whole as seen in the 2011
census. Familial influences were also clearly present as a theme in the data, as well as residency and birthplace.

The role of the child’s immediate family in shaping their views on national identity was apparent in their interview responses. When the children were asked about the reasons for their choices of national identity, familial influences, particularly parental national identity, were cited most frequently. This indicates the importance of the parental role in shaping children’s views on national identity with this particular age group. Barrett’s (2007) social-cognitive-motivational theory (which is an amalgamation of social and cognitive developmental theories described above, with the addition of the motivational perspective) places great emphasis on the parental role in shaping children’s views about national identity and this is reflected in the findings of the present study. Interview data confirms that at this age, the children associate national identity with the national identity of their parents. The wider family was also cited by the children, including grandparents and the family as a whole. As one child (School B 2) stated ‘… all my family that I know is Indian’ demonstrating the key role that familial relationships have in influencing children’s perceptions of national identity. Despite being in the school environment alongside their friends, the children did not mention their peers when asked to clarify their national identity choices. This is in contrast to Scourfield et al. (2006b), where friends were recognised alongside family as primary influences on national identity.

However, the children did consider place of birth and current residency to be significant, both in terms of a local and a national situation. Dixon and Durrheim’s (2000) exploration of place and identity asserts this to be an influence on national identity. When providing a rationale for their national identity choices, the children stated where they lived or were born in a local context, ‘I was born in Cardiff’ (School A, 2) and a national context ‘I live in Britain’ (School A, 5). This echoes Carrington and Short’s (1996; 1999) research in Edinburgh. When interviewing children aged 9-11 years, the results of the Scottish study revealed birth and residence were key aspects in determining a sense of national identity. In Wales, Scourfield et al.’s (2006b) study of children’s attachments to place and cultures with children aged eight to eleven years found that a prevailing indicator used to support nationality were place of birth, either the child’s own place of birth or their parents. Correspondingly, in this research project, the influence of family was noticeable when referring to place of birth or residence. Family birthplace or family residence occurred in seven responses (approximately half of the children interviewed), reiterating the importance of familial influences on children’s national identity.
Barrett (2007) also reflected on the influence place has; and particularly the school (including, curriculum, pedagogy and teachers). Similarly Waldron and Pike (2006), in their study of what it means to be Irish, established the ethos of the school as an influential factor when children were asked to reflect on Irish national identity. When the children were asked about their personal national identity the school was not mentioned as an influencing factor. The influence of the school was evident in one drawing (Figure 5) which is discussed above. However, as the data was only collected in one context, which is within the school, there was no possibility to compare the children’s responses in another location, such as at home. Consequently, I was unable to draw conclusions about whether their answers would differ in another social context and so explore the significance of each situation on the children’s responses.

The link between language and national identity is widely documented in many general studies of national identity (Herder, 1969; Smith, 1991; Poole, 1999), as well as in studies undertaken in Wales (Andersen, 2001; Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006). Language was mentioned twice in the interview process with two children. One child, who attended an English-medium primary school, commented that he spoke English but when discussing the rationale for his national identity categorisation, the language he spoke was not given as the reason behind the choice he had made. On the other hand, a child in the Welsh-medium primary school very clearly asserted that he was Welsh because all of his family spoke Welsh. Studies with adults in Wales, such as Andersen (2001) found language to be a leading aspect of national affiliations and Davies, Charles and Harris (2006) supported the notion of fluency in the Welsh language as a marker in Welsh national identity. Qualitative data collected as part of the Beaufort Research Project (2013) examined Welsh language use in daily life. Participants were asked what language meant to them and national identity was a common response. However, other researchers in Wales such as Bryant (2006) point towards other factors such as political and sociological influences on national identity in conjunction with language. It is unlikely that the child who was using language as an indication of his national identity in the current study was influenced by political factors, but possibly sociological influences may be relevant as he was attending a Welsh-medium school and came from a Welsh speaking family. Language was a noteworthy feature in the construction of his national identity.

Studies with children in Wales have drawn similar conclusions regarding national identity and the Welsh language, Scourfield et al. (2006a) identified language as a defining factor in their cross Wales study with eight to eleven year olds. When conducting research in the
areas which were populated mainly by Welsh speakers, the children recognised the ability to speak Welsh as a component of Welsh national identity. Although the data collection process in the present study was not carried out in a predominantly Welsh speaking area of Wales, language has been as a primary driver in both policy and practice in Wales, with the emphasis on creating a bilingual Wales (Welsh Government, 2010). Twenty-eight of the children were being educated through the medium of Welsh and therefore it was expected that the Welsh language would be mentioned more than once when discussing national identity. All children in Wales now study Welsh in English-medium schools up to the age of 16 and so language would also have been expected to feature as a reason in English medium contexts. This finding corresponds with studies carried out with older children in Wales such as Coupland et al., (2005). Their investigation concluded that Welsh language is only used to display a group’s distinctiveness in a ‘very muted way,’ (Coupland et al., 2005:17). Conversely, when the children were asked about their perceptions of Welsh national identity, the Welsh language was acknowledged as a significant aspect. This will be considered when discussing the second research aim in Chapter Five.

In the children’s drawings skin colour also seemed to be an important factor. Many of the children who used colour were meticulous in trying to represent their actual skin tone. Researchers such as Krzywosz-Rynkiewicz et al. (2002) have related skin colour to national identity, the children in the study did not cite this as a reason for their national identity categorisation either in the interview process or in their annotations. Conversely skin colour was identified as significant factor when the children were discussing Welsh national identity and this will be explored in the next chapter.

4.8 Summary

With regard to the first research aim which was centred on children’s perceptions of their own national identity, this study has generated many interesting findings. The reasons given by the children to support their choices of national identity, such as family, current place of residence and birth place, are fairly consistent with existing research. Other findings point to different conclusions than those drawn by previous researchers. The nine to ten year olds who participated in the study were generally able to articulate and justify their views on national identity. This particularly challenges developmental theories regarding this topic area (Piaget and Weil, 1951; Aboud and Amato, 200). Perhaps the most noticeable challenge to the literature was the absence of reference to language, particularly the Welsh language, for the reasons proposed by the children for their own
national identity. This was in contrast to previous adult (Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006) and child studies such as Scourfield et al. (2006a), as described above. This finding was also surprising regarding the current language policy in Wales and the drive to create a bilingual country.

The changing nature of the plural society in 21st century Wales is very clearly illustrated in the data, via the multiplicity evident in the national identity categories. Also a close affiliation to Wales was consistent in all three schools, but particularly the Welsh-medium school. These multiple categories of national identity and alliance to Wales provide a contemporary and discerning view of how the children in this area of Wales currently view themselves in terms of their own national identity.

The next chapter will present the findings for the second research aim of the study. It will explore the children’s views of Welsh national identity in general and what it means to be Welsh through an analysis of visual, written oral data.
Chapter 5: Children’s perceptions of Welsh national identity

The previous chapter discussed the findings in relation to the first research question of the study, which explored children’s perceptions of their own national identity. In this chapter the data will be considered in light of the second research question, which is concerned with the children’s thoughts and ideas about Welsh national identity. In order to explore this topic, the children were asked to draw a picture of a Welsh person and they had the option to annotate their drawings using some of the question prompts as shown in Table 9 below and seen in Appendix 6. These questions were formulated to elicit information on physical features, clothing and other not so visible indicators such as language. A sample of children was then chosen in each school in conjunction with the class teacher (sampling procedure is discussed in Chapter 3). The children were interviewed using the drawings and annotations as a tool to aid the discussion process.

Table 9: Questions to consider when drawing a Welsh person

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What do they look like?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Describe their features and body shape.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What colour hair and skin do they have?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are they wearing?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do all these things tell us that they are Welsh?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What language does the Welsh person speak?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do they do?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What hobbies do they have?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What religion are they?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What things are important to Welsh people?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What does it mean to be Welsh?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1 Analysis of drawings of a Welsh person

The sections below analyse and discuss the images produced in the three schools. The content of the image was the main focus and the approaches adopted were similar to those
used by Merriman and Guerrin (2006) and Stiles and Gibbons (2000). Recurrent themes were identified in terms of image content, then the frequency of their occurrence, drawing on the constant comparative method (Thomas, 2009). This method was also used to analyse the written and oral data as explained in detail in Chapter 3. Alongside the content of the drawings, the use of colour and the sizing and positioning of the image were considered in order to establish whether these were specific to each individual drawing, or if there were significant trends in each school or indeed throughout all three settings. However, the key aspect of the visual data analysis was the image content with the colour, sizing and positioning viewed to supplement this.

To reflect the multimodality of the research design, the interview data has been used throughout this section to enhance the consideration of the images and enrich the discussion.

5.1.1 School A – Image Content

In school A, 27 children took part in the drawing activity and the recurrent aspects reflected in their depictions are shown in the table below (Table 10). Most of the images were of head and shoulders, similar to their self-portraits, with nine drawings showing full body images.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image content</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary clothes</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Kit</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The images represented were made up of 16 characters portrayed in ordinary clothing. In two of these drawings the characters were wearing T-shirts with Wales written on them (one was drawn by a boy, one by a girl). One child drew a Welsh person in school uniform. Five males were drawn in sporting outfits. Four out of the five sporting male images were drawn by boys. Three of these images were labelled as football players, two were named
as: Gareth Bale (Welsh international footballer) (See Figure 17); one as Aaron Ramsey (Welsh international footballer); and a rugby player, described as Gareth Edwards. The girl did not label her image of a Welsh footballer. This drawing and follow up interview is described later in this section and the image can be seen in Figure 20.

Figure 17: School A, Image 5

The image above is labelled as Gareth Bale, who was playing in the Premier League as well as for the Welsh national team at the time the data were collected in this setting. Bale’s local connection with south east Wales is highlighted in the child’s writing ‘born in Cardiff’ which seemed to be significant to the boy in this instance and may have been the reason for Bale’s inclusion in this child’s drawing (Bale was also depicted by other children in schools B and C).

As detailed above, most of the drawings of a Welsh person were head and shoulder views, which was comparable with their self-portraits. One girl drew a woman with curly hair, identified as Shirley Bassey in her picture (See Figure 18). The drawing of this particular Welsh celebrity resonated with the quiz activity which was carried out prior to the drawing
activity. Children were asked to identify photographs of famous Welsh people and Shirley Bassey featured in this and therefore it is likely that the child has chosen to replicate this image in her drawing of a Welsh person.

Other drawings included a male wearing a striped shirt and glasses labelled as a farmer, a female in a kilt and a man in a blazer and bow tie. At the time of data collection I asked the teacher about these images. She informed me that the class had taken part in an assembly that morning and a farmer had been a key character in the presentation. The boy who played a Welsh farmer in the assembly performance had then gone on to draw a farmer in his depiction of a Welsh person as seen in Figure 19.
This illustration of a Welsh person indicated that the recent experience in the school assembly shaped the boy’s current perception of what constitutes a Welsh person. The boy who drew the farmer was interviewed and he discussed the illustration. He described himself as half Kurdish and half Welsh, as his family was originally from Kurdistan but he was born in Wales. During the interview, he stated that the image is of a farmer in plain clothing because when Welsh people live in the country they usually have a farm. He described the farmer as having ‘white hair, white skin colour, I said he was bald but I meant to say he has some white hair’ (School A, 3). When asked why he had drawn a farmer he said that ‘Most people that retire are farmers.’ Despite living in a large urban conurbation, his view of Wales seemed to represent a rural population made up of retired people who are now farming.

Twenty four of the children drew a Welsh person in accordance with their own gender, i.e. boys drew male figures and girls drew females. However two girls in this class chose to draw male figures when representing a Welsh person. One image, as seen in Figure 20, was a male in a Welsh football kit (her subsequent interview is described below) and the other was a male in ordinary clothing. A boy also drew a girl in school uniform as the picture of a Welsh person and in his self-portrait he drew himself in school uniform.
The girl who drew Figure 20 identified the person in the drawing as a Welsh footballer but did not specifically name the footballer. In her interview she discussed her family, she lived with her parents and her four brothers who all enjoyed watching sport. She liked watching all kinds of sports too. Her Welsh footballer is described as follows: ‘He’s got very spiky hair and he’s got blue eyes and he’s a bit pale’ (School A, 4). The girl describes her own national identity as Pakistani and British. In her self-portrait she drew herself wearing a hijab and commented on this in the interview and this is considered in the previous chapter. Her view of the Welsh person not only contrasts with her own gender but in addition to this, the image does not compare with her own skin and eye colour (brown), the Welsh person depicted here is white with blue eyes. However she noted in her annotations that Welsh people can look like any other person.

Overall in School A the images drawn were of Welsh people in ordinary clothing with some drawings showing characters in sporting kits, usually reflecting national teams. Although some significant aspects of the drawings, for example, skin colour are discussed briefly when considering the drawings illustrated here, a further examination of the use of colour in the drawings will feature later in the chapter as well as how this was elaborated in annotations and through the interview process.
5.1.2 School B – Image Content

In school B, 24 children took part in the drawing activity and the recurrent themes are shown in Table 8. Twenty two of the children drew a Welsh person in accordance with their own gender, i.e. boys drew male figures and girls drew females. Two girls in this class chose to draw male figures when representing a Welsh person. One image was a male in a sports kit with a daffodil and the other was a male in ordinary clothing. Most children drew full body images.

Table 11: School B Image Content (Welsh person)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image Content</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary clothes</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh costume</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Kit</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The images represented were made up of nine characters depicted in ordinary clothing. One boy drew a Welsh man in ordinary clothes holding a rugby ball and a girl drew a woman in ordinary clothes in a forest. Another girl (who described her own national identity as Polish) made a drawing of her friend from another named town in the South Wales valleys (See Figure 21). The image shows a female in a patterned skirt and top. Annotations relating to the prompt questions maintain that Welsh people can be any body shape and can have any skin or hair colour but ‘They tell you that they like being Welsh’ (Figure 21). Her perception of Welsh people reflected an acknowledgement of the pride in being Welsh exhibited by the Welsh people she had encountered.
Seven males were drawn in sporting clothing. Four of these drawings (all drawn by boys) were of rugby players; in some instances they had other symbolic images alongside them. Four of the boys sat on the same table in the classroom and so they may have influenced each other during the drawing process. One child drew a rugby ball, daffodil and some Welsh cakes alongside the image (See Figure 22) and another child drew a rugby ball and some coal (Figure 23). As part of the interview, the boy was asked to describe his reasons for drawing the rugby player and the coal. He said that ‘Welsh is quite associated with rugby cos it’s the national sport so I put like a rugby ball and the Welsh kit on. Then like Cardiff used to be, Wales used to be the world’s greatest coal exporter,’ (School B, 2).
Another image was labelled as Gareth Bale (Premier League and Welsh international footballer at the time of data collection). Alongside the drawing of the footballer was a
glass of beer and Welsh cakes (a traditional small, flat cake made with currants). Non-specific sporting images consisted of a male drawn wearing a large supporter’s glove with a rugby ball and sticks alongside and a male in a sports kit with a daffodil (drawn by a girl). The daffodil is the national flower of Wales.

Five girls drew pictures of females in traditional Welsh costumes (See Figures 24 and 25 for examples). When one of the girls was asked about the reason for this image she commented that ‘I have drawn a Welsh person because on St David’s Day more people wear like dresses and all that, like it’s more common here’ (School B, 4). St. David is the patron saint of Wales and the first of March is St. David’s Day. It is customary for children to wear traditional Welsh clothing to school on this day or during the accompanying cultural celebration known as an eisteddfod. Girls usually wear the Welsh hat, shawl, skirt and apron and boys often wear flat caps and waistcoats or Welsh rugby shirts. None of the boys in school B drew images of traditional clothing, which may indicate that wearing the national costume was more significant for the girls. However, the boys did depict their Welsh figures in Welsh rugby or football kit in this school. Other drawings included two people (one in yellow jumper) and a female in ballet outfit with a music player. One child drew an image which was a smaller replica of the drawing in the first box (where the children were asked to draw a self-portrait).

Figure 24: School B, Image 9
5.1.3 School C – Image Content

In school C which was the Welsh-medium school, 28 children took part in the drawing activity and the recurrent themes are shown in the table below (Table 12). Twenty five of the children drew a Welsh person in accordance with their own gender, i.e. boys drew male figures and girls drew females. However, one girl in this class chose to draw a male figure of a footballer and another girl drew a rugby player. One boy drew a female in ordinary clothing in a red dress.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image Content</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary clothes</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Kit</td>
<td>11 (10 male and 1 female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer</td>
<td>2 (2 males)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>28</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eleven males were drawn in sporting clothing. Seven of these drawings (six drawn by boys and one by a girl) were of football players; in most instances they had a football alongside them. One child had also drawn other players in the vicinity of the main character. Three of the drawings were labelled as Gareth Bale (Welsh international footballer), one as Aaron Ramsey (Welsh international footballer) and one as Craig Bellamy (Welsh international footballer). There are two drawings of footballers which are unnamed (one drawn by a girl). Four drawings of rugby players feature; one is identified as Leigh Halfpenny (Welsh international rugby player) and Shane Williams (former Welsh international rugby player) was identified as being the character in another drawing. The other two drawings show a rugby player with a ball and rugby posts in one of the pictures (See Figure 22 for an example below). There were a lot of sporting images evident in this school, more than in the other two schools. There was no specific reason identified at the time of data collection. The inclusion of sporting images in all three schools is discussed further below.
In the drawings of Welsh people in ordinary clothing, most of the drawings do not have other objects included. Umbrellas are depicted in two drawings by girls. Two drawings (See Figures 27 and 28) are of farmers, both wearing flat caps and checked jackets, both drawn by boys who sat adjacent to each other in the classroom. One farmer is holding a Welsh flag and the other has a sheep in the foreground. The boy who drew the image of the farmer was interviewed and was asked about why he had drawn this image. He indicated that he had drawn the farmer because ‘it just occurred to me that a farmer would be a kind of a Welsh person. I don’t know why it just did,’ (School C, 5). He then went on to describe the drawing further ‘He’s got old kind of clothes I guess. He has a beard and he’s got a farmer hat,’ (School C, 5). The boy also notes that he was carrying the Welsh flag. Both of these drawings have interesting annotations which express ideas about Welsh pride, language and religion. Figure 27 included the phrase ‘It is epic to be Welsh’, reflecting this child’s perceptions regarding how Welsh people feel about their Welshness. Similarly, in Figure 28, being Welsh is equated to being happy. References to language are also seen, accent is referred to in Figure 27 and both children stated that their characters spoke Welsh. The theme of language is explored later in this chapter.
There was a predominance of sporting images seen in School C and the images above display an interesting theme reminiscent of the farmer drawing seen in School A. Other interesting drawings in this school included a head and shoulders portrait of a male and another drawing of a male wearing a hat, holding a gun. This drawing also features a house and an animal which is probably a dog. Unfortunately the child who drew this picture was not interviewed as part of the project.

5.2 Discussion of drawing content - Welsh person

Following on from the analysis of the image content in each school, the data from all three schools was considered together to identify the similarities and differences in the content of the pictures. From this examination of the 79 images, a number of issues emerged including the prevalence of sporting images, the use of symbolic images and evidence of the influences which may have had a bearing on the content of these drawings. Initially the drawings were grouped in line with the content of the drawings and can be seen in Table 13.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 13: Emergent Themes from Image Content (Schools A, B and C - Welsh Person)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary clothes</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Kit</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welsh costume</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>79</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Drawings of Welsh people in ordinary clothing was by far the most popular category (48 per cent). Characters wearing sports kit predominantly rugby or football outfits were also common (29 per cent). These drawings were frequently labelled with the names of well-known Welsh football and rugby players. Gareth Bale was the player who featured most often (6 instances). At the time of data gathering, Gareth Bale was playing in the Premier
League football team, Tottenham Hotspur and for the Welsh national side. It may also be significant to note that he is from this urban area of south Wales and attended School B (although he was only identified by one child in School B). Other famous Welsh people who were recorded included Shirley Bassey (1 instance). The Welsh singer appeared in the quiz activity and therefore this may have had some bearing on the child’s choice of image.

School C had the highest percentage of sporting images (39 per cent) and School A the lowest (18 per cent). Sporting images were clearly visible in the classroom in School B, photographs of school teams and trophies were displayed around the environment and the class teacher was responsible for PE throughout the school, including managing the school teams. This may have influenced the children’s drawings in this school/classroom (29 per cent of drawings in School B featured sporting images). However, the highest number of sporting images were evident in school C, which did not have such a sports orientated environment. While the school has been identified as an influential factor in determining children’s national identity in previous studies (Waldron and Pike, 2006, Barrett 1997 and 2001), it is difficult to draw concrete conclusions about the influence of the classroom and the school environment in this instance. The learning environment, including the teacher, may have impacted on the imagery seen in the drawings in School B. However, there was no evidence to support this in School C.

Scourfield et al. (2006b) collected data in primary schools across Wales and found that children’s discussions of nation and national identity were framed by sporting markers. Rugby was particularly identified as a signifier of Welshness. The influence of sport on the content of the children’s drawings of a Welsh person can clearly be seen in this study. Football and rugby players were frequently depicted in similar numbers. Unlike the Scourfield research, there does not appear to be a particular bias towards rugby players in the illustrations gathered in the three schools. The influence of sport, predominantly rugby, has also been noted in research studies that have explored national identity in adults. For instance, Davies, Charles and Harris’ (2006) ethnographic investigation into Welsh national identity and the things that people attach to this identity noted support for national teams, especially the national rugby team, as a key theme emerging from the data. For the adults interviewed, the expression of Welsh national identity can be seen through support for national teams. This is comparable to the content of the children’s depictions in this study, many of the drawings that featured sporting images showed characters wearing the national team sporting kit (coloured in red) for either rugby or football with the symbols of the three feathers or the Welsh dragon. The three feathers (three white feathers encircled in
a gold coronet) is the heraldic badge of the Prince of Wales and is seen on the Welsh rugby shirt. Similarly the dragon is part of the Welsh flag and the emblem is used on the Welsh football shirt. Many of the children, particularly boys, seemed to equate Welshness with images of sporting figures. It is difficult to determine the actual reasoning behind this but this may be linked to media coverage of sporting events or attendance at such matches. These sporting occasions are often synonymous with displays of national pride including wearing red in the case of Wales and singing the national anthem. Therefore, some of the children may associate Welshness with these occasions and their accompanying traditions; hence the inclusion of the sporting images in their pictures.

As well as symbolic icons on sporting kit, alongside some of the drawings there were other images drawn which the children associated with Wales, for example, daffodils, Welsh cakes and coal (the latter images are seen in Figures 22 and 23). Children’s knowledge of national and cultural emblems is an under researched area, particularly with regard to how this links to their national identity. Moore and Kramer-Moore (2004) consider these symbolic images to be calling cards or visual identifiers, which can be seen from the outside but are also used by citizens to denote affiliation with a nation. Many of the children seemed aware of these visual identifiers and they used them frequently in and around their drawings of a Welsh person without being prompted to do so. Developmental studies (Weinstein, 1957; Jahoda, 1963; Barrett, 1995) maintain that children’s knowledge of emblems increases with age. In this study children aged nine to ten had acquired an understanding of the symbolic images which are associated with Wales and could justify their inclusion in their drawings, as seen in the discussion around the coal in Figure 23. The coal in Figure 23 was drawn because the child commented that Cardiff had been a major exporter of coal in the past. As the image of coal is not traditionally used as a signifier of Welsh national identity, this link between Welshness and the industrial heritage of Wales may have originated from curricula content and this will be considered in the subsequent sections of this chapter. Figure 28 shows a farmer carrying a flag. Flags were used in the work of Connolly, Smith and Kelly (2002) where even very young children (90 per cent of six year olds) were able to identify with flags and football jerseys. Therefore it is not surprising that the nine and ten year olds here are demonstrating their understanding of what they think it means to be Welsh through their drawings of flags and other symbolic images, including the national rugby and football kits.

Traditional Welsh costumes were only portrayed in School B and the image did not occur in any other school. As this arose only in the one school again it is problematic to identify
what had influenced these girls when choosing to draw these images. As part of the interview process, one girl was asked about this and revealed that the reasoning behind the drawing was because wearing these costumes was common in Wales on St David’s Day. Most of these children were sitting together and therefore peer influence may have impacted on the content of their drawings. The two boys who drew farmers in School C also sat together. Cox’s (1993) evaluation of children’s drawing of the human figures discussed the influence that children have on each other’s artwork. She noted the cultural diversity seen in children’s drawings from different parts of the world, where children have replicated parallel features within their drawings. Although there is some evidence of children using similar motifs in their drawings, there was also evidence of diversity in the visual data.

In their depictions of Welsh traditional costumes, the children were mirroring a somewhat clichéd view of Welshness, as these costumes are generally only worn at cultural celebrations such as St. David’s Day celebrations and eisteddfodau. This is substantiated by the response received in the interview process where the girl who was interviewed cited that it is common for these dresses to be worn on St. David’s Day. The perception of Welsh national identity displayed here, in their drawings of traditional dress, may indicate an awareness of the cultural symbols of Wales, as discussed above, when the children had included other emblematic objects in their drawings. The promotion of the cultural aspect of Wales is one of the goals of the Curriculum Cymreig as debated in Chapter 2. The children depicting Welsh national dress and cultural markers such as flags, daffodils and Welsh cakes are displaying a knowledge of traditional Welsh culture. However it is difficult to attribute this to specific curricula influences cited as a reason in subsequent discussions with the children.

The farmer image appeared three times in two schools. It is possible that the school may be a contributory factor in this instance or again there might have been be other prompts which may have motivated their choice of image. In School A, the teacher linked this farmer image to the assembly which had taken placed on the morning of data collection. The image can be seen in Figure 19 and the boy who drew this played the role of a farmer in the assembly presentation. Consequently a more direct connection can be made with what had occurred at the school and the picture drawn by this child. The subsequent interview is considered above and the boy stated that he drew the farmer because ‘I based mine on a farmer cos when Welsh people are in the country, they normally have a farm.’ (School A, 3) In School C where the two other farmer drawings were collected (Figures
273 and 28), one of the pupils who drew a farmer was interviewed as discussed previously but could give no rationale regarding why he had drawn a farmer, stating that it had just occurred to him. The other image of the farmer was drawn by his friend who sat next to him in the drawing activity but the other boy was not interviewed. Therefore it is difficult to ascertain whether one of the boys was duplicating what the other was drawing, as in the peer influence described by Cox (1993), and why they had both drawn farmers.

Theorists such as Gellner (2006) and Guibernau (2007) have explored the primary influences which impact on national identity. Both cited media as one of the influences that has a pronounced role in shaping opinions on national identity. Barrett’s large scale work in 1997 and 2001 also established media as a factor in influencing children’s views about national identity. Similarly Waldron and Pike’s (2006) analysis of Irish national identity had a number of media images represented in the children’s drawings collected as part of their study such as the ‘Guinness harp’. Media images such as those seen in the Irish study, did not feature prominently in the children’s drawings as part of the present inquiry. The celebrity, Shirley Bassey, was named in one drawing but as her image was presented to the children in the quiz prior to the completion of the images this may have prompted her inclusion in the drawing process. As previously considered, sporting images were often represented in the visual data and this may link to media coverage of large scale sporting events characterised by anthem singing, flag waving and the wearing of national colours. Barrett (2007) reflected on the sway that the mass media as well as visual and literary images have on children’s national identity. There was no evidence of literary images or characters from Welsh literature in the children’s drawings, however there were visual signifiers of national identity depicted such as for example, flags, daffodils and national costume.

Most of the children drew a Welsh person in accordance with their own gender. This is concurrent with previous research carried out by Silver (1997). She used DAS task (Draw a Story task) to investigate the style and content of children’s drawings. The results of these tests support the theory that girls tend to draw girls and boys draw boys. There were five girls who drew male figures and one boy who drew a female figure. Where the girls drew male representations, three of these drawings showed males dressed in sports kit and two were in ordinary clothing. The boy drew the female in a red dress (red is a colour associated with the Welsh flag, national costume and the sporting kit of the national teams in Wales). In Silver’s study (1997) children who drew images of the opposite gender
tended to draw negative representations of these subjects. However this was not the case here.

Most of the children drew a full body image of the Welsh person positioned centrally in the space provided for their illustration. Due to differing times for the drawing activity, not all children were able to colour in their images. The colour red features in many of the drawings in which colour was used. This colour is represented on the Welsh flag in the form of the Welsh dragon and is the colour of the national team shirt for both rugby and football. Therefore, this explains its inclusion in the coloured images, particularly when the children have drawn sporting characters in their drawings of a Welsh person.

5.3 Analysis of annotations (Welsh person)

The children were asked to draw their pictures and to annotate their drawings if they wanted to. They were given some questions as prompts on their templates to help them. The questions can be seen in Table 9. The annotated data gathered in each school is discussed below.

5.3.1 School A

In School A, 20 out of the 25 drawings were annotated. Some had a substantial amount of writing and the children continued to write on the back of their page, others had just written a few words. Most children used the questions as the starting point for their writing. Three children wrote biographical details of the person they had drawn, namely Gareth Bale, Aaron Ramsey and Gareth Edwards.

Eighteen children commented on skin colour in School A. Sixteen of these children used terms such as beige, light, white, peach, cream, fair and the most popular response pale (five children). Two children wrote that a Welsh person would have tanned skin. One of the children who wrote this had drawn Shirley Bassey and so it is likely that she was probably referring to the skin colour of the person she had drawn. The other child who indicated tanned skin defined herself as half Welsh and half Scottish. Two children said any colour, one of these children stated that he was Welsh and the other child was Pakistani/Welsh/British and female.

In terms of hair colour, in School A, 15 children commented on hair colour. Light brown or brown featured in five responses and black featured in two responses. Blonde appeared once and in a combination with other colours on two occasions. Three children commented on hair style rather than hair colour citing either long or curly or spikey. Eight children
commented on eye colour. Four children wrote that the Welsh person would have blue eyes, one stated green and one brown. The other children who responded used the terms turquoise and bluey green.

One of the prompt question was related to body shape. Two children commented that Welsh people could have any body shape. One of these children said that a Welsh person ‘Looks like any other person’ (School A, drawing 27). Other quotes included a ‘Welsh person is big with broad shoulders and muscly and tall’ (School A, drawing 18). Another girl said that the Welsh person she had drawn had ‘rosy cheeks and very red lipstick’ (School A, drawing 14). These comments relating to body shape do not present a consensus of opinion in relation to whether Welsh people are characterised by this particular physical characteristic. The rationale for the use of the prompts is discussed in the evaluation of the methodology, particularly with regard to this prompt question and the children’s responses.

Fourteen children commented on the language spoken by the Welsh person they had depicted. The most popular response was Welsh and English (eight children) followed by Welsh (five children). No other languages were mentioned but one child did comment that their person could have any accent. The term accent also featured in two further comments. One child said ‘She is not afraid to have a Welsh accent’ (School A, drawing 26). Another child said that the person would speak Welsh and that the ‘accent is different’ (School A, drawing 20).

The only religion mentioned was Christian. Eight children stated that the Welsh person would be or usually is Christian. One child (School A, drawing 9) said that the person could be any religion and also commented that a Welsh person could have any skin colour and any body shape.

There were a varied range of hobbies documented. Football occurred five times, rugby twice and sport twice. Other hobbies listed included swimming, knitting, golf, painting, drawing and colouring. One child (School A, drawing 9) said that a Welsh person could have any hobby.

Eight children commented on what was important to Welsh people. Recurrent themes were The Welsh National anthem (mentioned five times), family (two occurrences) and friends documented twice. One child also stated that ‘Everything is important to them; it means supporting Welsh Rugby, football, sports and knowing Welsh national anthem’ (School A, drawing 25).
The children were also asked via the prompts to consider how the person viewing the drawing would know that this person is Welsh. There were some interesting comments in relation to this question in the interviews, however only three children responded when annotating their images. Their responses are listed below and all of them referred to clothing in some way and how the clothing that these characters were wearing is an indicator of their national identity. Another child alludes to skin colour in tandem with clothing.

‘He is Welsh because of his skin colour; his clothes tell us that he is Welsh’ (School A, drawing 7).

‘Her top tells us she’s Welsh. To her being Welsh is a part of being something big’ (School A, drawing 15).

‘Red top, because our dragon is red’ (School A, drawing 18).

In summary of School A, language was commented on by over half of the sample. Many of the children considered physical characteristics such as skin colour and hair colour. Other quotes about religion of Welsh people and what was important to Welsh people were also insightful in revealing the children’s ideas about what it means to be Welsh.

5.3.2 School B

From the data accumulated from School B, 23 out of the 24 drawings were annotated. Most children used the questions as the starting point for their writing. The amount of writing varied on each drawing and some of the children continued to write on the back of their page as well as around their drawings, while others wrote brief notes on the pictures.

Fifteen children commented on the skin colour of a Welsh person in School B and 13 of these children used terms such as pale, white, peach, cream or creamy and fair skinned. The most popular responses were pale (four children) and white (four children). One child described Welsh people as having all kinds of skin colours, whilst another child said that skin colour was ‘normal’ (School B, drawing 1). Drawing 24 was annotated and stated that most Welsh people are quite fair skinned but not all of them.

In terms of hair colour, brown was the most common colour stated, with seven children saying that the Welsh person would have brown hair. Black was the second most popular category (three children) and blonde was selected by two children. A further two children gave a list of different hair colours in their responses including brown, black, blonde and
ginger. Fourteen children in total commented on hair colour. Some children also mentioned hair style in addition to colour, for example, three children described the hairstyle as spiky.

When commenting on the appearance of a Welsh person, four children expressed an eye colour (two recorded a response of blue eyes and two, green eyes). Body shape was only indicated twice with drawing 23 indicating that Welsh people were ‘Fat or thin in middle’ (School B, drawing 23) and ‘They can be tall, short, thin fat, I think they look normal’ (School B drawing 20). A further comment evidenced in School B drawing 9 noted that ‘A Welsh person can look like anything’. Drawing 17 included the comment that a Welsh person was average and had freckles.

Twenty one children wrote about language in their responses, nine children indicated that a Welsh person would speak a combination of English and Welsh. Out of the nine children, five children cited English and Welsh, whereas the remaining four children alluded to Welsh first in their writing i.e. Welsh and English. One child included French alongside English and Welsh. Seven children recorded Welsh as the singular language spoken and two said English. One child commented that if the Welsh person in the drawing ‘wants to say something secret she could speak Welsh’ (School B, drawing 14). Another interesting reflection on language was seen in drawing 24 where the child asserted ‘Some people don’t speak Welsh, they also speak English. Welsh people express Welsh.’

Religion was mentioned in 14 instances. The most cited religion was Christian, (shown in five drawings) and another example featured the word Christian or Catholic. One child wrote Catholic and another comment reflected that ‘Some can be Muslims’ (School B, drawing 1). Different religion or any religion was recorded four times in total and one child said ‘No Welsh person has a specific religion.’ Two children indicated that a Welsh person would have no religion.

A variety of hobbies was listed by the children (10 responses in total). Sports cited included rugby (three instances), football (one instance and swimming (one instance). Sewing featured in three of the annotations and knitting in two. Singing was written in one response and dancing presented in three drawings (cited specifically as ballet in one instance).

The children were asked what they felt was important to Welsh people and seven children in total documented a response to this question. Symbols associated with Wales occurred in four responses one child stated ‘Leeks and daffodils are important’ (School B, drawing 3). St David (patron saint of Wales) or St. David’s Day also appeared four times. Two of
the children talked about pride in being Welsh or stated that ‘it means a lot to be Welsh’ (School B, drawing 4).

When asked to identify how you would know that the person in the drawing was Welsh, 12 children wrote about this. The opinions expressed were varied and rugby and birthplace were frequent themes. Two children gave birthplace as an indicator of Welshness. They stated that the characters in the drawings were born in Wales. Rugby was also mentioned by two children, for example, ‘Wales is known for rugby’ (School B, drawing 24). One child had clearly linked their comment to the footballer that they had depicted in the drawing, Gareth Bale and said that you would know that he was Welsh because ‘He plays for Wales’ (School B, drawing 11). Other replies included they ‘speak different’ (School B, drawing 1) and you can tell they are Welsh by their clothes. Another child indicated that Welsh people were ‘fit and have lots of energy, they wear T-shirts and jeans’ (School B, drawing 15) and ‘They tell you they like being Welsh’ (School B, drawing 8). More ambiguous responses were ‘Some people will have different opinions on what it means to be Welsh’ (School B, drawing 6) and ‘It is important to be Welsh because my uncle played for Wales’ (School B, drawing 12).

In summary and in comparison with School A, there were more annotations in School B. The children’s annotations revealed a number of responses around skin colour and hair colour, which was similar to School A. Language was commented on by most of the children and over half the sample discussed indicators of Welshness in their drawings. Religion and hobbies were also discussed by a significant number of children.

5.3.3 School C

In School C, all 28 drawings were annotated. In common with the other two schools there were differing amounts of writing on or around each picture. In some cases the children continued to write on the back of their page as well as around their drawings. Others wrote briefly around the periphery of their pictures. Most children used the questions as the starting point for their writing and in general described their drawings when discussing the appearance of a Welsh person. When reflecting on appearance the term ‘different’ featured frequently (10 times). Comments such as ‘Welsh people are all different’ (School C, drawing 1) and ‘Everyone is different’ (School C, drawing 6) were typical of the annotations made. Several children wrote biographical and descriptive details of the sports person that they had drawn, namely the Welsh footballers Gareth Bale (three instances) and Aaron Ramsey (‘I am proud to be Welsh’ is recorded in a speech bubble) and another
player named as Nomuli Talli. The rugby player Leigh Halfpenny was also drawn by one of the children and they described his appearance and gave biographical information.

Twenty one children commented on skin colour. White skin occurred 12 times although in one of those instances the child commented that the person could have ‘black or white skin’ (School C, drawing 1). Pink skin was recorded by one child and ‘normal plain skin’ (School C, drawing 22) by another. Two children stated that Welsh people could have any colour skin and the remaining responses were similar, for example, ‘Doesn’t matter what skin colour she has’ (School C, drawing 3).

Hair colour was mentioned 20 times. Brown was the most popular hair colour (five children chose this) with black and yellow hair each occurring four times. Other colours described include ginger (two occurrences), light (one occurrence) and blonde (one occurrence). Any colour hair was written on one drawing and different coloured hair on another. One child commented on hair style rather than colour, i.e. spiky hair.

Five children discussed body shape, these annotations were varied and included reference to height (tall or short), build (slim, skinny or fat) and features such as head shape. One child recorded that the Welsh person he had drawn (a rugby player) had a fit body with a round head and big ears (School C, drawing 7). Eye colour was referred to in two instances, i.e. dark and blue eyes.

Language was referenced on 19 occasions. Welsh was the most popular response when the children were asked what language a Welsh person speaks. This occurred in eight instances and in addition to this, one child stated ‘Welsh language is important. A Welsh person speaks Welsh in a different voice’ (School C, drawing 10). Two children wrote that Welsh people speak English and Welsh, whereas five children cited Welsh and English. Other similar expressions were ‘Most speak English and some speak Welsh’ (School C, drawing 8) and ‘speaks English and a tiny bit of Welsh’ (School C, drawing 9). One child identified English as the language spoken by a Welsh person.

The only religion specifically affirmed was Christian (five children) and two further answers noted that Welsh people were not religious or had no religion. Hobbies listed were sports, shopping and walking, however when asked about the hobbies of their depicted Welsh person, one statement said ‘They do what they like’ (School C, drawing 1). Two children recorded that Welsh people played sport but one child established a gender difference in their writing, i.e. Boys’ hobbies are sport and girls’ hobbies are shopping.
Rugby and football were listed in three responses and ‘play rugby’ was documented by another child.

When asked what is important to Welsh people, only three children wrote about this. One child declared that an ornament or trophy may be important but this was dependent on the age of the person. Other responses were ‘family and friends are important’ (School C, drawing 8) and ‘Sport is important to them’ (School C, drawing 11).

Finally children were asked to comment on how we know that the person in the drawing is Welsh. Two children referred to birthplace as being significant in establishing whether a person is Welsh. Other remarks were focused around pride in being Welsh (two instances) and one drawing had the written declaration that ‘They love to be Welsh’ (School C, drawing 16). Happiness was also listed as a factor, i.e. ‘To be Welsh you must be happy’ (School C, drawing 5).

All the drawings were annotated in this school, which was not the case in the other schools. Skin colour and hair colour were discussed frequently by the children, in common with the other schools. Perhaps more significantly, in this school language was commented on by 19 out of 28 children. The findings emerging from the accumulated annotations in all three schools will be explored in the next section of this chapter.

5.4 Discussions of annotations - Welsh person

The data from the annotations was initially considered in each school as outlined in the previous section. Further analysis and comparisons were then conducted using the accumulated written material from all three schools. The children predominantly used the prompt questions on their sheets to annotate their drawings. This was then utilised as a framework to establish any inferences that arose from the children’s written notes. Annotations were considered in terms of physical appearance, taking account of the children’s written statements relating skin, hair and eye colour as well as body shape. Other significant topics were then established in light of the prompt questions and the annotated evidence, that is, language, religion and hobbies. What is important to Welsh people was also compared across all three schools and how we know that the person in the drawing is Welsh.

5.4.1 Physical appearance

Within the prompt questions children were asked to consider skin, hair and eye colour, as well as body shape. There were common responses that occurred across all three schools.
In terms of skin colour, the most common terms used were white, peach, fair, cream and pale. These terms were used regardless of the child’s own skin colour. When asked to comment on why the person in the drawing was Welsh, one child wrote ‘He is Welsh because of his skin colour,’ (School A, drawing 7). This child indicated that the skin colour of the person he had drawn was ‘very light or light’ (School A, drawing 7). Scourfield and Davies (2005) carried out qualitative research on children’s national and local identities in Wales, conducted with 8–11 year olds in six primary schools across Wales, with schools selected to provide diversity of region, language, social class and ethnicity. This notion of whiteness was seen in their findings where Welshness was viewed in association with whiteness. This perception of Welsh people being white skinned was common across the different ethnic groups represented in the current study. Typically children who considered themselves as Welsh, as well as the children who ascribed to other national identity categories, labelled Welsh people as having white skin. In two instances in School A, the term tanned skin was used. The child who drew Shirley Bassey (this Welsh singer’s paternal descent is Nigerian) labelled her drawing of a Welsh person as having tanned skin which is in keeping with the profile of the singer. Another girl also used this term in her annotations. Scourfield and Davies (2005) also found evidence of inclusivity in their data and this is also supported by the children’s written comments in this study. A small minority of children noted that Welsh people could have any colour skin or that it ‘Doesn’t matter what skin colour she has’ (School C, drawing 3). The notion of inclusivity is embedded in the National Curriculum and Curriculum Cymreig, promoting equal opportunities for all learners. In 2010, the Welsh Assembly Government reiterated in the ‘Unity and Diversity’ guidance for learning providers that schools had a duty ‘to develop the knowledge and understanding, skills, values and attitudes which will enable learners to participate in our multi-ethnic society in Wales’ (Welsh Assembly Government, 2010 b). Despite this directive and the embedded curricula which were common to all of the three schools that participated in this study, the concept of seeing Wales as a multi-ethnic nation as described within these documents, was not evident in the majority of responses given by the children in this study.

Although the children in the study appeared to have very definite opinions about skin colour, ideas about hair colour and eye colour did not produce such unified responses. Brown or black were the most cited in terms of hair colour. Fourteen children from the entire sample (17 per cent) commented on eye colour. Blue was the recurrent colour quoted with green and brown also mentioned. Body shape elicited some interesting responses, in retrospect this question may have found this a difficult question to consider.
In school A, one girl stated the ‘Welsh person is big with broad shoulders and muscly and tall,’ (School A, drawing 18) and ‘Quite muscly’ (School A, drawing 8) is a term used by another child in School A. When giving biographical details of specific sportsmen in their drawings, their body shapes are often described. Craig Bellamy (Welsh footballer) is described as ‘Very athletic’ (School C, drawing 2).

When reviewing the data gathered in all three schools, the findings indicate that children had very specific ideas about skin colour when considering Welsh people. This seems to be significant across all three settings. Whiteness was associated with Welshness by the children in this study regardless of their own skin colour and their own assertions of their national identity. With the evolution of Wales as an ethnically varied nation, this poses questions for educators and policy makers, parents and caregivers regarding further embedding of notions of inclusivity, in order to ensure that children are made aware of the diversity evident in contemporary Wales.

5.4.2 Language

When asked to comment on the language spoken by the person in their drawing, the most common response in Schools A and B was Welsh and English (17 children in total). However in School C (the Welsh-medium school), Welsh was cited most frequently (eight children) with Welsh and English recorded by 7 children. Twelve children in total in Schools A and B also said that the character in their pictures spoke Welsh. Only one other language was mentioned and that was French alongside English and Welsh by a child in School B.

The current Welsh government policy regarding the Welsh language is firmly focussed around creating a bilingual nation cemented through the publication of Iaith Pawb in 2003, the Welsh Language Strategy, which covers the planning period of 2012 to 2017, produced in accordance with Section 78 of the Government of Wales Act (2006) and the Welsh-medium Education Strategy (2010). In the latter document, the emphasis is not only the need to promote the Welsh language in educational contexts but similarly to create opportunities for children to use Welsh in social situations, so the Welsh is not confined to use within the classroom. There is a strong connection between the drive to create bilingual Wales and the data collected in the current project. The annotations of the children in the three schools reflected the view that Welsh people in Wales should be speaking Welsh and English. The predominant response in the Welsh-medium primary school was that the Welsh person in their drawing would be speaking Welsh. This was the second most cited category in Schools A and B.
It is interesting to note that, despite the multiple national identities presented in Chapter 4 in all three schools, aside from Welsh and English, the only other language mentioned was French. ESTYN inspection data (2006, 2009, 2010) gathered in the three schools indicated that a proportion of pupils in each school have English as a second language. This equated to around five per cent in School B and School C, with 37 per cent in School A. The other languages present in the schools were not reflected in the children’s perceptions of the language spoken by a Welsh person. Many children categorised themselves as Welsh in combination with one or more other nations, for example, half Welsh and half Pakistani (School A), Welsh and half Greek (School B) and Welsh and Iranian (School C), yet these national languages did not appear when adding notes to their drawings a Welsh person. Their depictions of a Welsh person may thus be representing someone other than themselves, even if they had used the term Welsh in their self-categorisation of national identity. The prompt question asked the children about what language a Welsh person speaks. In hindsight the term languages may have generated a different response. However most of the children did include Welsh and English when commenting on this. There were no indications that any of the children had drawn themselves when creating a Welsh person.

In School A, three children referred to accent in their annotations. This was not replicated in the other two schools. This may perhaps have been related to a particular topic that had recently been discussed within the classroom.

5.4.3 Religion

Christianity was the dominant religion reported in the annotations. Eighteen children in total said that the Welsh person that they had drawn was Christian. In School B, one child said ‘Some can be Muslim’ (School B, drawing 1), this was the only time that another religion was noted and this child defined her own identity as Welsh. In all schools a minority of children said that the person could be any religion or that it didn’t matter or that their illustrated character was not religious. Connolly, Smith and Kelly (2002)’s work with communities in Northern Ireland, looked at the interplay between community, identity and religion. This research was conducted in a country which was, and still is to some extent, deeply divided along religious lines. It looked at how children identified with particular religious groups, in this case the Protestant and Catholic communities. Children in this investigation had strong allegiances to particular religious communities from the age of six onwards. Although Wales does not have the religious tensions seen in Northern Ireland and therefore may not be so acutely aware of allegiances to particular religions and
communities, the children in the current inquiry distinctly perceive Christianity to be the principal religion of Welsh people.

In the 2011 census, 58 per cent (1.8m) of people in Wales named Christianity as their belief, which indicated a 14 per cent drop in the ten year period since 2001 (ONS, 2011). According to the 1996 Education Act ‘Every agreed syllabus shall reflect the fact that the religious traditions in Great Britain are in the main Christian, whilst taking account of the teaching and practices of the other principal religions represented in Great Britain’ (Education Act 1996, Section 375 (3)). In Wales, the curriculum for religious education is formulated in agreed syllabuses determined by education authorities and the Standing Advisory Council for Religious Education (SACRE) in each local area. In the area of southeast Wales where the research was conducted, the agreed syllabus for RE was adopted in 2008 in line with changes to the National Curriculum and readopted in 2013 (Cardiff Council, 2013). This framework for the delivery of religious education in schools advocated that Christianity should be studied at all key stages alongside the other principal religions represented in Great Britain (Cardiff Council, 2008). At key stage two, the other principal religions for study are identified as Judaism and Islam. The predominance of Christianity in the educational framework and resulting in the subsequent emphasis in the classroom is mirrored in the children’s perceptions of the religion and Welsh people. Although the curriculum is certainly not the only influence on the children in this study, they clearly identified Christianity as the prevalent religion in Wales. Whilst a small number of children indicated that people can be any religion in their responses, Christianity was the most frequently cited as the religion of Welsh people.

5.4.4 Hobbies

In response to the prompt question about hobbies, the children in the study frequently cited sporting activities as the hobbies that Welsh people would be involved in. Football and rugby were the sports that were noted most regularly, but other sports such as swimming and golf were also mentioned. There was evidence of a gender difference when considering hobbies. Sewing, knitting, dancing and painting were named as hobbies by girls, for example, in School B three girls listed knitting and sewing and three other girls wrote dancing. Sport was usually given as a response by the boys. The gender bias is evident in other studies not just within a UK context but in other countries too. In Stratford’s work in Australia in 2000, boys listed their hobbies as skateboarding and bike riding and similarly in Finland, Suoranta and Lehtimaki (2004) found that girls listed...
gymnastics, dancing and arts and crafts in their top five hobbies, as opposed to ball games and other more physical activities listed by boys.

From the analysis of the written data acquired in the three schools, the children in this study had stereotypical views about hobbies and these views were gender specific. When the Welsh person was depicted as male, the hobbies listed were mainly sporting activities, whereas female hobbies were linked to arts and crafts, although some girls did list sports such as swimming. As stated previously, most children drew an image which was consistent with their own gender. It is difficult to ascertain whether the hobbies which were attributed to Welsh person were the hobbies that the child participated in as they were not asked about this. However, the influence of gender specific hobby choices is evident but there is no clear link between national identity and the hobbies described. The listed pastimes were generic and, whilst the inclusion of rugby could be perceived as having specifically Welsh connotations and associated to national identity as seen in Scourfield et al. (2006b), it was not the predominant hobby listed in this investigation.

5.4.5 Things which are important to a Welsh person

The Welsh National Anthem, St David or St David’s day and emblems were recurrent responses when the children were asked what is important to Welsh people. Children’s relationship with emblems has been explored in terms of development studies in the work of Weinstein (1957), Jahoda (1963) and Barrett (1995). All of these researchers support the notion that children’s knowledge of emblems increases with age and Barrett (1995) noted that children gained knowledge about their own national symbols more quickly than emblems of other nations. The children in this study expressed the view that a range national symbols or emblems were important to Welsh people, particularly the Welsh National Anthem.

Winstone and Witherspoon’s recent musical study in 2015 explored thoughts, feelings and associations expressed by 8-10 year olds when listening to the British National Anthem to establish the role of the anthem in their maintenance and validation of national identity. In their project, the 10-year-old children generated more national associations to the National Anthem than younger children, which supports the developmental perspectives described previously. Whilst the national anthem is not sung on a daily basis in classrooms as in other nations, it is usually sung in events such as eisteddfodau which celebrate Welsh culture and in sporting occasion. These eisteddfodau are usually held around St. David’s
day to celebrate the life of the patron saint of Wales. The Welsh national anthem and St. David were evidenced as being important to Welsh people as part of the annotated data.

In the previous chapter, when asked to discuss their rationale for national identity choices, family was established as influential in the children’s perception of their own national identity. Similarly, when asked about what is important to Welsh people, children in all three schools wrote family and friends. At this age, nine to ten years, the influence of family on a child’s national identity has been established in research by Barrett’s (2007). His social-cognitive-motivational theory emphasises the parental role in shaping children’s views about national identity. In the same way Scourfield et al. (2006b) recognised the role of family as a primary influence on children’s national identity and also the impact of friends. In the current study, children deemed family and friends as being significant to Welsh people and with regard to family, as an important influence on their own national identity.

5.4.6 Characteristics which tell us that a person is Welsh

The children were invited to comment on how the observer of the drawing would know that the figure depicted was Welsh. There were a limited number of answers to this in the children’s annotations, particularly in Schools A and C (three children in School A and six children in School C). In School B, 12 children commented on this. The appearance of the character in the drawing was often cited in their writing. Skin colour was mentioned once but clothing, particularly if the character was wearing a red top or national sporting kit, was considered to be a defining factor. Physical appearance was considered in 5.4.1 and skin colour was recognised as a significant factor. Some children who had labelled their drawing as a particular sports person gave biographical details about that footballer or rugby player.

Birthplace was mentioned by children in Schools A and B. This tallies with the data gathered as part of the first research question when the children were interviewed about the rationale for their own national identity and similar results were evidenced by Carrington and Short’s (1996; 1999) in Scotland and Scourfield et al. (2006b) in Wales. Pride in being Welsh was noted in several annotations, particularly in School C (the Welsh-medium school), for example, ‘They love to be Welsh’ (School C, drawing 16) and ‘It is epic to be Welsh’ (School C, drawing 18). This is consistent with the prevalence of the term Welsh in singular and multiple categorisations of national identity as discussed in Chapter 4.
5.5 Analysis of interview data

Following on from the completion the drawing and annotations, the researcher and the class teacher in each school discussed the children’s work in order to establish a sample of pupils to participate in the interview process as discussed in Chapter 3. During the interview process, the drawings were used as prompts for the discussion and the children were asked to discuss their illustration of a Welsh person with the interviewer and the physical features of the person they had drawn for example, skin and hair colour and body shape. Other key questions related to language, religion, occupation, hobbies and what was important to the person on the picture and how an observer could tell whether this person was Welsh.

5.5.1 School A

Six children (three boys and three girls) were interviewed individually in total, two of the children (one boy and one girl) chosen for interview had drawn a sporting figure, in this case both footballers. One child named his footballer as Gareth Bale and this child described him when answering the interview questions, ‘He’s got black hair and pale skin, he’s a left footer and he’s quite tall’ (School A, interview 2). Another child (School A, interview 3) described the farmer that he had drawn and said that this was based on his perception of Welsh people living on farms in the country. Five of the children drew a Welsh person concomitant with their own gender. Apart from two children who described themselves as Welsh, the other four children recorded themselves as having multiple national identities.

All children described the skin colour of the Welsh person as being pale, light or white. However one child (School A, interview 1) suggested that they might have pale skin but that it didn’t matter what you looked like. Another child stated ‘his colour is usually beige because you don’t have like many brown people who are Welsh’ (School A, interview 5). Hair colour was more varied with a range of colours being listed or the response ‘any colour’. Other than the child who stated that Gareth Bale was tall, the children did not comment on body shape.

In terms of language, three children said that the Welsh person would speak English or Welsh, with one child commenting that this would depend on which part of Wales you lived in. Two children stated Welsh and English and one child (School A, interview 4) said English and some Welsh (this child also spoke Urdu as a first language). The use of ‘and’
and ‘or’ is particularly interesting here as in the case of English or Welsh, this implies that this is a choice, whereas as Welsh and English implies that both languages would be spoken in tandem. Similarly the order in which the languages are stated may also be significant. One child also referred to accent in her conversation with the interviewer. She stated that the female in her drawing was ‘not afraid if people make fun of her Welsh accent’ (School A, interview 6).

Christianity occurred in all responses when the children were asked about the religion of the person that they had drawn. School A, interview 1 said ‘Christian or Muslim or any religion really’ and another child (School A, interview 4) said ‘mostly Christian.’ One child clarified a rationale for his response ‘Because in Wales, most people are Christian when they are born here’ (School A, interview 3).

The children were asked about the occupation or hobbies of their Welsh person. As previously discussed two of the children said that they had drawn a professional footballer and another child drew a farmer. School A, interview 6 said the person in her drawing was a doctor and another child stated that their person might typically be ‘Working in some leisure centres, in some shops’ (School A, interview 5). Hobbies listed included sport and painting; two children commented that the Welsh person could have any hobby.

When asked about what was important to Welsh people, the children’s answers were varied. Only one child was unsure of how to respond to this question. Family featured in three responses, ‘Depends on the person, family and friends are important to me’ (School A, interview 1) and ‘Family, most people in the world care about their family’ (School A, interview 3). Pride in their country was also cited as well as the Welsh National Anthem, community, culture and sport (one child specifically mentioned the national teams for rugby and football).

There was one question which the children found particularly difficult. They were asked how we would know that this person was Welsh from looking at the drawing. One child said you would need to ask the person, one did not know and another child indicated that you wouldn’t be able to tell from the drawing. Skin colour was considered to be a factor by one of the children. He stated that he would need to colour his picture in as ‘Because usually Welsh people have got beige skin’ (School A, interview 5).

5.5.2 School B

Five children (three boys and two girls) were interviewed in total, three of the children (two boys and one girl) chosen for interview had drawn a sporting figure, in this case
rugby players. One child cited the reason for this as ‘Rugby is the national sport of Wales’ (School B, interview 1) and another child said ‘Welsh is quite associated with rugby cos it’s the national sport so I put like a rugby ball and the Welsh kit on’ (School B, interview 2). Another child described their drawing of a female in traditional dress and stated ‘I have drawn a Welsh person because on St David’s day more people wear like dresses and all that, like it’s more common here.’ (School B, interview 3). Most children drew a Welsh person which paralleled their own gender with the exception of two children who described themselves as Welsh. The other four children recorded themselves as having multiple national identities.

All children described the skin colour of the Welsh person as being pale, creamy, peachy or white. Hair colour was more varied with a range of colours being listed. Body shape was commented on by the two boys who drew rugby players. The boy in interview 1 described his drawing by saying ‘Usually rugby players might have quite broad shoulders like you know like quite wide so I drew him with his shoulders a lot bigger’(School B, interview 1). In interview 2, (School B) the child that also drew a rugby player considered that the male in his picture was quite strong because ‘most rugby players are strong’ (School B, interview 2). Another child (School B, interview 3) said that the Welsh person in her picture had a pointy nose but did not add any further detail.

In terms of language, four children said that the Welsh person would speak English and Welsh, with one child noting that ‘He’s got quite a strong Welsh accent!’ (School B, interview 2). When discussing the issue of language further he remarked that they would speak the ‘same amount’ of both languages. One child said that the person in the drawing spoke English, but did not elaborate on this response.

Christianity occurred in three responses when the children were asked about the religion of the person that they had drawn. In School B, interview 1 said ‘I don’t think he believes in a religion’ and interviewee 2 had a similar response stating ‘he doesn’t like have a religion.’

The children were asked about the occupation or hobbies of their Welsh person. When occupation was discussed, two of the children said that they had drawn a professional rugby player. The other child who had drawn a rugby player said that ‘I’d say maybe he works for the Welsh Assembly Government but then he likes in his spare time to do a bit of rugby’ (School B, Interview 2). This comment is very interesting as it does not present a clichéd view of occupations in Wales, nevertheless it does relate to a specific Welsh institution which has its main base in the area of south east Wales where the data was collected. The other two children, both girls, cited that the person in the drawing worked
‘In a hospital’ (School B, interview 4) and ‘an animal care centre thing’ (School B, interview 5). Hobbies listed included sport, mentioned by two boys. Other hobbies cited included as singing, horse riding and cycling.

When asked about what was important to Welsh people, the children’s answers were varied. Family featured in two responses, one child linked family and tradition together and when asked to explain what he meant by this, he responded, ‘Like stuff they did back a long time ago maybe that they keep in the family’ (School B, interview 2). Rugby also featured in two responses. Two children were keen to point out that the country of Wales and being Welsh was important to Welsh people. Interviewee 1 (School B) commented ‘they like to be Welsh’ and another child stated ‘Wales is their country’ (School B, interview 5). One child, who was Japanese, mentioned the daffodil and in her discussion she also commented that ‘Working hard is important to Japanese people’ (School B, interviewee 3) but when asked if it was the same for Welsh people she responded, ‘It’s a bit calm here!’ Interviewee 4 asserted that ‘St David’s Day, Jesus and everything’ were important to Welsh people.

Finally, the children were asked how their drawings showed that this person was Welsh. Apart from one child who said that she did not know, all children were able to offer a response and most had considered this in the way they had constructed their picture. Interviewee 1 said that it was because of the rugby ball in the drawing and the other three interviewees linked this to the clothing being worn in their illustrations. These items of clothing were a dragon on the t-shirt (interviewee 2), the traditional Welsh costume (interviewee 4) and Welsh writing on the belt (interviewee 5).

5.5.3 School C

Five children were interviewed in total, two of the children (both male) chosen for interview had drawn a sporting figure, in this case both footballers. One child named their footballer as Craig Bellamy and gave a rationale for this ‘I like Craig Bellamy because he’s Welsh and I like lots of Welsh people. And he’s really good at football and very fast’ (School C, interview 2). The other footballer was described as a Welsh player who plays for Arsenal player and described this player in the interview. Another child described the farmer that he had drawn and said that ‘Well, he’s a farmer but it just occurred to me that a farmer would be a kind of a Welsh person. I don’t know why it just did.’ (School C, interview 5). All five of the children drew a Welsh person, the boys drew male figures and the girls drew female figures. Apart from two children who described themselves as Welsh, the other four children recorded themselves as having multiple national identities.
When asked to comment on skin colour, there were mixed responses linking into topics such as language and ethnicity. Interviewee 1 (School C) stated that she was not sure about this because ‘some people are black skin colour, some people are white and some people are mixed race.’ The next child interviewed linked this to the ethnicity of the population in Wales commenting that ‘There are more white people than black people because black people have come from different countries like Africa and the English people we’ve come from like here, we’ve got born here, the Welsh people and like the English people have come over here, so more Welsh like 90 per cent and 10 per cent of other people I think!’ (School C, interview 2). The third child to be interviewed did not comment specifically on skin colour but said ‘I tried to draw her so she looks a bit English too’ (School C, interview 3) and that the rationale for this was because ‘lots of Welsh people speak English, there are lots of English people in Wales.’ Another child alluded to Welsh people having white skin but then clarified this by saying ‘I am not really saying that you have white skin to be Welsh but like most people I have seen do.’ White skin was also mentioned by the boy describing the Arsenal football player.

Hair colours were listed as dark, light, black or brown. Two children were keen to point out that Welsh people could have any hair colour ‘Everybody has different hair’ (School C, interview 1) and ‘Any hair, it doesn’t really matter’ (School C, interview 5). Body shape as commented on by three children, interviewee 2 described the footballer (Craig Bellamy) as slim and interviewee 4 again linking this to the Arsenal player in the drawing, said that the footballer was small. Interviewee 3 (School C) said that the teenage girl in her picture had ‘quite broad shoulders and dark eyes.’

School C was a Welsh-medium primary school. In terms of language four children said that the Welsh person would speak English and Welsh, with one child commenting that ‘The most common language is English or sometimes Welsh’ (School C, interview 1). In relation to the Arsenal footballer, interviewee 4 (School C) said that he could speak ‘a little bit of Welsh and he can speak English.’ Only one child specified that the person in their drawing would only speak Welsh.

Christianity occurred in two responses when the children were asked about the religion of the person that they had drawn. In School C, interviewee 2 said ‘If you don’t know the person then you don’t know what religion they are.’ One child confused religion with national identity and said that the person they had drawn was ‘sometimes just fully Welsh’ (School C, interview 4). Another child stated that it did not matter what religion they were.
The children were asked about the occupation or hobbies of their Welsh person. When occupation was discussed two of the children said that they had drawn a professional football players and another boy had drawn a farmer. The other two children did not comment on occupations. Hobbies mentioned included reading and going to town, rugby and football. Supporting Wales was also listed as a hobby by interviewee 5. One child remarked that Welsh people could have ‘All different hobbies’ (School C, interview 1).

When asked about what was important to Welsh people, the children’s answers were varied. Family only featured in one response this time and was linked to happiness. Rugby also featured in two responses and football in one. One child said that age as a factor in this, ‘Because, like children would say maybe a toy and adults might say and ornament or jewellery that they made’ (School C, interview 3). One child mentioned language and where they live as important and another child stated respect and being proud to be Welsh as significant factors.

When asked how their drawing indicated that the person was Welsh, the children did not respond or replied that they didn’t know.

5.6 Summative discussions of drawings and annotations - Welsh person

An overview of the data from the three schools on children’s views on Welsh national identity is discussed below.

5.6.1 Physical appearance

In terms of physical appearance, white, pale or beige skin was commonly stated in the interviews as in the annotations, although some children in School C specifically linked skin colour to ethnicity (See 5.5.3). In School C, one child particularly commented on the ethnic composition of Wales as a rationale for skin colour. The child cited the population of Wales as predominantly Welsh and equated this to whiteness. Ethnicity is closely linked to national identity and nationality, as recognised by Sulieman (2003) and this is supported by the children’s comments. Hair colour was indeterminate from the children’s explanations and very few children remarked on body shape or overall appearance.

5.6.2 Language

Language elicited interesting accounts in all three schools. In general, the terms English and Welsh were used most frequently. However the order in which both languages featured is interesting, as well as the connectives used. The children specified English and Welsh in most instances with English usually mentioned first. Other responses were English or
Welsh, English and some Welsh and one child commented that the most common language is English or sometimes Welsh. One child said English and another child referring to the footballer he had drawn said a little bit of Welsh and he (the footballer) can speak English. As debated earlier, the policy of the Welsh Government is firmly anchored around developing a bilingual nation within Wales, where the promotion of Welsh language skills is fundamental in an educational context. This drive to encourage Welsh language skills and bilingualism may have impacted on children’s perceptions of what it means to be Welsh. The Welsh language was evident in their responses and this was usually documented alongside English but with the latter appearing first. So although these children regarded Welsh people as speaking Welsh and English, perhaps the order, i.e. English referred to firstly, is also indicative of their attitude to language in Wales. This study was carried in south east Wales, categorised by Balsom (1985) as British Wales and these constructs were further explored by Bryant (2006). As such, it might be expected that many children would identify with the English language first, as seen here. Nevertheless, the children also recognised the Welsh language in their perceptions of Welshness as the language that sits in tandem with English in Wales. In School A, one child remarked that the language spoken would depend on which part of Wales you lived in, again consistent with the constructs of Wales illustrated in the work of Balsom (1985) and Bryant (2006) where certain areas of Wales may have more or less affinity with the Welsh language.

5.6.3 Religion

When discussing religion, the children’s views were consistent with the findings emanating from the annotations alongside their drawings. Christianity was perceived to be the main religion of Welsh people and the only other religion stated was Islam. The teaching of Christianity is still a fundamental part of the religious education syllabus in south east Wales as described earlier in the chapter. Christianity has declined in Wales in recent years, with a 14 per cent drop being recorded in the 2011 census (ONS, 2011) from the previous census data of 2001. However in some instances, there was greater ambiguity in the interviews, as opposed to the written notes. Some children were unwilling to ascribe a particular religion to their Welsh character. In the same 2011 census, a large number of Welsh people reported as having no religion (32 per cent, the UK figure was 25 per cent). Approximately 33 per cent gave an indefinite response when asked about religion in the interview process. This has some similarities to the children’s responses in the present study.
5.6.4 Hobbies and employment

When asked about the occupation of their character, some of the children drew a person in a particular job. The roles depicted were sportsmen and farmers, which the children described in the interviews, and this corresponded with the written notes. Other professions included a Welsh Government worker, a doctor, a carer in an animal centre and a leisure centre worker. Sports also featured when the children were questioned about hobbies. Most common responses were football and rugby, although cycling and horse riding were mentioned. The prevalence of sport and how this links to national identity, in this case Welsh national identity, is well documented in adult studies (Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006) and sporting markers were also established by In Scourfield et al. (2006b) in their exploration of national identity with children aged between eight and eleven.

The farmer appeared in two drawings and two children, one in School A and one in School C, were interviewed. During the interview, the child in School A said that most people that retire are farmers. The other child in School C said he did not know why he had drawn a farmer.

5.6.5 What is important to Welsh people?

Family was cited in all three schools, six children said that family was important to Welsh people. One child linked family and tradition and another family and happiness. When reflecting on the annotations, family and friends were common answers and this is comparable to the findings of other studies such as Scourfield et al. (2006b) in Wales and Barrett (2007) in a wider UK context. Family was also established as an influencing factor in Chapter 4, when the children were discussing their own national identity.

Sport was another common response and affiliation with national teams. The parallels between sport and national identity have already been considered through this chapter. Pride in being Welsh came through in all three schools. Tilley and Heath (2007) observed a distinct decline in British pride, suggesting that nationalist movements such as those in Wales and Scotland have impacted on this decline. Although the children in the present study were only specifically asked to comment on their drawings of Welsh people, the general sentiment expressed was that Welsh people are proud to be Welsh. This indicated that the children felt that pride in Welsh national identity was evident in Wales at the time of data collection.
5.6.6 How do we know that this person is Welsh?

The children reacted in a variety of ways to this question in all three schools. In School A, some children were unable to provide an answer and one child said that you would need to ask the person. However another child mentioned skin colour. The notion of Welshness being associated with whiteness was found with children in the work of Scourfield and Davies (2005) and has been considered throughout 5.5 and 5.6.

In School B most of the children provided a response linked to the image they had drawn, either with regard to the clothing worn by the character, such as a red t-shirt or because of other images in the picture, for example, a rugby ball. The drawing provided the connection between the oral and written data and the children used this to facilitate their discussions particularly around this question.

The children in School C felt unable to comment on this question. The reasons for less extensive responses in this particular setting have been discussed earlier in the thesis. The interviews took place in a busy library with children and staff present. Consequently the interviews in School C were less elaborated, as evidenced in the lack of response to this question.

5.7 Summary of children’s perceptions of Welsh national identity

The data generated from the visual, oral and written data gathered similar responses to the notions of what it means to be Welsh. Generally, the data revealed quite stereotypical views of Welsh people in terms of physical characteristics, religion and hobbies. The people of Wales were perceived as white and Christian with gender specific hobbies and pastimes, such as, football and rugby for boys and dancing for girls. Responses related to language were interesting and reflected the idea of Wales as a bilingual nation, although the way in which the children presented their answers was significant (whether English or Welsh came first) and the conjunction used (either and or or). As seen in Chapter 4, family was recognised as being important to Welsh people. This resonates with the children’s perceptions of their own national identity, whereby family was viewed as being an influential component. Cultural markers such as the Welsh national anthem and St David’s Day, were evident alongside depictions of symbolic images such as the Welsh dragon, the three feathers of rugby and even Welsh cakes. Awareness and recognition of these signifiers of Welshness demonstrated the children’s knowledge of these calling cards (Moore and Kramer-Moore, 2004), which represent an affiliation with the Welsh nation.
The final chapter of the thesis will synthesize the findings emanating from this chapter and the preceding chapter. Conclusions will be drawn in relation to the research questions, as well as the methodological issues that emerged as a result of carrying out this multimodal study.
Chapter 6: Conclusion

The aim of this chapter is to present a summative discussion in light of the research aims of the study. The most salient findings are highlighted and substantiated through theory and empirical research. As a result, the reader will be provided with an overview of the main conclusions emanating from this research.

The intentions of the thesis were to establish children’s perceptions of their own national identity and Welsh national identity through multimodal methods including drawing, writing and oral responses gathered through an interview process. Central to the research design and procedures was the inclusion of the child’s voice reinforcing the participation rights expressed in United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). Using multimodal approaches, the children were encouraged to express their thoughts and ideas through a range of modes, so that the voice of the child was able to emerge from the data in more than one way.

The categorisation of the children’s personal national identity was mainly established through their written and oral responses. However, the self-portraits that the children drew were an essential part of this research process and they were able to use the drawings to support their verbal and written comments. Likewise, when the children’s ideas about Welsh national identity were analysed, their drawings were insightful in themselves but also aided their writing and subsequent verbal interactions. Barker and Weller (2003) consider that the use of drawings as a research tool can support an inclusive and less intimidating approach with children, allowing their opinions to surface from the accumulated data. This was reflected in the data collection process. All the children seemed comfortable in participating in the drawing activity. This was also akin to general classroom practice in the schools where the data were collected. The use of drawings as a tool for ‘meaning-making’ in the classroom was evident in the classroom wall displays. Hope (2008) describes children’s drawing as link between the inner world of thought and outer reality. As discussed in detail in Chapter 3, which explored the methodological underpinnings of this study, the children’s pictures not only communicated their thoughts, but supported the generation of their written and oral responses; as well as acting as a prompt both for the child and the researcher.
6.1 Children’s articulation of their own national identity

The findings of the study identified that children aged nine to ten years are able to clearly articulate their national identity. The children in all three schools provided specific and often quite complex definitions of their own national identity. Designations of national identity were in singular or multiple categorisations. Some children used fractional groupings in their definitions, whilst others used less distinct ways to categorise themselves. However, the majority of the children who participated in the data collection process demonstrated a well-defined awareness of their own personal national identity and were able to articulate this through written means and the interview process.

Previous developmental theories (Piaget And Weill, 1951; Axia, Bremner, Deluca and Andreasen, 1998; Barrett, 1996; Barrett and Farroni, 1996) support the notion that children’s understanding of national identity develops around the ages of 10-11 years and this is dependent on their cognitive capacity. The results of the present study reveal that children have acquired the ability to express their national identity at an earlier age, nine to ten years in this instance, and this corresponds with studies that have questioned age-bound notions (Jenks, 2005; Barrett, 2007). Therefore, this study contributes to the debate around age-related concepts of national identity by asserting that younger children aged nine and ten can discuss their own nation identity in a discerning manner. Additionally, the multiplicity of the national identity categories evidenced in the data, demonstrated the increasingly plural nature of urban south east Wales and how this is influencing the responses of the nation’s youngest residents when discussing ideas about their own national identity.

The sample of children who were interviewed were asked to discuss the rationale for their choices. Familial influences were deemed important when the children gave the reason for their choices, particularly parental national identity. The national identity of their grandparents and the family in general was also cited. Family, particularly the role of the parents in shaping children’s national identity, was also a feature of Barrett’s (2007) social-cognitive-motivational theory. It could be argued that the significance of the family is pertinent to this age range (nine to ten years) and that as the child becomes more independent this may change. However, theorists such as Smith (1991) also affirm family as a defining factor in influencing national identity in general. In the Welsh context, family and friends were factors evident in the results of the study carried out by Scourfield et al. (2006b). This study also found place as being significant marker in children’s national
identity, an aspect that was confirmed in the data from this investigation where birthplace and current place of residence featured regularly in the responses given by the children.

Language was given as a rationale for personal national identity by one child in the Welsh-medium school. This is significant as it concurs with the findings of Coupland et al. (2005:17) who carried out a study with older children in Welsh-medium settings and established that the Welsh language was only evident as a marker to display in-group affiliation ‘in a very muted way’. More recently, Selleck’s study (2013), was also conducted in the secondary sector, found that there was a link between language and attendance at Welsh school and that the Welsh language was a ‘nationally identifying element’ (Selleck, 2013:36). This was echoed by Scourfield et al. (2006b) researching with a younger age group in primary schools, who saw the Welsh language as a signifier of Welsh national identity. The primary school children in the present study, some of whom were being educated through the medium of Welsh and some through the medium of English, did not consider language to be a defining element in their own national identity, although it was very significant when discussing Welsh national identity in general, as discussed in this Chapter 5.

In summary, the nine to ten year olds in this study were clearly articulating their own national identity and able to rationalise their choices, citing family and place as significant influences. The range of multiple national identities evidences the changing nature of 21st century Wales and the data makes an important contribution by exemplifying this fact in practice.

6.2 Welsh in the ordering of categories

In terms of national identity, Welsh was the most cited category in all three schools and this was regardless of the ethnic composition of the school, or whether the school was English or Welsh-medium. This is comparable with the strong sense of Scottish national identity seen in Carrington and Short’s (1996) work in Scottish schools. The results of the study reflect a strong sense of Welsh national identity in all three schools and in particular the Welsh-medium school. The ethos of Curriculum Cymreig and the Welsh Government drive to promote Welsh national identity is reflected in this data, however the children’s views cannot necessarily be attributed to this specific policy.

In the Welsh-medium school (School C), there was a stronger attachment to Wales evident in definitions, particularly where multiple identity categories were used. Welsh featured more frequently in the multifaceted identity categories this school. Most of children in
School C included the term Welsh in their classifications of national identity (singular and multiple definitions). In the other two schools two thirds of the children in School A and three quarters of the children in School B used the term Welsh. These findings show that children in School C may have a stronger affiliation with Welsh national identity than the children in the other two schools, although Welsh national identity was a strong feature throughout all of the data.

As a Welsh-medium school, the ethos and language of School C may have been a defining influence in shaping these children’s views of their own national identity. Fundamentally the children in all three schools were studying the same Key Stage Two curriculum, the significant difference in School C was that these children were taught through the medium of Welsh. The higher affiliation with Wales in the Welsh-medium schools would also support the idea that the language of the school had an impact on the children’s views on Welsh national identity. This was not, however, evident when the children were asked to rationalise their choice of categories for their own sense of national identity. These findings add to the debate around educational policy in Wales, namely the current Welsh Government curriculum initiatives relating to language and culture and identity through the Curriculum Cymreig and the Welsh Language strategy. The language of the school appeared to impact on national identity in the Welsh-medium school, although the fact that the parents of these children chose to send them to be educated via the medium of Welsh, and therefore may have a strong sense of Welsh national identity themselves, may also be a significant factor. Further research is required to explore the influences outside of the school that may be impacting on the national identity of these children as parental national identity, which was not investigated as part of this research project.

When children used multiple categories of national identity, the number of children placing the term Welsh first was greater in Schools B and C. The order of the responses in School A did not demonstrate as strong an association with Welsh as a national identity label for themselves, that is, fewer children listed Welsh first. School A had the highest population of ethnic minority pupils and this was the school where the greatest number of children chose more than one category of national identity. Whilst the ethnic composition of the school did not appear to be a factor overall when analysing singular and multiple categories of national identity, it did seem to be a determinant when looking at the ordering of the classifications; with children from ethnic minorities demonstrating a lesser affiliation with the term Welsh. This is comparable with, Scourfield et al.’s (2006a) study, which found that ethnic minority children did not choose Welsh as their primary national
identity. Similarly, in this study, the children in the school with the most ethnically diverse population, was the school where fewer pupils chose Welsh as their primary national identity when displaying multiplicity in their categorisation of their own national identity.

6.3 Children’s views on Welsh national identity in general

The children’s drawings, annotations and interviews revealed thought-provoking observations of how the children perceived Welsh national identity and Welshness. Findings from the project demonstrated that children had very clear ideas about what it means to Welsh in terms of physical appearance, the language spoken, religion, hobbies, job roles and what is important to Welsh people.

With regard to physical appearance most of the children in the study stated that Welsh people were predominantly white, in terms of skin colour. Similar findings with regard to skin colour were established by Scourfield and Davies (2005) and their study carried out in Wales revealed that some children see Wales as a predominantly white nation. This notion of whiteness as associated with being Welsh, was seen across all three schools. The children’s own ethnicity did not seem to be a factor in this, despite the fact that some of the children in the study had been meticulous in trying to recreate their own skin colour accurately. However, there were also some responses both in the written and oral data, which supported a more inclusive notion of what it means to be Welsh. A small number of children concluded that if you were Welsh you could have any skin colour and again Scourfield and Davies (2005: 104) also observed children ‘wanting to contest a white Wales and instead construct an inclusive nation.’

When considering the physical appearance of a Welsh person, the children in the study did not reflect this idea of Wales as a multi-ethnic nation in their consideration of skin colour. Although there was a diverse ethnic mix of children sampled as part of this study as evidenced in their own categorisations of national identity, the children viewed Wales as a principally white nation. This demonstrates an interesting dichotomy regarding how children perceive themselves and how they view the notion of Welsh people as a whole. This ‘them and us’ debate has been explored in many developmental studies of national identity (Aboud and Amato, 2001; Nesdale, 2005), which have focussed on theories concerned with in-group and out-group affiliations. This thesis clearly demonstrates that there is a distinction between how children see themselves and how they view the Welsh nation as a whole in terms of skin colour. Even though they may have used the term Welsh
in describing their own identity, their skin colour may not have been reflected in their
descriptions of a Welsh person.

Outcomes concerning other aspects of physical appearance such as eye colour or hair
colour did not produce such conclusive results. The use of the prompt questions as a tool
for scaffolding children’s representation of their ideas is evaluated in the latter part of
Chapter 3. As a former primary school teacher, I used my personal experiences in the
classroom, to design the template and I felt that the prompt questions would encourage the
children to develop their ideas about Welsh national identity. In hindsight, the questions
regarding physical appearance may have been problematic for some of the children, who
struggled to identify the physical characteristics of a Welsh person. It may have been more
productive to rely on the visual images produced by the children to convey their
perceptions of physical characteristics of a Welsh person and use prompts to illicit ideas
about things that would not necessarily be evident in their drawings.

Ideas about language were more defined where the children used the terms English and
Welsh and English or Welsh in their written and oral responses. The use of ‘and’ and ‘or’
was particularly interesting. In the case of English or Welsh, this implied that this was a
choice, whereas as Welsh and English implied that both languages would be spoken. The
view predominantly expressed by the children was that people in Wales speak Welsh and
English which mirrors current Welsh Government policy in Wales in terms of the Welsh
Language Strategy (2012a) promoting the bilingualism in Wales. However, use of the
terms ‘and’ and ‘or’ may indicate that some children see bilingualism as a choice, rather
than an assumed notion. Likewise, the order in which the languages are stated may also
echo the children’s views about which language is most important. The concept of a
bilingual Wales with Welsh and/or English being spoken concomitantly was common in
the three schools. However, in the Welsh-medium school (School C), the most common
response was that a Welsh person speaks Welsh. Therefore the children in this school, who
were taught via the medium of Welsh, perceived that Welsh people speak Welsh, which is
in line with the language of their school. Data collection took place in south east Wales,
labelled by Balsom (1985) as British Wales, with English as the first language of the
majority of people in this area. Therefore the expectation was that English would feature
significantly in the data when children were asked about the language that Welsh people
speak. This was certainly the case in the English-medium schools, but not in the Welsh-
medium school. Therefore it seems that the language of the school (and perhaps the
language of the home, although this cannot be established by this study) influenced the children’s perceptions about the language(s) Welsh people speak.

Christianity was considered by the children to be the religion of Welsh people. The only other religion noted was Islam. According to the census of 2011 (ONS, 2011), Christianity is still the principal religion in Wales. The children in this study were not asked to give their own religion and therefore conclusions cannot be drawn as to whether their own religious beliefs were reflected in their responses (One child did cite Muslim as part of her own national identity). However, the prevalence of the term Christianity in relation to a Welsh person, corresponds with the current curriculum for religious education in Cardiff which identifies Christianity as the primary religion studied at Key Stage two, alongside Judaism and Islam (Cardiff Council, 2008).

When looking at the sets of data, images, writing and interview transcripts, sport featured frequently when the children were asked to consider the occupation and hobbies of a Welsh person. Football and rugby were the most often cited and, similarly, sports people were depicted in the children’s drawings and in the occupations given in the annotations and interviews. Sport, particularly rugby, has been established as a marker of national identity through the work of Scourfield et al. (2006b). Johnes (2005) claimed that popular sports in Wales, namely rugby and football, are ‘caught up in the idea of Wales.’ Much of this is seen through the eyes of the media in Wales and although the children did not discuss the influence of the media in their depiction of sporting images in relation to national identity, they may have been influenced by what they see on television, online and in newspapers. The other image which reoccurred was that of the farmer. Subsequent analysis of the written and oral data presented the view that this was linked to the perception of a rural notion of Wales and in one school this was probably connected to the content of an assembly which had occurred on the day of data collection. The traditional Welsh costume was replicated by a number of girls in School B but was not evident in the other two schools. It is problematic to explain what prompted this recurrent image and oral data supported the idea that the child had drawn this because of the link between being Welsh and wearing a traditional outfit on St David’s day. Peer influence could also be a factor as to why this image was seen in five of the girls’ drawings in School B.

Furthermore, children were asked what they thought was important to Welsh people. Family and friends was a common answer. The influence of family on national identity can be seen in the studies by Scourfield et al. (2006b) in Wales and Barrett (2007) in a wider UK context. Family was also highlighted when children were asked to discuss the reasons
behind their choice of personal national identity. Other cultural influences were evident: the children cited the Welsh National Anthem and St. David or St David’s Day (patron saint of Wales) as being important to Welsh people. Again, this may be a reflection of the cultural elements of the curriculum promoted via Curriculum Cymreig but cannot automatically be attributed to this.

Overall, the messages emanating from the study reveal that the children saw Wales as a predominantly white, Christian nation and whilst this would support the 2011 census data, it does not necessarily correspond with the ethnicity of the children themselves in this multi-ethnic sample. These perceptions may be associated with the Wales that the children experience daily through media representations of Welshness, but it certainly does not correspond with the reality of their daily lives, living in the most ethnically diverse region of Wales. Sport was deemed as the most popular hobby. As well as the expected responses of family and friends, the children also considered typical cultural representations to be important to Welsh people for example, the national anthem and St. David. All of this paints a fairly stereotypical picture of how the children perceived Welsh people and their lives. Findings by Waldron and Pike (2006) discovered similar results in Ireland, where the 10 to 11 year olds in their investigation, also offered stereotypical ideas about the Irish national character and defined distinctive cultural markers. This was also seen in Howard and Gill’s (2005) study in Australia where the children choose stereotypical signifiers to indicate what it means to be Australian.

The formation of stereotypes and their relationship with social identity of which national identity was considered to be a factor, was explored by Tajfel (1978) and later by Oakes, Haslam and Turner (1994). According to the latter researchers, these stereotypes do not remain static, therefore particularly with young children, their ideas about national characteristics can change over time according to who they are with and what they identify with. Curriculum and school ethos can make a difference in prompting ideas about national characteristics as established by Waldron and Pike (2006). As well as Curriculum Cymreig, the Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship (ESDGC) agenda, which the Welsh Assembly Government (2008) stated was about values and attitudes, can have an effect on how children view themselves and others in society. Criticisms of programmes such as the ESDGC agenda and other citizenship approaches, suggest that these curricula do not support pupils’ understanding of the plurality of Britain (Maylor et al., 2007). The stereotype of Wales as a white nation is a direct contradiction of the multiplicity seen in the children’s perceptions of their own national identity. This study
confirms the lack of plurality in the children’s responses about Welshness and hence contributes to the discourse regarding how culture and identity can be explored in a more inclusive way.

6.4 Possible influences on children’s perceptions of national identity and Welsh national identity

As well as establishing children’s views on their own national identity and Welsh national identity, the study also sought to explore the features which impacted on these perceptions and how these might contribute to discussion about national identity in Wales. In the discussion above, influences such as the school ethos, language and ethnicity have been established as factors which may have an effect on children’s categorisation of their own national identity and their perceptions of Welsh national identity. These features evolved from the different modes of data collected as part of the investigation. The Figure (Figure 29) below illustrates the main influences found in the study. This contrasts with the original proposition in the introduction to the study, which included media as an influence. Whilst the influence of media was not explicitly evident in the children’s responses, it could be argued that children may have been influenced by the media in relation to the prevalence of sport seen in many depictions of Welsh national identity. This finding is in contrast to the work of Waldron and Pike (2006), where the children’s images clearly reflected the influence of the media in the symbols and slogans within the children’s drawings.

Figure 29. Theoretical Framework resulting from the study
The influence of the school is clearly seen in the children’s drawings of themselves, many of which featured school uniform. Likewise the effect of the school has been seen in comparative studies by Waldron and Pike (2006) in Ireland and in the work of Barrett (2007) in England. The impact of the school ethos was perhaps most evident when exploring the prevalence of the term Welsh in all three schools, when the children were ascribing their own national identity. As the data were collected in Wales, a strong affiliation with Wales and Welshness would be expected. However, this was even more prevalent in School C, where the children were taught through the medium of Welsh. In all primary schools in Wales, the curriculum incorporates the Curriculum Cymreig which encourages children to develop a sense of ‘Welshness’ and belonging to their local community and country (Welsh Government, 2012b). This comes through clearly in all three schools and particularly in School C, the Welsh-medium school, where the factor of language may have been an added element.

Despite this, when the children were asked why they had chosen their specific national identity or identities, only one child cited language as the reason for his choice. No other child in the Welsh-medium school or in the other two schools considered language to be a factor when naming their national identity. Selleck’s (2013) study, conducted in the secondary sector, established that a dichotomy exists between Welsh language policy, practice and perceptions; and that children’s actual experiences might be in contrast with Welsh Government policy initiatives. However, she found a link between language and attendance at Welsh school as a ‘nationally identifying element’ (Selleck, 2013:36) and this was also seen in the present study when the children reflected on Welsh national identity rather than their own personal national identity: the ‘them’ rather than ‘us’. In the Welsh-medium school, the children reported that Welsh people would speak Welsh whereas a combination of Welsh/English was seen in the English-medium schools. All three schools were delivering the same Key Stage 2 curriculum therefore the language of the school can be seen as a distinctive factor. This influenced the children’s perceptions about the language spoken by Welsh people and the school ethos which one could argue as a Welsh-medium school would strongly promote Welsh culture, may also have impacted on their ideas. Language was a more significant factor in the children’s responses when identifying Welsh national identity, in contrast with those about their own national identity.

Ethnicity did not appear to be a relevant aspect when looking at the use of the term Welsh in all three schools. Yet this was not the case when the order in which the children
presented their national identity categories was examined. The School with the highest proportion of ethnic minority pupils (School A) had the lowest number of pupils (50% less than in School C) citing Welsh first in multiple definitions of national identity. Therefore this demonstrates a tangible link between ethnicity and national identity and indicates that the children in School A did not feel as strong an affinity with Welsh identity as the children in the other two schools.

In tandem with their written annotations, the content of the self-portraits revealed the children’s thoughts about their own personal identity, including national identity. They frequently depicted themselves dressed in ordinary clothing such as school uniform (which some were wearing during the drawing activity), or sporting kit. Often the sports clothing was the Welsh national kit or the shirts of the regional teams for either football or rugby and therefore sport could be seen associated with their perceptions of national identity. The influence of sport was also clearly seen when the children were asked about the hobbies of Welsh people. Sporting markers in national identity were also represented in studies of adults (Davies, Charles and Harris, 2006) and children in Wales (Scourfield et al., 2006b).

As discussed above, place was cited in the children’s spoken comments about their reasons for their choice of personal national identity. Similarly, family was frequently cited. This was also evident when the children were asked about Welsh people and therefore of significance to both research aims; and contributes to discussions around both children’s national identity and Welsh national identity.

For the children in this study the concept of national identity was expressed through their drawings, annotations and spoken dialogue. In Wales, the relationship between the nation and the British state could be seen as adding further complexity to the debates around national identity and for some children the intricacy of this is clearly evidenced in representations of multiple categories of national identity. The data revealed how these children use national identity to define their own position in society as well as their relationships with others. Akin with Thompson’s (2001) perspective of the category of nation as a sociological tool for making sense of the world, these children are using national identity to construct their understanding of the world around them. This is clearly seen when the children were asked to give justifications for their own national identity, whereby the influences around them are visibly seen in their responses. Although many of their reasons for choice were around territory and birth, other significant influences such as sport and culture that were seen in their notions of Welsh national identity move away from the traditional categories. This trend was also seen in Thompson and Day’s (1999)
study whereby national identity was constantly shifting according to context. Unfortunately the children were not viewed in an alternative context to the school and as such cannot be substantiated with evidence from this study.

Anderson’s (1983) reflections on the nation as an imagined community has some resonance when focussing on the second research question. The children tended to view Welsh national identity as something separate to their own national identity, this was evident in oral, pictorial and written data. Some of their images reflected stereotypical views of the nation described by Billig (1995) as ‘banal’ reminders of our national identities. It was evident that some of the children had more affiliation with the imagined or stereotypical notion of Welshness than others. For example, the drawings and annotations which featured national costumes, rugby players and references to the symbolic emblems of Wales such as the leek, the dragon and the daffodil. The intention of the Curriculum Cymreig was not to develop this almost romanticised and stereotypical view of Wales, however in interpreting the curricula guidance some schools may have inadvertently endorsed this view of Welshness. However, the data does reveal a strong sense of shared understanding of what it means to be Welsh for these children. Again, the agency of the children and their future role in producing and reproducing these notions of nation needs to be examined further.

6.5 Limitations of the study

The main limitations of the study, particularly around the research design, have been explored in Chapter 3. However, it is useful to discuss the overarching restrictions in light of final conclusions. The research design sought to capture the children’s views through multimodal means so that the children were able to express themselves in a range of formats. As a result of this the data gathered via pictorial, written and oral means was rich and insightful, allowing the children’s voice to ‘come through’ at all stages of the process. Using all three modes also triangulated the data and increased the validity of the findings. As a former primary school teacher, my intention was to collect the data in a range of schools utilising my experience of working in primary school classrooms to support this process. The schools were all located within a five mile radius of each other and had a common curriculum; the language of the school was the only variant in the case of School C. It could be argued that if the children had been asked to complete the drawings, annotations and interviews in a different setting, for example, the home environment, they may have produced different results and that one context is restrictive. Spyrou (2011) argued that schools produce a particular kind of children’s voice and that the children’s
views need to be explored in other contexts to make sense of how their identities are constructed. However, carrying out further research in the home or in other social contexts was not feasible in this project due to time restrictions and difficulties in facilitating access to such settings.

Data collection process extended over a year and it was difficult to gain access to a Welsh-medium setting. The original school approached to take part in the study was not able to facilitate the research processes. As such there was a gap of several months between the collection of data in the two English-medium schools and the Welsh-medium school. With regard to the language of the school, the data gathering process in the Welsh-medium school was conducted in English, which may have impacted on the children’s reactions, particularly during the annotations and interview processes. Taking this into account, the interview responses were much shorter in terms of content in this school, but this was also complicated by the venue for the interview, a very busy library, and the proximity of other staff and children. Nevertheless the children’s written responses were equally as detailed and astute as the annotations seen in the English-medium schools. In essence, apart from the points noted above, these variations in school C do not appeared to have affected the data that were collected.

The responses gathered to address the first research aim of the study, produced rich and meaningful qualitative data. It provides a significant addition to existing literature around children’s own ideas about their national identity and their ability to rationalise their opinions at this age (nine to ten years). It also affords valuable insights into the viewpoints of children living in increasingly diverse contexts in this area of Wales. Although the data accumulated about the second research aim illustrates children’s ideas about what it means to be Welsh, the conclusions reveal quite stereotypical perspectives which may have been limited by some of the prompt questions especially with regard to physical identity. Further pan Wales research would be valuable in establishing whether the clichéd opinions expressed as part of this study are represented across the Welsh nation using multimodal responses, including other media such as photography to further support the elucidation of the ‘meaning-making’ process.

Whilst there was triangulation of data across all three schools, this is a small dataset collected in one area of south east Wales and therefore it cannot be generalised as an all Wales perspective. This multimodal examination of national data does, however, offer insights into how children see themselves and others in terms of national identity in Wales. An extended project which reflected an all Wales perspective would be a progression from
this study, as well as exploring the views of younger and older children. Further multimodal means of visual data capture methods, such as the use of still and moving images, could be used to elicit child-centred responses when considering the notion of Welsh national identity. Photo elicitation is a growing area of research and this would particularly engage the interest of older learners.

6.6 Final reflections

The research journey and the subsequent resulting thesis have allowed me to explore children’s views on national identity in a variety of ways. I feel that the children’s thoughts and ideas shine through and illustrate the complexity of this subject area and the multiple influences at play in the world of the child. This is particularly evident when reflecting on the first research aim. Findings contribute to discourse on national identity, not just in terms of age-bound notions of national identity, but also the complexity of national identity in a plural Wales; and how this impacts on the way in children view not only themselves but others too. Alongside this, the role of key influences in the debate about national identity are also evident, particularly the impact of education, such as school ethos and curricula objectives related to language and culture. This study has illustrated the need to continue to explore this complicated but fascinating subject in the light of the insightful and rich findings emanating from the data.

There has been a recent drive to encourage teachers to become researchers in their own school contexts, BERA (2014:5) called for ‘the development, across the UK, of self-improving education systems in which teachers are research literate and have opportunities for engagement in research and enquiry.’ Alternative views expressed by Hattie (2015) suggest that researcher should be left to the academics and that teachers could not be the experts in everything. I disagree with this stance as the teachers in my study were integral to the research process and interested in how research could inform their classroom practice. My own journey from teacher to researcher has been challenging but worthwhile and whilst I was employed as an academic when carrying out the research for this thesis, an important part of the rationale for the study stemmed from my experience as a primary school teacher.

When carrying out the data collection in the three classrooms I reassumed the role of the teacher with ease. Having practised in primary school classrooms for a number of years the design of the study and the methods used were based on my professional knowledge of the classroom and this knowledge informed the way in which this part of the project was conducted. I was and am still very comfortable in the primary classroom assuming the role
of educator very easily, therefore working alongside the children and other practitioners through the drawing, writing and interviews was very natural for me. Using the teacher to support the interview selection process seemed logical and professional at the time, although in retrospect this did not always allow for exploration of some of the more intriguing images and annotations with individual children. However, I was mindful of being respectful of the teacher’s involvement in the project and the need to support his or her agency in the study.

At a later stage in the analysis of data and writing up the thesis, the transition from teacher to researcher academic has become more apparent. I no longer view myself as a teacher doing some research but see myself as an early career researcher rooted in education. My future direction of travel will hopefully support further steps down the path of research as I intend to use this thesis as the starting point of my research career in terms of generating academic papers using the findings from this project but also exploring national identity in other educational contexts.

As Professor Dai Smith (1984:1) said, ‘Wales is a singular noun but a plural experience’. Even though the data for this study was collected in three schools within a five mile radius of each other in south east Wales, the plurality in the multiple notions of national identity and Welsh national identity are evidenced in this thesis. This multifaceted view of national identity is perhaps best illustrated by the child in School A, who identified herself as being Muslim/Arabic/British/half Mexican/half Turkish/quarter Russian. Her definition of her own national identity illustrates the complex nature of this subject area and the interacting influences which impact on these notions.
Reference List


London: Palgrave Macmillan


Cox, M (1993) *Children's Drawings of the Human Figure.* Hove: Lawrence Erbbaum Associates


187


Hoskins, B. (2006) *A framework for the creation of indicators on active citizenship and education and training for active citizenship*. Luxembourg: Office for Official publications of the European Communities


Learning and Teaching Scotland (2011) *Developing Global Citizens within the Curriculum for Excellence.* Glasgow: Learning and Teaching Scotland


Morrow, V. (2008) 'Ethical Dilemmas in Research with Children and Young People About Their Social Environments', *Children's Geographies* 6 (1) pp.49-61


Waldron, F and Pike, S. What does it mean to be Irish? Irish Educational Studies Volume 25, pp. 231-251


Appendices

Appendix 1: Leaflet

Taking part in the Research project

My Research Project

Who am I?
I am Alison Murphy and I teach at the University in Cardiff. I am also doing a research project.

Why am I at your school?
A research project is about finding out things. In this project I want to find out all about you and how you see yourself. I also want to find out what you think.

What will we do as part of the project?
I will be asking you to draw and take photographs and perhaps do a little bit of writing to go with it. We will talk about your pictures and I will record you so I can remember our conversation.

What will happen then?
I will go away and look at all the things you have said and the pictures. Then all your ideas will be brought together in a report. I will send a mini report back to the school to let you know what I have found out.

Will my name be in the report?
No. I will not be using anyone’s names or the name of the school in my report.

Do I have to do this?
No. It’s your choice. If you want to take part you can sign at the bottom of this letter. But if at any time during the project you decide that you do not want to continue then you can stop and carry on.

My name is...........................
And I want to take part in this project.
Date..............................
Appendix 2: School Consent Letter

Dear

I am currently teaching at UWIC on the BA Educational Studies with Early Childhood Studies and in tandem with this I am also studying for a PHD qualification. As part of my research towards my doctorate, I am seeking to carry out a study in the local area.

The theme of my thesis is children’s perceptions of national identity and initially this project would focus on establishing the children’s ideas on their own national identity and their notion of Welsh national identity, i.e. what it means to be Welsh. Children would be asked to participate in a number of activities including drawing, discussion and taking photographs. No photographs will be of identifiable individual children. The final thesis will not identify either participants or the school.

I would like to discuss this with you further, but I do appreciate that you have a very busy schedule. Therefore if it were possible to arrange an appointment in the near future I would be very grateful and endeavour to fit in with your availability.

Thanking you in anticipation of your cooperation,

Alison Murphy (B Ed, M.A.)
Lecturer in Education and Early Childhood Studies
UWIC
Room Q027
Cyncoed Campus
Cardiff
CF23 6XD
Telephone 02920 41 6731
email: amurphy@uwic.ac.uk
Appendix 3: Parental Consent Letters (English and Welsh)

Dear Parent/Guardian,

My name is Alison Murphy and I am currently teaching at Cardiff Metropolitan University on the BA in Educational Studies with Early Childhood Studies and in tandem with this I am also studying for a PHD qualification. As part of my research towards my doctorate, I am carrying out some data collection at your child’s school and the head teacher has very kindly allowed me to work with children in Year 5.

The aim of this study is to find out about children’s ideas of how they see themselves in terms of national identity and also what it means to be Welsh. Children would be asked to participate in a number of activities including drawing, discussion and writing. It is anticipated that the project will be carried over a four-week period in your child’s class and will be implemented during afternoon sessions when the children are undertaking cross-curricular work.

When the project concludes, the results of the study will be reviewed and written up as part of the PhD thesis. During the activities and follow up review and analysis of the project your child will not be identified by name and all records will remain confidential. In the event of any publication or presentation resulting from the research, no personally identifiable information will be shared.

If you **DO NOT** wish your child to participate in this project, please could you complete the slip below by ... If you require any further information in relation to the research activities, please do not hesitate to contact the head teacher or myself, my office number is 02920 41 6731.

Thanking you in anticipation of your cooperation,

Alison Murphy (B Ed, M.A.)
Senior Lecturer in Education and Early Childhood Studies
Cardiff Metropolitan University
Room Q014a
Cyncoed Campus
Cardiff
CF23 6XD
Telephone 02920 41 6731
email: amurphy@cardiffmet.ac.uk

I **DO NOT** wish my child……………………………………………… (Child’s name)

to participate in the research project.

Signature of parent/guardian…………………………………………
Annwyl Riant/Gwarcheidwad,

Fy enw i yw Alison Murphy ac rwy'n addysgu'r cwrs BA mewn Astudiaethau Addysg ag Astudiaethau Plentynod Cynnar ym Mhrifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd ar hyn o bryd, ac ar yr un pryd rwyf hefyd yn astudio tuag at gymhwystyr PHD. Fel rhan o'm hymchwil tuag at fy noethuriaeth, byddaf yn casglu data yn ysgol eich plentyn ac mae'r pennaeth yn garedig wedi caniatáu i mi weithio gyda phlant Blwyddyn 5.

Nod yr astudiaeth yw dysgu sut mae plant yn gweld eu hunain yn nhermau hunaniaeth genedlaethol a hefyd yr hyn mae'n ei olygu i fod yn Gymro/Cymraes. Gofynnir i'r plant gymryd rhan mewn nifer o weithgareddau, gan gynnwys tynnlu llun, trafod ac ysgrifennu. Rhagwelir y caiff y prosiect ei gynnwys eu nosbarth eich plentyn dros gyfnod o bedair wythnos, ac yn cael ei weithredu yn ystod sesiynau'r prynhawn pan fydd y plant yn gwneud gwaith trawsgwricwlaidd.

Pan ddaw'r prosiect i ben, bydd canlyniadau'r astudiaeth yn cael eu hadolygu a'u hysgrifennu fel rhan o draethawd ymchwil fy Noethuriaeth. Ni chaiff eich plentyn ei enwi yn ystod y gweithgareddau nac yn adolygiad a gwerthusiadau y prosiect o bydd pob cofnod yn ystod gyfrinachol. Os caiff yr ymchwil ei chyhoeddwi neu ei chyflwyno, ni chaiff unrhyw wybodaeth o'r prosiect ei rhannu.

Os NAD YDYCH yn fodlon i'ch plentyn gymryd rhan yn y prosiect hwn, cwblhewch y slip isod erbyn ... Os bydd angen unrhyw wybodaeth bellach mewn perthynas â'r gweithgareddau ymchwil, mae croeso i chi gysylltu â mi neu'r pennaeth. Rhif fy swyddfa yw 02920 41 6731.

Diolch ymlaen llaw am eich cydweithrediad,

Alison Murphy (B Ed, M.A.)
Uwch Ddarlithydd Addysg ac Astudiaethau Plentynod Cynnar.
Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd
Ystafell Q014a
Campws Cyncoed
Caerdydd
CF23 6XD
Ffôn 02920 41 6731
e-bost: amurphy@cardiffmet.ac.uk

NID WYF yn fodlon i .................................................. (Enw'r Plentyn)

gymryd rhan yn y prosiect ymchwil.

Llofnod rhiant/gwarcheidwad ..............................................
Appendix 4: Example of Quiz

Who am I and why am here?
- My name is Alison Murphy
- I work at the University
- The main part of my job is teaching adults about children and the way that they learn and develop.
- I am doing a project to find out about what children think and what their ideas are!

Your ideas...
- I am really interested in your ideas.
- Today we are going to think about our national identity or sometimes this is called nationality.
- We all have different ideas about our national identity.

What does it mean to be Welsh?
- Who is Welsh in this class?
- Who is British? What other nationalities do we have?
- Is it about where you are born?
- Or perhaps where you live?
- Is it about where your parents come from?
- What other things tell other people about your national identity?

It's Quiz Time
- Look at the pictures of famous Welsh people and in your teams think about who they are!
- Some are from books and films
- Some are from entertainment
- Some are from sport
- Can you name them?

Music
Now over to you

- You all will be given a worksheet.
- On the one side you can draw yourself.
- Finish off the sentence at the top of the page which asks about your nationality. This means whether you are Welsh or French or Greek or Italian or perhaps a mixture of things.
- On the other side of the sheet you need to draw a picture of what you think a Welsh person looks like.
- If you finish your drawing you can put some writing at the bottom of the page or on the back of the sheet. Remember to ask some questions to give you some help with this.

What happens next?

- I am going to look at your drawings.
- Then I will come back and chat to some of you about your drawing and writing.
Appendix 5: Drawing Template

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>This is me.</th>
<th>This is a Welsh person</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am .........................</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 6: Prompt Questions for Drawings

Tell me about your drawing of a Welsh person.

What do they look like?

What colour hair and skin do they have?

Describe their features and body shape.

What are they wearing?

How do all these things tell us that they are Welsh?

What language does the Welsh person speak?

What do they do?

What hobbies do they have?

What religion are they?

What things are important to Welsh people?

What does it mean to be Welsh?
Appendix 7: Interview Questions

Researcher: Can you tell me about the picture of yourself and tell me a little bit about you?
Researcher: Do you want to tell me about yourself and your family and where you live?
Researcher: Ok, and what have you written about your national identity at the top there?
Researcher: Why did you write that? Why are you …? (Discuss personal national identity categorisation)
Researcher: So have a look at the other picture you have drawn now, this is all about what you think a Welsh person looks like. Can you tell me what you think a Welsh person looks like, looking at some of the things you’ve drawn there?
Researcher: Ok, what colour hair would they have?
Researcher: What about skin colour?
Researcher: What would their body and features be like? Would they have any particular body shape or features?
Researcher: Looking at your picture, you have just drawn the head and shoulders, how would I know that that person was Welsh?
Researcher: Ok, so what language would they speak?
What would your person do for a living?
Researcher: And what religion would a Welsh person be?
Researcher: Ok, so what things do you think are important to Welsh people?
Researcher: Ok, just one more question what sort of hobbies do you think a Welsh person would have?
Female 1: I don’t really know because you could ask thousands of people and not all of them would be the same because everybody is like different.
Researcher: Thanks so much that was really interesting. Is there anything else you would like to tell me about your drawing and writing?
Appendix 8: Examples of data analysis/drawings and annotations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Justification for self-categorisation of national identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LSP 1 (Female) Welsh</td>
<td>Parental national identity/ family origins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSP 2 (Male) Welsh</td>
<td>My birthplace/ Family birthplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSP 3 (Male) Half Kurdish/ half Welsh</td>
<td>Family birthplace/ current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSP 4 (Female) Pakistani and British</td>
<td>Family birthplace/ my birthplace/ current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSP 5 (Male) Welsh and British</td>
<td>Current residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSP 6 ( Female) African American</td>
<td>Parental national identity, my birthplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENP 1 (Male) Half English quarter Welsh</td>
<td>Family birthplace/ my birthplace/ grandparents national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENP 2 (Male) Indian</td>
<td>Family national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENP 3 (Female) Japanese</td>
<td>Birthplace/ parental national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENP 4 (Female) half Welsh half Iraqi</td>
<td>Parental national identity/ my birthplace/residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENP 5 ( Male) unsure whether British or</td>
<td>Parental national identity/residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMB 1 (Female) Half Welsh,</td>
<td>Parental national identity/ family national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>half Irish and bit English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMB 2 ( Male) Fully Welsh</td>
<td>My birthplace/ Parental national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMB 3 (Female) quarter Jamaican,</td>
<td>Grandparents national identity, Parental national identity/ family/ origins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>quarter English and half Welsh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMB 4 (Male) Welsh, half Nigerian and</td>
<td>My birthplace, Parental national identity/ Grandparents national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>quarter Jamaican)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMB 5 (Male) Welsh</td>
<td>All family speak Welsh, residence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key themes emerging

Parental national identity 9

Grandparent national identity 3

Family national identity 2

Family birthplace 4

Child’s birthplace 8

Language (1 child)

Place of residence 5

Family residence 2

The key themes emerging from the data can be grouped into specific categories in relation to the responses given by the children. These themes were around the national identity of close family members, birthplace and residency. One child also included language. Some children just cited one of these elements as a determinant of their national identity, however most children used a combination of the categories in their responses. The national identity of parents was particularly significant to the children that were interviewed with nine children citing this as their justification of their own national identity. Typical responses included:

YMB 4 : ‘… also my mum’s Welsh but my dad’s Nigerian’
The national identity of grandparents was also considered to be important to three of the children when defining their own national identity.

ENP 1 ‘…my mum’s parents, both of them are Irish’

YMB 3 ‘…my grandparents came from Jamaica, … my other grandma came from Cornwall.’

Other children cited the national identity of the family in general.

ENP 2 ‘… all my family that I know is Indian’

Birthplace was another common category either in terms of where the child themselves were born or where their family members were born. The examples below are from children who cited their own birthplace as a determinant.

LSP 2: ‘I was born in Cardiff’

YMB 2: ‘… I was born here’

As stated above children also reflected on the birthplace of their close family as well as their own.

LSP 3: ‘Well my mum and dad were born in Kurdistan. My sister was born in Kurdistan but I was born in Wales …’

The current place of residence of child and their family was also frequently mentioned. Five children said their national identity was linked to where they lived and three children commented on the relationship between national identity and where their family resides or come from.

LSP 5: ‘I live in Britain’

LSP 1: My mum is Welsh and my dad is Welsh and they don’t come, they haven’t lived or came from any other place.

There was only one child who linked language to national identity. This child was studying in the Welsh medium primary school.

YMB 5 : ‘Pretty much every person in my family tree like from me and my sister to about like my gran, no, my gran’s mum can all speak Welsh.’

Another child in the first English medium primary did state that he spoke English when asked about defining his national identity

LSP5: ‘…and I speak English’
### Appendix 9: Example of data analysis/interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Drawing number</th>
<th>Gender/national identity category</th>
<th>Content of Picture 1 – draw yourself</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A25</td>
<td>Female – Pakistan/British</td>
<td>Girl in hijab and ordinary clothing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing number</td>
<td>Content of Picture 2 – draw a Welsh person</td>
<td>Annotations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Male with spiky hair and Welsh football badge</td>
<td>Hair – Brown, blonde.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Skin – white</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Language – English, Welsh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Physical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Appearance/Clothes/Hobbies - Looks like any other person, wear what any other person wears, hobbies same as any person What’s important to a Welsh person? - Everything is important to them, It means supporting Welsh Rugby, football sports and knowing the Welsh National Anthem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing number</td>
<td>Content of Picture</td>
<td>Annotations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| B18            | Male in rugby kit with rugby ball and some coal | Hair – Black
Skin Colour - White
Language – Welsh and English and Welsh
Clothing – Welsh rugby top and shorts, studs and socks
Hobby – rugby
No religion
Strong |
| B18            | Male in rugby kit with rugby ball and some coal | Hair – Black
Skin Colour - White
Language – Welsh and English and Welsh
Clothing – Welsh rugby top and shorts, studs and socks
Hobby – rugby
No religion
Strong |

**Identification:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity Category</th>
<th>Yourself</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B18</td>
<td>Male - Indian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Boy in ordinary clothes with brown skin and glasses